WOMEN, MUSIC AND CULTURE: EQUALITY ISSUES IN MUSIC EDUCATION AT KEY STAGE THREE

CAROL COSTLEY

Submitted for the degree of Ph.D.
Department of Educational Studies
University of Surrey

1995
Case studies and action research are used to investigate the music education of girls at key stage 3 (11-14), in five different secondary schools within one Greater London borough. Relevant literature indicates the significance of gender in European art music's history, musical aesthetics and education. Girls and women are found to have been excluded from certain musical roles.

The study shows how European art music's history is rooted in a male ideology which proscribes a female musical role for women and how these meanings along with other more general gendered knowledge is transmitted in schools.

This study finds strategies to improve the music curriculum so as to remove the gendered disadvantages. This may allow women in music to achieve success in all areas of music making. The case studies include close observation, interviews and account gathering. This provides necessary background information for action research in which teachers become involved in the research, reflect on the issues, and make changes in their classrooms. Action research raises awareness amongst practitioners and contributes to further debate on the subject.

The empirical research focuses on girls' experiences in the music classroom, and social class and race are seen as other major explanations for differentiation in music education. The values and assumptions and previous experience of students, teachers, schools and the wider society are compared, and considered in relation to gendered disadvantage in music.

The thesis concludes that it is possible to make education less gendered at key stage 3 in individual classrooms. However, there are wider institutional and societal influences which impede progress. A number of possible changes are proposed for a holistic music education practice.
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page No.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table of Contents</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgments</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 1 Introduction
1. Aim of the Research Study                                          | 1        |
2. Background of the Subject and Justification                         | 1        |
3. Structure of the Thesis                                              | 4        |

## Chapter 2 Women, the Arts and the Cultural Meanings of 'Western Music'

1. Introduction                                                        | 7        |

2. Women, Music and Patriarchy                                         | 7        |
   a. Romanticism and the Renaissance Legacy                             | 7        |
   b. The Industrial Revolution                                          | 10       |
   c. Music is Socially/Politically Constructed                          | 15       |
   d. The Values Transmitted by Western Art Music                        | 17       |
   e. The Male Gaze                                                      | 20       |
   f. Music as a Feminine Occupation                                     | 22       |
   g. 'Female' and 'Male' Dualism in Music Theory and Musicology         | 25       |
   h. The Treatment of the Feminine in Musical Form and Notation and Male Desire | 28       |
   i. Timbre and Gender                                                  | 32       |
   j. The Madwoman and Hysteric                                          | 33       |

3. Women's Music has been considered: Creatively Inferior, Absent and/or Stereotyped | 34       |
   a. Creatively Inferior                                                | 34       |
   b. Absent                                                             | 40       |
      i. Absent from spiritual life                                       | 40       |
      ii. Absent because of hierarchical structures                      | 43       |
      iii. Absence forced through economic/practical controls            | 44       |
      iv. Absence through cultural notions of women's role               | 45       |
   v. Absent from the history books                                     | 46       |
   c. Stereotyped                                                        | 47       |

4. The Power of Historical/Traditional Precedents and Psychological Conditioning | 50       |
   a. Words in Music; Meaningless or Offensive?                          | 50       |
   b. Conditioning                                                       | 53       |
   c. A Psychoanalytic Model                                             | 55       |

5. Conclusion and Alternatives                                          | 57       |

## Chapter 3 Research in the Education of Girls

1. Introduction                                                        | 64       |

2. The Entry of Girls and Women into Mass Education                   | 66       |
   a. Class Differentiation in the State and Private Sectors            | 68       |
   b. Equal Access to the Traditional 'Male' Curriculum                 | 68       |
   c. 'Sciences are not for Girls'                                     | 69       |
3. Equal Opportunities and Anti-Sexism for Equality
   a. Equal Opportunities Approaches
   b. Anti-sexist Approaches
   c. Equality since the mid 1980's

4. School and Classroom Issues in Behaviour Management
   a. Teachers' Attitudes to Discipline
   b. Gender, Race and Class
   c. Focus on Girls
      i. Teachers' Expectations
      ii. Teachers' Perceptions of Femininity

5. Equality and Assessment
   a. The problem of bias
   b. Examination Performance
   c. Students' Experience
      i. Cultural Conditioning
      ii. Environmental Factors
      iii. Reading Patterns
   d. Expectations
   e. Resources
   f. Assessment Techniques
   g. National Curriculum Testing and Objectivity

6. Conclusion

Chapter 4 Music Education - The Curriculum
1. Introduction
2. Background
   2a. Linking Music Education with Particular Occupations and Skills
3. The Structuring of Knowledge and Subjects
   a. The Case for Interdisciplinarity
   b. Music as one of the Performing Arts
4. Structuring Knowledge within Music Education
   a. What is Counted as Knowledge about Music
   b. Conventions of Gender Specific use of Instruments
   c. The National Curriculum: Music as a Foundation Subject
5. Characteristics of the Teaching/Learning Context
   a. Requirements and Expectations Concerning Matters of Equality since The Education Reform Act 1988 with Special Reference to Girls and Music
   b. Gender and Technology
   c. Singing as Expression and Emotion
6. Equality and Music education; Research  
   a. Women in Music  
   b. Written Resources  
   c. Teaching about Women Composers  
   d. Feminist Criticism in Music Education  
   e. Role Models  
   f. A Hidden Agenda  
   g. Teaching 'Music' not 'Composers'  
   h. A Personal and Relational Function of Music  
   i. Improvisation  

7. Conclusion  

Chapter 5 Methodology and Epistemology  

1. Introduction  
2. A Feminist Methodology and Epistemology  
   a. Background to Feminist Research Methodologies  
   b. Current Feminist Methodology and Epistemology  
   c. Feminist Post-Modernism  
   d. The Feminist Perspective Adopted in this Thesis  
3. Ethnography  
   a. Case Study  
4. Educational Action Research  
5. Values and Ethical Consideration  
   a. Introduction  
   b. Subjectivity  
   c. Difficulties and Advantages of Insider Research  
   d. Permission  
6. Description of Method  
   Phase 1 - Three Case Studies  
   Phase 2 - Two Action Research Projects  
7. Conclusion  
   a. The End of the Projects  
   b. Summary  

Chapter 6 The Case Study Research  

1. Introduction  
2. Social Context of the Area and Case Study Schools  
   a. Social Class Divisions  
   b. Ethnic Divisions  
   c. The Arts and Cultural Divisions  
   d. Selection of the School Community is Determined by Established Structures  
   e. Parental Choice and Institutional Values  
      i. Smart Uniform  
      ii. Musical Reputation  
3. Comparison Between Institutional Structures of Schools  
   a. Teaching Staff Hierarchy by Sex  
   b. The School Teaching Communities  
   c. Music Teaching Staff Hierarchy by Sex  
   d. Student Population of Schools  
   e. Student Composition of Music Groups by Sex
| PAGE NO | 4. Teacher and Student Identity  
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>178</td>
<td>a. Background of Teachers and Students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Identity can be Shaped by Experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>187</td>
<td>5. Equal Opportunities and Case Study Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>198</td>
<td>a. Institutional Policies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Teacher Time and Attention in Music Lessons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Instruments/ Equipment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. Singing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Listening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>f. Text Books</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>g. Displays</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>h. Work Sheets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>i. Practise Facilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>j. Extra-curricular Music Activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>k. Behaviour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>l. Focus on Girls</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>m. Special Needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n. Use of Language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o. Conclusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>200</td>
<td>6. Politics and Ideology of Music Teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. The Arts in Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Music's Status on the Curriculum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Choice of Music for Practical Work and Listening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. Music as a Female Subject</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Ethos of Music Departments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>f. After School Concerts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>g. Conclusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>220</td>
<td>7. Female Resistance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>237</td>
<td>8. Conclusion to Case Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>244</td>
<td>Chapter 7 Action Research Projects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>250</td>
<td>Action Research - School A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Examination of Resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Analysis of the Song Book 'Mango Spice'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. Action Steps- following analysis of resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Our Reflections- on the change of songs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>f. Action Steps- on 'female' songs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>g. Our Reflections- on 'redressing the imbalance'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>h. Action Steps- to 'break a cultural pattern'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>i. Our Reflections- on student centred ways of working</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>j. Wider Considerations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>k. Our Reflections- on institutional sexism and male domination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>260</td>
<td>1. Conclusion to Project A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>263</td>
<td>Action Research Project- School B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Action Steps- mixing girls and boys together</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. The Teacher's Reflections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. Action Steps- single sex groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Our Reflections- are we a mixed society?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>f. A Three Week Study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>g. Primary School Links</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>h. Action Steps- mixed sex, whole groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>i. Class W</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>j. Reflections on Class W</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Conclusion to Action Research Projects A and B 277

Chapter 8 Conclusion and Proposed Strategies 281
1. Resolutions to Original Research Questions 281
2. What Would 'the Feminine Approach to Music' Asserted in this Research be Like? 285
3. Proposed Strategies for use in Schools 290
   a. explore a universalistic music for all students 290
   b. importance of how music is taught 291
   c. a balance between a masculine and feminine aesthetic 291
   d. music evaluation 292
   e. equality issues in music education 293
   f. approaches with men and boys 293
4. Suggestions for Further Research 294
   a. Feminine Perspectives of Knowledge 294
   b. Feminine Aesthetics 294
   c. An Equalitarian Music Criticism 295
   d. Overcoming the Subjugation of Women Musicians 296

References 299
Appendices 315

APPENDIX A A Letter from the Guardian Education Editor 315
APPENDIX B Letter to LEA about Action Research Projects 316
APPENDIX C Check List of Observations for Case Studies 318
APPENDIX D Local Newspaper Article 319
APPENDIX E Music Syllabus- Case Study 3 320
APPENDIX F Letter to Headteacher and the Borough from Teachers Concerned about Equal Opportunities in Case Study 1 326
APPENDIX G Posters of Male Composers- Case Study 3 329
APPENDIX H Illustrations of Italian Words (with gender- personality bias) -Case Study 3 330
APPENDIX I Further Analysis of Song Book-Action Research Project 1 332
APPENDIX J Posters of Women Composers-Action Research Project 1 339
APPENDIX K Some Notable Women Composers from Medieval to Modern Times-Action Research Project 1 340

List of Tables
Table 1 Earnings: Great Britain 1987 65
Table 2 GCSE Results for Music 1989 95
Table 3 Peripatetic Instrumental Teachers- Case Study 1 175
Table 4 Peripatetic Instrumental Teachers- Case Study 3 176
Table 5 1st, 2nd abd 3rd Orchestras in Case Study 2 230
Table 6 Students given prizes for music at speech days 230
Table 7 Songs written to be sung by male/ female/ unstated 251
Table 8 References to the female and male in all songs 251
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

For the original idea behind this thesis I have most to thank Lynn Chisholm of the Institute of Education, University of London. There are thanks for consistent positive encouragement and concise advice to my supervisor, Jacky Tivers of the Department of Educational Studies, University of Surrey. To colleagues and staff in the Department of Educational Studies, I owe thanks for their support and the valuable help provided by the Research Methods Programme. The research was supported financially for two years by the All Saints Educational Trust.

Ideas and principles concerning music education in this thesis owe much to the discussions of the Women in Music (WiM), Education Group, Battersea Arts Centre, of which I am a member. Practical support in gathering information about equality in education generally, and constructive criticism on the action research was received from Molly Bellamy of the Multi-Cultural Support Service in Waltham Forest. Advice and planning for the Action Research Projects came from the local Professional Development Centre. Elaine Wilson, an advisory teacher and Barbara Drinkwater, a deputy headteacher were also helpful and supportive. Support and encouragement (in the field) came from Women in Education in Enfield. Particular thanks need to go to Pauline Armsby of the Department of Psychology, University of Middlesex, who helped generally, but especially with the formulations of the methodology.

Thanks are also due to teachers and students in the five schools where the research took place, to Chris Dufton who helped with the format and to Jean Kempton who typed some of the earlier work and patiently revised it.

Finally, special thanks go to my parents, my sister and my two children, Jim and Alice for their love, music, positive energy, and relationship - all the parts that went into this thesis.
Chapter 1 Introduction

1. Aim of the Research Study

The aim of this research is to improve the music curriculum for girls at key stage 3, to help to change the situation whereby women are not represented as highly valued practitioners in European high art music (or in popular music). It is the intention of this thesis to introduce change via curriculum focused innovation which may contribute to the eradication of a gendered disadvantage in music education at key stage 3.

In pursuit of this aim, the central question is; why are women not represented as highly valued practitioners of European Art Music or Popular Music and how has this been reflected in music education? There arises various debates and issues concerning women and music which are analyzed through the background chapters and through the empirical data.

2. Background of the Subject and Justification

The subject of women's position as music makers and how this is reflected in music education has a wider context which emanates from the arts and from the women's movement. Women's position within the arts has undergone a particular scrutiny since the 1940's when women's writing was re-viewed, re-discovered and re-evaluated by women who challenged the status of women's literature. Later, women's contributions in the visual arts and then the performing arts came under examination and in the last decade women and music has become a subject of enquiry. Several spheres of enquiry are relevant to this thesis and are covered in the background chapters.

The first sphere concerns women's historical contribution to art music and music from all cultures, and how previously unknown women musicians and their music are now being publicised, played and examined. This area is significant to education because 'a knowledge of the historical position of women in music is . . . essential to any understanding of their present position both within and outside educational networks' (Green 1993). The question therefore needs to be asked; what are the features in
the history of women's music which have contributed to their position as under-represented music makers?

The second sphere of enquiry has been a concern with the notion of feminine aesthetics (the praise and value of a more feminine music usually devised and played by women music and its different (or feminine) attributes). The debate here is whether or not there is a feminine aesthetic and if there is, to find out how it differs from the traditional masculine aesthetic. Is it a feminine or female aesthetic because men can be feminine too, and it is the sexes which have been divided. Some evidence explains the historical duality of men's and women's work in connection with sexuality and women's cultural position.

Some writers are more concerned with the reasons why women's work has been judged of less worth and the task of redefining quality. The second question that needs to be asked is therefore; what are the features in the history of women's music which have contributed to their position as undervalued music makers? This second sphere relates and intertwines with the first sphere of enquiry (cf chapter 2).

A third sphere of enquiry has been a feminist critique within education. This follows from previous studies of the curriculum, in other subject areas and in general, which consider girls' situation within the education system. There is therefore a substantial body of knowledge from which to draw when approaching a particular aspect of the curriculum. Crucial findings from previous studies of schools and the curriculum have found gendered divisions which have relevance to this thesis (cf chapter 3). The question here is; how has the history of women's education contributed to the position of women musicians?

Within this third sphere of enquiry there have been some very recent studies in music education which contribute to the understanding of the significance of girls' music education to their later positions as women musicians in society (cf chapter 4). Here the questions are; how has the history of women's music
and women's education been significant to the music education women receive and how does music education perpetuate a system of inequality?

The possibility of social class and race as alternative or additional explanations to that of gender is to some extent, integrated into the thesis.

The problem under consideration is approached through school-based studies (cf chapters 6 and 7) because education is seen as an area where it is possible to make changes to the attitudes and practices which categorize or ignore women and their music. 'In western civilization, more than in any other culture, education has been the..... means by which cultural tradition has been transmitted and sustained' (Bowen 1981). The final questions are; how does the situation look at a practical level and what can be done to promote positive changes?

Study is needed in women and music education because all areas of the curriculum need to be examined in differing contexts so that there can be a complete picture of the experience of women and girls in the education system. 'We can only come closer to gender-neutral education when we have pooled and shared our experiences'(Deem 1978), and Rendel (1981) calls for research to facilitate women's entry into positions of power which would include research at all levels of education.

More detailed research has been required in the arts in particular. 'If we consider work on girls' and women's education as a whole it is evident that we need much more research on specific areas' (Deem 1980). Since Rosemary Deem made this statement there has been work done and work in process in virtually every area of education although much work has focused on the traditionally 'male' areas of the curriculum such as science, maths, technology and Physical Education in order to explain why girls were under-represented in those areas. Music has sometimes been considered a marginal subject although musical activities are embodied in the wider aspects of the curriculum,
in further and extra-curricular activities and in the hidden curriculum. Music is also a more 'female' area of the curriculum, with more girls opting to study music at the end of key stage 3 and more girls taking part in musical activities.

From previous studies in education, it is now generally accepted that merely to permit access to the curriculum does not ensure equal opportunities and, within groups defined by race, class and gender, employment opportunities are not commensurate with their educational achievement. This is the case for women musicians who outnumber men considerably in education but find the situation is reversed amongst professional musicians in public life.

Music is the second biggest growth industry and music is socially important to young people. At key stage 3 when students are aged between 11-14 years, they reach a critical stage in their development as young adults which may shape their future aspirations and careers. It is a time when young adults form identities and muster self esteem to form and determine those identities. This is also the time when important decisions about option choices at school are made. If girls are to enjoy and take part in leisure and vocational music activities, then there is a need to identify and change ideological barriers about what is appropriate for girls and this is what this study seeks to do.

Paradoxically, this thesis attempts to write about an art form which defies full exposition by the written word, especially within the nature of the more feminine music being advocated. To this extent, there are some meanings which can only be implied.

3. Structure of the Thesis
In chapter 2, an examination of the cultural meanings of the art music of post-Renaissance Europe is described as essential to this work. This is because education, as well as being an agent of change in our society, is also a powerful means of reproducing 'traditional' social and cultural values which are embodied in art music.
Having established the need to study art music in particular, a central theme of the chapter is that music composed by women within the art music tradition has not been included in music history books. It has since been 'rediscovered', and questions are raised concerning the aesthetic quality and content of women's and men's work in relation to gender and sexuality.

Chapter 2 goes on to address the power of historical precedents, which produce a psychological conditioning and makes many of us proscribe differing roles for people based on their gender, class or/and ethnic origin/colour of skin and which assumes heterosexuality and is deeply embedded in every sphere of society. The way such conditioning manifests itself in music (and therefore in music education) is wide ranging and apparent in, for instance, language used around music, philosophy, social conventions, historical accounts, literature, sexuality and in the sounds of music itself. This review gives fuller understanding of the situation for girls in music education in schools.

Evidence shown in chapter 3 demonstrates that whilst the forms of incorporation of gendered curricula may have changed over the years, and whilst the ways in which gender divisions are manifested may have shifted fundamentally, differentiation on grounds of gender has retained its essential features. The inequalities we find in social structure and process are still reflected in education and curriculum. Chapter 3 therefore goes on to examine how research in gender and education has sought to formulate new concepts and to re-examine humane, holistic doctrines of education.

Chapter 4 observes articulations between gender and the music curriculum. Current thinking about music education in general is reviewed and research work in music education and gender, a relatively new field of research, is investigated and discussed.

Having surveyed the related criteria through the three background chapters, the purpose is then to seek explanations at 'grass
roots' level, to be concerned with the students and teachers and those involved in music education. Chapter 5 presents the mainly qualitative approach to the methodology and epistemology and describes how the theory and methods have been informed by feminist perspectives, ethnology and action research.

In chapter 6, three schools are selected as case studies to represent different populations in relation to class, race and gender. Girls in music education at key stage 3 are the focus of the studies. This chapter is the first phase of the research and examines and analyses three case studies with a view to considering what the inequalities are in music education so that practical changes can be made.

In chapter 7 the second phase is achieved by setting up two action research projects in two comprehensive schools. The first project school considers gendered language in music lessons and the second considers the relationship between musical creativity and gendered artistic and social conventions.

The conclusions in chapter 8 summarise the findings of the research study, both from the discussions in the background chapters and from the empirical studies. Various strategies for change are outlined and considered.
Chapter 2
Women, the Arts and the Cultural Meanings of 'Western Music'

1. Introduction
This chapter shows how the cultural meanings of western art music are rooted in a male ideology which proscribes women and their musical abilities and aptitudes in particular terms. It shows how these meanings have been transmitted in our society (and in our schools), and have been submerged and distracted by our tacit acceptance of thinking only in masculine terms of definition and masculine presumption. This is perceived to have led to suppositions that women are creatively inferior, that women's music is absent or stereotyped, that working class women are unable to aspire to this music, and that black women represent the exotic.

This chapter demonstrates how traditional music history perpetuates these ideas by mixing them with traditional values which are often seen as safer and as conserving the social order. Part of this social order was and is often seen as women and men occupying specific roles. In high art music men have dominated the roles of composer, conductor and as establisher of the standard for excellence. The chapter traces this domination back to the Renaissance but considers that Romanticism and 19th century conservative opposition to reform particularly stifled women's creativity because the industrial bourgeoisie sought to sustain privilege by collaborating with reactionary governments and churches to sustain the patriarchal culture of industrialised society and to maintain a restrictive classical education for the few men who were chosen by virtue of their social class.

2. Women, Music and Patriarchy
a. Romanticism and the Renaissance Legacy
The nineteenth century was a time for the organisation and structuring of value systems and laws which inhibited and oppressed women, working class people, people of colour and many other groups. Patriarchy which sought to control and define women long before this time had provided an overall uniformity of social control which enabled this structuring to take place.
During the Renaissance and post-Renaissance an emphasis was put on the visual which resulted from the increasing importance of analytic phonetic literacy and movable type printing. This gave rise to a whole series of interrelated concepts: objectivity, spatialized time, straight line cause-and-effect analysis, deterministic rationality and control which were used to organise and manipulate the physical environment.

'..educated men quickly thought themselves into the entirely mythical position of being separate from the world, of being able analytically to pin down physical, human and social existence as a unidimensional, static display having relevance only for the gaze of the beholder. The individual became supreme. But precisely because such an approach to the world is mythical, precisely because people can only become people and remain people through an interaction with others, ...this fiction of unilateral physical and social control implied a control over self that is both unconscious and invisible... European derived societies have tended to become reifications without people: ..essentially human values could only survive among the powerless in cracks and margins. The comparative experiential and emotional richness of proletarianized and minority ethnic cultures can in this sense be viewed as a projection through social stratification of values more fundamentally associated with the world of women.'

Shepherd 1991

The understanding that we have about knowledge and theory has been passed on to us historically and traditionally without fundamental questions being asked. Shepherd shows that the Renaissance brought a male controlled culture which compensated for their lack of control in biological reproduction by keeping women domesticated, in the home and under control, and compensated for their lack of social relatedness by mapping and notating and thus controlling knowledge, especially music which, he says, has been subject to similar control to that of women.
The way the world has been structured in western art music has to be understood against the background of its roots in Renaissance 'educated' culture. The 'educated' men of the Renaissance thought their reality was the 'real truth', that they had discovered reality. 'In music, art, literature and indeed science, post-Renaissance 'educated' culture has worn its logic on its sleeve' (Shepherd 1991). Clarity, lucidity, self-evidence and self-sufficiency have become not just virtues but the necessities for acceptance in the academy. However it is a culture which 'does not absorb the spectator, it can only be absorbed by the spectator' (Shepherd 1991), it does not allow the spectator in to complete the meaning, as Barthes says 'it is readerly' (Barthes 1976).

Men's fear of women and of music caused them, at the time of the Renaissance, to control and contain them. For music this was done by isolating the components of pitch and rhythm, which can be objectified and frozen through a 'fully analytic notation. (therefore limiting) ...the threat posed by uncontrollable musical experience to the "moral fibre" of the rationalistic scribe-state' (Wishart 1977 p.128).

In the nineteenth century society changed because of industrialisation and because of the effects of the thinkers and writers of the Romantic movement. The legacy of the Renaissance enabled the control and consequent alienation of many people. Each of these changes damaged the chances of professional women involved in the arts. The Romantic movement was influenced by Rousseau who expressed the importance of nature and natural, spontaneous emotions.

'Women in general are not lovers of any art, and have no artistic genius. They can succeed in small artistic works which only demand quickness of wit, good taste and sometimes the application of reason.....But the genius which consumes (is) always lacking in women's writings. Their work is as cold and pretty as themselves.'

Rousseau 1758
Rousseau felt that a woman's natural place was in the home as wife and mother and that women were lacking in any artistic drive. His ideas took time to be adopted in Britain and during the Victorian era women's fight for recognition as professional artists became more difficult. The Romantic movement had its own conception of art but the freedom of that style of art was not accorded to the freedom of women. 'What the nineteenth century did was rework and amplify an older rhetoric of sexual exclusion that has its roots in Renaissance theories of art and sexual difference' (Battersby 1989).

The traditions of cultural misogyny came about because Renaissance writers had drawn on pagan myths from ancient Rome and Greece. These ideas have been passed through history in various forms in order to explain convincingly to each age of thinkers that women have no potential for creativity in its highest form. An extraordinary set of circumstances arose when the Romantic philosophy appeared to be advocating qualities for the potential genius which had previously matched the qualities which women were supposed to have.

'What gives the Romantic contribution to the anti-female traditions a distinctly new feel is that women continued to be represented as artistic inferiors even though qualities previously downgraded as 'feminine' had become valuable as a consequence of radical changes in aesthetic taste and aesthetic theory.'

Battersby 1989

The Romantics who valued emotion, imagination, nature, symbol and myth (Wellek 1949), equated high art forms with male procreativity. Creative genius remained inseparable from virility.

b. The Industrial Revolution
Along with a new philosophy came a change in economic relations. After the power of the feudal system, a new social class emerged, the bourgeoisie, whose power came from the growing force of
material production as the expression of the domination of nature
and the domination of the working class.

Male hegemony had meant that people were conceptualised as
objects cut off from social relations which gave the few the
power to control the many. A society based on gender and class
divisions was put into practice to form the social structure of
industrial capitalism. The social stratification that took place
is viewed as a consequence of the particular form of male
hegemony that was present during and after the Renaissance.
'...social stratification, with its differentiated cultural
realities and modes of alienation, is more likely to be a
projection of the logic of gender relations than gender relations
a projection of the logic of social stratification' (Shepherd

Under the new, capitalist, bourgeois society production of goods
ceased to serve people but instead began to serve production.
Everything became subjected to the rigid laws of capitalism
including the arts (works of art were transformed into
commodities). 'Capitalist production is hostile to certain
branches of spiritual production, for example, art and poetry'
Marx (Theories of Surplus Value 1905-10).

Everything had become quantified and abstracted, and the arts,
which are the expression of humanity, oppose an inhuman society.
By using art as a medium a group of women aimed to 'come to their
senses' and found that 'Having been educated in the patriarchal
framework of tightly bound "reason" and supposedly detached
"objectivity," we hungered to feed our capabilities of perceiving
subtle, encompassing connectedness ...Boxed in by cultural
denial, we dissolved the boxes...(by) being in relation
...through myth, symbol, poetry, song and dance' (Spretnak 1991).

Art forms and artists are frequently seen as rebellious, creating
tension between the dominant social and artistic institutions,
and human creativity. In no precapitalist society was material
production in principle hostile to the arts, not even in
primitive society when arts were very directly connected to material production.

Nineteenth century artists who opposed the quantifying of artistic works took refuge in the arts as the purest and most adequate means to affirm their liberty and individuality in the face of the unacceptable reality of capitalism. Under capitalism everything became abstract and impersonal as opposed to the romantic ideal of the subjective and personal. When bourgeois academia invokes its faithfulness to reality, it is trying to justify and idealise bourgeois life as the proper concern of the arts which other aesthetic, critical realist and revolutionary artists reject.

Some forms of intellectual production were favoured by capitalism, in particular the natural sciences which grow and develop in the context of capitalist relations of production. The development of science is a necessary condition for the development of capitalism and it has been closely related in assisting with the transformation of nature since the beginning of capitalism. Production, however, does not directly determine the content or form of the arts which are only directly affected by productive forces, in the last analyses through its treatment as a commodity. The arts form complex connections not just with the economic base but other branches of the ideological superstructure. Therefore the arts have relative autonomy compared to science. However, the arts can only flourish to the extent that they can elude the grip of capitalist production which by its nature is unfavourable to the arts. The relationship between infrastructure and superstructure has been problematized and conceptualized in increasingly subtle and complex ways since the work of Raymond Williams (1961).

The division of labour under capitalism assumes specialisation and particularity, it is restrictive of the personality and can be alienating and degrading, and cause separation from community. People become transformed and reified and often cannot establish communication with art. 'We cannot hope to broaden and enrich
truly aesthetic consumption without extensively deepening and enriching the human sensibility, a task which is also indispensable to the radical transformation of social, political, economic and spiritual relations' (Gasset 1968).

The historical split between the arts and 'the masses' was caused because artists have been unable to share their art with the millions of human beings that capitalism has kept in a reified state. What developed was an art form which became elitist and for the cultured individual, whilst the rest were limited as consumers of 'mass art' with their creative capacity suppressed. The term 'the masses' and 'mass art' have only a pejorative meaning which implies depersonalisation whereas the term 'the people' represents the alive and fertile nature of individuals in a community.

There is a radical opposition between capitalist production and the human need to create. Societies, divided into classes under patriarchal hegemony and a cultural negation of the female body, destroy the foundations of artistic creation by limiting the creative impulse of the people. We know that all people need to create and have a creative attitude to the world because 'Arts are the deepest form of healing that humankind has at its disposal' (Fox 1990 p.97).

The division of artistic labour splits us into creators and consumers. As consumers many lose their creative capacity resulting in limitation and impoverishment of the art of the people and their folklore. As consumers we are often only invited to correspond with the artistic sub-products offered by mass art. This is because '....commercialization of art in overdeveloped cultures has often reduced the artistic vocation to that of salesmanship for unneeded goods on one hand, or trivialization by way of self serving complacency on the other' (Fox 1990 p.97).

Through techniques of persuasion, advertising and an education system which reproduces inequalities, people desire what they do not need or what does not correspond to their real human needs.
Packard (1957) shows how professors of social science, psychiatrists, psychologists, and specialised personnel of large corporations make an enormous effort to shape the consciousness of American people both as consumers and citizens.

These conditions have prevented the flowering of truly popular art by limiting people's creative capacity and by distributing artistic substitutes on a large scale which has kept people separated from professional cultured art as well as true popular creation. The people do not recognise themselves in what are purported to be their own products. This is particularly the case for women, whose representation is not consistent with the reality of their lives and who are depicted in stereotyped ways. Furthermore, black women and working class women are generally under represented and lesbian women, old women and disabled women are frequently not represented at all (Rodgerson and Wilson 1991 p.41).

Popular art would be neither a minority nor a mass art. It would not be realised just by the beauty of the contents but it would also be an expression of the aspirations and interests of the people in a given historical stage which as such maintains a relationship with politics (Gramsci 1948). To some extent the arts in popular collectives have been realised in community theatre, community arts projects often within community schools, in some aspects of artistic 'fringe' productions and by amateurs or non-professionals. All these endeavours involve a struggle for funding and recognition. People have to be careful that those pieces of art which are defined as worthwhile are not just those which are funded.

An art which is neither elite, nor a mass art, which obeys the economic and ideological demands of capitalism, which is interested in mass consumption, would be addressed to neither privileged nor alienated. Art does not have the same commodity value as consumer goods so there is some hope for those who, through tenacity, struggle, perseverance or whatever means, overcome the way the arts are transformed into purely formal or
mechanical activities whose lack of economic productivity repeatedly blocks creative possibilities.

c. Music is Socially/Politically Constructed

In some senses music has been silenced. For instance musicologists and those concerned with music theory have in the past avoided discussion about the social and cultural meanings of music.

Many musicologists and other writers have long held that music can only be for its own sake. It is considered an objective view that it cannot represent anything else and that there can certainly be no gendered distinctions in music. 'I must say I had always thought that music had values unrelated to gender...' (The Guardian Education Editor, 1991 see Appendix A)

Consequently (because women scholars find themselves holding a tenuous position in this highly male dominated discipline) there has been virtually no feminist criticism of music (Kerman 1985, Said 1987 and Sandow 1987 ).

Although, traditionally, many musicologists and music critics have held these firm views, it is ironic that everyday 'common sense' understanding concerning what music is about recognises that music can sound and create feelings of happiness, sadness, romance, bawdiness, nationalism, relaxation and so on.

People are socialised according to the messages, both overt and covert, that they receive through varying media including language, television, film, advertising and music. Foucault (1970) theorises that apparent universals such as knowledge, sexuality, the body and madness, have histories which are concerned with institutional power and have been defined, organised and constituted by means of cultural discourses such as literature and music. Foucault recognises that critics often take the view that the arts do not explain class struggle. The experience of music does not fit well into our interior monologue of language and it is true that an explanation of how music
socialises, especially to the extent that it assumes gender identities and structures people's behaviour, is difficult.

Most social groups, for instance, are represented by a particular musical genre. The correct conduct surrounding music and its procedures creates a struggle over whose music, whose pleasure, whose social conventions will be listened to and absorbed. Pop music in the 1950's and later groups like the Beatles and the Rolling Stones with their particular style and movements represented to parents and many in authority a subversive force which challenged hegemonic bourgeois values. Many ethnic groups prefer to listen to the music which is familiar to them and is an intrinsic part of their culture, discouraging their children from taking part in school musical events but encouraging them to practise the art of their own heritage. Foucault maintains that music is always a political activity and therefore to inhibit criticism is also a political act; 'the arts in their pleasurable aspect are one of the principal means by which hegemonic culture maintains its power' (Foucault 1970).

It is the subjective nature of music and its power to socialise which has been viewed with scepticism by many theorists. Yet music can hardly be an objective experience for even if it is hard to account definitively for 'common sense' accounts of music's power, its social and political influence has to be acknowledged.

Music has been shown to have a physical effect on the body, (Storr 1992). The rhythms and nuances of musical effect can physically change breathing patterns, the blood and the patterns of the brain. The body, however, is not included in so called objective theorists' accounts because of the subjectivity of considering the body as a factor when interpreting music. Reason according to Plato is abstract and centred in the mind. Yet music is received through the body. This may not be so obvious in western art music because actual physical movement is not of necessity a part of listening to the music. However, what is
often contained in this music is a concern with the arousing and channelling of desire and this is most definitely achieved through the body. Gender and sexuality are represented in all musics as well as in literature and film, not only in the activities around music but through the music itself. It is not surprising that there is resistance to questioning music's messages, because this means that not only gender but also sexuality are socially constructed (Heath 1982).

d. The Values Transmitted by Western Art Music

Adorno (1973) shows how the compositions of western art music are informed by the social and political atmosphere of their time. His work points out the contradictions raised increasingly by Romanticism in music between individual free will and the social pressure to conform. He considers that traditional musicologists maintain an illusion of total order and control which is patently not there. He shows how the German 'great' instrumental composers culturally represent the social tensions of their time.

With the seventeenth century came opera and the formation of a new language of musical expression. There were gendered signs in music before this but music drama provided the forum for a complete gender construction. The characters in the opera were delineated by composers developing 'a musical semiotics of gender' (McClary 1991). Gender and sexuality had become focal points for expression in society and these ideas were incorporated into opera. The construction of male and female forms (that is, what is considered their proper behaviour, appearance, duties etc.) may have changed depending on time, place and class but some attitudes towards gender have remained relatively constant and the messages which opera is purveying are often clear and relevant in any age.

Clément (1989) reveals how opera was one of the key media through which the bourgeoisie developed and disseminated its new moral codes. She discloses not only the gender politics that require the death or downfall of the prima donna but also the racism and colonialism that opera engages in and passes on. In Clément's
analysis opera perpetuates a social order through its plots. She maintains that the language and drama of opera has more relevance, more unconscious messages, more meanings than many people want to believe.

'..beyond the romantic ideology ....characters (are led to) death for transgression... of familial rules, political rules, the things at stake in sexual and authoritarian power.....A Gypsy loves whomever she pleases and goes off with the smugglers: Carmen. A Moor who is a foreigner in Venice marries one of the lagoon's daughter's, too blond, too far removed: Othello. A prostitute permits herself conjugal love: La Traviata. An infante of Spain loves his stepmother: Don Carlo. A one eyed god quests after incest and absolute power: Wotan in the Ring cycle. A singer kills the chief of the Roman police: Tosca. A Spanish nobleman defies heaven and his father: Don Giovanni.'

Clément 1989 p.10

The glitter and spot light are on the prima donna who is adored and worshipped by opera fans. However, in nineteenth century opera in particular, it is the death or domestication that is required from this female heroine/victim. When the men die it is because they too have become (like the women) outside of society's norm of heroic masculinity. They have become 'feminised' and are like heroines surrounded by real men. Those who are defeated are the weak sons, the lame, hunchbacks, black people, foreigners, and old men; those who are like women (Parsifal, Tristan, Othello, Rigolletto, Falstaff). Those who succeed are fathers, kings, uncles, male lovers, authorities and churches. In ideological terms it is the defeat of paganism with its gods, the rebellious, sorceresses, forces of night and darkness, the weak and the underprivileged, all associated with women. Reading the texts uncovers words which (usually couched in the setting of a love story - women's familiar fate) repeatedly tell the story of women dying and being controlled. Butterfly stabs herself, Tosca leaps into a void and so it goes on.
...I am too well acquainted with the powers of spectacle not to listen...to the stories repeated a thousand times by men who pursue women and reduce them to nothing. The only course open is death: that is opera's innermost finality.'

Clément 1989

Theatres, concert halls and opera houses became increasingly popular in the nineteenth century. The places were lavish, golden and ornate, and the Bourgeoisie who attended them reflected the same extravagant image. These trappings reveal a desire to emulate the nobility and opera particularly appealed to this elitist urge.

In nineteenth century England a model of 'otherness' was constructed around groups which did not fit the upper or new middle class model. These groups were mainly based on class, race and gender and although the focus is primarily on gender in this study it must be recognised that to some extent they cannot be separated.

Levy (1991), asserts that... 'women were often as much agents of hegemony as objects seized and defined by it'. This means the argument deploring women's exclusion from western art music could begin to sound like an argument about white middle class women's exclusion only, if class is not integrated into the analysis. However, the intention here is to be aware of and have some understanding of the complex articulations that are present when institutions and societies become involved in economic and cultural domination.

The question of whose values are transmitted in the music is therefore unavoidably that of the male members of the dominant social class. An added dimension is that there were those amongst that class (mostly women) who were both excluded from the making of the most revered forms of music, yet, because of the strict system of values and 'sheltering' of women which led to a lack
of awareness, they became part of the process of transmitting male cultural values in that class.

e. The Male Gaze

The term 'the male gaze' has been coined to describe not so much the uncomfortable stare with which men may familiarly look at women but that it is men's visual experience of women which is important in our society. It is this view, through which we are all expected to construct our reality.

From the Renaissance there is evidence that women who performed in public or tried to publish their art were regarded as courtesans and were pressured to grant sexual favours in exchange for being permitted to participate in cultural production. The old custom of 'the droit du seigneur' where conductors may demand sex from female performers before casting them is still in evidence in recent times (in 'Amadeus' (1988), the film, this convention was shown). Clement (1989) shows that these attitudes have affected the lives of famous divas from Milibran to Callas. The prima donna as a male constructed fantasy image receives demands from the public to conform to their peculiar ideals of femininity which include temperament, sexual behaviour, beauty and weight. When the singer inevitably begins to decline in singing ability it is often met with an unwarranted viciousness. Susan McClary, a professor in a music school, writes:

'I have colleagues who gleefully invent names of abuse for fading sopranos - names such as Miss Piggy and others too hurtful to mention - and who glory in sending bouquets of dead flowers to their dressing rooms before performances.'

(McClary in forward to Clément 1989 p.xvi)

The politics of sexual representation which were informed in part by the ideals of the romantic movement relegated women performers to being viewed as 'little better than prostitutes' (Sproule 1989), and Ruskin and other romantics considered that there was an air of immorality about women performers. 'How I ask can a calling whose only aim is to show oneself in public and, what is worse to show oneself for money, be suitable for honest women?
How can it be compatible with their modesty and virtue?' (Rousseau 1758).

Case refers to the concept of the male gaze as asserting that 'representations of women are perceived as they are seen by men. Here, the term 'men' represents the male subject in capitalist patriarchy' (Case 1988 p.119). The way we are all expected to view male and female performers is as though we are male. The characters in an opera or a play may be moulded to encourage an audience to view the female characters through the eyes of the male characters. Women instrumental performers may be assessed with their femaleness or 'otherness' in mind rather than as artists. This view of women which we are all invited to share only constructs a view of male heterosexual desire; women's desire is not symbolised in patriarchal culture.

The patriarchal determination of sexual development is explained by a Freudian-Lacanian approach which describes how males have come to represent the subject position for the whole of culture. This process excludes women from the role of subject or as the producer of symbolic expressions. 'Because it is tied to cultural castration, both Freud and Lacan locate the symbolic order in relation to the phallus of the child and the cultural 'Law of the Father', situating the entire production of art within the patriarchal order of father and son. Within this order of male desire and castration, the only role for women is as objects of that desire. The result is that women become fixed in the position of object of the gaze, rather than as the subject directing it. In that sense 'woman' is constituted as 'Other'.

Case 1988 p.120

That there have been fewer women composers and writers is explained in the same way as the sexualisation of 'woman' the observable sign. Women composers and writers are subject to the male gaze in a culture which seeks to render women as sexual objects or virtuous and hidden (the madonna/whore
categorization). Women therefore have even had fear of their names being seen in public.

'This division of masculine and feminine spheres of experience separated 'the world' from 'the domestic circle', the public from the private arena; women were denied access to the former and confined to the latter by 'custom'. The social hegemony of modesty and its attributes -virtue, honour, name, fame and reputation - served to police the segregation by ascribing a sexual significance to any penetration, either from within or without, of a woman's 'private circle'. To publish one's work was to make oneself 'public': to expose oneself to 'the world'. Women who did so violated their feminine modesty both by egressing from the private sphere which was their proper domain and by permitting foreign eyes access to what ought to remain hidden and anonymous.'

Goreau 1983 p.20

It was not considered appropriate for a woman to make a publication of any kind. Sarah Glover (1786-1867) added her name to few publications because she was a 'female, private individual'. Her sol-fa scheme was distinct from Curwen's but as a Priest and a male he was able to publicise and organise on a scale not acceptable for a woman. His 'system' was based on hers, he offered to share the publishing rights with her but she declined and he later went on to be known as the person who devised the sol-fa system, (Hyde 1984).

It has become a difficult process for women to distance themselves fully from the prejudices of a bygone age. Cixous (1981) argues that women have found difficulty publishing their work because, culturally, women's bodies have been assimilated by the patriarchal system of desire and representation. Women still experience unfair treatment when attempting to publish their work (Oakley 1981). This has led to the existence of women's presses and publishing houses.
f. Music as a Feminine Occupation

Male musicians and those men who follow western art music have often been called 'effeminate'. This claim goes back as far as there has been recorded documentation and music's association with the body (in dance, or for sensuous pleasure) has led to it being viewed as a feminine activity. The English in particular associate music with effeminacy. Charles Ives writes that music has been too long an emasculated art.

Here we must not become confused between feminine and female. A 'great composer' may be said to have feminine qualities i.e. like a woman, but he would not be a woman because he would also need to have male sexual energies (Battersby 1989).

In the nineteenth century 'great males' were praised for qualities identical with Aristotelian femininity. The difference was that passion, imagination, frenzy and irrationality were treated differently in men and women. A composer would most likely have feminine qualities but as long as he was 'great' the femininity was transformed into a virtue. It is femaleness not femininity which is downgraded in the male musician, although he has to be careful that the two do not get confused. This creates a situation for male musicians where they are sometimes driven to defend their maleness in the light of their ability to be sensitive, creative people.

This has resulted in music being defined in more male terms by assuming it to be the least physical of the arts and insisting on a 'rational' and so called objective dimension to music. It is a situation in this society that men frequently have their sexuality questioned in a negative way because they are musicians.

McClary (1991) cites how Schumann, when writing an essay on Schubert's Symphony in C major, raises a dichotomy between the more sensitive, romantic Schubert and Beethoven's 'virile power'. Schumann 'shields himself' from Schubert's sensitivity and turns to Beethoven to establish his own maleness.
In an analysis of early attachment to the mother, Dinnerstein (1976) points out that the male seeks comfort and nurture outside of himself whereas the female 'now lives in the female body that was once a source of nourishment, entertainment, reassurance' ..and therefore 'is more self-sufficient ...(for) what is inside oneself cannot be directly taken by a rival ..(whereas the male)..'must have exclusive access to a woman' (Dinnerstein 1976 pp41-43). Men have felt the need to be in control because women provide 'a reliable source of emotional sustenance that men can draw on for their 'real world' struggles' (Shepherd 1991) and because women are necessary as the source of life. Men and women suffer for this, men because they are lacking in the relational and emotional, women because they are estranged from the public world. Consequently, the relational and emotional has been downgraded and the rational and objective considered superior. Music itself has been controlled and dominated under patriarchy in a similar way to women:

'If women symbolize the source of life, the social interactions that are the source of our beings as people, and if sexual relatedness provides a biological code for these same processes, then women tend to become equated with sex... women as objects are in turn equated with a natural or material world thus susceptible to unilateral control by men. Control of cultural reproduction compensates for a lack of centrality in biological reproduction, and nowhere is this control more effectively exercised than on the mapping and notational procedures- among which music figures prominently... the vast majority of noetic and scribal elites have been male, for by this means men preserve themselves paradoxically as independent and in control of the very social relations which produce them.'

Shepherd 1991

Male political dominance tends to be visual rather than aural. The visual is silent and inert and is separated and 'at a distance' whilst sound is fluid, all around and integrates with
us. Sound brings the external inside us, the nature of sound being vibration, it passes through us and has a tactile quality. Symbolically, sound is our existence, it is 'the vibratory flow of matter/energy in you, through you, around you' (Spretnak 1991).

The habit of external referencing can create a situation where inner reality is far removed. To be so removed from the body and to deny feelings negates the interconnectedness of humanity and causes addictive behaviour and lack of compassion. Music, registered internally, has sensuous and bodily associations reminding us of our interdependence and communality.

'The existence of music, like the existence of women, is potentially threatening to men to the extent that it sonically insists on the social relatedness of human worlds and as a consequence implicitly demands that individuals respond. When this happens music reminds men of the fragile and atrophied nature of their control over the world.'

Shepherd 1991

Music, associated with the body, able to enter the body in the form of vibration, is experienced as female. Male musicians are therefore caught up in this fear of femaleness. They are often required to make it clear that although music may be a 'feminine' occupation that there is no trace of femaleness around.

g. Female and Male dualism in Music Theory and Musicology

Dualism can be a dangerous concept, it polarizes, separates, caricatures and creates an attitude of assumed difference based on a set of predetermined ideas. Dualism is especially harmful when it is applied to people. It can form the basis of prejudice, makes opposites and it idealises a type to which people are then obliged to conform.

Concepts of duality are seen as emerging from the need to 'master' nature and thereby hold chaos at bay. The point at which the urge to control overcomes humility and the urge to protect is seen as being where 'fear that nature unchallenged would
physically destroy us. The notion of experiencing oneness with natural world is feared by many as a horrifying engulfment: either one guards his individuality, freedom and particularity or he surrenders his being to an overarching monster, oneness. This highly charged dualism is central to the sensibility of modernity' (Spretnak 1991). Women are understood as being as of nature, mother nature, mother earth and, as such need to be controlled.

In music theory and where there is discussion about music, a language of opposites often emerges; major/minor, strong/weak, normal/abnormal, consonance/dissonance, objective and rational/romantic. Whilst in the music one might explain these opposites as devices used to evoke say, contrast, when the music is discussed these polarities are frequently ascribed to so called male and female traits. The following, most revealing statement describes major and minor in terms of male and female and accords the metaphor with holy countenance:

'Just as in the universe there has always been created a creature more splendid and perfect than the others of God, we observe exactly this also in musical harmony. Thus we find after the major triad another, the minor triad, which is indeed not as complete as the first, but also lovely and pleasant to hear. The first can be likened to the male, the second to the female sex. And just as it was not good that man (Adam) was alone, thus it was not good that we had no other harmony than the major triad; for how far would we come in a progression from one chord to the other?....And just as the womanly sex without the man would be quite bad, thus with music it would be in a bad way if we had no other harmony than which the minor triad gives. We could not once make an authentic cadence.'

Sorg 1745-1747

Similarly Schoenberg (1911) construes the traditional pairing of major and minor as attraction and repulsion, and as being 'natural and familiar as in male and female'.
The word 'feminine' in music theory is generally associated with weakness.

'feminine: Term used in such phrases as feminine cadence and feminine ending to denote relative weakness, e.g. the final chord is reached on a 'weak' beat of the bar. Second subjects in sonata form are sometimes described as 'feminine' meaning gentler than the first subject. This is a hangover from the age when women were regarded as the weaker sex.'

The Concise Oxford Dictionary of Music 1980

Other dictionaries do not accord the interpretation of 'feminine' with historical backwardness.

'Feminine Cadence: a cadence in which the conclusive tonic chord is reached on a weak beat of the bar.'

The New Everyman Dictionary of Music 1988

'Feminine Ending: (feminine cadence, metacrusis) The melodic termination of a phrase or motif on a weak beat or on an unstressed part of a bar, usually by conjunct motion and thus often with an appoggiatura or suspension figure. The concept was introduced by J.-J. de Momigny and later elaborated by Riemann in the first volume of his Grosse Kompositionslehre (Berlin and Stuttgart, 1902); its name is apparently derived, by analogy, from feminine rhyme' (i.e. between words such as 'mustard' and 'custard').'

The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians 1980

The final chord of a cadence generally falls on a strong beat but when it falls on a weak beat it is called a feminine ending. The usual ending is not called a masculine ending unless it is being distinguished from a feminine ending, it is just called an ending because it is the most usual and therefore the most normal.

The sonata-allegro form used from the mid nineteenth century had a tradition of a main, opening theme which was called masculine and followed by a subsidiary theme called feminine. The opening, masculine theme is in the tonic key, later other, feminine themes
create a 'large scale dissonance that must be resolved' (The New Grove Dictionary 1980). The feeling of resolution which is then anticipated 'depends on a logic that assumes as natural the tonic protagonist's subjugation ...of whatever occupies the second narrative position,' (McClary 1991). Here, the semiotics of masculine and feminine in sonata form can also be related to art forms where there is a main, controlling character or theme and a subsidiary character or theme. This second alternative other can be any threat to identity that must submit to the dominating, original tonality. However it is a salient point that whatever fills the second narrative slot is understood on some fundamental level as 'feminine'. The second slot never gets the last word, has to be purged or domesticated. To conquer an enemy is to emasculate him, to make him 'other', to categorise him as female, ('they ran away like a bunch of women' said John Wayne).

h. The Treatment of the Feminine in Musical Form and Notation

and Male Desire

Susan McClary's 'Feminine Endings' (1991) is a groundbreaking analysis about the treatment of the "feminine" in the syntactical procedures and structural conventions, the narrative impulses underlying sonata form and in the tonality of music.

These unconscious conventions are most powerful and operate 'below the level of deliberate signification'. They unwittingly allow us to make sense of the music through these invisible imitable, deeply engrained habits.

Tonality has allowed the process of instilling expectations and the subsequent withholding of promised fulfilment until climax and this has been a principal means for arousing and channelling desire even without texts or programs. Music as various as Bach's fugues and Brahms's symphonies have 'whipped up torrents of libidinal energy' (Schenker 1973). The sexual desire and release constructed in the musical medium is often called tension and release or attraction and repulsion. In Wagner's Tristan prelude, the point of the opera would be missed if the sexual longing was not understood.
'Wagner's music relies heavily on the traditional semiotics of desire available in the musical styles he inherited and listeners understand his music in part because they too have learned the codes (the minor 6ths demanding resolution, the agony of the tritone, the expectation that a dominant seventh chord will proceed to its tonic, and so on) upon which his metaphors depend.'

McClary 1991

Music is very often concerned with desire, with mapping patterns through the medium of sound which resemble those of sexuality. In texted and dramatic music it is clear that gender issues (and those of race and class) are the subject, but in 'absolute' music there has been a denial that there is any meaning. At the time of Bizet's Carmen in the mid 1870's, portraits where men were seen as being seduced by feminine sensuality were thought to distract them from their quest. The men then cast the female down or are brought down themselves. Carmen is still very popular today and the sexual politics behind it are analyzed by McClary.

Carmen in her title role is portrayed as a 'dissonant other'. Her main musical entrances are through the Habanera and Seguid dances. Before singing she dances, often using sensual hip swings associated with this style of music (depending on the particular production). Carmen has immediately been established as an exotic character, she is portrayed as the temptress but no visualisation or script is needed for this tension involving desire and possible fulfilment and release to occur:

'In her opening "Habanera," for instance, her descent by half steps through the tetrachord D-to-A is arranged so that we grasp immediately the outline she implies (and thus are impelled to desire the suggested outcome); but the way she moves through that descent alternately coaxes and frustrates. What is set up as the normative rhythmic motion from D to C# is halted on C natural - a tentative pitch with a strong gravitational urge to move onward - where she plays with her expectations not only by lingering but also by
reciting in irregular triplets that strain against the beat. She rubs our noses in this rather funky chromatic inflection to make sure we get it. The B natural that follows is quick and encourages us to think she will slide immediately now to the expected goal; but the Bb, which ought to have been an inconsequential passing note on a weak pulse, is given an insinuating nudge by the declamation of the word "re-belle." While there is never any question of her tonal or melodic orientation in this phrase, her erratic means of descending through the tetrachord (and subsequently, the remainder of the scale—sometimes granting the tonic, but often withholding it sadistically at the last instant before implied gratification) reveals her as a "master" of seductive rhetoric. She knows how to hook and manipulate desire. In her musical discourse she is slippery, unpredictable, maddening: hers is the music we remember from the opera. She becomes José's obsession—and likewise the listener's.'

McClary 1991 p. 57-8

Carmen is set against Micaela in a Madonna-Whore arrangement. Her music is predominantly chromatic and rhythmically syncopated whilst Don José and the pure, chaste Micaela sing diatonically. The real central character is Don José because it is his fate which is at stake; we are viewing the opera through male eyes: 'After a lovely lyric opening, (Don Hosé) begins to construct musical images of fevered longing and dread, as he imagines Carmen as demon and then as object of desire. On the words "un seul désir, un seul espoir" (a single desire, a single hope), he sets up a pitch-ceiling that constricts his melodic line (thus recreating in sound the experience of frustration), which he penetrates on "te revoir, o Carmen". Following this explosive moment, his energy gradually seems to subside almost to a kind of whimpering. But as he sings of submitting himself masochistically to her power ("Et j'étais un chose à toi"), he rises again—this time through an unaccompanied scale—
and attains climax on Bb, the highest, most vulnerable pitch in the aria. Strangely, he sings to Carmen of his masturbatory practices right at the moment when she expects them to make love. He reconverts her back into a distanced object of desire even in her presence; he manages to “transcend” only by so doing (though the treacherous chromatic harmonisation of his leading tone in mm. 44-45 indicates the extent to which Carmen has undermined his diatonic confidence: her influence almost prevents this hard won cadence at the last moment). Unlike the dialogues between Escamillo (the Toreador) and Carmen, in which genuine interaction appears to take place, José’s moment of great passion is his self-absorbed monologue, his internalized metaphysical narrative that has no room for another human voice.’

McClary 1991 p.59

The opera closes with the traditional musical, structural conventions. Despite the excitement of the gypsy music it is the duty ‘of the unfortunate white, male, high-art “victim,” ....finally to purge all traces of the exotic and chromatic, to restore social and musical order at any cost’. The convention of the eighteenth and nineteenth century is a resolution onto the tonic triad:

‘In the concluding scene outside the bullring, José insists that Carmen submit to his wishes while she continues to pull away. Unlike earlier scenes in which Bizet freely indulged in Carmen’s sexy music, this scene is informed by the necessity of tonal closure. As José pleads with Carmen to give in, the harmonic bass line turns into a maddeningly slippery chromatic floor. Not only Jose but also the listener (who is, knowingly or not, trained in terms of classical tonal discourse through exposure to film scores and television) longs for this fool of chromaticism to be stopped, for stability to be re-established – even though we know that the triumph of tonal closure means the violent murder of Carmen. Bizet’s musical strategies, in other words, set up almost unbearable tensions that cause the
listener not only to accept Carmen's death as "inevitable," but actually to desire it.'

This analysis of the music itself shows Carmen as 'other', not only because of her gender but also because of her race and social class. The interpretation points to how the music signifies the fear of the 'other' and how in spite of José's need for Carmen he had to destroy her and thus conquer his own attraction to/with the female.

i. Timbre and Gender

In western art music timbre has been constrained by the insistence on standardised purity which compensates for the harmonic-rhythmic framework. The focus of the music is a codified harmonic and rhythmic structure which restricts a fully 'relational' notation, unfettered by a standardised framework. However, pure timbres are like explicit musical languages, they are comparable to 'readerly texts', the 'separation' of the visual, and they are alienating in that in their 'completeness' they allow little participation; they say it all (Shepherd 1991).

Timbres articulate and reproduce gender identities because in their 'completeness' is encoded the desire to pin down and control culture and the material world. Social male-female fertility is both contained and aurally denied; in Barthes terms, the grain of the voice is flattened to filter out jouissance, thrill and erotic ecstasy (Barthes 1977).

'...the sounds essential to meaning within the 'classical' tradition have been stripped down as far as possible to a small number of homogeneous units or atoms....Notes stripped of much of their inherent sonic possibilities thus form the framework for a musical 'code' or realization of the brand of individualism characteristic of industrial capitalist societies.'

Shepherd 1991

The homogeneity of pitches, rhythms and timbres represents a finite, closed repeatable musical system which mirrors capitalist
social relations (Attali 1977). Everything that is 'allowed' in western art music is spelled out, logical and must be apparent, the music must not be ambiguous. The notes act as homogenous building blocks which are used to construct the complex but carefully planned manuscripts yet do not direct the ear to their internal qualities but away to their unambiguous relationship with other notes (Shepherd 1991). The scale that relates adjacent keys was developed, following the medieval modes, and as a consequence previously autonomous melodic shape became subservient to a unified harmonic scheme.

Timbres render productiveness and the relational unimportant by reflecting the essential male bourgeois, bureaucratic explicitness of harmony. The fertility of social femaleness and social maleness becomes redundant and gender relations are thereby rendered safe and non-threatening. As in 'the male gaze' music has been constructed for 'the male ear', rendering feminine interpretations irrelevant. The music of 'Western high art' is founded on the 'rightness' of notational control of pitch and rhythm as expressed through pure and standardised timbres.

j. The Madwoman and Hysteric

Women's madness has historically been defined as different from men's madness because of a discourse which explains a gendered madness. The individual in distress and who is suffering experiences that distress in a way which is defined by the particular discourse associated with men's or women's madness.

Sexuality for male and female has long been associated with insanity (witches were seen as castrators for instance), but its confirmation as a form of illness needing psychiatric help was confirmed in the nineteenth century and included masturbation, illegitimate pregnancy, homosexuality, frigidity, promiscuity and nymphomania. For women, sex itself or sex outside marriage became pathologised in the nineteenth century (Foucault 1979). McClary (1991) asserts 'that in classical music the erotic . . .(is) . . . framed as a manifestation of feminine evil while masculine high culture is regarded as transcendental. And the pervasive cultural
anxiety over women as obstacles to transcendence justifies ...narratives of the victimised male and the necessary purging and containment of the female' (McClary 1991).

It has been analyzed by contemporary writers that men's juxtaposed images of women as being the 'angel' or the 'castrating sexual monster' manifested itself in a particular way in the nineteenth century (Ussher 1991). Women were labelled mad if they did not conform to social convention and the hysterical women became both a figure of fun and an object of fear and contempt but often viewed with a voyeuristic interest. As madness was so closely related to sexuality, mad women were considered too sexual, outside of accepted moral values and therefore bad (Gilbert and Gubar 1979).

Male composers projected their own fears and fantasies onto women characters and performers, raising an image of the male flirting with madness and dangerous sexuality and then reimposing control. The links between madness, women and music are exemplified in the prima donna whose moments of excess are their own raison d'être (McClary 1991). The women were represented on stage as demented, distraught, frantic, and abandoned, with their bodies displayed in delirium (Clément 1989). Historically the mass popularity of madwomen appealed to sensationalism and nowhere was this made more explicit than in the dramatic music of opera, for instance, Donizetti's nymph, Lucia; Strauss's Salome; Schoenberg's antiheroine in Erwartung.

3. Women's music has been considered creatively inferior, absent
   and/or stereotyped
a. creatively inferior
Society's ideas about what and who constitutes genius are gendered and have historical roots. God had been perceived as male and as He was also regarded as the Creator, all 'great' creative works must have been in His image i.e. fashioned by males. Genius had therefore become a term used to give the supposed physical superiority of males a metaphysical status. The term genius originated in ancient Rome and had emerged from the
ancient Stoic doctrine of the logos spermatikos (the spermatic word). At first it meant a protective spirit for the family and then it came to mean the personification of patriarchal power (as in the Roman Emperor).

Medieval writers always interpreted Genius as a male usually connected with a divine or perfect male reproductive energy. Genius was both creative and procreative. When creating a work of art it was seen as being almost like an act of procreation. 'For a male, art is already displaced sexuality; for a female it is already misplaced sexuality' (Battersby 1989 p. 70).

More modern ideas about genius came about during the last decades of the eighteenth century. At this time it was originality rather than talent which became important. The new desirable qualities appeared to match those which had previously been attributed to women; being emotional, instinctive and closer to nature than reason. Some males appropriated these qualities for themselves drawing on the ancient ideas of male sexuality representing genius to evolve what Battersby calls 'The Third Sex', a feminine male who is like a woman but not a woman. Males can pride themselves on passivity whilst some women are accused of being loud and hysterical because, although femininity is associated with passivity, femaleness is not. And anyway it is not so much being male which is prized as being "not-nature" and "not female" (Spretnak 1991). Males can be feminine and superior, hence the need to separate the biologically given 'female' from the culturally moulded 'feminine'. The way the romantic concept of genius is gendered 'was forged at the point where two modes of misogyny meet.....the creative and the procreative' (Battersby 1989).

Arthur Schopenhauer's 'On Genius' and 'On Women' (1851) expressed undisguised contempt for women whom he called 'the second sex'. He describes women as little more than domestic and reproductive slaves and placed them as members of an inferior, semi-human race. His Romantic notion of genius is the supermale guided by something over and above himself to which he surrenders his ego. The outside force includes civilization, culture and the
perfection of the race. Women are said to be guided only by nature and their procreative function whilst ordinary males are in a struggle between self and nature. Battersby (1989) notes that there are uncomfortable links between the rise of European fascism and the cult of genius that are 'integral to the traditions of European culture'.

Otto Weininger's (celebrated) 'Sex and Character' (1903), argued that the perfect male includes the female within himself but that 'woman herself is only part of the Universe and that part never can be the whole; femaleness can never include genius'. He also supposed that women lacked memory, the capacity for real love, individuality, will, a sense of worth and value, the faculty for taking notice and any higher consciousness. What he says she does have is a strong, natural instinct for motherhood which can make her sexually rampant.

Weininger, himself Jewish, amazingly took on the current caricature of Jewish men which was that they were feminine and went around together like women. He claimed that only by renouncing Judaism could they aspire to higher creativity. Weininger shot himself in the room in which Beethoven had died in October 1903.

Charles Darwin's 'The Decent of Man' (1871) construes that the male has inborn superiority and that some so called feminine virtues like intuition, perception and imitation were also characteristics of 'the lower races' and were degenerate.

John Stuart Mill (1869) found a 'deficiency of originality' and a lack of 'great and luminous new ideas' in women, whilst Friedrich Nietzsche (1883-5) found that to create a great art work one needed 'Physiologically: the creative instinct of the artist and the distribution of semen in his blood'.

Edward Naumann in his 'History of Music' (1882) said 'all creative work is well known as being the exclusive work of men.' Sigmund Freud (1932) found that women were not born inferior but
in order to resolve the Oedipal drama they are socially conditioned into social, intellectual, moral and creative inferiority.

Influential shapers of modernity such as Marx, Nietzsche, and Freud '...were skewed by their own patriarchal attempts to smash the inescapable bonds with the Earthbody, the female body and the "stifling" female realm of the domestic. After attacking and displacing the old ways, they established themselves as the controlling fathers of the new, the daring, the disconnected' (Spretnak 1991).

Examples of how prominent (male) thinkers have historically proscribed women's abilities as a negative, lacking and absent, are numerous and have had their impact on contemporary culture. There have been voices which challenged these assertions but they have not been heard so widely. Johanna Schopenhauer, Arthur's mother, disagreed vehemently with Arthur's ideas about women's creative inferiority. Gina Lombroso-Ferrero's 'The Soul of Woman' (1924) challenged her father Cesare's 'The Female Offender' (Lombroso 1893) in which he wrote that women were not capable of reason or moral conscience. Simone de Beauvoir's 'The Second Sex' (1949) was an ironical contestation of Schopenhauer's misogynistic writings.

It is difficult to criticize the writing and thinking of historical figures in such a short space but, more to the point, because of the time and context in which these people were writing. The circumstances which allow feminist criticism on matters of gender and history (including issues of race, class and sexual preference) are a matter of contemporary readiness and awareness. It is important to be aware, especially in a study about oppression, that it is members of the professional middle classes that have the opportunity to impose their definition on the world and that, in the very act of critical writing, writers can be repeating that oppression. Current thinking about gender and history refers to 'the bad faith' of new historicism or the
way it repeats what it criticises others for doing (Hirsch 1990).

The intention here is to gain an insight into the thinking of relevant historical figures who may have informed predominantly held beliefs of their time in order to clarify current thinking and the belief system from which it comes. Evidence can only be selective and cursory yet it is the contention here that we know through current practices, theories and feelings that women's music has been judged by standards imposed by a male dominated society and affected by restrictions historically placed on women.

Women's restrictions in music have concealed women's creative abilities more than in any other art form. Women have traditionally suffered from lack of training and equal educational opportunities.

'Even within the last decade the writer has heard of German teachers who absolutely refused to teach women the science of harmony, because, as they declared, no woman could understand it....Another way in which conditions have been peculiarly favourable for the development of the composing faculty in men is that they have always breathed in the midst of musical environments. When a Bach or a Haydn is discovered to have a voice, he immediately becomes a choir boy, and being a boy he knows he may someday become choir master, so he observes the effects which may be produced from the organ, or the effects in chorus singing.'

Clarke 1895

Helen Clarke talks about how women were refused access to learning about music theory and composition and then goes on to the less concrete but equally important aspect of a person's advancement, that of the self-fulfilling prophecy. It has been well documented, especially in studies around issues of social class and education in the 1960's and 70's, that if people are given to understand at an early age that they will or will not achieve certain things, and are treated as such then the given circumstance is likely to come about. In Rist (1970) a widely
acclaimed study it was pointed out that 'the thrust of educational experience should be towards diversity not homogeneity' and that 'class barriers ...result in inequality in the social and economic life of the citizenry'. In the study it was found that 'lower groups were in numerous ways informed of their lower status and were socialised for a role of lower self expectations and also for respect and deference towards those of higher status'. Issues of gender can be interpreted in exactly the same way.

Mr Meadows-White, married to the composer Alice Mary Smith (1839-1884), was asked for a response to the question of why there have been few great women composers.

'There is no doubt that, where there is one woman who from circumstances has been able to cultivate such studies (composition and a general education comparable to that of men), there have been thousands and millions of men whose education has gone as far as their capacity allowed them... There is no doubt that a woman when she is married has other duties which may prevent her from occupying all her time in musical composition.'

Meadows-White 1882-3

It appears from Mr Meadows-White's perspective that women were not expected to achieve in composition but also that they had another role in the domestic sphere which would have to be fulfilled whether or not they became successful in their work. Amy Fay (1900) contended that women's self confidence had been so usurped by current theories about their inadequacies and their 'proper' role that they had been unable to take their own aspirations and talents seriously. Ruskin wrote:

(Women's intellect is)...not for invention or creation, but for sweet ordering, arrangement and decision'.... and that 'knowledge should be given her as may enable her to understand and even to aid the work of men.'

Ruskin 1865
Ruskin's work, in 'Of Queen's Gardens', an essay contained in his book 'Sesame and Lilies' (1865), epitomised the attitude taken by men towards middle class women and girls. The women and girls were 'put on a pedestal', were admired for so called feminine virtues such as modesty, grace, charm, beauty and talent. However, as Grabrucker (1988) pointed out, for a girl it was considered that 'there can be no great musical genius but she might develop a nice little talent'. It seems that the reason women were so described was due to a fear by men that women would take over in the field of music, just as a 'petticoat parliament' was feared when women were about to have equal voting rights and that women would 'wear the trousers' if they were allowed to wear trouser suits to work in the 1960's and so on. Neuls-Bates writes:

'Alarmed by women's growing presence, critics decried what they saw as a feminization of music, with its inevitable deterioration, and they developed theories that maintained the innate inferiority of women as composers. George Upton, the Chicago Critic made an early formulation of one such theory in his influential book 'Women in Music' of 1880.....Women, Upton allows, could serve as muse for inspiration to male composers, and they could also interpret, especially as singers; but they could not write music - that is, great music'.

Neuls-Bates 1982

b. Absent
i. Absent from spiritual life

The music of post-Renaissance Europe was primarily sacred music, organised and controlled by the Christian church although a great deal of music was played outside its jurisdiction. 'The art of formal composition was born in the great churches of Europe' (Larousse Encyclopedia of Music 1965, p.53) and that art, evolved from the early Christian church with its antecedents in the chants of Jewish synagogue music, was exclusive of women. Sophie Drinker complained that women have been devalued in the spiritual life of world religions. Their life bringing, healing ways have been neglected, especially in the creative arts of music and
healing of body and spirit. Women, being half the spiritual life of humanity should be key figures in religious and social institutions (Drinker 1948). It seems that an historical association between music and sexuality which caused men to fear 'women's temptations' resulted in women's voices being silenced thus ensuring men's control by removing this area of vulnerability.

Sexuality may be the factor which contains the roots of the prejudice against women musicians although Sonia Gergis is concerned that music conveys more than the sensual and physically exciting, but that music is a powerful means of communication capable of conveying a variety of messages, rising to the 'spiritually sublime' and that women need to be part of that whole expression (Gergis 1993).

In the story of Hildegard von Bingen, the twelfth century abbess, Jean Moore writes, as Hildegarde, to show how she regarded the importance of music in spiritual life

'(there)... was always the music, for music expresses most deeply the soul's yearning to sing praises to its creator, and echoes most clearly the harmonies of heaven...But in the last year of my life the music was silenced. We were placed under an interdict by the Archbishop and forbidden to sing the office or to receive communion....Instructed in a vision, I wrote to the Archbishop, asking him to lift the interdict and reminding him that those who silence music in this life can have no fellowship with the praise of the angels in heaven. The interdict was lifted and the music goes on.'

Moore 1993, p18-19

Women had devised music in songs of birth, rebirth in death, songs of womanhood and of marriage, songs of work and songs of fantasy and all aspects of life, itself identified with rhythm and sound which have magic power and women considered more closely related to the life force than men. There was a gradual
repression of women and a refusal of their participation in ritual and the music of the ritual, nor were they allowed to make their own music. In this they lost the 'self confidence in their own powers to be a dynamic beneficent influence on humanity' (Drinker 1948, p.182), for they were denied the pooling and sharing of their own communal values which through ritual and music become established in the creative collective consciousness.

(Women have) a unique experience that touches the heights and depths of emotion and sensation....Primitive woman had begun to put this experience into ritual and music ...But just as her attempt to evolve her own religion and music from her own experience began to approach the forms of civilized art, woman received a death blow from man's schematic religions.'

Drinker 1948

The rites and music of women in the religions of Brahmanism, Buddhism, Confucianism, Orthodox Judaism, Ecclesiastical Christianity and in Islam were outlawed at points in history soon after men founded these schematic religions. As Matthew Fox (1991) says, 'Religion often legitimizes the oppression of women with a kind of divine sanction.'

In 1676 Pope Innocent XI banned women from the stage; hence the need for Castrati. There is still a tradition of all male choirs in cathedrals and some churches, a tradition which dates back centuries but is widely accepted today. James Gibbons Hunecker, writing in 1915, said 'Mother Church does right in banishing from within the walls of her temple the female voice. The world, the flesh and the devil link in the larynx of the soprano or alto.' This statement is a reminder nearly two thousand years on of what the early patriarchs must have felt facing older religions in which women's power, sexuality and music were honoured.

Jewish women have played an important role in their communities but they have been excluded from the liturgy and their role in
the development of Jewish music is not recognised. A Talmud tract states 'The voice of woman is temptation'.

It is likely that the myths perpetrated about women in the world religions are concerned with men's anxiety about sexuality which is placed on women and inevitably on women's music. Millett explains this; '...religion itself (is) dependent on the fallacy of sin, in turn conditional on the lie that the female is sexuality itself and therefore an evil worthy of condign punishment' (Millett 1970).

ii Absent because of hierarchical structures
Against a background of fear and contempt for women's music, nineteenth century industrialisation offered its own patriarchal culture. Born out of capitalism with its female domestic sphere and public male sphere of paid work, capitalism requires the population to be structured into performing certain functions. The functions performed by women are subordinate to those performed by men. In Marxism it is called the sexual division of labour although it is not explained why the division has to be a sexual division or why within these sexual divisions women are subordinate to men (Deem 1978, p22-23). In an examination of the divisiveness of women's experience in music making, the following quotations represent attitudes which dismiss women as intellectually inferior and creatively incapable: 'Reproductive genius can be admitted to the pretty sex, but productive genius unconditionally cannot ...there will never be a woman composer' (Bulow 1879).

'Woman reaches results mainly by intuitions....(Music) is not only an art, but an exact science, and, in its highest form, mercilessly logical and unrelentingly mathematical. The imagination does not have a free flight, but is bounded within the limits of form. The mere possession of the poetical imagination and the capacity to receive music in its fullest emotional power will not lead one to the highest achievements in musical art....it does not seem that woman will ever originate music in its fullest and grandest harmonic forms. She will always be the recipient
and interpreter, but there is little hope she will be the creator.'

George Upton 1880

In the mid twentieth century when the status of women had improved to some degree, Seashore in his article 'Why No Great Women Composers' made his own negative assessment:

'Women's fundamental urge is to be beautiful, loved and adored as a person; man's urge is to provide and achieve in a career......In the graduate school I have observed that when a woman of marked achievement and fine personality is invested with the doctor's hood, there is a young man around the corner: we hear the wedding march, love's goal is reached, and the promising Ph.D. settles down and gets fat'

Carl E. Seashore 1940

iii Absence forced through practical/economic controls

To gain a realistic picture of the situation for women musicians it is useful to consult women musicians themselves. Ethel Smyth, an established composer and an outspoken campaigner for women's political and musical rights, had this to say:

'There is not at this present moment one single middle-aged woman alive who has had the musical education that has fallen to men as a matter of course, without effort on their part, ever since music was.'

Ethel Smyth 1933

Society had excluded women from professional music, as composers, instrumentalists and conductors. Women's musical ability was encouraged as an accomplishment only, and on a limited range of instruments. Women's music in the home, their work songs, lullabies and their teaching of children through song had been taken for granted and ignored.

Ethel Smyth, born in 1858, carved a musical career against great opposition. Her achievements, however, must also be seen in the light of her family's social class; they were wealthy enough to pay for her to study music in Germany.
Women's financial dependence, their role in the domestic sphere rather than in the sphere of paid work, has greatly limited their music. Virginia Woolf wrote in 1929 that to write a woman needed 'a room of one's own' and £500 a year. To be a musician a great deal more than that was needed. There was payment for instruments, for lessons and for composition classes as well as living expenses. If the woman's talent was for orchestral rather than chamber work there was the cost of printing scores, of halls, of musicians and the 'price to pay' for being a woman.

iv Absent through cultural notions of women's role
Even wealth and status at this time were not enough to find acceptance for women studying composition. Mabel Daniels's experience in the score reading class at the Munich Conservatory in 1902 illustrates how women have to fight generalisations about what they may or may not do:

'I began my enquiries about the Partitur Lesen (score reading) class of which I had read in the catalogue,....five years ago women were not allowed to study counterpoint at the conservatory. In fact anything more advanced than elementary harmony was debarred.. The ability of the feminine intellect to comprehend the intricacies of stretto, or cope with double counterpoint in the tenth, if not openly denied, was severely questioned....

"I should like to enter the Partitur Lesen class," said I innocently, not having learned all this......If I had thrown a bombshell they could not have appeared more startled.'

Mabel Daniels

Mabel Daniels went on to do the score reading class as the only woman with thirty men. She returned to the United States to pursue a long and distinguished career as a composer.

There has been an almost open bias that women, ethnic minorities and those whose sexual orientation is not heterosexual, should be kept out of conducting. Lebrecht (1991) found that 'Given the prejudices of record companies and the predominance of middle class values in concert life, blacks, women and known homosexuals
Historically, women composers have been described as being the wives, sisters or lovers of recognised male musicians, even when their gifts were equally as great. Of the nineteenth century German composers, Mendelssohn and Schumann are well known but many people have not heard of Fanny Mendelssohn, Felix's gifted sister, who also composed. Several of her works were published under his name. Clara Schumann, married to Robert, was an extraordinary woman who composed, bore eight children, nursed him through his final madness and maintained her career as one of the foremost virtuoso concert pianists in Europe throughout her life.

Lebrecht (1991) discerns 'a thaw' in the traditions which outlaw women conductors. In London Iona Brown was chosen to direct the Academy of St Martin-in-the-fields, whilst Jane Glover has conducted opera at Glyndbourne and the London Mozart Players, and Odeline de Le Martinez formed her own modernist ensemble. None have gained positions within international orchestras and Lebrecht calculates that despite improvements, the art and its consumers are imprisoned by tradition.

v. Absent from the history books

Little has been passed down from the convents where for centuries within their all female world, women, (within a male led church) controlled their own situations and exercised their creativity. For example, Hildegard von Bingen, whose books on science, cosmology, holistic medicine, scripture, and history as well as thirteynine paintings, seventytwo songs and an opera, went almost unnoticed by male dominated theological schools for eight centuries.

In the folk tradition, before women could read, history was passed down from mother to daughter. A child's nurse might have the history of their country in ballads. This aspect of women's music is ignored in traditional music history. Similarly, we learn about the male Troubadors of the middle ages but not the female Troubairitz who wrote and sang music which is being revived
and sung today. Their lyrics are among the only female witnesses from a culture which has deeply affected our own.

It may be surprising to learn that, despite all the difficulties, prejudices and moral sanction that women musicians have endured, women were more present in all fields of music than they have been credited with (see Neuls-Bates 1982, Bowers and Tick 1986, Peacock-Jezic 1988, Briscoe 1987, Pendle 1991 for anthologies and histories of women's music). For some women the need to be creative somehow managed to overcome society's strictures:

'The heightened activity of women as performers, music teachers, and patrons in the club movement in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries was paralleled in the field of composition by a significant increase in the number of women seeking to enter the ranks of art music composition. There had been, throughout the nineteenth century, a large number of women composers in the realm of popular music, amateurs mainly, writing parlour songs and dance music for piano. Their activity was seemingly deemed acceptable, or so lack of comment in the contemporary literature would indicate. By contrast, the influx of women into the loftier realm of art music - Le Beau and Smyth were part of this generation and at its forefront - occasioned a strong opposition that raged for more than thirty years'.

Neuls-Bates 1982

In Aaron Cohen's 'International Encyclopedia of Women Composers' 1987 he lists thousands of women and estimates that women must have accounted for about ten per cent of composers.

c. Stereotyped

The feminine stereotype which is stamped on women is the product of masculine discourses in traditional music history. Interpretations of women's music have been made by men which (unconsciously) reproduce the ideologies of our society. Music criticism therefore becomes an ideological practice based on established male standards which assume their own appropriate
norm rather than a neutral and objective exercise. The critic may be constrained by, for instance, language, codes of music, ideologies of music institutions, writings on music and meanings of music. These constraints provide a framework for understanding the significance of sexual difference in our culture. Women's position in culture is based on cultural myths and ideologies which define what is masculine and feminine. The characterization of women's art becomes biologically determined. 'The stereotype is a product of patriarchal culture which constructs male dominance through the significance it attaches to sexual differences' (Mary Ellmann 1968).

In nineteenth and twentieth century bourgeois society, the enforcement of women's economic and social position manifested itself in the elaboration of women's 'natural femininity' and women's 'divinely ordained domesticity'. Ruskin, in 'Sesame and Lilies' (1867) considered men as being in the outside world of work whilst women adorned the home and protected traditional, moral and spiritual values in a new industrial society.

For women musicians there were ramifications of these entrenched views which affected the way their music was received. This concerns the immutability with which a gendered view has defined women's music. The system of sexual aesthetics which has analyzed music in terms of masculine and feminine traits has been defined as in the following:

'...with the advent of music criticism and music journalism in nineteenth century Germany, "strong" instrumental music such as symphonies, concerti, and operas was considered masculine, and sentimental or melodious music was considered feminine. More active = masculine; more passive, more lyrical = feminine. Femininity in music was equated with beautiful melodies, refinement and sensitivity. Vocal music was considered appropriate for women, since it manifested most clearly the above named characteristics. But as far as instrumental music was concerned, harmony and counterpoint were often considered too intellectual, too logical for a
One of the main problems which have faced women musicians is the assumption that women are concerned with music as an accomplishment only. Along with embroidery, tasteful drawings, and the ability to speak French, middle class women were encouraged to sing and play an appropriate instrument. These talents were to stress 'femininity' and to help secure a husband. They were certainly not to be taken seriously or considered as the means by which a woman could make a living or make a name for herself. Women played the harp and the violin as solo instruments to entertain family and friends but not in public because it was considered by 'polite' society that middle class women should live their lives entirely in the home.

The legacy of this belief system (and in some cases the full, initial meaning behind it) remains with us in the twentieth century as a stronghold of prejudice against women orchestral musicians playing a public role. By tradition women violinists have been somewhat acceptable and the harpist was almost always female. The London Philharmonic Orchestra, founded in 1932, took on its first woman musician in 1963 apart from the customary woman harpist who was there from the beginning. Women currently make up eight of the thirty violinists, three of the twelve viola players, one of the ten cellists one of the three flautists and one of the three oboe players. They play no other instruments in the brass or percussion sections. The harpist is now a man.

Even within the range of instruments open to women their physical strength has been questioned; Cloison, (1944) found that '...frail young women .....exert a pressure of several tons as their little fingers pound on the ivories.' Countless women have, of course, demonstrated that they can play their instruments to a highly skilled and professional standard. 'I think the stereotype of woman as amateur is still highly detrimental to us as professionals and aspiring professionals' (Van de Vate 1981).
The strictures which have contained and limited women musicians deeply affected them as women and as artists. A whole array of social attitudes, prejudices and practical problems, all linked to the 'angel in the house' idea that ruled women's conduct, have classified women and their music in a particular feminine mould and the reasons are historical and traditional.

4. The Power of Historical/Traditional Precedents and Psychological Conditioning

a. Words in Music: Meaningless or Offensive?

We are born into a pre-existing world of meaning which shapes our experiences of femininity and masculinity through defining, among other things, the meaning of sexual difference. This is done primarily through language which structures and orders our reality.

'Much of the discrimination in language can be understood as an effect of who creates meaning. Men have long pronounced on linguistic rules and conventions and women have long been excluded from those religious, educational and political institutions whose job it was to establish meaning and define social order.'

Crowley and Himmelweit 1992

In song texts, delineation of characters in opera and in literary sources of programme music, a whole array of prejudices can be found which, when isolated from the music, spoken and interpreted presents itself as an embarrassing legacy from previous generations. Having said this, an examination of much contemporary music, apart from avoiding jingoism, still confronts us with some amazingly biased and harmful rhetoric.

If this is challenged the response is often that it is the music itself which compels people to listen rather than the words. In Western Art Music (or in Pop) words might be meaningless or offensive, but we listen without criticism. At the last night of the Promenade concerts traditionally every year, songs are sung which are nationalistic and hark back to an age where colonialist power and empire building were considered right and just
principles. Mark Elder refused to conduct the 1990 last night in the season of Promenade concerts if these songs were to be included because he considered it would be insensitive at a time when there was a threat of war in the gulf. Another conductor was found.

Songs sung in schools and colleges where the words would never dare be spoken though fear of contravening the sex discrimination act or the race relations act are brought out every year for the next generation to enjoy their traditional musical heritage. When I was at college all the music students were compelled to join the choir. Some of the students objected to the crass words which they were expected to sing in a particular song. Looking back I believe the tutor thought the objection was being made because some of the students did not want to be in the choir. However the situation became entrenched and the students stopped singing completely when it came to the offensive words and then resumed singing afterwards, right to the performance.

Many of us overlook the words, but to what extent are these messages subliminal? Do we really overlook them? If a song was in praise of paedophilia would we still say that the words are unimportant and we didn't understand it anyway? Perhaps because a song is in another language or because the listener cannot or does not follow the words but it is the music on which the attention is focused. Clément (1989) calls this 'risk free identification'. It is the seductive pull of the music rather than the content of the verbal text that compels people to particular musical genres and they do not want to hear any negative assessments of an aspect of the music they love. The consequent denial of the words is also a denial of women, (cf section 2d) 'Opera concerns women...they suffer, they cry, they die..touch them and they sing Lasciatemi morir (let me die).. It is the abandoned nymph's lament, the lament of every Dido and every Ariadne, the lament of women' (Clément 1989).

The unconscious, however, does not hear with the same deaf ear. As with pornography, we don't want to be exposed to these texts.
Not only are they abruptly offensive, but we also know that everything we absorb in some way becomes part of us.

Life, death and sex are the usual topics in the librettos of operas and in the words of songs. Behind the familiar romantic fantasy and integral to the stories are fraternal and reactionary ideas which reflect society's rules of sexual and hegemonic control.

The words of songs are typically framed from a male point of view and this could mean the use of the generic 'man' or whole plots which cast society in a patriarchal mould. Alerting listeners to this can provoke defensive reactions and they become protective of their traditions or consider it unimportant and trivial.

Language enters our consciousness at a subliminal level from an early age. The first language we hear may well be cloaked in song. Marianne Grabrucker (1988) wanted to find out exactly how society passed on its gendered roles, so she monitored all the experiences of her newly born daughter in the form of a diary:

3rd April 1984    Anneli aged 2 years 8 months
'We're at the free music centre in Munich - part of the local alternative scene - at a course in music and movement for three year olds. There are four other girls, a boy and six mothers there. The course leader is a man. A story is read from a picture book and is then reinterpreted in music and movement. We all stand in a row and sing 'I'm little Balthazar and I'm not afraid' - five girls, six women one boy and one man. I notice that Anneli, who has recently been struggling with the definitions of girl and boy and what she is herself, is puzzled. Why has the course leader, who knew beforehand how many girls there were to be in the class, selected a story with a boy as the main character and then had them all sing it? It would be inconceivable for a boy to define himself as a girl! Just imagine six fathers five boys, one woman and a girl singing, 'I'm little Barbara and I feel really scared.'
10th April 1984  Anneli aged 2 years 8 months

At the same music centre - the same scenario as last week, but with a different story and the same cast for the 'tragedy' (that's how I see it). What do we sing this time? 'I'm the little Hevelmann' (the Hevelmann is a bedtime story addressed to a little boy). This is what girls are taught; no wonder we women are plunged into identity crises, we were never allowed to develop one, and still aren't.

Grabrucker 1988

Not everyone notices the words they are singing at a sharp level of awareness because we have become so used to androcentric language that it often does not take our attention. The music itself can make one forget the words but the story or plot is set into the subconscious, working innocently, plainly visible to all but outside the code of the enjoyment and delight of the music.

b. Conditioning

'Give me a child until he is seven, and I will give you the man' quoted a sociological study starting in the 1950's before there was any great awareness that using the generic 'he' and 'man' really does exclude girls and women because women's discourse (in the Foucauldian sense) is different from that of men. However, there is some evidence that our perceptions of ourselves and of the world that are formed in early life have a lasting and determining affect upon us. This is most definitely the case for girls as it is for boys. Socialisation into gendered roles occurs as soon as the sex of a child is known. The implications for music are as deep and profound as in any other aspect of life:

20th November 1983  Anneli aged 2 years 3 months

'Anneli takes a record of a Schubert symphony out and wants to play it because she likes the sleeve so much. Then she inquires, 'which man is it playing?' I just manage to choke back the answer. 'Someone I don't know' and instead point out that it might just as well be a woman. So then she asks me the woman's name. I invent a woman's name. The extent to which she already accepts the masculine principle still
bothers me, (only later, does the connection become clear).

26th March 1984  Anneli aged 2 years 7 months
'The three of us are having breakfast. On the radio someone is playing a jew's harp. Klaus is impressed and says, 'He's a fantastic player.' I give him a look. Two days previously we had been looking at this diary so now he adds, 'or she, I don't know which.' Anneli is listening attentively.'

18th September 1984  Anneli aged 3 years 1 month
'Anneli notices the sleeve of an album of classical music lying around. She asks, 'Does that man play the music?' pointing to the picture. I answer yes. At the same time I suddenly remember the situation a year ago when I failed to grasp why Anneli assumed that making music was a male prerogative. Now it's quite clear to me. I look through our records and discover that out of ninetyfive sleeves only three show a picture of a woman; two of these are classical paintings of women, the third is a doll. The other pictures are of landscapes, towns, musical instruments and, over and over again, men in groups, quartets, orchestras, great masters. It's quite clear that music is made by men. The sleeves of light music are not much better. They only depict a woman if she is the star.'

6th March 1984  Anneli aged 2 years 7 months
I often play a little music with Anneli on the piano, the recorder, the guitar or her tambourine. She sings nicely and after a few attempts manages all the notes of a children's song she knows. I think or imagine that she's musically gifted. All mothers at some point think their child might be a genius. I'm no different and I fantasise about the great things she might achieve in music. Names occur to me: Menuhin, Stern, Barenboim, Gould, Karajan, Furtwangler, Orff. All of them men - not a single woman's name occurs to me, although I'm perfectly aware there are some very talented women musicians. They're famous too, but their not geniuses. To my horror I find myself ready instinctively to
abandon my wild dreams of great musical genius, because she's a girl. In a fraction of a second the idea flashes through my mind. She's a woman, so she won't be a great genius but she might develop a nice little talent.

What effect might such an attitude have? Am I likely to give up believing its not worth investing effort in an unobtainable goal? How many girls who really were born to genius has this happened to in the course of history? Perhaps its not only the conscious falsification of history that has left us so few female geniuses, but the fact that lack of faith deterred young girls from the very start. The genius in the Mozart family might otherwise have been called Amanda rather than Amadeus'

Grabrucker 1988

Social conditioning of this kind rarely creates tension with a boy's environment because we are so concerned with his sexual identity. In a patriarchal society any damage done to the male psyche could have far reaching consequences.

Both social and unconscious identifications can mould and influence us, so for instance, slips of the tongue, resistances to certain ideas and relationships and other unconscious phenomena appear to reinforce and confirm what we perceive in the social world.

c. A Psychoanalytic Model

The psychoanalytic tradition has been included because it may answer two interesting questions relevant to the discussion. Firstly, we ask why, in western culture, it is so often denied that music has social meaning yet at the same time there are claims of being transported and uplifted by it. Using a Freudo-Lacanian theoretical model we can postulate that music signifies, through the body, that we are still in a state of oneness with our mother. It is able to lull us into the security of infancy. Because music is not rational, like language or other systems of signs (Barthes 1985), it is as though there is a link with the mother's body. 'Just as those infantile feelings antedate social
meaning and thus are held to be infinitely superior to it, so
music's power lies in the simultaneous transcendental
meaningfulness/meaninglessness' (McClary 1991).

For those who love opera the unknown words please an ear which
has been released from meaning, so the opera is 'made to speak
to that part of childhood that hears the mother, feels her close
by, without yet knowing the meaning of those caressing words'
(Clément 1989).

It could be then, that music's power to transform, inform and
mould us may go even deeper than we think. To the extent that we
like what we know and what we know is the music we heard as we
grew, in some sense we are culturally bound to a limited range
of music. The messages in the music we are so used to hearing,
and interpreting at a subconscious, pre-linguistic level, are
inevitably comfortable and familiar. It is not surprising that
there is resistance to having one's own music challenged.

Secondly, a post-Kleinian theory of sexuality helps us find out
why there has been such a resistance to women creating music and
to women taking part in certain musical performances and rituals.

Mothers relate to their daughters with a greater sense of
symbiosis and identification than they do to their sons, to the
extent that daughters may be felt as extensions of or identical
to the mother (Choderow 1978). This poses specific difficulties
for girls in differentiating and separating themselves as
individuals and these issues become connected to ones of loss of
love and rejection. However, once women have differentiated
themselves as separate individuals they can identify themselves
as the primary source of fulfilment. In heterosexual
relationships women have to transfer their primary love object
to someone of a different sex whereas men, to a different member
of the same sex. Men therefore come nearer to a sense of oneness
with the mother in heterosexual sex than women can do, 'both
because of the historic situation of female mothering and the
fantasies and emotions associated with it, and because of men's
actual inabilities to be sensitive and caring, to 'mother' in short' (Ryan 1983).

This leaves heterosexual men in a situation where they need women in order to feel whole and connected to the life force and there is fear that this may be denied to them or that it will completely engulf them. The solution has been an attempt to control women and keep them as chattels. Fear and control are a potent mix which have resulted in oppression, assault, rape, witch burning and other violences. Women's music, which represents women's creativity, has been suppressed and controlled because of feelings of fear and apprehension about women's power.

From the point of view of western culture this kind of theorising is seen as opposition to the idea of individuality and self-will which is so greatly prized. Those who have raised questions admit that it is a thoroughly painful process to discover that the music which moves them emotionally and spiritually is so full of distasteful social messages. It can be even more traumatic to confront deep feelings concerning sexuality and relationship. This may be why many want to deny, ignore or challenge what is so overtly obvious and (given some informed analysis) what lay repressed.

5. Conclusion and Alternatives
Western art music, its traditions and institutions have evolved in a particular cultural and historical setting and so what has happened regarding women and their music making has been explained against the broader context from which the music emerges and is received.

This chapter has shown how the values, morals and social conventions of, particularly the nineteenth century, are contained in the procedures and activities around western art music and are also contained within the music itself. It has been explained that the society which holds these ideals is rooted in a patriarchal language and systems which are so entrenched that
they go almost unnoticed. This is not to say that the situation for women and consequently for women musicians was acceptable before this time, (patriarchy existed before capitalism) but that it worsened at this critical time in music history and has ramifications for us today. Indeed the cultural production of this kind of political hegemony, constructed by the professional middle class, is seen as having its roots at some time after the seventeenth century (Foucault 1980a) and was absolutely vital for the unfolding of capitalism during the nineteenth century (Levy 1991). Art music is the heritage of European communities, the music which is prized in this society as 'high culture' and the music of the dominant class who achieve dominance 'primarily on cultural rather than economic grounds' (Levy 1991). Music is therefore placed in a central position in the construction of cultural and political hegemony.

These values, morals and social conventions were a barrier for women as professional musicians and for women pursuing any high profile activity in the arts. Therefore attention has been given to questions about how gendered messages are passed down in history and in music and why they are accepted often without question by musicians, teachers, musicologists and others.

The circumstances in which women's music making continued to be marginalised caused reformers to become more radical which has led to a situation which has now been exacerbated by unemployment, economic depression, environmental crisis and the increasing political power of international corporations. It is because we are a result of our history that we need to understand our past. Those attitudes which have been repressive in terms of class, race and gender can be understood and countered, and a reassessment can be made of the nature and purpose of music and female music making. 'We must understand the historical process and practices that have determined the current situation of women artists if we are to confront the role of cultural production and representations in the systems of sexual domination and power' (Sakharov 1968).
In many ways it is difficult to be critical and to (re)view an art form with which one has a strong personal involvement. Shepherd (1991) realises that there is a level where his work could be seen as 'the attempt of a white middle class male to uncover the conditions of his own musical pleasures'. For Attali there is no doubt that the old codes of repetitious musical exchange have to be rejected for a new self-styled composition where 'we create our own relation to the world and try to tie other people into the meaning we thus create' (Attali 1977). Clément (1989), recognises that she herself has taken part in the 'bourgeois farce' of loving and internalising the stories of opera and she asks herself if it is possible to escape this heritage and 'bank on something else'. She concludes that simple rejection does not seem an option when such social and intimate involvement is at stake.

A key issue which comes out of this chapter is that of our profound connections to our biographies, cultures, societies, environments and our bodies. The way forward, therefore, is considered to involve an understanding and then dismissing of the way, at least since the Renaissance, patriarchy has controlled people (men and women), knowledge and the arts thereby hiding from view many of the consequences of human relatedness.

Alternatives - A Female Aesthetic?
Feminists in all disciplines are beginning to uncover the tendency to deny the body and identify only with the mind (McClary 1991). Attali, who suggests that music should be 'autonomous production' considers that to improvise and compose (in Attali's 1977, demystified sense of the word; that is 'to put together' and that this should be done by all members of society), is related to the assumption of differences, of the rediscovery and blossoming of the body. 'Composition ties music to gesture ...it plugs music into the noises of life and the body, whose movement it fuels' (Attali 1977). This way of expressing music can be adopted by anyone, but for women it is more than self expression, it is a reclamation of the body which has been turned into 'the uncanny stranger on display' (Cixous
1981). Cixous warns, 'Censor the body and you censor breath and speech at the same time. Write your self. Your body must be heard' (Cixous 1981).

A feminine approach to knowledge about music would abandon the patriarchal values embedded in prior notions of form in music theory, musicology and composition and support the liberation of women from the cultural fictions of the female gender in the practice of music. In order to construct new critical models and methodologies a feminine approach could borrow freely from: new discoveries about gender and culture in anthropology, sociology and political science; strategies for reading texts from the new work in English studies; psychosemiotic analyses of sound, performance and representation from recent film theory; new theories of the 'subject' from psychosemiotics; post-modern criticism and post structuralism; and some strategies of deconstruction (Case 1988). Some of these approaches are being practised amongst women musicians in education, in spiritual movements, amongst women artists, in women’s groups and in homes where women’s music has always thrived.

For instance, a new feminist theology is finding a voice within some traditionally male bastions where women are uncovering their old traditions. Jewish women are now finding their own space and playing their music, for instance 'Shalom', written by a woman, the songs of Betty Friedmann, songs for the full moon, (which are part of every tradition where women celebrate together) and they are exploring the issues arising for women performing music written predominantly for male performers and a male audience (Gottesman and Shillor 1993).

Women in the Christian tradition are also exploring 'the pain of many centuries of women's silence...as well as the spiritual power and wholeness with which the Church can be gifted when women believers refuse to be silent any longer and speak out their convictions, stories and hopes' (Slee 1993). Women in the Church of England, as well as having sought and won ordination,
also seek to use language, hymns and songs in the liturgy which are genuinely inclusive.

'We'll make the tunes for those who sing no longer,
Vibrating with a love alive in every heart.
We'll share our joy with those who are still weeping,
Chant hymns of strength for hearts that break in grief;
We'll leap and dance the resurrection story
Including all within the circles of our love.'

(Boyce-Tillman 1993a, p.28)

In their pamphlet 'Time for a fairer song', Salisbury Cathedral promotes itself as 'leading the world in creating a new musical tradition' of girl choristers. As well as a boys' choir, Salisbury is the first Cathedral in the country to offer girls the same opportunity to the depth and variety of musical education and experience traditionally only enjoyed by boys.

A new approach (which is not really new but has not been accorded equal value) would allow women to hear their own 'voice' which has historically been stifled, muffled and unable to blossom and grow. Only when all people have been allowed to articulate their own meanings can we have access to all the insights music offers and be, as a unity of people a part of the inter-relationships necessary for a balanced and wholesome society.

'Today a new music is on the rise, one that can neither be expressed nor understood using the old tools, a music produced elsewhere and otherwise. It is not that music or the world have become incomprehensible: the concept of comprehension itself has changed; there has been a shift in the locus of the perception of things.'

Attali 1977

There is much in common with the concerns of some of the French feminists and contemporary expressions of Goddess spirituality (mainly from the United States), including its flowering in the Arts (Orenstein 1990). Both the US and the French debates acknowledge the significance of the body and of creativity and the arts. However the US theorists have gone further in rejecting
the patriarchal view of culture as human endeavour pursued in opposition to nature but rather that culture is a potentially harmonious extension of nature. Music is, from this point of view, an integral part of the creativity which springs from our connections with the earth and the teachings of nature.

Music based on 'writing the body' with a new feminine voice is perceived as having a flexible, cyclical form and an engagement of the listener in the musical moment rather in the structure of the piece as a whole. It would resolve opposites, deconstruct hierarchies, disrupt linearity and avoid definitive closure. In sung music, vocalisation would be relaxed and make use of nonverbal or presymbolic sounds, (Pendle 1991).

In the past women may have had to adopt a masculine mode of expression in order to have their music taken seriously because qualities associated with the female have traditionally been considered inferior. A feminine aesthetic would value the female contribution to music and allow women to represent their own experiences rather than someone else's experience. A problem that arises here is for women to be able to distinguish their experience from patriarchal conceptions of the feminine that women have internalised because of the conditioning that embeds certain ways of conceptualising in the subconscious.

The emphasis on the female body and sexuality proposed by a new feminine approach in some ways looks similar to the constructions of femaleness offered by patriarchy but when determined by patriarchy the context is always negative. Women are now concerned to reclaim their bodies and their sexuality for themselves and to explain their own context. As Gilligan says 'we must use our different voice' (Gilligan 1982).

It is the contention that the denial of the music of the female (Drinker 1948) has contributed to the feelings of young people being cut off from the web of relatedness. Through singing, chanting, rhythm making and moving together young people find common expression. We are all well aware of the importance of
play in the very young and the importance of resting the mind from a turmoil of thoughts. Music can provide outlets for both of these activities. Concentration on the breath, on the body's rhythms and on sequences of sounds focuses the mind. Through the rituals of music making young people can re-acquaint themselves with their profound connections with each other and with the joy of playing together. The boredom and inertia which is experienced by many young people can be healed when they engage in the creative process. Whilst in the modern age of scientism it has not been considered appropriate to take account of the inner, emotional, self-conscious or spiritual self, renewed schools of thought are taking a holistic approach which may be described as 'looking at the whole child', 'taking a global perspective' or 'a more feminine model'. These approaches tend to consider body, mind and spirit and dispute tendencies to be concerned only with the mind, a philosophy which is grounded in Newtonian science, materialism and suspicion of spirituality which has resulted in personal alienation and ecological destruction.

In reflecting upon the priorities of ancient peoples and of indigenous populations in the world today, it can be seen that a concern with nature, with wisdom and with the arts has been the birthright of the young. In overdeveloped countries these rights appear to have been denied to some extent and need to be reclaimed.

Attali's hope for the future extends beyond cultural concerns to the way we live and the mode of production. He understands music as a key factor in the process of change; taking a share in power is also having one's voice heard. Attali may not have been thinking of women in particular when he crafted his words, there is a poignancy for all oppressed groups. We all need to create our own music and interlink with others if we choose. We have the right to compose our own lives.
Chapter 3  Research in the Education of Girls

1. Introduction

Whilst education can be an agent of change, chapter 2 shows how political, traditional and historical precedents are also reproduced in society by the education system and other institutions, (see Bowles and Gintis (1976), Althusser (1971), Bernstein (1975), and Bourdieu (1973) who examined differing implications of reproduction theory).

The tension which exists between reproducing culture through traditional curricula and understanding education as a prime instrument of social and intellectual change has caused conflict and controversy. This chapter discusses the issues round that controversy which most affect music education, but which also contain general principles regarding equality which are not specific to music.

The chapter considers the legal requirement (embodied in the National Curriculum) for schools to take some responsibility for the gender-linked problems in society. The main argument is that it is every child's human right to receive an education which prepares them for a changing society and which does not construct them as individuals according to a set of prejudices which are often embedded in institutions and are learned and consciously accepted or unconsciously transmitted by the adults who service those institutions.

Previous research demonstrates how many girls have not been stimulated in school to think further than becoming wives and mothers. The resulting limits on their career potential as they make option and career choices compounds their limitations in a society where there is already less opportunity for them (see table 1).

Many women find themselves ultimately dependent on their partners or on the state. Those who do work in paid employment tend to be in the traditional sectors of female employment where pay scales
are low and even those in equal pay jobs like teaching are at the lower end of the pay scale.

**Table 1**

**EARNINGS: GREAT BRITAIN 1987**

Average gross hourly earnings, excluding the effects of overtime, of full-time employees on adult rates: pence per hour

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>386.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td>526.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Differential</td>
<td>140.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Women's earnings as a percentage of men's 73.4

(Source: Department of Employment Gazette)

Social class and race are seen as additional or alternative factors in the historical reflections on the education system which reveal that the whole apparatus was originally set up by men for the purpose of the education of males. Even the philosophy which controlled and quantified the knowledge that is seen as worthwhile was male oriented. A proposal that a female centred curriculum would be more appropriate for girls is documented and discussed.

The actual situation for girls in the classroom is examined using mostly data from practitioners' (teachers and support teachers) as well as researchers' accounts. Again, race and class are also found to be factors in discriminatory practices.

Assessment, which is the key to success or failure in our educational system, is examined in detail to reveal the most subtle yet most fundamental of ways in which discrimination can work. Objectivity (or rather the whole idea of having banks of tests with numerous, detailed criteria which has become synonymous with the word) is discussed against the finding that girls are less likely to see things in small, abstracted parts, that they are more process orientated and benefit more from a holistic evaluation.
2. The Entry of Women into Mass Education

'All things bright and beautiful
All creatures great and small
All things wise and wonderful
The Lord God made them all

The rich man at his castle
The poor man at the gate
God made them high and lowly
And ordered their estate'

Cecil Frances Alexander (1813-95)

Schooling has been used to fit people into the labour market since the advent of compulsory education at the end of the last century and this has meant that people were 'ordered into their estate' depending on the class, race and gender accorded to them at birth. However, as well as assuming that class position is preordained by God, the above hymn ignores women. Women are designated their social position by the occupations of their fathers or husbands (Registrar General's (RG) classification of occupations). If they are classified by their own occupations using the RG scale, 38% of women are classified as 'other' because the scale is not designed to 'fit' women (Benn and Burton 1993).

At the end of the last century, working class boys were trained for their estate in the public sphere of the labour market and working class girls worked in domestic service, as maids, cooks and cleaners in middle class homes and then, after marriage, caring for their husbands and children (Turner 1974). Girls and boys were taught basic literacy and numeracy whilst girls also learnt domestic science and boys learnt crafts.

Boys from middle and upper class homes went to private and independent schools to produce an educated elite who had the necessary skills to enter the professions and to rule the country. Middle class girls learnt a very different culture, that of accomplishment in conversation, music and needlework and they were expected to supervise their servants (Sharpe 1976).
With the advent of compulsory education, more middle class girls went to private school where processes of gender differentiation and segregation were as much a feature as they were in the gradually developing elementary system. Girls were taught arts and social sciences and sometimes some science at a different level and in a different context to that taught to the boys.

Class as a fundamental category of exclusion (Bernstein 1975) has been a crucial factor in influencing the experience of different groups of girls and women. However it was difficult to escape the domestic role whatever their social position. Many struggled for female access to secondary and higher education in the second half of the nineteenth century and, for the few who were allowed access, education became a liberating experience.

What is significant in the ideology which informed the curriculum and pedagogy in the educational experience of girls and women is the influential middle class ideology that all women should be in the home as full time wives and mothers. The ideal upheld for working class females was that of a good wife and mother and they were offered a curriculum of domestically useful knowledge. The middle and upper classes were schooled to attract suitors, be ladylike homemakers and were offered an accomplishments curriculum. Both classes struggled against male ideas of femininity and against fathers and husbands who thought education was unnecessary for a woman's life.

Female teachers fought for equal pay and against the marriage bar in the 1920's and 30's. Since full female adult suffrage in 1928, it took until the Sex Discrimination Act 1975 for legislation to be passed on the equal treatment of women. Gender differentiated curricula are now unlawful.

The historical process, whilst evolving and changing according to the society of its day, reveals a strong inclination to retain its traditional ideals. There are parallels between the education females received historically and our education today:
a. Class Differentiation in the State and Private Sectors

There is a return to a centralised framework for state education which mirrors the late 19th century when a basic curriculum was centrally directed and teachers were paid according to their students' results. The system was later decentralised until the introduction of the Education Reform Act 1988 which requires a National Curriculum of core subjects: English, Maths and Science; and foundation subjects: History, Geography, a modern language, Technology, Art, Music, Physical Education and Religious Education.

Girls who go to fee paying schools (6% of students of compulsory school age), do not have to follow the National Curriculum and still receive an elitist education which fits them for a class society by also offering classical subjects, lacrosse, ballet, fencing, riding, flower arranging and playing 'feminine' musical instruments. In this way, class variations still occur in the manner of education for girls and in the expectations of their particular social group. Working class girls are expected to give up their unskilled or semi-skilled occupations after the birth of children whereas middle class girls may now be encouraged to combine a career with marriage (Deem 1978).

b. Equal Access to the Traditional Male Curriculum is not Equal Treatment

Attempts to make education fairer for girls by including them in the 'malestream' of the curriculum have not been completely effective because 'female subjects such as domestic science and child care are not compulsory and hence low status...(and) spheres in which boys excel and the teachers are predominantly male have high status...(also) equal access to a common curriculum is insufficient for guaranteeing equal treatment...(and the) co-educational nature of state maintained schools disadvantages girls since mixed schools are really boys' schools with girls fitted into the male paradigm' (Purvis 1991 p.126).
c. 'Sciences are not for Girls'
The situation exists whereby '...schools in the early part of this century initiated something which has proved hard to eradicate - a tradition that sciences are not for girls' (DES 1975, Deem 1978) and so in higher education, women tend to follow arts and languages and men the sciences, business, engineering and technological subjects.

In conclusion, it is apparent that 'the patterns of social class and gender differentiation established in girls' and women's education in the Victorian and Edwardian eras are still echoing in England today' (Purvis 1991 p.130).

3. Equal Opportunities and Anti-Sexism for Equality
In the 1950's and 1960's, social scientists began to recognise the class bias in the education system. They discovered that working class children were much less likely to receive the full benefits of a grammar school education than middle class children of the same measured potential. A broader interpretation of equality which recognised equal educational outcome as well as access had to wait longer, until the rise of the women's movement and the understanding of racially mixed society (Rubenstein 1984).

a. Equal Opportunities Approaches
In the 1970's there was little analysis of why there were so few women and girls in key subject areas, top jobs or well paid industrial employment, although several academic research studies indicated possible causal factors (Fogarty 1971, Rapaport and Rapaport 1978). The emphasis was placed firmly on the improvement of teaching methods and the careful dissemination of research findings for the benefit of all students, but with particular emphasis on the educational improvement of girls.

The suggestion that sex inequality in education was directly related to the general subordination of women by men was largely ignored. Equality of opportunity in this instance, was defined in terms of the current equal allocation of school resources and educational benefits rather than in any deliberate attempt at
positive discrimination in favour of girls, to make up for past discriminatory experience. In striving for equality within school it was considered that all would benefit. The girls would be encouraged to take up equal time and space in the traditionally male dominated subject areas like Maths and Physics whilst boys would be encouraged to take up those subjects that had been previously favoured by girls like Music, Home Economics and Commercial subjects. These 'encouragements', it was hoped, would not only give girls fairer access to the scientific and technological areas of the curriculum but would also assist boys into the arts and enable them to be more sensitive in their responses (Schools' Council/I.L.E.A. 1983). The following strategies were then agreed as being key points to follow:

1. Persuading girls to go into science and technology
2. Providing a compulsory common core of subjects throughout schooling so that girls would be unable to drop the 'hard' sciences and boys would be compelled to take courses in Child Development or the Humanities.
3. Analyzing textbooks, readers and classroom resources for stereotyping.
4. Reviewing aspects of school organisation e.g. registers, assemblies, uniform, disciplinary methods.
5. Devising non-sexist courses and materials aimed at changing the stereotyped perceptions of girls and boys.
6. Encouraging discussion by running staff conferences and courses, and producing policy guidelines on equal opportunities.
7. Establishing mixed sex equal opportunities working parties (though usually dominated numerically by women) to develop and monitor school policy.
8. Creating posts of responsibility for equal opportunities at inspectorate/advisor and at school level.
9. Establishing single sex grouping in certain subjects i.e. Science and Maths, to encourage girls to achieve the standards set by boys.

Weiner 1985

The philosophy behind these strategies seeks to make it possible for higher numbers of girls to enter domains which have been traditionally dominated by males and to assist more boys into the traditionally female areas (this includes vocational and leisure interests). To this end, there has been some success; there are a growing number of female students taking Maths and Physics at G.C.S.E. (with the National Curriculum, Science is now a compulsory subject in years 9 and 10), and a few more female students take Engineering courses. In music more boys are opting
for G.C.S.E., mainly because of the introduction of new technology enabled by the new G.C.S.E. exam, 1986.

The strategies have brought about changes within schools, such as changing of the blocking of options at key stage 4, increased discussion and activity around issues of gender, listing of names in alphabetical order instead of boys first then the girls, concern over unequal use of playground space between girls and boys, and having a computer club for girls.

However, in spite of equal opportunities initiatives to change the imbalance of the sexes at G.C.S.E. and to encourage more girls and women into male dominated positions, the situation remained fundamentally the same. Furthermore, some educationalists had not cooperated in attempts to make changes: 'Despite the increased discussion and activity in this area, many men (and some women) continue to remain indifferent or even hostile to the changes taking place or being suggested or promoted' (Weiner 1985).

Concerned on a political level with equal opportunities, this more 'liberal feminist' perspective is really making a case for 'sameness', access and integration into the male world. In this paradigm, masculinity is the hidden norm causing femininity which is associated with femaleness to become a deficit model. In particular, research evidence suggested that female students (and teachers) were at best undervalued and under-represented in the work of schools, and at worst ignored or harassed (Spender 1980, Kelly 1981, N.U.T. 1980), so the gap between educational practice and the rhetoric of equal opportunities became glaringly visible.

The 'gap' prompted interest from the D.E.S., H.M.I. and the E.O.C. describing many aspects of inequality in the education system, with EOC reports focusing on the hidden curriculum as well as the formal curriculum. There came greater awareness of gender inequality and many education authorities and individual schools began to take action on the consideration of gender issues. The Manpower Services Commission (MSC) found that sex
stereotyping was a serious obstacle in creating an appropriately skilled labour force. The first significant gender initiative in education was created by the MSC in 1984 when equal opportunities was adopted as one of the Technical and Vocational Education Initiative's funding criteria in the following clause: 'equal opportunities should be available to young people of both sexes and they should normally be educated together on courses within each project. Care should be taken to avoid sex-stereotyping' (MSC 1984).

With this clause came specific funding for gender. Local Education Authorities employed Equal Opportunities Co-ordinators and secondary schools awarded an allowance to a particular individual to coordinate equal opportunities in the school. This individual would usually set up a working party of interested colleagues who inevitably also concerned themselves with gender issues outside of the sphere of TVEI.

Other initiatives around this time were TVEI-Related In Service Training (TRIST), the Lower Attaining Pupils Programme (Lapp) and Records of Achievement, the new General Certificate of Secondary Education (GCSE) and Certificate of PreVocational Education (CPVE) examinations.

Problems with implementing the TVEI gender clause were described by Hertfordshire teachers as: 1. barriers outside school: parental attitudes, employer's attitudes, young people themselves and accepted social practice, 2. barriers inside school: organizational structure, staff attitudes, lack of resources and staff promotion policies (James and Young 1989).

There have also been National research projects like Girls into Science and Technology (1981-4) and the Schools Council Sex Differentiation Project (1982-3), and many Education Authorities developed materials and policies on issues of gender and other areas of inequality, for instance the now disbanded Inner London Education Authority.
b. Anti-Sexist Approaches

Many educationalists, parents and students who are feminists acknowledge and appreciate the 'equal opportunities' initiatives which enable them to establish a broad base of support and understanding. Policies of equal opportunities have attempted to 'educate' girls, ethnic minorities, working class and alternatively able students to 'fit' the existing structures which do not have their experience, their history, or their understanding in their frameworks. If, as is predictable, they do not succeed in a system not designed for them, then blame is put on individual students, rather than changing traditional structures to meet the needs and experiences of everyone and challenging prejudice.

Adrienne Rich (1980) argues that the ignorance of women about themselves and their culture has done much to confirm them in their oppressed state, and that female education will need to change before girls and women overcome their subordination. She further identifies the male establishment and its power structure as women's principal oppressor.

The equal opportunities approach fails to address the relationship between patriarchy, power and women's subordination, whereas the anti-sexist approach places it at the centre of thinking. Fundamentally, the difference in the two approaches is that anti-sexism recognises that males are not likely to want to give up their advantage of power, status and control simply because it is fairer and they want to be seen as being fair. As Gaby Weiner says in her challenging introduction to 'Just a bunch of Girls'; '....boys and men will have to give up their hold on the system - something they are unlikely to do without a struggle' (Weiner 1985).

Equal opportunities policies and strategies made way for clearer thinking and opening gestures towards equality. However if more than piecemeal progress was to be made, there was a need for restructuring in every aspect of schooling. As well as the
previous strategies 'the anti-sexist approach' includes the following points:

1. Feminist education means girl or woman centred education.
2. It has to take into account the actual (not stereotyped) experiences and lives of women and girls.
3. A curriculum needs to be provided which draws on the past and present experiences of women and girls.
4. Schooling, at the least should furnish girls and young women with the skills and knowledge to take on the male system 'out there', in the workplace.
5. Education should give girls and women a sense of solidarity with other members of their sex and hence a female based confidence and motivation.
6. Certain characteristics of present day schooling such as hierarchical school organisation, competitiveness, authoritarianism and selection should be replaced by new procedures based on cooperation, democracy, egalitarianism and community.
7. Feminist teachers, parents and pupils should be aware of the widespread oppression of women by men, and therefore be prepared for the struggles and opposition they are likely to encounter.

Curriculum changes needed:
1. Recognising the importance of girl-centred study. What is herstory or girls'/women's science or technology, or girl/woman centred mathematics or literature? And how do they differ from traditional (male-centred) forms of study?
2. Exploring the relationship between sexuality, women's oppression and sexual harassment both at school and in the workplace.
3. Developing girl-centred school organisation so that girls have the freedom, space, time and help to enable them genuinely to reach their full potential. (It may well be argued that single sex schools now and in the past have provided girl-centred education which, nevertheless, has had little impact on the social position of women. However, many of the girls' schools in the state sector were grammar schools whose curricular, examinations and school organization were all designed to integrate into the national system which was, and is, male dominated.)
4. Providing wider horizons for girls to aim at, and, at the same time, not denigrate the lives and work of their mothers, friends and the women in their community.
5. Establishing school girls' and women's groups to provide support for female pupils and members of staff.

Weiner 1985

Through these strategies it is possible for girls to become more self confident and to respect their caring abilities and communicative skills, co-operation and flexibility as well as their so called 'masculine' or objective skills.
C. Equality since the mid 1980's

Feminist publishing has seen a concern with post-modern theories which conclude that gender is an ambiguous category. Post-feminism is concerned with pluralism in theory and multiplicity of action. Categories like female, feminine and feminist are recognised as having diverse interpretations and the usefulness of these categories has been questioned.

However, much research in education continues to centre on the interests of girls and women, the concept of girl-friendly schooling and a feminist teaching practice, the more radical feminists working through anti-sexism on a political level with 'different but equal' and at a theoretical level with separation and difference. The outcome has been a paradigm of female uniqueness and the celebration of femininity and femaleness as an alternative reference point in every sphere.

Since the late 1980's the education system has been going through extensive changes brought about by the Education Reform Act 1988 and the centralisation of control away from local authorities. The government has particularly focused on vocational and technological initiatives in schooling.

On a practical level, political changes in the education system have inevitably made a difference to quality and equality in schools. In some instances political changes have meant a curtailment of equal opportunities initiatives; for instance, because of the removal of power from local authorities, schools have to monitor themselves when considering aspects of equality and some are better at this than others. The issue of equality in schools has not been well supported at many levels and has caused tension and confusion. 'Teachers have failed to get the backing of parents for equal opportunities and the government have made it into an issue of the "loony left"...We did not get enough support or a strong enough political constituency' (Arnot, NUT Conference 1992).
4. School and Classroom Issues in Behaviour Management

a. Teachers' attitudes to discipline

Teachers often come to realise from when they are student teachers that classroom discipline can pervade their thinking, become the only issue and prevent them from concerning themselves with the education of the students. Careful guidance and consciousness around this issue can help teachers overcome this problem, but frequently it becomes an area where to seek help with discipline is regarded as a sign of weakness. Teachers are told that they must manage their own discipline problems or they will be seen by their students as weak and unable to cope and they would then never be able to contain the students alone without a dependency on other teachers. Although there is some obvious truth in this way of thinking, it is untenable for the following reasons:

i. As teachers and human beings, we are dependent on each other. This need not result in teachers continually inviting other teachers into their classrooms to help with discipline problems or continually referring students to senior staff. It should mean that teachers are able to admit and discuss problems with others, to seek help and guidance to overcome anything from their personal trauma to seemingly impossible disciplinary situations which occur in school.

ii. There may be occasions when other teachers may have to be involved in disciplinary problems, but this does not mean the teacher has to be undermined. The way a school is organised and the attitude and manner of the staff towards the students and their colleagues make a great deal of difference to individual teachers.

iii. It has been found that where teachers are more likely to incorporate negotiation skills and less aggressive methods in their discipline practices they may be viewed by other teachers and by students as less powerful, helpless, ineffectual in controlling students, and if they are male teachers, as possibly gay (Delamont and Galton 1986, Beynon 1987). Female teachers are
found to seek help more often and admit they were having problems whereas male teachers were afraid of appearing weak.

'This fear may stem from the widely held belief that males must be seen to be in total control of their surroundings. With authority and discipline being closely linked to masculinity, admitting a problem ... can affect their self perceptions and possibly undermine their power and respect with regard to their students, peers and superiors ... controlling students, often by severe authoritarian means, became paramount for many male teachers, usually at the expense of a positive workable relationship with their students.'

Robinson 1992

Discipline is sometimes associated with the need to be authoritarian and dominating over students which is considered a masculine attribute and is concerned with the ideology of 'hegemonic masculinity' (Beynon 1989). This is clearly not effective classroom practice.

Classroom discipline is seen by many teachers as a matter of 'power' and 'control'. To be a 'good teacher' means having a class working in silence not daring to speak or move because they are under threat (Connell 1987, Abraham 1989, Robinson 1992). Discipline measures used by teachers who take this view can be coercive and violent and yet be taken as a sign of being a 'good teacher'.

A masculine approach to discipline is often seen as the most appropriate method of control in classrooms. Many male and female teachers are encouraged to take this hard, no nonsense approach. This approach is reinforced by a nostalgic recollection of 'how things used to be' when children 'knew their place', that educational standards have deteriorated because of lack of hard discipline and the ideals of rote learning, learning by heart and learning in isolation.
These ideas are simply untrue and have no foundation in good learning practice as is being currently discussed (Spring/Summer 1993) in the arguments and debates about testing which have brought up these issues between the Government and the vast majority of educationalists from many political persuasions.

b. Gender, Race and Class
Teachers dealings with students can be strongly conditioned by gender, race and class, with the effect that consciously and unconsciously teachers give out messages about their students' personal effectiveness.

'There is evidence that pupils and their teachers may have different expectations depending on whether they are male or female....Research evidence suggests that where stereotyping relating to particular ethnic/cultural/class characteristics exist this can result in different and even predetermined expectations which may adversely affect the recognition of a pupil's achievement. This can be further exacerbated by language difficulties and religious differences. It is important to recognise that where teachers are not closely familiar with particular cultural models they may not fully recognise the achievements of certain pupils.' (3.17 and 3.18)

RANS C Report 1988

The complex way in which we see ourselves is heavily conditioned (especially with children) by the way we in turn are viewed by others. How we see ourselves inevitably affects the way we behave and problematic behaviour in schools such as reticence, attention seeking, school refusal, violence and infringement of dress code can be seen as the students' statements about themselves in terms of reaction to and sometimes resistance to institutional expectations.

The following statements are just some of what have become familiar prejudices. A student who can't speak English well is likely to be perceived as less intelligent; so is a student who speaks with a dialect or a working class accent. A girl is likely
to be expected to behave well, write and present work neatly and be 'ladylike', a student from an Asian background is presumed to be more polite and hard-working than a white working class counterpart. A boy from an Afro-Caribbean background is expected to be lazy, challenging, aggressive and naturally good at sports but inclined to give up too easily whilst a white boy is expected to be not so talented at sports but more reliable under pressure. These are common stereotypes and, expressed as expectations, they blight the opportunities of students to be seen as themselves, to work at their own level and to make progress in their own terms. Instead they are frequently held accountable to a set of our own irrationalities that we would do well to dispose of by personal reflection and engaging in honest, patient debate in our institutions.

The exertion of a discipline of power and control coupled with some conservative and traditional attitudes towards gender, race and class (Evans 1982), results in a recipe for inequality. Students in oppressed groups respond in a number of ways.

Students may react to institutional stereotyping by 'cultural challenge' in which highly charged and contentious aspects of minority cultures become used as devices to challenge, publicise and celebrate difference. This is not, as many tend to feel, a uniquely black phenomenon; Irish people, for instance, have signalled their difference in their social mores and their religion for centuries.

Over some years now, there have been examples from Afro-Caribbean students of 'cultural challenge', from an emphasis on patois to expensive trainers, from tooth-sucking to jeans many sizes too big and pirate bandannas. The major value of such statements for students is that they cause many teachers to feel anxious and arouse antagonistic attitudes which increase the challenger's sense of power. The Fish Report (1985) showed that in areas where there are many students from ethnic minorities, a disproportionate number of black working class boys are likely to be considered to have special educational needs.
Many working class students see no point in school, and in this they may echo their parents' perceptions. This alienation results from a complex of causes, about the role, nature and usefulness of school, and its effect on self esteem. Some working class parents have aspirations for their children which are different from that of education and the school. They feel that school will do little in achieving those aspirations beyond basic literacy skills. That task completed, school becomes pointless and teachers might be viewed as a group of 'intrusive, snobby do-gooders'. For a smaller group there are no aspirations, education was miserable for them and they see little hope for their own children at school, especially if, when they visit the school, they are relentlessly charged with the information that their children are problematic academically and also in some cases behaviourally. Some families reject and obstruct education whilst others passively resist the right of those in power to get in the way of their lives.

One group of teachers have written of their concern about the continuing need to address issues of underachievement and school alienation of white, working class groups.

'As student teachers in the early Seventies (we were) regularly introduced to the notion that school did not reflect and respect the experience of working class students.....We are probably now in Waltham Forest only too acutely aware of cultural challenge among students from minority cultures. What we are not so ready to accept is the challenge that has always been there from students we perceive as sharing our own culture but who are by the nature of their experience wholly alienated from school.'

Waltham Forest Multi-cultural Development Service, 1992

The differing implications for boys and girls of social class and ethnicity as well as sexuality and disability create a multiplicity of explanations about girls' and women's behaviour and what has been deemed appropriate for them (Fuller 1980).
c. Focus on Girls
i. Teachers' Expectations

Much of the difficult behaviour to be seen in classrooms and which mars educational effectiveness is perpetrated by boys. It would be a generalisation to suggest girls never behave unacceptably; indeed many teachers will say that there are girls who are 'just as bad' and then name a notorious girl in their school. By comparison and in terms of numbers, publicly disruptive behaviour by girls is minimal.

In a report from an educational support service they tell us that they 'have lost count of the occasions when we have witnessed the following. A class is in the throes of working quietly at an individual task. The teacher is engaged in marking work and supporting students' efforts. Girls are to be observed diligently working at their tasks, their conversation quietly work centred, their interactions co-operative. By contrast, boys are inactive or only intermittently active in working, they move around the class feigning the need to seek help or equipment, but are in reality in search of forbidden excitement. They talk too much and too loudly, they disturb the conscientious, and often do this with aggressive behaviour which intimidates those seen as 'boffins'; feuds are carried over from the playground.'

Lea Green Language Support Service, 1992

This is clearly an intolerable situation and yet, curiously, it is one which often occurs without the teacher being strongly aware of any incongruity in behaviour. The reason for this seems to lie in teachers' expectations: the teacher expects boys to behave in this way and so doesn't notice their antisocial behaviour. Equally so, nothing unusual is perceived to be going on amongst the girls and so no comment is made. If the same expectations were to be made of students regardless of their gender, then the teacher would object to much of what the boys were doing.
Special needs students tend to be boys. The Fish Report (1985) on special needs showed that 86.6% of students in schools for those with emotionally disturbed behaviour are boys. Boys are generally referred twice as often as girls for treatment of speech problems, hearing, visual and other physical disabilities and emotional disturbances.

It is reasonable to question whether gender issues are involved with the identification of children with special needs. It seems probable that boys who are difficult in class are being labelled as special needs and then being removed from the class. Girls who need help may be overlooked if they are quiet and acquiescent.

ii. Teachers' perceptions of femininity

Teachers attitudes surrounding masculinity and femininity and its association or disassociation with authority and power influence classroom discipline practices. These attitudes often result in gender differentiated practices in the classroom and throughout the school as a whole (Delamont, 1980, Spender 1982, Stanworth 1983, Abraham 1989, Beynon 1989).

Teachers often deal humorously with boys misbehaviour, but with real disapproval of girls' misbehaviour (Llewellyn 1980). Instead of confirming the good behaviour of the girls, teachers frequently reinforce the unacceptable behaviour of many boys and in the process build up a self esteem based on notoriety rather than achievement.

Robinson (1992), recorded that overall, teachers found girls easier to discipline but sometimes related this to what they considered was girls' submissive nature. Teachers liked 'good girls' and took little notice of 'difficult girls' whose 'passive resistance' went unnoticed or was allowed. However those who were perceived as 'bad girls' and 'tarty girls' were regarded as a serious concern for teachers and the school as a whole.

'Bad' girls who were assertive, confronting, loud, aggressive and 'uncontrollable' were considered as displaying behaviour more
natural for boys. 'Tarty girls' judged on their appearance and perceived sexual morality encountered the double standard surrounding sexuality for males and females, young and old alike. Lees (1986), found that girls who did not conform to moral and sexual conduct according to appearance, make-up, clothes, language and behaviour were ostracised.

Girls' behaviour becomes a problem for many teachers when they challenge the boundaries of femininity. It is believed that the assumptions made about how girls should behave have serious consequences on motivation, self esteem, reputation and ability to fulfil educational potential (Spender and Sarah 1980, Evans 1982, Stanworth 1983, Davies 1984, Riddell 1988, Wolpe 1988).

5. Equality and Assessment
a. The Problem of Bias
The problem of bias in teaching and assessment is widely recognised but not well understood by many educationalists (Murphy 1990). It is known that the design of examinations affects outcomes for females and males and so 'equality of treatment' is clearly not enough. The style of assessment affects the relative performance of males and females (Heather 1976) and people from varying cultural and social backgrounds (Ryan 1972). Girls do better than boys in verbal reasoning and boys do better than girls in spatial tests (Maccoby & Jacklin 1974). It is easy to construct a test in which certain groups do better. For instance, in the U.S.A. a large corporation called 'Educational Testing Services' found that they could construct tests where black and white people had an equal achievement and likewise for male and female, rather than previous tests which had favoured the white, middle class male. Girls perform less well in multiple choice tests yet examinations favour this type of testing.

These considerations should not only lead to the development of assessment schemes which ensure equal outcomes, the content of curricula and what is tested as well as how it is tested should also be reviewed. This is because just to rely on manipulating the style of assessment would evade the equally important
contributions of pupils' perception of subjects, the experience they bring to the subject and the type of demands a subject makes, each of which can differently affect male and female performance. The National Curriculum History Working Party, for instance, found that 'events in the past were recorded in terms of deeds of men in battles etc., whilst both records and text books fail to report adequately the role of women' (DES 5.23 1991a). The difficulty then is to determine how much of the problem resides in pupils' perceptions and outside experiences and how much in the structure and assessment of the subjects. The task for examining boards is therefore vital from an equal opportunities viewpoint.

'The exam boards' role in equal opportunities should not be a passive one, nor can it be restricted to merely avoiding insensitivity in question papers, rather it requires active investigation of the demands syllabuses make in relation to known gender, cultural and class differences.'

(ULEAC 1992)

b. Examination Performance
The introduction of the G.C.S.E. has introduced assessment techniques which have considerably improved the performance of girls in most subjects. For instance in 1989 girls provided 51.3% of the total entries, despite making up only 48.5% of the 16 year old cohort. In English, 87% of the cohort entered, 90% of girls and 80% of boys.

Having noted that there are gender differences in the G.C.S.E. entry pattern, thereby reflecting different study programmes, there must also be a consideration of the outcomes. There is an argument that different outcomes should be accepted as reflecting basic differences between girls and boys and that the task should be to minimise any obvious bias in examinations. This position fails to recognise the changes in the relative performances of males and females over the past few years.

At a time of shortage of scientists, only 21% of the 1989 'A' level Physics, 30.8% Maths and 40.9% Chemistry entry was female, when 48.8% of the total 'A' level entry was female. Maths is
taken at 16+ by over 300,000 females of whom less than 20,000 go on to take 'A' level. The reverse side is that males are providing only 30.1% of the 'A' level English entry and 28.1% of the 'A' level French entry (figures from Assessment and Performance Unit 1989).

c. Students' Experience
Different experiences may shape different interests and ways of responding for girls and boys.

i. Cultural conditioning
Research indicates that children still come to school with narrow views of male and female roles (Millman and Weiner 1985). A child's social class is still the greatest indicator of future exam success. Exam results state the obvious, that above average ability children with motivating parents tend to get higher exam grades than below average students in deprived areas, (see the government's school league tables The Times, 19th Nov. 1992). Exam results also hide the real achievement of those children who are not in the G.C.S.E. A to C range, for instance those with English as a second language. These factors must always be considerations when discussing equality in relation to assessment. Every student's experience in school is shaped by public exams even though less than half of them get 5 G.C.S.E.'s in the A to C range.

ii. Environmental Factors
Researchers have tended to explain girls' underachievement in terms of environmental factors. It has been argued that girls' relative difficulty with spatial problems is because they do not have enough experience with construction toys. There is also evidence of 'fear of success' in Maths. 'Learned helplessness' is another possible explanation for differences in girls' performance (DES NC Maths 10.13 & 10.14 1991b).

iii. Reading Patterns
Girls read a wide range of books including fiction. Boys' reading tends to be non-fiction, technical and information books. The style of writing students adopt is affected by this. Depending
on which subject is being assessed and the modes of expression and learning style favoured in the subject, girls' or boys' performance will be either judged as 'good' or 'bad' (Language Awareness Project 1992).

d. Expectations
Closely linked to the role of experience are the expectations which students, teachers and parents bring to the study of the subject. Research finds evidence of differences in teacher behaviour towards girls and boys and that teachers are generally completely unaware of their own behaviour. It has been found that teachers communicate on an individual level more with boys than girls.

In Science most research indicates that attitude rather than ability accounts for gender differences. Many girls lack confidence and this is often reinforced by low parent and teacher expectations. Attribution theory argues that boys tend to attribute their success to internal, stable causes (ability) and their failures to external, unstable causes (lack of effort), whereas girls tend to reverse this pattern, taking personal responsibility for their failures, but not for their successes. Several researchers argue that it is the male sex typing of experimental tasks which may account for sex differences in performance '.we ..emphasise that Design and Technology encompasses activities of equal relevance to girls and boys' (DES NC Technology 1,42 1991c).

It is the interaction of both experience and expectation that may make an important contribution to understanding gender differences in all subjects. It is however Maths which again provides an instructive example. The National Curriculum Maths Working Party (DES 10.15,1991b) found that girls report that there is insufficient discussion in Maths and they have to work without understanding. Boys, they comment, seem prepared to do this.
e. Resources

Many classroom materials and resources reproduce a very narrow view of male and female roles. 'A large number of our story books at school, including those of high literary merit which are beautifully illustrated, still present children and adults in stereotyped activities, rigidly divided into masculine and feminine worlds, and often at the expense of the female' (Minns 1988).

In general, all-girls schools have been found to be less well resourced for science and technology than all-boys schools and co-educational schools (HMI Report 'Holy Family Convent School', London Borough of Enfield 1993).

f. Assessment Techniques

The way in which a subject is assessed, particularly in public exams, is likely to permeate the way it is organised. This involves not only the style in which students must communicate but also how they perceive the tasks they are given. If, for instance a technology task is set to design a fire escape system, boys are likely to get on immediately with ways of getting out whilst girls are more likely to look at preventative measures to prevent fire (U.L.E.A.C. 1992). The problem with this is that assessment generally concentrates on output so boys generally have more to show for their time than girls, even though their process work has been weaker. The girls' responses may be judged as a failure to understand the task rather than as defining it differently. National Curriculum technology, with its emphasis on process, could shift gender perceptions and performance of technology as a subject.

Multiple-choice testing -

Boys persistently do better than girls on multiple-choice items. One such explanation is that the 'eyes down' approach of boys is better suited to choosing one out of a number of items as correct. Avoiding having to express themselves in written English may also boost the scores of boys on such components, relative to those of girls.
G.C.S.E. coursework—
While research into multiple-choice bias has been well documented, the introduction in 1988 of the G.C.S.E. has produced some striking new evidence of the effect of changes in teaching and assessing on the relative performance of boys and girls. Central to this is the role that coursework has played since this is a compulsory feature of G.C.S.E. that was rarely present at 'O' level. The improved performance of girls relative to boys is directly related to the weighting and type of coursework required (Quinlan 1991).

g. National Curriculum Testing and 'Objectivity'
Gender bias in testing is a complex issue. It involves the relative experience of girls and boys and expectation about what they are capable of and the way in which this is assessed. The role of testing in this process involves the recognition that exams shape the curriculum, students' experience, their perceptions of subjects and which aspects of their understanding are assessed. How this is done will play a part in making a fair assessment.

The National Curriculum assessment system has begun to be implemented in classrooms. The Standard Attainment Targets consist of a criterion-referenced system which has been developed rapidly. There is a general tendency to break down criteria into smaller and more numerous criterial statements. The question of whether these minute particles do actually constitute the ability which is being assessed, and the difficulties of aggregation when essentially unlike criteria are added together in a model which makes x count as much as y, make the meaningfulness of the result questionable.

The need for criteria in assessment is obvious and anyone who assesses a piece of work, formally or informally, has criteria in mind. The problem is not so much criterion-referencing itself but the nature of the criteria and how they are arrived at. Broad, informing, and agreed criteria are very helpful in assessment; numerous, minutely detailed, prescribed criteria may
be constraining and prevent the assessor from forming an impression of the whole. A holistic valuation is a vital tenet of equality when it has been found that girls tend to be as concerned with process as much as product. Indeed, 'the need to specify criteria in detail can lead to a fragmentation of a subject into small assessable elements... criterion referencing, when grade related, is a bastard form of norm referencing' (Barrs 1990), which has been rejected in the past by many educationalists and has received considerable criticism in the United States, where it is now widely recognised that it does not assess children's normal work.

'We find it ironic that as Great Britain is turning towards a National Curriculum and a set of Attainment Targets, many California teachers are attempting to turn away from such a system and to create a space for learning more appropriate to the diverse multi-ethnic, bi-lingual student population present in our changing classrooms.'

Khalsa, Paddy and Williams 1992

Assessment can never be completely objective, as 'the kind of complex competencies that we want to assess can only be assessed through the exercise of informed judgement... and the pooling of these judgements' (Barrs 1990). Evelyn Fox Keller (1992) calls this 'dynamic objectivity' which is not unlike empathy, a form of knowledge of others that draws explicitly on the commonality of feelings and experience in order to enrich understanding of others in their own right.

Educationalists have consistently been calling for 'a broad concept of assessment which lays greater emphasis on formative assessment than rather than summative testing' (Brown 1990). The TGAT report (1988) tried to link formative assessment with the demand for summative assessment of achievement in the National Curriculum by attempting 'to reconcile the political and educational factors' (Murphy 1990). As monitoring of the early National Curriculum tests have shown, teachers have found them unhelpful and obstructive (Russen 1992, Haynes and Howes 1992,
Earlham 1992). It was found that 'scoring is clearly a less flexible method of assessment than observation' (Haynes and Howes 1992).

The source of the currently dominant beliefs which inform assessment practice is found in early philosophers of science and their concern over control, objectification, demarcation and quantification. This culture privileges this kind of knowledge which has consequences for teachers whose knowledge is generally non-numerical, often intuitive, more inclined to the narrative and gained through personal involvement. In the context of this kind of technological thinking teachers' knowledge is considered unreliable and merely 'subjective' but formal tests are considered 'objective' providing data you can 'count' on.

'Objective', summative tests are being used because it is believed that administrators need that kind of information to make decisions for instance, 'to provide evidence for league tables which are plucked out and used externally' (Russen 1992). This kind of information damages the notion of equity between schools and will result in different decisions being made from those that would result from more personal information. The new tests are a return to a meritocracy where race, class and gender articulate to the disadvantage of girls, ethnic minority and working class students. Furthermore this kind of testing 'devalues the kind of knowing of others that emphasises connectedness more than separateness' (Johnston 1992).

'In the last analysis, examinations are a mechanism for regulating social conflict and for legitimating the use of power by those who succeed in them' (Eggleston 1990).

6. Conclusion
Schools often intimate that girls play a passive role, recording interests and aptitudes of pupils through options from which they say students may freely choose. However, girls' experience is often that of restriction. This chapter has shown that traditionally male dominated subjects and curricula within subjects have been too heavily weighted in favour of boys. The
option to choose male dominated subjects or to choose activities within the subject area has not been a 'real option' at all. Resources are directed to boys' interests and experience and books in particular are often about boys. Assessment is disposed in favour of boys and recent initiatives in the national curriculum advocate the kind of objective testing which it has been shown is less favourable to girls. Girls have not been receiving their entitlement to an equal share and free choice of the curriculum.

It is recognised that there is an influence on students which goes beyond the school. Parents, religion, social class, youth culture and the media are strong socialising influences but teachers do little to challenge restricted aspirations and stereotypical views. In fact teachers often perpetuate these views, and curricula and organisation often conform to stereotypes.

The school environment reflects and reinforces much of the discrimination and inequalities that are shown towards girls and women in the wider community. These inequalities are perpetuated through schooling practices and structures, such as curricula, class-room interactions, teacher attitudes, sporting activities and the sexual division of labour. Students are divided by gender and by social class, and girls from ethnic minority backgrounds often experience an alternative category within that of 'femininity'. Girls' behaviour is given a different significance to that of boys and is sometimes judged in terms of their sexuality. The behaviour of some groups of boys is dominating and uncomfortable for students and teachers yet some teachers appear to accept it and punish girls for small misdemeanours.

Reinforcing stereotypes is damaging:

i. It treats people as a gender rather than an individual.

ii. Skills, talents and potential submerge in sex-appropriate activities and those deemed appropriate for girls are accorded less status.
iii. To meet the requirements that new skills and knowledge have produced, both boys and girls are needed for employment.

iv. Schools should be more enlightened about equality issues and changes in employment patterns.

Action educationalists might take;

i. Recognise, despite belief amongst teachers that they do not discriminate by gender, that girls and boys leave school with different qualifications, career aspirations and self-perception.

ii. Understand that change is needed. Attempts to raise awareness of issues in equality (by, for instance writing equality statements) is as far as some institutions have got and it has been found that recognition and understanding of the problem does not necessarily promote change. However, 'Strategies for change are needed now and as long as change is dependent upon principle and personal commitment, a coherent national policy for equality of opportunity in education will not emerge' (Carr 1985). In schools many of the teachers most committed to equality issues are not in middle or senior management roles and they have little opportunity to influence or initiate change (Weiner and Arnot 1987). Women also have to be active on their own behalf. Emancipatory education will not work if young people are not provided with emancipated role models.

iii. Institute change. The National Curriculum sets down a legal framework which includes every child receiving their entitlement to education according to their ability. Issues of equality are now legally binding; girls have to study science and technology and the new centralised education system could be a good basis for implementing policies of equality. The structure is there and in many instances the awareness is there, it just needs prioritising, disseminating and putting into action.
To continue to strive for equality in education inevitably means to continue to address issues of gender and feminism and the analysis of females as 'other' within the fundamentally male order. Present dilemmas and paradoxes may appear unclear but to progress and change may mean to accept the uncomfortable, unstable definition of gender and accommodate an unsettled balance between the two established sexes so everyone can receive the curriculum to which they are entitled.

This chapter has shown that the school system, despite some attempts to alleviate inequalities, continues to perpetuate the male hegemony concomitant with a patriarchal society.
Chapter 4: Music Education-The Curriculum

1. Introduction

The previous chapter has shown that there is a wide range of evidence that gender divisions throughout the whole curriculum are incorporated into curriculum principles and practice and chapter two has shown that the cultural meanings of western art music are rooted in a male ideology which prescribes femininity in particular terms.

This chapter describes how the music curriculum has been affected by the meanings ascribed to western art music as described in chapter 2 and the assumptions of a gendered curriculum as described in chapter 3. It addresses the need for additional or alternative music curricula which contain a more feminine approach and are constituted as holistic methods, and ways are explored in which sexist attitudes towards girls and boys in music education might be overcome.

Recent research in the field of gender and music education is summarised and recent changes via the national curriculum are recorded, including recommendations for considerations of equality and of assessment.

2. Background

I will review briefly the situation which has led to the current position in school music. During the 1970's the idea that music was a subject that everyone should enjoy at school rather than for the talented few was put forward by educationalists. Many teachers considered that creative music making was an important way to involve students of all abilities in the subject and Paynter's work reflects this (Paynter and Aston 1970) whilst Vulliamy and Lee (1978, 1982a, 1982b) supported rock, pop and ethnic music as a way to involve all students. 'From beginnings in a restricted curriculum whose appeal was... to a limited number of classically trained [students], music flourishes now as a many headed plant' (Paynter 1980). By 1986 the new GCSE contained a syllabus which was suitable for any student, regardless of previous musical background, who wanted to study
Music has always been a more popular subject for girls. More girls than boys take part in musical activities and girls choose music as an option choice in a ratio of about 2:1 compared with boys. Girls get better results at GCSE level (see table 2) and slightly more girls than boys choose music at A level.

### Table 2: GCSE Results for Music 1999 (England)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>% results</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>G</th>
<th>U</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Girls</td>
<td>15.0</td>
<td>22.9</td>
<td>24.9</td>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boys</td>
<td>13.4</td>
<td>13.4</td>
<td>21.0</td>
<td>15.6</td>
<td>13.6</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>1.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Equality issues for girls are concerned with, firstly, why girls tend to play only certain instruments and do not take so much part in using the new technology in the classroom. Secondly, why if such a large proportion of girls choose to study music are there so few women musicians, conductors, technicians and composers.

The stated and now statutory concern with each individual's needs and music education for all helps to put equality on a 'high profile' agenda. For instance, equality issues should not now be ignored and we must look for ways in which all students will be enabled to gain a sense of their own creative selves and have confidence in it. The music curriculum, with its complex hierarchies, can therefore be seen as gender-biased in a number of ways.
2a. Linking Music Education with particular Occupations and Skills

Broadly speaking, the vocational nature of music is seen as male and the idea of music as an accomplishment (a worthwhile leisure activity) is seen as female. Men are predominant in orchestras, bands, as technicians, composers, conductors, managers, and in the recording industry as a whole. There are large numbers of women in choirs but this tends to be unpaid. The only common route where women musicians earn a living is as a schoolteacher or giving private tuition. There are few women on the staff of music departments in Universities or in Colleges of Music. The musicians union reports that of its 38,000 members, only 12% are women (70% of these are under 35), and there are no women on its National executive (M.U.1986).

This situation does not exist because there are no talented and available women to take these jobs; 50% or more of students are women in music colleges and music departments at Universities, women are setting up their own recording studios and becoming technicians, and 'blind auditions' where the person being auditioned cannot be seen can give women a better chance of getting into orchestras and bands (Van de Vate 1981).

Traditional roles/stereotypes are reinforced in the range of professions open to musicians by the MSC's Career's pamphlet (MSC 1987). Women are shown teaching music but are absent from illustrations of music technology, retailing, broadcasting and recording industries. There is a struggle going on for women to enter paid work as musicians yet in classrooms many of the traditional stereotypes are working to perpetuate the old, gendered messages.

3. The Structuring of Knowledge and Subjects

a. The Case for Interdisciplinarity

It has been shown that teaching subjects in an integrated and interdisciplinary way is fairer on grounds of gender (UNESCO 1980 Rendel 1981), class (Bernstein 1971) and race. The UNESCO report in Women's studies found:
'By their interdisciplinarity.... women's studies could help bring about a restructuring and reunification of knowledge and scholarship at present increasingly fragmented, despite the fact that much of the most fruitful development is taking place between the boundaries of established disciplines.'

UNESCO 1990

The research shows the gains in understanding that can be made from the integrated and interdisciplinary approach. A UNESCO committee of experts stressed the necessity for women's studies to be both interdisciplinary and multi-disciplinary since the specificity of the conditions of women encompasses all disciplines.

Women are more likely to view the world without seeing subject boundaries around every activity or idea. One research student described these findings as 'intuitive knowledge' and the processes as constituting a 'hidden profession'. There is a way of perceiving knowledge which is as valid as regarding knowledge in different categories or forms; a holistic, flexible view which takes its stimulus from the current context, relies on spontaneity, improvisation and a group dynamic.

'To hive music off into specialist hands will disenfranchise women again, and worse than that, take away the richness of experience offered in many infant schools. More women than men have made up songs about puddles with their children, ephemeral pieces, not for preservation but for the joy of singing in the rain. As we tick off our National Curriculum boxes, we must not forget this'

Boyce-Tillman 1993b

Music is part of life in every human culture (Blacking 1976)

To perceive music as an abstract commodity, to isolate it and create a 'master work' which may not be related to anything, has been only a small part of the human act of making music and most often the act of men in the high art tradition of post Renaissance Europe. This particular kind of music making is
neither necessarily more worthwhile nor should it be considered of better quality.

b. Music as one of the Performing Arts

Music as a performing and expressive art form is not isolated from movement, drama, poetry and art. There are many (a majority) of situations where music is not the only art form being practised when taking part in or understanding a musical activity. Moreover some would say that music can never be 'absolute' or entirely for its own sake (Reimer 1980).

In some cultures, for instance, the arts are always conceived, as a whole. Music cannot be separated from dance or movement and some languages have no separate word for music. The holistic traditions in the arts which are commonly found in cultures outside western high art often includes music, dance and mime as one unified art form. In classical Indian art, for instance, 'dance, mime and drama stem out of an emotional structure which is initiated by the sung lyrics' (Jeyasingh 1988).

The arts are construed as conveying meanings which may not adequately be conveyed by the written word. Through art and the ritual of art, we can inform ourselves on levels other than those of rational understanding. In this, all art forms purvey meanings through semiotics and so, in Roland Barthes's terms, link with literature, drama, dance and art to study holistically the pleasure of 'jouissance', and in the terms of the new French feminists, the vitality of l'écriture féminine. The present drive in education towards an objective, thoroughly testable curriculum would seem to move away from the essence of artistic endeavour.

In the National Curriculum, Dance is with Physical Education whilst Mime would be found in Drama which has now been subsumed by English, and Music stays by itself (but at least it stays). The classifying of knowledge, and in particular the Arts, into forms in this way excludes understanding on a cross cultural level and this is exacerbated for women who are the main proponents of the oral and dance traditions. As Nashreen Rahman
pointed out, the woman artist is 'the other within the other' (Rehman 1993).

4. Structuring Knowledge within Music Education

a. What is counted as knowledge about Music

What is counted as 'knowledge' within music education is structured by historical precedent and the ways in which ideas and skills are contextualised in the teaching/learning process. In examining traditional curricula it was found that art music is the musical genre in which most music teachers have their expertise and it is the music dominantly used in schools, textbooks and by examining boards. Furthermore it was the music which was primarily considered when the state school system was first instituted at the turn of the century.

Within art music, women are given less status particularly as composers, conductors and in playing certain instruments. These constructions are also reflected in traditional curricula.

There is an important difference of opinion which exists between music educationalists. Where education is seen by some as a means of passing on high culture then music education would play a large part in the transmission of values which reflect a position where 'we would look for a growing familiarity with the master works, for an historical perspective on music, for factual knowledge about music and possibly skill with musical instruments, for a degree of musical literacy and for concert going and record buying habits...to play an instrument...assessed by carefully graded exams' (Swanwick 1992). However, Swanwick states that education should be more than the passing on of high culture and that these traditions are only part of a broader, more holistic perspective which is embraced by education. As Helen Simpson states, 'that we study music FOR ALL which has come FROM ALL ... taking cognisance of music emanating from women and girls, performed by them in the company of females and bring this into the central position of our curriculum' (Simpson 1993).
Indeed, it is only when all people are valued that education can be seen as truly qualitative and this will include 'the notated/the non-notated, the communally owned and the original work, the connection of music to life as well as the pursuit of purely musical skills, the conventional alongside the unconventional' (Boyce-Tillman 1993b).

b. Conventions of Gender Specific Use of Instruments

Studies which document the differing instruments which are learnt by boys and by girls provides evidence of imbalances between boys and girls receiving tuition on particular instruments. Abeles and Porter (1978) found that in the United States difference in preference according to gender was 'not very strong' in young children of Kindergarten age but more pronounced in children beyond grade three. At this stage, boys chose from a relatively restrictive group while girls chose a wider variety. From this age group onwards the boys' choices remained the same and the girls chose instruments with more 'feminine' connotations as they got older.

It was found that parents preferred clarinet, flute and violin for their daughters, drum, trombone and trumpet for their sons while 'cello and saxophone had no significant differences. Instrument gender associations were mainly connected with parental influences and also music educator influences. Abeles and Porter found that sex-stereotyping of musical instruments 'constricts behaviour and opportunities of individuals in participation in ensembles and selection of vocation'.

The factors that informed these so called 'choices' made by children were social conventions of gender specific instrument selection based on historical precedent. Sproule (1989), by her title 'The Angel at the Piano' encapsulates the bourgeois image of the female musician of the nineteenth century. 'Singing and playing the piano - the two went together - were an essential part of a middle class girls' education.' (Sproule 1989)
Who should play what musical instrument is traditionally associated with what is considered (naturally) masculine or feminine. Yet the national curriculum working party appear more concerned with the smaller number of boys who play orchestral instruments than gender inequalities which are detrimental to girls. 'Twice as many girls as boys learn instruments, and the proportions are yet more out of balance in woodwind and string. So it may be that the opening up of a lifetime's enjoyment of music making is being denied to many boys in particular' (DES 1991d). However they do go on to say that at the primary level teachers should '...ensure that girls as well as boys are given the opportunity to play large, loud instruments (drums, cymbals, mini basses)' (DES 1991d).

A DES statement says that teachers should monitor the engagement of both boys and girls in musical activities to ensure that choices are based on genuine musical preferences (DES 1991e, Music 5-14, p.52, 11:10). Teachers and Education Authorities should now be concerning themselves with this issue, taking active steps to ensure that students make real choices, and some of them have documented their efforts and achievements (Pugh 1992, Bruce 1993).

c. The National Curriculum: Music as a Foundation Subject

'We are all prepared by our education to enter a world which many of us see as dominated physically, politically and aesthetically by men, and to such an extent that perhaps the 'educations' we acquire are merely preparing us for reality. But it is a reality whose shape, form and structure are changing' (Arts Council 1993).

One reality which has not changed very much is the composition of the National Curriculum music working group membership. Chaired by a man, there were three women out of the thirteen group members and a further two men acted as assessors (the 5 secretaries were all women). The issue of gender and equity in relation to panels and committees is important. Arts minister Richard Luce in 1988 expressed, in a letter to the Arts Council, his concerns about the under representation of women on boards.
and panels. The effect is that women's issues are marginalised and male domination is perpetuated.

The rhetoric of the National Curriculum, however, with its insistence on equality of treatment for all, should be a welcome opportunity for disadvantaged groups. There is now a legal framework which includes the compulsory teaching of music up to and including key stage three and which seeks to create the same chances for everyone to take part in a structured course of study. Music is to be a mainly practical subject with two attainment targets (AT's), AT1 Performing and Composing and AT2 Listening and Appraising. There are programmes of study (PoS) which define what it is in music that students should do to achieve the end of key stage statements.

Whilst the content of the National Curriculum's final orders for music has only two attainment targets (instead of the three educationalists had recommended, representing playing, listening and composing), and an emphasis on western music, at least music remains essentially a practical subject and the Order has a built in flexibility.

The NCC proposals for music, equal opportunities - sex and gender (DES 1991d) (see this chapter section 5a), expressed more of a concern with boys' needs, probably because music is a more popular subject with girls. For many girls, the music area may provide the only 'safe' place in the school. Whilst play-grounds and other 'general' spaces are often difficult places for girls to socialise in, a choir practice at lunchtime or recorder club at break, the opportunity to practice in the hall or tidy up the music cupboard are all sites for female presence. Must these areas also become dominated by boys? Whilst, ideally both sexes should share in the resources of a school, until the male dominated school culture truly recedes, girls need a space.

It is now up to teachers to implement the curriculum in a way most suited to the students they teach. This may prove difficult because 'dramatically shrinking budgets, lack of expert back-up
and direction, reduced hours [and] redundancies [are] the reality facing music teachers in 1993 and beyond' (Hulme 1993), and where 'competition for resources is keenest ....males appear to prosper' (Arts Council 1993).

d. Assessment

i. Quality/Equality and Whose Notions of Quality are Counted?
The arguments around quality are complex and diffuse. Quality, in the arts 'has been defined for several hundred years and it is that several hundred years which excludes me as a black woman artist' observed one woman, and 'the rules of the game change but not the players' observed another (Arts Council 1993 p.17). The point being made is that what has become defined as quality is more in line with the aesthetic considerations of men and that women's creative work has been historically undervalued. 'The male dominated aesthetic is narrow' says Martinez\(^1\), feminine aesthetics which are often more concerned with process, context, improvisation, group creativity and devised pieces, are less concerned with high status and individual adulation for their work. In the DES Proposals for Music 5-16 (1991d) some of these principles are included in 'The nature of assessment in Music' (9.7 p.45), but they do not appear in the final NCC Guidance 1992 which accompanies the statutory Order for music. These points need due consideration.

What is needed, says Val Walsh\(^2\) is critical engagement not criticism; not arbiters and gatekeepers of what has been considered to be high culture and worthwhile but a dialogue and an engagement with the material. Teachers need time and space to approach their students' work at this more insightful level, it

---

\(^1\)Odaline de la Martinez, a composer, conductor and author speaking at the Symposium of Women in the Arts at a seminar on The Role and Responsibility of the Critic, Birmingham, 5-7 March 1993

\(^2\)Val Walsh, writer and critic in feminism and the arts speaking at the Women's Studies Network Conference at a seminar called Feminism and Nature: Ethical/ Political Connections, Northampton 16-18 July 1993
is a far more vigorous and thorough way of valuing students' work than objectives-based testing.

There seems to be a belief that equality is the antithesis to any concept of quality yet equality does actually equal quality (Arts Council 1993), because by removing barriers and by stimulating opportunity, there is an enrichment and plurality which comes from the whole and is representative of humanity.

ii. National Curriculum Requirements Seek for more Objectivity and Simplification in Methods of Assessment

We regularly talk about students in terms of their ability as if it were a completely natural, non-value-laden attribute. To judge an art form necessarily invokes what may be described as a more subjective, (less objective) consideration. Guidance on assessment for music in the National Curriculum states that 'assessment... should be sufficiently flexible for teachers to choose an approach which suits the needs of their pupils' (DES 1992e). The end of key stage 3 statements are:

Attainment Target 1.

Pupils will be able to use sounds made by their voices and a range of instruments with confidence and control. They will have explored different musical structures and have expressed their own ideas, feelings and moods through improvisations and compositions. They will be familiar with the various forms of musical language and able to read and write music with some fluency and accuracy. Over the key stage they will have learned a range of songs and instrumental pieces and have acquired the confidence and skills to perform to a variety of audiences.

Attainment Target 2

Pupils will be able to listen to music and describe features using a developed musical vocabulary. They will have heard a wide range of music and show an understanding of musical traditions from different cultures and periods recognising the contribution of a range of influential composers and performers. They will have begun to develop
an appreciation of a variety of music and be able to listen critically and express informed opinions. The end of key stage statements are to provide 'bench marks against which pupils can be judged at the end of the key stage [and] a framework for assessment and reporting to parents'. There is clearly some flexibility for teachers in both interpreting the key stage statements and in the assessment activity itself. Teachers will have to be careful to devise methods of assessment which comply with National Curriculum requirements and reflect a fair and equitable appraisal of all their students.

There is to be no 'scoring' but instead 'descriptive judgements' are to be given based on the teacher's own decision about 'what evidence is required (from, for example, a performance, composition, a piece of writing, pupil's discussion, etc.); (and possibly) to have determined what the specific criteria are for the achievement for that statement' (NCC 1992).

Educators have the opportunity to select broad and informing criteria and to make meaningful assessments if they have the time and the willingness to do so. In secondary schools there is very often only one full time music specialist who has the responsibility for reporting on the musical aptitudes in composing, playing and listening for over 500 students. It might be very persuasive for music teachers, in line with other subjects on the curriculum, which have objective, summative testing methods, to construct ways of assessing which are constraining and do not value a student's work as a whole.

There has been a growing realization in all fields that we construct rather than extract meaning, that science, and therefore being 'scientific' or 'objective', is a value-laden activity. These realizations have further consequences including the breaking down of the distinction between 'objective' and 'subjective'. Objectivity has come to be viewed as an elevating term applied to the results of tests whilst subjectivity a derogatory term applied condescendingly to the observations of
teachers. These terms have not been gender neutral in that the 'subjective' observations are mostly made by teachers who are frequently perceived as predominantly ('emotional') women. The privileging of numbers over narrative is concerned with the oppressive and controlling nature of the beliefs about science which underlies the current changes in assessment practices. In music education the need for self-evaluation or reflectiveness and the need for reflective communities, not just for students but also for teachers, are in danger of being overlooked if current trends in specific criterion referencing are followed.

Assessment does not promise to be the simple task it is hoped to be, yet with some thought and further guidelines there appears to be the possibility to make sound, considered appraisals. Problems are in the amount of time available and pressures on teachers to adopt simplistic, objective testing, (cf. chapter 3 section 5g).

iii. Teachers and Students' Attitudes to Girls' (creative) Work

Prior to the National Curriculum, teachers have not been required to make such judgements at key stages 1, 2 and 3 and need to develop this expertise. 'HMI visits to secondary schools in the last four years have found that assessment arrangements in music generally constitute one of the less developed areas of practice' (DES 1992d). It has been found that 'inequities experienced by women are both structural and attitudinal...many women continue to absorb and reflect the negative attitude towards their abilities as artists. In reviewing the inequitable position of women one of the factors identified was the value placed on women's work in general' (Arts Council 1993). As teachers work out their criteria and the evidence they require which constitutes a high standard, girls are in danger of being judged by male standards of quality and of encountering discrimination based entirely on the fact that they are female (cf. chapter 3 section 5 and this chapter section 5c).
Characteristics of the Teaching/Learning Context

a. Requirements and Expectations Concerning Matters of Equality since The Education Reform Act 1988 with Special Reference to Girls and Music:

a. The opening section of the act states that the curriculum of a school,

'satisfies the requirements of the act if it is a balanced and broadly based curriculum which:

a) promotes the spiritual, moral, cultural mental and physical development of pupils at the school and of society; and

b) prepares such pupils for the opportunities, responsibilities and experience of adult life.'

b. Since the ERA 1988 other clarifications of the act around issues of equality have been published by government departments and by national statutory bodies. The following quotations are mainly from those papers which identify gender as a concern.

Lesbian and Gay issues become a concern when considering gender and wider issues of equality. The Local Government Bill (May 1988), section 28, prohibits LEA's (not teachers) from

' - intentionally promoting homosexuality
 - publishing material with the intention of promoting homosexuality
 - promoting the teaching in any maintained school of the acceptibility of homosexuality as a pretended family relationship'

'Teachers should continue to exercise their professional judgement in the matter of sex education and there is no reason why lesbian and gay issues should not be discussed in this context' (NUT 1991). The issue may also be discussed in a number of different contexts, such as within an arts programme (NCCL 1992).

DES Circular 5/89 February 1989

This circular quotes the words cited above from the ERA and points out that the 1988 act 'emphasises the need for
broadth and balance in what pupils study' and that 'cultural development and the development of society should be promoted'.

DES Guidance for schools: From Policy to Practice, 1989
This document gives guidance to headteachers and governors on the production of school development plans to help implement the new legal requirements, and emphasises the concept of entitlement. 'In effect....(the act)...entitles every pupil to a curriculum which is broad and balanced ... The principle that each pupil should have a broad and balanced curriculum which is also relevant to his or her particular needs is now established in law'. The document then states: 'That principle must be reflected in the curriculum of every pupil. It is not enough for such a curriculum to be offered by the school: it must be fully taken up by each individual pupil'.

The document recalls and emphasises that 'the whole curriculum is much greater than the foundation subjects of the national curriculum....(and includes)... coverage across the curriculum of gender and multicultural issues... (and)... the intangibles which come from the spirit and ethos of each school, its pupils and staff'. Within the context of this very wide definition of the whole curriculum, the document states that 'a commitment to providing equal opportunities for all pupils, and a recognition that preparation for life in a multicultural society is relevant to all pupils, should permeate every aspect of the curriculum'. It goes on to state that 'in order to make access to the whole curriculum a reality for all pupils, schools need to foster a climate in which equality of opportunity is supported by a policy to which the whole school subscribes and in which positive attitudes to ....cultural diversity are actively promoted'.
Proposals of the Secretary of State for Education and Science, and the Secretary of State for Wales, for Physical Education, August 1991

This document states that 'Working towards equality of opportunity requires that teachers should treat all children as individuals with their own abilities, difficulties and attitudes. All children will have their individual gifts to contribute...' The document distinguishes between equal opportunity and equal access: 'It would be a mistake to equate access with opportunity, and it is important to appreciate the distinction between the two. In some schools pupils may be said to have the same access to curriculum physical education, regardless of their sex, religion, ability, or ethnic background. But it may not be the case that these children also have equal opportunities to participate in different activities. Children's capacities to take best advantage of the activities provided are affected by the attitudes and expectations of teachers; the preconditions for access which are often implicit; the interactions within mixed sex, mixed ability and multicultural groups; and the previous experiences and abilities of the pupils'.

Proposals of the Secretary of State for Education and Science and the Secretary of State for Wales, for Music, for ages 5 to 14, August 1991

This section starts by making general statements 'All pupils, regardless of ethnic and cultural origin, of gender, and of physical and mental ability, have the right to experience music. Indeed we believe that music has a very special role to play in breaking down barriers between pupils and releasing potential within them. In order to open up opportunities for all three points need to be borne in mind: a) pupils may need positive steering towards experiences and activities in which they can succeed; b) the tasks towards which pupils are steered may need to be adapted to enable them to respond positively; c) additional
resources may be needed if we are to ensure equal opportunities for all pupils.

A subsection called 'Sex and gender' makes the following three points:

'There is only one respect in which children's musical activities need be influenced by their sex. It is with the changing voice at puberty, more disturbing to some boys than to girls, though to some extent common to both. We have consciously retained, in the statements of attainment at the higher levels, the requirement to sing as well as play, but have recognised the need to nurture and protect changing voices by leaving open the option that they may be used only in group performance rather than in a solo capacity. Teachers will need to exercise particular care in the range and tessitura demanded of the voice at this stage (11.8).

At present roughly twice as many girls as boys learn instruments, and the proportions are yet more out of balance in woodwind and strings. So it may be that the opening up of a lifetime's enjoyment of music making is being denied to many boys in particular. Ways may have to be found of tapping and releasing their musical sensitivity (for instance, by starting boys only choirs) in the face of peer group pressure to conceal it. On the other hand microtechnology and pop music appear to have attracted more boys to GCSE since it began - a welcome trend, provided that it does not conceal a disinclination on the part of girls towards this area of musical experience (11.9).

It is important that teachers should monitor the engagement of both boys and girls in musical activities to ensure that choices are based on genuine musical preferences. At the primary level, for example, both girls and boys should be given the opportunity to play large, loud instruments (drums, cymbals, mini basses): and at the secondary level teachers might check that the composers studied and mentioned are not exclusively male' (11.10).
The above wording is almost exactly the same as that in the National Curriculum Music Working Group, interim report, February 1991, except the omission of the following at the beginning of 11.9.: 'We urge the avoidance of stereotyping by gender. There is evidence at present that boys and girls have developed quite distinctive attitudes to music.' Her Majesty's Inspectorate, Annual Report on Education in England 1990-1991, January 1992

With regard to further and higher education as well as with regard to schools, HMI states that 'Progress on equal opportunities is best described as patchy. In some schools and colleges, awareness of the take up of educational opportunities as between the sexes and among ethnic minority groups is high; in others it is totally inadequate. Most institutions have policies for promoting equality of opportunity but too often the gap between policy and practice is unacceptably wide' (para, 28). Equality Assurance in the School Curriculum: A consultative paper on meeting the new legal requirements Runneymede Trust April 1992

The report acknowledges that 'Both research and practical experience show that there are specific measures which schools can take to avoid perpetuating inequalities in wider society. Schools can, instead, intervene to help redress and reduce inequalities'. However it is realised that 'they are constrained by factors over which they have no control.....for example in the labour market and housing system, and in the overall climate of public opinion'(2.12 and 2.13).

The paper also makes the point that there is 'a distinction between equality of access, opportunity and treatment on the one hand and equality of outcome and results on the other'. They see the key issue as 'whether a school is doing as much as it reasonably can to ensure that it provides genuine equality of access, opportunity and treatment for all. Such equality is not merely a matter of
'offering' opportunities rather it is a matter of taking positive action to ensure that opportunities are taken up and used' (2.15).

Department of Education and Science, Music in the National Curriculum (England), statutory instruments April 1992e

There is no reference to issues of equality in either the non-statutory guidance (June 1992) or in this document. However the following general requirements are made for programmes of study:

'....pupils should be given opportunities to: undertake a balanced programme of activities.....perform and listen to music in a variety of genres and styles, from different periods and cultures. The repertoire chosen should be broad.....It should include examples of works taken from: the European 'classical' tradition, from its earliest roots to the present day; folk and popular music; music of the countries and regions of the British Isles; a variety of cultures, Western and non-Western.....and chosen in the light of pupils' needs, backgrounds and stages of musical development.'

Conclusion

There is no specific 'encouragement' to take an equal opportunities approach and there is no precedent set in the statutory instruments and non-statutory guidance for music. However, there is wide scope for interpretation in the final instruments and there is no stated expression against gender equality in this or other official documents (except concerning sexuality in clause 28, and that only applies to Local Authority initiatives). There have been, and continue to be, materials from established educationalists who produce positive statements and guidelines on differing aspects of equality. Teachers are free to take an approach which involves quality and equality.
b. Gender and Technology

Whilst the provision of equal opportunities and multicultural perspectives are cross curricular dimensions in the National Curriculum, information technology (IT) is a cross curricular skill identified by the National Curriculum document as being transferable and independent of the content of any subject.

Recent developments in music education have seen the increasing use of IT, including electronics. Electronic keyboards are an accepted part of a school music department's resources, as is a basic composing program for use with a computer. Some schools have more sophisticated hard and software to enable sounds to be synthesised, altered and saved and there may also be a sequencer for compositional purposes. There may also be items such as sound modules, samplers, sequencers, synthesizers (including keyboard synthesizers, Musical Instrument Digital Interface (MIDI) systems, rhythm machines, effects units and many other packages. Purpose designed sequencing software for computer systems which allows the computer to act as a digital recorder has proved to be useful to music departments as this enables compositions to be built up in real or step time, refined, edited and printed out. The composition can be analyzed in sections and looping, transposition, exploration of timbre, texture and form can be investigated. There is also other electronic equipment, not defined as IT, such as multi-track recorders.

Clearly, much of this equipment can only be used by small groups at any one time. The National Curriculum working group on music say that 'boys and girls have developed quite distinctive attitudes to music...microtechnology and pop music appears to have attracted more boys to GCSE since it began - a welcome trend, provided that it does not conceal a disinclination on the part of girls towards this area of musical experience' (DES 1991d).

For women's music to develop successfully, women have to become technicians and share in the control of production and distribution. A few women have set up their own studios and...
workshops but for instance Sally Morris and Kathy Prince found that in their community centre in Liverpool 'for countless male bands who've used our free practice space, we are now in our nineteenth year, seeing the first all girl band' (Spare Rib 1986).

Turkle (1988) regards the issue of women and technology as 'computer reticence', an inclination to stay away from formal systems 'because the computer becomes a personal and cultural symbol of what a woman is not' (Turkle 1988). Students see in the technical machinery around them not just machines but the predominantly male culture that has grown up around them, a culture where the machine is a medium which supports a powerful sense of mastery. Especially in adolescence, male students may come to define themselves in terms of things they can control 'because in our society, men are more likely than women to master anxieties about people by turning to the world of things and formal systems' (Turkle 1988).

c. Singing as Expression and Emotion

It seems there may be a danger of superseding singing with technology because boys often do not like singing (See this chapter section 5a no. 11.8, DES 1991d).

There appears to be more concern with boys' lack of interest and sensitivity in involvement with music than with girls' equality issues. Girls have taken part in choral activities in large numbers for generations, the emotionality of singing being something enjoyed by girls and not feared as it appears to be by some boys. 'Our voice, our own specific sound, is our identity and the most intense, vitalized manifestation of our breath (our life). Hearing ourselves and sensing the vibration and resonance throughout our bodies as we tone chant or sing can give us a sense of relaxation and unity within ourselves and with the world beyond ourselves' (McGinnis 1980). In some cultures it has been found that vocalising is a strategy women use to overcome social tensions, 'the pounding song is one of the most powerful modes
of verbal expression for (women's) concerns and... conditions of being' (Mvula 1986).

Whilst the issue of boys' reticence towards singing has to be addressed, it should not be done at the expense of girls or prioritised in such a way that girls lose their small space to express themselves. This is why a whole school ethos of equality is important.

6. Equality and Music Education Research
This is a relatively new field and work is only just starting in schools and colleges. A new awareness of gender imbalances in the field of music which (re)emerged in the 1980's has informed educationalists and work on many areas of the music curriculum is taking place in the 1990's.

a. Women's Involvement in Music
The eighth International Women in Music Conference took place in Spain in 1992 and the first National Music and Gender Conference took place in London, July 1991. An organisation called Women in Music (WiM) was formed in London in 1987 to recognise the work of women in all aspects of music and to aim for a 50-50 gender balance. Emanating from these events came a concern with gender equality in music education.

The Women in Music Education (WiMED) project group worked with Bristol University to organise the first National Music Education and Gender Conference which took place in Bristol in March 1993.

b. Written Resources
The WiMED group produced a pilot pack of materials which reflect equality in music for classroom use and are currently being used in schools to be considered for inclusion in 'Musicfile' (an annually published pack of lesson plans). 'Women in Music' by Aelwyn Pugh 1991 is the only textbook specifically about women musicians directed at key stage three students.
The 'Genderwatch Pack' (EOC 1987, updated 1992), gives guidance on how to take an equal opportunities approach in all subjects on the National Curriculum. The music section asks us to consider a number of questions, for instance: Are books and work sheets chosen whose illustrations are free from gender stereotyping? Do you intentionally avoid grouping children by gender, for example, for comparing the singing of different verses of a song? How do you endeavour to ensure that a balance between female and male instrumental teachers is achieved? Is the opportunity to excel in a tradition other than Western European available in the locality to female and male young persons..? (Glynn- Jones 1992)

c. Teaching about Women Composers

There has been a growing awareness of women composers in history as more are being discovered and their music is being played and recorded. However, whether they are Hildegarde von Bingen, Clara Schumann or Ethel Smyth, they are continually marginalised within teaching programmes whilst they are included as an exotic group for optional study or as token additions to the existing canon of 'great composers' (Fitzpatrick, 1993). In an attempt to have women composers incorporated into the history of music and into educational curricula and syllabuses, Askew and Wilkins 1993, found that attitudes, resources, quality and quantity of music were problematic. They concluded that there was a need to raise consciousness around the issue and to take action by seeking funding for projects and the presenting of work in this area.

Now it is possible to obtain at least some works by composers such as Fanny Mendelssohn Hensel, Cécile Chaminade and Emma Lou Diemer they can be used to teach young people and provide examples of women as primary creators (Briscoe J.1992).

Similarly women musicians and composers from genres other than western art music can be included in the National Curriculum which includes 'other musical traditions'. For instance, women composers of Rags (Lindemann 1980), Blues singers (Reitz 1980), gospel music, performers and teachers (Hinley 1984), folk singers (Cormier 1980), banjo women of Appalachia (Hayes 1980), sitar players (Rehman 1993), call and response, work songs, pounding
songs (Mvula 1986) and many other examples where women have instituted or have been very much a part of the genre.

d. Feminist Criticism in Music Education
'Feminist criticism has provided a theoretical space and practical content for the beginnings of a feminist music education' (Lamb 1993). There is a theory and practice struggle taking place as the new theorists point to sexual meanings and metaphors in music which carry a significance into our lives (McClary 1991). The way in which power relations are embedded in a gendered music discourse is being uncovered in differing aspects of music and music education.

One such aspect involves how women in music suffer a great deal of sexual harassment, perhaps due to the very great imbalance between the large numbers of female students and the teachers, who are predominantly men (Lamb 1993). 'Sexual harassment (at college) is so prevalent, yet so unacknowledged (it) suggests an extraordinary blindness on the part of institutions in which it occurs' (Arts Council 1993).

A new movement 'Critical Musicology' starting this year (1993), seeks to extend or challenge other forms of musicological enquiry. Critical Musicology includes Feminist Musicology which addresses issues such as 'music as culture', gendered language' and 'gender and timbre'. Critical Musicology is also 'a form of belated response to changes in British music education, enacting again a tension between widening access to the subject, and protecting security of the subject' (Griffiths 1993). The first UK Critical Musicology Conference, 'Goodbye Great Music?' is being held at the University of Salford, April 1995.

e. Role Models
Research shows that 'Women as role models for creativity in music must be provided by music educators' (Briscoe A.1993). To redress the imbalance of gender between music educators and their students, Roberta Lamb is concerned with the function of the mentor/role model in music tradition and her ongoing research
seeks to identify women's responses, resistances and initiatives within that function. It is also important for young people to come into close contact with women musicians in order to broaden their perceptions of gender, for instance women have a particular role as jazz musicians which is often overlooked (Tarr 1993).

f. A Hidden Agenda
Girls are more actively involved in school music, they opt for GCSE in a ratio with boys of 2:1, and they achieve higher grades whereas public music-making is largely men's domain. Lucy Green looked at teachers' perceptions of boys' and girls' musical relationships and found that 'musically active girls are understood to be numerous, and mediocre; boys, rare and outstanding' (Green 1993). Sarah Maidlow examined the perception of 'A' level students in the state sector and in private schools with regard to gender. She was unable to find any differences between attitudes and expectations of girls and boys. She concluded that other factors must have been at work to cause the difference in the numbers of men and women working in orchestras, as conductors, composers and so on (Maidlow 1993).

The discrepancy between the students' perception of themselves and the gendered assumptions that teachers and others make about students would seem to be particularly contradictory in the area of music education. The problem here appears to involve a philosophy on life and way of viewing the world which strikes at fundamental beliefs about maleness and femaleness (this issue is discussed in several other places in this thesis).

g. Teaching 'Music' not 'Composers'
Western art music has a tradition of teaching music through 'the great composers'. If the premise of music teaching is taken from this stance then other musics including the music of many women, will be rendered inferior (Peacock-Jezic 1988). Music which is ascribed as anon. and trad. is generally music from the oral tradition which has probably been devised by many different people and may have changed as it was passed down the generations, 'in the folk traditions we have women's and men's
creativity hidden and mingled- an example of communal creation and ownership...it would be a great loss if we lost this process of oral transmission' (Boyce-Tillman 1993b).

h. A Personal and Relational Function of Music

The personal and relational is often associated with femaleness and in all cultures music has been personal, relational and served a healing purpose thus helping people survive in the most awful circumstances. For instance the blues music that came from the black slaves in America. Women sing lullabies, make up songs for children and 'have sung their way through the washing up, the cleaning the preparing of food and managed to survive their role which was often as victims of male aggression and struggle for superiority' (Boyce-Tillman 1993b).

Music unites people when they play and sing together; National Anthems, group ritual and chants, school songs, religious music and so on, all serve a connecting purpose. Jill Purce, who is interested in the healing and transformative power of sound has said that 'the real aim of the assembly is to tune the pupils and teachers of the school into something higher than themselves so that the activities of the school can be harmonious, so that the development of the children can carry on smoothly'. She used chanting and singing with students in a way that it has always been used and found students receptive and 'right at the centre' of what was going on (Purce 1986).

Frankie Armstrong, a voice teacher and folk singer uses vocal sounds to express thoughts and feelings that may be impossible to articulate through speech; for her it is a 'way of seeing' the world. Through her protest music she exorcises her anger about women's oppression but then in the words of a song points out that 'hate corrodes the mind and soul, hate prevents us from being whole, we must face the pain, face the fear, face the hate and let it go' (Armstrong 1992). The popular music movement of young people has vented its frustrations through song, giving them an outlet for their opinions. Young people need to tap this valuable medium for tuning into themselves and to others.
Some women artists invoke the art of healing through music and away from the professionalisation of the sciences, 'returning healing to the arts where it once belonged when women were midwives and shamans, holistic healers of the mind-body totality' (Orenstein 1985). 'Music and dance (sound and motion) have always been the tools by which people have established spiritual union with what is unknown and invisible... music has continued to be the tool for making connections, both inwardly and out into the world' (McGinnis 1980).

1. Improvisation
Many musicians 'play by ear' and within the oral tradition music has been passed down by listening and reinterpreting. Improvisation is seen as an important way of expressing music which is more flexible and does not require a written notation. 'It seems that notation has come between the generator and the exponent of the musical utterance and has inhibited the passage of clear communication...students (need) to play without notation, to facilitate the necessary vibrancy in their timbres' (Simpson 1993).

7. Conclusion
In this chapter curriculum principles and practices in music education are seen as agents of social and cultural reproduction; in this case specifically oriented towards the maintenance of existing patterns of gender inequality. Gendered music curricula are found to select/allocate students into social/economic roles in accordance with assigned sex and then operate to reinforce the development of an 'appropriate' gender for each student by forming subject identities or gendered roles within the subject.

There is a legal requirement for students to have equal treatment and recommendations that all aspects of the curriculum should be examined in terms of equality. New curricular in the National Curriculum and new schemes of assessment have the propensity to reflect a male view of the world and a bias for western art music with its own inherent biases. However, the National Curriculum does provide a possibility for additional curricula and
alternative methods of assessment because it is not entirely prescriptive.

The current, gendered practices in music education are a result of particular events and philosophies which have taken place in the established and well recorded history of music. An alternative or additional tradition reveals the involvement of women in the making of music at a deep and profound level throughout history. The absence of acknowledgement of the extent of this involvement and the absence, to a large degree, of the female approach to music, is being contested by some music educators. There is a split in the opinion of music educators whether music should be taught in the traditional way or whether a more holistic approach should be taken which includes more women's music and more of women's way of working. The teaching of music using this more humane approach would take into account the personal and interpersonal, including not so much 'a training' as 'a sense of the creative self'.
Chapter 5
Methodology and Epistemology

1. Introduction
The stated aim of this thesis is to contribute to a movement for change of classroom practise in music education by investigating inequalities and focusing on gender.

Chapters 2, 3 and 4 addressed the central question of women's gendered representation as practitioners of European High Art music. Evidence was presented of structures and practises which continue to support a gendered music education and so contribute to the perpetuation of a biased system.

Key questions have been raised in each chapter:
Chapter 2 - What are the features in the history of women's music which have contributed to their position as under-represented and undervalued music makers?
Chapter 3 - What are the features in the history of women's education which have contributed to the position of women musicians?
Chapter 4 - How has the history of women's music and women's education (as described in chapters 2 and 3) been significant to the music education women receive and how does music education maintain a system of inequality?

Having already constructed this theoretical framework around the issues of women in music and a gendered music curriculum the next stage sought to discover how the gendered messages described in chapters 2 and 3 were passed down in the history of music and in the history of education (especially from the nineteenth century), and why they have been accepted by musicians, teachers, musicologists and others. These questions are considered at a practical level and this involves the building of three case studies (phase 1 of fieldwork research), each with a distinctive constellation of characteristics and elements which may affect girls in different ways. The case studies focus on music education at key stage 3 and how girls fare in the subject of
music in three comprehensive schools in a Greater London borough.

When the data from the case studies had been gathered in and evaluated the next phase was to implement strategies which could change practice in order to improve the situation for girls in music education.

The approach taken was that of action research. Two action research projects (phase 2) then followed which use information from the case studies and teacher self-knowledge as a starting point to make changes in music education practice at key stage 3.

Before addressing the case studies and the action research projects, in sections 2, 3 and 4 of this chapter, consideration is given to three key features of the method which have an impact in relation to theory. These are developments in feminist methodology and epistemology, ethnography, and action research. Their relevance is justified whilst recognising inherent limitations. Section 5 is a discussion of the values and ethical issues which arose and the difficulties that were encountered. Sections 6 and 7 describe the samples, sites of research and types of research instruments used and give an account of how phases 1 and 2 of the research were planned. Section 8 offers some concluding statements and suggests the uses to which the research might be put.

This thesis was undertaken at a time when feminist research had begun to undergo the change from a reactive to a more autonomous mode of enquiry. The method of research and reflective processes were revised and incorporated as the research took place and the thesis was produced. The research methodology and epistemology as a whole has always been in relation to the feminisms and sociologically based, which meant from the start, taking account of women and girls in what can be viewed as a sexually as well as socially divided society. The methodology set out to use mainly qualitative methods and to include women and girls' personal and subjective accounts (taking cognisance of
differences between women), and the researcher's position in the research (Roberts 1981). It also started by placing the female at the centre of thinking (Weiner 1985), making women and girls visible (Spender 1982) and challenging the dominance of the male view of the world (Mahoney 1985).

As the research went on in the late 1980s and early 1990s, considerations involving a more post-modernist stance began to pervade the research design. For example, it became difficult to categorise issues of gender in discreet headings to the exclusion of issues concerning social class, race, sexuality and other issues of equality. Whilst these issues had been in my mind, the theoretical debate which helps clarify thinking was only just emerging and some of the methodological reasoning only crystallised during the research process.

2. A Feminist Methodology and Epistemology
a. Background to Feminist Research Methodologies

Feminist methodology is a rapidly changing and developing field of study. Some earlier influences of the feminisms or the feminist critique of sociology were a reaction to traditional educational research methodology where women and girls were virtually ignored except as they related to men and 'the male' was seen as the norm. Studies of social mobility, schools, work, leisure, youth culture and the family had either ignored issues of gender or saw females only from a male perspective and this had been the case whether taking a functionalist, a 'new' sociology or Marxist perspective. Patriarchal systems in sociological research in education had been 'taken for granted', 'intuitively felt', and 'biologically determined' and feminists recognised that these systems were so embedded and unarticulated that they had gone unrecognised in the research work or the issues were not taken up significantly (Llewellyn 1980).

At this time material and literature from the existing body of knowledge exposed not only male dominance but also absences, silences, gaps and inadequacies about girls and women. Researchers had not set out in a conscious way only to count the
male view of the world and to see men as the principle actors; it was part of the social conditions of the time.

It was of great concern for feminists around the late 1970s and early 1980s to be rigorous about theoretical and methodological issues by taking gender into account in practice as well as in theory. In a political climate of female separatism the focus was on women and how to release them from their oppression. Qualitative methods, at this time, were seen by many feminists as the most appropriate research methods.

The following principles underlying feminist methodology were significant when the research was initiated:

i. It is the requirements of practice that direct the role of theorising. Stanley and Wise (1983) argue that the confines of research models which elevate theory above practice because practice is experience and is therefore subjective, constrict and divert attention from issues of gender. The requirements of practice, as judged by practitioners cannot be addressed without some theorising and the theorising is derived in some measure from experience. Women, because of their wider experience and subordinate position in society are able to create theory which attempts to uncover perspectives that men have vested interests in not being able to see.

In education there is not only a need to take a critical view which relates theory to practice but also to construct a model of practice which does not simply offer a picture of the way things are working but is itself a catalytic agent for change. It is such a model which the Action Research method seeks to create.

ii. Girls and women are placed at the centre of thinking: the research process should make girls and women visible. Issues around an exclusive female context remain controversial (Deem 1984). 'Educationalists working in girl centred education projects have found it '...a continuing struggle simply to keep the focus of the curriculum development on girls' (Chisholm &
Holland 1984). To place girls at the centre rather than at the periphery of what is happening, taking their point of view as important and valid and seeing situations from their perspective is difficult even for a woman researcher because it means challenging the dominance of the male experience which is all pervading. The researcher finds herself having to consciously think in terms of the girls' experience in a situation where there is competitiveness, hierarchical structures, heterosexuality, oppression, noise, aggression and opposition (Stanley & Wise 1983). The research, therefore, does include the category 'men' because men's behaviours relate to the experiences of women.

iii. The personal cannot be separated from the political. Theoretical sophistication may be desirable politically, to mystify research findings and make them accessible to only a few or as an academic discipline concerned with maintaining its cognitive boundaries, but it may only serve to obscure issues rather than clarify them (Walker 1989). The personal and everyday which includes feelings and experience is therefore used in analysis of how girls' and women's oppression occurs. The personal cannot be ignored because, subjective experiences which are primary concerns to the people in the research project, validate women's experience. If the research is to be of use to the researched then the researcher must be in a position to suggest strategies for change which are useful and coherent to them.

iv. Power is redistributed to those being researched by including their perspectives and ideas. If the researcher had complete control of the form and content of an interview or set of interactions the researched would become objects as part of the 'objective' research. However, the researcher retained ultimate control and responsibility but sought the trust and warmth of an interactive research relationship which was non-hierarchical, where the personal identity of the interviewer was invested in the relationship and where there was a strategy for documenting women's and girls' accounts of their lives. The
researcher's role was seen as an instrument for those whose lives were being researched more than an instrument for the researcher.

v. The experiences of the researcher(s) are taken seriously and incorporated into the analysis because 'herstory is my story', that is, the issues which are raised are of shared concern to the researcher and the researched (Roberts 1981). Why and how the research study came about and what the researcher already knows and acknowledges is salient because 'research is a process which is carried out through the medium of a person' (Stanley & Wise 1983), so biases or differences need to be stated.

b. Current Feminist Methodology and Epistemology
These earlier views have been criticised for their reactive stance, which did not take enough cognisance of questions which arose for feminists themselves. The research had assumed a cohesiveness amongst women which ignored their differences. For instance black women and lesbian women could not see themselves reflected in the new paradigm and feminist theories needed to start from women's experience rather than modifying male centred theories. These were the views and issues which were adapting and changing as the fieldwork took place and as the thesis was written new developments influenced the evaluation.

Feminist researchers and theorists in the 1980s and early 1990s have since built on theories which start from the experience of women by creating their own theories independently and moving beyond just unearthing and reacting to the sexism of patriarchal theories. In this respect, there is intense and ongoing work, which includes that which is theoretical as well as grounded and experiential. The writings of some researchers dwell on the links between theory and practice, a great deal of literature on feminist methodology and epistemology is being produced and there is now a conceptual language with which to work. Some key developments have concerned the acknowledgement of the relevance of feminist philosophy, a detailed analysis of epistemological issues and the advancements in the post-modernist movement (there being several post-modernist viewpoints).
Some of the current debates involved in a feminist research process are briefly summarised and issues are discussed which are most relevant in relation to this thesis. However, it is not argued that any of the research methods that are used are strictly feminist methods. The theoretical reasoning relates to the feminisms and a feminist stance is taken to practical action.

Harding (1987) calls for theories which have started from the experience of women and insists on epistemology as underlying both methodology and method. Harding identifies two epistemologies, feminist empiricism and feminist standpoint, which she sees as transitory as they still produce a 'successor science' or purport to know the real truth. She sees no point in a claim for a universal female experience to stand in place of the male one. Feminist empiricism is a view which is rejected in this thesis because it aims at objectivity in the same way as the methodology of mainstream science. However the feminist standpoint of Stanley and Wise (1990) is considered useful in this thesis.

Stanley and Wise (1990) make a detailed argument for a feminist praxis. They discern a feminist standpoint epistemology which can translate into research practices in which the researcher is a part of the research process, in which all understanding and theorising is defined and treated as material activities and in which the 'act of knowing' becomes the determiner of 'what is known'. They therefore further emphasise the importance of ontology in informing the epistemological stance because of the relationship between knowing and being. Their analysis is found useful because of the position taken as teacher/researcher. As was commented in chapter 3, it is the understanding of the situation in process which is the focal point of the research in order to improve the quality of music education for students. One way to do this (but not the only way) is to observe with sensitivity and intelligence from a position of women's experience but also to acknowledge that this position will inevitably change. For instance, instead of just lobbying for women composers to be unearthed from a history of disregard and
thus gaining access to what has been to a great extent the female position within male constructions, women might also contend that femaleness has brought about a way of being. This leads to a rejection of male systems and theories in the name of difference and for the equal value to be given to singing, oral traditions and other areas of music making in which women have excelled.

Cook and Fonow (1991) are mainly concerned with the conduct of enquiry and find commonalities amongst feminist researchers in all fields in which they have drawn out four themes: reflexivity, an action orientation, affective components and use of the situation in hand. They see these themes as being connected to the subordinate nature of women’s status in the research enterprise and the larger society. Cook and Fonow are pointing to a justifiable reaction by feminists to existing male domination in society and in research practice. Given the present situation, this (resistance) work needs to be done, (Kristeva 1986). The above four themes are all features of the methods used in this thesis because in order to understand girls’ and women’s position in music education, the situation has to be examined from a female viewpoint.

Davies (1989) is more concerned with a rejection of the current knowledge structure and a reformulation of discursive frameworks. Davies takes a post-structuralist view in which the dualities of femaleness and maleness are deconstructed. She believes that researchers should not start with a premise that there are heightened and marked differences between two separate and distinct sexes and genders. There are no inherent and distinct properties of individuals and the term ‘woman’ needs to be deconstructed and thereby the false identity which goes with it. The challenge is to unpick the existing assumptions woven around male/female binaries and discover what changes need to be made. Change itself needs analysis and must include an examination of power and powerlessness. ’To establish equitable education we must learn to change the discursive practices that create and maintain the inequitable social structure and . . . challenge duality as it is incorporated into each person’s identity (Davies
1989). Much of Davies's arguments contain the issues which we need to take up for a future music education practice.

As well as taking a feminist standpoint, there is now a need to reject the dichotomy male/female which constrains us all in our thinking because it is set in our consciousness. Students should not have to tie themselves to a particular sex or sexuality in order to aspire to a particular standing of musicianship. There is a need for both positions to be taken simultaneously even though they may, at points, cut across each other in say celebrating women's achievements in choral work whilst insisting on an ungendered way of being for ourselves (Moi 1985, Kristeva 1986, Davies 1989). Whilst endorsing the reconstruction of knowledge and the curriculum so that achievement at being male or female no longer becomes important, rather, each person is treated according to their musicality, there are reservations about this leading to an individualism based on a particular kind of masculinist rationality which is discussed in the next section.

c. Feminist Post-modernism

Post-modernism criticizes the aim of creating totalising theory, claiming that such theory is inevitably essentialist. When totalising theories are constructed they call upon an underlying principle (such as class struggle) to explain the need for change and these have been criticized by some feminists as incapable of explaining changes within gender relations. Some post-modernist claims say that theories based on gender would be no better because they would just substitute one essentialism for another (Gross 1992). In this thesis there has been some advocation of girl-centred education and research methods. From a post-modern perspective such ideas may be questionable and this position will now be considered.

Derrida's deconstructionism sought to dismantle the idea that an objective, universal cultural system, or code, structures our mental processes, language and social institutions. 'Signifiers' (words, concepts, metaphors, symbolic associations) need not have
a constraining effect because they have no fixed referential meaning. Foucault's contribution to the post-modern debate has been especially pertinent with his conclusion that all relationships are power-laden and therefore possibly dangerous to the autonomous self. The principal way in which power operates, according to Foucault, is through discourses, some of which are more dominant than others.

For post-modernists, the category 'woman' has to be questioned and in particular the idea of women having any universally shared defining characteristics (such as particular musical abilities in playing dainty piano pieces or intuitively singing to children) cannot be assumed. Ideas around femininity are seen as social constructs and are not predetermined by sex. Using concepts of location, positionality and agency (Gittens et al 1992), it can be acknowledged that our lives - all lives - are shaped by;

1 the epistemologies and the relationships of production of a particular time and place,
2 already determined patterns of social and cultural relationships which make profound impression on individual lives
3 our unique individualism which construes our circumstances in a variety of ways and can challenge, change, react, respond, accordingly.

From this perspective it can be seen that issues of race, gender and class may not be separated (Aziz 1992) and that the relationship between them is dynamic and complex and has implications for classroom practice. If race, gender and class issues are compartmentalised, the examination of equality issues and strategies developed for combating sexism, racism and class bias in music education could be limited and less effective than they might be. It is therefore acknowledged that the category 'women' and women's multitude of different experiences, sexuality, 'race', ethnicity, age and disability cannot be altogether generalised.
The positive and useful dimensions of post modernism then are that grand theories which are patriarchal are deconstructed, that the 'truths' of established knowledge systems are challenged and that the boundaries between knowledge systems may be broken down. Secondly, there is no assumption of any essentialist principles about women whether it be biological, psychological, musical or whatever and thirdly there is acknowledgement of an ever changing multiplicity and diversity of human occupation. For those concerned with equality these ideas are appealing and have an important reality and validity.

A view of post-modernism that assures the individual that nothing has any claim outside of one's constructing mind can be initially experienced as liberating for anyone who has suffered domination. To this end it is not surprising that post-modern theory is a powerful tool when arguing against, for instance, the dualities of male/female difference. 'Postmodern parodic representational strategies have offered feminist artists a way ...to initiate the deconstructive first step but (feminist artists) do not stop there. While useful, such internalised subversion does not automatically lead to the production of the new' (Hutcheon 1989). Extreme interpretations of post modernism which assume the notion of everyone as a discreet, unconnected human being leads to competitive self-preservation as a logical response. Post-modernist male theorists are thus able to avoid accountability for seizing the false rights of male power and for oppressing others. Perceptions of profound separateness yields alienation and reactive desire for autonomy and control and leads us back to a history of patriarchal culture's denial and separation from the body.

There are other questions around the post-modern debate which concern me and for which there appear to be no satisfactory answers. These are that:

1. the larger dynamics of loss of meaning in our time and ecological destruction seem to be implicit in certain interpretations of deconstructive post-modernism.
2. Artistic processes and feelings are ways of relating which fall outside of 'signifiers'. We therefore relate to each other on a basis other than language and so on a level which defies being labelled.

3. Why are these grand theorists, such as Foucault and his focus on power, now being given attention, when earlier expressions of similar analysis were ignored when presented by marginalised groups such as women. It is as if women's ideas have been appropriated and misused. Historically it has tended to be men who categorise, label, name and polarise arguments whilst more women have advanced less linear experiences, promoted a sense of the whole and the multiplicity within the whole.

The post-modern arguments which lead to a sense of individuals in community are accepted and those which isolate and contract the individual are rejected. Social deconstruction has worked in that post-modern feminism has deflated the ideological arrogance of those theories now rejected as totalising and hence oppressive. For example, there is a 'truth' in the commonsense warnings that white, middle class feminists project their experiences onto for instance, working class women and women of colour. However, a deconstructionist assertion that feminism can be nothing but 'a politics of difference' is rejected. This can result in white post-modernist feminist academics criticising their Afro-Caribbean peers for speaking of a 'being Black in Britain experience' as being a false commonality. It is acknowledged that there are concurrent ways of being in which it is possible to live through openness and co-existence with no absolutes which can only be oppressive as they can only be in the interests of a group (Crowley and Himmelweit 1992 p.336). Each unique individual is connected to others through commonalities of experience and being. If certain groups are oppressed they have the right to emancipate themselves and shape their own identities. Feminists may then pose their own premises but not their own universals.
Having no absolutes also makes sense artistically and music reflects the culture we live in. Whilst there is oppression, feminists will be joined together to fight it and although there is no need for a dualism between what is called masculine and feminine in the arts, you can tell people about your life through art and masculine and feminine constructs are a dominant presence in contemporary society. In some ways it seems as though we need the next century to celebrate the music of the feminine and the music of women composers which has been negated because of their sex. Then, having redressed the balance of women's former oppression as artists, say there is no difference. Yet naming differences has its dangers; 'If we name female difference, we risk becoming entrapped in the patriarchal structures we are challenging, because they already have a position for the "feminine." If we decline to name this difference, we reinforce and accede to the continued marginalisation of women in a gender indifferent discourse' (Stanton 1989).

'If a feminism of difference is to compete with reactionary forces for the spaces caused by political schisms, it needs to incorporate both the deconstruction of subjectivity and the political necessity of asserting identity' (Aziz 1992). It is therefore argued that it is not necessary to take either a post-modernist or a feminist standpoint position to the exclusion of the other. Knowing this is almost a relief which resolves some of the ambivalence some of us feel about post-modernist theories. This view fits well with the propositions made in this thesis;

1. that current music education practice needs to be challenged in its customs, procedures and applications, e.g. all male composers on the syllabuses, assumptions that girls sing and boys play.

2. that the patriarchal theories of knowledge on which music education rests, as argued in chapter 2, are based on male/female dualisms which are artificially constructed and unequal power relations based on the authority invested in a masculine production of knowledge about music education. These areas need to be reconstructed.
d. The Feminist Perspective adopted in this thesis

When this thesis was first undertaken in January 1988, the feminist arguments which influenced the research design were those outlined in the first part of this section (2a). Subsequently new thinking in the feminisms and particularly the ideas of feminist post-modernism outlined in sections 2b and 2c have influenced the work.

It may be that in this time of change for feminist researchers, that there are some inconsistencies. For instance, the research started with a clear focus on girls and women, with the notion of studying girls and women to the exclusion of boys and men. It is still considered that this is a useful way of examining gender focused projects where women have been subjects of oppression but there is now attention given to an epistemological argument made by De Lauretis and here defined by Braidotti: that we need to criticize 'the definition of gender as sexual difference on the grounds that it keeps women's thought imprisoned within the conceptual frame of patriarchal oppositions, that take the masculine as the standard norm' (Braidotti 1991).

Another inconsistency might be the initial stance which took a feminist standpoint but has now been tempered with the post-modernist misgivings of attempts to claim universality for feminist theories, for there are women for whom they do not speak. However, as Harding points out this does not prevent feminists from constructing theories in an innovative way as possible recognizing that anything that we develop will be unstable, but needing to express particular ideas and theories at a particular time from a particular perspective.

As has been argued in this section (2), the feminist perspective that has been adopted is therefore what Harding (1987) describes as a developing feminist post-modernist epistemology which deconstructs universalisms and relativises experience but also includes theories which are constructed from a feminist standpoint because they challenge existing systems.
3. Ethnography

As a researcher who was also a teacher, it was considered that the best way of illuminating a process from which pedagogical implications for ordinary classroom practice could be drawn was to attempt to accurately describe, decode and interpret precise meanings, of people and of phenomena occurring in their normal, social contexts. For this reason the research primarily uses qualitative methods. The significance of this kind of data is seen as most relevant, useful and appropriate for understanding the particularities of how girls fare in music education and in identifying possible reasons why their (quantifiable) good results are not reflected in their presence amongst professional musicians. There is therefore a concern with meanings, which it is believed are most likely to be understood through depth, semi-structured and group interviews, unobtrusive and participant observation, account gathering and analysis of related documents.

Ethnography is seen as particularly appropriate to the feminist approach used in this thesis because by using definitions of ethnography which emphasise the experiential and approach knowledge in a contextual and interpersonal way, ethnography thereby attends to everyday reality and human agency. This is important to a feminist perspective in ethnography because

'epistemological and ontological differences relating to the construction of knowledge bear on whether truth is 'produced' through enquiry (feminist standpoint) or whether truth is 'disputed' (feminist postmodernism). These differences are reflected by ethnographies produced by feminists...not least the central theme of challenging subordination on the basis of gender (as well as other criteria such as race and class).'

Williams 1993

The codified manner in which assumptions, articulations and covert prejudice takes place are phenomena which would be difficult to quantify and so this study mainly concerns interactions between people in a variety of organisational contexts observed in the natural situation in which they occur.
Ethnography is being used to 'unravel' these codes and find out exactly why people in certain categories become situated in less favourable positions to others. In the 1990s the subordination of particular categories of 'others' is a political issue. Politicians and public figures do well not to make overt remarks which might be construed as intolerance on the grounds of gender, race or class, and there are laws which compel us to give fair treatment in education, employment, housing and so on. However, some people still find themselves in less favourable positions to others based on these categories.

A Feminist concern about ethnography has an interest in the subjects of research and the extent to which their lives may be used as mere data without returning the results of research projects to them. It is precisely because ethnographic research depends on human relationships, engagement and attachment that it places the data provided by research subjects at possible risk of manipulation by the researcher. Data, is inevitably subjected to analysis and interpretation of some sort. It may then be considered that there cannot be a fully feminist ethnography but there are ethnographies that are partially feminist. These are accounts of culture enhanced by the employment of feminist perspectives which can achieve the contextuality, depth, and nuance which may be unachievable through less risky but more remote research methods (Stacey 1991). This stance is considered to be the most suitable and relevant for this research.

The task was to interpret meanings as they were perceived by the researcher and as personal insights and perceptions informed the researcher, was the understanding of those being researched. It was intended that the collection of data and its analysis and the description of the processes thus obtained should be written as case studies.

a. Case Study
Case study was seen as appropriate for an individual researcher interested in a particular aspect of a problem (i.e. gender issues related to the music curriculum) and wishing to make an in depth
study over a limited time period. Evidence was collected and the relationship between variables between each case and the interactions of factors and events were examined. Case study is seen as being three dimensional; it illustrates relationships, there are micropolitical issues and it shows patterns of influences in a particular context (Bell 1987). Various features were identified to show how they affect gender relationships in the schools that were studied and how outside structures and implementation of systems were affected by institutional sexism.

The information collected may be particularistic and even idiosyncratic but it does offer insight into the real world of school music. Whilst it is recognised that findings from a case study may not always be generalisable, Bassey (1981) points out that if details are sufficient and appropriate for teachers in similar situations to relate decision making to that in the study, then relatability becomes an important factor.

The ultimate aim was therefore to improve educational practice by extending the boundaries of existing knowledge about gender and the music curriculum at key stage three through case study research.

4. Educational Action Research
Action research in education is usually a form of curriculum development in which teachers change their practice in order to effect change in the curriculum in action (as distinguished from master plans and schemes of work). There are two distinct strands within the educational action research movement; 'mainstream' researchers whose aim is professional development and improved practice, and feminist researchers whose aim is to increase social justice within a professional development network. The main group emphasising the process of reflective enquiry rather than the practical changes that are made (Weiner 1989). Whilst there are many commonalities between the two strands, the premise of this research came from values which formed a feminist perspective and included the following:
1. That women in society are subordinated and oppressed in relation to men.
2. That changes need to be made in the social/ economic/ political position of women.
3. That gender and gender divisions are important in education and education research.
4. That women and their experiences should be made visible.
5. That feminist research need not necessarily be about but should be for women.
6. That feminist research should be concerned with improving the situation of girls and women.

Weiner (1989)

The power differential between researchers and participants may not be eradicated but action research can be used to conduct research which is based on relationships rather than detached observation, understanding commonality and difference and collective rather than individual work practices. It is also considered that '(action) research has an obligation to create social spaces in which people can make meaningful contributions to their own well being and not just serve as objects of investigation' (Benmayor 1991).

Action research was seen as the most appropriate means for this research actively to make a difference to music classrooms because it combines reflective process in which teachers develop educational theories with practical action. It involves intervention for change together with the monitoring or evaluation of change processes and outcomes.

Educational action research has increasingly come to be viewed as most appropriate for small scale projects which are practitioner led and oriented towards process rather than objectives models, (Skilbeck 1984, Millman 1987). The growth of the teacher/ researcher movement has both promoted and contributed to this view.

Since action research always implies innovation and change, the focus was not simply on development and process but had an
emphasis on outcomes. The teacher/researchers and the students were becoming aware and taking control of what was happening in the curriculum. This is change at 'grass roots' level and in the UK has been found to be one of the best ways of effecting curriculum development (Stenhouse 1975, Skilbeck 1984). This is because action research can combine curriculum development and teacher professional development in a single process. In this way it gives teachers ownership of the change they are implementing with the result that real change is more likely to take place. One aspect of action research, however, is that the task is not finished when the project ends. This is because good teaching practice is always reflective and open to review and development.

The Local Education Authority and schools with which the researcher was involved used in-service education and training (INSET) as a way of disseminating good equal opportunities practice. This has become common amongst LEAs because the practical problem solving aspect of action research is attractive to teachers. 'Colleagues (are) more likely to consider 'local' evidence than that deriving from national data' (Weiner 1989). Given the explicit framework of assumptions and qualifications set out in the thesis, the action research process created an understanding or explanation of some aspects of reality which demonstrated the curriculum in action for teachers themselves.

As well as legitimising the research activity itself, part of the plausibility of the action research rests on applicability in parallel contexts, i.e. its generalisability (Chisholm 1984). To arrive at generisable understandings, a wide range of approaches and methods were used, but above all there was precision, clarity and control over the research act. In that the values underpinning these practices are shared with other practitioners then there is some facility for generalisability (Whitehead 1989).

An important constraint regarding action research is the improbability for its use to promote wide-scale change. Although it is acknowledged as an effective means of changing the practice of those teachers involved in the research process, disseminating
good practice to others in the school, the local authority or a wider audience can prove complex. This is partly because the research is practitioner led and would therefore require a 'bottom-up' model of change which inevitably involves problematics around power relations.

5. Values and Ethical Considerations
a. Introduction
The issue of equality, which is the driving force behind this study is necessarily caught up with values because 'implicit in the concept of education as improvement is the question of value: the question of what constitutes the good to which improvement is directed' (Griffiths 1990). By using action research it was possible to apply our own practitioner oriented values to the research and practice rather than those values which are guided more by perhaps bureaucratic or economic considerations.

Values are a part of practice anyway and here they are construed as the purposes, priorities and ways of communicating which characterise my own particular intentions in life and therefore in this thesis. Whitehead (1989) suggests that as educationalists we should use our own educational development to examine these values, the explanation of which can be used as reasons for action. In this way it is the descriptions and explanations of practitioners which go to form what Whitehead terms as 'living educational theory' which is grounded in practice.

Consideration had to be given as to how far to publicly disclose information. Even though the schools had been open and candid about the reporting of findings and the people interviewed were in agreement with having their ideas made public, there had to be discretion about comments that were made and anonymity of schools and staff involved had to be ensured.

b. subjectivity
Insight in Case Study and Action Research opens the way for subjectivity. The researcher's preconceptions could determine which behaviours were observed and which were ignored as well as
the way the information was interpreted. Looking at the world through our own constructions makes subjectivity unavoidable because 'persons differ from each other in their construction of events' (Kelly 1970). The researcher's interests will have undoubtably influenced what has been studied and emphasized and the way in which it is evaluated. According to Kelly, each person's construction of events is unique and is bound to differ, even from others who have experienced the same set of events. Therefore 'pristine objectivity is an epistemological impossibility' (Eisner 1985).

To overcome this inevitable subjectivity, Kelly recommends that individuals articulate their perspectives (or premises) clearly. In this way it is possible to have some understanding of the personal models the researcher is using. Also the process of articulation allows thoughts to be clarified, to recognize the significance of the power of these thoughts and to form the basis for reflection as to potential alternative constructions. What is important then, is not to share the same constructs but to have some empathy and understanding of the points of view that are being taken.

In the same way, the researcher has taken an existing range of constructs or points of view as current hypothesis and, as such, potentially open to change. When faced, for instance with a polarisation of opinion between senior management in schools and the perspective of like-minded colleagues, the researcher employed a model of conceptual change. In this model, an alternative hypothesis to the construct already held was conceived. The researcher then acted and functioned for a short time, as if this were the construct which was believed in. In this way, the researcher was in a position where an alternative may be validated. The consideration of personal constructs of students, teachers and researcher could therefore be treated in a more equitable manner.

Knowing researcher's position and taking alternative positions was not the only method employed to counteract the imbalances of
subjectivity. The evaluation and description of students and teachers experiences is intended to illuminate what it addresses in such a way as to enable others to see what is subtle and complex. This 'occurs by a build up of common general features recognised in particulars' (Eisner 1985) which help to perceive, understand and appraise particular situations and therefore help in the formation of generalisations about educational practice. Eisner recognizes that the process is prone to subjectivity and is not an efficient method, that it is complex and takes time to read but he knows of 'no better way to learn how the game has been played than to watch it with sensitivity and intelligence while it is in process' (Eisner 1985).

An aim of this research is to improve the quality of educational life for students, and so the research must be designed to focus, not on scores that standardised achievement tests and other forms of summative evaluation provide, but on processes of educational practice. Subjectivity, if acknowledged and countered becomes a lesser obstacle than the parameters set up by 'objective' evaluation methods.

C. difficulties and advantages of 'insider' research
There was a familiarity with the borough because it was where the researcher and the researcher's children lived, worked and were educated. This research was set against a background of an intimate knowledge of the area as a school girl, a teacher, a resident and a parent. In the same way Walkerdine explains that the 'story of women doing research ...is also in many ways our own story. That is, the issues we will raise reflect our own histories not only as women but also as women who went on to higher education and academic work in a university. Our careers were channelled through those routes usually open to women..' (Walkerdine 1989). This stance can expose the researcher to challenges of lack of objectivity from those who are not able to perceive that male dominated experiences, masculine concerns and male settings are most often euphemised as 'objective'. When the researcher is in the research she then becomes as vulnerable as
those being researched and can view the situation from a
different perspective making her account less biased.

Bell (1987) set out some important issues concerning the ethics
of insider research which are discussed under the following four
headings:

It is unwise to assume that colleagues necessarily co­
operate with the research.

In case study 1, as a former teacher at the school some of the
data was collected as an 'inside' researcher. In this case, the
researcher was accepted by individuals and groups as a colleague
or teacher. In case studies 2 and 3, the researcher was known by
the music teaching staff and many others as a colleague in the
borough but not known by the students. Great advantages were
found in having familiarity with the situation, as has been
outlined by Bell (1987) in her description of a teacher/researcher who experienced '...an intimate knowledge of the
context of the research and of the micropolitics of the
institution ...subjects were easily reached...he knew how best
to approach individuals and appreciated some of their
difficulties...colleagues welcomed the opportunity to air
problems and have their situation analyzed by someone who
understood the practical day-to-day realities of their task'.
A disadvantage was that such close contact made it difficult to
reach a detached stance.

In case study 1, the researcher had taught in the school but not
during the time of conducting the field work. Connections with
the school were useful because the staff and students were known
and it was felt that there was a nurturing of trust in which
people were open and candid in their disclosures. Although these
feeling could have been wrong, there was some evidence that staff
were ready to trust me and disclose their problems and thoughts
about the topic of research. This was particularly noticeable in
that the music teacher allowed me to observe his most difficult
year eight class which was apparently not the case in the other
schools which were observed. There is therefore gratitude due to
this teacher and the need to point out that most teachers have
difficult classes at some time which they do not want others to
witness because it is an area to which the teacher could be
liable for negative criticism (cf. chapter 3 section 5).

The research needs to be discussed and planned informally
as well as formerly with those colleagues, students and
parents who the researcher wishes to take part.

In the case study research, the collection of data from the music
teachers and from students was negotiated with the head of music.
Letters were sent out to parents to obtain permission to
interview their daughters most of which were returned and all
marked affirmatively.

The action research needed close co-operation from the teachers
who were taking part. There was discussion about the implications
of the research and the time that would be taken up during
preliminary discussions and meetings of the Borough's gender
action research group.

Trust does not automatically exist between professionals
The relationship of myself (the researcher) and the researched
had been that of teacher, colleague and friend. It is not the
intention to distance myself from the subjects of the research,
in fact the researcher is one of the subjects of research. To the
extent of having been a teacher in the borough there was a shared
subjectivity of the researcher and the researched. However it is
acknowledged that as a researcher there was the power or final
authority to write up the research findings. This power imbalance
was minimised by calling on others to verify or contest accounts.
Accordingly, having systematically analyzed the interviews and
uncovered issues, respondents were invited to check for wording
and acceptability.

Practical relevance
The intention was not to find differences for their own sake or
for my objective convenience when analyzing the data. What has
been a prime concern in the research is clarity of thought,
theoretical coherence and to take account of personal issues within a professional approach. In practice this has meant, for instance, that open or semi-structured interviews and discussions were used and that issues that were important to the girls and women themselves were raised and taken into account. In this way greater insight was gained into people's lives and the research became more useful and recognisable to them.

In the interviews people gave information around broad questions; for instance, students were asked to talk about their family background and some gave their parents' occupations whilst some spoke more about other aspects of their lives. The other broad question that the students were asked in the background interviews was to talk about any music in their lives. Again, the variety of answers is seen as reflecting those students' circumstances and perceptions of those circumstances.

Many girls were concerned with the whole structure of the school, its unfairness to them and irrelevance to them and for some, musical activities were a way of escaping the playground. A closed set of interview questions would not have uncovered how music fits into the whole curriculum. The interviews were tape recorded and then condensed into a written summary.

d. Permission to carry out the Research

After making enquiries at the local teacher's centre, the Director of Education gave written permission to undertake the research provided the headteacher of each school was in agreement. Letters were written to the headteachers of four schools, two of whom agreed and two of whom did not agree for the research to take place. One of the schools that did not agree was an all girls school so a letter was written to the only other all girls school in the borough through a contact in the school and the headteacher there agreed. This left three schools in which to conduct the case study research.

In case study 1, where the researcher had recently been a teacher, the headteacher gave leave to talk to anyone and gather
data as it was needed, using my own discretion. It was decided to follow the year eight class who were observed in depth. Because of my close association with the school it was easy to gain access to all other aspects of the school and so the depth study was seen as being of most use to understand the more subtle and particular nuances of the situation.

In case study 2, the researcher was directed to the only female deputy head (still called the senior mistress) in order to negotiate my needs for the research. The researcher had attended the school as a student many years ago and there were other family connections with the school. The school felt comfortable and familiar and it was recalled how the special musical atmosphere had been taken for granted in school days.

In case study 3, the researcher was taken to be introduced to all members of the senior management team on arrival at the school. They liked to meet personally, everyone who would be on the premises.

It was clear that they were welcoming because there had been an introduction through a mutual contact. This is the way they functioned as a community: small and friendly, through a network of friends and acquaintances.

After the case study research had been undertaken, the researcher worked part time in two other schools in the borough. The headteachers and heads of music in these schools were approached personally and permission was obtained to carry out the action research projects. The projects were to run in conjunction with the Borough's GEDG project in primary schools. This meant that the two teachers and myself would have a support group who were also working on gender issues using action research.

The teachers were initially invited to examine and discuss the data with a view to becoming teacher/researchers (see Appendix B). This was an important and essential process which had to be dealt with sensitively by myself (the project co-ordinator) and others involved in sanctioning the viability of the project (the
headteachers, the advisory teacher for equal opportunities and the advisory teacher for research and development). This is because the practitioners have to be fully aware of what is expected of them in an action research project, especially in terms of time commitment (to reflect, write reports and negotiate with others in the project) and all people involved in the project have to synchronise their time for meetings and other support mechanisms, the critical significance of the negotiating and planning stages being a characteristic of action research.

6. Description of method

Phase 1, Three Case Studies

Close observation of music classes in three case study schools observing years 7, 8 and 9 (key stage 3) was undertaken in the spring and summer terms of 1989. In case study 1, a year 8 class was observed in depth on a weekly basis and that class was also observed closely in other areas of school life from 17.1.89 to 14.7.89. In case studies 2 and 3, one class from each year group was observed on a weekly basis. The following areas were considered:

- processes involved in sexist assumptions and practices in the music classroom
- the impact of sexism in materials and traditional music role models
- conventions of gender specific use of instruments
- the culture of patriarchal relations inside the school in relation to the culture outside
- the music teacher's role and influence on sex stereotyping
- girls' experiences in the music classroom and the school experience as a whole

The first 5 areas were considered primarily against the girls' actual experience. A more detailed check list of areas which were looked at carefully in regard to music and gender in the classroom is found in Appendix C. Some guidelines for the analysis of the research have been taken from 'Genderwatch' Equal Opportunities Commission (1988) on music education. The guidelines suggest headings; for instance 'peripatetic teachers'
and 'resources', under which questions about gender stereotyping might be raised.

-Depth interviews of between 45 minutes and one hour were carried out in the Spring and Summer terms of 1989. The head of music in each school was interviewed and other members of staff were interviewed according to who my link person in each school thought could help to understand the situation for girls and music in the school. Girls from years 8 and 9 were interviewed in groups of 3 or 4 after having received written permission from parents.

-Account gathering took place in the spring, summer and autumn terms of 1989. In order to understand the experience of girls in the hidden music curriculum (that is the understandings that students receive from music in the school that is not written or necessarily intended), accounts were gathered from rehearsals, concerts, school meetings, speeches at prize giving day, informal discussions, minutes of meetings and were used in the analysis.

-Follow up visits were made in 1990 in order to check the analyzed data with the respondents and gather any further relevant accounts. Final visits were made in 1992 and at this time music staff changes had taken place at all three schools.

In total, each school was visited for one day every week for 31 weeks. All three accounts begin by considering each school within its community and its background because the classroom situation is influenced by:

1. The ethos of the school (largely dictated by the history of the school and the current management).
2. The family background and cultural influences that the students bring.
3. The background and convictions of the individual teachers.
4. The wider influence of society, media, government and historical background of these institutions.
Each case study therefore considers these 4 areas and the research starts by explaining these social contexts which may have direct, indirect and subconscious effects on actions.

More data were collected for case study 1 in order to balance case studies 2 and 3 because case study 1 represents a more 'working class' intake of students, compared to the other 2 cases which represent more 'middle class' intakes and are both voluntary aided schools. A structured analysis is made around the issue of equality, focusing on gender and consideration of how class and to some extent, race affects gender is then integrated into the analysis.

**case 1**

Although an important source of data was an observation of one year 8 lesson, there were also observations of classes from years 7 and 9 and in this case study there was a wider and more in depth investigation of other aspects of the school. The lessons were observed and recorded under various headings. In the year 8 lesson there were 19 names on the register, 10 girls and 9 boys. Behavioural problems in this lesson centred round 4 boys, who between them, disrupted the lesson every week. What happened for 1 hour and 10 minutes every week was so distracting that the mode of observation was deliberately altered from that of general observation to sitting next to a particular girl in the group and focusing attention especially on her, all the stimuli she received and how she responded to it. This process was started after the first 2 lessons but the focus was sometimes lost in lessons where the boys' antics drew attention. There then followed background information on staff and students and on the school and the area showing a marked difference in life experience between staff and students. The next section comprised of interviews with staff and students and other accounts gathered during events taking place in the school followed by my analysis and conclusion.
case 2
The main sources of data came from observations of classes in years 7, 8 & 9, student and staff interviews. The study began by looking at the backgrounds of those who make up the school community and relating the school to its wider context within the whole community and society. The high level of ability in this school must be more pronounced in music because the school is a centre of musical excellence in an area which reaches beyond the LEA. There was a gathering of statistical information, an identifying of areas of concern and information was gathered from the observation of classes in years 7, 8 and 9 during the period 9.1.89 and 21.7.89. There were two sets in years 8 and 9 and only the top sets which were taught by the head of music were observed. Information is also drawn from interviews with teachers and students, and events taking place in the school during the same period. The analysis and conclusion which followed were concerned with raising awareness of the sometimes narrow view which is taken of music education.

case 3
The main sources of data came from observations of classes in years 7, 8 & 9, student and staff interviews. The study started by placing the school in its context within the community, some statistical information and then a study of classes of students from years 7, 8 and 9 who were observed and interviewed between 9.1.89 and 20.7.89. Information was gathered about the background of the music teachers, the students and the school. Following this, there were interviews with teachers and students and accounts of other activities in the school which involved music and the music department. The analysis and conclusion then focused mainly on the girls' experience in the classroom and the part played by the religious aspect of their music education.

Phase 2. Two Action Research projects
i. Initial Discussion with Teachers
Teachers involved in the projects were aware that data had been gathered about all aspects of girls in music with a specific
focus on classroom interactions and with a view to making changes which would aim to reduce gender inequalities.

The teachers in the two schools agreed to change principles and practice through positive action to:
- develop and monitor together with other teachers, anti sexist classroom strategies and teaching materials
- develop strategies to combat the role definitions in music, already carried by pupils
- heighten levels of gender consciousness among teachers of music

Teachers, having committed themselves to take part in the project, then perceived the situation from their own individual standpoint, surveying the situation further for themselves, by close monitoring of their own classroom and school situation. The two teachers and myself decided on the particular area of the music curriculum that we wanted to change and we reflected on how we might change the students' actual experience. On the basis of the evidence collected from the case studies, the teachers' own experiences and their current reflections, the process began.

ii. Funnelled research process and planning
Secondly, there was the funnelled research process and planning in which data gathering was progressively reduced and refined in extent and scope in favour of increased attention to analysis and interpretation (Owens 1989).
To undertake this process the teachers were asked to:
Stage 1
1. Ask questions about the learning context and what the students actually do, e.g. Do the students talk about/ read/ see, women composers?
2. Evaluate the effectiveness of what is done (especially for any changes that have been made recently).
3. Ask what might usefully be changed for the benefit of the students.
Stage 2
1. An aspect of the curriculum was chosen for close scrutiny. In school A it was decided to examine the impact of language in music education, particularly the words of songs, but also addressing the wider aspects of language in the classroom and its effects on the music curriculum and the way it is received by the students.

In school B it was decided to examine the relationships between creativity and gendered artistic and social (musical) conventions.

2. Particular KS3 classes or groups were chosen to take as a sample.
3. Teaching was carried out as usual, but it was ensured that for short periods of time, students were observed rather than interacting with them.
4. Observations were made by making notes on the spot. As soon as possible after the lesson, those things that had happened but which could not be recorded at the time were added.

Stage 3
Data were analyzed by:
1. Categorising the data in relation to the questions posed in stage 1
2. Looking for relationships in the data, between what the teacher did and what the students did.
3. Looking at what students did and what the teacher would hope they might do.
4. Looking particularly at the unexpected things which students did and considering whether these suggest that: the teacher did not do what she thought she was doing the teacher did not do what she wanted to do
Stage 4
Reflection on the Analysis
1. If something had come to light which needed more thought and attention, consideration was given to how this might be changed.
2. The teacher was alerted to any assumptions she may have made about what she had done or how the students had responded, by the researcher or if the researcher had been teaching the class, by the teacher.
3. Questions were asked about what might have made the students act as they did and whether they carried out assumptions that needed redressing.
4. Further questions were sometimes asked.
5. An hypothesis was formed.

Stage 5
1. A plan was made of the practical details of the changes that needed to take place giving careful consideration to their implications.
2. A thorough answer was worked out to the question 'What is it that is intended to do now?'
3. Plans were always made for the students' actual experience.

Stage 6
1. Changes in practice were made on the basis of evidence and analysis.
2. We started again at stage 1.
   (Based on 'Curriculum in Action' a joint project of the Schools Council and the Open University, 1980)

iii. Taking a Full and Detailed Account
Thirdly there was the importance of 'thick description' in order to 'take people there' (Geertz 1973). The researcher worked with each teacher to decide on the action steps to take in order to improve the perceived situation, involving, for instance different teaching strategies, resources and classroom organisation. We then undertook research to collect as much data
as possible about what happened when the action steps were put into effect:
- transcripts of students talking
- observation notes of classroom interaction
- interviews with students
- interviews with other teachers
- observations of each other teaching and interacting
- evaluation of resources
- the students' wider experiences in the school
- reflections on previous research
- evidence about students' background
The above evidence was collected for each project and this is detailed in the analyses of the individual research projects.

The teacher/researchers in each school undertook to formulate their own analyses of the research. In the roles of project co-ordinator and teacher/researcher, there was regular dialogue with the teachers as there was the need to talk about what was being done in order to reflect and theorise about the work. There were points in both projects when there was a need to negotiate changes in the original formulations.

iv. Data Evaluation
When the data was collected it was evaluated to see what, if any, changes had taken place. On the basis of this information we undertook the research spiral again, formulating new action steps or modifying old ones. The spiral then repeated for as long as we felt the refining process and focusing in on specific issues was of value.

Action Research Spiral
1. Ask questions
2. Collect data
3. Analyze
4. Formulate hypothesis
5. Plan Action Steps

(From the ideas of McNiff 1988)

6. Positive Action for Change
The insights which were gained from an analysis of this information gave fresh impetus to help improve existing classroom practice regarding gender and to apply them more systematically.

7. Conclusion
a. The End of the Projects
My role as teacher/researcher confirmed me as a participant in the projects and as a practitioner who had internally initiated the research. It was therefore not difficult to remain both focused and flexible about change. As Chisholm and Holland (1984) discovered 'paradoxically, it is when the researcher sees the research design slipping away that marks its success in action research terms'. At the end of the projects all the data was gathered, including the analysis from the teacher/researchers, to further analyze and reflect on what had been done in order to make recommendations (found in the conclusions to the action research projects and in chapter 9, the conclusions chapter), and thereby to:

i. Change Practice
Critical reflection from all those taking part in the project leads inevitably to explicitly grounded changes in practice whether teaching styles and pedagogies, the structure and content of the curriculum or organisational and social relations in the school.
There is no doubt that those directly involved in the projects were affected by them and have changed their practice but it depends on the individual's own network and experience in disseminating initiatives as to whether a wider audience is reached.

ii. Initiate and Further Debate
Written accounts, teacher led in-service training and general discussion, not only from myself but also from others in the project creates further professional debate. However, the power to change things institutionally is not invested in teachers and the impact we were able to make can only be minimal. Griffiths found that '. . .the class teacher, myself, the rest of the staff,
the head, the members of the university education department, are 'autonomous, responsible persons' in the sense that they are so as individuals. However their power to exercise that autonomy, their power to make their opinions listened to, and then put them into practise differed a great deal' (Griffiths 1990).

The headteachers at both project schools were enthusiastic and positive about the projects. At the time when the research was taking place, they were pleased to say that there were gender research projects going on in the schools. Most of the dissemination that has taken place since, has been initiated by the researcher through contacts in the local education authority and more recently through Women in Music.

b. Summary

In the methodology chapter the construction of a method which would bring about positive change has been discussed. It was felt important to use such an approach because the writer was a practitioner and needed to go about the research for the purpose of direct change in practice. It was therefore planned from the outset that action research would be the most functional method for meeting this requirement. Another consideration at the very outset of the methodology was a concern with girls in particular. At this time, the problems of gender inequality were seen as being solved most efficiently by focusing on girls and their specific problems. Feminist research methodology and epistemology were seen as the principal means by which this could be achieved. Later in the research process various considerations of the feminisms, particularly post-modernist feminism, caused a shift in the way the data were conceptualised, in terms of essentialist ... and a feminist standpoint was taken.

The selection of case studies allowed an approach in which a practitioner with inside knowledge of a borough and some of its institutions could use ethnographic research tools to collect and analyze data. Having constructed a conceptual framework around issues of music, gender and education in the background chapters and formulated three case studies each with characteristics and
elements around these issues, the research became even more particularistic when finally action research projects were undertaken in 2 schools.

The final stage used action research in order to work with teachers who had reflected on the issues raised by the findings from the case studies and who after initial discussions agreed to commit themselves to effect change through the curriculum in action (or the curriculum as it exists through the actions of the teacher and the experiences of the students). The aim was to help teachers move closer to an understanding of the curriculum in action and the particular effects it has on girls in music from their students' point of view.
Chapter 6 The Case Study Research

1. Introduction

The research questions and background chapters provided a framework which raised key issues which are relevant to music education and gender. Background, context, ideology, culture, race, class and positionality are all areas which the literature shows have significance in determining gender differences in music, education, and music education. Within schools, studies about gender in many differing curriculum areas have found a commonality in matters such as unequal treatment and expectations of girls, bias in testing and resource materials. In the case studies, these areas are examined from an empirical position to establish whether the findings in the literature are sustained in music education practice.

The case study research, to some extent, takes an approach using progressive focusing in which a whole borough is considered in terms of its secondary schools and the physical and political context in which the authority and the individual schools exist. Three case study schools in the borough are examined, firstly within the framework of the contextual factors surrounding them. This included the background of the individual schools. Secondly an analysis is made within the schools, much of which is from the observations of, and interviews with, the students and the teachers. Finally, the institutions are examined in terms of micropolitical and ideological matters.

The Schools
Case Study 1

A co-educational school, this school was chosen to represent the schools in the east of the borough. The school was popular with parents for its strict uniform code and seemingly tough attitude towards discipline. It had a multi-ethnic intake, a large proportion of students with learning difficulties, a great many bi-lingual students and quite a number of students who have free school meals. The main school building was originally a secondary modern school built in the 1950s for eleven to fourteen year
olds. The school has since become a comprehensive school and has changed its name.

Case Study 2
This school was a co-educational voluntary aided, grammar school. It was extremely popular and did not necessarily select students from the immediate neighbourhood but had an entrance exam at 11+ and a complicated system to judge applicants, more of whom were rejected than taken in. The school was highly academically successful and music was a special subject. It had a mainly white, middle class intake but because entrance depends on I.Q in the first instance there was a small but significant number of working class students.

Case study 3
This school was an all girls Roman Catholic, voluntary aided school which was popular and academically successful. The catchment was not taken from the immediate neighbourhood, although this was a secondary factor which might determine suitability for entrance, the first criteria was Catholicism. There were many Irish as well as English students and a proportion of the students were from Afro-Caribbean and Italian backgrounds. The school was placed in the centre of the borough, it was run by Nuns and religion played an important part in the school. The stated aim of the school was to integrate Christian faith with the students' learning experience.

2. Social Context of the Area and Case Study Schools
a. Social Class Divisions
The distinctive class divides of the nineteenth century can be seen reflected geographically, in the borough. In the study there were social, economic and cultural divides between the localities of the case study schools. Some areas had the best housing, leafy parks, well kept lawns, countryside, golf courses and arts' facilities whilst others featured more council homes and terraced houses, large industrial estates, a waste processing plant and sewage works and until the Education Reform Act 1988 most schools in these areas had 'social priority status'.
In the past, the divisions meant that people who lived in the poorer areas frequently went into domestic service for people who lived in the wealthier areas. Also, historically the schools in the wealthier areas were the old grammar schools and the schools in the poorer areas were the secondary modern schools until the reorganisation into comprehensive schooling in the 1970s.

Census figures show that the largest socio-economic groups are skilled manual workers (15.4%), junior non-manual workers (13.1%), employers and managers of small establishments (10.9%) and semi-skilled manual workers (10.1%). There is a lower proportion of social classes I, II and IIIN (professional, managerial and non-manual) and a higher proportion of class IIIM (manual) than in Greater London as a whole (Census 1991).

People living in the wealthier areas were able to select the more academically successful schools because they afforded housing in a more expensive area.

b. Ethnic divisions
The borough's population had changed in the last decade as ethnic minority groups settled more in some areas than others.

'The borough experienced one of the largest absolute and percentage increases (54%) of overseas-born residents of all London boroughs. By 1981 21.7% of the whole population were living in households headed by a person born outside the United Kingdom. These include about 16,300 persons in Cypriot households, 7,700 in Irish households, 7,400 in Caribbean households and 5,900 persons in Asian households.' (Borough Report, MacDonald 1986)

The borough's ethnic population had caused much controversy in the local Authority (Appendix B).

In an interview with Ms Y., a teacher in the borough (not a case study school), she said there were stereotyped attitudes to black people having 'natural music' and that the content of much schools' music (she spoke generally, not about any school in
particular) was not relevant to the experience of many of the black, refugee or ethnic groups in the borough. She said that there was too much emphasis on classical music and that this prejudice could be seen inside and outside the classroom in this borough. There were posters round the borough advertising classical concerts and she said 'it should not be a special thing to have a multi-cultural input as is often spoken about round here but a normal thing'.

The borough view she contended was that 'others' (meaning ethnic minority groups) should adapt. She said that cultural groups needed support and premises for their art and that some groups had found it easier than others to get help. 'Some individuals' behaviour and attitudes are like 30 years ago and others are only interested in writing things on paper and paying lip service to equality.'

When asked about girls in particular, she said 'Girls have to be better than boys to get the same treatment as them in this system and for some cultures even our equal opportunities policies may not be acceptable to them. Some cultures have options which we should not necessarily say is wrong. The British seem to have the attitude that they are always correct even for equal opportunities.'

Ms Y., a persuasive and clear thinker, was clearly angry about the struggles she had for four years in the borough's multi-cultural policy group. She finished by telling me that she was interested in working with the 'reality of what was happening' and that she was not going to sit on any more groups and committees talking about policies that 'either never happen or take so long to implement that the people who formulated them aren't there any more to tell you what they intended'; 'I don't care if they write it on the back of a corn flakes box as long as it is happening'.

---

- 162 -
c. The Arts and cultural divisions

In a report on the development of the Arts in the borough, it was found that the needs of the population (in terms of the arts) were not being met in the wider context of the borough or in education and this was particularly so in the poorer areas. It was stated that education had the potential to make the Arts accessible to the majority of children in families for whom the Arts had no meaning because they were unknown and that there should be in-service courses for teachers on ethnic music and on other aspects of ethnic arts, and similarly on Jazz, which was a growth interest for young people.

The report had been critical of the local Authority and recommended that an integrated, balanced curriculum which had the arts as one of its core elements should be put in place in order to bring about a creative, productive, caring and energetic society. An awareness of the need for such a curriculum was not found in the local education authority itself.

One of the initiatives which came from the report was a 'school and community link' production of a play about how things have not changed in the borough regarding prejudiced attitudes. It includes women's experiences past and present of life in "the borough" 1940-1990. The play demonstrated how gender and class difference had been an historical aspect of the borough and how ethnicity had now also added to social divisions.

The play centred on the lives of Michelle from the present day and her grandmother Iris. Michelle was growing up in a multicultural society and was sensitive to the dilemmas of her friends from ethnic minority backgrounds who were expected to culturally assimilate or 'fit in'. Michelle saw the racial divides and oppressions of the 90s as replacing the class and gender conflict of her Grandmother's life. She asked 'Have issues of equality really changed?'
The play was a straightforward representation of a 'then and now' situation. It was a compelling and convincing story with which students in schools were able to identify. However the complexities around issues of class, race and gender could not be developed in such a short piece. The oppression which occurs because of divisions created by class and gender has historical roots in the borough and its legacy has become ever more subtle and coded whereas the more recent division by race has led to a more overt prejudice which was more visible and obvious.

d. Selection of the school community is determined by established structures

Having established that there is a geographical class divide (section 2a) and that there are also ethnic and cultural divisions, this section shows how a new initiative which groups schools into neighbourhoods and fosters primary/secondary links served to perpetuate the differences between schools in different areas of the borough. This was because the main criteria for entry to secondary school were distance from home to school and attendance at one of the linked primary schools.

Music education at 11+ is bound to reflect the culture and experience of the students. In current debates about league tables and schools' success, the notion of 'value added' serves to demonstrate that some schools have to work harder for exam success. Schools have to 'add' more to their students if many of them are from backgrounds which have been shown do not easily facilitate academic achievement. Who goes to what school in the first place is therefore vital to the subsequent structure and running of a school and therefore of the curriculum in its broadest sense. Parents in the borough know this very well.

The option system which operated at the time of secondary transfer gave parents 3 option choices of secondary school. However, if the most popular schools (the schools that had the highest academic success, which were those which were previously grammar schools, and were also those in the wealthier part of the borough), were not put as first choice, then there was very
little chance of gaining entry (schools preferred to take 'first choice' students). Therefore a realistic first choice had to be made otherwise there was a danger of not getting any of the three choices and being allocated the neighbourhood school.

The 16 secondary schools had a hierarchy based on exam results. The only grammar school (case study 2) was allowed to keep its grammar school status because it was direct grant aided and selected students by an entrance exam and screening process. This school had the best exam results. The other former grammar schools which were the Catholic and Church of England schools and those in the wealthier areas of the borough, were popular and had high rates of achievement. The next range of schools with results of 12% to 20% of students having 5 or more GCSE passes were all mixed comprehensive schools in areas between the wealthier and poorer parts. The schools at the lower end of the exam success range were all in the poorer areas of the borough.

Some factors which correlated with exam results, were the number of students who received free school meals (for which a child's carer has to be in receipt of income support), and the number who speak English as their second language. Also, less overt signs, such as the nature of the school motto gave an indicator to the position of the schools in what appears to be as much a social hierarchy as an exam league table. The evidence for this is given below.

(figures for academic year 1988/9)

**case 1**

Type of school: ......................Comprehensive

Status before comprehensivisation.....Secondary Modern

Geographical location: ................Eastern edge of the borough

Role: .................................980 (6 forms of entry)

Number of students: with 5 or more GCSE passes .... 4 %

(from borough league tables)

who have free school meals ....24 %

(from deputy head)
with ESL ........................about 40 %
(figure approximated by head of special needs)

School motto: ' -------' is a caring school'

-The concept of caring for others is a prime feature in this school and the pastoral care organisation based on a year system reflects this (booklet for prospective students 1989). This school takes in a great deal of students whose reading age is under 9 years. The school has to deal with a number of social problems often associated with poverty, poor housing etc. For these reasons it was considered that 'caring' was a primary consideration in the school, (special needs teacher and deputy head, informal discussion).

case 2
Type of school: ..................Grammar
Geographical location: ............South/East of borough
Role: .............................1226 (6 forms of entry)
Number of students with 5 or more GCSE passes 91.1%   
(from borough league tables)
who have free school meals 4.6%   
(from schools secretary)
with English as a second Language - not known

School motto: Qui Patitur Vincit (He who endeavours conquers)
A latin motto indicates a traditional past and high educational values

case 3
Type of school ...................... girls' Catholic comprehensive
(lower secondary)
Geographical location ............. centre of borough
Role ............................... 534 (6 forms of entry)

Number of students:
with 5 or more GCSE passes (in the upper school) 45.2%   
(from borough league tables)
who have free school meals ..................14.5%
(approximated by head of year)
with ESL ...........................................9%
(approximated by head of year)

In this section there has been a connection made between educational achievement, and the geographical location and historical background of schools. Both location and time/purpose of foundation of a school affect the intake or catchment of each school in the borough.

The educational requirements of the student population are not only concerns of the national curriculum but are also distinguished by 'the particular needs of the community' (local authority handbook 1991). In turn, as has been discussed, the needs of the students become determined by class and ethnicity which, in many respects is associated with the student catchment for each school. Consequently, students’ experiences of music education relate to an institutional interpretation of students’ needs. The questions raised by this assertion concern whether or not institutions can evaluate students needs in this way if their institutional value system is predicated on patriarchal systems of hierarchy and control. These matters are addressed again below in section 4 of this chapter.

It is recognised that oppressions of race and class are, in themselves, patriarchal; and conversely, that gender is classed and raced. Gender can therefore be seen as having different implications for boys and girls in music education, according to historical determinants and/or geographical location of the institutions in which students are situated.

e. Parental choice and Institutional Values
In the borough, parents had to make a choice of school for children of 11+ which was often a stressful and exacting procedure. Schools promoted themselves by setting out their aims and objectives in glossy booklets. Parents were sometimes attracted to a school by its institutional values and ethos or
what they saw as the 'signs of a good school'. Apart from exam results, signs included, smart uniform, punitive measures taken for indiscipline, evidence that students were cared for and safe, well presented school publicity, and musical reputation.

Exam results are undoubtably a priority for secondary school selection as previously set out, yet, once parents realised that they could not get places for their children in the highest performance schools, many made a choice based on the other 'signs of a good school'. Two of these 'signs' will be considered, because one is concerned with equal opportunities for girls in general and the other specifically affects music education; smart uniform and musical reputation.

**i. smart uniform**

There was a great debate going on about uniform amongst schools and parents. One issue which formed part of the criteria as to whether a uniform was smart or not was, whether girls should be allowed to wear trousers.

It was found that schools with the strictest codes of uniform were the schools in the poorer parts of the borough except for the schools founded by religious denominations (survey conducted by the Gender Education and Development Group, 1990) The case study schools reflected this:

case 1; a strict code (girls may not wear trousers),

*case 2; strict about wearing school colours and smartness but relaxed about the style of skirts and trousers, no trousers may be worn by girls until year 11,*

*case 3; a strict code (girls may not wear trousers).*

These were some of the remarks made about uniform in the case study schools:

headteacher; 'I like to see my girls in skirts' and he had a manakin in his office which was dressed in the new proposed girls' uniform, a deputy head; 'like it or not, parents round here see strict uniform as a sign of a good school'
On June 8th 1989 the governors of one school made a decision about uniform which was conveyed to parents in a letter dated 12th July 1989 and in that letter was the decision that from September 1990 girls would no longer be allowed to wear trousers. The acting head seemed to think that the staff were in favour of girls not wearing trousers. When the head was asked about the relevance of the decision, particularly for the Asian girls in the school, he commented that they may be allowed special dispensation to wear trousers if they complained about it but that he had received no complaints so far and he didn't think there would be any who were likely to 'make a fuss'.

The following term the equal opportunities working party and the teacher governors worked together to persuade the governors to reverse their decision. The matter was raised in a staff meeting on 27th Feb. 1990 and parents were informed that girls could wear trousers in a newsletter on the 15th March 1990.

Debate about appearance frequently centres round the appearance of females. In chapter 2 the morality of women performers and the connected morality about women being seen in public was discussed in terms of 'the male gaze'. The need for girls to conform to a particular dress code which confirms their femininity and therefore passivity, occupies time and is an issue for deliberation in many schools in the Borough and from the evidence of the case studies, it is a topic frequently discussed in schools.

ii. Musical Reputation
In the borough, some schools were known to have musically gifted students who took part in successful music making with a high degree of expertise. This was the situation in case studies 2 and 3. These schools tended to be the same schools that had good exam results. Other schools in the borough did not offer music as a high profile subject. Case study 1 reflected this kind of school.
In one school in the borough a successful musical group was described in the school handbook as 'The Showpiece of the School'. In the prospectus for case 2, it was said that:

'The school has an outstanding musical tradition and the governors give consideration to the admission of pupils of exceptional musical talent provided that they are also capable of following the academic courses offered'. The headteacher also stated in the open day speech that students of high ability came to the school and it was hoped they would study hard, join clubs and societies like the chess club, the poetry club and the Christian association and take part in musical activities and the Duke of Edinborough Award.

In schools where music was not performed at a level where it could be used to 'sell' the school it was also the case that they did not have good exam results. In case 1, some teachers were self conscious about the school's musical performances and did not appear to consider the Arts as an important part of the curriculum (although some of these teachers loved music, theatre and art in their leisure time). It was difficult to understand exactly why this view was held, but when questioned informally about the relative value of arts subjects on the curriculum, the following statements were made:

1. 'Arts subjects in schools should sell a school by their presentation. If they are not of a high standard then they let the school down.'
   
   senior teacher

2. 'Parents in this area value vocational and scientific subjects. A school is like a business, it has to satisfy its customers. Our customers are the parents'

   acting headteacher

3. 'The band were good in the concert but some of those parents and governors will have been at concerts at other schools and will make comparisons. If the singers cannot do any better I don't think they should go on at all.'

   senior teacher
One of the areas of concern in current debates about music education is that music should be taught as a subject in its own right and should not be a curriculum area whose main task is to be involved with extra curricular activities. The term 'extended curricular activities' has been used in National Curriculum literature in order to reinforce the idea that school shows and performances should extend from the activities of the classroom.

When music is used to sell the school, there is a pressure on all concerned to produce high quality performances. The need to represent the school and perform to outside audiences may detract from the notion of a music education for all. It inevitably leads to selection of the best musicians who are often those who learn classical musical instruments and those who will sing and attend rehearsals. These are primarily girls.

Another issue, in the debate over an extra or extended curriculum, is that in the case studies girls use extra-curricular activities to pursue their chosen activity in their free time, as opposed to, say, playing ball games in the playground or other school clubs. In group interviews with girls from the case study schools, it was agreed that their music lessons were alright but that they preferred the extra curricular music activities, such as choir and guitar/recorder club. In the mixed schools it was also seen as a 'safe place' at lunchtimes and breaks, a place to go or a way to escape a male dominated playground.

Many more girls than boys took part in concerts and shows in schools. In the case studies, the ratio of girls to boys in the mixed schools at school performances was approximately 3:1 in the grammar school and 4:1 in the mixed comprehensive school. As I discussed in chapter 2, music making is often regarded as a middle class attribute for girls, a sign of creative potential for boys, and not a significant presentation of art, as such, for those whose cultural class favours popular or ethnic musics.
Using music to sell a school appears to promote middle class values and for girls this can mean conforming to the particular model of femininity that this implies.

3. Comparison between institutional structures of schools
This section is concerned with the selection of people who fill positions within institutional structures of schools. Attention is given initially to any categories which dominate individual institutions, and then to the peopling of music departments and whether there are any patterns which may be based on gender. Particular groups are then examined in respect to their capacity as role models and whether they may support any definite attitudes, actions, or interpretations in respect to music education and gender.

a. Teaching Staff Hierarchy by Sex (M=Male F=Female)
Of the 14 secondary schools in the borough, there were 3 female headteachers and 2 of these were headteachers in all girls schools.

case 1

HEAD TEACHER-M
1ST DEPUTY-F 2ND DEPUTY-F 3RD DEPUTY-M
1ST SENIOR TEACHER-F 2ND SENIOR TEACHER-F
HEAD OF UPPER SCHOOL-M HEAD OF LOWER SCHOOL-M
HEAD OF MATHS-F HEAD OF ENGLISH-M HEAD OF SCIENCE-M
6 HEADS OF YEAR 13 HEADS OF DEPARTMENT
4M 2F 8M 5F
28 MAIN SCALE AND 'A' ALLOWANCE TEACHERS

case 2

HEAD TEACHER-M
1ST DEPUTY-M SENIOR MISTRESS-F
1ST SENIOR TEACHER (ST)-M 2ND ST-M 3RD ST-M
HEAD OF MATHS-M HEAD OF ENGLISH-M HEAD OF SCIENCE-M
7 HEADS OF YEAR 14 HEADS OF DEPARTMENT
3F 4M 5F (needlework, French, Art, Home Economics, Chemistry) 9M
case 3
The head teacher and deputies were all nuns from the adjoining convent as were all the senior management team. In middle management there were 2 heads of year who were nuns and one who was not. There were no heads of department who were nuns. The 42 teaching staff were mainly women except for four men, one who was head of Design and Technology and the others who taught Maths, History and Science.
The schools' hierarchies reflected that of the whole borough in the matter of male centrality. There was an imbalance of men in senior positions in the mixed schools and those women who had middle management positions as heads of department frequently managed traditionally female subject areas.

b. The school teaching communities
In case 1, no particular category of people emerged as dominating the teacher population. Teachers ranged in their educational and social backgrounds. There were very differing ideologies about education, politics, priorities in life and the place of music in a school.

In case 2 it was noted (from the school handbook) that teachers were better qualified than other teacher groups in the borough; more teachers had masters degrees and doctorates, some had an Oxbridge background. It was observed by the equal opportunities coordinator, that the staff were 'more middle class and intolerant to working class students'. In the school and this was particularly noticeable in music department, the arrangements were directed towards academic success and other considerations, such as comfort, pleasant surroundings, social events and uniform, were secondary in the every-day running of the school. The message was 'be bright and intelligent and get on with the work, practise, or whatever was needed to be done'. This may have been why the students who exhibited the most disruptive behaviour (identified as working class students by the equal opportunities co-ordinator) were not tolerated easily by staff.
In case 3, the religious community was the dominant group and although there was a much smaller proportion of Catholics amongst the staff than the students, the staff were expected to have a positive involvement with religious activities, like being present at the Friday Mass. This applied especially to the music staff who were expected to teach hymns and religious songs to the students, quite often during music lesson time.

The school is smaller than those in the other case studies and the atmosphere was 'small and friendly' with most staff and students knowing each other. The school integrated the English, Irish and Italian communities in the borough by the emphasis on religion and community. For instance on St. Patrick's Day 17th March, although a serious affair, there was a friendly and community atmosphere. Students were invited to shake hands with those around them during the service, to ask for prayers for particular people and to join in the service by singing and chanting. Some students were involved in the procedure of the service. The service was led by a Priest from the local Catholic church and attended by five of the sisters, the music teacher, another teacher and a male history teacher with musical interests who led the musical part whilst communion was being taken. The key roles in the service were all taken by the only men present.

After the religious part of the celebration, some Irish dancing and music in celebration There followed a social time of mingling with staff, visitors and students. There was a feeling of community and friendship which would make it unlikely for students to be disruptive or anti-establishment.

In cases 2 and 3 there were commonalities amongst the staff which united them in supporting the same activities and in promoting the same school ethos. Music, which usually becomes a part of community celebrations also becomes a part of what unites people. The teaching population, in case 1, did not have such a strong, homogenous group of management and teaching staff with very similar ideas about their purposes and outcomes in regard to community, ethos and the place of music within these concepts.
c. Music Teaching Staff Hierarchy by Sex

Of the borough's 14 secondary schools there were 4 female heads of music and 2 of them worked in the all girls schools. There were, however, more female music teachers in the borough than males.

Case 1

**HEAD OF DEPARTMENT - M**  **PART TIME ASSISTANT - F**

Table 3

Peripatetic instrumental teachers:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INSTRUMENT</th>
<th>SEX OF TEACHER</th>
<th>NO. OF STUDENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BRASS</td>
<td>MALE</td>
<td>2 BOYS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRUM</td>
<td>MALE</td>
<td>2 BOYS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STEEL BAND</td>
<td>MALE</td>
<td>1 BOY 14 GIRLS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLARINET</td>
<td>FEMALE</td>
<td>1 BOY 1 GIRL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIOLIN</td>
<td>MALE</td>
<td>1 BOY 3 GIRLS</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

-Peripatetic teachers

There were three white males teaching brass, drums and violin, one black male teaching steel pans and one white woman teaching clarinet. The role models supplied by the peripatetics would support a fairly stereotyped view of what males and females, black and white might play.

There was no tuition available (at the time) for sitar, tabla, African drumming or any other ethnic minority instrument. This is a particularly relevant omission when one considers the amount of students from those cultures who may wish to play those instruments.

Case 2

**HEAD OF DEPARTMENT - M**  **2ND IN DEPARTMENT - M**  **3RD IN DEPARTMENT - F**

There are 28 peripatetic music teachers who visit the school to give individual and group tuition and there has been a departmental secretary for the last year who works 11 hours a week.

An issue raised by the equal opportunities co-ordinator at this school was the lack of role models for girls amongst the staff.
because the management team were predominantly male and most of
the traditionally 'male' subjects had male heads of department.
She thought more girls could be encouraged to take traditionally
'male' subjects. 'As far as I know there has always been a woman
in the music department but the head of department has always
been a man.'

Case 3
There was one full time head of department and an assistant music
teacher, a nun whose main duties were as head of year.

Peripatetic instrumental teachers:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INSTRUMENT</th>
<th>SEX OF TEACHER</th>
<th>NO. OF STUDENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PIANO</td>
<td>FEMALE</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KEYBOARD</td>
<td>MALE</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FLUTE</td>
<td>FEMALE</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIOLIN/Viola</td>
<td>FEMALE</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GUITAR</td>
<td>MALE</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clarinet (Saxophone)</td>
<td>MALE</td>
<td>4 (1)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above figures show that in each case study most of the
peripatetic teachers fitted the gender stereotype of the
instrument which they taught. Most of the students who had
instrumental tuition also fitted these stereotypes. In the two
mixed schools the head of department was male and in case 2 there
had always been a male head of the music department.

d. Student population of schools
In case 1 the student population came from the local area which
was in one of the poorer parts of the borough. The school was
near a well known market which was the centre of reference for
students. Students came from many different cultural backgrounds
and there were slightly more boys at the school than girls.

In case 2 there were many more middle class students who came
from a catchment area that went beyond the borough's boundaries.
It was noted that at the age of 11+, girls were more mature and
often therefore intellectually superior to boys. This school, however selected girls and boys in equal numbers. As a selective grammar school that takes the most academically successful students in the area, how did they get equal numbers of girls and boys? A deputy head did not know whether the governors gave a test which was biased in favour of boys thus equalising the number of most successful girls and boys or whether they merely took the first 90 girls and the first 90 boys each year. Either way, they were not contravening the sex discrimination act because in test cases (Birmingham and Wolverhampton) it was judged that direct grant grammar schools did not have to take students based on ability and they were allowed to discriminate by gender over this issue.

In case 3 students were girls from Catholic families. Many were middle class and fitted in with the educational aspirations of the school. Those who were not middle class still had values and lifestyles that fitted with the school community.

e. Student Composition of Music Groups by Gender

In cases 1 and 3 music was taught in mixed ability groups at key stage 3, but in case study 2, students were placed in sets in years 8 and 9. The top sets were always dominated by females but the large ratio of females to males (approx. 3:1), did not continue with such a variance in the GCSE class. There were always more females in the GCSE class but in a ratio of approximately 2:1. Currently there were 16 students in 2 sets in year 10 (10 female, 6 male), 25 students in 2 sets in year 11 (17 female, 8 male), 15 students in the lower 6th (8 female, 7 male) and 6 students in the upper 6th (4 female, 2 male).

The ratio of females to males in specialised music classes decreased as students moved through the school. Approximate figures from 10 universities and 3 music colleges showed equal numbers of males and females studying music. From these figures it can be deduced that many girls do not pursue their music making to higher educational levels. It might be, as expressed in chapter 2, that girls play music more as a pastime than a
career. From Lucy Green's research in schools, (chapter 4) it might be concluded that girls are not encouraged to pursue musical careers because teachers hold stereotypical ideas about the creative ability of girls which is deemed 'less than' that of boys.

4. Teacher and Student Identity
Students from the case 1 school did not generally achieve a high academic standard or a great deal of success in school music making compared to students from cases 2 and 3. The connections around these points have been explored at a macro level, in previous sections. In this section teacher and student self definitions are used to examine these connections further in terms of gender, and gender in relation to race and class. Identities are not limited to considerations of gender only because gender converges with our differing experiences of class, sexuality, race, place (of origin and inhabitation), age, and whether or not we are able bodied.

a. Backgrounds of teachers and students
The music teachers in each case study and students from each case, spoke about their lives particularly in relation to music. This section 4a, contain quotes from the fieldnotes and notes made immediately after observations and interviews, which give a feel of the conduct and outlook of the individuals and of the stance each takes towards music.

Background of Music Teacher case 1
The head of department's musical experience started in New Zealand. He was brought up in a middle class family where everyone learned the piano. He did well at music at school where the lessons consisted mainly of singing and the lives of the great composers. He enjoyed music and joined the choir at school and at his local church. He started playing the church organ and later studied music at university with organ studies as his first instrument. He went on to do an M.A. at the university of London and then a teaching certificate.
He loved opera and was a regular concert goer. Whilst living in London he took every opportunity to make the most of the capital's concert halls and opera houses. During his time in England he had taught in what he described as tough schools in Hackney and in this present post. Now aged 27 he saw his future career as moving to a school with more music going on where the students are keen to learn music and where he could build up an orchestra and a choir and use his expertise.

Background of Students case 1

No.1 Born in another borough, Emma's family struggled to get a council property in the borough where her extended family lived. They had finally moved to the borough two years ago.

Her mother and father both worked and she had to collect her younger brother, aged eight from school each day and look after him. She did not sing in the choir because the rehearsals were at lunch time and she went to her aunt's house for lunch. Her mother said that she could not afford school dinners and she could not have a packed lunch because there were no packed lunches allowed at her brother's school and she had to be with her brother at lunch time.

At home they listened to radio two. Her father had some records and they had a record player but it was rarely used. She liked pop music but her parents did not allow her to go to the school disco; she did not know why. She sometimes listened to music on radio one when her parents were not in.

None of the family's leisure activities involved music. They had gone to a wedding last year where there was a disco which she had enjoyed. She had heard a great deal of music on the television and especially liked the theme tune to 'Eastenders' and 'Neighbours'.

no.2 Kelly's parents owned a local shop. Kelly had been born and brought up over this shop and was, with other members of the family, involved in the running of this family business. On Saturdays she worked all day on a stall at the local market. She was interested in, and enthusiastic about, her life and involvement with her extended family and friends.
She used to sing at junior school but did not join in with much of this school's choir activities because she did not like the songs. Sometimes, if the music teacher asked her she would join in because she liked him.

At home there was often music being played in the house. Her parents liked Chas and Dave (a cockney folk group) and played their records a great deal. She had been taken by her parents to see them perform live. Her mother liked listening to radio two and her father had a collection of Elvis records he sometimes played. Other brothers and sisters listened to a variety of different styles of contemporary pop music. There were sometimes arguments in the house about music being played. Often there would be different music being played in every room and the house was very noisy.

No. 3 Rahana, born in Bangladesh, came to Britain when she was four years old. She did not remember much about Bangladesh but her family still listened to music from there. She enjoyed and understood this music but also liked English pop music. She was not allowed to listen to pop music at home or take part in anything related to this country's youth culture which was seen as 'dangerous' by her parents. Her parents demanded that she behaved 'well' which included not going to discos or listening to pop music. She did not know about western classical or folk music except what she heard at school.

She was involved in music/drama productions at junior school but did not want to be part of what was happening in the music or drama department at secondary school. She went to Indian dance classes after school. Rahana pointed out that none of the Asian girls or boys took part in the choir or productions at the school. 'It is not for us' she said, 'the others make us feel uncomfortable if we try and join in, and anyway I find some of the things they do embarrassing.'

It can be seen from the above descriptions that the students had diverse backgrounds. Their involvement with music varied a great deal and the genre of music with which each was involved, within the context of their families, differed. In common, the students all liked contemporary pop music, although one student felt an ambivalence towards this kind of music because of her parents' disapproval.
The music teacher did not relate well to pop music. It was not part of anything with which he was involved in his private life, career or education. He was, of course aware of some of the music and artists of the pop industry through the media. His main and overriding musical interest was in European high art music. His second interest was in English and Australasian (Old Commonwealth) folk music. There was clearly an incongruity between individuals, and their musical preference and understanding of different musical genres. The music teacher conducted his lessons with enthusiasm for the music in which he had such a great personal investment. This motive alone encourages and stimulates the interests of students. The teacher also had an affable demeanour and was well liked by students and staff. In spite of these positive points, the positionality of the music teacher within the society and the music this represented, ran counter to that of the students.

The teacher did not provide a role model for the girls. He was a likeable individual and the students noticed this and liked him. Although he was liked he was also described as 'soft' and not strict.

Boys and girls were treated differently and through language, body language and inferences, it was clear that there were certain expectations of boys and girls. He admitted this himself and although quite prepared to look at himself and examine critically his own outlook to equal opportunities, he had never actually done so or been encouraged to do so by school based initiatives.

Whilst the above circumstances may contribute to factors leading to students lack of success in music they are by no means the main or most causal determinants. These, it is believed are mainly located in institutional micropolitical structures which relate to or run counter to individual interests and these are dealt with in sections 5 and 6 of this chapter.
Background of Teachers case 2

Many of the teachers had taught at the school for virtually all their teaching careers and were committed to a grammar school education and traditional values. Many of the governors were long serving members with people from important institutions such as the House of Lords.

The head of music had the title 'Director of music', he had a B.Mus. and had taught before at a sixth form college and a University. He was lively, efficient, alert, enthusiastic, considerate and strict over the running of the lesson. He was acknowledged as a talented musician and able teacher. The students reacted positively to him. He found it difficult not to be talking and gave students helpful suggestions when they were making their own notes, straightened the piano cover and paced up and down during the time students were given to write.

The 2nd in the department gained his MA as a Choral scholar from New College, Oxford and performed as a Tenor outside school. He had a quiet personality but in some ways balanced the dynamics of the department with his more relaxed style of relating to students. He was also an accomplished musician and by all general accounts, an inspiring teacher.

The 3rd in the department, graduated from the Royal Academy of Music. Outside school she taught in the junior department of the Royal Academy and played with the London soloist orchestra. She excelled as a musician with successes outside the school and she had a good relationship with the students. She was young and fairly new to teaching.

Background of students case 2

Most of the students came from middle class backgrounds and had been to junior schools in areas where the teachers could concentrate on furthering their students' abilities rather than areas where there was poverty and a proportion of students who needed help with English or students who had special needs. Some of the students came from outside of the borough because when the school was founded the 'parish' from which students were drawn was geographically larger than the present borough boundary. The school was therefore able to take the very highest achievers according to their test score in the entrance exam. The means of entry (at this time) was mainly based on IQ, there was a substantial minority of working class students (as there had
always been at grammar schools). There are now new screening methods, including student interviews and achievement in graded exams in music is also taken into account.

no.1 Sarah lived in the west of the borough and her mother usually brought her to school by car but she would very often get the bus home unless she got a lift with her friend's mother. Her parents are both teachers and her mother worked part time. She liked pop music and classical music. She listened to pop music with her friends and classical music with her parents. Her father played classical records and she had been to a few concerts with her parents and with a friend and her friend's parents. She played piano and violin and had a younger brother who played the piano. She was a member of the 3rd orchestra and the junior choir. She liked playing music and sometimes played piano duets with her mother who also accompanied her on the violin.

no.2 Sara said she came from a 'musical' family but that she would not be choosing music or education for her career. Her father was a teacher of Geography but also conducted and played in concerts outside of his teaching career. Her mother was an opera singer who travelled sometimes and had to work unsocial hours. Sara's main point, however, was that neither of her parents earned very much and she was determined to study in an area which might prove more remunerative in a future career. Having said that, she was clear that she 'absolutely loved music', and that she would always listen to and play music as a pastime. She said she was happy to play any kind of music. The last music she played outside school was a 'cello part in the Fauré requiem her father was conducting in her local church. She had also played jazz on her clarinet and popular music on the keyboard. She liked modern 'classical' music and thought they should listen to more of it in school. She said that she didn't mind if I told the music teacher this as she had already discussed it with him. Sara lived outside of the borough and was driven to school by her father on his way to work and very often she came home with him as well or sometimes her mother would collect her and her brother who was in the 6th form.

no.3 Claire lived a short bus ride away and came to school and went home by herself. She had an older sister who went to a local comprehensive school and a younger sister at primary school. Her mother was a teacher but was not working at the moment and her father worked full time. She played the
recorder and the clarinet and was working on grade 7 clarinet exam pieces but could not take the exam because she had failed the grade 5 theory a year ago and was reluctant to resit the exam. She was in the junior choir and the junior singers and was going away with the junior singers to the school’s field centre in Wales for a singing holiday. She was enthusiastic about music and wanted to study it seriously when she was older. At home they listened to a variety of music, they had a piano which her mother played and also used to accompany her on her clarinet and recorder. She could play the piano as well but her first instrument was clarinet.

Whole group
I asked them if they thought the female music teacher was a good role model for them as girls. They agreed that she was, although they admitted they had not thought about role models before. Trudi said ‘Now you say it, she conducts the 3rd orchestra and I was thinking in rehearsal that I would like be a conductor’. All the girls viewed the head of music with respect and good at his job; he was considered a good role model, for the boys, as a teacher and as a musician.

In considering these students and teachers what is most striking about their backgrounds is their similarity in terms of locating themselves in the society, their culture and musical interests. The students were all from families where the adult members of the family were from the same socio-economic background as their teachers. The students were all emersed in the musical repertoire of European high art as were the teachers. Students and teachers were not constricted in their view of music however and many had additional interests in Jazz or Folk idioms.

The students came to the school with expertise in playing the musical instruments of this style. In fact the graded exams which were a desirable qualification for entry to the school, tested ability in the techniques of this music only. The teachers at this school were all particularly well qualified, all having music degrees from a University or College of music.
Background of Teachers case 3

The teachers at the school who were nuns (see following statistics), were all long serving members of staff. Other staff tended to stay at the school for about 6 years, which is longer than teaching staff in the London area at this time. Some members of staff were Irish and there was a great wearing of green on St Patrick's day.

The music teacher had a B.A. from London and a PGCE from Middlesex. She was a singer and pianist. Outside school she and her husband (also a singer) travelled round the country singing with their opera company. This was of course fitted in outside school hours. Miss O, worked hard at school, accompanying students on the piano, organising extra curricular activities and generally running the music department. She was an accomplished musician, an organised teacher (one of the few music teachers in the borough to have a written syllabus, see appendix E) and she was appreciated by the staff and students.

The Sister, who was 2nd in the department, had a Certificate of Education, she was a pianist and had also specialised in composition. She put a great deal of effort into the extra curricular activities of the music department especially the religious occasions and school shows.

Background of Students case 3

no.1 Lisa was born in Eire and had been living in the borough for 5 years. She was the oldest of 6 children in her family but all the others were boys and so they would not be coming to this school. She lived in the borough, a bus ride away and she came to school and went home on the bus with her friends. Her mother was not working but she was a nurse and thinking of going back to work part time. Her father worked in a factory; she did not say what his job was. Lisa liked music and music lessons. There was a lot of music in her life, her family listened to Irish music and went to Irish community activities which always had music and often dancing as well. Lisa went to Irish dancing classes outside school and went in for competitions and festivals of dance. Her Grandad played a whistle and everyone in the family did not mind singing and dancing on festive occasions. She would have liked to have learned an instrument but her parents said that they could not afford that and the dance classes.
no.2 Tundi was born in Nigeria and had been sent to England to stay with relatives so that she could receive the benefit of an English education. She liked it in England although she missed her family and friends at home. She wanted to stay and finish her education (her parents had apparently said that if she did not work hard and do well, she would have to return). Tundi liked music and found it easy to adapt her singing style from the style she sang in Nigeria. She had in no way forgotten the singing in Nigeria and demonstrated a popular Christmas song.

no.3 Laura was born and brought up in the borough, her parents were Italian and she had been brought up in a bi-lingual household. Her parents were religious and went to the church (opposite the school) on Sundays. She came to school and went home by herself and sometimes she had to pick up her younger brother from school. She liked music but got a bit bored in music lessons. She preferred pop music but didn’t mind listening to classical music and especially liked singing some of the songs. She was in the school choir. She used to learn the violin but decided to stop because she wanted to do other things, like gymnastics and have time to do her homework as well as watching the television. Her parents did not listen to music very much but there was always music at weddings and occasions which they went to in the Italian community and there was usually an Italian band there.

The above descriptions show that there was the same kinds of enthusiasm for music from the teachers as there were from the students. There was a feeling of community which emanated from students talking about dancing together and listening to live bands with their parents whilst they were socialising. All three students came from backgrounds where music was an integral part of community relations. The teachers, like many other teachers in this school were involved in Christian worship and were both dedicated to the musical realm of sacred music. Music, especially singing and dancing bound them together in a communal act which was not questioned by anyone, the music was familiar to everyone, students were not inhibited about making music, it appeared to be an accustomed activity for them.

The subject position and social background given by the head of music in case 1 differed to the subject position and background
given by students, but staff and students described themselves in similar subject positions in case studies 2 and 3. How people subjectively construct themselves is crucial to how they reconcile themselves as who they are. Subjectivity becomes a matter of both sub-conscious and social constructions. It followed then, that students’ aspirations concerning their education were more likely to differ from that of the teachers in case 1 but to be relatively the same as that of the teachers in cases 2 and 3.

b. Identity can be shaped by experience

Whilst academic and career aspirations were high in cases 2 and 3, students from all three schools saw themselves in relation to boys and recognised their treatment as being 'other' to that of boys. This is shown in the following-

Students’ Perception of Gender: girls 'in relation to' boys

In a group interview with students in case 1, students said that they liked the practical aspects of music making and did not like lessons where they had to do a great deal of writing because they had to do so much writing in other lessons. They accepted that written work in lessons like English or History was a necessary part of the understanding of that subject but that in music lessons they felt that it was used as a means of control. They recalled many occasions when the music teacher had started a practical lesson and then abandoned it when disruptive behaviour by the boys caused him to do so.

Students felt that the teacher had to spend most of the time in music lessons attending to the needs of some of the boys. They felt sorry for the teacher because he had such a difficult time with the boys and so they behaved well and did not interrupt. They would have had to put a lot of effort into disrupting the class to be worse than some of the boys. Most of the girls said it was not worth the effort. Rahana, for instance, like most of the other girls, took responsibility for her own learning. She and others felt they were part of what was going on. During an observation it was noticed that by her body language, involvement
in singing, playing and aural work, Rahana demonstrated that she understood the work and was willing and able to take part in the lesson. However, she never spoke a word in class and was never asked a question or spoken to by the teacher during all the observations of her class.

In case 2, there was a discussion about other girls in their classes and their musical abilities. The girls in the interviewed group who played instruments seemed to aspire to playing as well as their female peers, they did not compare their musicianship, as individuals with boys as individuals. They seemed to compare themselves as a group with the boys as a group, rather than seeing everyone as a homogenous group of musicians. They recognised that there were less boys involved in music making in the school yet more attention was paid by the teachers to the boys who played instruments.

In case 3, interviewed students perceived the institution as having a biased view of the feminine. One girl said that 'Teachers, especially the male technology teacher, treat us in a girlie way' another said that the caretaker had stopped them carrying some chairs. They did not think they were treated fairly in the school because they had to adhere to standards of behaviour which related to their gender. The behaviour that was required of the girls seem to imply a more adult way of conducting oneself than would usually be expected of young people aged 11 to 14 years old. One girl said she had been told by one of the sisters not to kick a ball but only to throw it. Another said that the staff are always referring to them as young ladies. Some of the girls had brothers at the all boys Catholic school and talked about the different activities in which their brothers were involved, both musical and non-musical (school trips, camping holiday, marching band, better school buildings, more school concerts, more class instruments and more playing of instruments in class). They thought that music lessons could have a more practical focus and could be more fun.
In a music lesson in one school a group of students cried out 'sexist!' when a teacher asked two groups of students to work, unsupervised, outside the classroom. This was because both groups who were to work outside were girls. The teacher had chosen them because they were the best behaved groups. It was the boys that had called out 'sexist!'

From this evidence it is deduced that the boys felt there were unreasonable distinctions made by the teacher, between boys and girls.

Students brought particular attitudes into school regarding gender roles and often, on a more subconscious level, gender roles in the subject of music. The attitude of the girls was that things were unfair, not right and that they were not comfortable about the position they often found themselves in.

In all schools female students said that they found many of the teachers sexist in their behaviour towards them (e.g. helping them with practical things and (in the case of the mixed schools) not helping the boys and getting boys to move things and do things whilst they watched or took notes). They saw their institutions as making unreasonable rules and demands on them as girls (strict uniform, lack of playground space, no jewellery).

What came through extremely clearly was that the girls did not see the teachers as dealing with them fairly, as being sympathetic to them when unfair treatment took place and in cases 1 and 3 as being positive role models. With a sometimes very narrow view of what education is about, i.e. to gain exam passes for future work, the girls often did not see their teachers' role as changing any gender divisions that already existed or as examining their own sexism and attitudes towards boys and girls.

**Teachers' gender awareness**

Awareness of issues of gender varied amongst the music teaching staff between and within schools. All the music teachers in the study stated clearly, when asked, that their intention was always
to treat all pupils in the same way regardless of race, class, gender, ability etc.

Gendered attitudes were reinforced by teachers (not all of them music teachers) in public places around the school:
1. 'I like my girls in skirts' - a headteacher.
2. 'Swearing is not very ladylike' - head of year.
3. 'Line up properly ladies' - several members of staff.
4. 'I suppose I'd better go and teach that bunch of slags now' - a head of department to other teachers in the staff room.

Examples of comments made by teachers of music when asked about their attitudes to gender equality:

**teacher 1**
'I realise that I probably do not give a great deal of thought to gender or any aspect of equal opportunities in my lessons, probably because it has never come up as an issue and also because there are so many other things to do'.

**teacher 2**
'I am worried about clause 28 (cf. chapter 4 section 5) although in the classroom I do not particularly bring up issues surrounding homosexuality. I am concerned that the fact of the clause itself is a sign of intolerance and a hardening of attitudes towards gay and lesbian people.'

**teacher 3**
'I would like a more informal atmosphere so I can do creative work and more practical and group work but if I try that, the class will be in chaos because the boys who cause the most disruption will be even more uncontrollable'. He had not given any thought to gender in this context and supposed that his lesson content was gender neutral 'I suppose there's no such thing though.....Was it gender biased?.....Oh dear its so hard, just surviving.'
'Considerations of equal opportunities must come before the learning process can take place. We need to be mindful of each other as equal, valuable people and this should be our primary concern in the classroom. Equal opportunities issues especially those of race, class and gender and especially in this school, physical impairment, should be confronted and if necessary challenged in the classroom and in the school as a whole. I feel sorry for many musicians I know who are struggling to make a living especially the women I know who have other factors making a life as a musician very difficult.'

Teacher 1 was pragmatic and made the point that pressure of work and unawareness of gender issues makes them secondary considerations which are frequently left unattended. One teacher spoke about the significance of lesbian and gay rights when discussing gender. There were no connections drawn, however between the oppressed position of women, and negative attitudes towards lesbians and gay men. It is assumed that the teacher wanted to make a point about gender issues but either had not thought the whole issue through or did not want to discuss it fully. Teacher 3 immediately construed issues around gender to be concerned primarily with the behavioural problems of the boys in his music lessons.

One teacher had thought about equality and what it meant for him foremost as a person and then in his role as a teacher. He seemed implicitly to recognise that considerations of gender were bound up with other inequalities, yet he recognised the difficulties faced by women musicians in particular.

Teachers interpreted gender inequality from their own experiences, according to their own priorities, their position in society and their position in the school. For instance, when a deputy head was asked about gender equality, she was concerned to put the school in a positive light and pointed out the positive image of the music department with the female music
teacher being such a successful, talented and high profile teacher.

Students and teachers divided by maturity, status, and generation understood gender equality differently within their institutions. However, teachers in each case disagreed amongst themselves whilst students in each case tended to share a common view about their position as being unequal to that of boys.

How music education and gender can be 'classed'

case 1

One teacher recognised that the girls in all his lessons took less part in the lessons, were sometimes intimidated by boys and were generally quieter. When asked why he thought there was this difference between girls' and boys' behaviour he thought for over a minute and said, 'I do realise that there is an injustice going on in my classes. Many students, mainly girls, are being demoralised and defeated in their learning by groups of boys who I cannot cope with adequately. I do try (pause) and in a way these girls have to cope with this in their lives anyway. They are used to it and accept things how they are. I do give more attention to the girls in extra curricular activities like choir'.

He thought he almost certainly did say things that were gender biased but that he could not help the way he was used to behaving. 'I have always assumed that you behave in a gentle way with girls.....I don't know if that makes my teaching gender biased?'

He thought that he related equally to boys and girls when it came to actually teaching but that he related to boys more on behavioural issues.

case 2

In an interview with one music teacher, he explained that he did not give a great deal of thought to equal opportunities because he had always judged people on their ability and not on their gender. He pointed out that many more girls did music in the
school. He did not know why, after such large ratios of girls taking part in music throughout the school and more women going on to music colleges and universities, that there were not more well known women conductors, composers, technicians and eminent musicians.

**case 3**
The music teacher said; 'I am keen on musical literacy as a first principle in music teaching... There is no taunting or bullying amongst the girls who are more able to display their child side and stay little girls longer. Girls are more conscientious than boys and listen attentively to what you say, they have a different priority to be right and good and are more perceiving and serious in lessons.... Girls are not as experimental as boys or as aggressive and it is a limit on their creative abilities.'

In case 1, the teacher referred to the girls as 'these girls' implying that certain girls have to tolerate particular circumstances because that is what they are 'used to' and have to 'cope with'. This teacher had already acknowledged the difference in social background between himself and the students. Using words like 'intimidated', 'injustice', 'demoralised' and 'defeated' to explain the situation for girls in his classes, he appeared to be projecting some of his own despair in coping with the stresses of his job which centred a great deal around an institutional acceptance of disruptive behaviour of some of the boys in music lessons. The teacher spoke unequivocally about his problems and the differences he saw between girls and boys.

In case study 2, the gendered messages were not quite so explicit. This teacher, and many others in case 2, could not see any unfair differentiation by gender at all, in the school. Their evidence was that large numbers of girls were high achievers in the school. In fact, most students were high achievers, because the school had selected those who were most likely to achieve at 11+. Another piece of evidence that the teachers used to justify the claim girls achieved their full potential in music was the large numbers of girls in choirs and orchestras. This teacher's
meritocratic attitude towards students, ensured that more girls took part in music making. In music, girls were in the majority throughout the school system, although the ratio between girls and boys narrowed as they went up the school.

It was only the set of circumstances in this particular case study i.e. the advantaged and socially superior nature of the school community, that enabled the teacher to make the comments about girls' achievements. Given these circumstances, girls as well as boys achieved status as professional musicians on completion of their education but they did not appear to achieve the same distinction and renown as some of their male peers.

What was not examined by many teachers was the underlying issues of girls' self esteem, their future aspirations and potential as professional musicians and how the school might address the institutionalised nature of sexism that had historically precluded girls in relation to these issues.

In case 3 as in case 1, the teacher had clearly defined attitudes towards girls which were gendered. Unlike case 1, this teacher only taught girls (she had previously taught in a mixed school). She thought the girls' behaviour indicated their femininity which she construed as being 'conscientious', 'attentive', 'serious', and 'good'. She also thought they were childlike and had a limited potential for creativity. It might be that this notion of being childlike; giggly, self-conscious, linguistically innocent, restrained behaviour, (my observations in this case) is attributed to girls and presumed to indicate a lack in creative capacity. Whilst childlike behaviour of some boys; name-calling, linguistically explicit, egocentric, (my observations in other schools) is construed as creative potential.

Fieldnotes made after interviews and observations with a group of students in case 1 gave accounts of the teachers as having no idea of what life was like for them in school:
Girls saw the teachers as 'middle class', 'adult and intolerant', 'educated and intolerant', 'living in a different world', 'behind a desk', 'in the staffroom', 'travelling between buildings in their cars', 'busy', 'protected by the institution', 'a part of the institution', 'not always speaking understandably' and 'oblivious to things that happened or were said right in front of them'. The students felt more at ease with some teachers than others and described those teachers as the ones that liked them, (this had nothing to do with how strict the teacher was).

Students indicated how they saw their position as 'classed' and how this was particularly isolating for girls who were supposed to be treated equally by the teachers. From interviews with teachers and comments made publicly by teachers (see above) it was noted that many of the teachers thought girls were to blame for their position in relation to the boys because of their passivity (or femininity) or lack of passivity (often seen as sexuality).

In case 1, many teachers were so far removed from their students' lives that they seemed unable, rather than unwilling to address the injustices that were felt by their students.

How music education and gender can be 'raced' Examples of comments made by teachers when asked about music, and multicultural education and racial equality:

**teacher 1**
She said that there was not a large number of black children and that she was not aware of any discrimination. The deputy head went on to say that there was an arrangement for Jewish people to have their own assembly and that there was a Muslim prayer group with 2 rooms to pray, that there was no hymn in assembly and no Bible reading, and that the music department encouraged all denominations.
teacher 2
This teacher believed that music should be available for everyone to enjoy. He did not have a strict view about what kind of music should be offered in the music classroom but he felt that European classical music represented 'a great deal of what is superb in music'. He regretted, however, that he knew virtually nothing about musics from other parts of the world and for this reason felt that he could not use them in the classroom.

teacher 3
He said that he selected his materials and presented the music in class that he knows about. He said that he was aware that he should be introducing music from other cultures and that he should go on some INSET for this but had not had time. 'In my previous school, attitudes amongst staff and students towards issues of gender and race were much more comfortable. I get the impression that here they don't like you to say too much about gender or race. They seem to think its subversive (laughs)'. He referred to a speech given in the school to parents, students and teachers by a speaker who had made sexist remarks and remarks about the desirability of colonialism (see appendix F).

teacher 4
She thought that Christian hymn singing in assembly was inappropriate considering this was a multi-faith school but she thought that this was a tradition of the school and not the music teacher's idea, although he played the accompaniments.

Teacher 1, a deputy head was concerned to point out that the school met the needs of ethnic minority groups and that she knew of no discrimination in the school. Two teachers referred to what they taught in music lessons, one who thought he should use more multi-cultural material and the other who thought he was unable to. Teacher 4 thought that Christian hymn singing was unsuitable for that school. Teacher 3 referred to the school politics of equality issues and indicated the divisiveness it can cause amongst staff.
Staff in each case study had differing thoughts about multi-cultural education and anti-racism. It was not like asking a variety of staff about appraisal or technology across the curriculum, where similar points and concerns came up and staff knew how to get themselves informed and were positive about doing so. Issues of race brought about a scepticism and defensiveness from some teachers. Music was a particularly tense issue in this context because some teachers felt that to move away from the European classical tradition was a negation of their own culture. Some teachers were in favour of a multi-cultural education but were dubious about anti-racism. For instance, some teachers were uncomfortable about the group of teachers who wrote the letter challenging racism described by teacher 3.

Conclusion to section 4
Identity appeared in some way to be shaped by teachers' attitudes to learning, discipline, to girls and to the arts. Identity was not just about being female or male but differing experiences of class and race added to the diversity of girls' experiences. Furthermore, girls found themselves positioned in very different contexts depending on which case study school they attended. An additional dimension which intersected with those already described, was the particular way each individual construed and dealt with her unique set of circumstances.

The teachers in the 3 schools were very different in their approaches, for instance, assumptions and meanings round the word 'behaviour' in music lessons took on different guises in each school. In case 1 behaviour meant bad or disruptive behaviour and there was a drive to make students conform (mostly the girls did conform but got little credit for this); in case 2 it was more the need to remind students to be formal, quiet and alert in order to achieve; in case 3 it meant involvement in the work rather than apathy so students might be dutifully involved in worthwhile pursuits.

Girls and women are generally adept at adjusting themselves to the needs of a situation and these three different priorities,
to conform, to achieve and to be involved were well met by the girls in the different schools.

There was a discrepancy between teachers' views of students and students' views of themselves. The students and teachers construed meanings, values and priorities differently and this was evident to different extents in almost every area of school and classroom.

Only three teachers said that they had given any previous thought to their teaching in terms of equality (two in case 1 and one in case 2), none of these were music teachers although 1 taught music. Most teachers thought that they treated students equally and that what they presented was free of bias. Given the nature of the society in which we live, the comments of students and overwhelming evidence to the contrary, this was a misguided conclusion.

5. Equal Opportunities and Case Study Schools

a. Institutional Policies

The borough had instigated the writing of equal opportunities policies in every school. The deadline for the multi-cultural policy had passed and some schools in the borough had submitted their policies whilst for others it was still in hand. Many schools had started work on the gender equality policy which was required next, by the borough. There were borough meetings and workshops for teachers involved in the co-ordination of policy writing in their institutions.

Some funding for equal opportunities had been provided through the Government sponsored, Technical and Vocational Education Initiative (TVEI) in which the borough participated. Each secondary school was enabled to appoint a co-ordinator for equal opportunities who was given a brief to write the equality policies. Schools in the borough responded to these borough initiatives in a number of ways. The case study schools exhibited differences and similarities in their stance on equal opportunities and a number of matters were raised.
In all cases there were teachers who thought that students were not made aware of issues of equality through the borough initiatives although students had been told about equal opportunities issues in assemblies and by some teachers. Students had heard the terms sexism and racism but were not always clear about what was meant by these terms. In two schools in particular some members of the teaching staff were frustrated and angry at the lack of positive regard towards equal opportunities in their schools. For instance, it was felt by some that school management did little to address the sexist attitudes brought by students who were influenced by factors outside of the schools.

Conversely, there were teachers in each case who did not want to address equality issues at all and many of them expressed opinions about equality similar to this teacher: 'There is no real problem here. Making it a big issue makes it a problem' (deputy head).

For those who thought equal opportunities was a real issue there was also a concern that there was lack of awareness amongst the staff about equal opportunities and this was also not being addressed. For instance, at a staff meeting in one school, staff heard how a female member of staff had been subjected to sexual harassment by a male member of staff.

Two of the three schools had no school policy for race or gender and little attention appeared to be paid to issues of equality at an institutional level. For instance, one teacher said 'some of the materials and lesson content I’ve seen around the school on cover lessons and even in my own department is overtly racist and sexist' (deputy head of year).

In one of these schools the working party for equal opportunities worked with the borough co-ordinator and took advantage of the borough’s link with The Gender Centre at University of London, Institute of Education, by attending meetings and workshops. Members of the working party said that there had been a lack of sensitivity towards issues of equal opportunities especially
amongst the senior management team. They said they had decided to take a 'softly softly' approach but were finding that the strategies they devised for promoting good practice in equal opportunities were not sanctioned by management.

During the academic year in which the study took place, the equal opportunities working party in this school made two recommendations in their Institutional Development Plan, a document that every department and working group had to produce each year. The first recommendation was that there was a need to raise awareness of equal opportunities issues amongst the staff with suggestions that this could be through in-service training, at staff meetings and by dissemination of ideas and strategies, through departments and year groups. The second was that the staff should make a decision about whether a policy was needed to monitor and deal with sexist and racist name calling and language.

The group then went on to research the extent of the racist and sexist language in the school and to present these findings at a staff meeting. There was little time given over to debate in the staff meeting and the matter appeared to be dropped by senior management.

An accumulation of events took place in the school during this period, including a speech made by a close associate of the school endorsing sexism and colonialism and a picture on a notice board of Nelson Mandela saying 'the struggle must go on' which was taken down by a deputy head. These events finally prompted about a third of the staff to send a letter to the acting headteacher (see appendix F). The head and deputy were informed that this letter was going to be sent and a copy was sent to the L.E.A. The letter set out some of the inequalities that had been witnessed by staff and pointed to management's reluctance to deal with them.

In a discussion with the acting headteacher she was asked about the visitor who made the inflammatory remarks. She said that she had taken a particular dislike to the speaker herself. He had treated her patronisingly calling her 'love' and 'dear'. He had
ignored her on several occasions preferring to obtain information from the male deputy. He had made remarks about her 'filling in' and 'coping' in the absence of the 'headmaster'. However, she did not want to 'make waves' about the speaker.

In this school, an entrenchment of positions had occurred in which management appeared to want to manage equal opportunities in such a way as to cause minimum uneasiness amongst all concerned whereas many staff considered matters of equality should be clearly and openly confronted and debated.

Amid the polarity of opinion between the management line and the hard edge of resistance against it, there was a complexity of values, meanings, significances and purposes in which staff took positions which were located in both personal and professional contexts. For example, three members of staff were worried about sending 'the letter' and making public exposures of prejudice because they thought it might negatively affect their career chances, their retirement rights and/or their position as citizens in this country. They had all previously lived under regimes where non-conformity can lead to punishment, sometimes by death and often by exclusion from the society. They were concerned about what might be written on their personal files which, in this borough, were not open for staff to see. There seemed to be some justification for this fear as shown in a staff bulletin which said: 'Considerable delay and difficulty was caused by those members of staff who failed to get their reports to third year tutors by the given deadline. In future such defaulters will be seen by a senior member of staff and a note recording this will be placed on their files' (unsigned)

One of the teachers, a mature man who had been a teacher before becoming a political refugee in this country was employed as an instructor (on a lower pay rate) and was worried about his possible future status. Another wanted to retire soon and to keep a low profile and then quietly leave.

Teachers belonged to friendship groups, departmental groups and informal alliances based on age, gender, background etc. which influenced professional decision making. Many found themselves
in factions taking up particular positions on matters concerning equal opportunities.

All teachers of colour except the man hoping to retire, signed 'the letter' and almost twice as many women than men signed it. Many women teachers thought that the school reflected the values and meanings of a male culture and that the management style of control, of top down decision making, was an authoritarian way of dictating to staff what they must do, with little or no consultation. For example, two women teachers said,

'All we wanted was for .... to stand up in a staff meeting and distance herself and the school from what the speaker had said. She would not do it. She said she was going to and then didn't. Really she's condoning what's been said. I spoke to her about it and she said that no other staff had mentioned it to her' (music teacher).

and

'Girls are discouraged by the lack of role models around them - most Heads of Department are male and others with positions of responsibility are male' (maths teacher)

From a management perspective it was difficult to gauge what criteria and reasoning were being used to sustain their position. Senior staff regarded with some suspicion a researcher (known to be a teacher in the borough) asking questions about equality at a time when such issues were causing so much consternation. However, some comments were made in writing, in response to 'the letter':

'...racially and sexually motivated abuse and harassment within our school has not been presented at a staff meeting.. (quotes minutes of staff meeting)- "Racial/sexist insults are frequently exchanged among some of our pupils" ...I have never received a report of any pupil or any member of staff being racially or sexually abused'

About the Nelson Mandela photograph was written '... the school wall should not display any material of a political nature which could cause offence to any section of our school community'
Management at this school, as in other schools had to present the school in a good and positive way to parents. Matters of sexism and racism were covered up if occurring in the hidden curriculum and denied if occurring in an overt way. An outside facilitator delineated the equal opportunities and curriculum issues which should be considered in the school:

**Hidden**

Hush ups, don't talk about it. Fear of listening to each other's viewpoints. Not listening to ethnic minorities and women. Shared values assumed. Lip service paid to equal opportunities. Sexism and racism of staff not addressed. Women under-represented in senior positions and in traditional areas of the curriculum.

**Overt**

Name calling and abuse. Low status of equal opportunities. Girls not allowed to wear trousers. Dealing with racist incidents. Books, resources and displays in the school, including pin-ups.

After this session the pin up calendars and pages from girlie magazines in two locations in the school were removed:

1. From the Caretakers office. These could be easily viewed through a window when entering the main school from the biggest car park. It was not an entrance usually used by students but it was not out of bounds.

2. From the office of the male P.E. teachers, situated in the boys' changing room. Most students knew about the pin ups and one teacher said he was appalled by the female nudes that could be seen by any boy who came to the office to speak to a member of staff there.

The management did not want to accept a proposed ethos statement for the school which included these words:

'....the school exists in a society with a long history of racism and sexism in its institutions, language and culture. The school also recognises that well intentioned statements can be made, yet unconscious attitudes, behaviour and practice can still exist which unintentionally discriminate . . . .

(from ethos statement in another borough school)
It appeared that some of the management were inept at staff management and were unaware of the issues concerning equal opportunities. An authoritarian management position caused those with differing views to increase their opposition. Some staff then construed equal opportunities as 'the preoccupation of trendy lefties' (male PE teacher).

In the school whose equality statement was in place it was found that it had been drafted by two deputy heads and one teacher said that it had been passed as acceptable by the staff in a meeting 'almost as a matter of formality'. I asked the deputy head with responsibility for equal opportunities, how the policy would be implemented once it had been introduced but she did not know. In an interview with the Equal Opportunities Co-ordinator in this school, the teacher was despondent about her role as co-ordinator. She felt that the post was only in place because it had been funded by TVEI and the school was interested in persuading more girls to take science subjects.

In the Catholic school, the aspect of equality which concerned caring for others and not judging others as being of lesser or greater worth (love your neighbour, love your enemy, giving to the least of Jesus’s followers) were issues which were implicit in Christian doctrine and valuing everybody was a positive part of school life, a friendly welcoming relation to all others (not just those in the community or those who were known).

The school, whilst successfully inspiring this feeling of human relationship, kept itself separate from many of the borough’s equal opportunities working parties. They took their line of management from the male led church rather than the male led local authority (as they had a right to do). There was an unspoken line between the authoritative powers which guided the school and an unspoken distinction between the raising of issues of equality and social justice, and having a faith based on experience and prayer which is both personal and shared.

Some individuals in schools (particularly those in management positions) became defensive and evasive upon mention of the word equality. Once this stance had been taken, it was difficult for
anyone to invoke a reasonable or productive dialogue on the matter. Personal blame seemed to be feared by some individuals when all that was being asked of them was to be vigilant and aware of students' rights to equality. Management took its license from the power and control with which it was invested and this included management of equality.

Those involved in working for change in attitudes to equality were in danger of taking a counter-reactionary position by becoming accusative, which might entrench them in immoderate positions. However, this did not happen to any group in the case study schools because they listened to guidance and support from informed and aware outside agencies.

b. Teacher Time and Attention in music lessons
The boys sought attention in most curriculum areas and the extent to which this occurred depended on the teacher, the subject, their mood and the subject matter. Girls in mixed schools were resigned to accept less teacher time.

Boys monopolised music lessons in both mixed schools. Fifty per cent more questions were asked by boys, teachers directed instructions mostly to boys and boys were picked to answer questions when there were boys and girls with their hands up fifty per cent more of the time. When girls did answer questions a comment was often made by a boy for instance:
Teacher: (pointing to Kelly) Yes Kelly
Chas: Yes, go on smelly

On one occasion, students who played brass instruments had been invited to bring them in to the lesson for demonstration; a girl brought a trombone and a boy brought a trumpet. The teacher asked the question 'Why is there a bell shape at the end of the instrument?' A girl at the front answered 'So the noise gets bigger' but the teacher didn't hear her. A boy then gave, word for word, the same answer. 'Yes' said the teacher who then asked 'How long would the trumpet be if it was opened right up?' The same girl at the front answered 'About a metre and a half' but the teacher still did not hear her. A boy then said '5 foot'. 'Yes' said the teacher.
On another occasion, a boys' group of three were recording some music. On the first take the pianist played nothing. 'Is this minimalist music?' the teacher said wittily. They recorded on the next take. A girls' group of three were then due to record. They giggled because the cor anglais kept getting stuck and were told that there was no time to laugh.

Boys appeared to ask for and need more help in music lessons. In one class, students were working intently on putting rhythms to a tune, the teacher went round to each group to offer help. There were 4 girls' groups and 3 boys' groups and the teacher made comments to all the groups except 2 of the girls' groups. The music teacher said he was trying to reinforce positive behaviour by giving praise and he felt this was needed more by boys.

In one class the music teacher spent a vast majority of his time dealing with the interruptions caused by boys. Each week the class started late because of disruptions and an average of a further 16 mins per lesson was spent dealing with behavioural problems which involved 6 particular boys. In another school attention was sought by a boy who took his shoe and sock off in order to examine his foot.

Teachers were often confrontational with girls and non-confrontational with boys. For example, one boy called out saying 'He's written lies on my work'. The teacher went over to the boy and gently subdued him by putting his hand on his shoulder and saying 'What's going on?'

In observations at mixed schools music teachers directed twice as many questions to boys than girls and helped boys more than girls. As shown in chapter 3, previous research demonstrates that this is likely to be the case even if teachers are aware of gender bias and consciously try to correct it. Teacher time was taken up either negatively by the boys misbehaving or positively by boys asking and answering more questions and by teachers taking more notice of boys and apparently valuing their contributions more.
c. Instruments/ equipment

In the all girls school, there were the usual classroom percussion, xylophones, triangles, maracas etc. and a set of 15 small keyboards. The school had some orchestral instruments on loan to students, 7 flutes, 3 clarinets and 1 saxophone, also quite a few violins but there were no brass instruments and no drum kit. There were BBC computers which were kept in the computer room and small groups of students during music lessons could use the music programmes, although this was never observed. The music teacher commented that the girls in year 9 loved to use the technological equipment and that they did not dominate each other over its use.

Girls in mixed schools were resigned to having less access to equipment. In the mixed schools technological equipment and bigger, noisier instruments like keyboards, drums and the larger more interesting percussion instruments were frequently taken over by boys.

In one class, each time the instruments were given out, the boys (all of them except the boy in the wheel chair) and two of the girls made a dash to get the best instruments from the cupboard. The girls who were left with the less desirable instruments made no or little comment and only on one occasion did the teacher say: 'Come on, let's be fair and let everyone have a go on the wooden xylophones'. But he did not enforce his statement and the same girls ended up with the smaller metal glockenspiels. Most of the girls did little to stop the boys grabbing the equipment, in fact in some cases they aided them. On one occasion two girls were given an instrument each. Michael and his friend had to share, albeit one of the larger instruments, but they kept arguing with each other and asked the girls for one of their instruments. One of the girls give their instrument to Michael. Later she was asked why she had given up the instrument; Jenny: Sir said we had to share so I told Kelly to give it to Sir
Kelly: I gave it to Michael so he could shut up.

The girls would have liked their fair share of time using these resources but rather than ask for their time, they accepted that
boys would dominate certain areas of the classroom. In fact, if they wanted a calm atmosphere, they appeared to have no choice. From studies about gendered behaviour in infant and junior schools in the borough, (Drinkwater 1991) it can be deduced that this is behaviour boys and girls had already learned.

d. Singing
In one school, singing went on in every lesson. The teacher was concerned that the hymn singing in the twice weekly assembly was not very good so he practised the hymn with each of his classes. In one particular class, singing was a strained activity because many boys and girls did not make any sound at all and those that did sing were quiet and reluctant. Four boys who usually behaved badly were also disruptive during the singing and sometimes sang in silly voices or made silly noises.

In the other mixed school there was very little singing in class time except to learn the school song and for 5 minutes at the end of some lessons. Singing took place during most lunch times and at break in the many singing groups which were dominated by girls.

The language in the songs that were selected tended to use only masculine terms of reference and were meant to have a male singing them. The girls made no comment about this and it did not seem to encourage the boys to sing properly.

In the all-girls school there was singing in most lessons which appeared to be enjoyed and entered into wholeheartedly. Girls in all schools were the students who preferred to sing.

e. Listening
In all schools, a very narrow range of musical styles was heard. In case 1, it was difficult for the teacher to instigate any critical response from female or male students because of the need for constant discipline and opinions of students were often ridiculed by groups of boys.
f. Text books
Illustrations showed mainly white men and no females at all shown as conductors, sound engineers, disc jockeys, composers, record producers or any of the traditionally male dominated musical activities. Similarly there were no males pictured accompanying female instrumentalists or as singers or tambourine players in all female bands etc.

g. Displays
In all schools there were no pictures of male and female students participating in musical activities. There were pictures of male composers but not female composers.

In case 3, for instance, in the music room there were music posters all round the walls. The first poster to be observed was 'a great composers' chart (see Appendix G). All-male composers were split into nationality and periods of time. There was a poster showing The Symphony Orchestra with a male conductor pictured in front and an all male orchestra except for the harpist. Around this poster were various items of student's work on the Beatles, orchestral instruments and composers such as Brahms and Purcell. The posters showed each section of the orchestra, brass, woodwind, strings and percussion all played by men except for a woman harpist and a woman guitar player on the strings poster. The next set of posters were called 'Music Around the World'. Here, although mainly men played drums, sitar and other instruments, there were quite a few pictures of women from Africa and Asia, dancing and in some cases playing mainly string and wind blown instruments. Finally a humorous set of posters featured cartoons of people representing the Italian words which are used as expression marks in much European music. Females represented smooth, very soft, girls as sweet, slowing down in old age and becoming gradually softer, whereas males represented vigorous, sad, fast, majestic, funny, loud and forceful, boys trumpeting and in a singing style, quietening down in old age (see appendix H).

h. Work sheets
In all schools the generic 'he' was often used. The language therefore often appeared to exclude females. One particular work
sheet called 'The Old Bag', where students had to write the notes B, A and G into a musical story about an old woman (the old bag) who lost her bag, was blatantly sexist.

i. Practise facilities
These were good in all 3 schools. They were used frequently in the all-girls' school and by more girls than boys in case 2, but in case 1 they were rarely used. Students went out at break times and were generally not allowed inside without a member of staff supervising them. The practice rooms were used as stores and for peripatetic teaching.

j. Extra Curricular Activities
In case 1, there was choir once a week at lunch times. This group frequently performed badly after months of successful practice. It seems that the all-girl group suffered some intimidation for taking part in what was considered by other students as being inappropriate for their social class and a distinctly feminine activity. The teacher said that there had been three boys in the choir but that last year the third boy had sung a solo in assembly and had been teased so much by other boys that he had stopped going to choir. He had then taken up the trumpet. This school also had steel band practice and a small 'palm court' orchestra made up of those who had instrumental tuition. The groups were nearly all girls, often the same ones who enjoyed classroom music. Many boys did not join because they 'did not like music', 'participated in sports teams', 'preferred to play' and 'preferred to watch T.V.' Girls who did not participate tended to have different reasons; 'parents refused permission', 'other artistic activities outside school' and 'participated in sports teams' (information was gathered by asking 6 out of the 18 form tutors in years 7, 8 & 9 to put questions to their classes).

In case 2, there was a senior choir, a junior choir, various madrigal groups, chamber choirs and the junior singers. There were 3 orchestras and various smaller ensembles. There were always rehearsals going on. There were more females than males in a ratio of about 2:1 in the orchestras (table 5) and on a ratio of 3:1 in the choirs.
In case 3, there was a choir and a school orchestra which rehearsed weekly and more frequently before concerts. By the end of key stage three, about two thirds of all girls had joined the choir at some time. Instrumentalists tended to remain the same group.

Visit from the Royal City Ballet—case 1
In the story of Swan Lake—If a handsome prince promises to marry the swan she will remain a beautiful woman and so on. Students were asked to get into girl/boy partners. In the initial 'cross-bow' part where the hunter shoots the swan, two boys adopted aggressive, 'shooting type' stances and expressions. Most students seemed embarrassed by the 'true love forever', 'plight thy troth' subject matter ('This is ridiculous' said one boy and in a teasing voice a girl said 'Its so sentimental') and they adopted silly poses, giggled and 'sent it up'. The visitor chose 4 couples, 2 of whom were all girls. They were self conscious especially the 2 boys who kept looking at their friends. After the movements were performed the rest of the group were invited to comment. All the remarks were directed towards the 2 boys (mostly about their ability to do it and their shyness).

Square Dancing—case 2
A square dance specialist had come in and the music group joined another class to take part for this lesson only. Girls came in same sex couples and were put into girl/boy couples.

'Head couples, take your partner in a ballroom hold; right hand round the waste, hold her hand with your left hand' (This last statement was apparently addressed to the boys)
'You've all got a new girl, you should have a new girl, so girls you take the identity of the man you're with. Everybody (he means the boys) take your new partner. Promenade your new lady on your right... Swing this corner, get the new lady and swing her...'

Extra curricular musical activities in the mixed schools divided students by gender. The content of the two visits by performance artists were caused girls and boys to have to take certain traditional roles prescribed by their sex.
In all schools girls dominated the extra-curricular musical activities, especially choirs. This is discussed in more detail under the heading 'music as a feminine activity'.

k. Behaviour

Case 1

Boys caused most of the disruption in the lessons and some had particular behavioural difficulties. One boy, for instance, had emotional and behavioural difficulties and was unable to cope with any of the work, written or practical. This boy who later went to a special school was in too much personal distress to conform in any way in the classroom.

Other boys, however did not have learning or emotional difficulties but their behaviour was still disruptive. One boy who was probably of average ability or above did not stop drawing attention to a whole range of distractions that he manufactured for himself e.g. a frozen drink which melted in his pocket, disagreement with those around him, no pencil, pen, book etc. calling out across the room, lack of interest in what the teacher was presenting, a lively sense of humour about anything that went on around him which made the class laugh, being late, walking out distressed and so on. He was bright, likeable, and he said he liked music lessons and he liked the teacher. He seemed ill at ease and as if he could not help himself. He was not calm and nothing would occupy him for long. This boy could not fit himself into the classroom situation.

Other boys joined in with the disruptions made by the two and seemed to enjoy the diversions from the lessons. The disruptive behaviour meant that students were not completing tasks and applying themselves to the work. It was decided to find out who was able to learn the music and who did not want to learn.

Diagram of Classroom

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>back</th>
<th>front</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B-B-</td>
<td>B+B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-B-</td>
<td>G+G+G+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-</td>
<td>G+G+G+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-B-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

told to sit at front

key: - those who could not play
+ those who could play
those who disrupted
Seven boys did not learn the tune, three of them because they disrupted (and maybe could not play either) and four of them because they could not or were unable to play. Two girls were unable or could not play the tune and seven girls could play.

**case 2**

Boys were more badly behaved than girls in case 2. For instance, on one occasion, the teacher was 11 minutes late for a lesson. The girls arrived first with their instruments which they had been asked to bring for this lesson and they started to work on their scores. The boys then arrived and crashed on the piano playing chopsticks and so on, banged on the timpani and made unpleasantly loud noises.

On another occasion, a boy, Steven, had been making noises ('raspberries') emulating the brass players we had been listening to in the lesson. He had been doing this for 15 minutes interspersed with calling names like 'shit head, 'plonker' and 'bean head' to boys around him. The teacher dealt differently with boys' misbehaviour than with girls' misbehaviour. In the case of Steven the teacher finally said 'Steven don't be so aggressive'. Later, when the students were writing, the teacher came over and chatted affably to Steven who didn't seem inclined to write much and patted him on the shoulder. However, another incident in the same lesson had occurred regarding Tamsin who interrupted the teacher when he was talking by giggling. The teacher said 'What is the problem? There is a problem at the moment, its you'.

The senior mistress spoke about behavioural problems which she said stemmed from outside school. She said that there was not a great deal of confrontation and that in general there was quite a high standard of behaviour in the school. She then said that there was more 'back chat' from boys than girls and that groups of boys tended to dominate the girls and other boys. Observations in music lessons concurred with her viewpoint.

**case 3**

There were no behavioural problems observed in case 3 but the teacher reprimanded the classes on many occasions, usually a
criticism of the class as a whole as shown on different occasions in the following examples:

1. The teacher arrived (late) for the lesson and found the room had already been put in order by students for a lesson on the keyboards, as they had been told in the previous lesson that they would continue with this work which was half way through. 'Why are the desks like this?' said the teacher. The class started their explanation. 'Never assume anything' she said. They had to learn the hymns for a Mass to be celebrated on Friday because the founder of the convent order was to be Beatified.

2. 'I don't like walking into a room and I can't hear myself speak'. The students stood in silence. She told them to remain standing in silence whilst she carried on her conversation with a student teacher.

3. The teacher went to get some song books from the cupboard and there was a slight murmuring from the class. 'What is the matter with you? All stand and you are not sitting down until there is silence', she said.

4. The students were to play keyboard this lesson and the teacher showed signs of being fed up with dealing with the drill of getting them out and setting them up. 'We've done this before' she said and 'So you don't know?' she said irritably 'We'll have to put the instruments away then'. No-one spoke, but they kept trying to guess at how the teacher wanted it done until she relented and told them.

5. The students were doing an exercise to teach them about scales. 'We are going to compose a tune in a particular key. What key could we compose it in?' There was silence. 'We have just talked about this' she shouted. The students had not connected 'key' with 'scale' but the teacher had not yet realised this.

There were few discipline problems in the school. If a girl behaved badly, for instance if she was rude to a teacher or if a girl was not in the school's uniform or was found to be truanting, she would be spoken to by the head of year and in the
last instance by the head or deputy head who were nuns. Most of the girls in the school were Catholic and it appeared that in cases where behaviour became an issue, the girls were appealed to, to behave correctly. There was a strict code of conduct.

Social class made a difference to the nature of domination by boys. In case 1 (a more 'working class' model), boys disrupted lessons by being disorderly whereas in case 2 (a more 'middle class' model), boys drew attention to themselves by misbehaving, making more noise and asking questions (sometimes irrelevant or fatuous questions). Social class also made a difference to the acceptability of a music curriculum based on high art music which was more acceptable to the students in case 2 and 3 than those in case 1 (and this was particularly so for the boys).

In the all-girls school discipline was noticeably harsher. Teachers wielded more power in the classroom and did not allow as much democratic debate. Teachers were sharp over small matters which went unnoticed in the mixed schools. The expectation that teachers had of girls, appeared to be complete obedience.

1. Focus on Girls

In a music class in case 1, the disruptive behaviour of some of the boys was so involving that the girls were not being noticed and it was found that, after observing two lessons, there was little recording of the experiences and perceptions of the girls. A decision was made to sit by one girl and monitor everything that happened to her in particular. The girl chosen usually sat alone but near a group of girls.

The girls were involved in a set of interactions which were almost unseen by the casual observer. They quietly, by mouthing and other silent gestures, borrowed each others pens, shared information about the work and waited and waited and waited. Much time was spent staring out of the window, fiddling, doodling and staring into space whilst the teacher dealt with the boys who were seeking attention. Rahana did try to take part in the lesson during the time when the teacher was teaching. For instance, on one occasion:
The class were to work on their scores where the rhythm the teacher played was different to that which was written. Mr G. asked them how many changes he had made. Some students put their hands up including Rahana, but a boy at the back (not one of the usually disruptive boys) called out the answer and then some other boys called out numbers which were not related to the question. The teacher called for order and continued with the questioning (which was popular with the class). Rahana seemed to be enjoying the exercise and said 'four changes' which was the correct answer, but only I could hear. The teacher went through it all and students called out rather than putting their hands up as this was what some of the boys had established. Only boys made themselves audible. Rahana was getting some satisfaction from the exercise even though no-one else knew she was contributing.

m. Special Needs

Teachers did not appear to be aware of any special needs in their classes. They knew that some pupils had language problems because English was not their first language and that some students were slower or brighter than others. In cases 2 and 3, there were few students who had special needs and those who did, received help outside of the classroom.

In case 1, there were a number of students who needed extra support and one teacher explained that he was more preoccupied with keeping order in his classes and making sure that everyone was wearing their correct uniform. In one class he had spent a total of 7 minutes getting one boy to change out of his trainers into his shoes and then stopping him throwing the trainers around the room. On another occasion the same boy had come in late and disrupted the beginning of the lesson, he was wearing some very muddy trainers and the teacher spent 4 further minutes getting him to change. On a third occasion another boy had taken his shirt almost off, because he was hot and underneath he was wearing a red tee shirt.

In this class, it was discovered that 6 of the girls and 2 of the boys had been noted by the school as needing help with English because it was their second language, although only 2 of the
girls received any help in the school because there was no allocation of ESL teachers from the language centre by the authority. The reasons for this were not clear, although subsequently a document 'Meeting the Needs of Bi-lingual Learners' was published by HMI which showed that this borough had seriously neglected its ESL students.

n. Use of Language

i. names

Teachers appeared to know the names of all the boys in each of the classes but not all of the girls' names. During the observations the researcher had learnt the names of all the boys and later it was noticed that neither the teachers nor the students used the girls' names very much.

ii. accent

The choir were singing 'My Grandfather's Clock' and the teacher stopped them to say; 'It sounds like a (local) accent, auld maen doid, sing it slowly and get the diction right'.

Comments made by a deputy head
She said that there was a social class mix and that people with a distinct 'posh' accent were teased.

iii. male camaraderie

In case 2, a group of year 11 girls walked through the music room during a lesson. The male teacher had a joke with a group of boys who were looking at the girls, which must have alluded to something that had happened in the past: 'Shall I get the phone numbers?' and then to the girls 'Did you get the Valentine?'

iv. words of songs

Nearly all songs heard during the period of observation in all case studies were meant to have a male singing them. In the Catholic school and the assemblies in case 1 there were hymns in praise of God using the generic 'He'. In case 2 the year 7 classes had to learn the school song off by heart and this again made a masculine presumption about the students singing it—'steadfast sons in loyalty'. 
v. Name-calling and Swearing
In case 1 students used unacceptable language between each other in the classroom which was very often sexist and heterosexist and sometimes racist. Although the conversations were not intended to be heard by the teacher, comments were often quite clearly audible. The offensive language used most often towards girls included words with some kind of reference to sexual morality like 'slag' or 'tart'. Words used towards boys contained inferences that the boy was gay or like a female, such as 'poof' and 'cunt' and comments about the sexual morality of the boy's mother.

In one particular class, this kind of name calling occurred, on average two to three times a lesson. It was mostly by boys to boys, sometimes by boys to girls and on only one occasion by a girl to a boy. There were no incidents of girls jibing at other girls.

Students seemed confused about what was acceptable language and what was not. If abusive language was challenged it was often excused (by students) because it had been a revenge taunt. There was often no distinction, for instance, between being pushed or called an idiot and someone being told that their mother was a prostitute.

vi. Androgynous Language
Teachers used the generic 'he' and only male terms of reference as shown in these examples taken from cases 1, 2 and 3.
1. 'Every year there is a different conductor and he always conducts 'Land of Hope and Glory'....'
2. 'The timpanist is marking time here, you can still hear his part.'
3. 'If anyone messes about I'll take his instrument away.'
4. 'Years ago in medieval times when the only music was Monks singing, only octaves, fifths and fourths were sung.'
5. On the board was written: Choose a composer
   Note a) How long he lived
   b) Which century
   c) Was he from a musical family
   d) Was he a Priest (church music)
e) Was he a genius (surprising family and friends)
f) Style
g) Which instrument(s) he composed for
h) His temperament (nervous, confident, humorous etc.)

There were other occasions when teachers in cases 2 and 3 appeared only to be talking to the boys. For instance by giving sporting analogies concerning football: 'Let's watch for the upbeat and really kick off on the first beat of the bar.'

On one occasion, when asked why they should do music in school, one teacher said that even if they were not likely to grow up to be a Mozart or a Beethoven they could be a music teacher and there were other jobs in the music industry. He said he would be pleased to talk about it just the same as if they were interested in being a P.E. teacher, they could go and see Mr D, Mr F, or Mr W (all male P.E. staff).

The two male heads of department in the mixed schools called the girls 'young ladies' or 'ladies' and the boys 'lads' or 'boys' and on fewer occasions 'gentlemen'.

On three occasions the teacher addressed the students as 'ladies and gentlemen'.

vii. Social Class Linguistic Misunderstanding
In the students' experience the word language commonly means bad language or swearing. Swearing was a commonplace part of their lives and they were aware of its powerful affect on some teachers. In a class in case 1, the teacher had explained that the language they were about to hear in a radio programme was quite hard to follow. A student in the class asked if there was going to be swearing in it. 'Of course not' the teacher replied. He had not realised that the students had taken his use of the word language to mean bad language.

viii. Conclusion
Case 1, was the only case where swearing and name calling was prevalent and it was only the boys who took part in it regularly. Many of the boys seemed to have a need to demean other people.
This could be because they felt subordinate themselves and as males, society would expect them to be competent and forceful, so they raised some self-esteem by negating others and thus putting themselves at least above girls and women, and any feminine boys.

The generic 'he' and male terms of reference were found in all cases. Language is often sexist and represents women in a particular way because women are seen as 'less than' or 'lacking' in patriarchal society. It is known that children enter language by an acknowledgement of difference and particularly an understanding of sexual difference between men and women. Part of this awareness is to acknowledge ones own difference as a girl or boy. Therefore to enter culture and language means acquiring gendered subjectivity. Having assimilated the fact of ones sex, language then provides us with a set of codes and signifiers which tell us that women are different ('other') and inferior to men. It is not surprising that men and some women use sexist language, its the language we all commonly use. Many teachers and students in the case studies had either accepted the male centredness of language or had not considered its implications.

o. Conclusion to section 5
There was a surprising lack of awareness of equal opportunities issues in the schools in general. Some staff were unaware of racism and sexism in their schools, although the research in case 1 that the equal opportunities working party had carried out showed that it was clearly there. Some staff in cases 1 an 2 regarded the idea of tackling gender stereotyping and making life fairer and more comfortable for girls and women, as a party political issue.

Staff and students received conflicting messages about equal opportunities and were confused. What happened in practice was not what was stated as policy. Some staff, including senior staff did not take equal opportunities seriously. Some staff were resistant to any kind of change. Many staff were so busy instituting the many other changes that were taking place in schools, that equal opportunities (being a contentious matter anyway) were overlooked. Where matters concerning equal
opportunities were taken seriously and put into practise was often when heads of department organised their departments accordingly. Equal Opportunities Co-ordinators were not teachers in high status positions. Other teachers, including senior staff could choose to ignore their recommendations, if there was no backing from school management.

Music teachers in mixed schools did not try to create any harmonious relationship between boys and girls in their classes; they were either struggling to keep discipline or there was a lack of time to organise other school related work. Students made sex stereotyped choices but this was not addressed. Teachers invariably did not have the time or take the time to deal with the incidents that came to their attention. When equal opportunities issues were dealt with in an assembly or tutor period it was often received by students as 'the teachers going on at us about something again'.

Staff in these schools were on one level, still working out inequalities amongst themselves so it was unlikely that they would be considered enough to address the issues facing the students. Some saw only racial inequality as an issue, some saw only gender and some thought there was no issue at all. Although some thought there was an issue but that it was not worth doing anything about it because it might be construed as political or because equality awareness in society is changing anyway so there is no need to make a fuss.

In case 1, the girls were not just failing to achieve in traditionally male dominated areas (except in Maths where the female head of department and female deputy had increased the girls success rate at G.C.S.E. by introducing non-sexist strategies), they were also failing to get through the school with positive, clear images of themselves as female people. Music education reinforced these attitudes in the school.

In case 2, policy decisions were made at management level and some staff could not see equal opportunities as an issue. Girls were achieving, but were given clear messages about their feminine role in the school as a whole and as musicians.
In case 3, girls understood their place as passive, obedient and feminine. They saw male leaders in a female community where equal opportunities was only talked about in the context of the Bible and not in the context of a liberation for women.

Teachers can only work within structures which are already in place and with the background and experience they already have. It would seem important to be flexible, sensitive and tolerant regarding issues of equal opportunities and not to react negatively, to become accusative, to feel unnecessarily threatened or to try to evade the issues as, many teachers in the case studies had done.

Equal opportunities is a cross-curricular dimension in the National Curriculum and each subject area is supposed to address issues of equality. However, the Runneymead Trust has criticised the National Curriculum because it includes no guidelines for instituting good equal opportunities practice. What appeared to be needed in these schools were institutional and personal strategies for school management and staff, a clear framework within which to work which would include an unambiguous policy and practical code.

6. Politics and ideology of music teaching

a. The Arts in School

Differences and divisions were noted as existing between members of staff who were male and female, black and white, on short-term or permanent contracts, established or new, those who 'fitted in' and those who did not 'fit in' and those who taught academic subjects with those who taught expressive or practical subjects. Arts teachers were rarely found in senior positions in any of the schools and this inevitably affected the perception that arts teachers had of their own careers chances. Arts teachers were more likely to appear unconventional, and perceived as teaching unacademic subjects. This meant that promotion chances were affected by the ideological viewpoints evolved by institutions and the curriculum subject which takes its status from its examinable knowledge. There was also a battle for material resources between subjects which was fought through both formal
and informal contexts including the structure of social relations in the schools.

Women music teachers in the borough and in the case study schools were concentrated in lower scale posts and under-represented in senior positions. Social and economic structures, class politics, and status groups were found to influence music education within and between institutions.

b. Music's Status on the Curriculum
Subjects in the secondary school curriculum fell into a hierarchy and the position which each subject occupied depended on the micropolitical situation in each school. In the case study schools, music education performed different functions in each school and was given a different status in each school depending on a number of interweaving factors. It was also construed, that to some extent there was a political ideology bound up in the nature of curriculum subjects.

In case study 1, it was felt by many teachers that Arts subjects were undervalued. This was reflected by a very high turn over of staff in the art, music and drama departments. The headteacher was a scientist and so were the three deputies, one senior teacher taught Business Studies and the other was an Historian. Some staff thought that senior management did not consider arts subjects as worthwhile subjects because they were not 'vocational'. It was held that senior staff judged arts subjects as being unlikely subjects for students to pursue as careers and therefore not to be given priority.

Simplistically explained (for this issue had many facets), arts subjects were associated with left-wing politics which in turn were associated with equal opportunities issues. The 'political' divide was also seen by some staff as cutting between senior and junior members of staff. For instance, every teacher in the Music, Drama, Art and English departments (except for the head of English) signed the letter about equal opportunities in the school.
In case 2, arts subjects were not so easily grouped together. This school was a centre for musical excellence (in Western European traditions). Music, brought reputation and positive regard to the school and therefore had some prestige in the school. Some teachers of other subjects resented this but senior staff were positive and enthusiastic about arts subjects especially music. For instance, during an interview with a Deputy Head, she alluded to the sounds coming from the choir as being 'like a chorus of heavenly angels'.

In case 3, music, as a curriculum subject supported the school's festival and ceremonial occasions which were mostly religious functions. Lessons were often cancelled to practise for these functions. During the study this happened on six occasions, for instance, to practise the hymns for St. Patrick's Day and to practise the Mass for the beatification of the Convent's founder.

Curriculum time-
The place of music in the school's curriculum can affect the amount of curriculum time it is awarded. In case 1, a particular charismatic head of music, of whom school folklore had it, sold some insurance to the headteacher, managed to get the class size reduced to groups of fifteen (half classes) and taught for an hour a week. When this teacher left the school to become an insurance salesman, a female acting head of music took the post and music started only to be taught for half the year and the class size went up from fifteen to twenty-two.

There was a confrontation almost every year between whoever was head of music and senior management as to whether there should be a G.C.S.E. music group as only small numbers had opted for music. It is a matter of negotiation and outcomes depend mainly on the relationship between the head of music and the headteacher and the head of music's social as well as professional positioning within the staff.

In cases 2 and 3, it was acknowledged by senior staff, that some subjects attract smaller numbers of students and music was taught at GCSE even in years where numbers were low.
Music as a selling point of the school-

Music's status was found to depend on its ability to be successful and high profile. This has been discussed above in section 2e on a school's musical reputation in the context of the borough. It is discussed here in connection with the internal pressures which are exerted on staff and students to present a particular kind of image. The discussion centres on case 1 where the image required by the school did not match the preoccupations, cultures or competencies of the students. In cases 2 and 3 students were willing and able to play orchestral instruments and sing parts in harmony from the repertoire of European Art music.

In case 1 there were three students who played orchestral instruments to at least grade one of the associated board of music examinations. These students and three members of staff formed an instrumental group. This group met if there was a particular occasion which needed an instrumental input, for instance presentation evening and Christmas concerts, although in the school handbook the group was described as an ongoing instrumental group. Those involved, all girls and women except the music teacher.

The management team were encouraging towards what they called the 'little palm court orchestra' but were disdainful towards the choir and the steel band. 'A wry smile appears on (the headteacher's) face if the subject of singers or steel band comes up' (music teacher).

There seemed to be a feeling amongst the management team that performances were not up to standard even though the music teacher was exercising considerable skill and personal charm in presenting programmes of music in the preferred style of the of the management and the students were clearly enjoying their participation. It seemed totally inappropriate to compare the choir with another school, acknowledged in the borough as a centre of musical excellence.
c. Choice of Music for Practical Work and Listening

The music the students were presented with in all cases was almost always European 'high art' music, composed by men. Students learned very little about oral and folk traditions or popular music. Students did not learn about music from other cultures which have informed and influenced European music.

In case 1, musical examples that were used during the observation included, for instance, 'Winter' from 'The Four Seasons' by Vivaldi, the slow movement from 'New World Symphony' by Dvorak and 'Rule Britannia'.

In this school many students did not recognise the music they were presented with as being relevant to them. It was seen as 'posh', 'old fashioned', and inevitably, 'boring'. These students found the music uninteresting and unintelligible and related only to popular music.

There were some students who enjoyed music from other cultures. The school had taken a large amount of ethnic minority students, which reflected the change in population in the borough. Apart from the steel band there was nothing in the music curriculum, in the extended or extra curricular activities, resources or displays which recognised that there were bazouki players, sitar players, eastern dancers and so on amongst the students.

A direct comparison was made by some staff between the music played by the steel band and orchestral music which implied a certain prejudice towards the steel band. There was some bad feeling in the school about the band; for instance, one parent/governor said informally at a tea and cakes occasion; 'The music teacher should work harder at building up the orchestra and not spend so much time promoting a load of dustbins'. Some of the office staff objected to the noise of the band practising and having their lessons. One member of staff said they were fed up with the 'tired old steel band (which) gets wheeled out every time something is on'.
There were some students who were receptive to the music the teacher had chosen. In case 1 this group were almost always girls.

In case 2, a range of styles from within the western art tradition were listened to by each of the year groups. Female and male students listened and answered questions positively. For example in one class students were working on arranging a musical theme by changing the key, rhythm etc. The teacher chose 'God Save the Queen' as the theme. On another occasion students were given a hand-out on 'composing variations'. The teacher chose a theme from Haydn's 'Surprise symphony' on which to work.

In case 3, a range of styles from within the western art tradition, with an emphasis on sacred music, were listened to by each of the year groups. In this school there was also an emphasis on vocal music which indicated that there was a different dimension to the teaching of music than that observed in cases 1 and 2.

In this example of a typical lesson, song books were given out, 'Captain Noah and his Floating Zoo'. The teacher talked about the music, that there are sacred and secular cantatas and asked questions. Students were asked to sing 'Oh What a Wonderful Scene'. The class were divided into two parts for first and second sopranos, according to the place in the room. The students followed the repeat signs and directives in the music proficiently, indicating that they had experience in following vocal scores.

In this all girls convent school the students were not introduced to the music of Hildegarde von Bingen and students could not name a composer or conductor who was a woman.

The above evidence shows that the pieces chosen in each case reflect a narrow choice for listening and playing music. It is a concern that students did not experience a whole range of musical styles and genres. The new National Curriculum which comes into full effect at key stage three in the academic year 1994/95, requires many styles to be represented. It seems that
teachers will need to acquaint themselves with varying styles of music if they are to meet these requirements and senior staff will need to alter their perspectives and change their expectations if music departments are to be supported in offering a multiplicity of styles.

d. Music as a Female Subject
In case 1, a head of year in the school who was not a member of the music department, thought girls liked music more than boys and that this was because it was the nature of the subject. 'Kids round here aren't usually all that interested in music, only pop music. It is usually the girls who are more open to what we present them with, the boys will usually dismiss things they can't come to terms with.'

Students can be affected as much by their relationship with a subject teacher as by the subject itself. It would seem that the subject matter and the teacher delivery style were difficult for many of the boys to deal with, without a disciplined atmosphere and these may have contributed to the disruptiveness. The girls tried their best for the teacher and if they could not understand the work, they resorted to activities like copying out the questions instead of writing answers and staring silently into space rather than, like some of the boys, causing disruption.

The classical music that was played, sung and listened to was seen by many boys as not only the music of the middle classes but also as feminine. They saw Music as being of more interest to their female contemporaries and to those boys (not considered 'macho') who were in the choir, taking part in school productions and learning musical instruments.

The subject matter of the music lessons was of more of a feminine interest and appealed to more girls than boys. Evidence for this came at the beginning of the third year when students were allowed to choose their own topic for a music project. Subjects chosen by boys were 'The Electric Guitar', 'The Drums', 'Rap', and 'Heavy Metal', whilst girls chose subjects like 'Dance and Music', 'The Nutcracker Suite' and 'The Flute'. The girls' choice
of topic directly reflected the kind of work they had been doing in music in previous years but the boys' choice revealed an interest in subjects which had not been explored in music lessons.

Although the content of the lessons was geared more to the interests of the girls, there was little scope for either sex to respond emotionally and imaginatively to musical activities because of some of the boys' attention seeking behaviour.

The Drama teacher, who also taught some music, thought that the Head of Music worked hard in the music department but that there was no, or very little, management support for Performing Arts in which students and staff could feel a sense of achievement and worthwhileness. He suggested that it may be because Music was seen as a 'female' subject and that physical education was so highly regarded in the school because of success in sports that the status of Music and of Drama had become secondary.

Many of the boys did not like Music because they did not see anything in it for them as boys. Many of the teachers in the school, who taught other subjects, geared not only their attentions but also materials towards the disruptive element amongst the boys. They freely admitted that they chose topics which would 'keep boys quiet', 'keep boys amused', 'have appeal even to the headbangers' and 'shut the drogos up'. The music teacher, however, chose to select his materials according to what he thought was appropriate, what was available and what included his own expertise. In choosing more effeminised material, he did the girls no favour. The girls were not given the teacher time or resources to explore 'their subject'.

Some of the girls were asked what they actually did in music.
girl one; To be honest its a bit boring. Its not just the boys, we never do anything interesting.
girl two; Yes, at my last school we used to play instruments a lot.
girl one; No, I mean I don't like the music he plays, its la-di-da
girl two: Yeah that's true and he won't let you bring your own tapes.
Researcher: What do you mean by la-di-da?
girl two: (The teacher) doesn't understand the music we like. We don't mind listening to some of his music. Like in my last school we did 'Joseph and his amazing technicolour dream coat' and that was good but (the teacher) just plays boring things all the time.

In case 2, there was a ratio of girls and boys of about 3:1 in the choirs and about 2:1 in the orchestras (table 5). The proportion of boys gradually increasing as they progressed through the school from 3rd orchestra to 1st orchestra.

table 5 Instrumental players by gender and instrument—case 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1st orchestra</th>
<th>2nd orchestra</th>
<th>3rd orchestra</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>females</td>
<td>males</td>
<td>females</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strings</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brass</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Woodwind</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percussion</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

table 6
Students given prizes for music at speech days in past four years—case 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>female</th>
<th>male</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Key stage 3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key stage 4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6th form</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the last two years, in the 6th form, one boy reached the 'Young Musician of the Year' national semi-finals, one boy became the 'Young Musician of (the borough)' and another was a co-winner for the award for outstanding achievement in (the Borough's) Schools' Music.

In case 2, sex-stereotyping in the playing of musical instruments
was clearly present. The school did not break with traditions in the ratio of girls and boys who played particular orchestral instruments. Table 5 (above) shows that fewer girls played brass and percussion instruments and that as students progressed through the orchestras the numbers of girls playing these instruments decreased even more. More girls than boys played woodwind and stringed instruments.

In Primary schools a huge number of girls played instruments and were academically more successful than boys at age 11, and case 2 selected equal numbers of girls and boys. Then, still with a larger proportion of musically oriented girls, there continued a process of gradually reducing the ratio of girls involved in music (as shown in tables 5 and 6, above). There seemed to be no reason why the orchestras should gradually include more boys as students progressed through the school. There was no apparent reason why the playing of particular instruments should become more sex stereotypical as the students became older. There was no evidence that girls lost interest in their instruments as they got older and from the observations in the classrooms, female instrumentalists were keen and able. When the time came for students to go to University and to Music Colleges, males and females were in equal numbers.

Music was considered feminine, but boys could express what might be seen as their feminine side for a number of reasons; the standard was high and students performed well, the style of music was acceptable because of the social class background of a large number of students, although girls were in the majority, leaders tended to be boys and the head of music provided an acceptable role model of a highly competent man leading a mostly female group, playing music written by men in a form constructed by men. If music making was an admissible activity for boys, then it followed that there were provisions, in place for girls to also take part.

In case 3, girls played woodwind and stringed instruments and were involved in more singing both in the class lessons and in extra-curricular activities. Music was a successful curriculum
subject when compared with other subjects and girls were encouraged in their music making. When girls progressed to the upper school at key stage four, there was a senior choir and an orchestra led by the male head of music.

Music was seen as a female subject in case 1 because many students and staff did not differentiate between femininity and femaleness. Any actions or feelings which may be associated with femininity, and this included Music, were immediately associated with the female and therefore in opposition to the perceived norm of male heterosexuality. Male heterosexuality being consistently celebrated and defended in this case. Girls who were interested in performing music found it difficult to have a space for what was labelled a female activity and the leaders of the school hierarchy did not affirm Music as a credible subject within the school and give it status. In case 2, boys celebrated what might be called a feminine side but under conditions of male authority. Girls could also find their space under these conditions, but often, quite literally, played 'second fiddle' to boys. In case 3, girls performed in styles and on instruments which traditionally had been designated for women and, as in case 2, music making was framed in a male hierarchy with male terms of reference.

e. Ethos of Music Departments
In the three music departments of the case study schools, students experienced differences in the management of the separate departments and differences in their approaches to music education.

In case 1, at the beginning of each lesson the students lined up outside the door whilst the teacher finished taking his register. They lined up in two lines, one of girls and one of boys. There was always much shouting and disruption in the boys' line and almost every week the teacher came outside the door and spoke to them about their noisiness and interruption of his tutor group before letting them in for their music lessons. The lessons started on average 8.5 minutes late. Lessons were formal directed
from the front by the teacher and the desks were arranged in rows.

The disruptive behaviour of boys directly affected the lesson content, the time the teacher spent on individual students, the amount of work that was got through in each lesson and the experience of all the students. What transpired as most unfair in observations of one particular class was that the behaviour of between 4 and 6 boys affected the experience of 9 girls and 3 boys.

In case 2, on a typical day when entering one end of the school there was an awareness of a busy music department. Strains of Mozart came from one practice room as a teacher instructed a small group of clarinetists. In a teaching room there was a year ten option group working on music theory and in another teaching room a year nine class were listening to music by Mozart. There was silence in the corridor and no-one was in sight.

The music department was seen by some teachers as elitist and an entity in itself. One teacher criticised the emphasis on classical music rather than other musics. She thought there was a lot of resentment amongst students who were not 'music department stars'; for instance, students who did well in other subjects were not given the same attention. 'The music department are like a superior race from everyone else. The students from the local area are not the main ones involved in the music department.' This teacher saw the main equality issue in the school as being that of class.

In case 3, the school was quiet and students moved around in an orderly fashion. When students came in for lessons they stood behind the desks set in rows. The teacher then said 'Good morning girls' and the class answered 'Good morning Miss O', 'and say good morning to Miss C' added the teacher, 'good morning Miss C' they chanted dutifully. The atmosphere was relaxed although there was a sense of formality. Students raised their hands to answer questions about note lengths and generally they knew the answers. They then had to clap back some rhythms and answer more
questions, 'Yes please Miss', Yes Miss', 'Yes Miss O'. All students appeared to be concentrating on the task in hand. When the bell went, there were no problems about packing away, putting chairs behind the desks and standing behind the desks to be dismissed in a well rehearsed and quiet way.

The different contexts of the three music departments meant that students experience of music education was bound to be different, depending on which school was attended. The different ways in which each context was gendered meant that girls had altogether dissimilar experiences.

f. After School Concerts
In case 1, the undervaluing of the choir of mainly girls by senior management did not help to raise their self-esteem or the standard of the performances. It takes confidence to stand in front of staff, parents, governors and peers, and these girls were only being supported in their efforts by a few people.

There was a Presentation Evening in which the choir sang three songs, the Instrumental Group performed two items and the Steel Band performed two items. Mostly female students participated in school concerts, prize giving and assemblies. It usually involved the choir and the steel band. Both groups were nearly all girls.

In case 2, the concerts were so popular that there was nowhere to park. The playgrounds were full and people had to walk from several streets away. When attending one particular concert, many prominent local and national people were recognised. The concert consisted of an assortment of orchestral and vocal pieces from the first, second and third orchestras, the concert band, chamber orchestra, junior singers, and the Borough's Schools Jazz Orchestra. The performances were of a high standard showing that the students had developed considerable skill on their instruments and had the opportunity of playing with others like them in the school.

In case 3, the yearly school show was 'The Sound of Music'.
The full house for the last night of a 4 night run seemed like mainly students and their relatives. There was an excited hum and chatter in the hall and a Nun got up and asked us not to thump the floor or whistle when we got enthusiastic about the show.

There were two men on either side of the hall with video cameras and several of the sisters were mingled amongst the audience as the show began and students filed onto the stage dressed as Nuns and singing the Agnus Dei. The audience were absorbed in the performance, the staff had obviously worked hard on costumes, set, sound effects, music and drama. The audience started clapping too early a couple of times but there was no stamping etc. as requested.

Differences between the three schools were striking and obvious. It was clear that the idea of comprehensive education is in name only. Students at the three schools came from particular communities in the borough who differed in their music making.

g. Conclusion

The music of the western art tradition that was played was the same as that played in the processions and proceedings of the higher institutions of the country ('the music of the great masters'). This was the music that was condoned by the school management in all three case studies. Students were not given the opportunity to present music from ethnic or popular culture.

In case 1 in particular, the 'macho' nature of some of the students which had such a strong affect on the school's subculture meant that other students were reticent about performing music that made them a target of negative criticism. One boy was observed saying to another 'If you're going to be mouthy you better have the bottle to deal with me'. This meant that anyone who voiced an opinion and spoke out in a public way was liable to face up to bullying which might be physical or a matter of a verbal pressurising or a 'facing each other out'. For performance artists the awareness of this kind of peer pressure is often strong enough for it to be pointless taking the risk of performance. Boys risked the questioning of their masculinity and
girls risked public teasing which could lead to confrontation or exclusion from the group for breaching an accepted norm.

The lack of support from management for music as a department, in case 1, meant little time given for rehearsals, no space given in which to rehearse, complaints about the sound when rehearsals did take place, no interest, praise or involvement in musical activities by senior staff. There seemed to be a situation where those who wanted tradition and stability had a conflict of interests with those who wanted creativity and change.

In all three cases, the power of headteachers and senior staff to dominate and control meant that those who wanted change struggled against the status quo in their schools. Each school appeared to suffer from didactic management and many teachers struggled in ideological opposition to their management. Much of the struggle for music staff involved positioning themselves amongst the staff in a way that would please management and bring favour to the music department. The dynamics of a school's organisation can be understood as an interpretation of the professional and the personal. For those wishing to conserve their principals and ideals and to take the moral high ground the situation became difficult. Negotiating for time, resources, support and so on depended more upon what appeared to be social relations than professional considerations.

A complex web encased each school in which power games were played out at the expense of those subject teachers who held a lower status on the subject hierarchy. The innocent sounding memo, the allusion, the casual comment, knowing the right people, the overheard conversation, understandings and denials, etc. were daily concerns in teachers' already stressed lives. In case 1, where Music had a low status on the curriculum, the institutional subordination of Music inevitably reflected on musicians in the school, most of whom were girls. In cases 2 and 3, girls had their space as musicians but were constrained by the conceptions of femininity which the schools held as appropriate for them.
Another possibility for schools might have been a more consensual model, where power was shared and teachers were encouraged and supported in their strengths. Ideological constraints placed on teachers do not appear to enhance students' education. Cultural and ideological matters, if not dealt with intelligently, creatively, efficiently and with care, inevitably have ramifications for students. It appears that Music and other performance arts, although marginalised subjects, can find themselves in the centre of political debates in schools.

7. Female resistance
Why did the girls and women in the study, in many ways, appear to allow their own subordination and oppression? Early experiences of female students and staff, may have conditioned some of the acceptance of female oppression which is internalised within our unconscious minds. Teachers were often struggling to gain equality within their own sphere but could not take on the sometimes different nature of the oppression directed at students. External, material power relations that force submission came into play to sustain patriarchal control. Teachers found that the institutionalised nature of these forces worked against their maintaining plausibility for themselves as professionals, if they struggled too hard in the name of equality for their students. Resistance to patriarchal control became difficult and dispersed because it exists both in the subconscious and external world and because, as explained in section 4b, patriarchy is experienced differently by different people. However, students did employ resistance strategies which took forms such as developing support networks, silence and struggle.

a. Internal oppression and group resistance
The students often brought with them a very narrowly defined image of how boys and girls should be. Girls were quieter, less assertive when asking questions or asking for help and did not insist on being heard or making a point. Girls behaved well even when teachers were out of the room. Girls contributed information about half as many times as boys. Girls requested help much less often than boys. Girls less often played solos or took the role of teacher for a specific activity.
Many of the girls simply accepted without public question the dominance, loudness and attention-seeking of the boys. Some considered that this was the way it was and that it was not worth challenging the situation and that it was not worth complaining about. In case 1, many girls were resigned to the way the boys behaved.

girl one; 'The boys in our group are always being naughty, that's just what they're like. They're like it in every lesson except when we have Miss L. then they don't dare.'

girl two; 'I don't like most of the boys in our group, only Stephen and Vimash are alright. I try to ignore them and I feel really sorry for (the music teacher). He is too nice.'

girl three; 'There isn't anything we can do about it (the boys' behaviour). It is what they are like. We just ignore them and get on with our work.'

The girls took the view that this was how things were and they coped with it as best they could. However, although they appeared complacent about what was happening, they had in fact, put up with this for most of their lives. 'Michael went to my junior school Miss, he had to sit in the corner most of the time. It (his behaviour) didn't bother us so much then.'

In case 2, when listening to music it was noticeable that all the girls and the boys tended to adopt particular positions:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Girls</th>
<th>Boys</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>head in hands-</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sitting forward</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with head in hands-</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sitting forward-</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>head on desk-</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The different body language of the girls and boys noted in case 2, suggested group unity by gender and this unity was also found to be true in case 1. Girls had formed opinions between themselves in which they counted the boys as immature, not worth bothering about and often with some contempt.
In case 1,
girl one; 'The boys are just stupid'
girl two; 'I don't take any notice of it (name calling). Let them be stupid.'
girl one; 'They are always cussing each other's Mums, they are really stupid. Sometimes it ends in a fight. They just like winding each other up.'
girl three; 'Jason keeps calling me a silly tart and pulling my hair. I try and stay away from him.'
girl one; 'Jason used to say those things at junior school and he was sent to (the headteacher). He still said them at playtime though.'
girl four; 'I think they are disgusting. I can't wait to leave school and get away from them. Some of them are alright you know.'

In case 2, The consensus of opinion about the boys was that some of them were immature and they talked in detail about different boys who were 'allright sometimes', 'can never be serious', 'has to show off all the time' and 'would be alright if he could be more sensible'.

Girls withstood 'the way boys were' by ignoring them, staying apart from them both emotionally and physically, regarding them as infantile, and mentally and emotionally inferior. They acknowledged that not all the boys were dominating. The girls opposed and defied any physical attempts boys made to control them.

In cases 1 and 2 girls and boys worked in separate groups. Mixed groups were rare and there was resistance from girls and boys if teachers tried to make them work in mixed groups. Group unity is needed for a successful artistic process. It is for the above reasons that mixed group music making can be made impossible or difficult. A particular set of circumstances has to be in place for group music making to be possible where everyone concerned feels comfortable with their position and status in the group.
b. External oppression and female awareness

Girls were aware of the external factors which unjustly positioned them in subjugated roles. Girls complained about the boys' dominating behaviour. Girls in case 1 were aware of a class difference and did not see female teachers as role models, whereas in cases 2 and 3 girls were aware of the feminine roles which were on offer to them. Girls protested when they were reprimanded for behaviour which was allowed for the boys and strived to overcome domination by boys.

i. Teaching staff and male domination

Women staff were not always able to translate their own oppressed state into what was happening to the girls in the school. Girls had to deal with domination by boys and members of staff, themselves, although they sometimes thought that staff should be dealing more effectively with boys' bad behaviour. In case 1, girl one said 'Really, they (the boys) should be made to behave themselves' and girl two said 'Its the teachers who are sexist, they wont let us do anything and they let the boys always spoil it.'

Some women staff were fiercely aware of the subjugation and sometimes humiliation which they themselves felt from some male members of staff. Some male staff (and boys) were also censured because of their perceived effeminacy but this did not mean that those men and boys associated themselves with the struggle that females were experiencing against femaleness. In fact it was often those particular men and boys, whose feminine qualities had been berated by other men, who took part in music making and superseded the girls and women.

ii. Role models

Even though the role models of the music teaching staff showed students that women used technical equipment, could be in more senior positions than men, had expertise in certain areas and so on, girls in case 1 did not identify with the women teachers.

In case 2, the woman presently in the department was a good role model especially for the younger students with whom she dealt the
most. The structure of the music department, however, had always entailed a male head of department and higher up the school, girls experienced few positive role models.

In case 3, girls experienced positive role models from both female teachers of music, one of whom composed some of the music they sung. In the upper school there was a male head of music. In exam syllabuses and in the media, only women composers and conductors are represented and this same hierarchy was being reflected in cases 2 and 3.

iii. Girls conduct was subdued by teachers
Girls noticed that they were treated differently from the boys and were not allowed to do thing which were allowed by boys. In case 1, girl one said 'I'm always getting told off for the slightest thing but the boys get away with it.' In case 2, two of the girls thought that there was more emphasis on girls' dress code than there was for boys and another girl said that this was solely due to the senior mistress (in charge of girls), who was 'so strict'. One girl said that some teachers treated the girls 'as if everything has got to be so correct'.

Any slight transgression of discipline by a girl was dealt with sharply whereas the teacher was more tentative in dealing with the difficult behaviour of a boy who, if challenged may have taken up class time by causing a confrontation with the teacher. Those girls who did join the mostly male domain of being loud and difficult with the teachers were soon kept in line by the teachers.

iv. male dominance is 'taken for granted'
There was not much 'space' for the girls to be visible. Looking particularly at behaviour patterns of girls and of boys led to a renewed realisation of just how oppressive some of the boys' behaviour was towards everyone else and the domination of nearly all of the boys towards nearly all of the girls.

In case 2, One girl spoke about a notice that had gone round inviting anyone who was interested to go to a football practice
and when she and her friend (both of whom had played at primary school) went to the practice, they were told that no girls were allowed. In the school generally, they thought that they were not treated fairly as girls, that the boys were given the best and most interesting things to do.

It was by the use of language, that domination was able to take place. Girls and boys understood themselves as occupying particular roles through an understanding of sexual difference which was constructed linguistically. The language used in case study 1 was particularly negative towards girls and women. However, most girls were aware of the gendered situation they were in and struggled against it. Few girls denied the existence of sexual oppression as some women teachers did. To be aware of a situation allows the possibility to look for solutions whereas denial blocks off potential routes of protest and confrontation.

c. resistance
The girls coped with male dominance in a variety of ways. A majority of girls kept quiet, opted out, accepted the situation and coped with it. They decided in their own minds that playing the synthesizer or drums was not so desirable an activity that it was worth a fight or a confrontation. Most of the girls resorted to silence or quiet conversations with each other. They kept their pride and their dignity. They would not be intimidated when challenged and were capable of keeping a sullen, insolent silence or giving a 'mouthful'.

Some girls behaved in what was more typically a 'masculine' way. They grabbed what they wanted, called out in class, thumped the boys and said 'it's not fair' if boys tried to dominate the instruments. These girls were a constant cause of dismay to many of the teachers. They were often called names by the boys and by members of staff (in the staffroom to other members of staff). These names were to do with being female (slags, bitches, cows) or references to their bodies (fat, ugly). These girls defended themselves with equal vehemence.
Those girls interested in the music offered by the school put themselves forward to organise musical activities. For instance, Kelly in year eight was keen to put on a musical review and to organise a group of girls who wanted to sing and dance and a group of boys from different year groups (two year seven boys who belonged to a drama club outside school, a group of boys from years eleven and twelve who were good at dancing and singing and did not mind being involved with something they considered appropriate for them and two young male members of staff), a smaller group of males than females but enough to make the show work, as it needed male parts. Kelly's organisational skills were exceptional. Another girl, Melanie, was a quiet yet strong year nine student who wanted to put on a concert version of the musical 'Grease'. She organised a group of girls and some teachers into joining in and rehearsing.

Both girls had to resist jibes and insults from others before, during and after the performances, but they mostly ignored the attacks with the disdain they deserved or dealt with them in a very forceful, self-confident way.

The girls who had 'opted out' of the struggle with the boys often joined in these 'safe' activities, organised by girls and approved of and protected by teachers.

The girls said that they were either
a) quiet, because to join the struggle for being heard, getting a good instrument or finding a creative space means being abused verbally and/or physically and especially for some Asian girls) being part of a situation they did not understand or have the experience or inclination to deal with.
b) struggling to be creative, get their space, battle with the dominant boys and cope with being told off by the teachers.

Girls were supported by their immediate friends, music teachers and some other teachers. Many girls were also supported by their parents in their musical ventures. These three support systems (friends, subject teacher and parents) would appear to be the most important factors in success in music education once the
self has been motivated. Girls were doing remarkably well under the circumstances. They resisted institutionalised inequalities in ways they found were effective and found support networks wherever possible.

8. Conclusion
The three cases—
In case 1, in examining the ethos of the school, the family background of the students, the background and convictions of teachers and the wider context of the community in which the school was situated, it was found that many of these factors were in open opposition to each other. A most important finding was that students' background and aspirations were often greatly different to the perceptions of the teachers; for instance the music teacher and other teachers in the school felt that boys and girls displayed differing behaviour because that is how they are, inherently different.

In case 1, dimensions of attitudes towards race, class and sex had come together in this school to make music a subject in which it was difficult to succeed. The school appeared to be trying to portray an ethos of a middle class grammar school: school uniform, comparing the singing to a local grammar school that specialised in music, the drive to improve standards of exam results with no particular attention paid to bilingual learners. However, it was found that:

i. The school did not support girls in music from senior management level by, for instance, encouraging the choir or promoting the steel band.

ii. There was no initiation or dissemination of equal opportunities practices.

iii. Expressive arts were not valued highly in the school.

These factors had negative effects on music in the school:

i. Able students saw involvement in musical activities as not being a way to be regarded as successful in the school.

ii. Some girls had low self esteem and did not want to 'risk' themselves in the performance aspect of music.
iii. Girls were expected to fulfil traditional roles in every area of school life by wearing skirts, being ladylike, weak, quiet and uncomplaining. This ideology of sexism inevitably carried over to music where traditionally girls sing/boys play, girls play certain instruments and (a more recent 'tradition') boys monopolise technological equipment.

Some of the observations of disruptive behaviour are shocking and it needs to be acknowledged that students of this age are often unaware of the potency of their language. Also, there is a particular cultural identity which permits almost any extreme of language to be used when a person is angry and this is clearly unacceptable to school values. This is not to say that any language is acceptable because it is part of a student's culture, but that there is a difference in experience, acceptability and perception of meanings between many of the students and the teaching staff. In one way it could be said that some of the students' language is more honest, as we know exactly what those students' think about their situation and other people. It is therefore easier to challenge their views and statements but the teachers do no always have the time or support to do this.

Case 2 was a school that provided musicians for orchestras, choirs, as teachers etc. in the wider society. The way the school managed this had the following effects:

i. Music was valued highly in the school

ii. The school fostered, often unspoken, assumptions about social class which meant that middle class girls tended to be the most successful.

iii. The school was only interested in targeting certain areas in the initiation and dissemination of equal opportunities' practices.

This meant that:

i. Girls had the opportunity to be successful in music in this school and to enjoy their music making, especially in extra curricular activities, in the lower school (years 7&8) where they were in large numbers.
ii. Girls could only be amongst the most successful music students if they were both outstanding as musicians and single minded in their ambitions.

iii. Girls were expected to conform to particular models of femininity in the school as a whole, for instance by being quiet, not wearing trousers, being well behaved.

The students in the school had already been selected for their ability and their musical talent. Most of the students were white and middle class and music was a subject which was favoured by girls. This meant that large numbers of girls were able to take part in and enjoy the musical activities provided by the school. At key stage 3 the girls were more numerous and more successful than the boys in the classroom and in the extra curricular activities. This was in spite of a syllabus which reflected the male dominance of European music and included little singing, the imbalance in prestige and status of male musicians considering the larger numbers of female musicians, and the extra help the boys received in the classroom.

In case 3, the most potent factor influencing the girls' music education was that of Catholicism. High art music of European culture had its roots in the church and includes a great deal of sacred as well as secular music. The school's musical activities therefore fitted into the morality, traditions and conventions of the wider society and to a large extent within the national curriculum which requires a daily act of Christian worship and assumes a music education founded on the European tradition (cf. chapter 3). The interruption of music lessons for religious music making was not questioned by staff or students. However (since this study) national curriculum requirements have meant that students need to spend more time studying the elements and structures of music.

Girls were supported and encouraged to learn particular musical instruments. There was no availability, no role models and no suggestion that they might play brass and percussion instruments. Class lessons only covered music from the European high art tradition. Students did not learn about the women in the history
of music or even the music of the convents. The resources in the music department reflected a gender stereotypical range of instruments.

What the school offered meant that:

i. Girls were supported in music making in the school by management, staff parents and other students.
ii. Girls were supported in a limited range of musical activities and on a limited range of instruments.
iii. There were few initiations and disseminations of equal opportunities practices in the school and none in music.

The effects of these factors on the students meant that:

i. Girls felt positive about themselves and their involvement in music in the school.
ii. Girls were expected to behave in a 'ladylike' way and accept their 'place' as Christian women within the traditions of the church. It followed that girls only took part in the music making which had been historically allocated as acceptable for them.

General criticisms made about schools and their dealings with equality issues are not intended to accuse people personally or constitute a condemnation of the establishment. The purpose of the criticisms is to open up issues for debate, and evidence is needed to show that these issues are due for attention.

In all case study schools—

Many teachers thought the girls should be feminine (in their own interpretation of the word) or 'ladylike' and therefore different and more inclined to certain activities. In the mixed schools the girls were treated differently, lined up separately, seated separately, competition was made between girls and boys ('girls to sing first then the boys to hear which group sings the best'), girls given the smaller instruments in many cases, girls to sing and boys to play the instruments and in the girls' school there were no loud percussion instruments or electrical instruments (apart from classroom keyboards) for the girls to play.
European high art music formed the content of the lessons in all three cases. None of the schools possessed instruments from other cultures apart from the steel pans in case 1 (except of course Latin percussion instruments). Only one poster in case 3 showed music from other cultures being played.

Only music composed by men was played in all three schools except some music composed by one of the music teachers in case 3. Girls tended to play sex-stereotyped instruments in all 3 schools and the tendency for this was greater as girls became older. The words of songs tended to be from a male point of view and reflect a male view of the world in all 3 schools. It is possible that the words of the songs were accepted as being male orientated in the same way as the generic 'he' and 'man' are accepted as 'a fact of the language which has no gendered meanings'. This male orientation in language has been challenged and the impact of language at a subconscious level has been considered. Masculine terms of reference in songs (or in any sphere) were never challenged in an overt way at any case study school.

Some key differences between schools-
Girls in case 1 were not encouraged by the school to achieve in music or even to enjoy and appreciate music whereas in cases 2 and 3 music was taken seriously as an academic subject and music was a part of school life, used in celebrations and occasions for the enjoyment of performers and audiences. Girls in case 1 could only succeed in music and enjoy their music if they were highly motivated and were 'strong' enough (i.e. willing to struggle or ignore) to overcome the 'put downs' and harassment which not only came from some other students but also from senior management.

In the 'middle class' models of cases 2 and 3 the ideology of equal opportunities ran counter to that of the hidden curriculum, where the ideology of femininity was still synonymous with wife and mother. The highly gendered activities in music encouraged girls to become accomplished on certain instruments. In the working class' model (case 1) patriarchal relations of dominance took place in a more overt way in the forms of boys taking over the more interesting instruments and girls wanting to sing.
By focusing on girls in cases 1 and 2 and the experience in the girls only school, it was possible to explore the differences between girls in the three cases and see their different cultures and attitudes. In the mixed schools (cases 1 and 2) the male experience constantly set the female experience in relief.

In case 3, the girls encountered an all female community controlled by a male authority. The Judeo-Christian and Islamic traditions have all cast women in inferior roles to those of men, 'the model of the dominant father figure ruling over supposedly childlike women is as operative within the Bible and the church as throughout the rest of society' (Verhoeven 1989). Catholic, female liberation theologians see no problem in the practice of both Christian faith and social justice. A collective statement from a conference held in Buenos Aires in 1985 included five themes, which are important for women in the Catholic faith; community, the body, suffering and joy, conflict and silence, the ludic and the political. These themes concern the connection of spirituality to social justice.

Future change-
It is concluded that it was possible for girls to achieve in music although many did not achieve their full potential and many barriers were in the way of success. However, requirements of the new National Curriculum will change the syllabus, incorporating music from other cultures and other idioms. With the implementation of the National Curriculum and the continuation of initiatives that promote equality issues, the situation for girls and their music making looks set to change in schools. The way these changes are made will undoubtably bring about a shift in current circumstances regarding music education and gender.
Chapter 7 Action Research Projects

School A
A mixed comprehensive school in the east of the borough. The school had recently moved into new buildings with the most modern and comfortable facilities. The music department had a full range of equipment, a suite of practice rooms and a music studio. The school was run effectively with a clear code of discipline.

School B
A mixed comprehensive in the centre of the borough. The school had recently reorganised because there was a new headteacher. From being a fairly unpopular school it was rapidly becoming more popular. There was only one music room and no practice rooms but there was a lively interest in music (and all the expressive arts) in the school in which students and many staff took an active part.

Action Research Project - school A

a. Introduction
The issue of specific focus in school one was language and in particular, the words of songs. This school had an equality statement which had been well thought out by all staff (not just teaching staff), students and governors. Students had a strong sense of equality and were aware for instance that sexist and racist language was not acceptable. The teacher with whom I worked was interested in the project and she acknowledged the importance of issues of race class and gender, commenting, for example, that she would never automatically refer to a conductor as 'he'. As well as my role as Project Co-ordinator, I also taught in the school on a part time basis.

b. Examination of Resources
We started by examining the resources and the teacher pointed out that she had several sets of Caribbean song books one of which, 'Mango Spice' she used routinely. She was worried about criticizing these books in case it was construed as being racist. At this point I explained that the wider implications of the research were that issues of equality have to be recognised in a number of ways. Women are not a homogenous group, although
there are many common issues, so it is important that our focus on gender recognises the plurality of women's experience. As women, 'Do we recognise ourselves as leaders, managers, mothers, daughters, as Black, differently abled, lesbian, oppressed or powerful?....If we do not see our strength and variety in the mirror of dominant representation...How can we change it?'

(Isherwood 1993)

We set to work analyzing the song books which were used frequently and were surprised by our findings. The gendering and male bias within songs was worse than we had thought once we had given the words our full attention. We also looked at visual, as well as textual material. What follows is an analysis of the song book that was most commonly used.

c. Analysis of the song book 'Mango Spice' (see Appendix I)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 7</th>
<th>Songs written to be sung by male/ female/ unstated</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>food songs</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>religious songs</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>songs about animals</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>songs about life</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>love songs</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dancing and singing</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anancy</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>totals</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 8</th>
<th>References to the male and female in all songs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>food songs</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>religious songs</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>songs about animals</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>songs about life</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>love songs</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dancing and singing</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anancy</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>totals</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
More than one third of the songs were meant to be sung by males whereas only one song was probably meant to be sung by female singers (table 7).

There were twice as many references to males as to females (table 8). Of the twenty-six references to females; nine of them were the romantic or sexual projections of male desire, the wife and three sweethearts in 'Dip an fall back', Bedward's daughter in 'Sly Mongoose', the three women who featured in the love songs and Dora in 'Anancy and Dora'. Only the 'sweet man' in 'Coconut woman' could be construed as an example of female desire in the songs. Heterosexuality was the premise of all the love songs.

Women featured in four songs from the section on food ('Tantie Mary', 'Coconut Woman', 'Dumplins' and 'Cerasee') more than in any other section but none were specifically meant to be sung by a woman except possibly 'Dumplins'. The pictures in this section showed a woman selling, a girl buying, a girl carrying and a boy eating. The religious songs and the songs about animals were all narratives and not written to be sung by either gender however all animals and all references to God were male. There were two songs in the section about life which were not meant to be sung by a man nor did they have males as their focal characters, these were 'Hill an gully' and 'Bring me half a hoe-Angelina'. In the love song section only 'The Twelve Days of Christmas' was a completely neutral song. The others were all about a particular woman and sung in the first person, yet there were still more male characters in these songs than female characters. The section on dancing and singing had many pictures of girls and boys dancing together. There were three neutral songs, 'Sing an jump up for joy' (the song in praise of Antigua), 'Manuel Road', and 'Banyan Tree', although the reference to 'ladies' may be objected to by some. Finally, the Anancy stories were all male gender biased, again because animals, tricksters, magicians and so on were always assumed to be male.

All the song books revealed the same results after analysis: virtually no songs were meant to be sung by a female, there were a few which were neutral and did not imply that they should be
sung by a male or female whilst most songs were intended to be sung by a male. Furthermore, ghosts were 'he', animals were 'he', God was 'he', she cooked, he ate, he loved, she was so pretty and so on.

d. Action Steps—following analysis of resources
We removed some of the pictures of male composers from the walls, put up some pictures of female composers and a female composers chart (see Appendices J and K). We chose two or three songs which had no gender bias from each book to use in the classroom. Neither of us had particularly liked the songs and although some of them we felt were 'alright', we became awkward about not singing some well known favourites. We decided to share the principles of this part of the research with some groups of students but not with others in order to monitor any differing responses to the changes. The groups that did not know thought that we were being awkward and stubborn about singing 'boring' songs in favour of popular songs. They could not work out the reason for themselves even though they knew about the gender research project. The group that knew of our specific aims could not be bothered with our explanations. Although many of them were girls who were very aware of their gendered position and the theory behind it, for this kind of awareness gender stereotyping was deemed unimportant.

e. Our Reflections—on the change of songs
We had to ask ourselves why do students with a raised awareness of gender issues turn a 'deaf ear' to the offensive words of songs. The equal opportunities policy in the school ensured that students were aware of equality issues, so it would seem reasonable to assume that vocalising words which are blatantly sexist would be an issue. It was not too difficult to conclude that the school's equality policy was not enough compared to something compelling in the music that we had all come to enjoy and accept. Singing the familiar tunes together had been an experience which connected us and united us in one voice. We considered the precedents which had been set. (cf. chap. 2 section 4a)
1. The historical precedents of words used in music have been traditionally what is now considered sexist, racist and even jingoistic.

2. These words, when spoken, are received as unacceptable but often, when sung are overlooked.

3. The messages in the songs may in some cases be subliminal and are received unchallenged because of familiar usage and because attention is being focused on the music.

4. It may be that we allow the words to be overlooked because we consider them unimportant. In which case we might ask how offensive the words would have to be, before we considered censoring them.

5. Everything we are exposed to becomes part of our make up. These familiar words which present a white, heterosexual male view of the world are received from birth and may become ingrained in our thinking, taken-for-granted and unquestioned.

f. Action Steps- on 'female' songs

After this contemplation, the next step in the project was to search for new and exciting songs sung from a female viewpoint. We presented the material with our usual air of assurance and goodwill. Many of the students, especially boys, pointed out politely that when singing love songs they should change the 'he' to a 'she' or whatever was needed to make the song appropriate for the boys to sing. We explained, politely, that the situation was usually the other way round but that it had not been mentioned then that the girls should sing different words. The students accepted this and the boys who mostly did not enjoy the singing so much anyway shrugged irritably or suffered silently.

g. Our Reflections- on 'redressing the imbalance'

We were still not comfortable with our outcomes. Redressing an imbalance did little to make people feel good, nor did it create a way forward to equality and change. More reflection and discussion amongst ourselves and we recalled the words of Cormier ..'In my own personal experience women tend to sing about men or women or both, while men tend to sing about men, women in relation to men or unusually beautiful or bad women. When I did a unit on American work songs with elementary school children ...
girls and boys sang happily of railroading, sailing and riding the ranges but most boys were unable to sing of women's work without making a joke of it.' (Cormier 1980)

We also ruminated over the words of Sophie Drinker ...
'...even if women participated equally in every current musical activity, our cultural pattern would still be against their creating music ...(which represents).. half the spiritual life of humanity....For women to attain the state of collective spiritual independence...their inner lives must be given the spiritual sustenance so long withheld and given it more intensively on account of their long starvation, '(Drinker 1948)

h. Action Steps- to 'break a cultural pattern'
With 'breaking a cultural pattern' in mind what we needed was alternative ways of doing things, ways of working and organising differently so students could find their own, special voice and participate with confidence yet recognize their vulnerability and their effort. We used improvisation and themes around the students' areas of interest. We used 'call and response' and story telling in rhyme and rhythm. Students frequently moved in dance or gesture as they sang. We used music from many cultures. Students brought their own ideas and gradually became more confident in generating their own songs. (Some of the details of these ways of working can be found in the Music Gender and Education Conference pilot pack (WiMEd 1993).)

i. Our Reflections- on student centred ways of working
It had been a resounding success. Students were creative and found this way of working enjoyable. We all put ourselves into the process. It had been an emotional experience with much laughter and some students with learning difficulties (of which there were many) found that they had the timing, the way with words, the quick-wittedness, the knowledge of the student-centred theme or whatever else it took to sing in a spontaneous group situation. Teaching points came out of the work around pitch, duration, pace, timbre, texture, dynamics, structure etc. which fed into future GCSE work and covered areas in the National Curriculum.
i. Wider considerations
We were delighted with the small area which we had changed and
continued to work in this way as well as singing some of the new
songs we had found, a selection of the old songs and many of the
old tunes with the words changed. However, wider considerations
were still a conscious reality.

The Student Teacher
A student teacher in the music department knew that the gender
and music project was taking place. He also knew that the
particular focus of the action research was language. In spite
of this knowledge I was surprised to observe him in the following
lesson which he had very generously allowed me to observe.

The student teacher asked four students, two girls and two boys,
to sit at the front of the class. Each student was to represent
one beat in a four beats in the bar pulse.

\[\begin{array}{cccc}
4 & \text{Gavin} & \text{Ahmet} & \text{Caroline} & \text{Natalie} \\
4 & \text{John} & \text{John} & \text{John} & \text{John} \\
\end{array}\]

He then gave each student the name John and we had to clap the
rhythm saying the name John on each beat.

\[\begin{array}{cccc}
4 & \text{John} & \text{Robert} & \text{Robert} & \text{John} \\
\end{array}\]

In order to demonstrate the difference between crotchets and
quavers the teacher then changed the two middle names (really
Ahmet and Caroline) to Robert.

\[\begin{array}{cccc}
4 & \text{John} & \text{Robert} & \text{Robert} & \text{John} \\
\end{array}\]

We clapped the rhythms, saying the names again. Later in order
to demonstrate semi-quavers he changed one of the names to
Alexander.

\[\begin{array}{cccc}
4 & \text{John} & \text{Robert} & \text{Alexander} & \text{John} \\
\end{array}\]

The teacher had asked different students to take part and
involved the whole class in the clapping, calling out names and
discussion about its purpose. It had been a good lesson; the
teacher was well prepared, engaged the students in appropriate
work, came across as enthusiastic and had kept discipline. If I
had been his teaching practice supervisor I would have commended
him highly and then mentioned that he should change some of the names used in the rhythm game to female names. If I had been the head of department I would have mentioned it. In fact whatever role I may have been playing (and I was a colleague as well as a researcher) I would have tried to make this small, easy to remedy point and I feel sure that this young man, who was friendly and approachable, would not take offence and would act on a well considered suggestion. However, in the politics of criticism and within the hierarchy of who is allowed to say what to whom, it was not mentioned to him by anyone. The student then went on to build on this lesson in other lessons, still using the all male names and culminating in a piece of written work which was displayed on the wall.

During the project a class had been observed for a day with a view to experiencing the wider ethos of the school to account for the students' whole experience of the curriculum. These were some of the points which arose regarding equality and language:

Assembly year 8

The head of year eight is a long serving member of staff and considered a 'character'. He is a man nearing retirement who states that 'a return to stricter discipline is what is needed in schools'. He wears a grey, striped, three piece suit, has his white hair cut in a short back and sides with fairly long sideboards and speaks with a distinct North London accent in an authoritarian and clipped tone. To me, to other students and teachers I spoke to and according to the folklore of the school, his manner and appearance represented a kind of Sergeant-Major figure, a male defined and no nonsense attitude, with clear objectives about discipline but a tendency to see things as either right or wrong.

When I entered the assembly hall, the students were filing silently into the assembly where they had to stand for the full fifteen minutes. The head of year eight was stalking about the hall, between the rows, glaring at people that were not looking straight ahead or were not in the correct uniform (no-one would dare speak). He occasionally picked out a boy to reprimand in a low voice but which could be clearly heard by everyone.
He then went and stood on a podium at the front but said nothing as he stared menacingly whilst the students finished forming orderly lines in front of him. They stood in their form groups with reasonably expressionless faces. He then nodded at the woman playing the piano and the students sang 'He who would Valiant be' almost inaudibly. If I had not known the words to this hymn, I could never have understood what was being sung. The staff did not have hymn books and were not singing but some were cajoling the students into singing by pushing their hymn books nearer to their faces, pointing at them and going up to them and telling them to sing. I was later told that they were instructed to do this by the head of year.

After the song the head of year told them that they had come in well but that their singing was not very good (this was very clearly an understatement). He then handed the podium over to another head of year who was to be their guest speaker for that day.

The other head of year started by saying that he thought youngsters were always trying to be like grown-ups. He gave examples; smoking to look grown up, swaggering, wearing adult clothing and going to pubs. Then he made the point that "if these growing up years" were missed out and people went straight into adulthood, they would miss an important part of what contributed to them as people. He used himself as an example and told us about the experiences of his youth that shaped him as an adult today. These were, playing in the football team for his school and scoring his one and only goal against Finchley grammar, understanding the idea of sportsmanship, his involvement in the Chemistry club and going into a pub with his mates when he was only slightly underage and getting the one who looked the oldest to get the drinks. He summarised by saying that students should make the most of their time at school, involving themselves in school activities that were available to them.

The head of year eight then spoke to them again, warning them that if they were found out of bounds that they would receive an immediate punishment. He told them that he was not bluffing and
that he never bluffed. He said this twice. They were then dismissed to go to their lessons.

- Name Calling
As I followed one class I heard a great deal of name calling, e.g. a boy saying 'shut up slut' to another student on the way into a lesson. There was quite a bit of 'mother cussing' in which usually male students call into question the sexual morality of the mothers of other male students. Gay taunts were fairly common among the boys.

- Classroom Incident
Then, in the last week of term a boy brought in a tape for us to play which was a song about the rape of a woman. Shocking as this may seem we did not allow this incident to spoil the class atmosphere and the boy was kept behind to be 'dealt with'.
It was made clear to the boy that his behaviour in bringing in this tape and then betraying our trust by playing it when he knew it was offensive, was unacceptable. He was given a detention and told that his form teacher would be informed. The form teacher then told the head of year eight. The head of year eight then, apparently, called the boy into his office and asked to hear the tape which he then confiscated. Later in the staff room the head of year came up to me smiling broadly and waving the tape. He called the boy a name and said that he had phoned the boy's mother who had been embarrassed about the incident. He then jokingly asked if what was on the tape was what was meant by our project on 'gender and music'.

k. Our Reflections- on institutional sexism and male domination
We asked ourselves: What was it about this boy's situation that had informed his psyche and allowed him/made him want to present us with this offensive music? Why did the assembly reflect such a male view of the world? Why did many of the boys go round so aggressively name calling so much of the time? Why did the male head of year respond so triumphantly when dealing with the 'tape' incident? And I asked myself why my colleague emotionally withdrew at this point.
1. Conclusion to Project A

We had made a comfortable space for ourselves and our students in the airy and welcoming area of the music department at certain times with certain teachers.

My colleague felt that what she was actually doing differently was involving herself with the students more directly. She now made sure she noticed all their interactions and had interactions herself with each student by calling to each one in the call and response sessions thereby having eye contact and sharing a fraction of time. Each student was cared for and nurtured through language and sound. This had made a difference to the attitude and demeanour of the students and the teachers. She wondered if the same intensity of close work and reflection could be continued once the project was finished. She thought there would be at least some lasting positive affects. She declined to talk much about the tape incident or the wider equality issues in the school.

The way we had worked with the classes, overall, had pleasing outcomes. There were some revelations that happened completely by accident. For instance, in the new and carpeted building there was a shortage of chairs and so we had taken to sitting on the floor. Through this we had come to using our bodies during the singing and chanting in many different ways which in some cases became dance. It has since realised that what we had naturally come to, was a group activity that has been going on in human societies for centuries. It is believed that this kind of music making engenders a more feminine aesthetic or a way of working more associated with the feminine. This would seem to be equally beneficial to male students who appeared to enjoy and take part in the sessions more than they did before the start of the project. Girls benefitted greatly because the boys were more sharing, more in communion, and less offensive than usual.

What was going on outside of the classroom seemed almost entirely out of our control. 'classroom practices cannot be understood without some appreciation of the power of the structures which
maintain social inequalities both inside and outside the school' (Weiner 1989). There were many ways we could each contribute to issues of equality within the institution and in the wider society and we were doing so to some extent. However, the energy we gave to changing what was going on for ourselves was far more rewarding. We did not have to justify ourselves, required no struggle with a higher authority and became a smooth, flowing, self perpetuating experience.

Our difficulties occurred in the margins between our 'comfortable space' and the outside. Students sometimes came into the lessons unacceptably and would sometimes revert to name calling and fighting old battles after they had left. Male students could not accept words of songs which were from a position of female desire. For instance boys could not sing; 'my aunty told her, I kissed a soldier' but girls routinely sang words like '...one night I used it to me girl and now me girl's me wife (and a lovely thing she is too)' and 'I'm not half the man I used to be...why she had to go I don't know, she wouldn't say'.

Also in project 1, female students and staff were 'objectified' by the act of a boy who brought in the tape about the rape of a woman. By the boy's action he showed disrespect and contempt which was allowed by the wider society; by the fact of the tape's existence and availability to young people, the head of year's and so ultimately, the school's minimal punishment and the head of year's patronising and triumphant attitude towards the women teachers. In court cases where accusations are brought by women against men, it is often found that the woman has 'brought it on herself', and in this case it was as though a woman teacher had 'invited trouble'. In a circular quandary we (the women teachers) felt powerless ('objectified') and did not make an indignant stand on the matter either inside or outside of the classroom for fear of drawing negative attention to ourselves. The tape incident which was so serious, had to be dealt with outside of the classroom and made us very uncomfortable. It was unfortunate that the particular head of year that was involved had a particular set of values that were not in keeping with the aims of our project or the stated aims of the school.
These issues are difficult to deal with and there is a whole set of unspoken mores which weave in and out of issues of equality, which often take on a political guise and which on many occasions feel impossible to deal with. I could empathise with my colleague over her feeling of insecurity about the tape incident. She had her career at that school and she liked to play sport and socialise with some members of staff who may have viewed our project with scepticism.

With the benefit of hindsight and taking a considered, reflective view, I consider that our project had only scratched the surface of the equality issue within the school. Equal opportunities is a 'cross curricular dimension' in the National Curriculum and as such should permeate into all aspects of the school at a deep level. On reflection, our need to 'create space for feminine, nurturing, welcoming security' were based on perceptions of the antagonism coming from the institution as a whole. There was no confrontation of institutional values because we had both felt disempowered. This was manifested in:

1. The lack of discussion over the girls' reticence and the boys' irritation for our reasons in changing the songs.
2. The student lesson, in which no-one told the student teacher he should change some of the names to girls' names.
3. The 'tape' incident, which was dealt with outside of the lesson and not given sufficient institutional backing.
4. The assembly, in which no-one discussed gender implications with the head of year.
5. The silent withdrawal of my colleague, which was not mentioned but (I felt) was mutually understood.

The more positive outcomes concerning what went on inside the classroom are encouraging in that they promote 'girl friendly' ways of working. Our work was done under the umbrella of equal opportunities and so we were involved in combatting sexism and designing work and practice which was girl centred. However there seems to be a 'difference between the 'liberal' approach to equal opportunities of the policy makers and that of feminist teachers advocating girl-friendly schooling' (Weiner 1989).
Action Research Project- school B

a. Introduction
The second project aimed to consider relationships between musical creativity and artistic and social conventions and to establish to what extent, if any, these are gendered.

I was again working as a part time teacher in the department and coming in on other days to assist the head of department (the only other teacher in the department) with his part of the research project.

My colleague had told me that he was going to try and persuade the students to work in mixed sex groups although they would normally work in single sex groups if told to form groups by themselves. During our observations we decided to try and address the following situations:-

Interaction- who takes control in various circumstances? Who has ideas? What notice is taken by the rest of the group? Who takes the teacher/conductor role?

Behaviour- Who commands more time from others in the group/teacher? What kinds of behaviour are displayed by students? Do different kinds of behaviour affect the groups’ processes and outcomes?

Language- How is language used for instance, to communicate, control, interrupt?

Resources- Who uses the instruments and equipment?

b. Action Steps- mixing boys and girls together
The teacher wrote of the effects of getting a girl and a boy to share a keyboard:

Ella and Richard- 'I put the two together because they were both full of ideas and I thought they might stretch each other and from a distance this seemed to be so. However when I sat closer to listen I found Richard was dominating the keyboard and the
decisions being taken. He physically pushed her hands off the keyboard which he sat in front of, when she insisted it wasn't fair he said "OK You can have one go", she asked if she could try something in particular and he gave her permission to. Because this continued I intervened and suggested sharing tasks. The second time they shared a keyboard together the work went wrong. Richard returned to his seat while Ella continued to try to get it right. They enjoyed working together and have asked to since.'

Kim (well thought of) and Rick (with behavioral problems)- 'Kim managed to sit in front of the keyboard but Rick was constantly standing up, leaning over and taking up space. He also changed what he didn't like without consulting Kim. Again Rick was satisfied with the uncompleted piece and Kim stayed back and completed it.'

James and Nasreen- 'He was in front of the keyboard and ignored her. She stood up to take her share of the space but again he physically pushed her hand away. I intervened and suggested sharing tasks and to discuss, before hitting the keys, what they were aiming for.'

Darren and Felicia- 'Darren was extremely physical and kept pushing Felicia's hands off the keyboard. Even though she had the right idea he wouldn't listen and I had to intervene a number of times. The next time they went to the keyboard they were fighting for who should have the nearest chair. When I sent them away to fetch something Felicia reached the chair first but Darren pushed her to move and she did.'

'The last two mixed sex pairs were very successful and needed no intervention. With each pair the girl was a more dominant personality and the boy a quiet person. It also turned out that the girls were bigger and older by eight months and ten months. In each case the girl sat in front of the keyboard, there was no argument over this and they did not dominate the space. They shared out the tasks and discussed their aims before getting started. They also asked each other before changing anything.'
c. The Teacher's Reflections

All the pairs produced something in the end but the process is important in group work and this is what was noted:

1. The boys dominated the keyboard and space;
   a) by their position
   b) by physically pushing girls away
   c) by making final decisions.
   (Out of all the groups only one girl was actually dominant over a boy)
2. The girls were slower and more thorough over the completion of a task.
3. What is seen from a distance is not necessarily what is really going on.
4. Intervention makes a difference. The pairs co-operated much more the second and subsequent times they worked together.

My colleague noted:
'Through the observations of others I began thinking about my own classroom practice - the time I spent with boys compared to girls and my use of the girls as a control e.g. when lining up for an assembly, in group work and on the keyboards. I was putting the lively impatient boys of the class with bright sensible girls because they would put up with them, hopefully learn something from them and it was probably his best chance of success, but what about the girl's success? I saw single sex groups as opting out of a problem. We are a mixed society obviously and need to work together in life.'

d. Action Steps - single sex groups

We decided to observe a class working in single sex groups. We found that on the whole the girls were far more likely to be successful. They were communicative, made little or no fuss, were less likely to exclude a partner and were less physical, always discussing and asking each other before playing the instrument. We would not have predicted that they would be so co-operative. On the whole the boys worked on a hit and miss basis by plunging into the keyboard straight away and working by trial and error, some being successful but less so than the girls. Two friends hardly said anything to each other while they were sharing a
keyboard. They appeared to be successful until on closer inspection the teacher saw they were not actually getting anywhere. He suggested that they told each other what they were thinking before starting to play. A couple of pairs who had asked to be together ended up by fighting and in another pair one boy got bored and walked off. One pair of boys were successful.

e. Our Reflections— are we a mixed society?
We had come to a point where my colleague seemed quite depressed about his findings. We decided that for a few weeks we should suspend the classroom observations whilst I observed students outside of the classroom and we both interviewed students to ascertain whether we are 'a mixed society' and whether we do 'work together in life' as he had postulated.

f. A three week study
Through my three week observation of key stage three students in and around the school and from our discussions with students we made the following observations.

1. Girls and boys play separately in the playground
2. Girls and boys walk to and from school separately.
3. When given the choice girls and boys sit separately in classrooms and assembly and line up separately.
4. Girls and boys form separate friendship groups outside of school. They only go to the houses of those in the same sex group.
5. The two groups tend to have different interests, hobbies and pastimes.

g. Primary School Links
We knew that much of this behaviour was socially constructed. In the link primary schools, for instance, we knew the students had been trained to operate in single sex groups. We were also aware that many parents saw the behaviour and roles of their sons and daughters in very different ways. Discussions with colleagues involved in primary school based action research projects informed us that boys and girls entered primary school with
particular behaviour patterns. A report from one of our link schools showed the behaviour of some four year olds; 

'...the boys in the morning nursery were aggressive and dominating. They were physically very rough, running wildly around with little consideration for others. They appeared to be possessive of the bikes and some intimidated other children into giving them up. There were negotiations going on to ensure that bikes changed hands only between the 'favoured few'. I had felt that the girls were equally as bad with the prams and swings but my observations revealed that this happened in a quieter, less intimidating way.'

'A class sat on the carpet and the teacher supervised 'show and tell'. The carpet was square and on two sides skirted the wall, and a hot water pipe ran round it which served the classroom's radiators. The entire length of this pipe was covered with boys, enjoying its comfort. They didn't have to fight for this warmth: the territory had already been ceded to them by the girls with barely a fight; the boys were probably not even aware of their selfishness.'

Borough Primary Gender Action Project 1990

Coupling the students into a girl-boy unit which reflects the traditional heterosexual couple had caused many girls undue discomfort and sometimes harassment. We were still looking for a situation where girls and boys would work co-operatively as my colleague particularly was convinced of the 'need to work together'.

h. Action Steps—mixed sex, whole groups

We decided to group the classes in mixed sex whole groups but allowing particular friends to stay together within these groups. We did this with two very different classes in year eight. Although the school was committed to mixed ability teaching, one class was of considerably higher ability than the other. This was because an extra class had to be made to meet requirements of numbers of children wanting to go to the school. The extra class was smaller than the other classes but there were many students
with special needs and a higher proportion of students who spoke English as a second language. They were to work with percussion instruments and one keyboard per group on a creative project.

i. Class W
In the first lesson with class W (a group of twentyeight who were of higher ability) the teacher said to them that he wanted to try an experiment by putting them in mixed sex groups. They all complied with little comment as they seemed eager to start the lesson. As they were working with instruments in groups of four to six it was decided to send one group out of the room to work in the space outside.

When 8W came in on another occasion they immediately argued about which group was going to have the best keyboard. This did not happen in the other group and my colleague thought that they were unaware that there were any differences in the keyboards but I thought they didn't care. 8W had sat in different groups to last lesson although they were still mixed sex groups. My colleague told them that he didn't mind.

He placed one keyboard on the centre of each table. There was much arguing as to which pair round the table would use the keyboard rather than the percussion instruments.
Eventually, after five minutes, groups one, two and three had two boys sharing the keyboard and groups four and five had two girls sharing. One girl asked to change groups because she did not get on with a boy. The teacher explained the task; to set words to a rhythm first in four time and then in three time. A lot of fuss ensued, talking loudly and insistently about the task. The teacher explained the task again. In group three, where the girl had asked to be moved, all the boys monopolised the keyboard. One of the girls complained to the teacher about a boy saying "He keeps calling me a tart". In group two the lone girl, who was a capable keyboard player gradually took over. She said "I can do it, they don't get the right notes"

In the final performance, group two were very good, the girl played and they all sang. In group one the boys played and they
all sang, in groups four and five the girls played and they all sang and the performances were good. In group three a boy played and only boys sang, the girls were said to be sulking by the teacher and the performance was poor. The teacher was angry about the way people had worked together. I could only see that group three had been a problem although some others had been a bit excitable. He then told them that next week there would be inspectors visiting the class and that there were to be no dramas. A boy from group three started to justify their behaviour by laying blame on one of the girls but the teacher shouted at him before he could finish and the boy was silenced.

i. Reflections on Class W

My colleague wrote:

'...quiet boys became dominant when mixed with girls and dominant girls became passive when mixed with boys. It also became increasingly obvious that girls were constantly fighting for space. This was done unobtrusively. Their work was spoilt or interfered with by the presence of boys. Boys tended to be reluctant to let the girls work with them and the girls tended to give up and work by themselves so the groups split into two.'

In another lesson with 8W only percussion instruments were given out to each student in each group. On this occasion the groups worked amicably together. Girls took more initiative in leading the practical work and appeared more interested. My colleague made the same observation but also pointed out a particular boy whom he considered outstanding and better than all the rest put together. I agreed that this boy's technical ability on his instrument was of a high standard and that this enhanced the group performance but I did not consider his ability to listen to others and play sensitively and spontaneously within the group was particularly remarkable. I consider this difference of opinion most illuminating on the issue of gender and musicianship.

Boys and girls rattled instruments annoyingly. Boys and girls took part in the making up of a rhythmic pattern.
The boys did most attention seeking: standing up and miming a march/band leader type of action, one boy blew his nose and showed the content of his handkerchief to the two girls next to him, one boy hit another on the head with the maracas and there was a lot of body movements with the instruments from the boys. My colleague wrote that 'some boys made carnival type movements and more flamboyant actions, they pummelled the instruments but it did not detract from the lesson'.

k. Class H
Class H were not so keen to work in mixed sex groups and several of them, notably two Turkish boys and two Asian boys, complained about having to work with girls. When we spoke to the students about it on a separate occasion, it transpired that the rules regarding male and female interaction apply to all cultures but they are also chronological. There are stages when some boys feel they may become feminised (or that others may think they had become so) if they mix too closely with girls and this was true of all the boys who were interviewed regardless of family and cultural background.

My colleague interviewed some of the boys from class H:
Teacher Why didn't you want to work with girls?
Students Boy 1 (laughing with others) They smell
Boy 2 They get on your nerves Sir, know what I mean?
Teacher No, I don't know what you mean. I have no problem with girls.
Students Yeah but you're... (a great deal of laughter)... you like them don't you Sir?
Teacher. Are you trying to say that you think I'm gay?

There are stages where some boys feel that they should be interacting with girls in order to practise the exertion of their power.

A different group from class H at a different time:
Teacher You're a sensible person Neil and you don't mind working with girls.
Neil (in a knowing voice) No sir I don't mind working on girls anytime.
These stages appear to be at different times between cultures and at different times or not at all amongst groups within cultures, perhaps, we thought depending on personality, socialisation and other variables. What was clear was that it was the boys who decided which stance was to be taken and the girls (and sometimes other boys) who dealt with the posturing.

I interviewed some of the girls and mostly they said that the boys were too immature to work with:
Lee It doesn't matter what subject it is, you can't work with them, their stupid.
Josie Terry's alright and so is David sometimes.
Lee That's because you fancy him

The next time 8H came in they did not sit in the groups they had been arranged in during the previous week. We decided not to insist on mixed groups but to see how things went. A group of all girls were sent outside to work by the teacher. I later told him that I had sent all girls groups out to work by themselves in my own classes. What were the ramifications of this? We concluded that we trusted the girls more but the boys often thought this was unfair.

In another lesson with 8H they sat in single sex groups. Two groups of boys had problems completing their tasks because no-one in the group was able to read well enough.

1. Reflections on Class H
My colleague said that the class did not work well in a mixed sex grouping because they are lower ability and that more of the boys are macho in lower ability groups. Many of the boys did not work well in a single sex grouping either without a great deal of attention from a teacher.

I was concerned about what the girls were like. They were so quiet and unassuming that they were rarely mentioned. I thought of a poem I had read about working class women and which I wanted my colleague to consider with me:
About to Speak

In my silence
I can be proud
And self-respecting
Keeping my thoughts and feelings to myself
Keeping my bitterness and anger to myself
Keeping my culture and beliefs from your analytical claws
Keeping your language and questioning from my ears
Keeping my strength and wisdom to myself

Annette Kennerley 1989 p.349

m. Reflections on each other

My colleague thought that I was a bit idealistic. We each wrote
what we thought of each other’s approaches. Me to him—
Witty, cynical, energetic, capable. Respected by students
even though what they consider a feminine approach sometimes
receives taunts. Hard-working and respected by staff.
Likeable, strict yet with a flexible style of teaching.
More interested in doing things than reflecting on them.
Preference for active rather than administrative tasks.
Aware and sensitive to equality issues and with a 'no
nonsense' attitude.

Him to me—
I have been well supported by you in the department. I know
you are keen to do this project and I am sorry I can’t be
more helpful but there are so many things to do in the
department and there is never enough time. You have got on
with your classes and I have appreciated your quiet and
calm manner and so have the students. You are highly
principled and thoughtful about what you do.

n. More Reflection

We were gaining a deeper insight into what seemed to be an
insurmountable problem but where had we got to? The girls had to
struggle for space when working with the boys. There was a
particular problem with some groups when using electronic
equipment. Some of the boys wanted to monopolise the equipment,
especially the keyboards. When everyone had a keyboard, some of
the boys thought they should have the best ones. What made these boys believe they had the right to monopolise space and equipment? Why did there seem to be so little resistance to their demands?

o. Action Steps - back where we started from
We had not been able to address some of our original questions because of the situations we ourselves had created by insisting on mixed groups. We decided to let them sit with whoever they felt they could work with best. We would monitor them closely and set very clear ground rules about what behaviour and language was permissible towards each other. We did this with three year eight classes and three year nine classes.

Most classes organised themselves in mainly single sex groups with sometimes a mixed group as well. There was a pattern which emerged to one extent or another in all the classes. Disaffected students got together in single sex groups. There were all female groups, all male groups and mixed groups.

p. Conclusion to project B
i. deeper insights into the gendering of musical creativity
The boys in the disaffected groups did very little work and rarely produced anything worthwhile if at all. The girls in these groups always attempted the work but sabotaged their own work by continually changing what they were doing so no process was able to become established, or arguing about what they were doing (its relevance, whether it would show them up or something not related to the work).

The all female groups who worked well were the best behaved groups. They tended to work co-operatively, sometimes without a particular leader and sometimes with a girl who had some musical skills taking the lead but always with at least one other girl supporting her or feeding in her own ideas a bit more than the rest of the group. The word that both my colleague and myself had independently used about these groups was 'spontaneity'. The successful all girl groups were more pleasant, they did not swear at each other or dismiss each other so much. They worked openly
and very much in the group rather than as individuals contributing to a pieced together whole. As my colleague put it, 'the individual was the group, they lost themselves in it'. Girls who were interviewed from these groups overwhelmingly made statements about how much they had enjoyed the experiences and several said that they much preferred working in these groups rather than any other way of working.

The all male groups that worked well always had a member of the group who had some expertise in a musical instrument. Boys from these groups who were interviewed said:

Brian- Zac knows what he's doing so it's worth doing it
Terry- I only like the group work when I'm in James' group
Hakim- It's not worth going with those fish so you might as well do something good

The boys worked systematically and often without pleasantries although my colleague thought this latter point was irrelevant. There was an exceptional group of three boys in one class who worked differently from anyone else. They were co-operative with each other but they had their own agenda. During some work on improvising chord progressions they wanted to take a section of a hymn tune and arrange it for keyboard and handbells. My colleague said they were 'off the wall'. They certainly did seem a little eccentric and were viewed by some other boys as (almost inevitably) 'gays'. I thought that they were being innovative and that they were aware of the lateral kind of thinking which takes one outside of the narrowly defined task. They were not experienced enough to do this with great success, yet because they were not a discipline problem, they were often allowed to pursue their own ideas.

The mixed groups were the most volatile. They were led by girls except in one case by a boy and a girl. The girl leaders were strong, high profile people who talked a lot and who 'managed' the difficult boys by 'giving back as good as they got'. Their qualifying characteristic in this scenario seemed to be management of people and organisational ability. They had to
manage people falling out with each other, people getting upset, people not completing their task or wanting to change their task. There was one group where the girl leader did not display these characteristics. Everyone in this group was a well motivated student and followed her leadership because she had expertise in the subject.

ii. General Conclusion

Some of the outcomes were obvious and there was no disagreement between myself, my colleague and the students: Boys took up more space, dominated the use of the equipment unless supervised closely, interrupted and spoke out of turn more and took more of the teacher's time.

The boys perceived girls as female and therefore not male and not the group with whom boys should associate (almost as if the girls' femaleness might be catching) or girls were perceived as female and therefore sexual, which meant that the girls' sexuality or lack of it had to be constantly alluded to. The male teacher was made 'less than' by the boys because the boys made sexual intimations as if the teacher was not aware of sex, they did not include him in their 'knowing looks' and male camaraderie which was almost always around the referencing of girls' sexuality.

The boys tried to prevent the girls from being in the 'subject' position i.e. the pivotal characters in organising the group, the centre of attention when they had particular musical ability, the ones playing, composing and leading. There was always a struggle and it appeared at many times that the boys were too busy defending 'their space' to be creative and join in the music making. Some boys would not concede that the girls were good at conducting and organising the music groups. These boys would rather destroy girls' creative work than acknowledge it.

Girls were successful, however, even though some of them were made to work in 'a male space'. What was most striking was the difference in the 'ways of working' between the successful single sex groups and the girl leaders of the mixed groups. In spite of
being told to select a group leader by the teacher, the all girls groups had sometimes opted to work co-operatively. The girl leaders of mixed groups had to draw on personal resources involving skills outside of musical skills. To organise a successful musically creative mixed group, girls had to be musically able and adept in dealing with unreasonable male behaviour and other girls' reactions to it.

My colleague considered that the situation had become possible because there were two teachers in the room, we had been insistent on a particular level of personal discipline (rather than the discipline that involves nobody annoying the teacher or the smooth outward show of the class) and they knew it was for some special purpose i.e. an isolated circumstance. His basic contention was that the boys were more undisciplined because of their approach to their own masculinity and that given enough control, the situation where they will not work equally with girls, can be solved. He was not saying that this was ideal or how things should be, but that given this was the situation then this is how we should deal with it.

I considered that the girls had dealt with the situation in a number of ways. During the performances, for instance some girls who had led the single sex groups, organised their groups boldly and it was easy to see which girls in the group had taken initiatives and had the expertise whereas some girls in the same situation who had led strongly in the single sex process became quiet and less involved for the performances. All the successful single sex boys groups organised themselves in the same way as they had undergone their process and with apparent ease in the situation. The girl leaders of the mixed sex groups were less at ease, and had an air of defiance about them directed at any possible critic. They were ready to make a sharp tongued reply to any taunts about the usual topics of intimidation; their sexuality, the quality of their work or their appearance but this was mostly unnecessary because of the strict rules and our vigilance in enforcing the quietest or most insidious interruptions. This was confirmed by the girls:
Venice- You and Sir are really good, can't we always work with Clint, gagged?
Nicola- I've never worked without the boys interfering before.
Maria- I enjoyed the lessons and I liked the way everyone had to behave and not be horrible to each other.
Reena- It was great in music when we worked in the groups and no-one was allowed to mess about or be nasty.

Music as a school subject is a popular subject for girls; it is considered a feminine subject and more girls are successful, at key stage 3 than are boys. It should therefore be no surprise that, given the opportunity more girls took the initiative in leading group work in composing, arranging and devising music. They did this when they had to risk themselves in a mixed sex group and in performing in front of the whole class at the end of most lessons. To me, it felt like it had been 'allowed' on this occasion by some of the boys who would usually put down any girl or girls who took a role of leader.

It was noteworthy that I had been most concerned with the girls and that my colleague had been most concerned with the boys, in various ways. My colleague had not found the boys' attention seeking behaviour as distracting as I had. He was more able (or willing, I don't know which) to go with it, ignore it or put a stop to it, than myself. My colleague seemed to view me in the context of himself whereas I was able (and willing) to view him separately. The fact of us having to 'police' the situation for the creativity to occur felt artificial to me. Boys exercising masculine power over girls should not be viewed as 'part of an understandable aspect of school discipline' like talking out of turn or not doing homework.

Conclusion to Action Research Projects A and B
In both projects sexual name calling was prevalent; much of it directed at girls by boys (about the girls' sexuality) or at boys by other boys (about the boys' effeminacy or about their mothers' sexuality). The attitude of some boys towards teachers in both projects meant that the male teacher in project B was accused of effeminacy and was seen as championing the girls' cause, and
female teachers were treated with less respect unless they disciplined the class successfully in an authoritarian way or managed to be caring and kind (mothering), without 'allowing' references to sexuality.

What has been concluded from both the projects' research findings, centres round 'the Male Gaze' of a culture which renders women as sexual objects and leads to an 'otherness' with which women are viewed, allowing young men and boys to treat young and older women (who may even be their carers) with contempt (cf. chapter 2 section 2e). This manifested itself in similar and sometimes identical ways in each research project. For example, in the language used in the music itself and music education, and in group musical creativity, girls were viewed only in terms of their sexuality and from the subject position of male heterosexual desire.

In both projects, girls were constantly compromised over their use of time and space. This meant that they were often not tolerated to have time to state their point of view or try out a piece of music because boys were for instance, 'pushing their hands off the keyboard' (project A), 'interrupting and being rude and aggressive' (project B). It was as though the girls were perpetual visitors, negotiating for space that did not belong to them.

In each project we changed existing curriculum knowledge. We wanted to move away from an understanding of knowledge and theory that reflected male controlled culture. Instead we presented what we considered was valid as knowledge in ways which acknowledged a female presence in culture and affirmed more feminine ways of working.

The task was difficult because knowledge within music education has been passed on according to historical precedent. However despite the difficulties it was possible to delineate some of the more female oriented ways of working. In project A: 1. Students, especially girls preferred using oral and improvisatory forms, like call and response and chanting.
2. Many students, especially girls, impulsively moved their bodies when singing and playing music.
3. Many students used a fluidity of language in the vocal improvisations, even students who had been silent when using other, more traditional forms.

In project B:
1. All girls' groups organised themselves without leaders.
2. Girls' groups were more spontaneous and less planned.
3. Girls' groups took a more holistic approach to creative work. They worked together, adding little parts between them as the music took shape whilst boys' groups broke up the task with each boy working on his own part.
4. Girls worked better without restrictions whereas more groups containing boys needed discipline, organisation and boundaries for themselves and for their work.

In the projects, a feminine perspective briefly took the place of the traditional masculine forms and girls had excelled. The forms of music and ways of working had been acceptable to many of the boys too. Their behaviour towards the girls was no worse than it was when using the traditional methods. The masculinist domination that prevents feminine forms from sharing space occurs at an institutional level. There was no or little institutional awareness of a feminine perspective in knowledge or aesthetics. Schools exist in a society where outside influences inevitably become reflected in the school. Exam syllabuses, local authorities, governing bodies, the DES, and other outside structures, exert powerful controls over curricular and schools' organisation.

We were dealing with a double oppression; a male defined music curriculum and an institutional structure which placed girls and women in particular roles and categories. It was the latter area which the schools defined as the issues round which equal opportunities should be focused. The two project schools were working on overcoming sexism in that women and girls should not be discriminated against because they were female. Girls had to exist in a male dominated atmosphere and this aspect of patriarchy was recognised and was the subject of review. For
instance it was stated that girls involved in the same pursuits as boys should have equal time, equal access and so on, as the boys.

In the everyday running of the music departments, girls had to concur with masculine ways of working using masculine materials and forms, neither being acknowledged as such. Feminine interactions took place on the edges, not in the mainstream of the schools (recognising also that Music is a marginalised subject). The projects themselves, particularly project A, were cocooned in the music room, as isolated 'experiments' which were not embraced by the schools and built into the institutions' curriculum knowledge.

In the project schools, it was only possible to change a small part of each particular music teacher's practice and the projects did not appear to make much difference to the ideology or activities of the schools as a whole. Some changes were made in the schools, however, because these projects and other equality initiatives that went on in the schools were documented and used as evidence that equality was being taken seriously as a dimension in the National Curriculum. Even though only small changes were made, it was seen as worthwhile in the struggle for equality. Girls and women, and arts subjects continue to be confined and constrained because structural changes need to made in the operation of equality issues in schools.
Chapter 8 Conclusion

1. Resolutions to Original Research Questions

This thesis asks why women are not represented as highly valued musicians in many fields of European Art Music and how this has been reflected in music education at key stage three. The explanation was sought by examining women's position in music history in chapter two, women’s position in the history of education in chapter three, the music education curriculum in chapter four and to directly observe the situation as it exists in schools in chapters six and seven.

In chapter two, it was revealed that women experienced a subjugation in the history of western art music which positioned them as undervalued and under-represented as musicians. Women had been limited by their upbringing, they had been discriminated against in patriarchal society and experienced a public sanction which determined a 'women's place' as being in the private sphere, making their position in institutions and media as composers, conductors and players virtually untenable (Rieger 1981). Much of men's manoeuvring of women musicians has been attributed to a male response to female sexuality (Pendle 1991) and women's 'role of merchandise in the world of male exchange' (Case 1988).

The case studies and the action research projects, indicated that the situation described for women musicians in chapter two, was still evident in music education. Male heterosexual desire and dominance was apparent in the schools. Women's and girls' desire were not symbolised and patriarchal culture continued to vie against female (and also those considered feminine or 'other') voices. In chapter seven, the action research projects revealed in practice how the male 'gaze' operated in the politics of sexual representation for women musicians and as teachers. Women teachers, by 'risking' and 'exposing' themselves as performers, leaders and deliverers of (male) knowledge became prey to the same gaze.

Chapter three showed that schools were historically male institutions and in many respects, still are. Women's music
education has taken place in a predominantly male defined space with male defined knowledge and significance. 'The definition of the school reflects the values and meanings of men's culture. The language and culture of the school are predominantly shaped by patriarchy' (Ball 1987 p.192).

In chapter 4, the music curriculum was conceptualised as a site of social and cultural reproduction and from this view, it could be seen that the inequalities described in chapters two and three had been maintained through music education and this was demonstrated in the empirical research. Specifically, this took place by a gendered structuring of musical knowledge in which already male constructions of music (chapter 2 and empirical research); were presented to students in institutions conditioned by patriarchy (chapter three and empirical research); using curricular which allocated students to gendered roles and sometimes used objective and summative assessment techniques more associated with traditional masculine knowledges and aesthetics (chapter 4 and empirical work).

In the past, the subjugation of girls and women, because of their femaleness, meant that men positioned women so that it was almost impossible to succeed in music for two main reasons. One was that women were trying to achieve in a male world and the other was that the music that was sanctioned was masculinist in form.

With regard to women trying to achieve in a male world, a lifting of some of the sanctions against women musicians in this century meant women could take part in the male world of music, by for instance going to composition classes, entering public life in places like Symphony orchestras where they were once excluded.

From the empirical research it was found that girls and women were still struggling to find their voice and their space in a male world. This was so in cases 1 and 2 which were mixed schools where 'the male experience constantly set the female experience in relief' and in the action research projects where 'girls had to exist in a male dominated atmosphere... and... had to concur with masculine ways of working' and in project B where 'boys took
up more space, dominated the use of equipment unless supervised closely, interrupted and spoke out of turn more and took more of the teacher's time. In the all girls school, case 3, 'girls encountered an all female community controlled by a male authority'.

Male dominance manifested itself by assuming particular roles for girls. In case 1 'girls were expected to fulfil traditional roles in every area of school life ...this ideology of sexism inevitably carried over to music where traditionally girls sing/boys play, girls play certain instruments.. and boys monopolise technological equipment'. In case 2, 'girls were expected to conform to particular models of femininity in the school as a whole.. (the music) syllabus.. reflected the male dominance of European music and included little singing'. In case 3, 'girls were supported in a limited range of musical activities on a limited range of instruments'.

Male domination assumed a particular role for female teachers. In action research project A, a 'boy's action .. showed disrespect and contempt (for female students and staff) which was allowed by the wider society .... women teachers felt powerless.. and did not make an indignant stand ... for fear of drawing negative attention to (themselves)'.

Patriarchal society was found to be 'classed' so working class girls were far less likely to achieve in music. in case 2, 'unspoken assumptions about social class.. meant that middle class girls tended to be the most successful'

In a male world it was found in case 1 that 'girls could only succeed in music and enjoy their music if they were highly motivated and were "strong" enough' and in case 2 that 'girls could only be amongst the most successful music students if they were both outstanding as musicians and single minded in their ambitions'.

In schools, music education was found to be still on masculine terms; the high proportions of female musicians in schools was
not proportional with male musicians, in terms of status. This is reflected in public life where women musicians are still not represented as successful and highly valued by comparison with men, especially as composers, conductors and leaders. This is so, in part, because girls and women may be unable or unwilling to take on the competitiveness and prejudices of male dominated systems. Although equal opportunities are now enshrined in law, this study shows that sexism is still prevalent.

With regard to the dominance of masculinist forms, the question of feminine aesthetics was part of the original set of theoretical research questions but it had not been prioritised as an issue when undertaking the empirical research. The issue became important as the research progressed and as the musical inclinations of the girls and women in this study began to provide an answer to the question about women's place and value in Music and how this is represented in schools.

It is advanced, in this thesis, that the dominant masculine approaches to knowledge in education and dominant masculine aesthetics in music, excludes girls and women who are more likely to excel when feminine knowledges and aesthetics are valued. This was significant in the research findings.

In the case studies it was noted that there was a group unity by gender in the mixed schools. The section on female resistance shows that girls formed opinions about masculinist behaviour and ideas between themselves which they counted as immature. It was found that particular circumstances needed to be in place for girls music making to be possible where everyone concerned felt comfortable with their position and status in the group.

Evidence for girls enhanced position within a feminine aesthetic was most apparent in the action research projects when teachers changed their practice; girls preferred oral and improvisatory forms, used their bodies integrating dance and music, were fluid and spontaneous in their music making. Girls frequently organised themselves without leaders and need for containment, took a more
holistic approach and worked together adding small parts to the whole.

In very brief summary, male domination of women musicians, which was found to have deep-seated and complex historical roots, still exists in society and in schools but to a lesser extent in contemporary society. However, masculinist knowledges and aesthetics, remain as 'the norm' and 'taken for granted' in culture and society and in schools. This research shows that girls were able to succeed despite the male controlled circumstances and the masculinist knowledge and aesthetics. But success, especially high status achievements, were more prevalent for boys than girls and more likely for middle class and white students. The research also showed that girls were more interested and able to involve themselves in music which was premised on more feminine knowledges and aesthetics.

It is therefore concluded that women are not represented in high status positions as musicians because patriarchal systems have prevented them from being significantly involved in European Art Music and because when women have chosen to take a feminine approach to music it has not been valued. Below is a list of points which arose out of the research and which describe what a more feminine approach to music entails.

2. What Would 'the Feminine Approach to Music' Asserted in this Research be Like?
From women's history, from the observations and discussions with female musicians and from the empirical research findings of this research, a group of concepts has been identified which form, at least in part, the dynamics of a feminine aesthetic. The concepts involved in this more feminine approach are; oral/aural approaches, improvisatory modes, multiple traditions, the significance of melody, concern about context, use of timbre, holistic approaches, flexibility and subjectivity. These concepts overlap each other and are not definitive but an attempt is made to articulate how they formed what was construed as a feminine aesthetic in the research.
AURAL/ORAL approaches: Women in the folk traditions passed on their music from mother to daughter. As discussed in chapter two section 3b, women's historical 'absence' from music making was manufactured, by writing women out of history, ignoring their music as being of less worth, refusing their music because of 'fear of women' and refusing the admittance of women into musical institutions. Despite these strictures women continued and still continue to make music in the home, in families, in groups, and at work. They are often motivated by their children, by a social inclination to celebrate life and work and to celebrate spirituality. The oral traditions include countless examples of women musicians from European/ North American culture and world cultures as described in chapter four sections 6d and 6i. The special circumstances surrounding women's lives made them create this music and it would be more productive for people if we valued it, continued with it and learned about ourselves from it.

A particular feature of making music in this way which runs counter to the dominant traditions, involves moving the emphasis away from notation, (but not excluding it). The absence of notation when making music puts less emphasis on the visual and more emphasis on listening with the inner ear which involves a more profound absorbing of another's work, rather than a critical reaction to it. There is quite a split in opinion amongst music educationalist about whether or not notation should be a key feature in the curriculum at key stage three. This was addressed in chapter 3, section 6i and is discussed below.

Not using notation inevitably leads to music which is ADAPTED, DEvised, INTERPRETED and IMPROVISED. Written music which is replicable always aims for the single definitive performance. As Attali (1977) points out (cf chapter 2 section 5), music has become repetition. In European Art music, an important criterion is to follow the score as written. For instance, students learning orchestral instruments or singing will learn the importance of understanding written music in the way that was intended by the composer of that music, with all the nuances and subtleties that implies. The object is to reproduce the music in the way the composer intended thus venerating the composer's
creative gift to the world, a gift which might otherwise be lost. Feminine forms are likely to embrace music which is not written but may be devised by the performers rather than led by the teacher/conductor. In the case of vocal music this is more a celebration of the importance of a personal, oral potential. Similarly, instrumental music which is conceived in this way, is born in the present and expresses the feelings and circumstances of those performing the music.

There are MULTIPLE TRADITIONS of music which have existed through time and place. The traditional 'History of Music' and musicological analysis focuses on 'European high art' music, and lacks multiple critiques. European folk music does not organise its music around the notion of 'Composers', but like other improvised traditions, passes on its music orally. The notion of 'great composers' is rejected by a feminine aesthetic because there is an emphasis on plurality, sharing of a performance experience and an acceptance of the ideas of others. Women have their own tradition of music making more concerned with the rhythms of everyday life, the oral tradition or (some would argue), a feminine aesthetic within the high art tradition.

A feminine aesthetic is more predisposed to accept multiple traditions and learn or borrow from them. Music or any art form should be approached from a universal point of view yet taking cognizance of the particular. 'There is only one music which splits into different styles just as there is one earth which splits into different countries and political systems' (Nicol 1986). Freire (1972) considers attitudes to other cultures when he considers the view of 'the invading culture' vs. 'cultural synthesis'. Rather than becoming culturally swamped (Thatcher 1979), in an evolving art world, styles and practices become fused and interwoven. What people might bring does not impose and is not imposed upon, it becomes part of the historical process (Freire 1972).

Within the 'European high art' tradition, influences outside of our nation states have gone largely unrecognised (e.g. the culture of colonised countries has historically been under-
represented). Similarly, music made by women, both because they were women and because the form of the music was not deemed as being of high value, has been under-represented. Musics from multiple traditions and women's music have been hidden in music history and/or viewed as 'other' or different from the 'mainstream'. There is currently a new musicology emerging which acknowledges women composers who have been ignored and renders some of them influential in our own time.

As discussed in chapter 4, the National Curriculum states that music in school should include music from other traditions other than the European Art tradition, although there is an emphasis on the dominant tradition, teachers will have to include music from other cultures and genres.

Music is made in a particular CONTEXT, and usually has a specific meaning or intention both at the original conception of the music and at each time it is rendered. By placing music into its social and cultural context, it may have relevance to performers and audience and fit their purposes. HOLISTIC approaches to music education, mean a concern with the whole person and would include a concern to contextualise students' learning in music which is appropriate and pertinent to their lives. It is always good educational practice to 'start where the students are'.

A feminine approach, overall, gives more significance to MELODY, moving the emphasis away from harmony which was a 'late and local development' of European Art Traditions; 'Harmony may be described as the clothing of melody - which was left unclothed in Europe until ...the end of the 15th c. and is still so left, over a great part of the rest of the world as also in the peasant tunes of Europe itself'

Concise Oxford Dictionary of Music 1974

There is sometimes an assumption that harmonic music is superior to melodic music. The work of Shepherd (1991) described in chapter 2 section 2a. shows how the logical ordering of knowledge in the Renaissance period meant that scholars sought control over their music by, for instance, organising the notes vertically
into analyzable harmonic coordinates. McClary (1991) pointed out (chapter 2 section 2h) that melody can sometimes be viewed as uncontrollable, wild and sexual especially in its use of chromaticism. In the European Art Tradition, melodic forms are used within a structured piece of music, so they may be contained and controlled.

An alternative or more feminine approach to music does not root itself in a particular musical genre. Before the 9th c. all music was melodic and music outside of European Art Music remains melodic. Melody can be simple or arranged in a complex way, for instance, by using a motif at a different pitch level or the use of a high note at a particular point of expression. Rhythm frequently operates with melody to make rhythm an important and subtle element of melody.

The students work in the action research projects used a single melodic line in their chanting and singing in project A and in the instrumental pieces in project B. Students found they could bring expression to their work by using a variety of musical concepts without the need to, for instance, use a harmonic accompaniment. Feelings expresses themselves strongly in melody, particular melodic phrases which often represented the sentiment being expressed in a song or instrumental piece.

TIMBRE: In chapter two, section 2a, it was shown how during the Renaissance, the sonic aspects of music were organised and contained (Shepherd 1991). By disregarding musical forms and notatio it is possible to engage in the sonic aspects of music that have been lost in European Art Music. This, again ties into the notion of Multiple Traditions which are not tied by the need to notate and lose a range of sonic possibilities. Improvised music which does not conform to western art music's harmonic and notated structure can convey its meaning through sound colour, intonation and expression.

FLEXIBILITY in making music may allow the content of the music to dictate form. Historically, women and 'others' have received messages from society that they are not of equal worth, (chapter
two section three) relying on one's own impulses and creating the music that is needed for the moment inspires confidence in oneself.

SUBJECTIVITY: The objective and measured elements concerned in testing can only reflect certain aspects of music education. The subjective elements of learning and judging, partly guided by personal values and belief are an essential part of music education. In chapter two section three, 'society's ideas about what and who constitutes a genius are discussed. It is shown that what is considered of value and worth by an individual or a group is a subjective measure based on limited criteria. A female aesthetic bases its evaluative criteria in a subjective judgement which has meaning for particular subjects at a particular time and place and is acknowledged and explained as such.

The above points have mainly come from women musician's experience but it is not to say that men cannot share in what has come to be understood as a female approach.

3. Proposed Strategies for use in Schools
a. Explore a universalistic music for all students
Music education is for everyone. 'A philosophy for describing and implementing a curriculum must be based upon what is available for all pupils' (ILEA music guidelines 1985). This moves away from old conceptions of music being a subject for the musically gifted only. In project A students maintained fluidity and each person's needs were addressed by referring to flexible, cyclical forms rather than a fixed structure. This involved teaching 'music' rather than 'composers'.

Outside of the framework of form and notation, students were given the opportunity to explore the sonic aspects of music thus looking at music's universalities. Improvised music which does not conform to western art music's harmonic and notated structure conveyed its meaning through sound colour, intonation and expression. Students experimented with creating their own meanings, relating sounds to feelings or using a stimulus, for
instance a mood, a musical conversation. This moved away from the 'perfect', acontextual series of sounds.

b. importance of how music is taught

2. How music is presented was found to be no less important than what is offered (Swann 1985). The process or act of creativity had a value of its own. Girls in project B found that they wanted to work in a pleasant, dignified atmosphere. The processes of singing and chanting together put students and teachers in contact with each other through eye contact, vibration and by a jointly constructed piece of music. These group experiences appeared to be important to students on a social and human level. Music education can use this group and caring dynamic in a continuous and developing process.

Music was found to have social value, qualities which involve mind and body, and it concerned education of feeling, leisure, aesthetic appreciation and it served the school. Teachers utilised the affective qualities and expressive qualities of music in their classrooms, as shown in the action research projects, 'each student was cared for and nurtured through language and sound'. Feelings were incorporated into our work so in playing and composing music we did not artificially marginalise the emotions. This included addressing problems directly and an emphasis on co-operation rather than competition.

c. A balance between a masculine and feminine aesthetic

Traditional music education and what is counted as 'good music' needs to be reappraised (Peacock-Jezic 1988). In this research questions were asked, for example should we teach music from the perspective of the 'great' composers and their lives, sing nationalistic songs and keep traditional role models? This was the model of music teaching used in the case studies. Or should we develop more feminine perspectives as shown by the work in which the students in the action research projects were involved.

Also, we must be wary of making assumptions:

'While.. acknowledging the need to develop interest in high art music the belief that it is intrinsically more worth
being studied and experienced than folk music (and all ethnic musics as well as jazz, blues and rock) subsumes a value judgement that needs to be examined' (Peacock 1987).

A European focused education would seem to be right because this is where we live. However, there are many forms of music from Europe including the popular and folk traditions which appear to be equally as valid as Art music. More feminine genres within Art music would include vocal or piano music. Music from Africa and Asia would easily manifest itself in the context of a European music, it does not have to be 'a bit tacked on' (Blacking 1986), and anyway the term 'ethnic music' becomes increasingly meaningless in a plural society' (Peacock 1987).

In the research, being aware of a feminine aesthetic meant acknowledging the body and not only identifying with the mind '...music can organize our perceptions of our own bodies and emotions..' (McClary 1991) 'Composition ties music to gesture... it plugs music into the noises of life and the body whose movement it fuels...' (Attali 1977). Acknowledgement of the feminine helped us to understand our profound connections to our biographies, cultures, societies and environments. We could state who we were through our art. Schools will need to have the resources and expertise amongst teachers in order to include a more feminine aesthetic, unlike the case study schools in this research.

d. Music evaluation
The higher prestige is given to the activities in school which lead to theory and analysis courses in higher education. These hierarchies need to be questioned. The objective and measured elements concerned in testing can only reflect certain aspects of music education. The subjective elements of learning and judging, partly guided by personal values and belief are an essential part of music education. We now know that quality comes out of equality; if all are included then talents can flourish (chapter 4).
e. Equality issues in music education

From the prejudices that were observed as being so prevalent in many faceted ways in the case study research, it seems that issues of equality need to be confronted when teaching and interpreting music history. Concepts of gender, race, class, sexuality, age, disability and all matters of equality can be incorporated into a redefinition of what really makes good music, whose perception is counted and how we teach it. This will necessitate deliberation and agency around issues such as hegemony, hierarchy, social context, vernacular, and the private sphere (Peacock-Jezic 1988).

In the research there was a clearly identified need (chapter 3 and empirical research) to adopt girl and woman centred ways of thinking using female definitions and female terms of reference. Because we are so used to thinking within the male structure we have constantly to consider an alternative perspective. Changes and challenges were levelled at traditional processes and knowledge about music rather than getting girls to join in male discourses.

From project B the need was found to work towards a wider level of awareness in our institutions and communities (without stress and in any way it is possible to organise) whilst changing our own practice on our own terms. This could only happen when we stopped trying to control the uncontrollable which was 'outside of the classroom' and went on to correct what we had the right to change.

f. Approaches with men and boys

The research showed that males suffered from patriarchy too and there was a need to think also in terms of human relatedness. Not all the boys tried to dominate and control and some of the boys were receiving a similar harassment to that of the girls. Many of the boys enjoyed working with the new approach. Feminine approaches are for everyone. However, as expressed in chapter 4 there is a need to beware of 'gender issues' which entreat a better deal for boys in music education. Sexism results from prejudiced attitudes based upon notions of sexual superiority and inferiority, when prejudice combines with power it causes
behaviour and institutional structures which discriminate against girls and women bringing disadvantage in many areas of their lives. Music may be one of the few areas where girls can find a safe space. There is often concern that boys are not exploring their feminine side and this is implied in the original National Curriculum document (see chapter 4).

4. Suggestions for Further Research
A number of issues have emerged out of this research which are ongoing in the debates about women, music and education. These issues need further examination and research.

a. Feminine perspectives of Knowledge
An important question raised by the research findings concerned why we continue to think in terms of the framing and boundaries of knowledge and the arts (Bernstein 1971, Shepherd 1991, McClary 1991). It has been asserted by educationalists (Rendel 1981, Weiner 1995) that such structuring mystifies learning and access to knowledge to all who do not think in terms of the 'rational' and 'objective'. Sociologists in the 1950s and 60s demonstrated that education was not accessible to working class children because of the way knowledge and language was structured and feminists believe that existing notions about how knowledge is produced and where it comes from (Hevey and Spence 1992 p.9) should be deconstructed so a feminine perspective can then be included. A case was made for feminine perspectives regarding knowledge and was discussed under epistemological considerations in the methodology and epistemology, chapter five. The assumption that there are feminine perspectives raises other questions, as follows.

b. Feminine Aesthetics
Related to questions about feminine perspectives of knowledge are questions concerning the concept of feminine aesthetics which are raised in chapter two, chapter four section d.i. and chapter eight section 1. The view taken in this thesis supports the notion of feminine aesthetics. This notion is not necessarily accepted by all writers. For instance Green states 'the masculine meaning of music can be disrupted, if we find out that it is a
female composer, a female improviser, behind the music. When this happens, we are made aware of having assumed a masculine meaning' (Green 1994).

There is a need for further debate about the difference between the words 'female' and 'male' which are biologically given and the socially constructed 'feminine' and 'masculine'. It is unfortunate that the words feminine and masculine are derivatives from words which represent the biologically given because in this culture 'opposite' sexes denote extreme polarisations and this gives us the idea that either one view or the other view needs to be taken. Also feminine and masculine attributes are then accordingly associated with females and males and there seems to be no reason why those characteristics which are (in any given society) considered feminine should necessarily belong to a female and vice versa.

A feminine aesthetic means an alternative aesthetic which is more fluid, free, improvisatory and unrestricted, but this need not be particularly associated with the female. Females and males could freely choose to make music in their chosen way without a sexual connotation.

As was discussed in chapter five, we are looking to a future where there may be changes in the popular constructions of gender and an 'ideal scenario' might be that neither females nor males have a propensity to create and play music in ways related to their gender. In which case there would be different ways of making music but they would not necessarily be on a continuum of being either like this or like that. It would be better not to think in terms of dualities, then debates about aesthetics would perceive each musical creation in the context of all musics.

c. An Equalitative Music Criticism

Another issue, in the light of the National Curriculum that will need detailed scrutiny, concerns music criticism and, in schools, assessment and testing in music. In chapter four section d.i there is a discussion about an e/qualitative music criticism. The present, dominant, masculine forms of music are sanctioned by those who have the power and status to publish, authorise,
support, approve and critique. 'Western art music' has a set of hierarchies. Music by certain composers ("Let us listen to some Beethoven") is considered as the best and of the first order. Certain conductors, orchestras and artists are revered and we go in great numbers and pay higher prices to hear music conducted by and played by 'superior' musicians. Certain genres such as the Symphony and Dramatic Opera are considered the measure of worth of a composer. Playing in the concert hall is deemed the mark of success and the more prestigious the concert hall the more successful the musician.

The dominant, traditional forms are given more status on the curriculum, in the concert hall and in the media. This is because the question of what music is of good quality and worth, and should be most highly valued has been appropriated by a certain cultural elite who perpetuate the dominant, masculinist forms.

We need to ask whose perception is, and has been counted as to who are the 'greats' in music? When considering a particular artwork, ask; 'when, how, why, for what purpose, to express which feelings was the artwork created?' (Peacock-Jezic 1988 p.7). Traditional distinctions between 'high art' and 'popular culture' can be challenged by focusing on musical forms that stress the social nature of the arts, experienced at a daily level of communal life (Bell 1987).

d. Overcoming the Subjugation of Women Musicians
A different issue concerns the downgrading of women's musicianship because of prejudiced attitudes which do not accept what is done by women as being of equal value to that done by men. This is a familiar problem to women musicians but consistent attention is need to try and overcome prejudice.

Where men who have so called feminine attributes and who compose or play what is considered feminine music, they are at an advantage to women. Whatever they do, it will not be judged in advance as being lesser based on their sex. Prejudiced attitudes are such that knowing the sex of the composer or musician can
affect the way the piece is judged. For instance, '(A music critic's) new knowledge that the composer was a woman affected the way that he heard the music itself and the way that he translated the music into words' (Green 1994)

It is mainly because of these prejudices against women, because they are women that previously unknown women and their music are now being uncovered from the history of music. These women may or may not have composed or played music which is feminine in form or style, they were excluded because of their sex. How can we contest women's continued exclusion from music making because of their sex?

In conclusion, the evidence from this research shows that changes need to take place in schools. The music that is taught, the way it is taught and the circumstances under which it is taught are in need of radical review. A group called 'Community Work' who describe themselves as bringing music teaching wherever it is most needed, state that 'one of the intractable problems of music education in schools ...is the conflict between the stratified and hierarchical demands of mass education and music's need for spontaneity and a more flexible framework' (Community Music Ltd. 1988). In the case studies and the projects, working in a male organised hierarchy had been an intractable problem for many teachers and students too. It has been shown in this research, that Women and Music have had the same problem, but that there is a capacity and possibility for change. Progress was made towards a more feminine model of music education in the Action Research Projects. These kinds of changes have an opportunity to restyle music education now that the National Curriculum requirements have precipitated a transformation.

What has become clear from this research is the need continually to challenge traditional music history and its value laden premises. In order to make changes new concepts have been formulated and there has been a reexamination of more humane, holistic doctrines of music and music history. This has included a wider concept of music as a universal art form, the rethinking of the existing hierarchy of 'great' composers, giving equal
importance to genres such as song and piano music and embracing the oral and folk traditions.

There are a multiplicity of reasons for being involved in the debate about the gendered music curriculum but what appears to be important at this time is that discussion is taking place. The, hitherto, lack of research relating to women and music may have been to do with music's capacity to speak on social, cultural and biographical levels, (Feld 1984). However, these articulations are now being unravelled and this thesis contributes to the debate.
References


ABRAHAM J. Gender Differences and Anti-School Boys Sociological Review 37(1) 1989


ARMSTRONG F. with PEARSON J. As Far as the Eye can Sing? London: Women's Press 1992


ARTS COUNCIL OF GREAT BRITAIN Women in the Arts, notions of e/quality Symposium: Ideas and Observations for Discussion Birmingham 5-7 March 1993

ASKEW C. & WILKINS M. L. 'Women Composers, 12th - 20th Centuries' In: Music Gender and Education proceedings of the first conference for Women in Music, University of Bristol 1993


BARRS M. Words not Numbers: Assessment in English Exeter: Short Run Press Ltd. 1990


BELL W. et al 'Race and Representation in the Arts' Arts Centre Film Programme University of London, Institute of Education Spring 1987


BENN R.& BURTON R. 'Women, Social Class and Access to Higher Education: The social classification of women's work, a perspective transformation' In: Research Imaginations proceedings of The British Sociological Association Annual Conference, University of Essex 1993


BERNSTEIN B. 'Classification and Framing of Educational Knowledge'. In: Knowledge and Control by YOUNG M.F.D. London: MacMillan 1971


BEYNON J. 'Ms Floral mends her ways: a case study of the micropolitics of creative drama' In: Tickle L. ed. The Arts in Education London: Croom Helm 1987


BLACKING J. How Musical is Man London: Faber and Faber 1976

BLACKING J. Culture and the Arts National Association for Education in the Arts 4- take up series 1986


BOYCE-TILLMAN J. 'Processional Song: We Shall Go Out' In: Broken Silence women finding a voice Hemel Hempstead: Women in Theology 1993a

BOYCE-TILLMAN J. 'Skirts and Trousers or Valuing the Feminine' In: Music Gender and Education proceedings of the first conference for Women in Music, University of Bristol 1993b


BRISCOE A. 'Teaching Women's Compositions to Pianists. Ages 14-18' unpublished paper 1993


BRUCE R. 'Which Instrument?': proceedings of Women in Music's first conference of Music, Gender and Education, University of Bristol 1993

BRUCE R. & KEMP A. 'Sex-stereotyping in Children's Preferences for Musical Instruments' British Journal of Music Education 10 213-217 1993


CARR 'Legislation and mediation: to what extent has the sex discrimination act changed girls' schooling?' In: Whyte et al Girl Friendly Schooling London: Methuen 1985

CARR P. 'Things Change, Don't They?' A play from Her Story: Women's experiences past and present of life in Enfield 1940-1990 A school and community link initiative Co-op/ Herstory productions/ Enfield LEA 1990

CASE S-E Feminism and Theatre London: MacMillan 1988


CHISHOLM L. & HOLLAND J. Sinking and Swimming: the experience of developing affirmative action collaborative research in schools University of London, Institute of Education, Sociological Research Unit, GAOC Working Paper no.3


CLARKE H. J. 'The Nature of Music and its Relation to the Question of Women' In Music (Chicago) 7 (March 1895): 459-61 Quoted in NEULS-BATES 1982
CLEMENCE C. Opera or the Undoing of Women London: Virago Press 1988

CLOISON E. 1944 Quoted in Spare Rib no.172 November 1986 p.32


COMMUNITY MUSIC LTD. Annual Report 1987-88 Interchange Studios London NW5 1988


CORMIER H.H. 'Women in Folk Song' In: 'Heresies' no.10 USA 1980

CROWLEY H. & HIMMELWEIT S. 'The Aims and Achievements of Feminist Theory' In: Knowing Women; Feminism and Knowledge Cambridge: Polity Press 1992


DARWIN C. The Descent of Man and Selection in Relation to Sex 1871 reprinted from 2nd 1874 ed., London: John Murray 1901 Quoted in BATTERSBY 1989

DAVIES B. 'Education for Sexism: a theoretical analysis of the sex/gender bias in education' Educational Philosophy and Theory 21 (1) 1989


DELMONT S. Sex Roles and the School London: Methuen 1980


DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCE Curricular Differences for Boys and Girls Education Survey 21 HMSO 1975

DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCE Circular 5/89 HMSO 22nd Feb 1989

DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCE Guidance for Schools: From Policy to Practice HMSO 1989


BRISCOE A. 'Teaching Women's Compositions to Pianists. Ages 14-18' unpublished paper 1993


BRUCE R. 'Which Instrument?': proceedings of Women in Music's first conference of Music, Gender and Education, University of Bristol 1993

BRUCE R. & KEMP A. 'Sex-stereotyping in Children's Preferences for Musical Instruments' British Journal of Music Education 10 213-217 1993


CARR 'Legislation and mediation: to what extent has the sex discrimination act changed girls' schooling?' In: Whyte et al Girl Friendly Schooling London: Methuen 1985

CASE S-E Feminism and Theatre London: MacMillan 1988


CHISHOLM L. & HOLLAND J. Sinking and Swimming: the experience of developing affirmative action collaborative research in schools University of London, Institute of Education, Sociological Research Unit, GAOC Working Paper no.3


CLARKE H. J. 'The Nature of Music and its Relation to the Question of Women' In Music (Chicago) 7 (March 1895): 459-61 Quoted in NEULS-BATES 1982

CLÉMENT C. Opera or the Undoing of Women London: Virago Press 1989
FELD S. 'Communication, Music, and Speech about Music'

FISH J. Educational Opportunities for All: Report of a committee reviewing provision to meet special educational needs Inner London Education Authority 1985

FITZPATRICK M. 'Women Composers in Early 19th Century London: A New Perspective': proceedings of Women in Music's first conference of Music, Gender and Education, University of Bristol 1993


FOUCAULT M. History of Sexuality vol.1 New York: Vintage 1980a


FULLER 'Black Girl in a London Comprehensive School' In DEEM R. 1980

GASSET J. O. y The Dehumanisation of Art Princeton: University Press 1968

GEERTZ C. The Interpretation of Cultures New York: Basic Books 1973

GERGIS S. 'The Power of Women Musicians in the Ancient and Near East: The Roots of Prejudice': proceedings of Women in Music’s first conference of Music, Gender and Education, University of Bristol 1993

GILLIGAN C. In a Different Voice: Psychological Theory and Women’s Development Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press 1982

Girls into Science and Technology (GIST) University of Manchester, Dept. of Sociology 1981-1984 Final Report 1984


GOTTESMAN N. and SHILLOR I. 'Jewish Women's Music': proceedings of the Women in Music’s first conference of Music, Gender and Education, University of Bristol 1993


GRIFFITHS M. 'Action research: grassroots practice or management tool?' In: Managing Staff Development in Schools: an action research approach Lomax P. (ed) Multilingual Matters 1990


HARDING S. (ed) 'Is there a Feminist Method?' In: Feminism and Methodology Milton Keynes:Open University Press 1987

HAYES E. 'Banjo Women' In: Heresies no.10 USA 1980

HAYNES S. & HOWES S. 'SATs How was it for you?- Bigland Green Primary School, Tower Hamlets In: Language Matters- Assessment London: Centre for Language in Primary Education no.2 1992

HEATH S. The Sexual Fix New York: Shocken Books 1982

HEATHER N. Radical Perspectives in Psychology London: Methuen 1976


Her Majesty’s Inspectorate (HMI) report Holy Family R.C.
Comprehensive School (age 11 - 14) London Borough of Enfield, HMSO 1993

HEVEY D. & SPENCE J. 'Marks of Struggle' In Women's Art Magazine no.47 July/August 1992

HINLEY M. 'The Uphill Climb of Women in American Music: Performers and Teachers' In: Music Education Journal USA April 1984

HIRSCH M. edit. 'A Conversation about Race and Class' between Mary Childers and Bell Hooks In: Conflicts in Feminism London: Routledge 1990


HULME J. 'Facing the Music' In: The Teacher: Journal of the National Union of Teachers London: NUT January/February 1993

HUNECKER J. G. (1915) Quoted in Spare Rib no. 172 Nov. 1986


INNER LONDON EDUCATION AUTHORITY Music Guidelines 1995


JAMES & YOUNG In: Changing Perspectives on Gender Milton Keynes: Open University Press 1989

JEYASINGH S. 'Shedding Light on Indian Dance' In: Spare Rib 193 Aug. 1988


KAPLAN E. Ann Women and Film New York: Methuen 1983

KELLER E.F. Reflections on Gender and Science Newhaven (Conn): Yale University Press 1992


KERMANN J. Contemplating Music: Challenges to Musicology
CLÉMENT 1989 p.ix

KHALSA S. et al 'Making Connections' In: Language Matters-
Assessment London: Centre for Language in Primary Education no.2
1992

LAMB R. 'The Possibilities of/for Feminist Music Criticism in
Music Education': proceedings of Women in Music's first
conference of Music, Gender and Education, University of Bristol
1993

The LANGUAGE AWARENESS PROJECT Language and Gender Pack 1 & 2
Equal Opportunities Commission HMSO 1992

The LAROUSSE Encyclopedia of Music (1955) edit. MINDLEY London:
Hamlyn 1971

Lea Green Language Support Service Race and Gender Issues Waltham
Forest 5/11/92

LEBRECHT N. The Maestro Myth: Great Conductors in Pursuit of
Power London: Simon and Schuster Ltd. 1991

LEES S. Losing Out: Sexuality and Adolescent Girls London:
Hutchinson 1986

LEVY A. Other Women: The Writing of Class, Race and Gender 1832-

LINDEMANN C. 'Meet the Women Composers of Rags' In: Heresies
no.10 USA 1980

LLEWELLYN M. 'Studying Girls at School: the Implications of
Confusion' In: R.DEEM 1980

LOMBROSO C. (1893), with W. (Guglielmo) FERRERO, The Female
Offender trans., London :T. Fisher Unwin 1895. Quoted in
BATTERSBY 1989

LOMBROSO-FERRERO G. The Soul of Woman: Reflections in Life
trans., London: Cape 1924. Quoted in BATTERSBY 1989

McClARY S. Feminine Endings Minnesota: University Press 1991

MACCOBY E. & JACKLIN C. The Psychology of Sex Differences
Stanford, California: Stanford University Press 1974

MACDONALD I. Development of the Arts in Enfield: A report to the
London Borough of Enfield and Greater London Arts 1986

McGINNIS A. 'Music and Healing' In Heresies no.10 USA 1980

McNIFF J. Action Research: principles and practice London:
MacMillan 1988

MAHONY P. Schools for the Boys? London: Hutchinson 1985
MAIDLOW S. 'Perceptions of Girls' and Boys' Studying Music at 'A' Level': proceedings of Women in Music's first conference of Music, Gender and Education, University of Bristol 1993

Manpower Services Commission Choice of Careers 101: Music pamphlet MSC 1987

Manpower Services Commission TVEI: Annual Review 1984

MARX K. (1905-10) Theories of Surplus Value eds. Ryazanskaya S.W. & Dixon R. London: Lawrence and Wishart 1972


MILL J.S. The Subjection of Women 1869, Quoted in BATTERSBY 1929

MILLETT K. Sexual Politics London: Virago 1971

MILLMAN V. & WEINER G. Sex Differentiation in Schools: is there really a problem? Report from former Schools Council Project Longman 1995


MILLMAN V. & DUNN S. Chameleons in the Classroom Educational Review 40(1) 1988

MINNS H. Girls Don't Get Holes in their Clothes: sex stereotyping (*U**+ ( schools 1988

MOORE J. 'Hildegarde's Story' In: Broken Silence; women finding a voice Hemel Hempstead: Women in Theology 1993


MUSIC FILE Teachers' notes and Lesson Plans London: Stanley Thornes Ltd.

MUSICIANS UNION Quoted in Spare Rib no. 172 November 1986


KHALSA S. et al 'Making Connections' In: Language Matters-Assessment London: Centre for Language in Primary Education no.2 1992

LAMB R. 'The Possibilities of/for Feminist Music Criticism in Music Education': proceedings of Women in Music's first conference of Music, Gender and Education, University of Bristol 1993

The LANGUAGE AWARENESS PROJECT Language and Gender Pack 1 & 2 Equal Opportunities Commission HMSO 1992


Lea Green Language Support Service Race and Gender Issues Waltham Forest 5/11/92


LINDEMANN C. 'Meet the Women Composers of Rags' In: Heresies no.10 USA 1980


McCLARY S. Feminine Endings Minnesota: University Press 1991


McGINNIS A. 'Music and Healing' In Heresies no.10 USA 1980


MAHONY P. Schools for the Boys? London: Hutchinson 1985

MAIDLOW S. 'Perceptions of Girls' and Boys' Studying Music at 'A' Level': proceedings of Women in Music’s first conference of Music, Gender and Education, University of Bristol 1993


PURCE J. SOUND in Mind and Body Resurgence no 115 March/April 1986


The RANSC Report (equal opportunities in records of achievement) DES 1988


REHMAN N. 'A South Asian Perspective': proceedings of Women in Music's first conference of Music, Gender and Education, University of Bristol 1993


REITZ R. 'Mean Mothers: Independent Women's Blues' In: Heresies no. 10 USA 1980


RIDDLE S. Pupils Resistance and Gender Codes: a Study of Classroom Encounters Gender and Education 1(1) 1988

RIEGER E. Frau, Musik und Mannerherrschaft Frankfurt: Ullstein 1981


ROBINSON K. H. 'Classroom Discipline: power resistance and gender. A look at teacher perspectives' Gender and Education 4(3) 1992

RODGERSON G. and WILSON E. Pornography and Feminism London: Lawrence and Wishart 1991

ROUSSEAU J. J. (1759) Letter to Monsieur D'Alembert Quoted in SPROULE 1989
RUBENSTEIN Equal Educational Opportunities, The Tripartite System and the Comprehensive School Milton Keynes: Open University E205 Block 2 Unit 6 1984

RUNNYMEDE TRUST Equality Assurance in the School Curriculum Race Equality and Cultural Diversity: A consultative paper on meeting the new legal requirements London: Runnymede Trust 1992


RUSSEN A. 'SATs, How was it for you?' St Judes School, Lambeth In: Language Matters- Assessment London: Centre for Language in Primary Education no.2 1992


RYAN J. 'I.Q. The Illusion of Objectivity' In: Richardson K. & Spears D. eds Race, Culture and Intelligence Harmmondsworth: Penguin 1972


SEX DISCRIMINATION ACT HMSO 29th Dec. 1975


SCHOOLS COUNCIL/ ILEA Equal Opportunities: Whats in it for Boys? Conference Report 1983


SHARPE S. Just Like a Girl Harmondsworth: Penguin 1976


SIMPSON H. 'Issues of Gender in Music Education' proceedings of Women in Music's first conference of Music Gender and Education University of Bristol 1983


SLEE N. Broken Silence; women finding a voice Hemel Hempstead: Women in Theology 1993


SPARE RIB 'Calling the Tune', a feature on the 'Every Which Way' exhibition on women in music held in Liverpool, October 1988 In: Spare Rib no. 172 Nov. 1988


SPROULE A. Women and the Arts Hove: Wayland Ltd. 1983


STANTON D. 'Difference on Trial?' In: The Thinking Muse: Feminism and Modern French Philosophy Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press 1989

STANWORTH M. Gender and Schooling London: Hutchinson 1983


SWANN Report Committee of Inquiry into the Education of Children from Ethnic Minority Groups Education for All Great Britain 1985

TARR J. 'Jazz Education'; proceedings of Women in Music's first conference of Music Gender and Education, University of Bristol 1993

TGAT (Appendix F) The EOC submission to the DES Task Group on Assessment and Testing, a digest for schools chaired by Prof. P.J Black DES 1988


UNIVERSITY OF LONDON EDUCATION AND ASSESSMENT COUNCIL (ULEAC) Assessment and the National Curriculum 1992


USSHER J. Women's Madness: Misogyny or Mental Illness Hemel Hempstead: Harvester Wheatsheaf 1991

VAN de VATE N. Interview October 7 1981 In:NEULS-BATES 1982 p.323


WALKER M. 'Moral understandings: alternative "epistemology" for a feminist ethics' Hypatia 4:15-28 1989


Waltham Forest, Multicultural Development Service Race, Gender and Class Issues in Behaviour Management PSS Handout 12 1992


WEINER G. Changing Perspectives on Gender Milton Keynes: Open University Press 1989
WEINER G. 'Professional self-knowledge versus social justice; a critical analysis of the teacher-researcher movement' British Education Research Journal 15 (1) 1989


WHITEHEAD J. 'Creating a Living Educational Theory from Questions of the Kind, How Do I Improve my Practice?' In: Cambridge Journal of Education 19 (1) 1989

WILLIAMS A. 'Diversity and Agreement in Feminist Ethnography' In: Sociology Journal of the British Sociological Association vol. 27 no.4 November 1993


WOMEN IN MUSIC (WiM) Battersea Arts Centre, London SW11 5TF

WOMEN in MUSIC EDUCATION (WiMEd) 'A Better Balance' Pilot pack for proceedings of Women in Music's first conference of Music, Gender and Education, University of Bristol 1993

WOOLF V. A Room of One's Own London: The Hogarth Press 1929
Dear Ms. Maidlow,

Thank you for your letter of 16 June. I must say I had always thought that music had values unrelated to gender, but I am afraid I am unable to use your contribution to the debate at this stage.

Yours sincerely,

Stephen Bates
Education Editor
This is an action research project based in two secondary schools, and . The purpose of the project is to explore gender issues in relation to the music curriculum (by this I mean the curriculum in its widest sense: hidden and overt, extra-curricular and the extended curriculum) and to develop strategies for change.

Those involved in the project

1) School
   Headteacher  Head of Music

2) School
   Headteacher  Head of Music
   researchers

3) Carol Costley - Project co-ordinator

Also as the project will run during the academic year 1991/92 when Teachers centre (T.C.) are establishing action research projects in gender in primary schools, the teacher/researchers named above at 1 and 2 will try to attend the training sessions offered at T.C.

The principles of the action research method and the equal opportunities issues involved are the same for the wider curriculum issues in primary schools as for the specific area of music in secondary schools. Any differences in application can be discussed with the project co-ordinator.

The advisory teachers involved in the primary project have therefore been asked to act as consultants who may come into the schools to observe, discuss and offer expertise.

WHY JOIN UP WITH PRIMARY COLLEAGUES?

1) It is seen as a positive advantage to work with others who are involved in similar work as this involves, exchange of information, moral and practical support, confirmation that what is being done is worthwhile.

2) The access to resources, advice, and general back up of the teachers centre in sanctioning the viability of the project is seen as an important process especially during the initial sensitive stages of the project.

3) Things with primary schools and new contacts in the borough are always advantageous.
ROLE OF THE CO-ORDINATOR

My role is to be in regular dialogue with the teacher/researchers so they may reflect and theorise about their work. I see myself as a stabilising factor. I may need to keep practitioners focussed on the reflective nature of the project or help solve practical problems. I may need to negotiate suggested changes in my original formulations.

I am available to support and observe if necessary one and a half days per week when I have non-teaching time.

BACKGROUND TO THE PROJECT

I have just completed a piece of research around the issues of music education and gender. The final stage is to use action research in order to work with teachers to reflect on my findings and the curriculum in action (that is the curriculum as it exists through the actions of teachers and the experiences of the students).

ROLE OF THE TEACHER/RESEARCHERS

To follow our prescribed action research process. For instance,

1) ask questions
2) collect data
3) analyse
4) formulate hypothesis
5) plan action steps
6) positive action for change

This should be then repeated and refined for as long as the teacher feels the process is of value.

The teacher/researcher need not be overburdened with work as the project co-ordinator can help and support. The more rigorous expectations of the primary projects which include report writing and presentation need not be followed. Some written statement is needed though, which may be similar to those set out in the leaflet 'action research projects gender' 1990 - 1991.

Carol Costley
October 1991
APPENDIX C Check List of Observations for Case Studies

LESSON CONTENT

* Do you exclude any of the following activities because they are disliked by the male and female pupils in your classes: singing, playing music, listening to music or making critical responses to the music of others?

* Is the content of the lessons geared to the interests of female and male pupils?

* Is the musical piece or song suitable for the age range of the class?

* Are the musical tasks varied enough to enable male and female pupils of all abilities to contribute?

* Do the female and male pupils in the class often experience a sense of achievement in their music lessons?

* Do you choose topics to stimulate creative work which are, as far as possible, relevant and interesting to boys and girls?

THE INSTRUMENTS

* Do you have a good selection of instruments for class music lessons, i.e. diatonic and chromatic tuned percussion, simple wind instruments, an extensive range of untuned percussion as well as non-European instruments?

* Are these instruments in good working order?

* Are the instruments appropriate for the age range you teach?

* Do you have enough instruments for a class of female and male pupils?

* Do you encourage pupils to explore additional sound sources, i.e. vocal sounds, body sounds or everyday sounds from the environment?

* Make a list of the most popular instruments in your classroom. How are these instruments allocated in lessons:
  * by pupil preference?
  * teacher direction?
  * a system of rotation?

* Do the female and male pupils complain that the same pupils play the most popular instruments each week?

* Who gets the instruments out of cupboards or clears them away after lessons?

* Do these helpers tend to be the same each week?

SINGING

* Is this activity always teacher directed?

* Do female and male pupils sing a variety of songs, including songs from musicals, jazz, pop, soul, classical songs, or songs from different cultures?

* Are the lyrics acceptable to the age range of the pupils?
APPENDIX E  Music Syllabus- Case Study 3

The Syllabus for each year is divided into the three necessary components for G.C.S.E.

1) Performing
2) Listening
3) Composing

Year 1

Performing

Class singing in unison, singing in groups and singing separately.
The use of percussion instruments
The use of the electronic keyboards
Books to be used to help with the above:-
a) Music Making Activity Book
b) Ten Scenarios
c) The Daniel Jazz
d) Jonah-Man Jazz
e) Supertoad
f) Songs from 35 countries
g) Swingin' Samson
h) Ten of the Best
i) Holy Moses
j) Sing-a-Round

Listening

The Instruments of the Orchestra
The Carnival of the Animals
The Danse Macabre
Nos. 1-6 of Key Concepts in Music
The Life of Saint-Saens
Books to be used in conjunction with the above:
a) Adventures in Music
b) Instruments of the Orchestra

Composing

The plan of the keyboard
Names of the notes in the treble and bass clefs
Note values and rests. \( \), \( \) Time-Signatures 2, 3, 4
Simple Terms, rit and rall, p. & f, staccato, cresc., din, Adagio, Andante, Allegro

Termly Plan

**FIRST YEAR**

**AUTUMN TERM**

1. Singing
   Instruments of the Orchestra - Strings
   Selections from The Carnival of The Animals
   Names of the notes in the treble clef
   **Note values**
   Sheet 1 of Key Concepts in Music

2. Singing
   Instruments of the Orchestra - Woodwind
   Bar lines, time-signatures
   Percussion instruments
   Untuned composing - (give a rhythm and a beat)
   Sheet 2 of Key Concepts

**SPRING TERM**

3. Singing
   Instruments of the Orchestra - Brass
   Selections from The Carnival of the Animals
   Plan of the keyboard
   Sheet 3 of Key Concepts
   Melodic composition in C only

4. Singing
   Instruments of the Orchestra - Percussion
   Rests
   Simple Terms
   Composing - combining melody and rhythm
   Finish Carnival of the Animals
   Sheet 4 of Key Concepts

**SUMMER TERM**

5. Singing in Canon and Rounds
   Names of the notes in the bass clef
   Life of Saint-Saens
   Sheet 5 of Key Concepts

6. Singing
   Sheet 6 of Key Concepts
   Danse Macabre
   Keyboard and Composing
Second Years

Performing

1. Singing in unison and 2-parts
2. Use of the electronic keyboards and synthesizer
3. Performance of own composition

Listening

Pitch - to be able to recognise which note is the highest out of 2 and 3 notes played in quick succession.
Nos. 7–12 of Key Concepts in Music
Form - binary and ternary
The Baroque and Classical periods including Beethoven - to be able to recognize which period a piece of music comes from.
Books to be used:-
"Into the Classics"
"Enjoying Music" - Books 1 and 2
"Adventures in Music"
"Discovering Music"

Composing

Dotted notes and ledger line notes
Dotted rests
Time signatures — $\frac{6}{8}$, $\frac{4}{4}$, $\frac{12}{8}$
More terms and signs — pp, ppp, mp, mf, ff, fff, Presto, Largo, Moderato,
Repeat sign, Accents, Pause sign
Composing own composition
AUTUMN TERM

2ND YEAR

1. Recap. of 1st. Year work
   e.g. Recognising instruments etc.
   Sheet 7 of Key Concepts
   Dotted notes and rests.
   Pitch
   Singing in 2-parts
   Ten Scenarios
   Start the Baroque period

SPRING TERM

3. Ledger line notes
   No. 9 of Key Concepts
   Ten Scenarios
   Singing
   Composing - using all instruments
   and all forms of Notation

   Finish the Baroque period
   Bach, Handel, Vivaldi etc.

4. More terms and signs
   Ternary form
   No. 10 of Key Concepts
   Start the Classical peri
   Singing
   Composing - using ternar
   Fin
   Ten Scenarios

SUMMER TERM

5. Finish the Classical period and be able
   to recognise different composers' styles
   from any of the Baroque and Classical
   periods
   No. 11 of Key Concepts
   Singing
   Practical exam - including performance
   and composing - as a solo or as a group

   Ludwig van Beethoven
   No. 12 of Key Concepts
   Ten Scenarios
   Assimilation of all 2nd Year wor
THIRD YEARS

Performing

Singing in unison and 2-parts
Conducting
Performance of own composition on electric keyboards

Listening

Form - Rondo
Nos. 13 - 18 of Key Concepts
Romantic period including Brahms, Tchaikovsky, Chopin, Schubert, etc. and to recognize composers and their different styles.
Aural recognition - e.g. pitch, volume, tempo, instruments, expression.
The Concerto, Sonata, Symphony, Opera, Operetta

Composing

Time-signatures \( \frac{2}{2} \), \( \frac{3}{2} \), \( \frac{4}{2} \)
Chords I, IV and V
Triads I, IV and V
Keys up to 2 sharps and 2 flats
Composing own composition on electronic Keyboards
AUTUMN TERM

THIRD YEAR

1.
Recap. of 1st. and 2nd. Year work
Time-signatures $\frac{2}{4}, \frac{3}{4}, \frac{4}{4}$
Rondo form
No. 13 of Key Concepts
Composing at the keyboard

2.
Chords and triads
No. 14 of Key Concepts
Start the Romantic period
Singing
Composing

SPRING TERM

3.
No. 15 of Key Concepts
Keys of C major, G and D majors
The Romantic period continued
Aural recognition
Conducting

4.
Finish Romantic period
Keys of F and B♭ majors
Aural recognition
No. 16 of Key Concepts
Singing
Conducting, Composing, Performing

SUMMER TERM

5.
The Concerto, Sonata, Symphony, Musical,
Opera and Operetta and Oratorio, Cantata
Listening to all the styles studied and to
be able to recognise each period
No. 17 of Key Concepts
Composing
Singing

6.
No. 18 of Key Concepts
Assimilation of all 3rd. year wor
APPENDIX F  Letter to Headteacher and the Borough from Teachers
Concerned about Equal Opportunities in Case Study 1

Dear ,

We, the staff concerned with equal opportunities at school, feel the need to express our sincere concern about certain events and attitudes which have been witnessed within our school in recent times.

1) Documented evidence of racially and sexually motivated abuse and harassment existing within our School was presented at a staff meeting by the Equal Opportunities Working Party. This was in order to encourage debate and develop staff awareness with the aim of working towards a whole staff view for the drawing up and implementation of a multicultural, antiracist policy.

2) Notice was given from the Governing Body which required girls not to wear trousers from September 1990. Many staff were angry and amazed at this decision over which they were not consulted. A teacher governor had to raise the issue which was finally resolved after much argument.

3) An invited speaker recently came to our school and made offensive and derogatory remarks, as he had done on a previous occasion. These remarks included an implied defence of colonialism - a violent and terrorist ideology which degrades people. Remarks such as these run counter to the stated aims of the school, yet discussion on this incident was suppressed. The deeply felt discomfort of many (particularly black) pupils and teachers was therefore ignored and no attempt was made to distance the school, its management, its ethos, or its aims and objectives from the values and attitudes that were apparent in the talk.

4) A teacher put up some pictures of the release from prison of Nelson Mandela. One of these pictures, outside the school office, was immediately removed by a member of the Senior Management Team. When the teacher concerned questioned this he
was told that such pictures were not appropriate for our school walls and the other pictures were then soon removed. (Please see the attached rationale which specifically answers your objections to these pictures and states our reasons for the need to display them.)

5) A welcome sign for the above mentioned speaker remained up in the school hall for more than half a term until strong objections were raised, yet the poster about the struggle of people against oppression was labelled 'terrorist' and 'disturbing' and was pulled down within hours.

Teachers and pupils at this school (especially black teachers and pupils) have heard, seen and felt discrimination expressed towards them. The undermining of attempts to overcome racism and raise it as an important issue are seen as collusion and silent agreement with it. This causes unrest and discomfort amongst those who are concerned about equal opportunities. We believe that an urgent review is needed to clarify the position of the School about racism and discrimination. The school's aims and objectives need to be developed in the context of supporting people's aspirations for a just society and this cannot be done in an abstract, academic context that bears no relationship to practice.

Yours sincerely,

Teachers concerned about equal opportunities:
RATIONALE FOR DISPLAYING THE PICTURE OF NELSON MANDELA

This picture highlights the nature of racism and how difficult racism is to oppose. In line with school aims and objectives, if pupils are to understand the nasty society which they are inheriting and if school is to reflect the aspirations of people for a just society, then clear positions are required on issues of racism and discrimination generally. The issues cannot be sanitized and reconstructed by schools to make them easier to deal with.

'Schools should help pupils acquire sufficient social, political, historical, environmental and economic knowledge to understand the world in which they live and to be aware of the issues facing society.'

Curriculum Statement (ECS)

2) The word 'struggle' on the poster means just that. A long term struggle that exists in every country in the world for people to have an equal say in shaping their lives and to do so without fear of imprisonment and death, regardless of race, gender and class.

'Enfield believes the following qualities in pupils to be important
- the capacity to give proper weight to the interests of others
- an active sense of justice.'

(ECS)

3) The raised fists justify personal pride and strength of spirit. Self respect is continually being worn away, particularly for black people by having their contribution to society devalued and their experience of racism and racial harassment neglected.

'Schools should help pupils to... develop self-confidence and a proper sense of their own worth and value.'

(ECS)

4) Labels of 'terrorists' on the ANC in the light of - the colonialism promoted by the speaker at our recent Presentation Evening - the distortion of self-preservation strategies by isolating them from the particular situation in South Africa - no comparable consideration to the effects of the legalised and extreme state terrorism in that country, makes the label of 'terrorist' in this case inappropriate and naive.

Whilst there is no place for party politics in schools, there are political factors that affect and inform the lives of our pupils which need to be understood in their proper context.
MATERIAL REDACTED AT REQUEST OF UNIVERSITY
Appendix I Further Analysis of Song Book

'Mango Spice' 44 Caribbean songs

Songs are listed in categories:

1. Jamaican alphabet

This song goes through the alphabet naming different foods until it comes to Z. Here the line is 'Z is for Zuzu dat's a bwoy can nyam' (Z is for Zuzu that's a boy who can eat).

   Sung by:-- unstated

   Picture:-- a boy who can eat

2. Tantie Mary

About a woman, Aunt Mary, who sells cherries.
'I asked my friend Kenny to lend me a penny'

   Sung by:-- unstated

   Picture:-- a woman selling and
   a girl buying cherries

3. Coconut Woman

About a woman selling coconut water who suggests you might buy it for a number of reasons including-
'A lady tell me the other day
No one can take her sweet man away.
I ask her what was the mystery
She say coconut water and rice curry'

   and

   'Man it's good for your daughter'

   Sung by:-- unstated

4. Cane

About someone pulling sugar cane when the cane cart passes but 'the man does crack his whip sometimes'.

   Sung by:-- unstated

   Picture:-- a boy eating cane

5. Dip an fall back

About a blend of foods called dip an fall back.
The generic 'man' is used to mean people, ...'an man was experimenting wid tings to fill dem space'

Later the singer says that he would rather lose his wife and three sweethearts than his dip an fall back
'Mas John say tek me lan, tek me mule and tek me dray
Tek me married wife and me tree sweetheart away...'

   Sung by:-- implies a man

6. Dumplings

About someone whose dumplings go missing.
Janey and Sarah are asked if they have seen anyone pass who may have taken them.

   Sung by:-- probably a woman
7. Mangoes
About different kinds of mango. Sung by: unstated

8. Cerasee
About a mother and daughter. The daughter eats something poisonous and the mother gives her cerasee (a medicinal plant) Sung by: unstated

There are seven references to males; Zuzu, the boy that can eat in 'Jamaican Alphabet', Kenny the friend in 'Tantie Mary', the sweet man in 'Coconut Woman', the man who cracks the whip in 'Cane', Mas John in 'Dip an fall back' and the generic 'man' in 'Coconut Woman' and 'Dip an fall back'. There are eleven references to females although four of them are not positive characters they are spoken about as chattels of Mas John in 'Dip an fall back'; Tantie Mary the cherry seller, Coconut Woman the coconut water seller, a lady in 'Coconut Woman', the married wife and three sweethearts in 'Dip an fall back', Janey and Sarah in 'Dumpins', Mamma and Elena in 'Cerasee'.

Praise God together nos 9-13

9. Freedom
About someone who would rather 'go home to my Lord and be free' than be a slave. Sung by: unstated

10. Dip dem, Bedward
About a healer called Bedward Sung by: unstated

11. Zion, me wan go home
About going back to 'lan me father's home. Sung by: unstated

12. Rivers of Babylon
A freedom song.
'How can we sing King Alfa song in a strange land' and
'Sing a song of freedom sister
Sing a song of freedom brother' Sung by: unstated

13. Let us break bread together
Religious.
'Oh Lord, have mercy on me' and
'Let us praise God together on our knees' Sung by: unstated
There is one reference to the female in this section; the sister in 'Rivers of Babylon'. There are six references to males; Bedward in 'Dip dem Bedward', the father in 'Zion, me wan go home', King Alfa/Far I and the brother in 'Rivers of Babylon', Lord in 'Freedom' and 'Let us break bread together'.

Some a dem halla some a bawl nos 14-20

14. Chi-chi bud oh!
About a flock of birds.
'Some a lagga head ...An chickman chick..Some a John crow' and
'Him build him nest a low limb,
An never shoot him ah only adore him.' Sung by:- unstated

15. Tinga Layo!
About a donkey.
'Me donkey kick wid him two hind feet' Sung by:-unstated

16. Ol Mas Charlie
Whole song-
'Ol Mas Charlie
Him got a bulldog
Ina him back-yahd,
An when he get mad,
Chain have fe chain him,
Chain have fe chain him.' Sung by:- unstated

17. Humming -bird
About how a humming bird makes sounds Sung by:- unstatement

18. Ratta madan-law
About Ratta, who drops dead because he laughs so much at other's misfortunes. He was a 'Mongoose'.
'Ratta laugh, him laugh, him laugh
'Him tumble dung so dead' Sung by:- unstatement

19. Sly Mongoose
About a 'sly mongoose' who steal from Bedward and goes into his daughter's bedroom with a view to seduce her.
'Mongoose went up to Bedward daughter,
Ask her if he could have some water.
Bedward daughter say 'What's the matter?'
Sly Mongoose.

Mongoose get out a dollar and a quarter,
Slipped it to old Bedward daughter
Bedward daughter say, 'My lord and master!' Sly Mongoose

Bedward went up to see his daughter,
Found Mongoose playing with one garter,
Found Mongoose playing with one garter, Bedward hit him just where he oughter.' Sung by:-- unstated

20. Jackass wid him long tail

About a Jackass.

'No tease him, no worry him...no threaten him, no beat him...' etc. Sung by:-- unstated

Picture:-- a boy and a girl with a Jackass

There are two references to females; the mother in law in 'Ratta madan-law' and Bedward's daughter in 'Sly Mongoose'. There are fourteen references to males; chickman chick, John crow and docta bud ('him build him nest') in 'Chi-chi bud oh!', the donkey ('wid him two hind feet') in 'Tinga layo', Mas Charley and the bulldog ('he get mad') in 'Ol Mas Charlie', Ratta, the brother in law and the father in law in 'Ratta madan-law', the mongoose, Bedward and 'my lord and master' in 'Sly Mongoose', the Jackass and the boy in 'Jackass wid him long tail'.

Pull away, me boy 21-27

21. Good morning, Missa Potter

About a man (the singer) who goes to see Mr Potter to complain. 'Good morning, Missa Potter,

Good morning to yu, sah,

Come to lodge a complaint to yu now, sah,' Sung by:-- a man

22. Sammy dead oh

About how the 'grudgeful' killed Sammy.

'A no lie Sammy lie mek him dead oh! mm

But a grudgeful dem grudgeful kill Sammy, mm' Sung by:-- unstated

Picture:-- a man digging, watched by three other men

23. Hill an gully

About the countryside. Sung by:-- unstated

24. Pull away, me boy

About a ghost (Jumbie) who plays tricks. The singer entreats us to 'pull away me boy' in each chorus.

'Pull away me boy, pull away, me boy.

Jumbie tek all me money,

An he laugh after me' Sung by:-- unstated

25. Hosanna!

About building a house on sandy ground. Sung by:-- probably a man

Picture:-- a man

26. Bring me half a hoe- Angelina

About growing beans and someone telling Angelina to plant them.
27. Day oh!

About bananas and the tallyman who counts them before they are loaded. Sung by:- probably a man

There are two references to the female in this section; Mary Jane in 'Good morning Missa Potter' and Angelina in 'Bring me half a hoe-Angelina'. There are six references to the male; Missa Potter and the landlord in 'Good morning Missa Potter', Sammy in 'Sammy dead oh', the Jumbie ('he laugh') and me boy in 'Pull away me boy', the Tallyman in 'Day oh'. Although the singer is usually 'unstated', because of the nature of the work being described, for instance building a house and loading bananas most students thought that most of these songs, five of which are written in the first person, were written to be sung by men.

Dis long time, gal, me never see yu

28. Water come a me eye

About the loss of a girlfriend called Liza. 'When I think about my gal Liza
Water come a me eye
Come back Liza, come back girl' Sung by:- almost certainly a man

29. Under the coconut tree

About a betrothal under the coconut tree. 'Let's go under the coconut tree, darling
T'was there that you promised your love, darling' Sung by:- a man

30. Janey gal

About a girl called Janey. 'All dem bwoy a say, Janey gal,
A we no go bak-dam (lovers lane)' Sung by:- a man

Picture:- a girl and boy dancing

31. The Twelve Days of Christmas

Traditional, using language and dialect of the Caribbean Sung by:- unstated

32. Dis long time, gal

Love song about a girl. 'Peel head John Crow sid upon tree-top
Pick off de blossom,
Mek me hol your han, gal, mek me hol your han.' Sung by:- a man

There are three references to the female; Liza in 'Water come a me eye', Janey in 'Janey gal', the gal in 'Dis long time, gal'. There are five references to the male; the singer in 'Water come a me eye', the singer and dem bwoy in 'Janey gal', the singer and John Crow in 'Dis long time, gal'.
Come mek we dance an sing nos. 33-39

33. Christmas a come

About wanting presents and finery at Christmas.
'Pretty, pretty gal, me wan me lama,
Pretty, pretty gal, me wan me deggeday' Sung by:- probably a man

Picture:- boys and girls dancing

34. Sing and jump up for joy

In praise of Antigua. Sung by:- unstated

35. Charley Marley

A children's chanting song.
'...right tru de rocky road
Sing Charley Marley call yu' Sung by:- unstated

36. River to the bank, Covalley

Whole song-
'River to the bank, Covalley, (one)
Ah no, Covalley, (three)
Ah yes, Covalley,
Tek him put him down the alley.' Sung by:- unstated

Picture:- a girl and boy

37. Manuel Road

About rock breaking.
'Go down a Manuel Road, gal and bwoy,
Fe go bruk rock stone, gal and bwoy.' Sung by:- unstated

Picture:- a girl

38. Brown girl in the ring

A dance song.
'Then you wheel and take your partner, tra la la la la
For she like sugar and I like plum' Sung by:- almost certainly a man

39. Banyan tree

About dancing and singing under a banyan tree.
'Ladies mek curtsy, an gentlemen bow,
Me deh rock so, Yu deh rock so, under banyan tree'

Sung by:- probably a man

Picture:- a girl and boy dancing

There are five references to the female; pretty gal in 'Christmas a come', the gal in 'Charley Marley', the gal in Manuel Road', the girl in 'Brown girl in the ring', the ladies in 'Banyan tree'. There are six references to the male; the singer in 'Christmas a come', Charley Marley and any bwoy in 'Charley Marley', the bwoy in 'Manuel Road', the singer in 'Brown girl in the ring', the gentlemen in Banyan tree'.

Anancy, the magic spiderman nos 40-44

40. Anancy, the spiderman

About a spiderman who is frisky and greedy.
'Anancy is a spider, Anancy is a man...
Anancy is a trickster, he's sensitive to guile,
He sometimes can be like a very greedy Chile.'
Sung by:- unstated

41. Anancy, Monkey and Tiger

Monkey is caught by Tiger and is saved from being eaten by Anancy.
'Lord! Lord!
Hunger kill me dead oh!
Poor me boy' Sung by:- Tiger(a he), Anancy's friend

42. Anancy and Dora

Anancy kidnaps Dora, the beautiful daughter of Ma KayKay, an old widow.
Sung by:- Anancy the spider
Picture:- A spider with a man's head

43. How Monkey shame Anancy

Whole song-
'He's gone, he's gone,
He's gone to a silent home,
And forever, and forever,
Amen so let it be.' Sung by:- Anancy

44. Anancy and Fee Fee

Anancy disguises himself as a girl and wins a prize in the girls' foot race.
Sung by:- Anancy
Picture:- a boy carrying the 'prize'

There are two references to the female; Dora and Ma KayKay in 'Anancy and Dora'. There are nine references to the male; Anancy (a man) and the Englishman in 'Anancy the spiderman', Tiger (the singer), Lord, me boy and Monkey in 'Anancy, Monkey and Tiger', Anancy (the singer) in Anancy and Dora', Anancy (the singer) in 'How Monkey shame Anancy', Anancy (the singer) in 'Anancy and Fee Fee'.
MATERIAL REDACTED AT REQUEST OF UNIVERSITY
Appendix K
Some Notable Women Composers from Medieval to Modern Times

Medieval period

Hildegard von Bingen (1098-1179)
Countess Beatrice of Dia (c. 1140-1212)
Maria de Ventadorn (1165-1221)
Dame Costeloza (b. 1200)
Christine de Pisan (1363-1431)
Marie de Bourgogne (fl. 1450)

Renaissance

Maddalena Casulana (1540-1583)
Tarquinia Molza (1542-1617)
Raffaella Aleotti (b. 1570)
Vittoria Aleotti (b. 1575)

Baroque

Francesca Caccini (1587-1640)
Isabella Leonarda (1620-1704)
Barbara Strozzi (1619-1664)
Elisabeth-Claude Jaquet de la Guerre (1666-1729)
Antonia Bembo (c. 1670)
Anna Amalia, Princess of Prussia (1723-1787)
Elisabetta de Bambanini (1731-1764)

Classical

Anna Amalia, Duchess of Saxe-Weimar (1739-1807)
Marianne Martinez (1744-1812)
Corona Schroeter (1751-1802)
Maria Theresia von Paradis (1759-1824)
Amelie Julie Candeille (1767-1834)

Romantic

Louise Reichardt (1779-1826)
Maria Agatha Szymanowska (1789-1831)
Louise Farrenc (1804-1875)
Fanny Mendelssohn Hensel (1805-1847)
Josephine Lang (1815-1880)
Clara Schumann (1819-1896)
Painle Viardot-Garcia (1821-1910)
Ingeborg von Bronsart (1840-1880)
Louise Heritte-Viardot (1841-1919)
Augusta Mary Holmes (1847-1903)
Agathe Backer-Grondahl (1847-1907)
Cecile Chaminade (1857-1944)
Appendix K
Some Notable Women Composers from Medieval to Modern Times

Medieval period

Hildegard von Bingen (1098-1179)
Countess Beatrice of Dia (c.1140-1212)
Maria de Ventadorn (1165-1221)
Dame Costelloza (b.1200)
Christine de Pisan (1363-1431)
Marie de Bourgogne (fl.1450)

Renaissance

Maddalena Casulana (1540-1583)
Tarquinia Molza (1542-1617)
Raffaella Aleotti (b.1570)
Vittoria Aleotti (b.1575)

Baroque

Francesca Caccini (1587-1640)
Isabella Leonarda (1620-1704)
Barbara Strozzi (1619-1664)
Elisabeth-Claude Jaquet de la Guerre (1666-1729)
Antonia Bembo (c.1670)
Anna Amalia, Princess of Prussia (1723-1787)
Elisabetta de Bambanini (1731-1764)

Classical

Anna Amalia, Duchess of Saxe-Weimar (1739-1807)
Marianne Martinez (1744-1812)
Corona Schroeter (1751-1802)
Maria Theresia von Paradis (1759-1824)
Amelie Julie Candeille (1767-1834)

Romantic

Louise Reichardt (1779-1826)
Maria Agatha Szymanowska (1789-1831)
Louise Farrenc (1804-1875)
Fanny Mendelssohn Hensel (1805-1847)
Josephine Lang (1815-1880)
Clara Schumann (1819-1896)
Paline Viardot-Garcia (1821-1910)
Ingeborg von Bronsart (1840-1880)
Louise Heritte-Viardot (1841-1919)
Augusta Mary Holmes (1847-1903)
Agathe Backer-Grondahl (1847-1907)
Cecile Chaminade (1857-1944)
Modern (before 1900)

Ethel Smyth (1858-1944)
Amy Beach (1867-1944)
Mary Carr Moore (1873-1957)
Mabel Daniels (1878-1971)
Almer Mahler (1879-1964)
Irene Wieniawska Peldowski (1880-1932)
Mary Howe (1882-1964)
Rebecca Clarke (1886-1979)
Florence Prince (1888-1953)
Marian Bauer (1889-1955)
Germaine Tailleferre (1892-1983)
Lili Boulanger (1893-1918)

Modern (between 1900-1918)

Grazyna Bacewicz (1913-1983)
Miriam Gideon (b.1906)
Louise Talma (b.1906)
Julia Smith (b.1911)
Margaret Bonds (1913-1972)
Ruth Crawford Seeger (1901-1953)
Elisabeth Lutyens (1906-1933)
Vivian Fine (b.1913)
Peggy Glanville-Hicks (b.1912)