Mediating Tourism
An analysis of the image of the Caribbean in the UK national press

by

Marcella Elizabeth Daye

Submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

School of Management
University of Surrey

March 2004

© Marcella Elizabeth Daye 2004
ABSTRACT

Studies on tourism destination images have traditionally been based on the measurement of consumers’ cognitive images of destinations. Few have examined the images of destinations conveyed by media texts to determine how they are likely to influence consumer perceptions. Therefore the purpose of the study is to identify and to analyse mediated image constructs of Caribbean destinations and their holiday experiences in order to clarify their relationship to consumer responses. In pursuing this goal, this thesis examines how these images have been constructed in newspaper narratives to determine the meanings of these constructs and to interrogate the representational practices of the UK press of Caribbean destinations. A tripartite schema of landscape, local people and activities was identified as the main classification of mediated tourism destination images (TDI) and this framework was used to conduct content and discourse analyses of newspaper stories published on these destinations in the Sunday editions of the UK national newspapers in 2000. The findings of this study show a pattern of image constructs that featured the dominance of landscape attributes and recreational modes of seeing and experiencing Caribbean destinations. The prevalence and dominance of these stereotypes were demonstrated by the similarity of image constructs of the destinations across the various segments of the UK national newspapers. It was found that the shared news values and culture of the UK media reflect dominant epistemologies of Caribbean destinations in terms of the ‘Other’. However, it was argued that these stereotypical images lack symbolic resonance and appeal and as such may be reducing brand identity and competitiveness of these destinations as well as devaluing the Caribbean holiday experience. In proposing a tourism destination image media matrix as a heuristic model that links functional and enactive imagery to low elaboration/involvement responses and affective and holistic imagery to high elaboration/involvement, this study presents clarification on the role of mediated images as key determinants of consumer perceptions and responses.
AKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My thanks and appreciation are far weightier than expressed here and continues beyond these written statements.

Special thanks:-
To my principal supervisor, Professor Richard Butler for his incisive critiques, timely interventions and especially for his support during the tenuous and vulnerable periods I experienced in the preparation of this thesis.

To Dr Marion Bennett for facilitating a clear direction for the thesis at the beginning, and honing and refining it at the end.

To my family of friends with whom I prayed, partied and shared many laughs.

To my siblings who have never wavered for a moment in their commitment of care and love for ‘Babysister’ – I owe a lifetime of gratitude.

To my father, Noel Washington Daye, who initiated this academic path by investing such diligence in hunting for and buying all the texts on my primary school booklist.

To my mother, Violet Elizabeth Daye, who taught me the fear of the Lord and instructed me in the knowledge of the Holy; and who has bequeathed an enduing legacy of faith.

Above all, ceaseless thanks to my Heavenly Father; Who transforms traumas into triumphs, for hope deferred, gives Purpose; before Whom all impossibilities yield; the ‘Author and Finisher of my faith’.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE OF CONTENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT .............................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AKNOWLEDGEMENTS ...................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS .................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES .....................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF FIGURES ..................................................</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| CHAPTER .................................................................| 1 |
| INTRODUCTION ..........................................................| 1 |
| 1.1 BACKGROUND .......................................................| 1 |
| 1.2 Rationale for the Study .........................................| 2 |
| 1.3 Research goal ....................................................| 7 |
| 1.3.1 Central research question of study ........................| 7 |
| 1.4 Research Approach ...............................................| 8 |
| 1.5 Limitation/delimitation of study .............................| 8 |
| 1.7 Organisation of Thesis .........................................| 9 |
| PART II – INTRODUCING THE STUDY AREA – THE CARIBBEAN ....| 11 |
| 1.8 The Commonwealth Caribbean ...................................| 14 |
| 1.9 Destination image of Caribbean countries – implications of study for marketing directions | 17 |
| CONCLUSION .............................................................| 18 |

| CHAPTER 2 |
| FRAMING TOURISM DESTINATION IMAGE IN THE MEDIA | 19 |
| INTRODUCTION ..........................................................| 19 |
| 2.1 Establishing a framework for tourism and media research | 19 |
| 2.2 Exploring the link between the media and the tourist experience | 24 |
| 2.3 The role of image in mediating destination choice and the vacation experience | 25 |
| 2.4 Characteristics of Tourism Destination Image (TDI) studies | 29 |
| 2.5 Defining Tourism Destination Image | 32 |
| 2.6 Identifying key image constructs for the operationalisation and measurement | 32 |
2.7 Applying the communication model to TDI 39
2.8 Reader–response models – making a link from text to mind 42
2.9 The Role of Myths, Mythmaking and Fantasy in Tourism Imagery 45
2.10 Discourse, Praxis and Texts 48

CONCLUSION 51

CHAPTER 3 52
TOURISM REPRESENTATIONS AND THE CONSUMER 52

INTRODUCTION 52
3.1 Theories of the media and the transfer of meaning 52
3.2 The media ‘effects’ debate 54
3.3 The media and travel behaviour 56
3.4 The media and tourism experience at the destination 58
3.5 Popular culture, media and tourism 62
3.6 ‘Ways of Seeing, Travel Writing and the Guidebooks 64
3.7 Travel writing - fiction or factual narratives? 67
3.8 The reader of travel writing - Traveller or Tourist ? 70
3.9 A typology of tourist experiences 72
3.10 Landscape representations and constructing tourist destinations 75
3.11 Destination peoples in the tourist experience 75
3.12 Activities and the holiday experience 78
3.13 Postcolonial theory and tourism representation 79

CONCLUSION 81

CHAPTER 4 83
DESTINATION IMAGE CONSTRUCTS DISCUSSION 83

INTRODUCTION 83
4.1 Developing the destination image coding form 83
4.1.1 Image content 84
4.1.2 Form Variables -Coding identifier categories 86
4.1.3 Coding dates and Newspapers 87
4.1.4 Coding page numbers 87
4.1.5 Coding for gender of writer 88
4.1.6 Destination mentioned in headlines 90
4.1.7 Destination coding 90
8.5 Discussion of destination characteristics
8.6 Discussion of destination attribute constructs
8.7 Description and analysis of image attributes
8.8 Discussion of landscape image attributes
8.9 Discussion of image constructs of local people
8.10 Portrayal of leisure activities
8.11 Discussion of reader response and style constructs
8.12 Limitations of the study

CONCLUSION

CHAPTER 9
METHODOLOGY - DISCOURSE ANALYSIS
INTRODUCTION
9.1 Introducing discourse analysis
9.2 Varieties of discourse and discourse analysis
9.3 Applying discourse analysis to communication and media research
9.4 The linguistic turn and the quest for meaning
9.5 From language to 'messy texts'
9.6 The structure of media texts
9.7 Genres and rhetorical strategies
9.8 How to ‘do’ discourse analysis?
9.9 What makes discourse analysis different from other qualitative methods?
9.10 Doing discourse analysis
9.11 Selecting and collecting data
9.12 Sorting, coding and analysing data
9.13 Presenting the data
9.14 Validity and Reliability
9.15 Reflexivity
9.16 Benefits and limitations of using computer-aided qualitative software
9.17 Using NVivo for Discourse Analysis
9.18 Limitations of Discourse Analysis

CONCLUSION

CHAPTER 10
FINDINGS & ANALYSIS – DISCOURSE ANALYSIS
INTRODUCTION
10.1 Colonial discourse and images of the Caribbean
10.2 Images of the ideal Caribbean holiday—deconstructing the stereotype
10.3 Of smiling hosts and their guests
10.4 Differentiating Caribbean destinations
   10.4.1 Highlighting differentiation strategies in travel texts
   10.4.2 Marketing implications of destination image differentiation
10.5 Differentiating image constructs by textual characteristics
10.6 Introducing the Tourism Destination Image Media Matrix
   10.6.1 Functional Destination Imagery
   10.6.2 Enactive Destination Imagery
   10.6.3 Holistic Destination Imagery
   10.6.4 Affective Destination Imagery

PART 11 'WORLDS APART': THE CARIBBEAN AND BRITISH NEWS CULTURE
10.7 Political representations of the Caribbean, the compliant position
10.8 Crime Reporting – the conflict position
10.9 Reggae rhythms – the celebratory position
10.10 Explaining the rhetorical structure of news stories in relation to organic images

PART 111 - A SYNTHESIS OF THE FINDINGS
10.11 Key findings on the nature of destination image constructs

CONCLUSION

CHAPTER 11
CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

INTRODUCTION
11.1 The research agenda
11.2 A summary of the findings
11.3 Limitations of the study
11.4 Contributions of this study to tourism research

PART 11 - RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH
11.5 The case for academic research on media influence and tourism destination images
   11.5.1 Research imperative for TDI matrix
   11.5.2 Interrogating existing epistemologies of Caribbean destinations
11.6 Specific recommendations for tourism research on the Caribbean and for the marketing of these destinations 304

11.6.1 Specific recommendations for marketing and media relations practices in the Caribbean 306

11.7 A Caribbean coda 309

11.8 Postscript 309

CONCLUSION 310

BIBLIOGRAPHY 311

APPENDIX 1 Map of the Caribbean
APPENDIX 2 Destination Image Codebook
APPENDIX 3 Destination Image Coding Form
APPENDIX 4 Pilot Test Coding Form
APPENDIX 5 ‘Escape: Caribbean Special: Grenada’
APPENDIX 6 ‘Barbados’
APPENDIX 7 ‘Cool luxury: St. Lucia’
APPENDIX 8 ‘EU halts rice mills : Turks & Caicos Islands’
APPENDIX 9 ‘Britain to legalise gay sex : Overseas Territories’
APPENDIX 10 ‘Police take Yardie battle to Jamaica’
APPENDIX 11 ‘Simpleton framed: the Bahamas’
APPENDIX 12 ‘Getting back to their roots: Jamaica’

CD – Sample of newspaper articles used in study
LIST OF TABLES

TABLE 1.1 TOURIST ARRIVALS TO THE CARIBBEAN BY MAIN MARKETS 13
TABLE 1.2 TOURIST ARRIVALS IN THE COMMONWEALTH CARIBBEAN 14
TABLE 1.3 TOURIST ARRIVALS FROM THE UK TO THE COMMONWEALTH CARIBBEAN 16
TABLE 2.1 A FRAMEWORK FOR THE STUDY OF TRAVEL JOURNALISM (FURSICH & KAVOORI) 21
TABLE 2.2 A FRAMEWORK FOR MEDIA ANALYSIS IN TOURISM RESEARCH 23
TABLE 5.1 SUNDAY NATIONAL NEWSPAPERS, THEIR OWNERS AND THEIR POLITICS 108
TABLE 5.2 VOTING PREFERENCES OF NATIONAL NEWSPAPER READERS 108
TABLE 5.3 SUNDAY NATIONAL NEWSPAPER DECEMBER 2000-DECEMBER 111
TABLE 6.1 CONTRASTING PARADIGMATIC POSITIONS OF POSITIVISM AND CONSTRUCTIVISM 131
TABLE 6.2 TYPES OF INSTRUMENTAL METHOD COMBINATION 134
TABLE 6.3 ADVANTAGES AND DISADVANTAGES OF METHODOLOGICAL TRIANGULATION 138
TABLE 7.1 DEFINITIONS OF CONTENT ANALYSIS SUPPORTING INFERENCES 159
TABLE 8.1 PERCENTAGES AND INTERCODER RELIABILITY FOR VARIABLES 184
TABLE 8.2 DIFFERENCE OF COVERAGE BETWEEN NEWS AND TRAVEL STORY 187
TABLE 8.3 DIFFERENCE IN LEVEL OF COVERAGE OF HARD AND SOFT NEWS STORIES 188
TABLE 8.4 TOP PAGE NUMBERS OF VARIOUS SUBJECTS OF STORIES IN NEWSPAPERS 189
TABLE 8.5 DESTINATION FOCUS OF ARTICLES 192
TABLE 8.6 LEVEL OF REPRESENTATIONS OF LOCAL PEOPLE ATTRIBUTES IN STORIES 204
TABLE 8.7 REPRESENTATION OF DESTINATION PEOPLES IN NEWS AND TRAVEL STORIES 205
TABLE 8.8 MODES OF ADDRESS IN NEWSPAPERS 208
TABLE 10.1 MAIN IMAGE CONSTRUCTS OF CARIBBEAN DESTINATIONS 264
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FIGURE</th>
<th>DESCRIPTION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>DIAGRAMMATIC REPRESENTATION OF DESTINATION IMAGE STUDY IN THE MEDIA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>THE ATTRIBUTE/HOLISTIC AND FUNCTIONAL/PSYCHOLOGICAL COMPONENTS OF DESTINATION IMAGE (JAMAICA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>DIFFERENT MEDIA FIELDS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>CENTRALITY MODEL OF COMMUNICATION CONTENT TAKEN FROM RIFFE, LACY, ET AL. (1998)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>LEVEL OF COVERAGE OF CARIBBEAN STORIES IN SUNDAY NEWSPAPERS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>GENDER OF WRITER OF NEWS AND TRAVEL STORIES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>LEVEL OF DESTINATION MENTION IN HEADLINES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>TYPE OF STORIES ON CARIBBEAN DESTINATIONS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>LEVEL OF REPRESENTATION OF TOPICS OF ARTICLES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>PEOPLE IMAGES IN ARTICLES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>SUBJECTS COVERED IN SUNDAY NEWSPAPER ARTICLES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>PHYSICAL LANDSCAPE ATTRIBUTES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>LANDSCAPE PSYCHOLOGICAL ATTRIBUTES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.10</td>
<td>FREQUENCY OF MENTION OF LOCAL PEOPLE IN ARTICLES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.11</td>
<td>COMPARATIVE FREQUENCIES OF POSITIVE AND NEGATIVE PEOPLE ATTRIBUTES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.12</td>
<td>LEVEL OF HOLIDAY ACTIVITIES IN STORIES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.13</td>
<td>GENRE CONVENTION IN TRAVEL STORIES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.14</td>
<td>READER POSITIONING IN THE TRAVEL PRESS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.15</td>
<td>BENEFITS FOR READER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.16</td>
<td>SPONSOR/COMPANY IDENTIFICATION IN TRAVEL STORIES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>DIFFERENT APPROACHES TO DISCOURSE ANALYSIS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>TDI MEDIA MATRIX</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION

1.1 BACKGROUND
The ubiquity of the media is such that few areas of human or social life are immune from its operations and influences. As a global phenomenon, tourism is particularly vulnerable, even dependent, on the media to generate, sustain and convey images of the tourism experience to mass audiences. However, although the relationship between tourism and the media remains relatively under-researched, there has been a longstanding academic interest on how the media shape tourists’ perceptions of destinations as well as their travel decisions and behaviour.

With respect to the media’s role in destination image formation, one of the earliest research enquiries was conducted by (Ehemann, 1977) who investigated the image of the Republic of Ireland in the American media. Ehemann’s stated research aim was ‘to determine what sort of image of the country a person is likely to glean from the printed news media’. The research questions addressed by her study were

1. What evaluative image do the printed media seem to convey?
2. Do different types of articles seem loaded with evaluation terminology that would sway the reader toward a particular sort of evaluation conclusion about a place?
3. What sort of image would a person formulate based on the media as he tries to come to grips with a country he has never seen?

In operationalising this research, Ehemann included a sample of news-oriented articles, general-interest articles and travel guide articles for the period January 1974 to March 1975, and January 1976 to March 1977. The articles were analysed to indicate the negative or positive nature of the messages for the three types of articles. The findings pointed to a high level of negatively oriented messages in both the news article and general interest article categories, while travel articles were more positive.
As an exploratory investigation, Ehemann’s study is particularly significant in establishing a novel approach for destination image research based on the analysis of media texts, specifically, print articles. Furthermore, by distinguishing between types of articles, such as hard news, general interest and travel stories, the study accounts for both organic and induced images of the destination (Gunn, 1972). Ehemann’s study therefore represents an attempt to measure the image of a destination using media articles as the subject of enquiry rather than individuals.

1.2 Rationale for the Study

This study proposes that Ehemann’s (1977) questions remain relevant and pertinent in determining the nature of tourism destination image within the printed media. Hence, it follows on this earlier research focus of assessing tourism destination image in the media by means of textual analysis. The rationale for this study is therefore based on an attempt to clarify how tourism destination images (TDI) of the Caribbean are constituted in the printed media, and to determine how these may be evaluated in terms of the representations, impressions, meanings and perceptions that are portrayed of destination and the tourist experience.

However, a limitation of Ehemann’s study was that it did not present a clear definition for the measurement and evaluation of negative or positive features of the newspaper articles. The coding of the articles as positive or negative appeared to be at the discretion of the examiner/reader of the articles. In this regard the reliability of the study is questionable. This means that the study did not present an objective set of indicators that could be applied to the newspaper articles that could be measured to indicate the overall image presented. As such, the negative or positive characteristics of the articles were not clearly defined as message characteristics that could be validated across various studies on newspaper articles.

Dilley (1986) also investigated the images of destinations presented in the messages and images of travel brochures. His main intent was to determine the pattern of image constructs based on the measurement of attributes that were presented in the articles. He used content analysis to identify and measure the level of attributes that were associated with various destinations and this was used to determine those attributes.
that were mainly used to describe and define the destinations and their holiday experiences. The significance of Dilley’s study is that it demonstrated an objective approach to the measurement of TDI constructs within texts and in producing a set of variables or image constructs that could be validly applied across various studies.

However, Dilley’s main aim was to objectively measure the level of image attributes presented in the brochures of the destinations in his study sample. Unlike Ehemann, he was not attempting to determine the persuasive features of these brochures in order to determine those message characteristics of the brochures that would lead to particular images or evaluations of the destination. Ehemann’s interest on evaluation terminology was therefore not operationalised in Dilley’s study of mediated destination images in brochures.

Therefore, the question raised by Ehemann of operationalising and determining the evaluative images conveyed by the printed media or via mediated messages has not yet been addressed in the TDI literature. A lack of clarity remains as to how mediated destination images work in influencing ‘readers toward a particular sort of evaluation or conclusion about a place’ (Ehemann, 1997).

Apart from Ehemann and Dilley approach in determining TDI images from texts, the traditional approach to TDI measurement has been to measure the cognitive perceptions and impressions of consumers based on a set of destination attributes (Gallarza, Saura, et al. 2002). TDI measurement is often conducted in such studies to determine the prevalence of attributes that best defines the image of the destination. The image of a destinations held by various target groups could therefore be determined by establishing the pattern of correlation between destination attributes and demographic variables of respondents.

But while such consumer based studies are able to match the image attributes of destinations to consumer responses, similar inferences cannot be made solely on texts. This is because the measurement of image constructs of texts is not sufficient to make direct inferences on the general perceptions and images of destinations held by consumers. Therefore it is not possible to make valid conclusions from texts to consumer perceptions and attitudes by only measuring image attributes of destinations.
as was done by Dilley (1976) in his study on the brochures. Consequently what is needed is an understanding on the extent to which TDI can be analysed textually to establish likely consumer responses.

In their study on TDI, Echtner & Ritchie (1993) differentiated types of destination images as functional images and more psychological holistic images. Their research indicated that functional TDI images were descriptive and were comprised mainly of the physical attributes of destinations. Holistic images by contrast consisted of more psychological and affective attributes that individuals associated with the destinations. According to Echtner & Ritchie, TDI was made up of both functional and holistic images that constituted the overall global impression that the individual held of the destination.

Echtner & Ritchie’s work has been significant in distinguishing features of TDI constructs that could be applied textually to determine the types of and levels of image constructs presented in texts. However, they did not extend this differentiation between TDI constructs to varied consumer responses. So although the Echtner & Ritchie framework shows that TDI constructs work at different cognitive levels, it does not clarify how these cognitive levels may relate to consumer responses whether at the high or low involvement level.

It may be concluded that the extant literature on TDI studies has not established a link between types of images and responses of consumers. However, image and brand studies within consumer behaviour have established links between consumer responses and message stimuli. Such studies have theorised that functional product attributes with low symbolic appeals are mainly associated with a lesser-involved consumer. On the other hand, products with symbolic meaning and differentiated value tend to produce a distinct brand image and a more involved consumer. This means that consumers tend to establish brand positioning more on the basis of symbolic, attributed characteristics than on the basis of intrinsic, functional product characteristics (Poiesz, 1989:461).

This theoretical differentiation was therefore used as a basis in this study to infer consumer responses to the various types of destination images identified in the text.
This is an attempt to address the gap in the literature following from Echtner & Richie's differentiation between functional and holistic images in terms of likely consumer responses. Consequently, this study engages in the measurement and the discursive analysis of the various types of image constructs in order to assess how they may relate to consumer responses.

However, TDI constructs are mainly relevant to travel articles, but since this study also incorporates news stories there is also the need to account for the persuasive features of news stories. Other than identifying that organic images are produced by news stories as more credible than induced images that are based on destination advertising and promotion, TDI studies do not clarify how news stories may relate to the formation of destination images. Therefore in order to determine how mediated images may or may not shape images of destinations, and how they can be used to determine consumers responses, there was a need identify the textual features of mediated images that may be used to make valid inferences on their likely effects.

Consequently, theories that clarified the persuasive features of texts in terms of likely consumer responses were drawn into this study in order to make the link from text to mind. Reader response theory and as well as models on symbolic consumption within the field of consumer behaviour were integrated into this study to locate those features of texts may be used to establish a bridge from text to mind (McQuarrie & Mick 1996; Mick 1986; Scott 1994; Stern 1988).

This study therefore seeks to address gaps in the literature on TDI in terms of the operationalisation of the analysis of media texts as a means of determining destination images. It also seeks to add to the literature in clarifying how differentiated destination images may be used to infer to likely impressions and involvement responses of readers. This enquiry therefore addresses the wider issues of the relationship between the media and tourism as it explores the influence of the media on tourist perception and behaviour. In so doing, this study widens the scope of existing studies on tourism destination image by clarifying how mediated messages on destinations may shape how destinations are represented and perceived.
The main research enquiries of this study are operationalised with an assessment of the image of the countries of the Commonwealth Caribbean based on both travel stories and generic news articles on these destinations that were placed in the Sunday editions of national newspapers in the United Kingdom in the year 2000. Specifically, Echtner & Ritchie's (1993) tourism destination image framework for image assessment, comprising the measurement of both functional and holistic images has been adopted in this research. This measurement is conducted using the content analysis method in order to conduct an empirical analysis of the image constructs. An analysis of the meanings of the image constructs is also undertaken in an attempt to determine how they relate to the tourist experience.

The examination of the signifying and representational practices of the UK media was conducted using discourse analysis in order to determine how the meanings of image constructs are produced reproduced and shaped by the media. The various image constructs of texts were therefore discursively analysed in order to determine how attributed symbolic meanings of Caribbean destinations were ascribed and valorised. Postcolonial theory that challenges the normative practices of representations of the Other, provided the framework to interrogate and analyse the bases on which attributed symbolic meanings, attribution of value and worth in the representations of destinations were made in the newspaper articles.

Destination image analysis provides the means of assessing the image of the destination in the market and to inform strategies on how to improve the destination's competitive position (Gartner, 1993; 1996; Chen & Uysal, 2002). This study therefore examines the images of the Commonwealth Caribbean in the UK press in order to assess the global images and impression conveyed by this medium of the region. It also examines how TDI images may be used to determine and evaluate the competitiveness as well as the brand distinctiveness of these destinations conveyed by the UK press. By focussing on newspaper texts, this study examines both the organic and induced images that occur within the press, and probes into how these destination images of the Caribbean may be created, confirmed, reinforced or resisted in news stories and travel accounts of the destinations.
1.3 **Research goal**

The research goal for the study is to define and analyse the image of the Commonwealth Caribbean in the UK national press.

This goal is addressed in the following research questions:

❖ What are the image constructs of the Commonwealth Caribbean holiday experience in the UK press?
❖ What are the news media images of the Commonwealth Caribbean?
❖ What are the meanings of these image constructs?

These research questions were answered in terms of the stated objectives of the study detailed below:

❖ To identify and assess the image patterns of the Commonwealth Caribbean destinations in the UK press
❖ To determine the most common image attributes of the Commonwealth Caribbean holiday experience
❖ To assess the relative frequencies and types of stories on the Commonwealth Caribbean occurring in the press
❖ To determine differences in the types of image constructs across the various newspapers

1.3.1 **Central research question of study**

Since this study also seeks to determine the persuasive appeals of the destination image constructs of the Caribbean in the newspaper, it was therefore necessary to include likely consumer responses of these images in the overall research enquiry. The various research strands of this enquiry are therefore addressed in the central research question:-

**Do mediated destination images of the Caribbean have particular characteristics that relate to consumer responses?**
1.4 Research Approach
This study utilises textual analysis to conduct the investigation of the destination image of the Commonwealth Caribbean in the UK press. It employs both quantitative and qualitative methods in the operationalisation of the research. The specific methods chosen for this study are content analysis and discourse analysis to facilitate both an empirical and critical assessment of the image constructs of the region presented in newspaper narratives. The sample for the study covers all the articles on the eighteen countries of the Commonwealth Caribbean that were published in the Sunday editions of the nine national newspapers in the UK for the year 2000.

1.5 Limitation/delimitation of study
This study uses discourse analysis as a method to clarify the meanings of the destination image constructs. However, this is not the only the goal of the study and so this enquiry is not delimited to only producing an analysis on power knowledge discourses as they are constituted and organised in texts and signifying practices of the UK press of Caribbean destinations.

Instead, discourse analysis is used as method in this study to determine how meaning is ascribed and constructed to convey established epistemologies of Caribbean destinations and their travel experiences. It therefore uses discourse analysis as tool to clarify how mediated texts on destination image are discursively organised and constructed to legitimate particular orientations and 'stereotypical and accepted views' of destinations. These meanings and interpretations derived from the discursive analysis of these texts are considered in terms of how they ascribe value to destinations' attributes as well as preferred holiday experiences.

It is also important to delineate the boundaries of this study in terms of media effects or influence. It is not the intent of this study to establish a correlation between image constructs and consumer responses. It is also not the goal of this study to test for media effects of image constructs of texts to infer the 'inevitable shaping of readers views' (Deacon, Pickering, et al. 1999). The claims for media influence made in this study is in terms of the message characteristics, this is, how their discursive formations and rhetorical organisation produce meaning that when decoded may be
deemed to have an effect. According to Hall (1994) these set of 'meanings may influence, entertain, instruct, or persuade with very complex perceptual, cognitive and emotional, ideological or behavioural consequences'.

TDI images are important indicators of the value that is ascribed to the destination. In terms of consumers, they indicate the likely choice of a vacation destination. In other words TDI constructs can attest to how consumers attribute value. However since media texts are powerful sites for production and consumption of representational images of destinations, they are also important indicators of how image attributes are constructed and valorised. It is the nature of the signification of worth and the differentiation of value as they are constructed in text that are key moments for understanding how image constructs relate to destination image. The aim of this study is to therefore locate those message characteristics and discursive formations that account for the ascription and the valorisation of preferred attributes. In this respect, the meaning of TDI constructs are evaluated for the extent of their influence in terms of level of symbolic meanings that they evoke.

1.7 Organisation of Thesis
This thesis is presented in the following eleven chapters and is summarised below:

Chapter 1 presents the Introduction that establishes the aim and rationale for the research and presents the overall structure of the study. It locates the study’s main research goals to clarify the nature and meanings of mediated destination images and the discursive formations of tourism representations in relation to overall consumer perceptions of destinations. Part II of this chapter also introduces the study area of the Commonwealth Caribbean with a review of the main tourism performance indicators of the region.

Chapter 2 is Framing Tourism Destination Image in the Media which discusses the research framework for the study by outlining the various disciplinary strands and theories from the literature that have been integrated to inform and clarify the research question and agenda. The chapter also critiques the concept of tourism destination image in terms of the image formation and destination selection process.
Chapter 3 - Tourism Representations and the Consumer examines the power of the media to signify and impose ways of seeing and experiencing the region. This chapter proposes three main strands or a tripartite schema for tourism destination images which are landscape images, representations of local people and holiday activities.

Chapter 4 - Destination Image Constructs Discussion presents the rationale for the categories and variable construct selection used in the content analysis. It reviews how the variables used in the coding form were applied in past research and explains how they specifically relate to this research enquiry.

Chapter 5 – The Newspaper Landscape in the UK examines the polarity of the UK national newspaper press across readership segments. It examines the features of the three categories of the upmarket broadsheets, middle market tabloids and downmarket mass tabloids. The manifest differences that delineate the various newspapers and the similarities of their news values and culture are also discussed in this chapter.

Chapter 6 - Quantitative and Qualitative Research Methods is a critical review of the philosophical and theoretical foundations of quantitative and qualitative research methods. It seeks to clarify the epistemological and ontological assumptions of the research traditions and how their application addresses the research goals of this study.

Chapter 7 – Content Analysis critiques the method in determining message content and how these can be used to make inferences to the sender and the receiver of the messages. It also explains fundamental principles of the method such as intercoder reliability as well as human versus computer coding. Issues of sampling, validity and the reliability of the study are also discussed.

Chapter 8 presents the Findings & Analysis of the Content Analysis with a discussion of the results of the coding exercise by reviewing the pattern and frequencies of the image constructs. In this chapter, the relative frequencies of various image constructs are analysed to assess the overall image of the Caribbean destinations in the sample. The results of the intercoder reliability tests are also presented in this discussion.
Chapter 9 on Discourse Analysis examines the case of the method as way of determining social meanings as constructed by discourse. It charts the challenges of the application of the method noting its lack of standardisation and unfamiliarity in the academic research community. However, it also elucidates the utility of the method as a critical tool for textual analysis.

Chapter 10 on the Findings & Analysis of Discourse Analysis discusses how representations of the Caribbean have been constructed in terms of dominant discourses that prescribe preferred holiday experiences. It also reviews how prevailing newspaper practices reflect similar news values across newspaper types. This chapter concludes with a synthesis of the findings of the content and discourse analyses and discusses these outcomes in terms of the overall research goals of the study.

Chapter 11 – Conclusions and Recommendations - This chapter highlights the key findings of the study. It outlines the specific contribution of this research to destination image studies in particular, and the relationship between the media and tourism in general. The chapter also presents suggestions for future research on the role of mediated messages in the formation of tourism destination images.

Part II – Introducing the study area – The Caribbean

The Caribbean archipelago comprises some 34 nation states including islands located in the Caribbean Sea, the Atlantic Ocean, as well as countries on mainland South and Central America. The Caribbean Tourism Organisation (CTO) spatially defines the Caribbean as territories between the south of Florida in the USA; Cancun, in Mexico; Belize in Central America; Venezuela and Suriname in South America as well as the islands of Bahamas and Bermuda located in the Atlantic Ocean.

With a population count of some 60 million, the region is a polyglot of English, French, Spanish and Dutch speaking countries that all share the common history of European colonisation. Notwithstanding their spatial proximity and shared historical experiences, the countries of the region represent a differing array of size, population, culture and landscapes (Jayawardena 2002:88). Whether to a greater or lesser extent,
most countries of the region are dependent on tourism as an engine of economic growth. Poon (2000:143) observes that the Caribbean is one of the most ‘tourism dependent economies in the world, with tourism accounting for nearly one-third of all regional exports’.

Tourism emerges as an attractive economic activity for the developing countries of the region because of its potential to foster GDP growth, to create employment, increase foreign exchange earnings and attract capital investment. According to the World Travel and Tourism Council (WTTC 2002), Caribbean tourism contributes some 17% to regional GDP, 14.1% to overall employment, 18.5% to total foreign exchange earnings and 21.3% in regional capital investment. Between 1996 and 2000, the industry grew by 32% totalling some US$ 19,881.1 million in 2000. This places the Caribbean 6th in the world in overall tourism receipts (Jayawardena & Ramajeesingh 2003: 176).

Up to the year 2000, the Caribbean attracted some 3% of world tourist arrivals. According to the CTO (2000:21), stopover arrivals to the Caribbean grew by 58.4% between 1990 and 2000 or at an average annual rate of 4.7% which was a slightly faster rate than the international growth rate. The Caribbean’s rate of growth placed the region second only to Europe which had an annual growth rate of 9.1%, and ahead of Canada at 3.9% and the United States at 3.2%. Cruise passenger arrivals also grew steadily with an average increase of 6.5% between 1990 and 2000.

These tourism indicators show the success of the industry in the region but also underscore the over-dependence of many of the destinations on the fortunes of the industry. As open, dependent economies with a limited export focus, these countries rely on tourism as a lead sector to stimulate growth and development (McDavid & Ramajeesingh 2003:180). Although tourism is the fastest growing sector in the region, the high level of income leakage ranging from between 25% in Antigua & Barbuda, 40% in Jamaica and 56% in St. Lucia means that a significant portion of earnings is lost to the region’s domestic economies.

Furthermore, most economies are not able to maximise the benefits of their tourism earnings due to weak inter-sectoral links and limited economic diversification.
(Jayawardena & Ramajeesingh 2003:177). This means that in spite of the success of the industry, the structural weaknesses of these economies persist. This limits their ability to harness the potential of the industry through economic linkages to primary sectors such as agriculture and agri-business. The particular vulnerability of the region’s tourism industry was underlined in the aftermath of the September 11 disaster in the United States. According to CTO statistics, tourist arrivals fell by 4% overall with a decline of 18.8% in the last four months in comparison the previous year. The European market which is the fastest growing segment to the region since the 1980’s, dropped by 1.6% in 2001 over 2000.

The Caribbean relies heavily on the neighbouring North American mainland for tourist traffic which is the main market for the region. However, the UK and wider Europe represent a potential growth market for the Caribbean. As Table 1.1 shows, the American market is the mainstay of the region’s tourism industry.

Table 1.1 Tourist arrivals to the Caribbean by main markets (000)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>United States</td>
<td>8,705.4</td>
<td>9,113.2</td>
<td>9,350.4</td>
<td>9,427.9</td>
<td>10,117.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>932.3</td>
<td>983.7</td>
<td>1,050.6</td>
<td>1,074.5</td>
<td>1,233.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Europe</td>
<td>4,126.8</td>
<td>4,494.4</td>
<td>4,775.3</td>
<td>5,097.8</td>
<td>5,254.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caribbean</td>
<td>1,106.9</td>
<td>1,159.5</td>
<td>1,237.0</td>
<td>1,321.4</td>
<td>1,408.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other/Unspecified</td>
<td>1,822.4</td>
<td>2,041.2</td>
<td>2,047.7</td>
<td>2,135.7</td>
<td>2,295.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Europe is placed as the second major market for the Caribbean accounting for almost half of total arrivals compared to the total from the United States. However, European tourists are considered profitable accounting for a higher share of the total bednights spent by tourists vacationing in the region since they usually stay longer than visitors from the US (CTO, 2000). Still, as long haul destinations in Europe, the Caribbean faces the imperative of maximising their competitive position in the wake of increasing competition from areas such as the Asia-Pacific and the former Eastern bloc countries (Poon 2000:143). Intra regional competition is also heating up for Europe, particularly the UK market. In spite of their apparent natural advantage in the
UK market, the English speaking destinations of the region are facing fierce competition from Spanish speaking countries such as Dominica Republic and Cuba.

1.8 The Commonwealth Caribbean

The specific focus of this study is on the English speaking territories as a distinct grouping of countries within the Caribbean that share common political, social and economies ties with the United Kingdom. The English speaking countries of the region, also referred to as the Commonwealth Caribbean or British West Indies, represents some 18 nation states. Today, the former British colonies in the region, as well as smaller territories currently under British rule known as overseas territories still maintain political and economic ties with the United Kingdom in spite of the dominance of the United States in the region. As a subgroup in the region, countries of the Commonwealth Caribbean have performed creditably in terms of visitor arrivals. Table 1.2 below shows, there was an increase of 2.7% growth in total arrivals to the Commonwealth Caribbean between 1999 and 2000.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Destination</th>
<th>1999</th>
<th>2000</th>
<th>%Change 2000/99</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Commonwealth Caribbean</td>
<td>6,017.9</td>
<td>6,182.5</td>
<td>2.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anguilla</td>
<td>46.8</td>
<td>43.8</td>
<td>-6.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antigua &amp; Barbuda</td>
<td>239.6</td>
<td>236.7</td>
<td>-1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bahamas</td>
<td>1,577.1</td>
<td>1,596.2</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barbados</td>
<td>517.9</td>
<td>544.7</td>
<td>5.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belize</td>
<td>180.8</td>
<td>195.6</td>
<td>8.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bermuda</td>
<td>354</td>
<td>328.3</td>
<td>-7.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>British Virgin Islands</td>
<td>285.9</td>
<td>281.1</td>
<td>-1.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cayman Islands</td>
<td>394.5</td>
<td>354.1</td>
<td>-1.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dominica</td>
<td>73.5</td>
<td>69.6</td>
<td>-5.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grenada</td>
<td>125.3</td>
<td>128.9</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guyana</td>
<td>74.9</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>40.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>1996</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jamaica</td>
<td>1,248.4</td>
<td>1,322.7</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montserrat</td>
<td>9.9</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Kitts &amp; Nevis</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>73.1</td>
<td>-13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Lucia</td>
<td>260.6</td>
<td>269.9</td>
<td>3.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Vincent &amp; the Grenadines</td>
<td>68.3</td>
<td>72.9</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trinidad &amp; Tobago</td>
<td>358.8</td>
<td>398.2</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turks &amp; Caicos Islands</td>
<td>117.6</td>
<td>151.4</td>
<td>28.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


The Commonwealth Caribbean accounted for 27.7% of all tourists to the region in 1996 and some 24.8% in 2000. However, the Hispanic Caribbean comprising Cuba, Dominican Republic, the Mexican Caribbean destinations of Cancun and Cozumel and Puerto Rico accounted for some half of all tourist arrivals in 2000. According to the Caribbean Statistical Report, destinations of the Hispanic Caribbean are gaining market share in Europe, with appreciable growth in arrivals from the UK and Germany. Between 1999 and 2000, there was a significant growth of UK visitors to Cancun and Cuba. Leading markets for the UK such as Barbados, Jamaica and St. Lucia showed modest, yet steady growth in arrivals between 1999 and 2000 at 11.7%, 8.3% and 3.3% respectively. However, the island of Barbados is the number one destination for the UK market in the Caribbean, accounting for the largest share of arrivals at a commanding 19.5% of total arrivals to the region.

Statistics from the CTO show that European tourists tend to visit Caribbean destinations with which they share historical links and common languages. In 2000, 60% of all visitors from the United Kingdom visited destinations in the Commonwealth Caribbean.
### Table 1.3 Tourist arrivals from the UK to the Commonwealth Caribbean (000)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Anguilla</td>
<td>2,552</td>
<td>2,880</td>
<td>2,738</td>
<td>2,703</td>
<td>2,786</td>
<td>3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antigua &amp; Barbuda</td>
<td>50,417</td>
<td>57,737</td>
<td>57,500</td>
<td>71,313</td>
<td>74,957</td>
<td>5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bahamas</td>
<td>45,885</td>
<td>55,500</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>na</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barbados</td>
<td>139,588</td>
<td>155,986</td>
<td>186,690</td>
<td>202,959</td>
<td>226,787</td>
<td>11.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belize</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>8,007</td>
<td>na</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bermuda</td>
<td>22,876</td>
<td>24,302</td>
<td>30,379</td>
<td>28,137</td>
<td>2.1b</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>British Virgin Islands</td>
<td>10,139</td>
<td>10,673</td>
<td>13,018</td>
<td>15,597</td>
<td>17,456</td>
<td>11.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cayman Islands</td>
<td>22,180</td>
<td>21,704</td>
<td>23,895</td>
<td>23,422</td>
<td>16,174</td>
<td>na</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dominica</td>
<td>4,621</td>
<td>5,408</td>
<td>5,577</td>
<td>6,663</td>
<td>5,921</td>
<td>-11.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grenada</td>
<td>19,538</td>
<td>21,350</td>
<td>23,311</td>
<td>26,234</td>
<td>32,236</td>
<td>22.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guyana</td>
<td>4,777</td>
<td>4,410</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>na</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jamaica</td>
<td>114,417</td>
<td>116,390</td>
<td>116,552</td>
<td>124,930</td>
<td>135,338</td>
<td>8.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montserrat</td>
<td>1,464</td>
<td>964</td>
<td>1,403</td>
<td>2,178</td>
<td>2,592</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Kitts &amp; Nevis</td>
<td>9,092</td>
<td>9,938</td>
<td>12,847</td>
<td>13,163</td>
<td>12,841</td>
<td>-2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Lucia</td>
<td>50,393</td>
<td>59,592</td>
<td>63,160</td>
<td>71,108</td>
<td>73,433</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Vincent &amp; the Grenadines</td>
<td>8,632</td>
<td>9,370</td>
<td>11,984</td>
<td>20,345</td>
<td>12,849</td>
<td>-36.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trinidad &amp; Tobago</td>
<td>27,960</td>
<td>38,413</td>
<td>47,760</td>
<td>49,812</td>
<td>52,138</td>
<td>4.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turks &amp; Caicos Islands</td>
<td>1,899</td>
<td>2,363</td>
<td>2,175</td>
<td>3,622</td>
<td>4,737</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


**na** – Not available

Apart from a significant decline in UK arrivals for the islands of St.Vincent & the Grenadines and Dominica at -36.9% and -11.1% respectively, Table 1.3 shows that there has been relatively steady growth in visitors to the UK to the Commonwealth Caribbean over the period 1996-2000. However, there are clear challenges that these countries face in maintaining competitiveness in markets such as the UK where Hispanic Caribbean destination such as Cancun and Cuba have been making major gains.
1.9 Destination image of Caribbean countries – implications of study for marketing directions

Since its emergence in the tourism marketplace in the early 60s, the Caribbean has earned global recognition as a premier destination region. Renowned for its white sand beaches, sunny climate, azure seas, tropical landscapes and vibrant culture, the countries of the region have long relied on these attributes to attract the tourist hordes to their shores.

There has been some attempt to diversify the region’s product offering with a thrust towards attracting eco-tourists and other special interest travellers. However, it is apparent that the Caribbean attracts mainly the sun, sand and sea market in terms of the region’s competitive advantage in the international market. The Caribbean has not been generally successful in breaking into other tourism markets such as eco tourism, heritage tourism or even adventure tourism. However, the Caribbean Tourism Organisation (2000) has been advocating the development of these segments in the region in order to diversify the product offering of the region and to reduce dependency on the mass market. Nevertheless, the main thrust of most countries marketing and promotional activities has been geared to the mass market that constitutes the most viable segment for these destinations.

In the quest for novel marketing approaches to improve competitiveness, the question may be asked whether the traditional sun, sand and sea image of these destinations will be able to continue to generate market growth and sustain tourism in the region. In other words, are contemporary epistemologies, that is, ways of seeing the region able to continue to ensure competitiveness? The high dependence that most destinations in the region have on tourism means that they must the competitive edge in terms of appeal and value in the marketplace. It is therefore necessary to examine how current representational practices of the Caribbean destinations and their holiday experiences produce preferred ways of seeing and experiencing the region.

These normative practices of representations must be interrogated to determine the basis they ascribe value in the construction of destination images. This study therefore examines the stereotypical representational practices of the UK press in terms of their implications for the competitiveness of Caribbean destinations. It also
seeks to identify ways in which these destinations may be able to 're-value' the image of their mass product in order to enliven and sustain popular imaginations of the region's holiday experiences.

CONCLUSION
This chapter introduces this study on the image of the Caribbean in the UK national press. It has shown how this study addresses the need to clarify the role of mediated tourism destination images in destination image formation. It also demonstrates how this study had been operationalised to clarify how textual characteristics of destination image constructs relate to consumer responses which is currently under theorised in the literature on tourism destination image. In part 11 of this chapter, the study area of the Caribbean is introduced with an overview of the performance of the region's tourism's industry. The region's dependence on tourism is highlighted in this discussion as well as the need to remain competitive in the global marketplace. This chapter also underscores the importance in gaining an understanding of how tourism destination images of the Caribbean have been mediated in the UK press. It also indicated how this study contributes to this understanding by interrogating the extent to which existing epistemologies of the region are beneficial for the long term competitiveness and development of Caribbean destinations.
CHAPTER 2

FRAMING TOURISM DESTINATION IMAGE IN THE MEDIA

INTRODUCTION
This chapter introduces the theoretical framework for this study on the image of the Caribbean in the UK press. A focal point of discussion is the multi-disciplinary breadth of this investigation which spans several domains within tourism research chiefly consumer behaviour, cultural geography, sociology and media studies. The chapter also extensively critiques the concept of tourism destination image, highlighting the main role it plays in the destination selection process and in moulding the tourist experience. It was shown that there are key image constructs identified in the literature for the measurement of tourism destination image, and that these comprise both functional and holistic attributes. It was also found that while Source/Sender based models for destination image formation have been adequately theorised, there is still a need for more understanding of how texts, and the messages they send to readers, work in terms of the image formation process. In this regard, this chapter presents reader-response theory from the consumer behaviour literature as an approach that focuses on how textual features produce meaning, and how these relate to consumer responses, thereby creating a bridge from the text to mind.

2.1 Establishing a framework for tourism and media research
The nature of media operations and their influence on, and within the tourism industry, have attracted examination from several disciplinary platforms motivated by diverse research agenda. Tourism marketing researchers have analysed how consumer perceptions and choices may be shaped by media images of destinations (Britton 1979; Butler 1990; Gartner 1996; Gartner 1993; Gunn 1972; Gyte 1988; Gyte 1987). Of interest to anthropologists and cultural geographers, has been the influence of the media and popular culture in the commodification of place, people and history and as attractions and products of the tourism industry (Barnes & Duncan 1992;
Duncan & Gregory 1999; Burgess & Gold 1985; Relph 1976; Squire 1998). Sociological critiques of tourism have focused on themes of tourism representations and practice, with issues of authenticity, identity and power relations between hosts and guests emerging as related themes in defining the relationship between tourism and the media (Culler 1988; Dann 1996; MacCannell 1976; MacCannell & MacCannell 1982; Mellinger 1994; Morgan & Pritchard 1998; Sturma 1999; Thurot & Thurot 1983; Urbain 1989).

Apart from these areas where tourism studies examine media influences and interaction, there is no formal approach or framework for the study of tourism and media research in the literature. In this regard, this field of enquiry now reflects an eclectic range of disparate research agenda and objectives. Nevertheless, there has been growing recognition that the relationship of the media and tourism represents a distinct field that presents a potentially rich vein of research enquiry for understanding the processes and practices of tourism. Support for the relevance and critical importance of building a research programme for the study of tourism and the media has been detailed in a recent article by Fursich & Kavoori (2001:149) who propose a critical framework for the study of travel journalism. Although their use of the term ‘travel journalism’ may seem to limit their examination only to travel writing, yet the discussion presented in their article encompasses wider issues of the ‘ideological dimensions of tourism, transcultural encounters, and the ongoing dynamics of globalisation’ of both the media and tourism. Essentially, they offer a theoretical framework primarily from a cultural studies perspective for the study of travel journalism.

Based on a review of the literature of tourism in sociology, anthropology and cultural studies, Fursich & Kavoori (2001:150) propose three distinct theoretical strands for the analysis of travel journalism. The three perspectives identified by the authors are ‘Issues of Periodisation’, ‘Power and Identity’ and finally ‘Experience and Phenomenology’ for a programmatic framework for studying travel journalism. In explaining the perspective of Periodisation, Fursich & Kavoori (2001:155) suggest that the main conceptual issues for research relates to enquiries on the development of the touristic experiences in relation to the social changes from modernity through to post modernity. For the ‘Power and Identity’ perspective, the authors point to the
examination of the role of travel journalism in representing both travel and the destinations that are visited. They suggest that issues for investigation may include questions such as the ideological work performed by travel journalists in trying to fix the ‘Other’. For the third strand of ‘Experience and Phenomenology’, Fursich and Kavoori suggest that key points of inquiry could focus on the link between travel journalism and issues of phenomenology and experience, in looking at how the tourist experience is constructed in travel writing. The table below presents a range of research questions and issues proposed by Fursich and Kavoori in relation to the three perspectives they identified in the literature.

Table 2.1 A Framework for the study of travel journalism (Fursich & Kavoori)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme/Perspective</th>
<th>Research Questions/Key Conceptual Issues</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Periodisation</td>
<td>What are the constructs of authenticity that travel journalism has predominantly used in the past and now? What textual strategies work best to further issues of authenticity and leisure? How does actual travel reflect the experience of authenticity? Is there a tension between the textualisation of authenticity and the actual experience?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Power and Identity</td>
<td>At the level of textual analysis, one can ask what are the dominant modes of representation in western travel writing? What is the range of these frames and what are the discursive categories that they draw on? Do certain kinds of tourism present different modes of representation or is a cultural homology evident in their representation? How do travel narrative fix the ‘Other’? What is the range of travel journalism texts produced in the Third World and how are the images of a western ‘Other’ are incorporated by the ‘Others’ themselves?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience and Phenomenology</td>
<td>How do travel journalists construct the tourist experience? What concept of ideal tour and preferred traveller are created?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
topics of academic inquiry, there is a need for communication scholars ‘to follow suit and interrogate contemporary practices of travel journalism’. They maintain that this research should be conducted both at the encoding, that is the message content, and also at the decoding level when it is received by audiences. However, while they have proposed a comprehensive review, Fursich and Kavoori did not include the tourism marketing literature in locating the points of connection from that literature to ‘specific questions for mass communication research’. For the most part, their framework emphasises the encoding stage of communication reflecting a concern for accounting and explaining social meanings produced by the nexus of tourism and the media.

However, although the framework did not take this area into account, a research agenda is also required for the decoding stage directed towards enquiries on the reception, behavioural responses and incorporation of messages and meanings on the part of audiences and targeted groups. Destination image studies in tourism marketing that is discussed more extensively later in this chapter, have examined the ways images relate to the destination choice of consumers. However, as media images tend to draw on cultural resources to create meanings and impressions in order to evoke desired responses among receptors, there is need for more clarity on how these processes work in tourism (Dann 1996; Dann 1998; Emmers-Sommer & Allen 1999; Gunter 2000). Table 2.2 below adds this marketing dimension for investigation and presents a framework that attempts to give a comprehensive research perspective and highlight the conceptual issues that are particularly relevant for tourism studies. This proposed framework for media analysis in tourism covers three strands which are already defined areas in the field. However, this framework also exposes the need for more development into consumers as audiences of tourism media messages and how these may influence their behaviour and consumption of the tourist experience. This is an important area for investigation in the quest to evaluate and to create more effective communications within the industry, and in clarifying how tourism communications work in tourism marketing and consumer responses. Even though these distinct streams have been identified, for the most part these various strands complement each other research enquiries.
### Table 2.2 A Framework for Media Analysis in Tourism Research

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes and Perspectives</th>
<th>Key conceptual issues</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Marketing/Consumer Behaviour Approaches</strong></td>
<td>Traditional tourism marketing models have presented media as channels for getting information to the consumer. Pre-trip information creates images of the destination and so directs consumer choices. The image formation process is linked to consumer behaviour and attempts to explain how image change can occur. The media is identified as a stimulus factor that can influence consumer images of the destination (Baloglu &amp; McCleary 1999; Crompton 1979; Gartner 1993; Gunn 1972; Solomon, Bamossy, et al. 1999).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sociological/Cultural Approaches</strong></td>
<td>This perspective examines the social relations and cultural significance of image creation and production in tourism. The function and role of the media and communications in tourism is reviewed to uncover the power relations embedded in their representations of society. Looks at postmodern critiques of the tourist gaze as a manifestation of consumer culture. Issues of tourism images as constructed and constructing phenomena that makes the industry a ‘communicator and shaper of society’s ideology’. The impact of the system of representation that tends to subjugate individual identity, cultural values and lifestyles (Cohen 1979; Dann 1995; Hollinshead 1999; MacCannell 1976; Morgan &amp; Pritchard 1998).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Communication/Media Studies Approaches</strong></td>
<td>This strand of research is currently being dominated by studies of the impact of Information Technology and the opening up of new channels for consumer marketing. IT developments are opening up new avenues of interactivity, feedback between consumers and marketers and the simulation of the vacation experience through virtual reality. The diffusion of media products is making it easier for people to experience events and is integrating the media product as major feature of the actual tourism product (Acland 1998; Rojek 1998). More traditional communication approaches examine the encoding stages, messages and textual strategies of communication.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author

For example, this study of the image of Caribbean destinations in the press incorporates studies from Cohen’s sociological typologies of tourist experiences, marketing models on cognitive processing of brand information and symbolic consumption as well as media theories on the role of textual discourse in the construction of social meanings. The connection between the three areas are shown in the diagram below:-
This diagram shows that there is an overlapping of research fields in the pursuit of the research question and points to the interdisciplinary framework of this study's research question.

2.2 Exploring the link between the media and the tourist experience

Principally, the research identified in the literature address to varying degrees the ways in which the media shape perceptions, attitudes and expectations and even the development of the tourism industry. Nevertheless, more clarity is needed on the specific ways in which the media through their operations of 'informing, educating and entertaining' their audience, relate to the tourism industry, and are also touched by it. Roger Silverstone (1999:2) argues that understanding how the media work, sheds light on their capacity to make and share meaning, and to provide a sense of the 'general texture of experience'. In other words, mediating experience is essentially the main activity and consequence of the media. Silverstone writes that
Our stories, our conversations, are present both in the formal narratives of the media, in factual reporting and fictional representations, and in our everyday tales: the gossip, rumours and casual interactions in which we find ways of fixing ourselves in our relationships to each other, connecting and separating sharing and denying, individually and collectively...it has been suggested that both the structure and the content of media narratives and the narratives of our everyday discourses are interdependent, that together they allow us to frame and measure experience. The public and the private intertwine narratively. (11)

Tourism engages the media in purveying the holiday experience. Commercial tourism media products such as brochures, advertisements, travel guides and magazines mainly attempt to sell the vacation experience to consumers. Prentice, Witt, et al. (1998:1) claim that the 'core product of tourism is the beneficial experiences gained'. Ryan (1997:4) says it may be that 'experience' is the objective of holidaying'. Consumers of tourism media products are shown images of destinations or resorts that are devised to invoke moods and feelings that they desire to fulfil. Consumers are transformed into prospective tourists as the 'experience' somehow becomes a desired goal, stirred by the images and the meanings derived from interpersonal and media communications they are exposed to in everyday life.

2.3 The role of image in mediating destination choice and the vacation experience

Crompton (1979) and Gartner (1996) suggest that images shape attitudes and behaviour. Gartner posits that images operate at three levels in terms of the travel decision-making process. Firstly, there is the cognitive level which relate to the perceptions people have about a product, then there is affective response, which comprises the way people feel about the product and then the conative level, which is the decision to travel based on the other two levels. This explanation of images and how they function in relation to consumers, suggests that images bear encoded information which consumers read and respond to.

Tourism brochures, advertisements and other Destination Specific Literature (DSL) (Etzel and Waters, 1985 quoted in Gartner 1993) are geared to solicit positive images of destinations and to engage the target audience towards choosing the destination. But at the same time while the consumer is being directed towards this behaviour,
their expectations and appreciation of the proposed holiday experience are being moulded. Rojek (1993:103) asserts that the role of mass communication in leisure and tourism is to create 'aura and simulacra' and answers the questions as to how people 'know places before they visit them' (108). It is suggested here that in mediating the holiday experience, tourism media products are providing consumers with 'cognitive maps' which may shape how they perceive and even behave while on holiday.

The literature on consumer information search theorises on how consumers reduce their uncertainty about the holiday experience and how they use 'both single and multiple source' information to frame and structure the way in which they manage and maximise the entire vacation experience (Fondness & Murray, 1998). For travel consumers, information is essential. It is vital in the second stage of the travel decision process where consumers evaluate destinations and decide the order of preference in their awareness set. Goossens (1994:90-91) points out that tourism research indicates that mass media information is consulted by consumers mostly in the beginning of the information search process and as such 'play a significant role in determining choice of recreation and vacation destinations. However, consumers not only need the 'facts', but interpretations of these 'facts' as well. In this regard, the credibility of the source of the message and information they get tends to filter the extent of their acceptance and influence.

Gartner (1996) suggests a direct relationship between message source and consumer influence. Building on Gunn's (1972) distinction between organic and induced images, Gartner outlines a complex system of overt and covert induced images projected by tourism media products which accounts for the various ways in which consumers relate and actively filter messages by source. Based on this model, tourism information coming from official tourist organisations are 'overtly-induced', and are less influential than those from autonomous image agents such as general news reports or even from word of mouth endorsements.

It could be argued that consumers require credible message sources because this is critical for the validation of the experience they seek. The tourism experience is usually intangible at the point of purchase by the consumer, and so there is a need for
assurance that is more likely to be received from credible information sources in making this high involvement decision. This explains why marketing theory advocates the view that word-of-mouth sources or communication are highly credible and are especially influential in high involvement purchases and when consumers are unfamiliar with the product (Solomon, Bamossy, et al. 1999:282).

The significance of Gartner’s image formation model is that it suggests ways in which the destination image may be managed both in terms of creating and in changing the image of the destination. While autonomous image agents coming from news and popular culture and organic agents which are based on past experience of the destination are normally beyond the destination’s control, intervention is possible at the four induced levels. The induced levels include Overt Induced I represented by consumer advertising and promotions, Overt Induced 11 comprising information from independent tour operators and wholesalers, Covert Induced 1 involving the use of celebrities and credible spokespersons to endorse the destination, while Covert Induced 11 represents articles reports and stories about the destination from an ‘ostensibly unbiased source’ (Gartner 1993:200). For example, familiarisation tours are usually conducted by destination marketers for travel writers in order to get stories placed in the media. Often there is no indication to readers that the author’s expenses were paid by the destination or the travel trade. Most times travel writers seemed constrained to present a favourable image of the destination (Weir-Aldersom 1988).

Dann (1996) has described Gartner’s model of image formation agents as a Sender based model. This label is particularly apt as it explains the cognitive responses of consumers to the messages they receive depending on the characteristics of the source or sender. In this respect, source credibility as a variable in the image formation process has been extensively theorised. This has provided a frame for understanding the image making process based on who sends the messages rather than what messages are sent and how they work in influencing the consumer.

In the interest of tourism marketing communications it is also necessary to explain how mediated messages work for consumers in the formation of images of destinations. It is hardly contentious that it takes more than the source credibility of messages to account for image formation and the images that are held of destinations.
The literature on tourism destination images explores other contributory variables in image formation including the attributes of the destination, the motivation of consumers, the nature and extent of information that consumers receive, as well as the attitudes and responses of host communities (Ashworth & Goodall 1990; Baloglu & McCleary 1999; Chon 1990; Crompton 1979; Echtner & Ritchie 1993; Gallarza, Saura, et al. 2002; Jenkins 1999; Ryan, Scotland, et al. 1998).

Apart from Sender based models, Goossens (1994) proposes a message based approach to consumer image and behavioural responses. He argues the importance of emphasising experiential information in brochures as promotional leisure messages about feelings of pleasure, relaxation, excitement, adventure and fun are likely to motivate tourists to plan a trip (Goossens 1994:52). Specifically, messages that invoke imagery of role-play and active participation are deemed to ‘directly or indirectly affect behavioural intention when the imagery is processed’. This is termed ‘enactive imagery’ by Goossens which he defines as

specialised as representing the temporal and affective aspects of a stimulus... This temporal perspective of enactive imagery extends to include the possible consequences of action. Enactive imagery provides an insider's perspective on situations, and allows access to subjective aspects opaque to subjects using verbal or visual representations.

(Goossens 2000:308)

The practical outcome of enactive imagery is such that the ‘consumer goes beyond its content and connects in some meaningful way to real life’. This means that the consumer is shown ways in which the product or the experience may be used, acted out and performed on location. In terms of travel, enactive imagery is represented in language that reads like scripts where the consumer is invited to share in the performance of the vacation experience. This is presented and depicted in such as way that stresses specific actions and activities, as well as the feelings, the emotions, the pleasures and the thrills of the experience. While functional imagery focuses on identifying attributes, enactive imagery is directly opposite as it emphasises the subjective and affective aspects of decision making.

Goossens (2000:300) suggests that the affective and experiential aspects of consumption play an important role in consumer choice behaviour to the extent that it can be inferred that the messages with a high level of enactive imagery may be more
critical in influencing the preferred buying decision than functional imagery. These distinct characteristics expose the textual features of tourism destination image.

2.4 Characteristics of Tourism Destination Image (TDI) studies

Concerning the study of Tourism Destination Image (TDI), there is agreement among several researchers that there is a lack of conceptual framework for the field (Echtner & Ritchie, 1993:3; Gallarza, Saura, et al. 2002:57; Jenkins, 1999). There is also unanimity in the literature that tourism destination image is complex and multidimensional, making it a very challenging area of inquiry (Baloglu & McCleary 1999; Echtner & Ritchie 1993; Mackay & Fesenmaier 1997). Nevertheless, there have been considerable attempts in this quest that have yielded invaluable insights on the conceptualisation, operationalisation and measurement of destination image.

A review of the tourism research literature on destination image analysis from 1973 to 2000 conducted by Pike (2002) yielded some 142 papers leading him to conclude that it one of the more popular research fields in tourism. In their review of destination image in the literature, Gallarza, Saura, et al. (2002:57) found that approaches were interdisciplinary and featured a taxonomy of methodologies that were employed for its measurement. They also maintained that there have been a variety of approaches in studying destination image which have been tackled by disciplines such as anthropology, sociology, geography, semiotics and marketing in terms of clarifying 'understanding of tourism consumer behaviour'.

Based on their review, Gallarza, Saura, et al.,(2002:70) also concluded that the widely-accepted approach to destination image measurement has been to assess the multi-attribute based images of the destination in order to determine the 'global scores of the image components'. However, consumer perceptions were usually the focus of these measurements. As noted earlier in the introduction, (Ehemann, 1997) was among the earliest attempts to measure destination image based on texts, that is newspaper articles.
Dilley (1985:60) also approached image measurement by identifying specific attributes of the destination that were conveyed by tourist brochures produced by the National Tourist Organisations of selected countries. He used content analysis to count the frequencies of image attributes found in the brochures in order to uncover general patterns and the common image constructs of various destinations. Importantly, Dilley’s study, like Ehemann’s, focussed on the analysis of texts as a means of TDI assessment but he also included the added dimension of evaluating the attribute constructs of destinations.

The framework of TDI assessment proposed by Echtner & Ritchie (1993) provides a more rigorous approach to image measurement. They argue that TDI is comprised of three continuums - attribute-holistic; functional-psychological and common-unique. According to Echtner & Ritchie, ‘the attribute-holistic continuum is comprised of individual attributes such as the nature of facilities, climate and friendliness of the people as well as holistic impressions which are mental pictures of the destination. The functional-psychological continuum is based on the distinction between directly measurable (functional) characteristics and those less tangible or difficult to observe (psychological) features. The third continuum presents those perceptions based on ‘common’ characteristics (such as clean beaches) and ‘unique’ features (like a place for lovers) (Chen & Uysal, 2002:989). The Echtner/Ritchie framework remains influential in TDI studies particularly in terms of obtaining an empirical assessment of TDI (Echtner & Ritchie, 1993; Gallarza, Saura, et al. 2002; Pike 2002). It is also useful in gaining an empirical evaluation of the position of the destination in the market, and can be used to indicate to destination marketers the facets of the image that may need improvement (Chen & Uysal 2002; Gartner, 1993).

However the extant literature also points to another research tradition in the study of destination image. Apart from attribute identification or a functional approach best represented by the Echtner and Ritchie framework, there have been also critical cultural studies on tourism representations of destinations that seek to interrogate the wider ‘social, cultural, and political’ context of the production of tourism images. Studies within the critical cultural tradition have focussed on representations of destinations in guidebooks, promotional materials, photographs, holiday postcards
and advertising in the quest to analyse how ‘they respond to, support and shape destination images’ (Andsager & Drzewiecka 2002:404).

Many of these studies have used qualitative methodological approaches such as semiotics, discourse analysis and phenomenology to deconstruct and to disassemble tourist imagery in order to explain their characteristics, how they occur, and how they function as social and cultural codes that influence tourist behaviour. Therefore, for Crick (1996), representations of destinations operate and thrive on the generation of images of the Other and in the specious creation of ‘natives’ and ‘authenticity’. He warns that these images are often manipulated by commercial interests in destination marketing and may ultimately lead to the exploitation of both the natural resources and the peoples of poorer destinations that rely on tourism.

However for Thurot & Thurot (1983:176), the study of representations of tourist behavior is required to fully understand the social and cultural context that produce the codes that tourists act on. They contend that images and representations are not simply consequent to human cognition, but are social artefacts endued with the themes, ideologies and myths that produce social meaning. Accordingly, there has been particular attention in the literature on the role of myths and mythmaking in the construction of tourist images, and how these resonate with tourist motivation (Dann, 1995; Mellinger, 1994; Morgan & Pritchard, 1998; Selwyn 1990,1996). Of note is Uzzell’s (1984:97) semiotic analysis of tourist brochures, which concluded that myth and fantasy represent the cultural tools used by consumers to build an image of the destination and the overall holiday experience.

The goal of the cultural critical agenda therefore is to examine the discursive formations of representations and image making in tourism. This quest seeks to deepen understanding of the underlying ideology and themes that occasion their creation and appropriation by tourists. It is possible to point to the force of ideology in helping to prescribe the interpretation and the meaning that is embodied in tourism imagery. Increasingly, studies of tourism imagery are acknowledging the power of representations in their operation as markers for the tourist gaze and in directing their attitudes towards the travel experience (Dann, 1996; Hollinshead & Jamal, 2001; Morgan & Pritchard, 1998; Suvantola 2002; Urry 1990). Therefore, it may be argued,
that a comprehensive assessment of tourism destination image that seeks to both
account for, and to explain the meaning of these images, requires a combination of the
functional, that is attribute identification, as well as the critical cultural research
approaches.

2.5 Defining Tourism Destination Image

Essentially, there are two salient issues that emerge from the literature on TDI.
Firstly, there is the definition of the term destination image and secondly, its
operationalisation and measurement. Jenkins (1999:2) notes that the most commonly
cited definition for the destination image is that proposed by Crompton (1979:18) as
‘the sum of beliefs, ideas and impressions that a person has of a destination’. Baloglu
& McCleary (1999:871) similarly define an image as a mental representation of an
object or place which is not physically before the observer.

For Jenkins however, this definition mostly relates image to consumer behaviour at
the individual level, and does not acknowledge that images can be shared by groups
of people. According to Jenkins, it is also important to incorporate the notion of
shared or group image of destinations as it can provide insights in ‘understanding the
segmentation of markets and facilitates the formulation of marketing strategies’ (2).
In terms of its inclusion of group image, Jenkins advocates the definition provided by
Lawson and Baud Bovy (1977) which states that destination image is

*the expression of all objective knowledge, impressions, prejudice, imaginations, and
emotional thoughts an individual or group might have of a particular place...*

This definition perhaps is particularly relevant in addressing stereotypes and specific
cultural orientations and responses and views that are held by various groups or
segments. However, this definition is also significant in addressing the emotive and
attitudinal components of TDI. Baloglu & McCleary (1999) agree with this view as
they point out that image constructs have both perceptual/cognitive and affective
dimensions. While the perceptual and cognitive evaluations represent the beliefs or
knowledge about the destination, the affective evaluation refer to the feelings,
attitudes and attachments that people have for it. The holistic images of a place comprise both these cognitive and perceptual dimensions.

Mackay & Fesenmaier (1997:541) state that image is subjective knowledge. This implies that individuals process and interpret information in their formation of TDI. The question that subsequently emerges is the relative importance and relationship between cognitive and affective dimensions of TDI. In other words, are the attributes of the destination that appeal to the cognitive component of image more significant than the affective dimensions? It is apparent that consumers do require information for cognitive processing, however the affective component seems to be also important in stimulating socio-motivational needs. Crompton (1979) suggests that the socio-psychological needs and motivations of tourists may be realised at any destination that is able to fulfil them. Crompton (1979:415-422) explains that

*For example, the escape from a mundane environment, exploration of self, and regression motives, require only a destination which is physically and socially different from the residential environment. Literally thousands of destinations could meet these criteria and thus serve as direct substitutes... the value, benefits, and satisfactions derived from the vacation were neither related to, nor derived from, a particular destination attributes. Rather the satisfactions were related to social or psychological factors unique to the particular individual or group involved.*

In other words, Crompton argues that destination marketers should not only attempt to stimulate motivational need, but they should also attempt to ensure that a clear link is make to their destination. This suggests that highlighting the attributes without establishing the distinct value of the particular destination is not really and effective approach. However, Uzzell (1984) contends that most holiday images presented in vacation brochures do convey the attributes of the destination in both functional and symbolic ways so that they also operate symbolically beyond the overt and superficial attributes of holiday destinations. According to Uzzell, the images of holiday brochures assemble reality and fantasy in such a way that allows the individual to interpret and process them in accordance with their own fantasies, wish fulfilment and socio-psychological needs (82). He argues that the attributes of the destination in creating induced images are therefore presented in a manner to resonate with meaning, and act as a stimulus in eliciting and motivating the consumer towards the desired travel choice.
The motivation dimension of image formation is also proposed by Chon (1990:6) who argues that the image of the destination is determined by individuals in terms of the perception of the destination in meeting their desired outcomes and accomplishing 'their need and wants'. Chon proposes a model based on the evaluative congruity theory that compares performance expectancy, that is image, with the performance outcome, that is the perceived reality of the destination. This model suggests that individuals modify their image of destinations in the image search process. New information that may or may not adjust their perceived images of the destination may come from books and articles, destination advertisements, news media items and discussions with friends and families at the pre-trip stage, or be based on an evaluation of the actual trip to the destination.

Chon hypothesises that a person who holds a negative perceived image of a destination, who then receives new information that leads to a change towards a positive image of the destination is likely to feel highly satisfied because the outcome is perceived to be better than what is expected. The reverse also holds, so that a positive perceived image when followed by subsequent negative image, leads to high dissatisfaction as the outcome is disappointingly lower than expected.

Although Chon's model is presented as an 'ideal type', still it leads to questions with regard to application to the everyday. How general is it for people to take a trip to a destination even though they hold a negative image of it? If that perceived image is based on a negative attitude towards the holiday experience offered by the destination, is it likely to be part of the evoked or decision set of destinations to visit? Another weakness of Chon's model is that is does not take into account the possibility that perceived images held before embarking on the destination trip may condition and shape the individual's attitudes and impressions of the entire experience even though the destination is visited.

Basically, Chon's model is mostly useful in assessing the possibility of repeat visits to the destination and the dissemination of positive or negative word of mouth information on the destination, rather than for the assessment of first time visit to a destination. However, Chon's model is worthwhile in attempting to establish the link
between image, travel motivation and satisfaction. This means that people’s perceptual beliefs, that is, image of a destination may determine the potential of a destination in realising satisfaction, while generating expectations on their part which is likely to influence their behaviour, particularly with respect to destination selection (Coshall 2000:85).

2.6 Identifying key image constructs for the operationalisation and measurement of TDI

Most TDI studies feature a list of image constructs and attributes. In his findings on the review of destination image literature, Pike (2002:542) notes that in spite of recurrent criticisms of the use of attribute lists in the operationalisation of destination image, there is no acceptable replacement of traditional multi-attribute models as they continue to be prevalent in TDI studies. It is apparent that attributes of destination are key, essential variables in relating destination images to travel behaviour. Echtner & Ritchie’s (1993:3) study on destination image has been influential in guiding the conceptualisation and measurement of TDI. Significantly, their study focussed attention on the characteristics of destination image as having attribute-based and holistic components.
For Echtner and Ritchie, attributes that can be ranked as functional have tangible qualities, while psychological and holistic attributes have more abstract features. The authors further distinguish between image attributes that are 'common functional and psychological traits to those based on more distinctive or even unique features, events, feelings or auras' (ibid 3). The advantage of the Echtner and Ritchie model is that they attempt to capture the more tangible and measurable constructs such as landscape features along with the more intangible psychological characteristics such as the atmosphere, mood and the friendliness of locals.

In this model of the destination image of Jamaica by Echtner and Ritchie, there is a differentiation of the attributes of the destination between those that are physical and observable such as the climate, nightlife, scenery and the price and more holistic features. Consequently, attributes such as friendliness and perceptions of safety of the destination are ranked as more psychological characteristics. Physical attributes such
as weather and ethnicity of the locals are deemed to contribute to the more holistic
dimensions of destination imagery while reggae music and impressions of a relaxed,
fun and party atmosphere are categorised as psychological characteristics.

After an extensive review of the literature, Gallarza, Saura, et al. (2002) identified
core constructs of TDI. These were attributes that were most commonly identified in
TDI studies and covered both functional and psychological dimensions. The list of
core constructs are various activities conducted at the destination, landscape-
surroundings, nature, cultural attractions, nightlife and entertainment, shopping
facilities, information available, sports facilities, transportation, accommodation,
gastronomy, price, value, cost, climate, relaxation, accessibility, safety, social
interaction, residents' receptiveness, originality and service quality.

According to Gallarza, Saura, et al. (2002:63), 'residents’ receptiveness was the most
popular attribute in the literature followed by landscape and or surroundings. They
observed that the multi-attribute feature of TDI often means that these constructs
comprise both the 'global and holistic perception of all the components of the
destination' (ibid 70). The core attributes as identified by these authors corroborate
earlier findings by Jenkins (1999) and Pike (2002) based on their review of the
literature.

Related to the identification of the features of image constructs is the issue of
measuring them. The ability of researchers or destination marketers to assess image
levels among target markets is crucial for image evaluation and policy
implementation. Pike (2002:542) found that most of the research conducted on TDI
used quantitative methods while less than half reported applying a qualitative
approach. Gallarza, Saura, et al. (2002:73) also reported that image studies between
1979 to 1999, showed a great diversity of statistical methodologies which were
mostly combinations of multivariate and bivariate techniques. For the authors, these
data reduction techniques reflect attempts to manage the complexity of image
measurement.

However, Dichter (185:95) argues that relying only on such statistical approaches to
determine image may not be effective. He argues that image is 'not just anchored in
data and details’ but must also account for the cultural context, the psychological associations along with the more objective qualities of the product. He argues that in image research

*Linear and one-dimensional thought models, such as hierarchies, lists of appeals and orders of importance will have to be abandoned. Human psychological response is based less on specific facts than on total impressions.*

The implication of Dichter’s comments is that it may be impossible to capture or corral all the dimensions of image components. As gestalt impressions, images are elusive and definitely dynamic. According to Dichter, as soon as the paradigms and parameters of the description of images are drawn, then these same descriptions ‘will affect our perceptions of it’ (ibid 77). This demonstrates the complexity of pinning down image constructs and attempting to measure them. Nevertheless, it may not be feasible to abandon attribute measurement as Dichter maintains since this approach establishes an empirical context for such enquiries. What is important in such exercises is to recognise the limitations and to acknowledge that such data reduction techniques may not be definitive by themselves.

However, the need for a qualitative phase in measuring image studies is recommended by Jenkins (1999:7). She argues that image constructs should first be elicited from the population under review so as not to force respondents to respond to a standardised framework that may not accurately represent their own image. According to Jenkins, construct elicitation techniques such as interviews, triad elicitation and photo elicitation should be applied to find the constructs used by the study population in their cognition of destination image. She notes that written information such as guidebooks and photographs of travel brochures can be used to identify images projected by destinations to target groups. This qualitative step should be then followed by the quantitative phase when constructs are placed in set categories and then subjected to inter-coder reliability tests.

Dilley’s (1986) article exploring destination image in tourism brochures is distinct in it use of content analysis for image measurement and analysis. Quantitative content analyses of texts of advertisements, brochures or even of consumer interviews have not been widely conducted in the tourism literature. Examining the patterns of images
in texts can provide valuable insights on the process of image formation and how consumers may respond to them. According to Kassarjian (1977) content analysis is useful in researching consumer behaviour. In commenting on the benefits of this method in a later article, Kassarjian (2000:102) contends that

> Instead of observing behaviour directly, interviewing them, or asking them to respond the scales, content analysis takes the communication materials that people produce and ask questions of them.

Kassarjian has therefore identified communication material as objects of enquiry using content analysis as a means of understanding consumer behaviour. As shown by Dilley (1986), it can also be effectively applied in the elicitation of destination image constructs in communication texts. Furthermore, the level of frequency of particular constructs can also be measured using content analysis. As Gallarza, Saura, et al. (2002) point out, the main issue for image measurement goes back to the need for greater clarity on the conceptualisation of TDI. They suggest that more theoretical and empirical studies are required in order to move forward in gaining more clarity on how TDI is developed.

### 2.7 Applying the communication model to TDI

The application of the traditional communication model of Sender, Message and Receiver and Feedback may be useful in expanding the conceptualisation of TDI. Marketers and advertisers have traditionally tried to understand how marketing messages may influence or change consumer attitudes in terms of this communication model (Solomon, Bamossy, et al. 1999:147). As suggested by Dann (1996), Gartner’s model of the image formation process that focuses on the level of image development based on the message source, may be labelled as Sender based. However, the relationship of the image formation process to message content and structure, as well as the overall impact of receivers, have not been theorised or examined in-depth in tourism studies. The field of marketing communication addresses the relationship between consumers and their responses to messages directed at them and is useful in terms of application to destination image studies (Kotler 1991; Solomon, Bamossy, et al. 1999).
According to Solomon, Bamossy, et al. (1999), most messages contain appeals to influence consumers ranging from rational or emotional depending on the argument. Advertising messages in particular, are persuasive in their intent to change consumers’ attitudes. Usually, the persuasive elements of messages are related both to their content and structure. Hence the extensive use of metaphors, allegories, drama and other literary devices in consumer messages in order to solicit desired responses (Solomon, Bamossy, et al. 1999:172). The relative importance of source characteristics as opposed to message features in influencing consumer responses is theorised in the Elaboration Likelihood Model (ELM). The model specifies that the less-involved consumer is more likely to be influenced by source effects, than a more involved consumer who is more likely to process and pay attention to the components of the message (ibid, 171).

Therefore the ELM model suggests that Sender based models relate more to the low involvement consumer. For example, an highly involved consumer is therefore more likely to keenly note the figurative language used in advertisements. Goossens (2000:313) explains further, that the highly involved consumer requires more evaluative information in comparison to a low involvement one. He argues further that vivid, persuasive and more evaluative messages are more likely to increase consumers’ involvement, and their ability to discriminate in making destination decisions and choices. Consequently, Goossens reasons that tourism messages are able to invoke various images that relate to and can determine involvement which influences the consumer’s buying decisions and choices.

According to Reid & Crompton (1993:182), involvement is an important variable in explaining purchase behaviour. It is most commonly associated with the individual’s approach towards the product or service. Reid & Crompton state that ‘differences in involvement levels and ability to differentiate between attributes of services lead to differences in sequencing of the cognitive, affective and conative components of the decision process’. As such, they conclude that involvement may be evoked by stimuli since it has ‘drive properties’. This is particularly relevant for advertising messages that seek to persuade consumers. In theorising on the relationship between involvement levels and advertising messages Gardner, Mitchell, et al. (1985:6)
propose that messages that support processing strategies are usually coherently organised, and linked to a brand identity. They maintain that high involvement occurs when there is high attention and there is a processing strategy for brand evaluation by the consumer.

In contrast, low involvement is associated with a non-brand strategy, where individuals are not able to distinguish between salient and not-salient product or service attributes (Reid & Crompton 1993:190). This occurs because the lack of relevant information means that the individual cannot identify those alternatives which have the attributes which are salient. This means that information that provide semantic support and counter arguments tend to be more persuasive than messages that simply give facts on the attributes of the product. When applied to tourism destination image, it may be argued that functional or attribute based images may be related to more low involvement strategies, while holistic and affective images that stimulate evaluation or emotional responses may be associate with high involvement.

In terms of TDI, it is also important to clarify the how media messages work to influence consumer attitudes. It is also beneficial in determining the differences in message content, structure and style both at the organic level, and the induced level of image formation. This may assist in clarifying how these messages work in creating images in the minds of consumers. From the onset, it may be proposed that autonomous image agents may not appear persuasive in comparison to induced destination specific messages from the viewpoint of the receiver. However, general news stories that cover destinations in terms of their politics, natural events or cultural features usually create or reinforce stereotypical images of particular countries that may influence how people see them as destinations.

It is also plausible to question the objectivity of news stories or the presentation of balanced or neutral representation of a particular country. It is important to locate the image of the destinations presented at the autonomous level in the media, that is, from a so-called unbiased source, in order to determine how these countries are represented at that level. The convention of objectivity that is assumed in news stories, work on readers to give assurances of unbiased reporting, and in maintaining this form, may have the effect of persuading readers on the veracity of the news item (Allan
In this respect, media texts are able to influence readers not only in terms of content, but also in terms of the style or the genre that is utilised.

2.8 Reader–response models – making a link from text to mind

Within consumer research, there is continuous exploration by some authors on the relationship between media messages and consumer responses (McQuarrie & Mick 1996; Mick 1986:277; Stern 1989; Scott 1994). While this reader-response research in consumer behaviour has focussed primarily on advertising messages, there is relevance and applicability to media messages in general, since it also engages the act of reading. In making the case for establishing a theoretical bridge from text to mind, Scott (1994:462) argues that this approach attempts to establish the nexus between textual form and consumer responses so that there is some understanding as to how certain formal features produce consistent effects. Scott therefore introduces reader response theory as means of negotiating a bridge from text to mind that goes beyond mere analysis of the textual form of the text, to an explanation of consumer responses. Scott explains further that

Exposing the structure of an advertisement and accounting for its impact are not the same things, however. To explain a consumer’s response to an ad, we cannot rely on a theory of signs that is axiomatically removed from the circumstances of use. We need a way of reaching out into everyday life, where some texts are read differently than others, where some propositions are resisted, where some writers have more authority than others, and where readers are skeptical and products are part of experience.

Here Scott argues that textual analyses should be linked contextually to an understanding of how consumers may respond to the reading of messages. This effectively shifts the focus of analysis from the text, to the act of reading where the reader interprets and is actively engaged in the production of the ‘meaning’ of the texts. This reorientation towards a focus on the practice of interpretation to readers has its roots in a brand of literary criticism, called reader-response theory that rejects the notion of textual autonomy and insists that meaning ‘inheres completely and exclusively in the literary text’ (Tompkins 1980:201). Reader response theory advocates the view that the reader responds to the authorial cues in the texts which leads to a particular interpretation or experiences. According to Scott (1994:463), a reader-response interpretation
tries to show how a text works with the probable knowledge, expectations, or motives of the reader. Authorial intention to produce a certain reading experience is sometimes inferred. What binds together the intention and the anticipated response is shared knowledge of cultural conventions and the invocation of probable strategies for reading.

But Scott also points out that there are readings that defy or resist the intention of the author and the anticipated response. Consequently, no one interpretation or reading is privileged and there can be no definitive statement on how a text should be read. Nevertheless, Scott contends that reading is by no means completely idiosyncratic as

Reader-response theorists ...argue that reading is based on collective conventions and that groups of readers can share certain reading strategies, allowing for the possibility of grouping similar readings and shared responses.

One of the main textual conventions that guide the reading experience is the use of genres. Readers approach the genre based on the rules and conventions that they know and so ‘knowledge of the genre functions as a schema that is used by the reader in the act of reading. This knowledge determines the kind of reading strategy that is employed and so the reader responds by selecting the appropriate frame for the interpretation of the text. For example, objectivity is usually expected in the news story genre. This is eminently different from the frame that the reader uses when reading advertisements as she is aware of that the intentions of the sender of the message is to sell a product or to persuade on a particular point of view. It is on this basis that Scott (1994:476) notes that for reader response theorists ‘it is axiomatic that all reading requires inference’. Essentially, reader response theory connects the form and content of texts to that of an engaged, active reader who utilises various reading strategies in the process of interpretation and meaning making.

However, questions may be correctly raised as to whether the meanings that readers derive from text should match the author’s intentions. Texts may be interpreted in various ways by varying readers and so coming up with the same meaning intended by the author is not a requirement of achieving meaning. As Ahuvia (1998:144-145) points out it is a mistake to view the author’s intended meaning as ‘the guiding principle of interpretation’. He suggests that the focus should rather, be on discovering the cultural assumptions that allow the text to be written and read in a
meaningful way. In other words, texts may be used as indicators of the shared attitudes and beliefs of readers, and so function as frames for understanding their responses and their behaviour.

However, an important caveat must be inserted here in this discussion in the application of reader response models. While it is plausible to maintain that readers engage with and respond to text in the process of meaning and interpretation, it is should not be assumed that this also universally accounts for their behavioural responses. Interpretation and meaning is the level of engagement of reader response, not subsequent action or non-action. Reader-response theory is therefore not applied as a predictive model of consumer behaviour, but as a means of explaining and clarifying how consumers may respond to messages. It presents an explanatory framework in the quest for tracking the effects of communication messages. The relationship between the reader and the message is dynamic, and changing in terms of shifting cultural context and processes. Here Scott (1994:478) strikes a cautionary note

No matter how much we would like to be able to simply use formal categories to predict response, the essentially provisional nature of textual appeal makes it unlikely that such studies will ever yield that kind of general predictability.

The importance of reader response theory is that it establishes a basis for making inferences from texts to the reader. It seeks to lay the tracks between the texts, the message and ultimately its response on the part of the reader. Its adaptation in consumer research is valuable in identifying textual schemas and interpretative repertoires that are engaged in meaning making and information processing that takes place in the experience of reading. This understanding aids the establishment of typologies and categories based on reading strategies and interpretative communities. As Mick (1986:201) points out, the meanings that people derive from messages are crucial because ‘consumers behave based on the meanings they ascribe to marketplace stimuli’. Enquires into meaning processes in terms of the connection between texts and the active readers offers more understanding on how meaning systems work in influencing consumer behaviour.
2.9 The Role of Myths, Mythmaking and Fantasy in Tourism Imagery

Research enquiries of the meaning represented by models such as reader-response theory tend to acknowledge that human behaviour cannot be totally explained by cognitive schematic models. In their seminal paper on the experiential aspects of consumption, Holbrook & Hirschman (1982:132) argue that traditional information processing models of consumer behaviour often fail to take account of the symbolic, hedonistic and aesthetic nature of consumption. The authors contend that consumption should also be seen as involving a steady flow of fantasies, feelings and fun which they have termed the experiential view. This approach goes beyond the cognitive ‘black box’ approach to view consumer behaviour as an ‘endlessly complex result of a multifaceted interaction between organism and environment’(ibid 139). Rather, it may be argued that it is the cultural and social environment in which people live in the everyday that provides the context for explaining consumer experience and behaviour.

Social experiences are usually mediated through symbolic perceptions that people hold that makes their lives meaningful. Products are bought for their utility and also what they symbolise in terms of their consumption. This image is formed by belief systems that extends to more universal issues of good vs bad, happiness rather than misery, success rather than failure that form narratives or myths that provide meaning in everyday life. Langholz-Leymore (1975:5) clearly highlights the salient role of myths in informing social conduct and behaviour. She explains that-

*Myths are a culture’s body of hereditary stories that make up a mythology, whose roots lie in the primal seasonal and biological narratives about the recurrent life cycle birth and death. These narratives, including consumption stories, shape both the structure and content of the culture’s story stock.*

Stern (1988) links consumption to pervasive cultural influences and these operate primarily in mythic stories that are articulated in communicative texts. She suggests
that ‘mythic analysis’ can shed light on the way consumers perceive their consumptive experiences. However, the understanding of how myths, symbols and codes function at the personal and societal level is necessary to determine how people not only make sense of them but also appropriate them as part of their own cognitive processes.

For the French philosopher, Roland Barthes (1982) mythmaking is part of the ideological framework of contemporary society. According to Barthes, myths project images and are forms of communication and ‘language’ which produce second-order meaning (Culler 1983:35). So for Barthes the ‘objects and practices’ of social usage are bounded by myths situated in ideological domains which are accepted as the norms of everyday life. Therefore consumption can be interpreted in this context as not just the satisfaction of a need, but also as a symbolic participation in a particular lifestyle and experience. Therefore, the product or service is purchased not just for its utility, but also for the meaning and pleasure that the consumer derives based on a perception of its value and attributes. Consequently, second-order meanings are interpretations embedded in images which people consume and may accept or reject.

Dann (1996:137) argues that the role of myth, iconography and fantasy in tourism media products, is based on the affective process in decision making. He explains the affective components of the image as produced by media products that are able to arouse the feelings and emotions of consumers. These are related to their personal motivations as they associate the satisfaction of these impulses with the realisation of the experience promised by the message. Myths and fantasies are therefore part of the arsenal of strategies employed by marketers and communicators desiring to appeal to the affective responses of consumers. With regard to tourism marketing symbols and signs are linked and bonded to various holiday destinations and experiences in the attempt to seduce consumers to choose them.

In explaining why myth, fantasy and the search for paradise are key themes in tourism discourse today, some researchers such as Selwyn (1996:148), contend that myths and myth-making in tourism are part of a postmodern trend for the search for wholeness in modern life. MacCannell’s (1976) thesis of the tourist quest for authenticity is interpreted and presented as a view of individuals desiring to escape the routine and
banality of the everyday for the transcendence of contact with primitive cultures. Dann (1996:63-79) has also shown that images of paradise dominate the brochures of destinations. The reason for this practice he sees primarily as a device by advertisers to persuade potential tourists to leave the tedium of their everyday life to experience the exotic.

Generally, explanations of how images of myth and fantasy work in conveying the holiday experience are linked to social experiences in general, and also to the particular operations of the individual's imagination. Tourism images and texts therefore emphasise and invoke the imaginary in terms of their content and the use of language to convey the vacation experience. Urry (1990:13) quotes Campbell's term of 'imaginary hedonism' to explain how individuals tend to seek out the reality of experiences they have already conceived in their minds. So that for Urry,

Tourism necessarily involves day-dreaming and anticipation of new or different experiences from those normally involved in everyday life. But such daydreams are not autonomous; they involve working over advertising and other media-generated sets of signs, many of which relate very clearly to complex processes of social emulation. (13)

In terms of Urry's diagnosis, the imaginary feeds on the fantastical, the 'other-worldliness' of tourism media images and uses them to build expectation and anticipation of the vacations experience. Urry is clear on the point that the imaginary not only depends on the stimuli, but are also shaped and delineated by them. In other words, texts and images may expand or delimit the conception and perception of the holiday experience.

People share in mythmaking, they use them to make meaning of the world and to build their experiences which are essential to their inner motivations for wholeness and satisfaction. Urbain (1989:112) elucidates this concept as he suggests that myths and symbolic experiences and cryptic basic narratives all become 'archetypes' in tourism advertisements and travel narratives. A specific example of this is the quest theme that is pervasive in tourism and travel literature and advertising. For Urbain this archetype 'involve(s) the individual in a programmed quest for simple movements, natural activities, and old fashioned conviviality, pleasure and comfort'.

47
Uzzell (1984:94) makes the case that the inclusion of local people in European tourism brochures relates to the need of tourists for the authentic experience of encounter with the locals of the destination. Therefore ‘priests, peasants and donkeys’ all signify authenticity’ so that the tourist is assured that there could be some entry to the ‘back regions’ of host communities. This desire for authentic contact with hosts, Uzzell sees as reflecting the desire for the feeling of discovery, being allowed to see, yet not being a part of the society that is being visited. Uzzell concludes that tourism advertising constructs an entire cultural meaning system that extends beyond the surface or denotative or surface level of representing the attributes of the destination. Consumers therefore ‘interact with this meaning system by adding to it and forming images of new identities and experiences that create a demand for the product’ (Pearce, 1988:167).

2.10 Discourse, Praxis and Texts

If the codes and symbols in tourism media texts and images are indicators of the overall ‘texture’ of the tourist experience, then the deconstruction of these texts and images may uncover how these meanings are constructed and devised. In his paper on consumer research and semiotics, Mick (1986:205) writes:

*Human experience is mediated by a panorama of signs and codes both linguistic and non-linguistic and it is the meanings of these phenomena that we act upon, not the objects of quasi-existence that we assume supports them.*

In this regard, through the analysis of media outputs/texts in relation, it is possible to find out how ‘our reality – words…myths, products/services, theories – acquire meaning’ (ibid 197). Interpretative textual analyses such as semiotics and discourse analysis are methods that can be used to identify shared meanings between objects and experiences. The point of emphasis here is that media output bear encoded meanings and these representations reflect a process of selectivity and construction consistent with the perceptions or rationale of a dominant ideology of society or group.
Foucault terms this as a process of ‘discursive formations’ which is ‘at once singularly authoritative and deployed in the interests of existing structures of authority and power’ (Deacon, Pickering, et al. 1999:147).

Implied in discursive messages therefore are preferred patterns of behaviour, of values and of thinking which carries axiomatic credence and legitimacy in social life. According to Dann (1996:4), the importance of discourse is that it is ‘not just about what is represented and communicated, it is also what is practised’...so that ‘discourse reinforces praxis and vice versa’. The discourse related to particular representations therefore should act as signposts to societal norms and explain the basis for various stereotypes. Representations and representing are critical engagements in society as they reflect power relations, control and influence. Morgan & Pritchard (1998:242) therefore see tourism representations as manifestations of power relations in the industry and the wider society.

Tourism imagery is therefore one of those sites of struggle where particular ideologies triumph at the expense of others – these successful ideologies structure the ways in which tourists see the world and its inhabitants...For too long, tourism imagery has been divorced from discussions of power which have been articulated elsewhere. The cultural power of tourism and the discourse tourism imagery demand more attention, revealing as it does, micro and macro relations of power.

For Crick (1996:35) there are detrimental implications in representations which belie the realities of the places and peoples of tourism destinations.

The imagery of international tourism is not, for the most part, about socio-economic reality at all. It is about myths and fantasies, and in this sense it can harm a country’s development efforts precisely because its own image making creates a false picture of the Third World.

It can be inferred that the extent to which the media reinforce and sustain stereotypical representations of destinations and their peoples may impress prescribed perceptions of reality on their audiences.

Tourism representations are particularly important for Thuot & Thuot (1983:173) who suggest that advertising messages may disclose more about ‘social codes which act on tourism’ than actual tourists behaviour. They contend that advertising texts utilises the feedback and responses of various groups in society to create
advertisements and then these are used for the 'stories which tourists will make up about their own experiences'.

Therefore, consumers actively read representations of tourism and absorb them in the process of their experiences. For example, Crang (1997:269) suggests that an examination of the photographs that tourists themselves take is likely to indicate their own representations of their holiday, and reveal the ways in which they make meaning out of the experience. In this regard he argues that tourists' photographs are indications of the ways people represent their lives and can be used to construct their travel narratives.

Again, although he refers specifically to tourism advertising in the following quote, Urbain (1989:107) provides the illumination to clarify how texts and narratives may embody and encode the tourist experience. He notes that his article ‘The Tourist Adventure and His Images’ could also be subtitled “Tourism Advertising: Mirror and Memory of the Narrative Consciences of Travelling” and that

\textit{the argument of this belief will show two problematics which prove to be fully complementary: the ideology of tourism advertising, and the tourist experience as an empiric translation of a narrative consciousness of travel. This two-edged tourist experience, distinct from oral or written travel tales, concerns travels lived as a narration and their evidences and representations in modern advertising language. Tourism advertising, as a memory and mirror of a narrative travel consciousness, carries and reflects the marks of a basic experience of the tourist.}

The close relationship between discourse and practice has been suggested by this discussion, and shows the path by which mediated tourism information may shape attitudes and perceptions. But there is no inevitability between texts and what people perceive and how they eventually behave. While discourses do reflect praxis and can also shape it, there are gaps and spaces between what is written and what is actually done. The main consideration however, is that discourse accounts for practice by seeking to clarify how people derive meaning and hence gives insights into their attitudes and actions. By examining the discourse of destination image in texts, this study seeks to uncover the ways in which images of the Caribbean tourism experience are constructed, consumed and resisted in the newspaper medium.
CONCLUSION
The purpose of this chapter was to establish the research framework for the examination of this study on the image of the Caribbean in the UK press. It has been shown that there is an opening up of a research agenda on the nature of media operations within the tourism industry. Specifically, the analysis of the literature on tourism destination image has indicated that it is multidimensional and complex. Nevertheless, some thirty years of investigation on destination image have produced consensus that it is usually composed of both functional and holistic attributes. More importantly, this chapter has pointed to the need to expand research on the image formation process from Source and Sender based models to an understanding of how messages work in influencing the tourist experience. It was shown that the myth, fantasy and stereotypical representations that are the norm in tourism media messages, relate to consumer motivation as well as to prevailing currents in popular culture. The next chapter continues this discussion to probe more deeply the theories of media influence and communication effects. It will also examine specific issues on the relationship between the media and travel behaviour.
CHAPTER 3

TOURISM REPRESENTATIONS AND THE CONSUMER

INTRODUCTION
Continuing the review of the literature, this chapter extends the discussion on the role of the media in the travel decision process. This discussion commences with an examination of the ‘effects’ model of communication that attempts to trace the media’s effectiveness in terms of audience behaviour. Although the debate on media ‘effects’ remains contentious, current communications research suggest that the effectiveness of the media rests primarily on the ability to signify and construct meaning and hence to influence people’s perceptions, rather than accounting for their subsequent behavioural responses. The power of the media to signify and impose ways of seeing is highlighted in representations of the tourism experience that constructs and endues meanings to destination landscapes and peoples. Representations and images of tourist destinations are therefore not the sole remit of the cognitive individual who actively reviews information in the travel decision process. Instead, it is suggested that images and representation are social and cultural constructions that shape individual perceptions and attitudes in terms of prescribed ways of seeing under the force of ideological discourses presented in the media. The chapter concludes with a postcolonial critique of tourism representations in order to uncover the meanings and assumptions that occasion touristic experiences and practices.

3.1 Theories of the media and the transfer of meaning
There are divergent positions in media and communication theories regarding the process of the transference of meanings as well as their effects on audiences. Some media theories propose that texts are polysemous, thereby presenting many readings and meanings (Hall 1994). It has also been argued that people produce and create meaning at the point of the reading of the text. However, the classic rendition of meaning transfer is the Shannon Weaver model suggests that the communication
process starting with the Source that produces a message, which is then sent through a transmitter which encodes the message into signals via a channel. Signals are then adapted for transmission to the receiver, who decodes it and reconstructs the message from the signal into the original form that it was sent. Should the noise source interfere with the transmission of the message from the signal, there is distortion of the message that may lead to miscommunication.

However, the Shannon Weaver model of communication has been widely disparaged on the basis that it fails to account for the complexities of personal responses in human communications. Therefore, there is no ‘silver bullet’ or ‘hypodermic needle’ that ensures that people will decode the message as the sender intended and also respond in the desired manner. In other words, meaning is not to found entirely in texts. Instead, the widely held view that discounts the Shannon Weaver model is that meaning is not extracted but rather constructed. Each person decodes messages according to varying attitudes and situations so that the receiver may see or hear the message in a different way than the sender intended. Meaning is therefore constructed and derived in the interplay between text and reader. Consequently, the encoded meanings of texts are dynamic, contextual, and not fixed.

Hall (1994) argues that the process of making meaning is best demonstrated by the notion of encoding and decoding. Audiences are able to interpret messages by decoding, and so this accounts for the differences that may occur between the encoded meaning and what is apparently decoded. At the other extreme is the subjectivist view that contends that meaning rests totally in the interpretation of the texts by the reader. But spanning these two extremes are dialogical theories of meaning which argue that meaning is a process of negotiation and so texts are neither completely predetermined nor completely open. People therefore make meaning. Nevertheless, Stuart Hall maintains that under the force of ideology, and overall hegemonic influences, content can be arranged to produce ‘preferred readings’ or the meaning producers of the texts intend readers of the text to accept (Gunter 2000:85). It is here the power and the influence of the media is essentially located, in terms of their selectivity, choice of images and story angles, as well as their production norms which together work to shape and construct meaning and social experience for their audiences.
3.2 The media ‘effects’ debate

Media theories have long grappled with attempting to determine the extent to which media images lead to traceable effects. Earliest studies of the effects of television violence and increases in violence mirrored concerns that the media could unleash untold uncontrollable forces on society through their messages and images (Gurevitch, Bennett, et al. 2000:14). This research agenda that prescribes to the view that that the ‘mass media have direct and reasonably predictable effects upon the behaviour of human beings’ has been termed the effects model (Gauntlett 2002:2). Generally, media research on the effects of television violence suggest that they have limited effects, as there are many complex variables, even the ability to distinguish between real world and movie-land, which act as checks on the dominant force of the media.

The verdict on the range and extent of media effects is still out, as research conducted across various disciplines such as psychology and sociology continue to produce conflicting findings. But Gauntlett (2002:8) asserts that the reason for indefinite results on television media effects studies is due to a lack of theoretical explanations as to how ‘merely seeing an activity in the media would be translated into an actual motive which would prompt an individual to behave in particular way’. However, the question is not necessarily one of people’s understanding or responses to messages, but the key point is that the responses and subsequent actions are checked by the individual’s choice to accept or resist the message.

In spite of the incisive critiques on media effects launched by many researchers (Gauntlett 2002), studies emanating from an interdisciplinary team of academic researchers based in Scotland known as the Glasgow Media Group continue to argue that media power is undeniable and is able to wield influence on society under particular circumstances (Philo 1999:4). The Glasgow group contends that...

...many of the terms used in media/cultural studies obscure vital processes in the operation of media power. Concepts such as ‘polysemy’, ‘resistance’ and ‘the active audience’ are often used to by-pass or even negate enquiry into the effects of cinema, press or televisual representations. Our work shows that the complex processes of reception and consumption mediate, but do not necessarily undermine, media power. Acknowledging that audiences...
can be 'active' does not mean that the media are ineffectual. Recognising the role of interpretation does not invalidate the concept of influence (emphasis mine).

In maintaining a case for media influence, the Glasgow Media Group re-examines the notion of meaning transfer arguing that there is a difference between audience interpretation and reaction. They point out that their research findings show that even when audiences shared a common interpretation of the intended meanings of a TV programme or news report, they would differ in their reactions. Media power is therefore predicated on the level of interpretation, rather than on the level of reaction or response. Therefore they insist that it is more fruitful to investigate media effects in terms of influences and perceptions, rather than in relation to effects and behaviours (Gauntlett 2002:9).

The Glasgow Media Group therefore advocates extending the line of media effects research beyond the limits of prior media effects studies embodied in issues of reader resistance and the polysemous nature of texts. Their argument in favour of further media effects research in terms of tracing media impacts seems liberating in clearing a path for more enquiries in this field.

...it is vital to maintain concern with media 'impact', besides being attentive to ways in which people engage with, criticise, use and resist media messages. Attention to the latter processes should not prevent us from acknowledging media power. It is clearly true the personal or collective experience, politics, logic and scepticism, as well as diversity of images within the media, allow for a more complex process than straightforward 'imprinting' of individual media messages on a tabula rasa audience. However, it is still possible to chart media influences and to trace sources of inaccurate beliefs or particular frameworks of thinking. Acknowledging the complexity of audience reception processes does not necessitate deserting any attempts to theorise about media influence. Media power does not exist in a vacuum, and audience reception is not an isolated encounter between an individual and a message. (Philo 1999:20)

Although there is some constraints to the extent that media influence can be causally linked to behaviour, there is also some acceptance that the meanings and shared interpretations that people derive from encoded information can have an 'effect'. As Hall (1994:202) points out, the media's power is that it is 'able to influence, entertain, instruct or persuade with very complex perceptual, cognitive, emotional, ideological or behavioural consequences'.
3.3 The media and travel behaviour

A conceptual framework to clarify media influence in tourism has been proposed by Richard Butler (1990:48). Essentially, Butler suggests the segmentation of tourists according to their media preferences. He argues that visual and literary sources (brochures, posters etc) assist tourists in forming general impressions in their minds of preferred destinations. Comparatively less in their importance are travel agents’ intermediary role of mainly linking these general consumer preferences with an actual destination or specific site. Travel agents are even less influential according to Butler than other social factors such as parental or peer group influence, or the media in ‘determining the general type of destination and experience sought, and the general type of area selected’ (italics mine). So the media is presented as a significant variable in influencing the type of experiences sought by tourists.

Butler puts much weight on the influence of the various media such that he presents a model of a relationship between media type and tourist choice of vacation destination. According to Butler, the oral, literary and visual characteristics of the media appeal to various segments of tourists that in turn tend to prefer specific destinations. So, the oral media which has a small audience, is skewed towards more exotic destinations while the literary medium tends to appeal to more allocentric, elite tourists. The visual medium however, appeals to all types of tourists, but favours more distant and exotic destinations. This model is pivotal and distinct in the tourism literature in establishing a link between the media and travel behaviour. It also integrates media influence with models of tourist typology and destination choice, so as to explain how the media may be instrumental in tourist choices of holiday destinations.

Butler’s arguments are guided by McLuhan’s maxim of ‘the medium is the message’. He therefore maintains that it is the way in which the various media operate which is the basis for their impact or influence with consumers. For Butler, it is then not so much what is said, but moreso how it relayed and presented by the individual medium that determines the level of influence. In other words, it is how the message is mediated rather than the message itself that is the basis of the media’s power. In expounding McLuhan’s thesis, Silverstone (1999:20-21) in his exposition of the media explains that his view was essentially of ‘the simplicity of the media’s
displacement of the message as the site of influence’. But he also cautions that this view of the operations of the media ascribes some ‘over-determination’ to the media, which fails to fully account for the ‘nuances of agency and meaning’ in the human exercise of power and resistance. According to Silverstone therefore, how the medium is appropriated and utilised is based on antecedents of meaning and value which tend to prescribe ‘how’ consumers relate and respond to the media. This implies that that social context of meaning is paramount in situating media effects beyond the medium used.

Indeed, the issue of the relative influence of text as opposed the medium is debatable and difficult to determine as they are both shaped and expressed in terms of each other. For example, radio texts use language to paint pictures so that listeners can ‘see’ while they listen, television scripts work to link scenes in a narrative order and so TV texts are rarely explanatory as the pictures tell the tale. Nevertheless, in spite of their different appeals the oral, literary and visual media rely on codes in various forms to be meaningful, and these codes are configured and designed to adapt to the medium in which they will be encoded.

The rapid development of new information technologies may also tend to date Butler’s (1990) demarcations between media type. The concept underlying today’s multi-media communications is to integrate all the advantages of the oral, visual and even the literary in one medium. Technology allows media domains to be criss-crossed, so that newspapers can be read, radios listened to, and television watched via personal computers. Even the notion of word-of-mouth and or interpersonal communication is being exploited with the marketing tactic of ‘viral mail’ where marketers get individuals to introduce new products to their friends via email.

On another level, contemporary and classical books are tirelessly being used as grist for Hollywood movies while members of movie production teams are also writing books on the making of these films. Sargent (1998:184) records that there have been Penguin publications entitled The Making of Emma and The Making of Pride and Prejudice. This overlapping across the various media could result in a probable situation where ‘Bronte Country’ may appeal to those ‘elite’ allocentrics with a classical education as well as those psychocentric ‘masses’ who were fascinated by
Hugh Grant’s and Emma Thompson’s performance in the movie adaptation of Jane Austen’s literary ‘Pride and Prejudice’. The issue is that both ‘types’ of tourists may end up at the same location while perhaps seeking different types of experiences. These arguments that the increasing complexity of media technology may undermine Butler’s notion of the medium as the main location of media influence on consumers.

3.4 The media and tourism experience at the destination

The role of the media in influencing how tourists behave however is a relatively unexplored and unresolved issue. Notably, work such as Dann’s (2996) that point to the language of tourism as a means of social control emphasises the power of the industry to harness cultural and media resources towards prescribed and desired consumptive practices. In relation to this argument, Harrison’s (1997:398) trenchant critique of Dann’s thesis of tourism questions the determinism implicit in the argument:

...there is another ‘reading’ which attributes more importance to the human actor and less to the impersonal and reified forces of capitalism and its lackeys, which puts the people back in the tourist brochures, not as passive advertising fodder but as architects of their own lives, creating their history as well as reflecting it, enjoying their holidays, or suffering them, not as cultural dopes or dupes but as those who have paid for their holiday and, at least retrospectively, appreciate it...

Clearly, the analysis of media texts can only presume to explain the social environment within which people operate. Human actors are also social actors. They can be autonomous as well as social in their responses to media messages. The randomness of the human condition means that each individual has the ability to exercise his or her will according to personal choice. Burgess & Gold (1985:223) also makes the point that people sometimes maintain dual positions.

It is perfectly possible for people to accept and indeed consent to particular interpretations of how things are while at the same time contesting those interpretations through their personal, situated knowledge of their immediate reality.

Indeed, as Harrison suggests, tourists are indeed senders of messages themselves and so provide grist for tourism representations as well. Analyses of texts or media outputs, be they advertisements or more objective journalistic pieces can record social or contextual environments within which people make their decisions and attempt to
determine how the use of archetypes, symbols and myths are manipulated to establish preferred versions of reality. The circuit of culture framework as put forward by Johnson, (Squire, 1994:7) and first proposed by Hall (1994:203) is a useful tool to explain how textual communications and other social practices become part of people’s behaviours and lifestyles.

In explaining the model, Squire notes that meanings are transformed as they are encoded and decoded by producers and consumers over time and in different contexts. She notes that these texts become a part of symbolic systems which are again transformed by different audiences depending on factors such as gender, social class and ethnicity. Again, these meanings are incorporated into ‘lived culture or everyday life and these in turn contribute to new moments of productions, new texts and new readings’. Meanings are therefore a dynamic process moulded by both public representations and private ‘lived experiences’.

Some researchers have attempted to clarify the ways in which media outputs may be influencing the tourist experience at the destination. Fenton, Young, et al. (1998:1) conducted experiments at the Great Barrier Reef in Australia to determine how representations of the reef mediated the experience of visitors. Using 20 photographs of coral reef environments, they asked some 103 reef tourists to judge which best represented their expectation of what the reef should look like. As most of the visitors had a limited direct experience of the coral reefs, their findings indicated that most visitors to the attraction held stereotypical, idealised images of the reef and that their expectancies were shaped by these ideal images. The researchers concluded that secondary information sources provided by the media and tourism industry were instrumental in shaping the experiential expectations of visitors.

McGregor (2000:46) also makes the case for the strong mediating role of texts in shaping the visitor experience. In his study of tourists visiting the Tana Toraja, Indonesia, he concluded that guidebooks led to a commodified experience and gaze which were ‘tutoring’ tourists to look for the ‘Other’. He found that travellers who saw photographs of the burial site attractions known as ‘tau-tau’ before actually viewing them at the destination, tended to have their expectations satisfied, but rarely surpassing them. In comparison, those sites that they did not have prior visual
impressions of, tended to meet, and surpass their expectations. For those sites which were not mentioned by the guidebooks or word of mouth, McGregor contends that they were not gazed on with enthusiasm. He also claims that his findings indicate that the search for the authentic was not for the real, everyday modern lifestyles of the Torajans, but instead the showed a preference for gazing on the romantic, primitive, exotic Other of the Western imagination that was induced by their guidebooks.

The extent to which people reconfigure and reorient their concepts of the vacation experience while actually on holiday was examined by Botterill & Crompton (1996). In their case study research on the nature of the tourist’s experience using a Personal Construct Theory (PCT), Botterill & Crompton found that the classical Clawson and Knetsch five-phase stage of the recreation experience did not fully explain the cognitive and affective processes of the tourist experience. The Clawson-Knetsch model states that the recreation experience involves five phases starting with the anticipation phase, then travel to the site, followed by on-site activity, return travel and ending with a recollection phase (Botterill & Crompton 1996:57).

The main limitation that Botterill and Crompton identified with the Clawson-Knetsch model was that it did not include the possibility of tourists vacating their ‘psychological space’ while on holiday. They maintain that there are opportunities available to the tourist beyond the ‘constructs’ her/she carries with her to the destination, to reconstruct and optimise the experience so that the experience is ‘not only a vacation of space; but also a vacation from previous constructions—an enlivened tourist on a ‘true’ vacation’.

They also suggest that this is where the skill of intermediaries such as travel guides and writers come in, to ‘enable tourists to understand’ that they can construct their own experience guided by their personal interests and approach to life. For Patterson, Watson, et al. (1998:426) their hermeneutic study of ‘wildland recreationists’ found that individuals tended to experience the world in highly individualised and unique ways. These findings led them to conclude that nature of the touristic experience is ‘emergent rather than predictable’.
Still, Sternberg (1997) argues that people may need support in order to optimise the touristic experience. He presents the argument that visitors usually require reinforcement or markers to support the tourism experience on site. He notes that apart from the pre-trip image that the tourist may have, there is need for 'iconic products and markers on-site to provide 'meaningful evocativeness' of the image in order to make the experience fulfilling. In a case study of Niagara Falls, Sternberg (1997:957) argues that although visitors to the attraction may have 'come prepared for the experience through travel writings', yet most visitors only lingered a few minutes to look and seemed unable to maximise the experience. According to Sternberg, the experience at the Niagara Falls was in need of enrichment at the site so that visitors could find it more meaningful, appreciate the value of the site and stay longer at the location. Culler (1988:161) seems to be making a similar point on the role of markers and symbolic signs to provide semiotic mediation for tourist experiences.

_A visitor to Niagara Falls who does not know that it is 'Niagara Falls' he is seeing, will immediately demand, 'What is this place?' since a great deal of its interest comes from its relation to its marker or 'symbolic complex'._

Culler therefore contends that the tourist experience is dependent on signs, markers and signifying structures to make the encounter meaningful and fulfilling. This is essentially what defines and structures the tourist experience of attractions and destinations. According to Culler the modern quest for experience is a quest for an experience of signs which explains the incompleteness of experience and its dependency on markers for meaning. In reviewing these arguments, it may be maintained that there is indeed individual agency and a 'space' for emergent holiday experiences. Nevertheless, it is also apparent that individuals draw on frameworks of meanings they acquire from social and cultural interaction to enliven their holiday experience. Of course, they have options to interrogate and challenge these frameworks, but it is undeniable that they also tend to appropriate and depend on these signifying structures to make their holiday experience meaningful.
3.5 Popular culture, media and tourism

Fiske (1989:1) defines culture as the ‘constant process of producing meanings of and from our social experience’. He further explains popular culture as the resistance of the subordinated and disempowered peoples who challenge and conflict with the ‘dominant, hegemonic’ discourses. For example, Fiske argues that Madonna’s premier position as an icon of popular culture at the height of her career was based not so much on her reputation as a singer and actor, but on her shocking challenge of the norms of femininity and fashion.

According to Fiske, popular culture is dynamic, so that meanings do not reside only in texts since they are inadequate in themselves. Rather, Fiske sees texts as operating as ‘provokers of meanings’ which are only completed when people respond to them. For example, the high failure rate of new products whether cultural or material in spite of extensive advertising, and the exploitation of the cultural aspects of the products, attest to the independence and resistance of the consumer who ultimately chooses ‘which commodities they will use in their culture’.

Nonetheless, in spite of Fiske’s assertions, it could be argued that people are liable to be seduced by the dominant ideology or viewpoint unless they are able to counteract them by their own knowledge systems. Fiske’s view that popular culture defies tendencies of control and management may also be challenged in terms of the slick marketing and publicity machinery that controls the world of popular music, fashion and entertainment.

Popular culture has also produced images that have been exploited by the tourism industry. As discussed before, some tourism destination have benefited from the filming of major, box office hit movies with the result of economic and public relations spin-offs (Riley, Baker, et al. 1998). According to Riley, Baker, et al.
(1998:932), 'movie inducements' for locations have lasted up to some four years and more. Sargent (1998) notes that the 'Darcy effect' of the BBC's 1995 serial adaptation of Pride and Prejudice was such that as soon as it was aired, people started going, not only to the location but to several other National Trust properties as well.

Riley catalogues both anecdotal and empirical evidence of the promotional spin-offs for destinations as movie locations, but he also notes that sometimes there are negative after-effects should the movie fail to be a big hit or capture the imagination of viewers. He notes as well that there are occasions when tourists are disappointed when the location viewed in the movie appears different from the impressions they had in their minds from seeing the movie. The critical factor for the representation of destinations in popular movies is that they are not structured in terms of a holiday experience. Movies follow their own narrative structure and are not following a tourism industry script, so that representations of the holiday experience are usually incidental to the film and do not provide closure of the vacation experience.

Sometimes, it is the media reviewers who emphasise the setting for the movie rather than the movie itself. As Riley, Baker, et al. (1998:933) observes, there is need for studies to determine which has the greater impact on a location, 'the movie or the media blitz that promotes the movie'. Arguably, movie viewers may be stimulated or inspired to visit the location based on the scenes they see, but it is likely that they will find validation of the visit in terms of their own recall or memories of the film, the memorabilia they buy, or just the satisfaction of saying to others, 'hey, I went there and I saw it (whatever)' without a real impression of the location. In such cases, people themselves provide their own closures for their holiday experiences as there were no defined pathways for them to follow based on the movies themselves.
3.6 ‘Ways of Seeing, Travel Writing and the Guidebooks

Unlike movies and popular culture however, it has been suggested that travel writing and guidebooks appear to offer specific pathways for the tourist experience. Dann (1999:161) makes the claim that not only are travel accounts a significant source for holiday decision taking but they also ‘can and does convert description into action’. In this regard, he argues that travel writing serves a vital promotional function for the travel industry. The evidence of the rise of travel and the sale of travel books suggests for Dann, that travel writing is more likely to be providing a vicarious experience that promotes travel rather than replacing people’s need to travel.

Travel writing also plays a crucial role in assisting tourists in managing the unfamiliar terrain of the destination according to Dann (1992:59). First time visitors in particular, rely on the travelogue at the pre-trip stage in order to focus the experience. Travelogues or guides are used and utilised by consumers to provide practical information on the destination and as such fulfils the role of resolving the tension between ‘familiarity and strangerhood’ for the traveller. But even this functional role is allied to a prevailing promotional intention that appears to characterise all travel writing.

Travel writing, in whatever medium they may be found, whether guidebooks, magazines, newspapers and radio or television features, apparently serve commercial and trade interests. Often, such travel accounts follow a prescribed agenda of stock in trade tourist information of where to go and what to do, while providing a ‘nice read’ of an exotic foreign country. Some researchers argue however, that travel writing is not only characterised by a neutral agenda of promoting, informing and entertaining their audiences (Dann 1992:59). For example, in her analysis of the popular ‘Lonely Planet’ guidebook to India, Bhattacharyya (1997:387) found that representations of India were constructed in terms of a Western ‘Orientalist view of the country’s past glory and present exoticism’. In other words, the Lonely Planet writers were not merely presenting an authentic India reflecting the current lifestyles and perspectives...
of the country and its people. Instead the guidebook actively engaged in constructing an India that satisfied the Western gaze and perpetuated the view of the 'Orient as spectacle'.

In mediating India, Bhattacharyya notes that the Lonely Planet guidebook utilised various textual strategies such as the use of an authoritative narrative voice, the selection and de-selection of particular sights for the book, and the positioning of local peoples in subordinate postures. The echoes Mary Louise Pratt’s (1992) identification of the 'Imperial I/eye' that she contends is still operational in a post-colonial world. Bhattacharyya argues that this narrative voice serves to stereotype and reinforce a discourse of Western dominance. This presentation also establishes the legitimacy of guidebook as an effective valuative tool, by asserting opinions as uncontested facts, with the right of the writer to ‘make moral judgements about the behaviour of Indians and their customs and the country’. Travel guidebooks utilise discourses of destinations as ‘Other’ in using these representations in the process of mediating the holiday experience for readers. Attraction and sights, the people and their customs are pointed out in most travel guide books in terms of the aesthetic or moral values of the Westerner which are used to define what is best or worthwhile in the travel experience.

The power of mediation is essentially the ability and the means to signify, to ascribe and prescribe meaning and responses in terms of how the world is perceived (Hall 2000). In this respect the media do not merely reflect reality, but also shapes the logic, direction and contours of social reality and in turn, people’s perception. It has also been suggested, that in the act of mediating and making meaning there is an active construction of meaning or encoding that takes place (Grossberg, Wartella, et al. 1998).

To understand how media texts really work in mediating social reality require probing into the ways and the 'how' of their construction. Semiotic and discourse analyses offer the means to understanding how meanings are constructed and communicated in texts. The manner in which the codes, symbols and signifiers of media text are organised are indicators of how they are constructed (Grossberg, Wartella, et al.
1998). For example tourism destinations are often signified by the ‘exotic’ with verbal and visual cues which emphasise the perception of ‘Other’.

Landscapes of differences are central to the conception and meaning of vacation experience. The destination images of the Caribbean in winter markets they target are often scenes of white sands, sunny, blue skies and clear azure seas. These are visual codes of warm weather, water sports and as these codes and semiotic cues are generally perceived and decoded by various peoples in similar ways, so that an accepted meaning is established. Travel writings or guides in their descriptions of various destinations reinforce these codes which serve to engage accepted or stereotypical ways of seeing landmarks and attractions of the holiday experience.

Mary Louise Pratt (1992:219) in her work, Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation gives detailed and convincing evidence of how travel writings construct places and impose ‘ways of seeing’ the landscapes and peoples of various countries. Pratt shows in her work how the writings of early pioneers and scientists in places of ‘discovery’ in the Americas and Africa reflected their own imperialistic notions of superiority and conquest. According to Pratt, the colonial discourse of empire in the writings of 19th century explorer and naturalist Alexander von Humboldt ‘sought to reinvent popular imaginings of America’. She argues that popular views in the heartland of Europe at the time were shaped by these writings, as they were ‘read, reviewed, excerpted and reviewed’, thereby finding a place in the public imagination of popular culture. Her contention with Humboldt’s and other such writings of these pioneers was not that they were inaccurate in tracing the physical and spatial features of the landscape:

*The point is not to argue that Humboldt’s representations were somehow implausible or lacking in verisimilitude. I do want to argue, however, that they were not inevitable, that their contours were conditioned by a particular historical and ideological juncture, and by particular relations of power and privilege.* (127)

Pratt’s contention is that the discourse of empire that claims the traveller’s superior view of the world, seems not to have changed much even among contemporary travel writers. She illustrates this in an incisive critique of Paul Theroux’s commentary on landscape in his book, Old Patagonian Express:
What does it mean for Theroux to assert, on the one hand, that "One of the beauties of train travel is that you know where you are by looking out of the window", then add, on the other, that in Patagonia this did not work because the landscape "did not alter"? For Theroux, it means Patagonia is violating the aesthetic norms of train travel, failing to provide the right kind of landmarks. The Patagonians who do not look out the window, are failing to travel correctly on their own trains...Such (are) the logic and rhetoric of unexamined prejudice. (219)

Pratt accounts for this way of seeing as attributable to a discourse of negation, domination, devaluation and fear that was active in the late ‘twentieth century as a powerful ideological constituent of the west’s consciousness of the people and places it strives to hold in subjugation’.

It could be argued that as part of the tradition of postcolonial studies, Pratt’s critique of travel writing would perforce turn a critical eye on how former colonies were represented by imperial writers. However, there is a substantial body of critical work that interrogates the ways in which contemporary travel writing imposes discourses of Western dominance and representations of certain countries, mainly former colonial lands (Clarke 1999:232; Duncan & Gregory 1999; Holland & Huggan 1998; Pratt 1992; Spurr 1993). Postcolonial scholars such as Mary Louise Pratt’s major contribution has been to show how travel tales directly and indirectly shaped the rest of the world for Europeans. Spurr’s (1993) *Rhetoric of Empire* has pointed to travel writing as a discourse of colonialism that accounts for how one culture is interpreted and represented by another. Travel writing has also come under the spotlight of studies in international relations where the political relationships between states have been noted to share similar discourses with travel writing (Leslie 2000).

3.7 Travel writing - fiction or factual narratives?

In a comprehensive, thorough and salient critique of the travel writing genre, Holland & Huggan (1998) make the case for the critical analysis of travel writing as it belongs to a wider structure of representation within which cultural affiliations and links-cultural itself-can be analysed, questioned, and reassessed. Travel has recently emerged as a crucial epistemological category for the displacement of normative values and homogenising, essentialist views (viii)

Holland & Huggan (1998:47) seem to agree with Bhabba’s (1990) viewpoint that travel writing contributes to a ‘meditation on the myths of western power and
knowledge which confine the colonised and dispossessed to a half-life of misrepresentation and migration'. It is generally agreed that the question of verisimilitude, or a commitment to a realistic representation of the countries covered, is not a required prescription of the genre. Consequently, travel writing then has been accorded with the ambiguous definition of being ‘fictions of factual representation’ (Holland & Huggan 1998:10).

For Holland and Huggan, travel writing is subjective and self-consciously biographical and intentionally anecdotal, and puts the writer in a peculiar position to ‘report the world they see and their often repressed desire to make the world conform to their preconception of it’. But a distinction can be made between the travel book as a literary read, as opposed to the guidebook that serves a functional utility to map out spatial features and helpful hints of things to do. Some travel writers of guidebooks see their role as primarily to provide factual and helpful information for visitors in terms of mediating their travel experience at the destination. Travel writer, Lesley Reader (2002:17) in an article in ‘The Sunday Telegraph’ claims that she carefully checks out all the facts of the destination, even to the point of lying to local hoteliers in order to get access to their facilities in the guise of a regular customer. She explains that lying is required so that she can ‘convey facts’ that her readers may know what is really on offer.

*I can hardly admit that I am a travel writer sussing out their hotel for a guidebook – the most gleaming room would be displayed, the staff develop friendly smiles, the price drop radically...Isn’t it unfair? Fooling people, not telling them the truth about who I am and why I am there? Yes, it is, but I haven’t really worked out a better way to be fair to the readers...*

For Lesley her motivation to get the true facts obviates and justifies the lies in order to get an ethnographic and true picture of what an actual tourist will face at the destination. This is mandated by her readers, and she knows what information they want, her detailed notes therefore record if there was ‘a smell of sewage, if these specs of blood on the sheets are indicators of fleas or bedbugs’. Although she is primarily motivated to be ‘fair’ to her readers, she is not similarly constrained to be ‘fair’ to the local hoteliers. Lesley’s only reservation and worry is with the power of her work when she noted that the one hotelier complained that since the German,
French and Lonely Planet and Rough Guide all ‘pointedly neglected to mention his (hotel)… no one stops here’. Lesley concurs with him on the basis that many of her readers ‘equate a guidebook with the Bible’.

In contrast, Weir-Aldersom (1988) does not share the triumphalism of Lesley’s approach to the genre. He sees his role as not only giving practical tips, but also to address prevailing topical issues that may not tally with tourism interests. He illustrates how business interests impose their definition of the genre in an example of his allusion in a travel piece on a particular city’s history of anti-Semitism and racism. This mention incited the ire of a local official who told him that his article was ‘not only in bad taste but also off course for the type of magazine and article he was assigned to write’ (Weir-Aldersom 1988:28).

There is some aversion among travel writers at national newspapers in particular to cover the underbelly of tourism destinations. In his interview of travel editors of the national newspapers in the UK on their editorial practices, Seaton (1991:11) notes that most editors conceded that ‘knocking pieces’ on destinations were rare particularly because readers expected the travel pages to represent space for the ‘good times to roll’. It was also noted that knocking pieces were only seen to work well for places that were well known, and for editors it did not seem worthwhile to utilise limited space for negative stories. However, the editors also admitted that the occasional ‘hatchet job’ was vital for reader credibility.

But Weir-Aldersom remonstrates with subscribers to the ‘Pollyanna school of travel writing’ which he sees as undermining the principles and practice of journalism. His apparent frustration in finding publishers who were willing to embrace a wider definition of travel writing to include more hard nosed investigations of the industry, led him to the conviction that unless travel writing relieves itself of its complicity with business interests, it simply ‘dishonours our free press’. Still, Seaton (1991:18) notes the particular dilemma of travel writers with national newspapers who are in the ambiguous position of satisfying their readers who not only want to be informed and entertained but who are also ‘buyers or potential buyers with consumer information requirements’. He points out that most travel editors end up with a compromise between the need to inform and entertain the general reader, while also ensuring the
use-value of text for the prospective traveller. Holland & Huggan (1998:24) sum up the dualities of fact and fiction, of functionality and subjectivity that occurs with the mediation process of travel writing.

*Travel writing, after all is a pseudoscience of observation; inhabiting the indeterminate area between fact and fable, history and myth, it has thrived on a diet of half-truths, rumour, mysteries, illusions – the trappings of a world whose geography is only partly covered, and whose multiple possible histories are partly understood.*

Whether it is established as fact or fiction, it may be argued that the travel writing genre generally advocates a particular way of seeing the world.

3.8 The reader of travel writing - Traveller or Tourist?

Barthes (1982) questioned how travel guide books mediated the travel experience for readers. He wondered about the type of experience of destinations that readers were being tutored to expect and desire.

*Open a travel guide... and usually you will find a brief lexicon which strangely enough concerns only boring and useless things: customs, post offices, hotels barbers, doctors, prices. Yet, what is travelling? Meeting people (la rencontre). The only lexicon that counts is that of the rendezvous.*

Barthes in his own travels particularly in Japan, challenged the stereotypical reading of destinations. Diana Knight (1997:153) suggests that Barthes promoted what may be termed as ‘anti-tourism’. Essentially it was that he refused to subscribe to the accepted meanings of the symbols and codes of travel as widely practised by tourists. The stance of a superior viewing the ‘Other’ was rejected by Barthes, and he sought to redefine his own meaning of the destination apart from the received, dominant notions of travelling or vacations. Barthes in his travels through Japan sought to ‘own’ his narrative and so engaged in his personal readings of the city and he also encouraged others to the same.

The result is that he produces hand-drawn maps in his work *Empire of the Signs* which were not literal spatial representations but rather ephemeral productions of his own ethnographic activities of ‘walking, looking and remembering’ (Knight, 1997:150). In his creation of a singular, unique experience of Japan, Barthes actively engaged in the process of making his own meaning of Japan through his personal constructs of place. In rejecting the accepted meanings of symbols, he sought to
reconstruct and reinterpret the meanings of physical landscapes, and also of the people, thus creating his particular tourism experience of his visit to Japan.

Here Barthes transcribes himself as a traveller rather than a tourist. As a traveller-writer he defines his activities as that of an ethnographer that is immersed in the country and the people he visits so that he is able to gain a meaningful appreciation of them. According to Dann (1999:163) this notion of a difference between the traveller and the tourist was propagated by Fussell in his work, Abroad, British Literary Travelling Between the Wars. The traveller is supposedly akin to the travel writer in terms of not gazing or craving for the practised touristic settings and sights. For the traveller, the tour groups, the trekking at attractions that make up the touristic fare, fail to capture the real experience.

Like Barthes, Fussell appears to be advocating anti-tourism in that he rejects standardised tourism as too democratic, egalitarian and filled with cliché (Tisdale 1995:72; Voase 2000). This also translates into the world of representations where the guidebook that is primarily factual, is directly geared for the tourist, but fails to serve the needs of the traveller. By contrast however, the travel book which is more autobiographical and literary is likely to suit the taste of the traveller, that is one who is engaged in a search for more authentic touristic experiences (Dann 1999:16).

But as Holland & Huggan (1998) point out, the popularity of travel writing transgresses the notion of the traveller-tourist distinction

*With the global spread of tourism, travel writing – like travel itself- has been made available to a wider audience; but some of the best-known writers often seem to react against the democratizing process. The much-touted distinction between travellers and tourists is symptomatic – as if contemporary travel writers always likely to pride themselves on being individualists...conscious of separating themselves from the vulgar herd...for while it is certainly true that travel writing are being read by more people than ever, they remain to some extent a refuge for complacent, even nostalgically retrograde, middle-class values (Preface, viii).*

It has been suggested that such demarcations between traveller-tourist reek of an elitist snobbery predicated on notions of high versus low culture, and that tourists generally engage in a search for authenticity (MacCannell 1976). However, there is some validity that is implied in the suggestion that different tourists are motivated
towards varying kinds of touristic experiences. This distinction between tourist types may be useful in attempts to segment or devise typologies of readerships according to a preference for a particular type of touristic experiences. This approach is reminiscent of Plog's typology of tourists, which attempted to segment tourists according to their travel motivations.

There is a clear research mandate for determining the nature of the readership and 'constituency' of travel writing. This empirical appraisal of travel writing readership is required to determine the various ways that travel writing is appropriated into the overall touristic experience. It could be argued that varying motivations for travel may be articulated and illustrated in representations of the touristic experience. One of the research goals of this study is to determine the varying types of image constructs of the tourist experience in travel writing in the press. Another goal is to determine whether there are varying constructs in relation to the different readership segments of the various newspaper publications.

### 3.9 A typology of tourist experiences

According to Cohen (1979), the tourist experience can be differentiated in terms of an individual's motivation and relationship with a variety of 'centres' (Li 2000:864). In explaining this relationship, Cohen (1979:6) has developed a typology of tourist experiences by analysing the different meanings that interest in and appreciation of the culture, social life and natural environment of others has for the individual traveller. He further explains that the typology relates to different points of a continuum of private motivations in relation to the tourist experience. The five modes of touristic experience presented by Cohen are:

1. The Recreational Mode
2. The Diversionary Mode
3. The Experiential Mode
4. The Experimental Mode
5. The Existential Mode
These modes according to Cohen are ranked to represent the range of experiences of the tourists who seek ‘mere’ pleasure in exotic destinations to those who like pilgrims, search for meaning at the centre of another culture. In summary, the recreational mode represents the tourist who does not seek for the authentic, but is eager to accept the make-believe in order to enjoy it as recreative, entertaining or relaxing experience. Tourists in the recreational mode are so concerned by their motivation for escape that they are relatively indifferent to the choice of a particular destination as long as their basic motivation is likely to be fulfilled (Crompton, 1976).

The diversionary mode tourist is similar to the recreational mode in terms of a desire to relax, however the main thrust of the experience is predicated by a desire for change and recognition of personal dissatisfaction with everyday life. In the experiential mode, this rejection of the home society is even more intense so that the tourist in this mode engages in the cultures of the destination in order to satisfy his or her ‘real needs’.

With the experimental mode, the tourist sees the travel to the destination as a time to closely engage and share in the culture of the host, but in fact makes no real commitment or kinship to them. In contrast, the existential mode tourist embraces the world of the Other as real and fulfilling to the point that there may a willingness to live and become a part of the host community. Cohen (1979:17) concluded that it was possible for individuals to engage in various touristic modes as such persons maybe equally at home in two or more ‘worlds’.

Although Mannell & Iso-Ahola (1987:321) have criticised Cohen typology as lacking empirical and systematic research, it has been utilised and applied in a number of past and current research projects (Bhattacharyya 1997; Boomars 2000; Li 2000; Ryan 2000; Sternberg 1997; Young 1999).
In her study of representation of landscapes and landscape experience, Boomars (2000) utilised a version of Cohen’s modes of experience in order to analyse and interpret representations of landscapes in brochures of the National Park de Hoge Veluwe in the Netherlands. Boomers found that the recreational and diversionary modes dominated the messages of the brochures while the existential mode was not identified in any of the brochures that were sampled. She concluded that these findings suggest that the landscape representations are not uniform and at several layers of meanings and messages may refer to the landscape. This study applied Cohen’s typology in order to determine the varying levels of tourist experiences presented in the travel writings of national newspapers. The aim was to determine how these touristic experiences were represented in these writings in an attempt to clarify the meanings that have been attributed to the Caribbean holiday experience.

Spurr (1993:13-27) argues that representations of the Other operate mainly on two levels of the landscape and of local people.

> When it descends from the heights of mountain ranges and hotel rooms, the gaze of the Western writer penetrates the interiors of human habitation, and it explores the bodies and faces of people with the same freedom that it brings to the survey of a landscape. The eye of the writer as a technological extension the camera, take us inside the dwelling places of the primitive and the exotic...

Another aspect of the representation of tourist experiences is that of the activities of tourists at the destination. Cohen (1979:3) points out that a main motivation in the pursuit of the tourist experience is tension management so that people engage in various types of leisure and recreational activities so that they may find release and relief from ‘real’ life. There is an opposition between notions of ‘play’ and work so that a functional purpose is served in activities as a break in from the everyday. Tourist activities are therefore generally represented as ‘vacant’ time’ where there is ‘no work, no care’.
3.10 Landscape representations and constructing tourist destinations

Presumably, people hold perceptions of destinations that are similar to the actual attributes or spatial features of the locations. However Squire (1994) contends that destinations are 'cultural constructions whose meanings and values are negotiated and redefined by diverse people and mediated by factors often related only tangentially to a particular tourist setting'. Squire (1994) has also argued that representations of place in popular and classical literature can work to transform images and perceptions of places and landscapes, and that tourist destinations may assume attributes which are reflexively construed rather than a reflection of some physical or spatial features or use. For example, Butler (1998:126) makes the somewhat evangelical assertion that the poems and novels of Sir Walter Scott

virtually single-handedly changed the image of the Gael and his homeland from one of despair, unattractiveness, savagery and violence, to one of triumph, beauty, nobleness, and above all, romance. Through his poems and novels, Scott created and developed a mythology akin to that King Arthur and the Round Table, one based on a mixture of reality and artistic licence, and presented in a style which perfectly caught the imagination of Victorian society.

3.11 Destination peoples in the tourist experience

Twinned to constructions of landscapes in the media are representations of destination peoples. Host peoples are either fixed as symbolic markers on landscapes or totally obviated from them (Dann 1996). Cohen (1995) speaks of the stereotypes of natives in touristic images, while Hollinshead (1996) decries the 'brutal misrepresentation of aboriginal peoples and lifestyles' of the tourism marketing machinery. Whether they are conceived as hosts, primitive or authentic, 'smiling, walking tourist attractions, sexual partners, terrorists or holiday tormenters, destinations peoples are deemed integral to the holiday experience.

According to Baum (1997:92), the intensity and intimacy of the holiday experience means that the entire encounter must be managed as hosts are able to make or break tourist experience. Consequently, those providing direct services to tourists must be trained to provide the highest standards of services while the general public should be beneficiaries of tourism awareness programmes to 'enhance the welcome that visitors receive from the community'. Training should be aimed towards reducing the' risk of
inconsistent or unmanaged 'moments of truth' faced by guests in the holiday experience' when the reality does not match their expectations. This approach makes the landscape and the people interchangeable. It gives them no identity or self-determination beyond delivering the service required by their guests. The imperative according to Baum’s dictum, is to mould them to match a prescribed notion of experience.

Milne, Grekin, et al. (1998:111) record the conflict of tourists’ perceptions of the wilderness experience and their resentment of the Inuit’s customary hunting and use of the animal resources. Tourists did not like the Inuit’s killing and shooting of seals which was deemed ‘loud and obtrusive’. Storylines and narratives of conservation and ‘animal-rights’ integrated in the concepts of the wilderness holiday experience was perhaps a moment of truth, not held as truth by the Inuit. Hollinshead (1996) asserts that rather than resolving these tensions in the interest of the tourism market, industry practitioners should use their media access to positively and inventively present cultures through the eyes and visions of local myths and customs. It is therefore crucial to identify the extent to which constructions of holiday experiences, incorporate the views and perceptions of local peoples. Issues for examination are whether in texts and images they are given a voice as independent, capable of shaping and expanding tourists’ general views of the world and the holiday experience. Is it that the encounters between hosts and guests in the holiday experience are primarily presented as comical or anecdotal? Is there an appreciation of destination peoples as equals, or are they smiling, walking tourist attractions or spectacles?

As mirrors of reality, it may be questioned if the media reflect the tensions between hosts and tourists in terms of the overall tourist experience. Perhaps, this is reflected primarily in dramatic terms or general contexts of crime against tourists, or as troubles in paradise, travel advisories or warnings, or as indicators of the effects of Third World indebtedness. It would be interesting to test if the sensibilities and Western attitudes of NIMBYS (Not In My Backyard) are transferred to host peoples in terms of an assessment of their demonstration of resentment of untrammeled tourism development in their communities.
While tourism advertisements and brochures tirelessly work to erase and redirect such concerns and images, organic images formed through word of mouth experiences and news stories of incidents do create junctures which contend with positive advertising. The questions persist as to how the perspectives of hosts, in particular, their rejection of the assumptions tourist/holiday experience are treated in the discourse. Notice how the local view outlined by the Antiguan novelist Jamaica Kincaid (1997) in her novel *A Small Place* accuses tourists of sublime ignorance of the nature of their encounters with the land and the people of the destinations. There is the suggestion that the Western tourist experience maintains an apparently blinding fixation on the landscape markers, with the local people sublimated in the scenery.

*From there to the shore, the water is pale, silvery, clear, so clear that you can see its pinkish-white sand bottom. Oh, what beauty! Oh, what beauty! You have never seen anything like this. You are so excited. You breathe shallow. You breathe deep... You see yourself taking a walk on that beach, you see yourself meeting new people (only they are new in a limited way, for they are people just like you)... You see yourself, you see yourself...* (13)

The repetition of the words ‘you see yourself’, is reference not only to the act of daydreaming but moreso to mockingly suggest that tourists do not in reality see themselves through the eyes of those they gaze on. In not seeing themselves, tourists fail to understand how their pursuit of their holiday experience is exploitative and Kincaid seeks to awaken this self-knowledge through a shocking descriptive rendition:

*An ugly thing, that is what you are when you become a tourist, an ugly, empty thing, a stupid thing, a piece of rubbish pausing here and there to gaze at this and taste that, and it will never occur to you that the people who inhabit the place in which you have just paused cannot stand you... They do not like you. They do not like me! That thought never occurs to you.* (17)

Kincaid’s writing here should not just be seen only as a cry from the ‘subaltern geographies’ for a voice opposing dominant representations by the West of the ‘Third World’ (Shurma-Smith & Hannan 1994; Spivak: 1990) or only as a form of counter travel writing as defined by Holland & Huggan (1998). Instead, within the context of this discussion, it raises the question of how the holiday experience is constructed and scripted for tourists in the media. It also brings into focus the extent to which representations of Caribbean destinations are resisted or subverted by an invocation to tourists to engage in reflexive ‘gazing through the eyes of local hosts."
3.12 Activities and the Holiday Experience

Print advertisements of the popular Caribbean all-inclusive hotel chain, Sandals International are usually crowded with scenes of tourists doing fun activities at the resorts. Couples are seen enjoying water-sports, dining and other activities at the resort hotels. Vibrant pinks, deeply hued blues and green colour the photographs so that there is an overall impression of vividness and dynamism. The pictures do not leave any doubts that there are diverse activities and opportunities for having fun at the Sandals resorts. This dimension of the holiday construct is also embedded in tourism media outputs. Critcher (1992:106) holds the view that leisure activities are in themselves expressions of meaning so that

Ultimately it may be possible to recontextualise the message of the activity as representation or signification back into the contexts of participants' lives and their location in the social structure.

Texts and media outputs give a picture of the total experience as well as the social and contextual meanings people attach to specific activities in defining their holiday experience. But as Critcher judiciously points out, empirical connections between textual constructs of tourist experiences in terms of the activities they do, would be better served by focusing on the consumer. The idea is that the phenomenology of tourist behaviour, that is, what they actually do while vacationing at the holiday destination should guide inferences and theorising in this regard. Texts give possible insights as the commodification of these activities in an idealised form, but they cannot be seen to be reflective of or for that matter, predictive of what tourists do.

Possibilities of many varied things to do or even to do nothing are offered to tourists which is like a shopping list of activities to choose from, and depending on individual fancy or tourist type (allocentric, psychocentric) different activities may be chosen. It seems likely that the individual will choose to act out the holiday experience based on what is actually available on the ground, as well resolutions arrived at based on prior experience and or expectations. According to Wearing & Wearing (1996:237), the individual tourist experience requires meaning to be constructed.

We have argued that the tourist experience is the interaction that the tourist has within the tourist space, that is the tourist destination and the meaning that the tourist gives to the interaction. Such individual meaning will be constructed according to the tourist's own cultural and social background, the purpose of the visit, the companions, preconceived and
What is the key consideration in this discussion, is the basis for the construction of representations and meanings of the tourist experiences. Both the social and cultural context of their lives and the marketing images of the destinations are sites of representations that are constructed in terms of particular ideologies and value systems. It is therefore crucial to critique the ideological assumptions underpinning tourism representations in order to determine the nature and structure of the images and constructs that delineate the tourist experience. The overall conclusion is that representations of landscape, local hosts and activities from a combined schema for tourism destination image constructs. This operates as a framework to engage both in empirical and critical and analysis of TDI in this study.

3.13 Postcolonial theory and tourism representation

Postcolonial theory is a field of academic inquiry into the ‘ideologies and subject positions which are invoked in the representation of Third World peoples’ (Spivak 1994). Here ideology refers to ‘all our mental frameworks, our beliefs, concepts and ways of representing our relationship with the world’ (Loomba 1998:25). A common thread of inquiry conducted by the three principal representatives of postcolonial theory - Edward Said, Homi Bhabha and Gayatri Spivak is the uncovering of the oppressive discourses that pervade Western representations.

Said’s main contribution to the study of colonialist discourse is in his critiques of the regime of representations whereby the coloniser established a sense of superiority and difference from the colonised Other. His work exposed the essentialist nature of discourses which established ontological binary polarities in Western epistemological understandings of the Other. However, Bhabha contends that such binary demarcations do not take into account the currents of cultural hybridity, or the in-between spaces that subverts grounded differences between coloniser and the colonised. He argues that cultural hybrids occupy these third spaces beyond these polarities and offers alternative epistemologies for political and cultural relationships. For Spivak (1994), the subaltern, or subjected peoples cannot speak, and so are not
able to contest or challenge the prescriptive weight of their representations in Western cultural practices (Parry 1987).

Although there is some controversy in defining the term postcolonial, it has generally accepted to mean not just as a condition after colonialism and marking the end of its political control, but rather to indicate the move to resist colonial domination and the ‘legacies of colonialism’. As a tool for cultural critique, postcolonial theory interrogates the ‘totalising forms of Western historicism, of generalising and stereotyping that subjugates the Other’ (Tiffin & Lawson 1994; Shome 1996).

According the Shome (1996:42), the focal question of postcolonial research is ‘how do Western discursive practices, in their representations of the world and of themselves, legitimise the contemporary global power structures’? Secondly, to what extent do the cultural texts of Western nations reinforce the neo-imperial political practices of these nations? Whereas under colonialism the main task was territorial control, in the postcolonial period, this control is exercised discursively. The signifying and cultural power of texts is therefore demonstrated in the exercise of representations and meanings that form the ideas and practices of social life.

The application of the postcolonial critique to tourism representation has been demonstrated by Mellinger (1994) in his seminal paper on the analysis of tourism representations. In his analysis of the representations of postcard photographs of African Americans in the South, he found that dominant racist ideologies exerted considerable influence over the organisation of discursive features. He concluded that the ‘mass-mediated cultures that tourists inhabit act as powerful tourist guides that produce ideals that establish the boundaries of their gaze’ (Mellinger 1994:776). Mellinger stated that the aim of his critical analysis was not only to determine the types of tourism representations, but to also ‘unambiguously condemn and disrupt the imperialist structures and colonialist fantasies that constitute much of tourist culture, and to take up a discourse of possibility that provides for the empowerment of misrepresented groups and the transformation of tourist representations’. Hollinshead (1998) following on Bhabba’s approach of hybridity argues that this notion may provide the means to transform tourism representations by contesting
master discourses of polar differences and open up space for new and alternative travel narratives.

Tourism and the tourist experience are shaped and produced by the practice of discursive formations and representations. Postcolonial critiques of tourism images and representations provide the opportunity to understand the attitudes, practices and behaviours of tourists. In this study the postcolonial critique of the discourses of Caribbean representations and experience of media texts is applied to clarify the social and cultural context of their production. This is done in order to account for the effect of these discourses on the practices and material evolution of tourism in the region and beyond.

CONCLUSION
This chapter presented a review of research literature to determine the role of the media in contouring tourist perceptions of the vacation experience. The three main approaches in representing the tourist experience in the media identified in the literature were landscape images, representations of people and activities, or things to do while vacationing. These three dimensions describe and reflect the nature of tourism representations with respect to narratives and constructs of the vacation experience. They also operate as a tourism destination image schema in explicating the holiday experience. The texts produced by travel writers were identified as key sites for the examination of the mediating role of discourses in influencing tourist expectations and perception of destinations as well as the overall texture of tourism experience. It was argued that tourism discourses mediated and supported preferred holiday experiences. Postcolonial critique was introduced in an attempt to interrogate and clarify how these discourses produce meaning and relate to the practices and manifestations of modern tourism. The review of the literature continues in Chapter 4 with a discussion of the operationalisation of the study in terms of the image constructs that were used in the development of the coding form for the content analysis.
CHAPTER 4

DESTINATION IMAGE CONSTRUCTS DISCUSSION

INTRODUCTION
This chapter discusses the categories that have been selected for the destination image coding form. The overall aim is to demonstrate the validity of the content analysis coding instrument that has been devised to identify the representations of the Caribbean holiday experience in the newspaper articles in the sample. The theoretical underpinnings guiding the operationalisation and generation of coding categories are discussed in detail. It is shown that these categories have been constructed to examine both the form and the content of the newspaper articles. Content analysis conventions and protocols as presented in the research literature have guided the construction of the overall form of the coding instrument while variables relating to the content of the articles have been generated primarily from the literature on destination image research. In the reader-response construct variables, the textual style of the articles was measured for their persuasive appeals to readers.

4.1 Developing the destination image coding form
According to Neuendorf (2002:118), a coding form in content analysis is defined as a set of dictionaries or a group of measures which is detailed in a codebook (See Appendix for coding form used in study). She maintains that many of the measurement guidelines for good operationalisation in survey and experimental research also apply to content analysis. In this respect, the goal of the researcher is to design category levels that that are exhaustive and mutually exclusive. By exhaustive, it is maintained that an appropriate code should be assigned to every unit being coded, while mutually exclusive means that there is only one appropriate code for each unit coded. By conducting pre-tests and pilot codings along with a series of revisions, the researcher aims to ensure that categories are complete and unambiguous so that there is little room for individual differences between coders.
The coding form for this study was developed after a process of iterative readings of the articles in the sample, a review of relevant literature on research methodology, tourism destination image and media studies. According to Babbie (1992:319), all research methods usually involve the interaction of theoretical concerns and empirical observations in their conceptualisation and operationalisation. The literature on content analysis methodology advises that the chosen message set is to be read to determine how the relevant theoretical concepts may operationalised on the basis of the empirical features of the communication (Weber 1990; Riffe, Lacy, et al. 1998; Deacon, Pickering, et al. 1999).

The coding categories for this study therefore relate theories with empirical indicators in the texts under review. For Neuendorf (2002:11), all content decisions on categories and variables must be made a priori, that is, before the task of coding actually begins. Therefore, the codebook outlining the lists of all the variables and their operational definitions for the study, as well as the coding sheet, were completed before actual coding of the articles began. The objective of the coding exercise was to develop coding categories that were strong theoretically and empirically derived to the extent that high reliability could be achieved between coders (Slater 1998:244).

A pilot coding form was developed in order to test the reliability of the categories (Kassarjian 1977:14; Neuendorf 2002). Babbie (1992:310) advises that content analysis coding scheme should be pre-tested before it is used in a study. The pre-test was randomly carried out on a sub-sample of categories to test for agreement between two coders. Some categories had to be refined by clarifying definitions more clearly for coders (Neuendorf 2002:147-148).

4.1.1 Image content

The question under examination is the image or representation of the Caribbean holiday experience in the newspaper articles sample. As discussed before in this study, the sample includes general news stories as well as specific travel news features. It has been established that general news stories produce autonomous images of a destination for consumers. Travel stories on the other hand, are located in the middle of the continuum between autonomous images produced by news stories,
and the overt induced images created by advertising and promotional activities of the
destination (Gartner 1993; Dann 1996). According to Gartner (1993:200), travel
stories are covert induced image agents. But while they may not have as much
credibility as news stories, yet travel features are supposedly able to be more
convincing, as the source of the message is not directly from the national tourism
organisation or agency representing the destination. This model therefore suggests
that images of destinations are formed at various levels from overt induced, to the
‘autonomous’ level, and then to the organic level which for consumers has most
’credibility as it is based on personal experience’ (Gartner 1993:205).

One of the main goals of destination marketers therefore should be to ensure that the
levels of disparity between autonomous, organic and induced images are reduced as
much as possible in favour of induced images (Gartner 1993:205; Baloglu &
McCleary 1999:892). This coding instrument therefore distinguishes the differences
in content and style between news stories and travel features in an attempt to capture
representations of the Caribbean both at the organic and at the more covert induced
level. Equally, it also gives indications of the areas of convergence between organic
newspaper images and covert travel features images.

In the preliminary stages of this study, the approach was to devise separate coding
forms for news stories and travel feature stories. However, in the course of
development it was found that this approach, apart from being tedious, was not
entirely efficient in time, and more importantly, in presenting a comparative picture of
the images in the texts. By using the same coding form for both news stories and
travel articles, a more fulsome picture has emerged of the varying levels of
representation in the two story formats. Allowances within the coding form have been
made for more in-depth explorations of the style and content of the travel stories
required for clarifying the research issue, but otherwise, the categories are generally
applicable to news stories and travel features. Overall, the design of the coding form
covers both story genres with respect to identifying and recording the image attributes
related to the destinations and the holiday experiences they offer.
4.1.2 Form Variables - Coding identifier categories

One of the conventions of constructing a content analysis coding form or schedule is the establishment of basic identifier categories that describe the main features and characteristics of the communication or message being coded. These basic identifier categories generally include the medium, that is, whether the report appeared in the newspaper, radio, television, the date, the position in the medium, or the time of day of the report and other related features of the text (Hansen, Cottle, et al. 1998:107). These variables are also called form attributes or formal features as they identify the main characteristics of the medium of the mediated messages. According to Neuendorf (2002:24), these variables are mainly characteristics of the medium through which the message is sent and relate to the particular form of communication.

Traditionally, in newspaper content analysis, issues such as column inches, size and content of photographs are standard identifier categories that are included regardless of the focus of the research question (Holsti 1969; Krippendorff 1980; Riffe, Lacy, et al. 1998). According to Hansen, Cottle, et al. (1998:106), this practice resulted in researchers spending valuable time gathering column inches data which were not particularly useful in clarifying their research question. The information yielded from such identifier categories were often ignored or not integrated in the overall research findings and analysis. Hansen, Cottle et al. advise (106) that only those basic identifier categories that are expected to provide meaningful data are to be included in coding schedules. Neuendorf (2002:112) asserts that the categories in content analysis should be valid, that is, the categories measure only the 'intended concept'. In other words, it should be clear that the categories of the coding form do in fact measure 'what we want to measure' (Kassarjian 1977:15). For this study, it was not necessary to measure column inches or to count the overall number of words in articles as such measurements were not pertinent to the research question. Since photographs were not included in the study sample, those measurements were not undertaken.

In this study, the basic identifier categories are presented under the general heading of form variables. Before coding commenced, each coder was assigned a coding number which was recorded on the schedule. Coding was conducted independently...
as this was required in order to maintain the reliability of the coding process (Kassarjian 1977; Krippendorff 1980; Weber 1990; Babbie 1992; Riffe, Lacy, et al. 1998; Neuendorf 2002).

4.1.3 Coding dates and Newspapers

Recording dates of the communication being coded is a standard practice in content analysis primarily to identify them, and also to track the progression of particular subject themes as they are developed within each and across various newspapers. As discussed in the preceding chapter, the sample includes all stories on the Caribbean that were published in the year 2000. Coders were instructed to carefully code for the newspaper each article was taken from. The relative frequencies of Caribbean stories appearing in the set are the main indicators of the varying levels of coverage on the region and gives a picture of which newspapers may have more dominant images of the Caribbean.

4.1.4 Coding page numbers

For newspapers, it is often useful to code the page number where the article occurs as this may be a likely indication of the significance of that story in terms of the rating of its news values (Keeble 1994; Bell 1998). Stories appearing on the front pages of all newspapers are deemed most important followed by those on page 3. The back pages of newspapers are also viewed as a prominent location, as many readers have the tendency to scan the front and back pages before looking inside.

Coding page numbers is also useful to highlight the topics and subject areas that tend to feature on the premium spots in newspapers. Undoubtedly, stories (and reporters) compete for these coveted locations, and as such, stories that gain such places testify of their saliency for news editors and by extension for readers as well. Occasionally, stories will make it on the more prominent pages of the newspaper to fill a gap when an expected story does not make the press deadline. But even though this story may not have fitted the initial considerations of premium news values for the editor, the positioning on a prominent page may have the effect of ascribing it a high level of importance for the reader. Within the context of this study, the page numbers of the articles are regarded as a pertinent indicator of the level of prominence accorded to stories on Caribbean destinations. The nature and the frequency of the subjects and
topics on the Caribbean that feature in these premium pages in the newspapers may be used to point to the level of coverage that the region generally gets in the newspapers. The question of what type of stories on the Caribbean normally gets prominent coverage is also an issue to be addressed. The prominence of a news story can be linked to the impressions and images that may be ‘top of mind’ for readers, and this has direct implications for the organic images that are held of the region’s destinations.

4.1.5 Coding for gender of writer

There are no indications on the extent to which the gender structure of the journalistic profession in the UK influences both the content and the framing of news stories in news stories. According to McNair (1999:18), charges of sexism in the industry persist in spite of the rise in the number of women and their movement into higher positions in the hierarchy of newspaper management. He also argues that with the ‘feminisation of British journalism’, women have begun to make inroads in British journalism which was once a male dominated ‘stronghold of patriarchy’.

In his study on travelogue images of destination peoples, Dann (1996:362) notes the gender of all the writers, of which, only two were women who wrote on their visits to New Guinea. However, he makes no attributions of any characteristics of the ‘feminine gaze’. In a content analysis of the images of Aboriginal cultures by travel writers in Australian newspapers, Zeppel (1999:125), recorded that the stories were all written by ‘mainstream, white travel journalists’, of which 13 were male and six were female. Like Dann, she does not make distinctions of writer orientation by gender.

Pritchard and Morgan (2000:117) bemoan the lack of image-based research on the extant work on gender on tourism. However the study by Sirakaya & Sonmez (2000) on gender images of state brochures and that of Marshment (1997) on gender representations of holiday brochures address and examine the extent brochures assume a gendered reader as a potential customer. However, Pritchard and Morgan are unequivocal in their assertions that the images in the travel media have been
dominated by particular masculine scripts which has the effect of privileging the gaze of the ‘master subject’ over others.

According to Pritchard and Morgan (2000:124) the structure of the advertising industry where the majority of ad campaigns are designed by men ‘goes some way in explaining why ads portray women in stereotypical, sexist ways’. They argue that the male heterosexual gaze is particularly evident in advertising and travel writing accounting for the predominance of images of gendered tourism landscapes that offer feminine seduction and masculine adventure. The overall irony of the gender imbalance is that although women usually take the lead role in the choice of family vacations yet media images cater predominantly to the male gaze (Pritchard & Morgan, 2000:131).

While Pritchard and Morgan in their article do not provide any example of writings of female travel writers or evidences of images that distinguishes the feminine gaze from the male one, they do point to a study by Humberstone and Collins (1998:140) that suggests that women have a more reflective and spiritual perspective of their experiences with the landscape compared to men, who tended to be more competitive and exploitative.

Still, Pritchard and Morgan’s claims seem limited in giving examples of the specific feminine viewpoint as opposed to the masculine gaze in travel writing. Nevertheless, they do make a case for the consideration of the gender of the travel writer as a variable in the analysis of media images of destinations. However, this coding form is restricted to noting only the relative frequencies of female and male writers. The extent of the distinction of representations across gender lines in the article requires further investigation beyond the remit of this study.
4.1.6 Destination mentioned in headlines

Another convention of content analysis of newspaper articles has been the examination of headlines (van Dijk, 1988; Bignell, 1997; Bell, 1998; Guijarro & Heranadez, 2001). Bignell (1007:96) notes that main function of headlines is to draw the attention of the reader to the topic of each news story. In this regard, headlines are crucial as they set the stage for the understanding of the story. They are also significant because they may determine whether the newspaper is bought or not or even if the story is read at all. Notably, the headline may be all that is read by many persons who merely scan headlines rather than read the entire story. In this respect, headlines become stories in their own right and on most occasions exhibit the news values and even suggestions of the ideological positions of the newspaper.

According to van Dijk (1988:59), a headline is the ‘most salient cue to activate certain semantically related concepts in reader’s minds: it is thus the most powerful framing device’. The means that the headline acts as a controlling structure that may guide the reading of the story that follows, and for the most part steers the cognitive processes of the readers of the story towards a preferred meaning or reading. van Dijk (1998:53) also argues that headlines work as part of a news schema with its specific bold type that matches the level of impact on the reader, giving it greater priority than the ensuing text. Coming next to the headline in impact, is the news lead or the leading sentence of the story, which is just below in the news schema order. Consequently, the mention of the destination or the region in a story headline is an important variable, as it may account for the level of impact it has on the reader. The occurrence of the destination in the headline means that the spotlight is even more intense, and in turn, creates heightened awareness for the destination. Clearly, a negative or positive association in the headline for a destination has far more intensity than if comes next in the lead or buried in the body of the story.

4.1.7 Destination coding

Category 8 on the coding form requires that the name of places apart from specific country names mentioned specifically in headlines is recorded. For example, some countries have identifiable resort regions such as Ocho Rios or Montego Bay in
Jamaica. Sometimes capital cities gain prestige on their own such as Bridgetown in Barbados gaining a distinctiveness in its own right as a gateway for British Airways’ Concorde. The mention of a place apart from the destination is key indicator of the popularity of that location even beyond the country. According to Gartner (1993:207), it is possible for smaller entities or cities to have such a strong image that it overpowers the brand image of the destination. For example, Mustique is an example of an individual island that has a distinct image even though it is part of St. Vincent and the Grenadines. It is possible that many people who are aware of Mustique, may have no knowledge of St Vincent and the Grenadines.

The Mustique example poses some difficulties in coding for the destination brand of the coding schedule. Although Mustique has a strong brand identity, yet geopolitically it is a territory of St Vincent and the Grenadines. The guide for the list of Caribbean destination used for this study is the official listing of the Caribbean Tourism Organisation noted on their web-site http://www.doitcaribbean.com which does not list the individual islands of a particular country. For example, Cancun is listed as an official destination in the CTO and is generally marketed within the Caribbean even though it is a part of Mexico.

For coding purposes, areas such as Mustique that have their own identities are still coded under the official brand name of the country that governs it. Some stories give an overview of several destinations in the region and these are coded as Caribbean (more than one destination mentioned). For stories that make no specific mention of any one island, this is coded separately as Caribbean (no one island mentioned). These stories give a composite image of the region and presents a regional brand image rather than images of individual islands. The regional image is pertinent to the research mandate that examines the representations of the holiday experience both at the regional and the individual level.

Coding for destinations gives the relative frequencies of stories on the various countries in the sample. Unquestionably, the level and type of coverage are pertinent issues in determining the image of these destinations as presented in the newspapers. Each country name operates as a brand according to Gartner (1993:206). He cites Okoroafo’s (1989) definition of a brand as a name, design or symbol. The brand
identity of the country name is often evoked whenever it is mentioned regardless of the context.

4.1.8 Coding for news type and style

According to van Dijk (1998:5), while readers may intuitively differentiate between news articles in the strictest sense and other types of informative texts in the newspaper, it is not so easy to define the distinctions between them. He gives a rather generic definition of hard news as 'new information, about events, things and persons'. Essentially, news gives information about recent events. For this category of this coding exercise, news stories are essentially non travel feature stories. However travel feature stories focuses on describing some aspect of a vacation experience based on the personal impressions and subjective perspective of the travel writer (Dann, 1996; Dann, 1992:59).

News stories by contrast, are positioned in a way so that the visuals and quotes are arranged as evidence and facts for the reader by a supposedly objective, impartial writer. These news stories are positioned as documents of events and occurrences as they have just happened in a 'truthful' manner (Hansen, Cottle, et al. (1998:214). Tuchman (1978:190) states that news stories report occurrences as public events and gives shape to them by giving specific details or 'particulars' so that an objective schema of who says what, when and where is answered in the report. The purpose of the reporter in writing the news report in an objective manner distinguishes this news format from that of a soft news feature (Allan 1999:67). It is not only the subject being reported, but it is also the treatment of the topic that generally creates the distinction between the two formats. Coders were therefore instructed to note that tourism related issues such as airlines, hotels or tourism destination may occur as news stories if they are presented in that manner.

Only those articles that have been selected as news stories are applicable for the category of types of news story. The reason for coding this distinction between hard and soft news stories is to record the nature of the news stories that most frequently occur on Caribbean destinations. Hard news stories are noted both for their content and style (Tuchman 1978:191). The content is normally on serious issues relating to government, economics or crime (Sparks & Tulloch, 2000), while the structure of
hard news stories is usually set to an objective rigid schema of what, who, when of the matter being reported. Importantly, hard news generally employ elite news sources, persons who are in or close to the seat of officialdom or the corporate world. Soft feature stories by defined as popular in that they ‘stand apart from the concerns of the serious world’ (Allan 1997:67). Human interest stories and others that have a private emphasis are considered soft news. News styles such as features, opinion pieces and commentaries as well as anecdotal stores are categorised as soft news where there is no strict adherence to objective reporting, but allows for the subjective perspective of the writer to be part of the structure.

4.2 CONTENT VARIABLE CONSTRUCTS

4.2.1 Subject Coding

The subjects and topics covered by the articles are wide and varied. It was therefore necessary to organise and group all the subject variables coherently and meaningfully. Based on iterative readings of the articles, several dominant subjects emerged which were then grouped into three subheadings based on their main thematic focus. The three subheadings are (A) Travel Specific Focus (B) People Focus and (C) Thematic Focus. The coders were instructed to make a judgement based on the reading of the article on which subject stands out above all other issues as the dominant focus the story. Here the measurement for variables is that of the degree. The coder was therefore instructed to code the subject that is the main focus of the story. While other subjects areas may have been addressed, yet the instruction was to code for the variable that is most dominant and that centers the story.

Much of the rigour of content analysis method relies on ensuring that variable categories do not overlap (Slater, 1998:233). Inevitably, topics seem to overlap for example in an instance where a story focused on weddings and honeymoons at a particular hotel or resort. As these instances posed challenges for coding and achieving high inter-reliability scores, an attempt was made to overcome this limitation by instructing coders to look at other cues for the main focus or subject of a story. These cues include checking which subject is mentioned in the headline and in the lead sentence. Sometimes if a travel wholesaler or hotel group is noted at the end of the story as the main facilitator of the trip by the travel writer this may be used to
code for this category. Whatever subject appeared most frequently in these added checks, then it was to be coded as having the edge over other subject variables. Admittedly, the reliability of these variables may be lessened in the instance of articles where there is no apparent dominant subject focus. However, pilot tests showed that coders readily identified the subject emphasis of most of the articles.

The variables grouped under Travel Specific Focus are mostly relevant for coding travel feature stories. These seven variables are generic and inclusive in order to account for the many varied topics that may occur under this category. For example, the variable 'holiday activities' includes any type of recreational activities that may be undertaken at the destination. Slater (1998:234) maintains that the rigour of content analysis rests on the structure of categories that are exhaustive in that every representation or subject is to be assigned to a category even if it the category is 'other'. Throughout this coding form, the category 'other' has been included to ensure that attributes are all accounted for within the coding form.

Stories that focus on people as the main subject are categorised in three divisions - locals, ex-patriots and celebrities. These divisions were generated primarily from the reading of the sample and also from the literature. The variables in this division are primarily noted for their relative frequencies. An important indicator is the relative incidents of news stories on locals, ex-patriots and celebrities in news stories to account for the type of people images on the region. Particularly for travel feature stories, the balance between locals as opposed to other images may be useful in determining how locals are represented in the newspapers.

The importance of perceptions held of destination peoples and their responsiveness to tourism has been identified as a major stream of destination image research (Gallarza, Saura, et al. 2002:61). Images of locals therefore play a significant role in shaping destination images. However, Dann (1992: 61) also notes that representations of ex-patriots also play a role in destination image formation. He notes travel writers have introduced characters from the destination who originally belong to the home society as a method to resolve the tension between 'familiarity and strangerhood' for readers who may be apprehensive about the travel experience at the particular destination. These stories tended to portray activities that involved ex-patriots maintaining the 'rituals' of the home country as distinct from the everyday life of the destination. The

1 In a comprehensive review of the literature on destination image, Gallarza, Saura, et al. (2002:73) noted that resident responsiveness and landscape were attributes most commonly studied.
variable of celebrities was included as they appeared in several stories from broadsheets to tabloids. The association of some Caribbean destinations with celebrities have contributed to their image as the ‘playgrounds of the rich and famous’.

For this study, topics focusing on wide subject areas such as the economy, culture, politics and environment of the destinations are categorised under the Thematic Focus heading. Stories on the staging of local events or crime as well as both natural and man-made disasters are variables in this category. These represent wide parameters of subject areas that capture an unwieldy array of attributes in defined and discrete variable groups for coding purposes.

4.2.2 Coding components of destination image

As previously discussed in the review of the literature on tourism destination image (TDI), three construct axes have been identified that support the image of destinations. Echtner & Ritchie (1993) located these as functional/psychological, the common/unique and the holistic/attribute-based constructs. Based on this frame for measuring TDI, it was necessary to code for these components in the texts. The operationalisation of these components required categories that captured the physical attributes of images as well as their meanings and more subjective dimensions of image conception. Traditionally, more qualitative measurements have been used to identify these variables as illustrated by Echtner & Ritchie in their study of motivational measurements of destination image. However, as a wide range of variable components of destination image has been identified in the literature, the task for coding was to use those suitable for the study area, and to carefully define them in the code book for coders (Gallarza, Saura, et al. 2002).
4.3 Physical Landscape Attributes

In this category, coders were instructed to code for more than one variable. In contrast to the subject category where the emphasis is on degree, here the measurement is on the frequency of the variable attributes that occur in the articles. The aim is to assess which attributes are used most in descriptions of Caribbean landscape. The number of incidents of these variables in the sample is used to demonstrate dominant image patterns. The landscape attributes presented in this coding form were reported by Dilley (1986:61) as variables in his content analysis. Dilley’s investigation focussed on the destination image attributes presented in tourist brochures that included a range of Caribbean destinations in the sample. The variables he lists also match the range of landscape representations found in the articles for the sample. Content analysis research practice advocates using previously created categories as often as possible where there are appropriate and if they fit the study framework (Manickas & Shea, 1997:69).

However, beyond physical variable attributes of landscape, much research has been done on the meanings that are attached to places (Relph 1976; Ringer, 1998; Goss 1993; Young, 1999). Adjectival descriptors of landscapes are often used to communicate the symbolic meanings that are derived from people’s encounter with unfamiliar landscapes and these have become stereotypical in travel feature stories. Young (1999:399) proposes a range of meaning attributes for landscapes that identifies both favourable and negative responses to the landscape.

Variables that were most relevant to the research question were used in the coding form under the subheading of Landscape – Psychological Attributes (Rojek, 1998; Jacobson, 2002). These attributes probe the range of image meanings that have emerged from people’s more subjective appreciation of landscapes. Young’s meaning structure of the landscape is composed of a wide range of variable attributes, but not all these variables were individually used in this coding form. The approach was to collapse variables that shared similar attributes into one. For example, Young lists
'crowded' as a separate variable from overdeveloped, while for this coding form, 'crowded' was included as a dimension of overdeveloped in its definition.²

4.4 Images of People

As already noted in this discussion, the images of destination peoples have been almost universal as a variable listing in TDI studies (Gallarza, Saura, et al. 2002). However, most studies tend to identify this variable in a generic manner. For example, Zeppel (1999) coded for 'Aboriginal people', 'local people' by Dilley (1986) and 'people' (Pritchard & Morgan, 2001). However in his content analysis study of state advertising in the United States, Hummon (1988:187) explored the various levels of people representations when he identifies several variables – families, couples, child/youth, adults, elderly, minorities, constumed- under the category of images of people. His study is significant as one of the few studies which codes for images of tourists as well. But generally, images of tourists do not appear as a significant variable in destination image formation.

Other research methods of tourism destination images of people code for race of locals (Echtner & Ritchie, 1993:8), friendliness of locals which often appears as a variable (Baloglu & McCleary, 1999; Gyte, 1988; Coshall, 2000) and for how locals are positioned in photographic images (Bhattacharyya, 1997). Based on a sample of travel articles Dann (1996a) generated a list of variable attributes of destination people images which were modified for use in this coding form. The list was deemed appropriate as the sample included a review of Jamaica that is in the Caribbean, the area under review in this study. More specifically, these variables proposed by Dann matched the criteria of attributes observed in the study sample. Dann also suggests that there may also be portrayals of neutral images of destinations peoples portrayed in travelogues.

² Neuendorf (2002:148) also noted that sometimes in refining categories in the content analysis, it may be necessary to collapse categories. Gallarza, Saura, et al. (2002:62) also noted in their review of the literature on tourism destination image (TDI) that researchers would collapse categories when required to eliminate variables used in past studies that were not specific to the area being studied
4.5 Activities – Leisure based

Since both news stories and travel features are being coded using the same coding form, it was necessary to emphasise that the activities being considered are those related to leisure activities. Representations of non-work activities are leisure based and so they are not directly relevant to destination image. The focus is therefore on coding for leisure activities inclusive of those represented in news stories where they are not usually prevalent. As there are quite a number of leisure activities, they were grouped in categories that are clearly defined in the codebook. In the generation of these categories, the approach used by Gallarza, Saura, et al. (2002:62) was generally followed by grouping similar attributes (like fishing, hunting and rafting) into one generic category ‘sports activities’. In this coding form there was a slight departure, where the distinction was made between water-based and land-based activities sporting activities.

4.6 Types of holiday experiences – motivation and meaning

Coding in content analysis may include the coding of both manifest content, that is the visible, surface content of texts as well as their latent content which is the underlying meanings (Babbie, 1992:318). However, the difficulty of coding latent categories is that it stages the risk of lower reliability and specificity in coding. In this study, the pilot coding of latent variables showed low coder agreement. The coders did not easily grasp the distinctions between Cohen’s five modes of recreational experiences. It required extensive training and practice for coders to understand and then to code this category appropriately.

When problems of coding categories arise, content analysis research proposed several remedial actions. The most drastic is offered by Kassarjian 1977:14 who states that these categories should be omitted as they cannot be ‘proven scientifically’. Reliability scores are expected to be over 80% to be considered satisfactory for any research. Kassarjian and Neuendorf also suggest that it may be necessary to simplify and narrow down categories in order to achieve higher reliability scores, but Holsti (1969) cautions that this approach may weaken the validity of the measures.
In a study of leisure themes in international advertising, McCullough (1993) investigated the presence of leisure themes in over 500 print advertisements. Coders were required to test for six latent leisure themes which were the framework for the content analysis of the advertisements. McCullough reports that the 'subjective definitions of leisure used in the study may have contributed to low interjudge reliability scores' (ibid, 384) which averaged between 57% to 65% in the sample. In McCullough's study, she also required coders to test for all dimensions. These low reliability scores illustrate the problematic nature of using latent or more subjective categories in content analysis. In an assessment of the landscape images of brochures, Boomars (2000) also coded for multiple dimensions of Cohen's modes of tourist experience in her study. However, she did not indicate whether coders were used or report intercoder reliability scores.

4.7 Reader-response constructs

The Laswellian model of communications as 'who says what to whom via what channel with what effect' reflects an age-old concern for how communication finds resolution at the receiver end of the message. Within this context, it is suggested that writers employ rhetorical strategies in their presentation of messages to readers. Meanings are therefore a function of the style and structure of messages (Tonkiss, 1998; van Dijk, 1998; Barnes & Duncan, 1992). These variables in this category are based on an attempt to conceptualise and operationalise the textual links between texts and the minds of readers (Scott, 1994; Tompkins, 1980). One of the fundamental enquiries addressed in this study is how meanings of Caribbean destinations are communicated to newspapers readers, as well as how these patterns of representations and meanings are constructed.

4.7.1 Genre Convention - Narrative Voice

In her work on the representation of India in the Lonely Planet guidebook, Bhattacharyya (1997:375) identifies narrative voice as an important indicator of the writer's claim to authority as well as his or her ethical posture. The significance of a stylistic or narrative strategy that conveys authorial expertise or elevation is that 'the reader is likely to feel that his/her own evaluation is unnecessary'. In the case of the travel writing genre of newspapers it is notable that first person pronouns are
generally used. Readers therefore are presented with the view of someone who was not only on location, and who, as any friend can, give a first-hand account of the experience, but also positions the writer as a travel expert who can authoritatively and credibly evaluate the experience (Dann, 1992:60). Pratt (1992) also theorises on the use of what she terms the Imperial ‘I’ in the writings of the early science explorers in the Americas noting that this narrative style was indicative of the their attitude to order, control and manage the foreign countries they visited.

Hard news stories in newspapers are characterised by the use of the passive voice and this tends to be a rigid requirement. However, soft news and features are not so strictly contained, and writers have more freedom to employ various styles. Often the genre convention is adhered to as the structure itself communicates to the reader the type of engagement that is expected between herself and the writer. Departures from genre conventions are therefore important to identify, as they point to different approaches in engaging the reader or even suggest ways in which the genre is evolving. The use of the first person as opposed to the passive voice was therefore coded to account for their relative frequencies in the sample.

4.7.2 Reader Positioning

It is unlikely that any text is written without a purpose in mind. Even if the intentions are not to elicit a specific reader response, but simply to convey information, that is also a purposeful intent. Hard news stories are not deemed to display call to actions techniques as they do not usually have any direct or indirect alliance with those who sell or market products or services. In contrast, marketing and sales communication do not leave consumers’ responses to chance, they are usually clear invitations for consumers to respond to the stimuli presented in the message. The inclusion of features such as contact phone numbers, addresses and web-sites are often placed in advertisements in particular, to ensure that the consumer is guided towards the favourable resolution desired by the sender of the message.

Calls to action normally operate as positive imperatives, albeit sometimes subtle, in their presentation. It is important to note here that a call to action is primarily seen as a positive instruction towards a desired response from the reader to take action after reading the message. This excludes messages that discourage actions not buy a
product. For example, a travel story may exhort readers not to go to a particular
destination, or there may be negative suggestions that tell readers indirectly not to
bother to visit a particular attraction, but these are not calls to action.

Goss (1993:672), in a study of advertisements of Hawaii observes that these texts
tended to constantly challenge the tourist to

'find out', first by consulting an expert witness- the travel agent, who will confirm the
text's theory as well as flights and hotel bookings – and then for themselves by
visiting the islands...Special privilege is according to vision, and advertisements are
promise that readers will see, watch, witness, behold, look at and look into scenic wonders,
visions, views and sights. But 'you' will also smell flowers, orchids (sic), intriguing tales...
and ultimately hear it all...listen to stories...taste wine (672).

These examples listed by Goss illustrate a direct call to action to the reader where the
experience is simulated for the tourist with instructions of what exactly to do. The
experience is choreographed in such a manner that it assumes that the tourist is
offered direction on how to enjoy the experience. For the purposes of this study, it is
important to identify the extent to which call to action techniques are utilised by travel
writers to indicate the level of persuasive content of the texts.

4.7.3 Benefits for the Reader

The relative frequencies of beneficial outcomes and negative ones are coded to
determine the extent to which travel experiences may be presented as positive or
negative to readers. This is not the only measurement for the positivity of a story, but
indeed it is a crucial one, as it essentially links the reader to the text. If benefits for
readers are emphasised, particularly beyond those the writer personally achieved, then
it is apparent that the experience is being conveyed in a positive manner. The
converse of this holds true. It should be noted that coders have been instructed to
code only one variable. This is based on the assumption that writers tend to maintain
a definite position in writing a story.
4.7.4 Sponsor/company identification

Travel articles tend to indicate whether the writer’s trip was sponsored by the National Tourist Organisation (NTO) of a destination, hotel chain, airline or cruise company, a travel intermediary, or in rare instances, the newspaper company. These sponsor identifications may operate in various ways. Companies may feel that they are getting specific exposure if their names are mentioned in the report, or it may be that writers feel obligated to provide at least name exposure for the sponsors of the trip. Some newspapers have a policy not to accept sponsored trips as feel obligated have to write favourably about the experiences at the destination if they do (Seaton, 1991). Reader responses to sponsor credits may be varied. Some readers may respond by contacting the sponsors if they are interested. Others may adjust their views on the credibility of the story if there is a feeling that the travel writer had a stake in writing a favourable story for the sponsor’s benefit (Gartner, 1993; Dann, 1992; Dann, 1996).

Here the frequencies of sponsors mentioned are coded primarily to ascertain which sector of the travel industry are dominant facilitators of press familiarisation tours. Indeed, press trips are generally co-sponsored with various aspects of the cost of the trip being covered by various companies. Overall, this measurement is useful in identifying the level of destination and trade support for press trips.

The last three categories of the coding form – Reader Positioning, Benefits for Reader and Sponsor Identification focus primarily on travel articles. This emphasis supports the research imperative that seeks to determine the nature and level of travel images in the press. While generic news stories give an overall picture of the image of the destinations, there is a specific inquiry undertaken in this study to identify the mediating characteristics of travel stories and to determine the level of persuasive appeals and how they work in relation to readers. These considerations are explored in more detail in these categories.
4.8 Measurement methods for coding form

The categories of the coding form were being measured for the frequency of their occurrence and their relative levels of emphasis in the texts. Nominal scales were used for the measurement of all variable categories in keeping with the purpose of frequency counts. The data from the coding form were imputed to SPSS for relevant statistical tests and these results have been reported in the chapter on Content Analysis Findings.

CONCLUSION

This chapter has provided a detailed explanation of the construction of the coding form. It has shown that category and attribute variables are theoretically grounded, informed by previous studies in the literature, and by observation of the researcher after iterative readings of the sample, as prescribed by content analytical methods. Due consideration was given to adhering to the convention of piloting categories for their reliability during the process of developing the construct and variable attributes of the coding form. The rationale and relevance of both form and content variables were presented in order to clarify the relationship their application to the research inquiry on the images of the Caribbean holiday experience in UK newspapers. This chapter has been concerned with exploring the key issues of the validity of the coding instrument that has been devised for the operationalisation of this study. The following chapter now reviews the media landscape of the UK national Sunday newspapers.
CHAPTER 5

THE UK NATIONAL NEWSPAPER LANDSCAPE

Many of Corker’s anecdotes dealt with the fabulous Wenlock Jakes... ‘When he turns up in a place you can bet your life that as long as he’s there it’ll be the news centre of the world. Why, once Jakes went out to cover a revolution in one of the Balkan capitals. He overslept in his carriage, woke up at the wrong station, didn’t know any different, got out, went straight to an hotel, and cabled off a thousand word story about barricades in the streets, flaming churches...Well, they were pretty surprised at his office, getting a story like that from the wrong country, but they trusted Jakes and splashed it in six national newspapers. That day every special in Europe got orders to rush to the new revolution. They arrived in shoals. Everything seemed quite enough, but it was as much as their jobs were worth to say so, with Jakes filing a thousand words of blood and thunder a day. So they chimed in too. Government stocks dropped, financial panic, state of emergency declared, army mobilised, famine, mutiny and in less than a week there was a honest to God revolution underway, just as Jakes had said, There’s the power of the press for you.’ Taken from Scoop by Evelyn Waugh (1938:67).

INTRODUCTION

The prowess of new information technology in conveying information has not been able to effectively erode the foundations of press power in the United Kingdom. In adapting to the changing times, newspapers have established an electronic presence on the Internet while maintaining their traditional printed news sheet form. Today, newspaper headlines, investigative reports and exposes continue to not only inform and entertain, but to also inspire fear, shock and more importantly influence public mood and attitudes within the society. However since the late 20th century, there has been a trend towards declining readership in the UK. This contraction in newspaper readership has contributed to a media landscape characterised by intense rivalry, oligarchic consolidation of newspaper ownership, and a clear polarisation between the downmarket tabloid and elite newspaper brands. This chapter therefore discusses these distinctive characteristics of the UK national press. It focuses on the salient features of newspaper ownership, readership segments and differences in style and content between the quality broad-sheet and tabloid press.
5.1 The politics of newspaper ownership in the UK

The height of newspaper power in the UK is often associated with the time they were located at their prestigious offices at Fleet Street (Leapman 1992; Tunstall 1996). It was therefore ironic that it was one of their own, the Australian media mogul Rupert Murdoch, proprietor of the quality Times and the popular Sun brands, that orchestrated their exodus to the more modest location at Wapping in the Docklands, situated in East London. While there was some suggestion that the move represented a loss of their venerable status and influence, it was undeniable that the relocation to Wapping pioneered by Murdoch seemed reasonable as the new offices were designed specifically for newspaper operations and appeared to open up a new world of profitability and modernity for them. The economic rationale of the move however, disguised the more radical shift in the balance of power that Murdoch hoped to achieve by breaking the might of the printers union that had long imperilled profitability of the newspaper industry by their frequent exercise of the right to strike (Tunstall 1996).

At Wapping, the offices were fitted with new computerised typesetting and printing equipment that rendered obsolete most of the traditional printing practices and the staff that supported them. Notwithstanding valiant union resistance and years of picketing at the Wapping offices, Murdoch succeeded in his bid for tighter control of his operations and opened the way for other newspaper owners to follow suit. Newspaper owners now had more flexibility to wield control and to make changes to operate more competitively. However, this consolidation of their control also intensified the rivalry and the bloodletting between the top national newspapers for lucrative readership segments, circulation and the advertising dollar.

Sparks (1999:45-46) asserts that the British press is truly capitalist as the UK press market is free from 'extra-economic' interventions by the government. Apart from legislation on content and anti-competitive practices, he argues that the newspaper companies have operated in a free market economy and have been able to pursue
policies to make their businesses profitable. But although the top ten national newspapers compete actively against each other, the reality is that ownership patterns reveal oligarchic control of the market by a few firms. For example, News Corporation, the Mirror Group, the Daily Mail and General Trust and the Guardian Media Group account for nearly 90% of total circulation (Audit Bureau of Circulation, 1991). The dominance of the top four companies presents a daunting prospect for new entrants in the market and this has tended to facilitate oligarchic conditions in the market.

The vast commercial interests of News Corporation spans other media including radio and television broadcasting in the UK, Australia and the United States. Although there are no other newspaper companies with the global scope of Murdoch’s enterprise, seven of them also own and operate regional, provincial or local newspapers (Tunstall 1996:7). Only News Corporation, Pearsons, publishers of the Financial Times and the Canadian based Hollinger Group who own the Telegraph brands, do not operate regional newspapers. For the most part however, regionals have been eclipsed and marginalised by the nationals. According to Sparks (1999:42), although a regional newspaper such as the Scotland on Sunday has been operating nationally in Scotland, it is not considered to be truly national in the overall political geography of the British Isles that see such newspapers as parochial. This may explain why most national newspapers except for the Guardian Media Group are headquartered in London, so that on average, some 69% of all newspapers distributed in the UK are edited in London (Sparks 1999:42).

Their location in the centre of Britain’s political and economic life in London means that national newspapers are seen as being close to the seat of power and influence in the UK. Not only does this imply that they are the most credible sources of information on government and business affairs, but there are also suggestions that these newspapers are also able to galvanise public support for particular political interests and issues. Newspaper owners have been open and vociferous about their political affiliations and have not been reticent in reflecting their positions in the pages of their newspapers. Although the main newspaper companies are not owned or funded by political parties, they are partisan. According to Tunstall (1996:240), throughout the 1980s and most of the 1990s,
national newspapers were ‘right-skewed’ with clear sympathies for the Conservative Tory party. In his study of newspaper articles in 1993, Tunstall (1994:242) found that the ‘Tory’ press were found to have biased coverage in favour of the Conservative agenda, with a predominance of negative stories on the Labour party.

However, the UK political newspaper landscape has been dynamic with newspaper companies abandoning old allegiances and transferring their support to parties that suit their interests. Notably, the old vanguard of the Tory press, that is, News Corporation’s tabloid papers the Sun and News of the World as well as the broadsheet Times and Sunday Times shifted their support to New Labour on the eve of the party’s election to power in 1997. On the other hand, their main rivals the Mirror Group, traditionally Labour, have hardened their stance against the centre right direction of the Labour government. Meanwhile the Daily Mail and General Trust plc seem to have stepped into the position as the main opposition to the New Labour with a move towards a more strident right wing position.

Shifts in political support by the national newspapers also reflect change in ownership often resulting with the inevitable installation of a new editor whose political orientation is in tandem with that of the new owner. As Table 4.1 below shows, the British press are not as ‘right-skewed’ as they were in the 1980s. Tunstall (1996:243) explains that newspapers owners tend to like to be associated with the political ‘winners’ and this may account for some of the political shifts made by some national newspapers. It is also likely that such changes allow newspapers to display their influence and power to political interests, but their may be some commercial risk if this alienates their core readership and reduce circulation.
Table 5.1 - Sunday National Newspapers, Their Owners and Their Politics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Newspapers</th>
<th>Owners</th>
<th>Politics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>News of the World</td>
<td>News Corporation</td>
<td>Centre Left</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Sunday Times</td>
<td>News Corporation</td>
<td>Centre Left</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Mirror</td>
<td>Trinity Mirror</td>
<td>Left</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People</td>
<td>Trinity Mirror</td>
<td>Left</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Mail on Sunday</td>
<td>Daily Mail and General Trust plc</td>
<td>Right</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Express</td>
<td>Northern and Shell</td>
<td>Centre Right</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Telegraph</td>
<td>Hollinger International</td>
<td>Right</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent on Sunday</td>
<td>Independent News and Media</td>
<td>Centre Right</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Observer</td>
<td>Guardian Media Group</td>
<td>Centre Left</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Media UK – 2002 by James Cridland

Newspaper companies may rest on the assurance that they have the support of readers who share their political allegiances. As Table 4.2 below indicates, readers tend to choose newspapers that share their political views. By 1995, it was clear that the majority of the readers of the old Tory press, The Sun and The Times were voting Labour. While the Daily Telegraph maintained its mainly conservative readership both the Daily Mail and the Daily Express showed an almost even split between conservative and labour supporters in their readership. However, it is not clear the extent to which newspapers are able to shift their political stance and maintain the same readers as well as their loyalty. Tunstall (1996:242) reports that a common pattern among readers is that about half agree with their daily paper’s partisanship while a quarter support the opposite party. This suggests that readers may remain loyal to their brand even though they do not agree with the paper’s political views. Therefore it may be risky to infer the scope of the political influence of newspapers solely in terms of their readership.

Table 5.2 Voting preferences of national newspaper readers 1995 (%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Readers of</th>
<th>Other</th>
<th>Lib Dem</th>
<th>Conservative</th>
<th>Labour</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daily Telegraph</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daily Express</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daily Mail</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Times</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sun</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daily Mirror</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guardian</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The editorial and opinion pages are the sections of newspapers where overt political views are usually presented. But as Anderson & Weymouth (1999) point out in their study on British newspaper reporting on the UK, even ‘objective’ news stories reflect anti EU or pro EU discourses depending on the position taken by that newspaper. However, it seems even more unlikely that outside the domain of news, editorials or commentary; political discourses will be able to infiltrate consumer and specialist pages such as travel, motoring or entertainment reviews. But Tunstall (1996:168) disagrees and argues that

*Even travel can be quite political. The *Guardian* on the left and the *Daily Telegraph* on the political right both carry a lot of sections dealing with such semi-political material. There is also, of course, a strong ‘semi-political’ element in much arts, theatre, and book reviewing.*

But such political influences in non-news stories are more nuanced and not overt, and are likely to be inflected in terms of discourses that fit the political world order that the newspaper subscribes to and support. Consequently, Tunstall (1996:170) contends that while consumer pages and sections do not present overt political material, they however exert cultural power. It starts simply with editorial choices and the decision of what topics to include or exclude, the focus of the story and how they are placed on the public agenda. In the case of travel pages this power is demonstrated in the destinations chosen for review or the type of holiday experience covered. These choices represent the power of these apparently innocuous newspaper sections that not only have the ability to highlight and feature particular destinations, but to also influence readers perceptions and attitudes towards them.

5.2 The national Sunday newspapers and their market segments

Most of the dailies have Sunday editions that have their own editors and staff dedicated solely to their production. Generally, the Sunday nationals are considered to be flagship brands that are able to secure premium advertising rates and the highest circulation figures. Like their daily counterparts, the Sunday national newspapers are also divided into the three groups which are mass downmarket tabloids, middle market tabloids and upmarket broadsheets.
Although it sells two million less papers than the News of the World, the Sunday Times is ranked as the unassailable upmarket leader since the 1950s. Based on this prestigious position, the Sunday Times is able to charge premium rates to advertisers while also maintaining top prices for the newspaper. In comparison with the other Sunday newspapers, the Sunday Times has been the most profitable title in British newspaper history and with up to ten sections in each edition, it is also the fattest (Tunstall 1996:16). Table 4.3 shows that the News of the World leads in the downmarket tabloid range and commands the largest circulation of over three and a half million.
Table 5.3-Sunday National Newspaper December 2000-December 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Dec 2001</td>
<td>Dec 2000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>News of the World</td>
<td>3,789,689</td>
<td>3,846,697</td>
<td>-1.48</td>
<td>3,789,916</td>
<td>4,028,810</td>
<td>4,025,023</td>
<td>0.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Mirror</td>
<td>1,659,830</td>
<td>1,752,257</td>
<td>-5.27</td>
<td>1,689,072</td>
<td>1,795,953</td>
<td>1,865,003</td>
<td>-3.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People</td>
<td>1,287,155</td>
<td>1,413,681</td>
<td>-8.95</td>
<td>1,315,950</td>
<td>1,353,371</td>
<td>1,467,688</td>
<td>-7.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mail on Sunday</td>
<td>2,232,728</td>
<td>2,316,638</td>
<td>-3.62</td>
<td>2,286,937</td>
<td>2,315,139</td>
<td>2,228,814</td>
<td>3.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Express</td>
<td>812,324</td>
<td>881,809</td>
<td>-7.88</td>
<td>834,264</td>
<td>905,599</td>
<td>905,599</td>
<td>-7.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Times</td>
<td>1,318,359</td>
<td>1,306,199</td>
<td>0.93</td>
<td>1,342,780</td>
<td>1,358,756</td>
<td>1,331,737</td>
<td>2.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Telegraph</td>
<td>754,011</td>
<td>773,360</td>
<td>-2.50</td>
<td>786,370</td>
<td>776,728</td>
<td>770,674</td>
<td>0.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observer</td>
<td>415,494</td>
<td>398,124</td>
<td>4.36</td>
<td>439,388</td>
<td>441,431</td>
<td>407,926</td>
<td>8.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent on</td>
<td>180,321</td>
<td>196,671</td>
<td>-8.31</td>
<td>223,234</td>
<td>198,923</td>
<td>210,915</td>
<td>-5.58</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Audit Bureau of Circulations, 2001

In 2001, The Mail on Sunday trailed the News of the World with an average circulation of just over two million, while the Independent on Sunday was the poorest performer with an average circulation of some 180,000.

The trend towards declining sales is also shown in Table 4.3. Apart from the Sunday Times and the Observer, the other newspapers all recorded a decline in sales between 2000 and 2001. But newspapers have been facing a market of declining sales for decades having to contend with sales being siphoned off by specialist magazines and the Internet (Stokes & Reading 1999). In order to maintain sales, mass tabloids in particular have relied on price cutting to entice readers from their competitors. In the 1990s there was a protracted price war between the newspapers that led to an overall decline in all sectors of the market (Sparks 1999:49). Mass circulation tabloids, or red tops as they are also called because of the red colour of their mastheads, depend on circulation sales for their survival. Their profitability is based on the volume of sales as up to 80% of their revenue come from sales and 20% from advertising. The reverse is true for quality broadsheet papers, as they receive a minimum of 60% of their revenue from advertising. The middle market newspapers also rely heavily on...
sales for profits, but they have been also keen to attract key market segment of readers that they can sell to advertisers (Sparks 1999:53).

The key distinction between the quality newspapers and their competitors is that their profitability is based on the type of readers they attract rather their circulation figures. As Sparks (1999:52) explains

"From the point of view of selling advertising then, what matters to a newspaper is not the total number of readers it attracts but the social composition of its audience. It can either go for as many readers as possible, accepting that they will necessarily be relatively poor, and thus less attractive to advertisers, or concentrate on reaching a much smaller, but very much richer, audience that is very attractive to advertisers...It was therefore in the interests of the owners of elite newspapers to restrict the circulation of their papers in order to maximise their profits."

If price cutting is therefore not a viable option for quality newspapers, what are their options in order to increase their competitiveness in the market? Sparks contends that it is only by their content or more accurately, the way in which they 'prioritise the kinds of material that they will sell to particular kinds of people' that ensures their competitiveness. A 1997 National Readership Survey showed that 'the five broadsheet titles all had more than 50% of their readers in grades A and B, the two mid-market newspapers had between 20%-30% in that category, while the three mass tabloids had less than 10% of readers in A and B grades' (Sparks 1999:50). Therefore the imperative has been on product differentiation within the newspaper sector that is, with the broadsheet focussing on serious issues of public enlightenment in contrast to the tabloids that are concerned with entertainment and the private lives of celebrities and individuals. The strategy of the elite newspapers is such that their content is shaped and constructed to fit the needs of the social grades of their target readership. Their overall goal is to ensure that there is a clear differentiation between the newspaper products (Sparks1999:49).

It is valid to generally conclude newspaper readership in the UK is stratified across class divisions with the quality broadsheets having mostly an upper and middle class readership while the readership of the mid market and mass tabloids are predominantly working class. However, some newspapers have attempted to extend their readership beyond class divisions as in the case of the Daily Mail and the Mail on Sunday that have successfully targeted female readers. They have also been able
to increase their sales as well as the social composition of their readership towards more educated while collar workers (Sparks & Tulloch 2000:34).

The Daily Mirror and the Sunday Mirror have removed their trademark red top masthead on their newspapers in a bid to move to the mid-market level having failed to reach sustainable circulation levels as the Sun and the News of the World. It appears that the Mirror hopes to reposition in order to compete with the Mail brand as the opposite leftwing to the rightwing position of the Mail in the mid-market sector. However, this attempt by the Mirror group to reposition may not be easily achieved. Changing the signifier of the redtop masthead or content may not seem credible to readers and so not successfully realise the objective of differentiating the product.

5.3 Differentiating newspapers by content
The notion that news stories, consumer sections and editorial are produced with the commercial intent of appealing to their desired market segment may undermine conceptions of the free media as the bastion of democracy. Sparks (1999:45) warns that there should be no illusions that newspaper operations are altruistic despite the many populist calls or social justice campaigns they have instigated.

Newspapers in Britain are first and foremost businesses. They do not exist to report the news to act as watchdogs for the public, to be a check on the doings of government, to defend the ordinary citizen against abuses of power, to unearth scandals or to do any of the other fine and noble things that are sometimes claimed for the press...To the extent that they discharge any of their public functions, they do so in order to succeed as businesses.

Newspapers are constantly preoccupied in finding the right news mix that will ensure their commercial success. News values and the process of newsgathering reflect this end. The general opprobrium of checkbook journalism perhaps fails to account for the need for newspapers to find the stories and that ‘scoop’ that will improve circulation and prestige. Still, it should be remembered that the constraints on rampant commercial journalism are exercised by notions of public trust and credibility that are required by readers and the society at large. This inevitably checks the extent to which news content can be constructed and presented without some attempt to produce the evidence that demonstrates some consistency with objective ‘truth’.
The news media have been further differentiated by a distinction between serious or hard news that have a public emphasis as opposed to soft or news that emphasises the private with a high level of copy on scandal, sports and entertainment (Sparks 2000:12). Quality broadsheets are ranked among the serious press with a high concentration on politics, economics and public life. Tabloids are usually characterised by a low level of serious issues and are dominated by stories on sex, sports and celebrities.

Sparks points out that the distinction between the serious and tabloid press is best represented as a continuum with newspapers positioned at different points depending on the concentration on the type of stories that they publish. However, it is possible that tabloids have been unfairly charged for not adequately covering serious issues. In their study of science news reporting in the prestige and tabloid press in the United States, Evans, Krippendorf, et al. (1990) found that both types of newspapers had about the same proportion of science news. The main difference between them was that quality newspapers tended to use official government, public relations and news wire sources while tabloids usually checked scholarly journals, abstract systems and conference papers as sources for their news stories.

5.4 A typology of newspapers

Five types of newspapers have been identified by Sparks (2000) according to the kind of content and their relative emphases on serious or private issues. These types of newspapers are represented in Figure 3.1 in a continuum model between serious, popular and the supermarket tabloid press.
According to Sparks, the serious press is represented in the UK by the Financial Times. The four main quality broadsheets are included in the semiserious press category featuring content that mainly focuses on hard news but has been increasingly committing more space to feature stories, lifestyle topics and celebrities. The serious-popular press include the two mid-market titles of The Express and The Mail while the news stand tabloid press represent titles such as the News of the World and the Mail on Sunday. Sparks notes that there are no newspapers in the UK that fits wholly into the supermarket tabloid press but this category is generally represented in the United States.

The tabloid press are still subjected to the disdain that was meted to their forbears, known as the penny or pauper press of the 18th century. Today, they are also no less popular that their predecessors commanding over one third of the British newspaper readership (Tunstall 1996). Such high levels of readership are sustained despite criticisms that they are scandalous, trashy and slightly incredulous. It appears logical
to relate their mass circulation to their diet of scandal, celebrity gossip, heartrending stories of the sufferings of the ordinary man as well as the deserved fall of corrupt officials. But it not just the entertainment value or the shock tactics of the tabloid content that only explains their mass appeal. It is also evident that their popularity relates to the ability of the tabloids to resonate with and affirm the view of the world held by their ‘working class’ readers. This point is demonstrated by the comments of an interviewee in Pursehouse’s (1987:10) study of readers of the Sun. When asked to state his opinion why he and so many people bought the paper, he responded that

... cos it’s a very basic paper. It’s not a hard paper to understand, it’s very run-of-the-mill type-compare with like the average person. There’s more middle-class and lower-class than actual upper-class like, which is what The Sun really caters for. I mean I wouldn’t say that it is an upper class paper that ‘toffs’ would read. You don’t find the F.T index in great detail in it or anything like that. It just gives you basic news and basic waffle and— for the everyday person.

Here this Sun reader exposes the class tensions and snobbery of the society that is dramatised in the pages of the tabloid. He establishes the paper’s appeal on the its ability in communicating a common-sense approach to understand the social and nature world. This is characterised by a pragmatic, unpretentious and ‘folk’ knowledge that appeals to the common man. Whereas in the quality broadsheet the cognitive and logical approaches to knowledge and making meaning are privileged, for the tabloids, it is the ritualistic, the impressionistic and emic perspectives that are valued.

5.5 Differentiating media language and styles

It is also possible to differentiate newspapers according to their media language and styles. Namenwirth & Bibbee (1975:52) propose that newspapers either use a restricted or elaborate speech code in conveying their messages. These represent distinct differences in the news language of the quality and tabloid press. They explain that quality broadsheets employ an elaborated code that combines and selects words in a complex manner. The elaborated code is characterised by ‘appeals to reason which have a more theoretical articulation’. The restricted code on the other hand ‘as in rituals, protocol and myth combines and selects words in a simple repetitive fashion’. As the syntax is predictable, it is the expressions and shared identifications and expectations that primarily convey meaning.
Bignell (1997:93) explains further by noting that tabloids use an orally based, restricted set of vocabulary and sentence structure that simulates oral communication while quality newspapers use a more elaborated and complex set of codes which have more in common with written communication. This gives the overall impression of being more authoritative and formal than the popular papers. Broadsheets tend to use longer sentences, no misspelling or contrastive stress within stories, no signifiers or incomplete sentences. By contrast the orality of the tabloids with deliberate misspellings, short and incomplete sentences and clichés, 'connote familiarity, camaraderie and entertainment value' as opposed to the serious formality of the discourses of the quality broadsheets.

From the reader's perspective the elaborated code style requires more cognitive engagement than the restricted code style. The restricted code is more emotionally engaging and not primarily concerned with encouraging cognitive processing. Cottle (1993:22) also identifies two types of news epistemologies or ways of telling stories in the press. He establishes a similar dichotomy between the tabloid and quality press. He proposes that tabloids have a subjectivist news epistemology characterised by a focus on the news from the perspective of the individual. But the quality paper's style of marshalling facts, quoting statistics and expert sources represent a objectivist news epistemology that attempts to present the truth of some social reality. There is no implication that one news epistemology is more effective or influential than the other, but rather that different speech codes or news epistemologies engage readers on different levels. It is being suggested that news language have different levels of appeals whether cognitive or affective in conveying media messages. In other words, there are varying modes that are employed by the quality newspapers and the tabloids in the process of encoding and making meaning in their messages.

Differences in media language occur across newspaper types but also between different types of stories that are published. The differences between hard news and soft news or feature stories are also identified in the language style. Although they did not investigate travel feature stories in newspapers, nevertheless in their study on the differences between news items and tourist brochures, Guijarro & Heranadez (2001:364) show how their rhetorical differences operate with readers. In the study,
Guijarro et al found that the differences were mainly related to the communicative purposes of both text styles. The study concluded that while the communicative tenor of the language of news stories were more impersonal, ‘the persuasive function of the travel brochure led the writer to use linguistic strategies to influence the reader’s behaviour in order to obtain a positive response’.

5.6 Convergence of news values in the UK press
Notwithstanding the distinct differences in media language styles displayed by newspapers, they do not disguise that there are points of convergence of their news values and approaches in the framing of news stories. Newspapers often headline the same stories and usually share assumptions on newsworthiness and issues of significance (Allan 1999:61). In terms of the coverage of foreign countries, Allan (1999:63) points out that among all news media there is a noticeable hierarchy that prioritises elite countries such as the United States and Western Europe at the expense of poorer ‘third world’ countries that are hardly featured.

Usually, stories on poorer countries focus on negative issues and the inhabitants are not given the space to voice their perspective, or if allowed, their spokespersons are not rendered with the same credence and authority as ‘first world commentators’ (Reeves 1993). Western journalists covering lesser-developed countries tend to privilege the views and comments of governmental or elite spokesperson of their own countries so that the subaltern voice as argued by Spivak (1994) never speaks. The consequence is that representations of poorer countries in the first world news discourses are constrained within the boundaries of this news culture.

Arguably, the news that is produced by newspapers is not an objective or impartial account but is constructed by a process that includes and subverts, foregrounds and contextualises according to presupposed, institutionalised practices (Tuchman 1978:196). This kind of news schema also produces ideological effects among news audiences as it normalises and naturalises assumptions of power relations, social meanings and an established world order (Fairclough 1995:14-15). As such newspapers are cultural artefacts and appropriate sites for the examination of discursive formations of society. This study therefore seeks to examine how
representations of Caribbean nations are constructed in terms of the ideological frames and processes of news production. It also investigates how these representations and images are communicated, naturalised and normalised in the pages of national newspapers in the UK, thereby contributing to the perceptions and attitudes of their readership.

CONCLUSION

Faced with a declining readership market, newspapers in the UK have sought to gain competitive advantage through product differentiation. This has contributed to a intensely competitive newspaper sector with periodic bouts of price cutting. The UK newspaper landscape features distinct polarities between the quality broadsheets that emphasise serious issues of politics, finance and social policy, and the tabloid newspapers that predominantly focus on sport, sex and entertainment. In this chapter it was shown that there are contrasting language styles between the newspaper types. While the elaborated speech style of the prestige broadsheets facilitates an impersonal and cognitive response from readers, the restricted speech style of tabloids solicits a more subjective and ritualised engagement with their readers.

The case was also made in this chapter that despite the varying objectivist and subjectivist appeals of the newspaper types, they share some similarities and common ground on their conceptualisation of news worthiness and values. This similarity was demonstrated in the coverage of foreign countries by both tabloid and quality newspapers in the UK that tend to favour elite nations with much lesser and more negative stories on poorer countries. This chapter concluded that while they varied in the mode and the way they approached meaning and the construction of reality, both the quality and the tabloid press in the UK operated in and subscribed to a common news culture. This study continues with a discussion in the next chapter of the
theoretical underpinnings of quantitative and qualitative methods of research in order to clarify their application in this research.
INTRODUCTION
This chapter examines and explicates the principles underlying quantitative and qualitative research traditions in order to clarify their application to this research. As this study employs both positivist content analysis and constructivist discourse analysis that appear to be drawn from opposing research traditions, it was deemed necessary to conduct an in-depth exploration of their knowledge claims. Consequently, this overview traces the evolution of methodological practices and the philosophical ferment that spawned them. The intent is to clearly demonstrate their validity in the research process of this enquiry. Specifically, this chapter also examines debates concerning the use of the interpretivist paradigm in the field of tourism. It also discusses the contention that the field has been ‘under-served’ by qualitative inquiries that have the power to clarify understanding of the complex network of processes that constitute the phenomenon of travel and tourism.

6.1 Clarification of Methodological Traditions
Although expositions of the distinction between quantitative and qualitative research have progressed beyond the reductionist definition of the use of numbers as opposed to words, explanations on their varying characteristics remain a contested ground (Hammersley, 1996:161). The quantitative-qualitative debate has been conducted on many fronts in academic fora, ranging from the exact definition and characteristics of the research methods, the epistemological and ontological assumptions inherent in each of them, and the basis for their combination in research. At times, questions of efficacy and superiority of one approach over another tend to bedevil arguments to

---

such an extent that the 'divide' between them seems insurmountable. Those who argue from a particular preference tend to denigrate the other position in making their case, while some researchers seek to reconcile quantitative and qualitative methodologies, and argue for a continuum that eliminates the notion of polarities between the two approaches.

This critique seeks to elucidate the philosophical positions of positivism, critical theory and constructivism that comprise the range of quantitative and qualitative methods of research. The fundamental principles and tenets of the varying methodological approaches indicate the ways they may be best applied and used in various research enquiries.

6.2 Positivism and the roots of methodological research

The historical periods identified as the Renaissance and the Reformation are noted for ushering in the age of reason when the stranglehold of Medieval Church dogma and ways of knowing were challenged and overthrown. Questions such as 'how do we gain knowledge of the world?' emerged from the ferment of philosophical debate occasioned by the questioning of the orthodoxy and theology of existing scholarship (Murphy, Greatbatch, et al., 1998:17). The roots of methodological philosophy can therefore be traced to the scepticism of Enlightenment discourse that rejected the established view that phenomena possessed occult or hidden qualities beyond the domains of experience. But it was this emphasis on experience that was significant in demarcating the foundations of rational, positivist thinking from traditional metaphysical doctrines.

Essentially, the bedrock of positivist thinking is based on the argument that a distinction can be made between questions that are to be defined as legitimate knowledge and issues that are unlikely to be resolved in that they reside outside the realm of human experience and experimental enquiry (Kolakowski, 1993:3). According to the doctrine of positivism, a scientific worldview is not concerned with inquiries of the world 'in itself' that cannot be supported by observation. Positivist views therefore reject knowledge claims that cannot be justified or falsified by empirical data. Consequently, knowledge claims must be based on identifying those
features of the world that are accessible to human experience. Kolakowski (1993) writes that

\emph{Defined in the most general terms positivism is a collection of prohibitions concerning human knowledge, intended to confine the name ‘knowledge’ or ‘science’ to the results of those operations that are observable in the evolution of the modern sciences of nature (7).}

As a philosophy of science, positivism excludes metaphysical knowledge systems, while it also legitimises and reifies the capacity of the rational mind to apprehend the phenomenon being observed and to make empirical judgements. Value judgements however, are anathema to positivistic norms. This is primarily because there is no logical way to falsify or prove whether value concepts are true. For example, value judgements such as ‘good’ or ‘evil’ are not objective entities or ‘monads’\(^2\) that exist in a physical world (Murphy, Greatbatch, et al., 1998:26).

Positivists therefore view value judgements as arbitrary and not based on scientific grounds as they cannot be deemed to have a real existence ‘in themselves’ outside of their names and expressions as mental constructs by individuals. According to (Archer, 1988:272), positivism advocates a theory of knowledge (epistemology) which asserts that fact and value are distinct, thereby making value free knowledge achievable. Non-positivists reject this view however, using the argument that is almost impossible to distil values from facts so that despite claims of objectivity, so-called scientific knowledge is still infiltrated by value judgements. The possibility of value free knowledge therefore assumes that the enquiring subject can stand apart from the phenomenon being investigated, that is, to be objective. It is the state of objectivity that restricts the subjective observations or biases of the investigator who has to put aside personal beliefs, opinions and feelings and empirically discover the nature or the principles underlying various phenomena.

Generally, the positivist enquiry begins from the point of conceptualisation, governed by an attitude and an acceptance of a belief system and worldview that rigidly subscribes to an ideal of what constitutes knowledge. From this stance, a system of

\footnote{The German philosopher Gottfried von Leibniz (1646-1716) argued that the world was filled with objective entities which he called ‘monads’ He maintained that in spite varying perspectives on these objects or their relationships with each other, their inherent qualities and characteristics were immutable.}
procedures and methods is prescribed which ensures that this paradigm is applied in such a manner that all the criteria of producing 'legitimate' knowledge are met. When they are formalised into a system of methods, that is methodology, these procedures become the building blocks of scientific research and the basis to explain phenomena. In other words, this systemisation of methods is able to describe phenomena, and more significantly, to organise and arrange the stages and processes of the enquiry, so that component parts of the phenomenon is investigated in order to account for its manifestation in the 'real' world. Mere human observation therefore has to be subjected to a logical system of discovery.

True knowledge could not be reached by undisciplined mental processes, but the use of the intellectual tool of scientific method allowed for the control and refinement of reason so that it could produce objective knowledge. (Polkinghorne, 1989:22)

It is within the context of the appropriate application of these methodological procedures that objectivity can be achieved. That which is objective has temporal consistency and therefore can be identified by different researchers at any time if the method of enquiry is replicated. This is possible because of the existence of universal, fixed principles in reality. For positivists, this conception of reality or ontological position, implies a reality that exists 'out there' governed by principles that are unchanging and functions according to fixed laws. Consequently, methodological application is able to unveil underlying principles of this 'reality' manifested in causal relationships, dependencies, interdependencies, correlation and patterns of phenomena. Following on this systematic accretion of knowledge of phenomena through a process of methodological rigour, findings are produced that offer explanations and generalisations beyond the specific research being undertaken. Outcomes of this process are expansions in the body of knowledge of the nature and behaviour of phenomena.

Unarguably, the concept of methodology is a positivist notion particularly in terms of an approach that establishes guidelines and protocols that are used by the researcher to direct the inquiry is such a manner to clarify phenomena. Methodology is therefore a legacy of positivist thinking that is an accepted standardised approach for conducting all kinds of research in both the natural and social sciences. A guiding doctrine of positivism is that of methodological monism which means that the unity of
scientific method is applicable to all kinds of subjects for scientific investigation (von Wright, 1993:10). These general laws are therefore deemed applicable to the study of social actors as well as phenomena. Consequently, the principle of methodology has been inscribed and readily accepted by competing research traditions whether quantitative or qualitative (Wood, 1999:7). One significant point of departure between the approaches is the intent of the methodological application in research, in that, positivists will make no loftier claim than to ‘clarify’ phenomena. But for non-positivists, methodologies can be developed and expanded beyond the limited remit of clarification and explanation or ‘Erklären’, to wider applications of social research that privileges the researcher with an understanding or ‘Verstehen’ of the social processes as well as social actors (von Wright, 1993:11). Despite their differences however, both positivists and non-positivists to a degree share the positivistic conviction that a methodological premise is the foundation for determining universals facts or understanding of the character and behaviour of phenomena.

It is logical that a process aimed at determining fixed, universal laws will be temporally consistent and prescribe to a formulaic routine of methods in the conduct of investigations. A scientific research that follows the rules is therefore reliable, that is, when replicated and reproduced, findings remain the same. They also have to valid in that the methods applied do in fact measure what they are proposed to measure. When these criteria are fulfilled, it is possible to be predictive. Within the positivist framework, validity is an extension of the Correspondence Theory of Truth which argues that scientific findings correspond to an ‘objective reality’ (Kvale, 1989:75). As a key evaluative tool for research investigations, validity must be demonstrated throughout the research process from the data collection stage through to the analysis and conclusions at the end. Validity is a tool that is used to check and question the process of the research so that there is an overall system of verification that ensures the consistency of the investigation and that it lines up with some
theoretical position. According to Kvale, (ibid 74), 'validity equals correlation with a
criterion' so essentially, validity shows how knowledge claims are justified. Kvale
however, challenges the grounds of the positivist conceptualisation of validity and
argues that one of the dangers of a focus on validity may be to 'foster an emphasis
upon the verification of existing knowledge rather than on the generation of new
knowledge'. In raising this cautionary note, Kvale suggests that in spite of the merits
of validity for effective research, in its purely positivist conception, it is not to be
enshrined as the only ideal for verifying knowledge claims.

6.3 Interpretative approaches in research
The emergence of alternative paradigms and approaches to apprehending the world
developed within the context of critiques of the empiricist methodology of positivism,
particularly in relation to researching social phenomena (Denzin & Lincoln 1998;
Schwandt 1998; Nightingale & Cromby 1999; Potter 1996). The quest for the
understanding of social processes and actors led to the conviction that in order to
arrive at meaning, interpretation must take place (Schwandt, 1998:222). The
Weberian notion of Verstehen or understanding is a forerunner to a number of
interpretivist approaches that are related to hermeneutics, that is, a theory of
meaning.5 Whereas positivism centres on external, observable phenomena,
interpretivism changes the focus to the internal, on the motivations and experiences
that account for and explain human behaviour. The emphasis on understanding of the
subjective by interpretivists is based on the view that people have an 'internally
experienced sense of reality.' (Gunter, 2000:6). Interpretivists claim that the gateway
or route to an understanding of subjective experiences can be accessed discursively.
Consequently, within the interpretivist tradition, the perusal and examination of texts,

---

3 Archer (1998:273) uses the term non-positivism to refer the wide range of philosophical positions
that reject positivist norms.
4 von Wright (1993:11) notes that the German historian and philosopher Droysen is to be credited for
introducing the methodological dichotomy in defined in the German terms Erklären and Verstehen
translated in English means explanation and understanding respectively. According to Droysen while
the methodological practices in the natural sciences sought to explain, human science investigation
were aimed at understanding phenomena. Another German philosopher, Dilthey also expanded the
concept to Verstehen to apply to an emphatic position of the researcher in an attempt to understand
experiences of social actors.
5 The word interpretivist, interpretive and interpretative appear to variant spellings of the same word.
In accordance with Schwandt 1998's spelling popularised in the text Handbook of Qualitative
Research (Guba & Lincoln, 1998) eds, interpretivist is used in this study.
conversations, written words and pictures as a means of uncovering embedded meanings is paramount (ibid: 5).

Interpretivist persuasions therefore focus on developing philosophical and paradigmatic postures rather than outlining procedures and methods for the research process. Interpretative approaches generally represent a range of alternatives to empiricist epistemology. These include methods such as symbolic interactionism, interpretive interactionism and constructivism. Their common epistemological root is the conviction that positivism is not the sole basis of gaining knowledge of the world. While methodological positivism eschews value judgements, the interpretative approach is normative in method application. The interpretivist tradition therefore undermines the traditional view of methodology with its system of procedures and rigid protocols that are abstract and formalised. Instead, the interpretative orientation privileges the ability and the right of the researcher to exercise judgement in applying methods appropriately based on the context of the research. This contrasts starkly with positivism that views methods as the means to avoid subjectivity and achieve the valued benefit of objectivity.

The interpretative turn reorients the ontological search for a reality that is separate and apart from the researcher, and locates this search in terms of the an acknowledgement of the researcher as being ‘irretrievably a part’ of the system of the production of meaning by his or her participation in the ‘circle of readings or interpretations’ (Schwandt, 1998:227). The overall aim of pursuing these readings and interpretations is to gain insights into the link between theory and praxis, thereby producing a body of knowledge that is useful and has social relevance and applicability. Since interpretivists argue that there is no objective reality to be discovered, they maintain that the object of investigation and the tools of investigation share the context of human reality and cannot be separated.

---

6 The terms constructionism and constructivism have been used interchangeably in the literature. Henwood (1994) argues that the terms are synonymous. Therefore researchers who take the position of epistemological constructionism or epistemological constructivism holds the view that versions of reality are constructed in the research process and that outcomes are not facts of self-evident objective reality. Potter (1994:128) however argues that constructionist positions are varied and commonly characterised by an opposition to realist assumptions. He also distinguishes a field he terms social constructivism that focuses on ‘social processes in texts and rhetoric’. However, the term constructivism as popularised by the main proponents Guba and Lincoln is used in this study.
Furthermore, because of the contextual nature of phenomena, interpretivist researchers are caught up in a dialectical and hermeneutical circle that is constantly renewing and expanding interpretations and meanings. Interpretative researchers do not have to rely on a set of procedures or methods that attempt to guarantee the reliability and the hence the validity of their inquiries since they do not subscribe to the epistemological assumption of objectivity.

Nevertheless, the lack of clear procedures or methods leaves the interpretative approach vulnerable to the charge of being arbitrary and lacking in rigour. (Potter, 1996: 129) refutes this criticism by stating that

...the lack of a 'method', in the sense of some formally specified set of procedures and calculations, does not imply that the theoretical system is not guiding analysis in various ways.

Essentially theoretical considerations are foremost in interpretative inquiries and serves as the benchmark for the conduct of the investigation and evaluation. Guba and Lincoln (1998:216) sanction Potter's claims with their assertion that an epistemological understanding of the paradigm differences is the foundational methodological 'know-how' or technique required by the researcher. It is not that there is a total disregard for methods, as there are common activities that must be undertaken in the research exercise.

Schwandt (1998:222) points out that all researchers on the ground still have to 'watch, listen, ask, record and examine'. In other words whether it is interviews, archival research, participant observation or any such method, an interpretative theoretical and epistemological conviction underpins the process. The purpose of the inquiry is therefore informed by the epistemological position and directs the operationalisation of the research.

This reorientation of methodology within the interpretative tradition has implications for verification and testing of interpretative findings. This problematique is resolved in positivist methodologies as the validity criterion is systemised and operationalised.
The rejection of this notion of validity in interpretivist traditions calls for other indicators to judge and assess interpretations. The so-called ‘problem of criteria’ (Schwandt, 1998:246) arises with the question of the basis on which subjective analysis mediates overall inter-subjective meanings. According to Schwandt, the main argument proposed by constructivists is that of the ‘goodness criteria’ which maintains that if the method fits the aims of the research then there are grounds to accept the interpretation as plausible. Going beyond that position to greater claims of the discovery of ‘truth’ is impossible in light of the relativity of knowledge and the polyvalency of meaning.

Schwandt notes that within constructivism some analysts such as Hammersley, concede the notion of a subtle realism that argues that ‘truth, worth, or value of a claim, theory, interpretation, construction ...is ultimately determined by something beyond the claim, theory, interpretation, construction’. Therefore, while there may be varied interpretations, these are all basically accurate if they are relevant to aspects of the phenomenon being described. Essentially, Hammersley modifies the notion of the ontological relativity in an attempt to link findings with some objective ‘being-in-the-world’. Substantively, interpretative approaches reorients the concept of validity in terms of evaluative measures of thoroughness, trustworthiness, coherence and comprehensiveness (ibid 229).

Potter (1996:139) emphasises reader evaluation as a major criterion in the notion of validity in interpretative exercises. He contends that the most important and distinctive feature of validation in constructivist approaches is the presentation of rich and detailed materials in a manner for readers to assess their adequacy. In this way, readers will be afforded the opportunity to judge the materials and interpretations as well as the adequacy of the claims.
6.4 Constructivism

Beyond the general critique of positivist empiricism characterised by the ‘interpretivist orientation, constructivism goes further in challenging the main epistemological, ontological and methodological tenets of positivism. Positivist dogma of objective truth and empirical realism are refuted by constructivism (Schwandt, 1998:236). The main argument that propels constructivism is that there is no objective truth ‘out there’ on which to pin observations and findings in order to determine reality or the nature of the world. Rather, truth is located within the minds of individuals, and it is formed through their agreement and acceptance of these findings at a particular moment in time.

Subsequently, new truths may be formed depending on whether there is a new consensus or revision based on emergence of new information and readings. Since ‘truth’ is relative and plural within the constructivist framework, it follows that there is an accommodation of multiple versions and constructions of the same phenomenon. Findings and outcomes of research are therefore constructions that emerge from the process of the research. This process is not linear or defined, but is dynamic involving a ‘dialectic of iteration, analysis, critique, reiteration, reanalysis’ (ibid 243). The constructive paradigm therefore integrates a relativist epistemological and ontological stance with the application of methodology in research. It also charts an alternative framework for making knowledge claims. Table 6.1 below outlines the contrasting paradigmatic positions between positivism and constructivism.

---

7 Social constructionism is examined here in detail as it represents one of the main areas of development of constructivist principles and practice. It is noted by Nightingale & Cromby (1999) that social constructionism is a type of psychology that subscribes to constructivist ideals that in particular emphasises the discursive turn, that is, the role of language in forming the world. They point out that even though there is a broad consensus of views among social constructivists, they are no means homogenous, as there are different strands within social constructionism. One strand of social constructionism is a so-called ‘dark version’, emanating from the work of Foucault that focuses on issues of power and subjectivity, while there is also the ‘light version’ that examines discourse and social process.
Table 6.1 Contrasting paradigmatic positions of positivism and constructivism

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Positivism</th>
<th>Constructivism</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inquiry aim</td>
<td>explanation, prediction and control</td>
<td>understanding, reconstruction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nature of knowledge</td>
<td>verified, hypotheses established on facts or laws</td>
<td>individual reconstruction, coalescing around consensus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge accumulation</td>
<td>accretion – building blocks, generalisations and cause-effect linkages</td>
<td>more informed and sophisticated reconstructions, vicarious experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goodness or quality criteria</td>
<td>conventional benchmarks of 'rigour' internal and external validity, reliability and objectivity</td>
<td>trustworthiness and objectivity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voice</td>
<td>disinterested scientist as informer or decision makers, policy makers, and change agents</td>
<td>'passionate participant' as facilitator of mutlivoice reconstruction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training</td>
<td>technical and quantitative, substantive theories</td>
<td>resocialisation, qualitative and quantitative, values of altruism and empowerment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Adapted from (Guba & Lincoln 1998:210)

Significantly, the training requirements for the constructivist researcher involve a process of resocialisation that moves from a distancing from the context of the research to a position of engagement. It alerts the researcher to the awareness that the methods in themselves are not do not ‘uncover reality, but instead, they are agents of the production of constructions of reality.

This stance of engagement explains why within constructivism, the research enquiry is focused on the world of lived experiences. It takes the epistemological position that in order to achieve an understanding of the world, there must be an examination of social artefacts such as language and culture that accounts for how meaning is created and constructed. Language is therefore particularly crucial, as it expresses the patterns of social relationships, interactions and socially constructed meaning systems. Through an in-depth examination of language and the discourses produced, people’s subjective perspectives of reality may be determined in a bid to explain human behaviour, motivations and understandings. Language therefore functions as the expression of experience and as such is responsible for the social construction of
the world. Reality then, can only refer to the world that is discursively constructed. Potter's (1996:126) quote of John Shotter and Kenneth Gergen's explanation of social constructivism in worth noting here as it puts forward the rationale for the constructivist emphasis on the world of lived experiences:

(Social constructionism) has given voice to ...the role of power in the social making of meanings; rhetoric and narrative in establishing sciences; the centrality of everyday activities; remembering and forgetting as socially constructed activities; reflexivity in method and theorising. The common thread underlying all these topics is a concern with the processes by which human abilities, experiences, common-sense and scientific knowledge are both produced in, and reproduce, human communities.

The primacy of social processes within social constructivism stands in opposition to other traditions in psychology such as behaviourism and cognitivism (Pujol & Montenegro, 1999:83). Within the discursive psychology strand, there is concentration on how events are constructed in social and cultural life and manifested in talk, conversations, discourses and signifying practices. In contrast to attitude research or cognitivist inquiries, constructivists privilege language as the means of representing and constructing the world. Consequently the reality transmitted by language is essentially discursive. The constructivist perspective therefore argues that reality can only be represented in texts, that is, in social artefacts, since there is no essence of reality that can be captured beyond language.

6.5 Basis for method combination in research

While there are dominant voices that advocate an accommodation between the quantitative and qualitative methods in research based on pragmatic grounds, they do not necessarily share a homogenous position on the basis for method combination in research. (Murphy, Greatbatch, et al. 1998:58) distinguishes various ‘turns’ or positions that are held by researchers who choose to combine qualitative and quantitative methods based on an instrumental premise. The first view proposes qualitative research as junior partner to the more preferred quantitative method. As such, qualitative methods are given a subsidiary role in the exploratory or pilot stages of the research. The qualitative is then regulated to only those instances when statistical methods are inappropriate.

---

8 It is again important to point out departures in views among social constructivists. While some such as Potter hold the view that reality is a discursive construct, that is, ‘there is no reality beyond the text’, others who subscribe to critical realist position believe there is a extra discursive dimension to reality.
The second position is that proposed by researchers such as Hammersley (1992) and Silverman (1993) that denies any hierarchy of methods in application to research questions. This position has been termed as 'Horses for Courses' by (Murphy, Greatbatch, et al. 1998:59). Here, the researcher chooses the best tool that produces the most fulsome results for the enquiry. The third turn is that of ascribing qualitative research a pre-eminent position as senior partner. In the hierarchy of choices, qualitative methods takes precedence to quantitative on the grounds of the specific strengths of qualitative research in uncovering the social processes and the subjective realities of actors.

These distinctions can be further extended in terms of their paradigmatic emphasis, their role in relation to ensuring the validity of the research, and the main context of their application in the research. Table 6.2 below sets out this relationship in order to clarify the areas of divergence. A positivist epistemology tends to support the role of qualitative method as junior partner. Concerns for operationalisation and generating data in order to address the research question and to build hypothesis are the major considerations in this approach. The main research activity however, remains the quantitative focus on which the main findings will be based. Pragmatism and the need to clarify and explore the dimensions of the research are the methodological motivations for the Horses for Courses approach. However, the researcher takes centre-stage being equipped with an expansive knowledge of the range of methodological tools. It is this know-how that guides the selection of the best methods to realise the aims of the study. The preceding position contrasts to the view of qualitative research as senior partner where the decision is basically epistemological and motivated by the aim to represent subjective reality. According to (Murphy, Greatbatch, et al. 1998:61), in this approach there is concern to ‘develop true accounts, whether by descriptions or explanations, of the way the world is’. However, it is important to emphasise that these distinctions are not mutually exclusive and areas of overlapping and convergence may occur between them.
Table 6.2 Types of Instrumental Method Combination

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Method Combination</th>
<th>Paradigm emphasis</th>
<th>Main purpose</th>
<th>Primary determinants of choice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>QR as junior partner</td>
<td>Positivist</td>
<td>Operationalisation, data gathering</td>
<td>Research question, type of data required</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Horses for Courses’</td>
<td>Constructivist</td>
<td>Clarifying, expanding and exploring the dimension of the research</td>
<td>Researcher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QR as senior partner</td>
<td>Constructivist</td>
<td>To adequately represent experiences and processes that may be been missed in quantitative approaches</td>
<td>Epistemological decision</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Murphy, Greatbatch et al (1998)

Significantly, this table also explicates the varying positions within the instrumental method combination perspective and shows how the three positions relate to epistemological and methodological and theoretical concerns faced by researchers. It is also clear that no one ‘type’ of method combination is entirely comprehensive. It has been suggested that in such cases, there are trade-offs which the researcher faces whenever one method or approach is chosen over the other. Hammersley, (1992), Murphy, Greatbatch, et al. (1998), Silverman, (1993), Fielding & Schreier (2001). It is therefore advisable for the researcher to recognise that what is gained in quantitative methods in terms of higher reliability and validity reduces the contextual and depth. On the other hand, the advantage of ‘thick’ description and depth in qualitative research for example, usually comes at the expense of higher reliability. It is this aim to gain the benefits of the various methods in a singular research that has characterised the main approaches to method combination.
6.6 The role of triangulation

The role of triangulation in research was originally suggested means for qualitative researchers to address concerns for inherent bias in the research process. Patton (1990:464), notes that Denzin who proposed this concept in qualitative of triangulation stated that

*By combining multiple observers, theories, methods and data sources, 'researchers can hope to' overcome the intrinsic bias that come from single-methods, single-observer, and single-theory studies. (Denzin, 10970:313)*

Clearly, triangulation was conceptualised within the pragmatic, instrumental tradition in order to mainly address issues of validity and verification in the qualitative process. Again, the notion of a trade-off is suggested, as the benefits of one method is applied as a means to redress the bias of the other. Triangulation was also conceptualised as a means of reducing the risk of systemic distortions inherent in single method usage (Kelle, 2002) (Para 6). So that a hypothesis checked by a series of tests using various methods is likely to be more 'valid' than one relying only on a single method. According to Denzin's argument, methodological triangulation in particular, creates the advantage of 'playing each method off against the other so as to miximise validity of field or 'ethnographic' effort with the result of reducing the threats to internal and external validity (Kelle, op.cit, Para 6). This cross-validation in triangulation may be conducted across several parameters. Patton, (1990:464) lists four types of triangulation used in qualitative analysis. These he defined as

**Methodological triangulation** which is perhaps the most popular, involves cross-checking findings based on different data collection methods.

**Source triangulation** – the consistency of the different data sources within the same method is cross-checked

**Analyst triangulation** – Several analysts review the findings of the research
Theory/perspective triangulation – when multiple perspective and theories are used to interpret the data.

Essentially for Patton (op.cit, 470), triangulation is a validation process that is utilised as ‘strategies for reducing systematic bias in the research’.

But this idea of triangulation as an sure means of achieving mutual validation has been challenged by several researchers, notably Fielding & Fielding (1986) who argue that different methods may produce separate errors and as such convergence in results is no guarantee of validity. This means that the errors in one or the other method are not obviated by their combination and cross-checking of results.

Furthermore, Fielding & Fielding (op.cit 31) maintain that since different methods are based on divergent epistemological assumptions, it is possible that several ‘different methods my actually increase the chance of error’. Kelle (Para 7) also points out that strong correlations between results may be indication of the fact that ‘both results are right or that they are wrong in the same way. Besides, in the event that triangulation produces different results, or there is no corroboration in findings, it cannot be concluded that this is evidence of inherent biases in the process. On the contrary, Jensen & Jankowski (1991:63) state that when findings fail to corroborate each other it is the beginning of research, and ‘further empirical, but also theoretical work is needed to specify the explanatory value of different methods of data collection.’ It is therefore not clear that the failure of corroboration of findings is always an indication of a weakness of the validity of the overall research process.

6.7 Methodological Triangulation

Although methodological triangulation is often the focus of discussion and review, Fielding & Schreier (2001:Para 31) point out that there are other approaches to method combination apart from triangulation. They have termed these method combination sequencing and hybrids. Sequencing is defined by the authors as the use of quantitative and qualitative methods within the same study in different phases of the research process. An example is that of a qualitative phase of data collection which precedes a quantitative phase of data analysis. Hybrids however, are defined as
approaches 'which in themselves constitute a combination of qualitative and quantitative features which are so integrated that the distinction is hardly discernible (op.cit Para 33). Systematic content analysis is listed by Fielding & Schreier as an example of an hybrid as this method combines the 'qualitative coding of texts with the quantitative calculation of coefficients of interrater agreement'. Sequencing and hybrids are similar in many respects, but as noted by the authors, 'they differ in the sense that hybrids require precisely one specific combination of the qualitative and quantitative phases, whereas in sequencing, any kind of combination is possible'.

The definition of methodological triangulation in the research literature however, has been more contentious than other variants of method combination. This is mainly due to nebulous areas regarding to working out of epistemological concerns of research in relation to methods and procedures. For Kelle (2002:Para 10), the use of triangulation in research practice relates metaphorically to the classic definition of the term within the context of trigonometry. This has resulted in no one definitive, conclusive approach that is prescribed by the term. In defining methodological triangulation, he points out that

\[
\text{If we use the metaphor of triangulation is such a way that we regard the results of qualitative and quantitative methods as analogous to the results of single measurement operations in triangulation, that means we wish to describe different aspects of the same phenomena with the help of two methods, and one will naturally expect different but not contradictory) results.}
\]

Here triangulation is presented as an approach that is employed to 'produce a more complete and fuller picture of the social phenomena under review (op. cit, Para 12). But this is one of two main positions that emerge from the term triangulation and how it can be applied in research. The other position sees triangulation as an approach to ensure validation of 'methods and research results in order to identify threats to validity'. The pertinent question that arises is how the researcher is to approach these divergent positions on methodological triangulation.

Table 6.3 summarises the advantages and limitations of the varying positions on methodological triangulation. However, an important caveat is that these different positions are not mutually exclusive in their application, but they are instructive in terms of the purposes for which methodological triangulation may be utilised in a
An awareness of the relative strengths and weaknesses of the various approaches is useful for the researcher in order to make appropriate strategic decisions in the course of the research. Whatever position(s) that is undertaken in a research project it is critical that it is consistent with the overall objectives of the research.

Although there have been questions the on utility of triangulation in reducing threats to validity, still sceptics of this view such as Fielding & Fielding concede that it helps the researcher to take a critical stance towards the data. Ultimately, this stance opens the way for a more comprehensive and intensive understanding of the phenomena being investigated. But there are also risks to reliability in this triangulation approach as the analysis may be skewed only in favour of locating points of convergence in the findings that supports the research question.

### Table 6.3 Advantages and Disadvantages of Methodological Triangulation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Purposes of Triangulation</th>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Advantages</th>
<th>Disadvantages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mutual validation, to identify threats to validity</td>
<td>Denzin &amp; Lincoln, (1998), Patton, (1990) Berg (2001)</td>
<td>Addresses concerns of inherent biases in any one methods used in the research. Helps the analyst to take a more critical and discerning stance to the data, particularly in field studies, triangulation offers the researcher a means detachment from the data.</td>
<td>There is no guarantee of validity as errors can occur in both methods used. Correlation may be an indication of ways in which methods share similar errors.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To provide breadth and depth to research</td>
<td>Fielding &amp; Schreier, (2001), Kelle (2002) Hammersley (1996)</td>
<td>Gives a fuller more complete picture of the phenomena under review. Provides a basis to explore micro and macro levels of social processes.</td>
<td>Reliability may be reduced as there is a reliance on the researcher as ‘an active agent’ who identifies the convergence of the data with the research enquiry. As the main intent is not to ‘validate’ the analysis may be biased towards data that supports the research question.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author

However, this danger can be minimised by the analyst maintaining a reflexive mode that constantly keeps check on the process in terms of the overall theoretical underpinnings of the enquiry. According to Kelle (2002),(Para 4), the theoretical context of the research is especially pivotal in providing guidelines for the kinds of
strategic method applications that will facilitate the research. He argues that methodological and epistemological concepts alone cannot adequately answer the question of which methods may be best to investigate the social phenomena under review or if qualitative and quantitative methods should be combined at all in the research. Kelle therefore takes the 'instrumental' view that in the process of research there are strategic decisions that are made in the quest for 'truth'.

The intent of the methodological combination therefore recognises that while statistical facts provide explanation at the macro level, other interpretations can also be uncovered at the micro level to open up dimensions of understanding of the phenomena under review. Fielding & Schreier clarifies this view from an epistemological standpoint by noting that although different methods rely on competing epistemologies, their combination give range and depth to the research process. They caution however, that there are limitations to this strategic use of methodological triangulation to increase the chances of obtaining 'objective' truth. In a metaphorical sense, the methodological triangulation paradigm can be seen operating like a prism that diffracts beams of light on a spectrum to produce varying levels of illumination.

6.8 Application of methodological triangulation in this study

This study utilises the two methods of quantitative content analysis and qualitative discourse analysis. Based on the definition of Fielding & Schreier, content analysis is adopted as an 'hybrid' method. However, the combination of content and discourse analysis applied for this study constitutes a form of methodological triangulation. It is not sequencing, as the discourse analysis method is not entirely dependent on the content analytic results or vice versa. Each method is independent and can therefore stand on its own in terms of the findings that are produced. However, the overall analysis of results integrates the findings of the two approaches with the intent to explore the various dimensions and facets of the research topic.

In an article on the application of triangulation in qualitative research (Decrop, 1999:158) proposes 'triangulation as a way to make qualitative findings more sound, and to gain larger acceptance of qualitative tourism studies'. However, this approach
is not adopted in this research. Methodological triangulation has been utilised in this study in order to answer the research question rather than as a means of validation of the qualitative findings. While it follows logically that the findings of discourse analysis are validated by the quantitative content analysis and vice versa, yet the main purpose of their combination is not a validation process to gain acceptance of the qualitative findings. This paper therefore appropriates the stance suggested by Fielding & Schreier (2002) and Kelle that methodological triangulation is to provide depth and a means of uncovering dimensions of understanding of the phenomenon being investigated.

The research literature does not provide explicit guidelines on procedures on how to treat data generated from the combination of methods. However, Baptiste's (2001) recommendation on the strategic decisions or moments that are made by the qualitative researcher during the analytic process is instructive. The researcher has the choice to take a positivist approach by focussing on the statistical elements of the data and making that aspect the focus of analysis.

Cupchik (2001), (Para 15) observes that positivists 'have a greater interest in uncovering specific functional relationships between operationalised variables'. Consequently, the associated tasks include highlighting statistical correlations as the basis for establishing the relationships between variables in making generalisations and inferences on predictability. On the other hand, the constructivist or qualitative approach may be focussed on linking data in such a manner to 'develop stories and build theories' (Baptiste, Para 37). According to Cupchik,( Para 15), this position focuses on 'describing the coherent structure of a multilayered phenomena and strengthens the fabric of understanding'. In this respect the researcher is then able to put forward a comprehensive picture of the relationships between the various concepts and construct an overall understanding of the phenomena.

The main objective of this study is to examine the image of the Caribbean in the UK national press. To achieve this aim, quantitative content analysis has been used to identify the constructs and variables related to the image of the Caribbean in the UK national press. The pattern of variables relationships across the newspapers are cross tabulated and correlated to determine the 'manifest' features of the representations.
and their relative frequencies. Discourse analysis has also been applied to determine the ways in which these representations of these image constructs are constructed and how they relate to wider cultural currents in the practice of tourism. The results of the two methods are analysed qualitatively in that there is a focus on constructing a 'story' from the pattern of variable frequencies and relationships established from the quantitative content analysis as well as the findings from the discourse analysis on how these themes and variables are constructed. This triangulated approach addresses the main objective of this study to determine the image of Caribbean destinations that is presented in the UK national newspapers.9

6.9 Quantitative and qualitative research in tourism studies
Faulkner & Ryan (1999:3) make the claim that as a field of study, tourism has 'a tendency to draw on theoretical and methodological insights from many disciplines'. They argue that tourism researchers are to make use of the opportunity to draw on this eclectic range of approaches within the social sciences. They therefore conclude that 'positivist, post-positivist, constructionist and de-constructionist paradigms of social theory' are to be embraced in tourism research in order to develop the field.

However, there have been claims by some tourism researchers that the study of travel and tourism has been poorly served by an overemphasis on quantitative enquiries in comparison to studies using interpretative paradigms and qualitative methods (Walle 1997; Riley & Love 2000; Hollinshead 1996; Jamal & Hollinshed 2001. In a review of the dominant research approaches used in tourism articles in four major tourism journals between their inaugural editions and 1996, (Riley & Love, 2000:171) identified positivism as the main paradigm based on the number of qualitative verses quantitative articles. Several factors were identified in their article contributed to the dominance of the positivist paradigm. Chief of these is a tendency to view travel and tourism predominantly as an economic endeavour that is focused on achieving goals that improves profitability and national incomes. Consequently, tourism studies have been oriented towards enquiries of revenues, segmentation strategies and models of tourist flows that were more suited to positivist quantitative enquiries (ibid 182).

---

9 Further discussion on the application of content analysis and discourse analysis are addressed in separate chapters in the section on Methodology.
Paradoxically, ground-breaking research in tourism that utilised qualitative methods have been constant and ongoing in disciplines such as sociology, anthropology and related fields that explored issues such as tourist motivations, host/guest relations and cultural identity. But Riley & Love (2000:166) observes that these contributions were to mostly located and published within their various fields rather than in tourism journals. It is can be argued that it is not so much that there is a general paucity of qualitative enquiry on tourism, but it is the question of the level of acceptance or awareness of the need for interpretative approaches in exploring dimensions such as understanding and meaning in tourism (Walle 1997).

Wood (1999) asserts that the main dispute is not whether to use traditional positivist approaches or alternative ones, but rather it is for tourism researchers to adopt the method and approach that is best suited to investigate the phenomena of tourism. A critical requirement in tourism studies is the need for conceptual frameworks to accommodate various strands of research so that the theory fit the facts, rather than the facts the theory’ (ibid 15). Without the development of conceptual research, individual research agenda pursuing various hypotheses are limited in advancing understanding if the field. There is added support for this position by (Archer, 1988:294) who states that research development of certain areas of management fields is not cohesive

...because the development of theory proceeds in a predominantly ad hoc inductive fashion rather than being impelled by a positive heuristic consisting of issues raised by some existing theory, or of conjectures or putative insights arising out of some proto-theory.'

There are various dimensions of theoretical and conceptual development within tourism. Theory development may emanate from a disciplinary focus that has been applied to tourism research. For example, It is possible for the development of theoretical and conceptual frameworks in tourism to emanate from the various disciplines that have been applied to the field. Archer (1988:296) argues that various methodologies are related to particular disciplines and as such these methods and their paradigmatic references are often imported into management research. It is therefore necessary for immature and emerging fields to build hypotheses and research questions that provide an ‘epistemological bootstrap’ on which to build knowledge.
For example, the case of interpretative approaches in consumer behaviour has been argued by Holbrook & Hirschman 1982; Holbrook & O'Shaughnessy 1988). According to these researchers, consumer behaviour is not sufficiently explained by cognitive or attitudinal theories that fail to take account of the unremitting tendency (of humans) to seek meaning in their lives. (Holbrook & O'Shaughnessy, 1988:400) maintain that

*Humans live embedded within a shared system of signs based upon public language and other symbolic objects that confer a sense of social existence and identity... The recognition that people in general and human consumers in particular differ from atoms and molecules in their endless quest for meaning dictates the need for interpretation in our attempt to explicate the meanings embedded in consumer behaviour.*

The establishment of the conceptual framework within consumer behaviour facilitates such enquiries within the field of tourism. Echtner (1999) also provides specific examples of areas for potential conceptual research studies in tourism marketing using the semiotic paradigm. She lists research topics such as the representations of destination images, interpretations of tourism representations by tourists and the symbolic consumption experiences offered by destinations as areas amenable to interpretative research.

A post-modernist re-conceptualisation of the study of tourism is proposed by some tourism researchers whose view of tourism transcends disciplinary paradigms and boundaries. Notably, Hollinshead (1996) argues that tourism researcher is unwittingly cast into the role of bricoleur in order to come to terms with an industry that is becoming increasingly ‘diffuse, ambiguous and plurivocal’ (Jamal & Hollinshead 2001:78). It is this dynamic movement and currents in tourism that occasion Hollishead’s appeal for dialogue on multiple approaches, theories, practices, methods and techniques in tourism studies. He contends that a critical, interpretative framework is therefore more suited for this kind of tourism than approaches and concepts that prioritise objectivity in research.

This call for the emancipation of tourism from positivist domination is related to a conceptualisation of tourism as an agent of human and social experience, activities and actions. Enquiries therefore have to be contextual and situated and served by a recognition on the part of the researcher of how Foucaultian notions of power
relations infiltrate cultural ways of being, seeing, knowing and experiencing (Hollinshead 1999:17). Hollinshead therefore displays an unerring constructivist vision in his conceptualisation of tourism as a field of research and praxis.

Tourism studies have inevitably inherited the paradigmatic, epistemological and ontological tensions associated with the methodological approaches of research within the social sciences. However, it is unlikely that researchers separated by the methodological divide will disagree that both positivist and interpretative approaches have contributed to an accretion of knowledge and understandings of touristic phenomena. Therefore, although the relative merits of qualitative and quantitative research will be an ongoing point of debate, tourism research should not be limited or dictated by these arguments. Establishing a position of certitude and indisputability for any methodological application is a Sisyphean task. The approach taken is this study is to produce justifiable and plausible grounds for the methodological choices and strategic decisions that have been taken throughout the research process in order to achieve clarity and to contribute the process of theory building in tourism.

CONCLUSION

The overall aim of this chapter has been to establish the theoretical justification for the methodological approach that is undertaken in this research and to lay the foundation for ensuing discussions on the theory and method of content analysis and discourse analysis. In achieving this goal, this chapter has presented a critical review of the various philosophical traditions that have influenced the development of methodological approaches in the social sciences. It has shown that the apparent schism between quantitative and qualitative methods have emerged from the conception of methodological monism which claims that the social sciences must conform to the methods of the natural sciences to be truly scientific. There has also been a comprehensive discussion of the role of Weberian and interpretivist notions of ‘Verstehen’ or understanding of the emic perspective of social actors, in opening up space beyond positivist boundaries for legitimating interpretative paradigms and qualitative modes of enquiries of social processes. In order to establish the theoretical bases for methods combination in this research it has been necessary to clarify the epistemological and ontological chasm between positivist and constructivist
traditions. This chapter also explained that the methodological triangulation that was used in this study was to provide depth and a means of uncovering dimensions of understanding of the image constructs of the Caribbean in the UK national press. This discussion also reviewed the basis for their application in this research and argued that both positivism and constructivism are useful for theory building in the field of tourism. The next chapter follows with a discussion on the issues relating to the theory and practice of the content analysis method.
CHAPTER 7

METHODOLOGY - CONTENT ANALYSIS

Its (content analysis) theoretical basis is unclear and its conclusions can often be trite (Silverman, 1993)

Content analysis is a qualitative process, because the categorisation and the decisions what to count and how to count are qualitative.

Harald Klein

I really do not understand why we must force content analysis to be EITHER qualitative OR quantitative. Content analysis has to do with the meaning ("content") of texts. Even in computer content analysis (which should strictly be called computer ASSISTED content analysis) a human being must explain/interpret what the categories mean (what the numbers tell us about the nature of the texts being analysed). This means that content analysis has qualitative aspects. However content analysis is quantitative because we count the instances of the categories of interest. (I do not recall that there used to be some work on qualitative content analysis but I think that work is pretty much is just considered qualitative research, dropping out the 'content analysis' part). Why must it be a dichotomous choice between one or the other?

Bill Benoit, University of Missouri

INTRODUCTION

It is not unusual for textbooks on content analysis to commit numerous opening pages to expounding the definition of the method. For example, recent publications on content analysis written by Neuendorf (2002) Riffe, Lacy, et al. (1998) and Roberts (1997) dedicate their introductory and first chapters to defining and delineating the features and boundaries of the method. The divergence of opinions on content analysis among academics reflected in the opening quotes above may suggest reasons for such solicitous attention to defining the method. As the discussion in this chapter indicates, consensus on content analysis is an ongoing project, and there are aspects of its definition and practice that are still under construction. Nevertheless, the research literature also shows that there is unanimity on the central role of content analysis for the critical examination of texts and communication messages. Although content

2 This statement was posted on CONTENT by Harald Klein, German academic who created INTEXT a programme designed for the analysis of texts for the humanities and the social sciences. Accessed this correspondence on 18.04.02.
3 Comment posted on 23.04.02 by Bill Benoit of the Department of Communication at the University of Missouri at CONTENT, the online email listserv. CONTENT was established in 1994 by Bill Evans at Georgia State University to provide a forum for discussion among content analysts.
analysis has established a reputation as the foremost method in the analysis of media content, it has also been utilised extensively by linguists, psychologists, sociologists and marketers for the analysis of various communications. Content analysis has also been applied to what seems to be unlikely fields such as economics, law and medicine as researchers attempt to critically make sense of documents, images, conversations and scripts. The appeal of content analysis and its wide application in such varying fields is that it offers a system that attempts to apply scientific rigor in measuring, summarising and analysing textual data. This chapter therefore commences with an examination of the qualities of content analysis with an in-depth appraisal of the protocols and conventions that govern the method and its application in research. The advantages and the limitations of content analysis are discussed in addition to efforts to refine and hone it into a more effective and efficient research tool. The chapter then discusses the processes and procedures in the design and conduct of the content analysis in the operationalisation of this research. It concludes with the arguments that have guided the selection of data, sampling procedures and the utilisation of human coders.

7.1 The evolution of documentary and textual research

The genesis of text and documentary analysis in human research has often been traced to the work of the sociologists W.I. Thomas and Florian Snaniecki, whose five volume publication in 1920, The Polish Peasant, represents a scholarly evaluation of the impact of Polish immigration to the United States (Jupp & Norris 1993; Manning & Cullum-Swan 1998; Silverman 1993). The work is notable for the use of a wide range of documentary sources gleaned from the diaries, letters, personal documents of Polish immigrants as well as records, reports of public agencies, courts and newspapers both in the United States and Poland. Significantly, this work introduces textual analysis as a credible method for researching the relationship between individuals and social structures.

However, the 'interactionist-interpretative' approach to documentary analysis pursued by Thomas and Snaniecki at the renowned Chicago School of Sociology, was not adopted by subsequent communication researchers who focussed their examination on
texts, media output and various communications in the quest to determine their powerful effects (Jupp & Norris 1993:38). The intent of the media researchers was to find a rigorous and objective means of analysing media output so as to identify the characteristics of messages in terms of their perceived responses from receivers.

Among the media researchers at the time was the American political scientist, Harold Lasswell, who has been credited as a major influence in the development of content analysis for the study of messages, particularly as a systematic method that examines the ‘what’ of messages as well as their effects (Neuendorf 2002:34). Lasswell’s approach to the study of media messages and texts is pointedly empiricist and positivist. He defined content analysis as

\[ \text{a technique which aims at describing, with optimum objectivity, precision, and generality, what is said on a given subject in a given place at a given time. Quoted in Neuendorf (2002:36).} \]

Among Lasswell’s major achievement was a joint project he conducted with the BBC during World War II which was able to forecast and predict Nazi policy and activities based on systematic analysis of Axis radio broadcasts (Neundorf 2000:37). Nevertheless, beyond the practical success of tracking German troop movements, content analysis also gained credence as a scientific approach to examine the effects of mass media output on the society. The post war explosion of mass communication and information technologies sparked the concerns of national governments on their impact on human behaviour and social order.

Questions were raised on the role of propaganda, public information and violence on television which in the age of the rise of the mass media were seen as potential agents of insidious influence and power. Content analysis therefore emerged as a form of textual analysis that fulfilled the need for an objective, systematic means of determining the nature of media communications and other kinds of messages and how they influenced individuals and societies.

Messages however, represent only one dimension of Lasswell’s communication axiom, ‘who says what to whom via what channel with what effect?’ Apart from message content, the source of the message, the medium and the receiver/audience are
crucial dimensions in the communication process and are all inter-related. Messages represent the stimulus factor in the communication process whether they are in the form of words, images or both.

While message stimuli have distinct features and properties, they are also reflections of the sender that generate them and the receivers who also respond to them. Whether they are effective or not, messages are not created without intent or an aim on the part of the sender. In turn, messages may reach audiences they are not intended for and are also misread by those for whom they are targeted. Consequently, this poses difficulty in making general conclusive statements on media effects.

But studying any one dimension of the communication process, that is, the source, the message or the receiver, has implications in terms of understanding the entire communication process. It is unlikely that a strong correlation can be made from the study of the message content and its effects without corresponding research in a representative sample of receivers. However, messages operate as intermediaries or mediating factors between senders and receivers and represent the underlying link between them in the communication process.

7.2 The importance of message content in the communication process

The study of communication messages rests on the assumption that they reflect the cultural contexts of their production and consumption. Content analysis authors such as Berelson (1952:13) and Riffe, Lacy, et al. (1998:9) go further to argue for the centrality of content in the communication process. They state that content analysis is important in building theory on communication effects and processes. This is demonstrated in the centrality model shown below:
According to Riffe, Lacy, et al. (1998) communication content is the end product of the antecedent individual, organisational, social contexts in society that produces the communication content which then relates to the responses that emerge from these messages. In other words, the values, constructs and ideologies of senders are transmitted in messages and these correlate in various ways to receiver responses. Still, there must be empirical or theoretical grounds in order to make the links from content analysis to sender or receiver. While the central model of communication makes the case for the study of messages as a basis for understanding features of senders and message effects, it is not clear that content analysis as a method on its own necessarily provides the means to achieve that understanding.
Riffe, Lacy et al (1998:11) maintains that content analysis is essentially a method used to answer research questions about content. In this regard, content analysis can be seen as an ‘end in itself’, that is, to identify and describe message content without any attempt to link or integrate findings to conclusions concerning the sender or the effects on receivers. But while Riffe, Lacy et al accept that such content-based studies are valid, they agree with the criticism of Shoemaker and Reese (1990) that most content analyses are not linked ‘in any systematic way to either the forces that created the content or to its effects’ (p.649). The suggestion is that it is important for content analyses to be conducted within a theoretical framework that links the content studied to either the ‘antecedents or the consequences of the research’. By making such theoretical connections, theory building is facilitated that is able to shed more light on the overall communication process (Hansen, Cottle, et al. 1998:92).

7.3 Defining Content Analysis
According to Babbie (1992:312) content analysis is categorised as a method that involves non-obtrusive or non-reactive research. This means that this method allows the researcher to examine and measure content without the risk of confounding the data in the process of examination (Weber 1990:10). In content analysis, the researcher does not ‘intrude’ on, or influences the sender or the receiver of the messages to determine their motivations or responses. Instead, the researcher uses texts, documents, images and various forms of human communication as the social artefacts that constitute the raw data that are coded to gain insights on social processes. Significantly, within cultural critiques, the concept of text extends beyond artefacts that are specifically designed to communicate particular meanings.

According to Slater (1998:234), texts include visual, aural and tactile structures of meaning; so that even the ‘way people dress, the foods they choose to eat, and the way they prepare them, the pattern and structure of the meal itself can all be read as cultural texts’. It is in this ‘ostensibly subjective field of cultural meaning’ that content analysis offers a set of methodological controls for researchers to be ‘objective’, to replicate or disprove findings and to make generalisations (Slater 1998:233). Therefore, content analysis is a method that attempts to apply positivist principles to textual analysis with no less rigour than other forms of social research.
such as the survey method. As Neuendorf (2002:49) maintains, content analysis is a research method that is consistent with the goals and standards of the popular survey research. Slater explains the similarity further when he notes that 'content analysis is like a social survey of a sample of images, rather than of people, using a tightly structured and closed questionnaire. The stages are much the same'.

Among most content analysis practitioners, consensus on the main features of content analysis centres on positivistic paradigmatic principles. One of the earliest definition of content analysis provided by Berelson (1952:18) reflects this positivist agenda which today remains a basic tenet of the method for most practitioners:

*Content analysis is a research technique for the objective, systematic, and quantitative description of the manifest content of communication.*

One of the main concerns for content analysts was to differentiate their work from the tradition of literary and linguistic analysis of texts and documents. Consequently, there was an emphasis on designing a set of procedures that conform to the scientific method. Most definitions of content analysis tend to adhere to prescriptions of being systematic, objective and quantitative. Although he does not reject these descriptions of content analysis, Krippendorff (1980:21) emphasises other features of the method in his definition of 'content analysis as a research technique for making replicable and valid inference from data to their context'.

Weber (1990:9) also has the same emphasis on validity in his definition of content analysis as a research method that uses a set of procedures to make valid inferences from texts. For Riffe, Lacy, et al. (1998:10), content analysis is a procedure that assigns numeric values according to valid measurement rules. This definition explains how validity is achieved in the method, that is, essentially in terms of the sound measurement procedures. Measurement is also a key concept in some content analysis definitions. According to Berger (1998:116), content analysis is a research technique that involves measuring something...in a random sampling of some form of communication...

In their definition, Shapiro & Markoff (1997:16) identify measurement as the principal feature of content analysis. They argue that content analysis is basically a
'technique of measurement rather than of description or inference'. They also maintain that the approach to measuring is not simply to generate a set of statistics that merely quantify features of a text, but that it is aimed at measuring the relationships among variables in order to produce more understanding of the issues under review.

In his definition of content analysis, Carney (1972:52) presents the method as a technique for posing questions to a communication' in order to get findings which can be substantiated... The communication can be anything, a novel, some paintings, a movie, or a musical score- the technique is applicable to all alike and not only to analysis of literary materials. Carney's definition is significant not only for highlighting the variety and wide range of material that may be analysed, but also for restricting the method to findings within the communication, consequently limiting the scope of the content analysis in making inferences. Neuendorf's (2002:10) definition seems to detail the procedures that Carney suggested in the notion of substantiating findings from a communication. She leaves no doubt about the positivist and quantitative mission of the method and attempts to incorporate the main emphases of validity, reliability and measurement outlined in other definitions.

Content analysis is a summarising, quantitative analysis of messages that relies on the scientific method (including attention to objectivity-intersubjectivity, a priori design, reliability, validity, generalisability, replicability, and hypothesis testing) and is not limited as to the types of variables that may be measured or the context in which messages are created or presented.

While some definitions of content analysis may be categorised as having a method orientation, that is, there is an emphasis on explaining how the method is executed, others have a more purpose-oriented definition that focus on the goal, intent, or what is to be achieved from the design and application of content analysis. Although they may have different emphases, the definitions whether overtly or by implication tend to address both the method and purpose of the method. Some definitions like Neuendorf's cited above, attempt to incorporate both, in order to demonstrate that the method prescribes the purpose, functions and procedures in the conduct of research. This discussion on definition shows that there is some justification in Shapiro & Markoff's (1997:30) claim that
Although there is general agreement that content analysis must be somehow scientific, there is not, necessarily, agreement among these authors as to how they view the essential components of a scientific method.

It is possible that this statement may explain why there are different emphases and orientations in content analysis. But overall, these differences do not necessarily overshadow the primary conventions that have been established for the methodological procedures in content analysis research.

7.3.1 Clarifying core concepts of content analysis

It is necessary to examine the main prescriptions of content analysis as systematic, objective and quantitative in order to clarify their application in research. Many of the claims of content analysis rest on the notion of empirical and objective procedures that essentially distinguish the method from other qualitative approaches to textual analysis such as semiotics and discourse analysis. Generally, content analysis uses any of the relevant quantitative sampling techniques in the selection of data. This data is subjected to coding procedures based on some conceptual or theoretical framework. The process of coding transforms the data into a standardised form that may be replicated and produce the same results over time as long as the coding procedure remain consistent.

Some authors such as Babbie (1992) and Berg (2001) see content analysis as mainly a 'coding operation'. This is hardly a contentious point since features of texts are coded and assigned to various categories. However, it would be more precise to refer to content analysis as a specific form of coding operation that must fulfil all the prescribed criteria of being systematic, objective and quantitative. There are other coding procedures that although they are rigorous in their specific contexts, are not synonymous with content analysis. It is therefore not appropriate to term the inductive coding of qualitative interviews as content analysis since the prescriptions of content analysis are not followed. Coding that relies on the identification of variables and construct categories in the process of analysis is not content analysis. The categories and variable must be established before coding begins in keeping with the positivist orientation of content analysis (Berelson 1952; Babbie 2002; Holsti 1969; Krippendorff 1980; Neuendorf 2002; Weber 1990). There is need for caution
in referring to the terms 'coding' and 'content analysis' synonymously without clear distinction between the method and the coding procedure in qualitative data analysis.

### 7.3.2 Content Analysis as Systematic

One of the core features of content analysis that sets it apart from other coding operations is that it is systematic. According to Kassarjian (1977:9) systemisation has two applications in content analysis. In a direct sense, systematic means that there is a consistency in the application of coding rules in the assignment of variables to categories. In so doing, it is clear that all aspects of the data are accounted for, and that it is not only those that support the hypothesis that are selected. Systematic also refers to the testing of hypotheses where the relationships among variables related to a particular phenomenon are identified. The deductive testing of variables is then followed by their statistical measurement to identify if the suppositions of the hypothesis are proven correct. If this occurs then the process of theory building is facilitated by the enquiry.

In content analysis systemisation is demonstrated in the establishment of a design where categories are established based on a theoretical concept. So that as Neuendorf (2000:11) instructs, 'all decisions on variables, their measurement, and coding rules must be made before the observations begin'. The procedure for content analysis prescribes that in human coding, the codebook and coding form must be constructed before the coding begins. Similarly, with content analysis computer coding, the dictionary and coding protocol for the study precedes the coding exercise.

Systemisation in content analysis also involves the process of quantifying variable categories in relation to an overall theoretical framework. For example, Kassarjian (1977:9) states that 'purely descriptive information on content that is not related to other variable attributes is of little value'. He notes that a tabulation that simply reports the number of periodicals at a library is not content analysis unless these results were used for a trend analysis. But even at its most descriptive, Holsti (1969:5) argues that all content analysis 'is concerned with comparison which is dictated by the investigator's theory' and also by the research question as well. Altogether,
systemisation supports the validity of the research process and lays the groundwork for the evaluation of the findings of the research.

7.3.3 Content analysis as Objective

A distinguishing feature of content analysis from literary criticism and other informed commentary on communications is that it follows procedures to ensure objectivity, that is, to at least minimise the biases and subjective concerns of the researcher. Objectivity implies that the research design is reliable and that the categories of analysis may be applied to the same body of content and produce the same results (Kassarjian 1977:9). But this raises the question as to the procedures that are required to realise objectivity in the operationalisation and design of the research.

One of the first procedural criteria of objectivity is the establishment of precise categories that facilitates the reliability of the process. These categories should be clear enough to ensure a high level of agreement among competent, independent coders. A high level of intercoder reliability is required for the research to achieve ‘scientific’ status. Low intercoder agreement undermines the validity of the variable and construct categories. Frequently in content analysis, researchers try to avoid the risk of low intercoder agreement scores by eliminating the more connotative or latent constructs in the data and relying only on the overt or manifest content for coding, but this approach can also undermine the validity of the research if these dimensions of the study are ignored.

As a rule it has been recommended by most researchers that categories with low reliability should be excluded (Hansen, Cottle, et al. 1998; Kassarjian 1977; Neuendorf 2002; Riffe, Lacy, et al. 1998; Slater 1998). The use of computer software for coding eliminates the need for human coders and intercoder reliability tests. In spite of this invaluable advantage of guaranteed reliability that the computer provides, the drawback is that computer coding may not be suited for content analysis that goes beyond the counting of words. Some research projects examine the relationship between words that may not be readily measured by computers (Riffe, Lacy, et al. 1998:190). Even when there is an assurance of reliable coding with computer assistance the question can still be asked as to how objective is content analysis, and
the extent to which the process is removed from value-free judgements (Gunter 2000:57). This question is applicable to all methods that claim to be objective, but for content analysis in particular, the formulation of categories for measurement involves some level of induction and personal judgement on the part of the researcher.

### 7.3.4 Content analysis as Quantitative

Perhaps one of the more controversial aspects of content analysis is the debate whether it is essentially quantitative or qualitative. One of the earliest definitions of content analysis by Berelson (1952:55) describes the method as providing 'quantitative description of manifest content of communication'. Most authors on content analysis tend to agree with this position (Deacon, Pickering, et al. 1999:116; Hansen, Cottle, et al. 1998; Holsti 1969; Kassarjian 1977; Krippendorff 1980; Neuendorf 2002; Riffe, Lacy, et al. 1998; Slater 1998; Weber 1990). There is also some agreement that the main purpose of content analysis is to quantify salient features of texts and generate statistics on the content.

Measurement in content analysis means that numbers can be given to key categories in the texts so that they can be compared and the extent of their differences determined. But the numbers that are assigned to categories must be consistent with the meaning of the content in order to be valid. The variations that are counted in the message set are usually summarised statistically using percentages, averages and ratios and then applied to test hypotheses and answer research questions (Riffe, Lacy, et al. 1998:26). It is therefore possible to account for the ‘presence’ or ‘absence’ of certain categories in the data and determine the level of representation in the message set based on the frequency of these categories. Measurements that are statistically significant may then be used to make inferences to the population.

However, in spite of the measurement of variables in content analysis, there are some practitioners who argue that the process of creating categories and also deciding what to count is a qualitative process. Again, this is a similar criticism of the claims of content analysis as objective. The main point is that the method does not indicate specifically how these categories are to be established but relies on the researcher’s understanding of the application of theory to the research design. This step in content
analysis is essentially qualitative and this has led some commentators such as Harald Klein (quoted above) to maintain that content analysis as qualitative. However Fielding & Schreier (2001 Para 33) have categorised content analysis as a hybrid method which bears quantitative and qualitative features. In other words, content analysis is a hybrid method as it combines the ‘qualitative coding of texts with the quantitative calculation of coefficients on intercoder agreement’.

Nevertheless, Neuendorf (2001:14) rejects the notion of non-quantitative content analysis. She notes that since the goal of content analysis is a numerical summary of a message set, it cannot be qualitative. She argues further that it is ‘neither a gestalt impression nor a fully detailed description of a message or message set’. Deacon, Pickering, et al. (1999) note that the term content analysis ‘is used inconsistently in the literature to ‘cover any method that involves analysing content’ but they argue that the more precise use of the term describes a quantitative approach. Authors such as Altheide (1987, 1996) and Gunter (2000) make the distinction between content analysis and other methods by referring to non-quantitative approaches as ethnographic content analysis and qualitative content analysis respectively. Other textual analytical approaches such as semiotic, discourse, rhetorical, narrative and interpretative analyses are also termed qualitative content analysis by Gunter (2000:83).

7.4 Making inferences to source or receiver characteristics

Another contentious issue in the literature on content analysis is the extent to which inferences to source or receiver characteristics can be made using content analysis alone. There is still a lack of consensus among practitioners whether content analysis by itself is a sound basis for making conclusive statements on sender characteristics or message effects. The chart below shows the definitions of content analysis that inextricably link the method to making inferences.
Table 7.1 Definitions of Content Analysis supporting inferences

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AUTHOR(S)</th>
<th>DEFINITIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stone, Dunphy, Smith &amp; Olgilvie (1996)</td>
<td>Content analysis is any research technique for making inferences by systematically and objectively identifying specified characteristics within the text.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Krippendorf (1980)</td>
<td>Content analysis is a research technique for making replicable and valid inference from data to their context.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weber (1990)</td>
<td>Content analysis is a research method that uses a set of procedures to make valid inferences from text.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Riffe, Lacy &amp; Fico (1998)</td>
<td>Quantitative content analysis is the systematic and replicable examination of symbols of communication, which have been assigned numeric values according to valid measurement rules, and the analysis of relationships involving those values using statistical method, in order to describe the communication, draw inference about its meaning, or infer from the communication to its context, both of production and consumption.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Adapted from Neuendorf (2002:10)

These definitions show a commitment for utilising content analysis beyond only accounting for the characteristics of the texts. These definitions hold the view that inferences from the content analysis exercise can therefore be used to make conclusions on the meaning of the texts based on identified variable relationships as well as to extra-textual variables such as the source and receiver.

Texts in the field of media and communications tend to define content analysis as a method that may be used for making inferences on source or receiver characteristics. Berger (1998:116) notes that

*The basic assumption implicit in content analysis is that an investigation of messages and communication will allow some insight into people who receive these messages.*

Offering a somewhat more general endorsement of inferences is that by Hansen, Cottle, et al. (1998:92).

*...the aim of content analysis in media research has more often been that of examining how news, drama, advertising and entertainment output reflect social and cultural issues, values and phenomena.*
In their book *Researching Communications*, Deacon, Pickering, et al. (1999:116) state that the purpose of content analysis is to generate statistics which are 'used to make broader inferences about the process and politics of representation'.

But Kassarjian (1977:8) states a conflicting position on the issue of inferences:

> Content analysis is the study of the message itself, and not the communicator or the audience. It is the study of the stimulus field.

Here Kassarjian limits the remit of content analysis and suggests that the focus of its application is pointedly on the characteristics of the message.

In *The Content Analysis Guidebook*, Neuendorf (2002:52) is no less forthright about her stance:

> The view presented in this book does not accept the notion that it is appropriate to make conclusions about source or receiver on the basis of an analysis of message content alone.

Neuendorf, however, gives reasons why she does not endorse the making of explicit inferences strictly from content analysis results because:

> such unbacked inferences are inconsistent with the tenets of the philosophy of science- it is important to note that they are not empirically based (54).

There is support for Neuendorf's position by Gunter (2000:57) who states that the measures of media texts may be used to make *empirically-verifiable inferences* about the potential impact of media content upon individuals, groups or society as a whole. In subscribing to the notion of the positivist ideals of content analysis, both Neuendorf and Gunter argue that inferences to source or receiver characteristics can only be made on corroborating empirical evidence. Even some authors such as Shapiro & Markoff (1997:25), who do not believe that there is a need to take a definite position on the matter of making inferences in content analysis still maintain that inferences require justification.

> Our own definition is non-committal: We insist only that the analysis be of use of social science, but of course we want any inferences to the audience as well as the source to be justified.
They explain further that there are two grounds for inferences from message content. The first is that the message should be powerful to the extent that it is clear that the message led to a particular effect among audience. Likewise, the feedback of audiences to a particular message provides the basis for making inferences.

Neuendorf (2000:61) proposes that in order to make overt inferences from content analytic information, an integrative model that links the message level data with other available 'empirical information regarding source, receiver, channel, or other contextual states' is required. Notwithstanding the validity of these arguments on the need for empirical corroboration, it seems to put the notion of making inferences to source or receiver characteristics into a positivist straitjacket. Besides empirical corroboration, it is plausible to make inferences also on theoretical grounds. Riffe, Lacy, et al. (1998:8) present a cogent and reasonable argument for making assumptions beyond the message content by noting that

...the validity of that assumption depends on how closely the content evidence can be linked empirically (through observation) or theoretically to that context. And...communication content also merits systematic examination because of its assumed role as cause or antecedent of a variety of individual processes, effects or uses people make of it. (Emphasis mine)

This position makes a case for using the study of messages as a means of making deductions on the characteristics of the sender or their effects on receivers and extends the role of content analysis beyond limiting empirical boundaries. The centrality model of communication content referred to earlier in this chapter reinforces the view that the message relates in some way to both source and receiver. The nature of these relationships may be explicated both empirically and theoretically in the search for the meaning of the communication and in the assumptions extended to the source or the receiver of the message. After all, content analysis makes a basic assumption that cultural forms of expression and social reality are expressed in texts.

Bos & Tarnai (1999:660) seem to shed some light on the reasons for the differences in views on the use of content analysis for making inferences. They point out that there are two procedures within content analysis that social scientists use to infer social reality. These basic procedures can be 'divided into hermeneutic-interpretative content analyses and empirical-explanatory content analysis. The hermeneutic-interpretative approach means that the explanations of the text move from the
elementary level towards a theoretical understanding or to a ‘cognition of social meanings’. But this procedure is rejected by the empirical-explanatory approach as subjective and ideological. The empirical-explanatory school therefore supports limiting the level of inference from content analysis only to corroborated empirical evidence. On the other hand, the allowance for making inferences seems to be following on the hermeneutic-interpretative tradition that maintains that it also “scientific” ‘to explain texts in a rule oriented manner to comprehend the sense intended by the author’ and to gain understanding of social processes (Bos & Tarnai 1999:661).

In summation, it is plausible to argue that the analysis of messages is based on the intent to discover or to clarify social phenomena. So while it is a perfectly legitimate exercise to identify and make inferences based on the empirical corroboration, it is also justifiable to do so based on sound theoretical endorsement. Above all, the method should be applied in the expectation that greater understanding is gained on the construction of meaning in human communications and the nature of social life.

7.5 Coding for manifest and latent content

It is often debated whether content analysis may be used to code the deeper meanings and symbolic content along with the more apparent and distinct features of texts. This issue arises as the process of understanding communications involves addressing the meaning that operates both at the denotative level and connotative or more latent level. There are divergent views on whether only the manifest content of texts should be coded as opposed to latent content as well. One of the main concerns is that an attempt to code for the meaning or latent content inevitably reduces the reliability of the research and the attempt to get coders to ‘read between the lines’ in a consistent manner may be futile. Berelson (1952:19) cautions against the inclusion of latent content in content analysis as he believes that the ‘psychological pre-dispositions of the reader become involved and to some degree they distort the comprehension of the ‘manifest content’.

Riffe, Lacy, et al. (1998:30) agree with this position noting that although language users may share meaning they also have ‘idiosyncratic variations of meanings for
common symbols'. This leads them to question the extent of the reliability of analyses that entail individual interpretation. As such they contend that coding should be 'restricted to manifest content only'. Like Lasswell, Riffe, Lacy et al believe that coding for latent content is interpretative, and not objective in keeping with the claims of quantitative content analysis.

For his part, Babbie (1992:318) acknowledges that the coding of manifest content is akin to use of standardised questionnaires, but he maintains that at times it is necessary to include latent categories for coding in order to attain 'depth and specificity' of understanding. According to Babbie, relying only on manifest content for coding may not fully or satisfactorily reflect the validity of the variables that are to be measured in the research. He therefore advocates the coding of both manifest and latent content 'wherever possible' in order to satisfy the requirement for reliability and validity and as long as high intercoder reliability scores are achieved. According to Slater (1998:18), coding only the manifest content may ensure the achievement of reliability, but this comes at the expense of depth and significant observations.

It has been suggested that the distinctions between manifest and latent coding tend to be nebulous and it is better to view them as a continuum from 'highly manifest' to 'highly latent' content (Neuendorf 2002:23). Furthermore, some authors have argued that is impossible to measure latent content without using manifest variables (Riffe, Lacy, et al. 1998). However, the use of a code book or dictionary explaining the definitions and meaning of the variables to be coded may be helpful in ensuring high intercoder reliability especially for latent categories. Moreover, the intensive training of coders may be effective in getting them to code texts within defined parameters prescribed by the researcher. The suggestion being that training leads to a form of standardised interpretation.
7.6 **New horizons for content analysis?**

Nevertheless, the issue of addressing the latent content of texts has encouraged attempts to refine the method to account for these characteristics. Increasingly, researchers are looking for ways to effectively capture the latent textual features so that where there is a need for interpretative coding, it is at least conducted in a rigorous and consistent manner. There are also attempts to make the process of category formation more accountable and transparent. For example, Bos & Tarnai (1999:666) introduce the concept of hermeneutic-classificatory content analysis that attempts to achieve objectivity in category formation by ‘examining the text through discursive dialogue with experts’. This approach helps to introduce inter-subjectively verifiable procedures that seek to control the level of personal interpretation in both the creation of categories and in coding texts. For content analysis to be more effective and useful in research Bos & Tarnai advise that there is need for further qualitative and hermeneutic integration in the content analytic process. Explaining this approach, they note that

...for content analysis to be carried out in practice, it is necessary that qualitative interpretation supplement quantitative analysis. In order to fulfil scientific demands while at the same time being applicable and rich in useful data, content analysis needs to possess several features or elements. They are: theoretical inference and the basis for cognitive interest, sample selection that can be checked and justified inter-subjectively, a reliable and valid category-system that is developed in the process of examining the material, and quantitative analysis of the data with appropriate interpretation.

Even Neuendorf (2002:23) who advocates a strict positivist practice of content analysis concedes that have been studies that have justifiably and successfully integrated qualitative message analysis in the coding of latent content.

Significantly, there have been novel attempts to expand the remit of content analysis to be more effective in coding for latent content. An example that is instructive is presented by Ahuvia (2001) who advocates new forms of content analysis which he terms reception based content analysis that allows the researcher to quantify how different audiences understand texts, and interpretative content analysis, which is a method for counting interpretations of content. Interpretative content analysis and reception based content analysis differ from traditional or classical content analysis
particularly in terms of coding procedures. With interpretative content analysis coders are usually researchers in the field or highly trained workers who have the expertise to understand the context of the texts so that there is no need for a code book or the training of coders (Ahavia 2001:11).

Researchers are required to collaborate, so that unlike traditional content analysis, there is no independence of coders and consequently no need to test for inter-coder agreement. The test for reliability with interpretative content analysis is not in terms of inter-coder agreement scores but is based on the notion of public justifiability, that is, the researcher is obliged to submit all the focal texts of the research as well as the justification of codings for public review. In cases where the numbers are very large, then a random sample of texts can be presented so as to avoid the charge of the researcher selecting only those examples that supports the coding strategy employed.

Reception based content analysis studies are more suited for enquiries that seek to make inferences on the effects of messages on various audience categories. In order to facilitate these inferences, Ahuvia suggests using a representative sample of the population of the audience or receivers of the message to code focal texts. As with interpretative content analysis, this approach dispenses with code books and the training of coders to allow the emic or subjective readings of the texts to emerge. The level of consensus on the meaning of the texts then becomes a research finding and not a measure of the quality of the research, but the researcher still plays the main role of providing the overall interpretation of the findings and relating this to the research questions. The elimination of the coding form and independent coders reduces the positivist dominance within the method while the introduction of interpretative coding by experts or representative populations integrates more qualitative features in the method in a practical manner.

Although Ahuvia’s reformulation of the methods appears intriguing, there are areas that need more clarification. For example, how should the researcher treat a ‘deviant’ reading of a text, is it just a statistical outcome, or is it a case for further enquiry? Besides, what is the theoretical basis to account for the relationship between the various interpretations in interpretative content analysis? In reception based content analysis, is it likely that the demographic characteristics of the ‘representative
population' chosen to code these focal texts are to be factored in the examination of variable relationships? These operational issues need to be resolved further before this approach can be applied generally. Ahuvia perhaps, would have made a stronger case for these new methods if they were presented as studies that were already conducted so that all the procedures and steps taken in the research could have been reported. But Ahuvia's proposals should not be discounted as they seek to operationalise and chart a course for the integration of more qualitative features in content analysis in an attempt to address issues of latent content as well as making inferences to audiences. As such his 'new method' has theoretical support based on the hermeneutic-interpretative tradition within content analysis (Bos & Tarnai 1999:660). Equally, it reflects the current mood and trend in content analysis to build a more comprehensive tool to tackle the task of linking the analysis of messages in terms of wider and deeper understanding of the human communication process.

7.7 Limitations of content analysis
Apart from the difficulties in coding for the latent and connotative level of meanings in messages and making inferences as discussed above, content analysis tends to be subjected to the generic criticisms proffered against quantitative methods. Chief of these is the charge that content analysis is unable to take into account the context of the written text (Manning & Cullum-Swan 1998:248). This problem of context stripping is particularly crucial for the analysis of texts where meaning is related to the use of language. The counting of key words in context can be problematic as the use of words in the text may convey ambiguous meanings depending on their usage in particular contexts. This difficulty extends to content analysing pictorial images as well, since the coding categories tend to detach constructs from their original setting and so the entire context of the meaning conveyed may be lost.

The counting of the frequency of variables contributes to the fragmentation of the overall meaning of the message. This leads to the question that is often asked of content analysis as to whether the quantitative assessment of text is the most useful approach for an understanding of meaning (Gunter 2000:57). Essentially, what are the implications of the frequency measurement in terms of producing deeper meanings of
the texts? In this respect content analysis has been criticised for the assumption that frequency of occurrence of variables accounts for their significance in the text.

But content analysis has no theory of significance. It merely assumes the significant existence (or existence-as-significance) of what it counts. It may be counting illusion or a fragmentary part of a real significance, but without a theory of significance it would not know: its concept of the significance of repetition gives it no knowledge of the significance of what is being repeated. (Sumner (1979:69) quoted in Hansen, Cottle, et al. (1998:96).

It is cannot be denied that content analysis relates significance to variable frequencies. This may pose some problems for an accurate representation of the text. For instance the high frequency of a particular variable within a text does not necessarily mean that it may have the same importance with respect to the overall meaning. As Hansen, Cottle, et al. (1998:95) point out, it is not clear to what degree quantitative indicators relate to questions about the 'intensity of meaning in texts, the social impact of texts, or the relationship between media texts and the realities which they reflect'. Other textual analysis techniques such as discourse analysis address more adequately the issue of intensity of meaning as they rely on detailed, more contextual analysis of texts in determining meaning.

However, it may be argued that the mere counting of variables simply for its own sake in a meaningless way is hardly a scholarly exercise. In some respects content analysis answers the question of significance by insisting on a theoretical framework for the research. It is usually expected that the frequencies of variables are related to an overall picture of variable relationships in the text. These relationships have relevance and meaning in terms of theory and wider social phenomena. So although there is an initial fragmentation of the texts into categories, it is again reassembled in the analysis stage so that the significance of the variable occurrence and co-occurrence are explained (Hansen, Cottle, et al. 1998:98). Still, this limitation of the method has encouraged commentators to advise researchers to combine content analysis with another qualitative method in order to also capture the contextual dimensions of meaning in texts (Bell & Garrett 1998; Deacon, Pickering, et al. 1999; Gunter 2000; Fenton, Bryman, et al. 1998; Gunter 2000).

Another limitation of content analysis cited by Gunter (2000:82) is its tendency to apply definite meanings during coding based on an assumption that these meanings
are fixed. However there are attributes of media texts that are not easily corralled into defined categories. This means that there may be shifts in meaning that are lost in the process of categorising and quantifying these attributes. Furthermore, questions may be raised on the relevance of a method that offers no guarantee that the constructs and meanings of attributes of texts as defined by content analysis will be shared or even appear relevant to the receivers. Inevitably, there is some chance that the interpretations and representation of messages presented by content analysis may differ in terms of the level of significance, meaning and inferred responses of audiences (Gunter 2000:82).

7.8 Using computers in content analysis

One of the most beneficial uses of computer software is the coding of texts that eliminates the need to have trained coders to perform this function. Computers have been most frequently used to count words and symbols quickly and with guaranteed reliability (Kassarjian 1977:15). Other categories of text analysis functions include key word in context (KWIC), co-occurrences, tagging and text comparison. According to Stone (1997:40) interest in the use of computer grew out a need to reduce the labour intensive, costly and tedious features of content analysis. The earliest software packages such as General Enquirer designed by Harvard academics, Stone, Dunphy, Smith & Olgivie in 1966 were devised for ‘large mainframe computers that were able to sort text, retrieve and make counts of textual data’ (Stone 1997:41). Such features also proved advantageous for the practical management and organisation of voluminous textual data.

For a lone researcher facing a deadline for the submission of a thesis, it was tempting to readily adopt the use of computer software in content analysis on the basis of the above named benefits. With this purpose in mind, this researcher took an intensive hands-on, two-week course in the General Enquirer conducted by one of its designers, Phillip Stone at Essex University. The course demonstrated the preparation of texts and application of the software for analysing the kinds of texts, excluding pictures or images. The General Enquirer is designed not only to do simple word count as is the
case for many other computerised programmes, but it also attempts to capture the context of sentences.

According to Stone, the key advantage of the General Enquirer is that it attempts to operationalise the main thematic content of texts. This is achieved based on the boolean functions of the General Enquirer that retrieves words listed in a standardised dictionary compiled in relation to theoretical concepts. The so-called ‘grand theories’ of political scientists Lasswell and Kaplan as well as psychologists Osgood, Suci and Tannebaum were utilised in the programme dictionary that facilitated the coding of texts within pre-specified categories (Stone 1997:41). The later version of General Enquirer carries a dictionary that ‘connects empirical results with the theory’ and it also allows researchers to build custom dictionaries based on the concepts related to the particular research (Riffe, Lacy, et al. 1998:185). Today, there are a wide variety of content analysis software packages that offer standardised and facilities to build custom dictionaries. However, their application in research is dependent on their ability to maintain the validity of the categories and variables used in the research.

7.9 Computer coding vs Human coders

In deciding on whether to use the General Enquirer for this research, several issues had to be resolved. While the availability of a standardised dictionary in the programme is beneficial in terms of economy of time and reliability, Neuendorf (2002:129) cautions that the availability of handy dictionaries may not be suitable for measuring the variables of specific studies. In this study the standardised ‘grand theories’ dictionaries of the General Enquirer could not measure the specific constructs and variables relating to the concept of destination image. Therefore it was not likely that the General Enquirer would have yielded valid measures for this study without the building of a custom dictionary. Although the building of a custom dictionary would have adapted the software for the thematic concerns of the study, there were still other variable measurements that could not have been measured using the software. Examples of these are the form variables, the latent constructs such as types of holiday experiences and reader responses.
Content variables of physical landscape attributes and images of destination people would have been more amenable using the General Enquirer or any other similar content package. There are examples in the literature of the combination of both computer and human coding of texts of different variable items in a study, yet this method was not adopted as it did not seem likely to offer benefits of time or validity. It was decided that it imprudent to go through a process of building a custom dictionary that would be able to measure less than half of the total number of variables. Furthermore, this approach would not enhance the overall reliability or validity of the research as human coders were still required. Overall, it seemed more judicious to utilise human coders for the entire study rather than mixing this approach with computer coding.

Shapiro (1997) argues that in spite of the pervasive use benefits of computer software, the practice of using human coders is by no means obsolete. He makes the observation that although the use of coders originated from the need of earlier content analysts to find ‘surrogate scientists’ to code volumes of data based on complex coding instructions, still, beyond that basic requirement, human coders serve an important role in what he terms representational textual analysis. In explaining,

Shapiro notes that two newspapers may both feature military issues but that does not mean that they have the same position on the topic. In this instance, computer software that engage in word counts or ‘pure machine technique’ are of questionable validity and serve only an instrumental purpose in noting the level of frequency while not making a valid account of the intensity or an adequate representation of the topic in the newspapers. According to Shapiro, human coders will remain relevant for studies that are not concerned solely with the instrumental features of texts, that is their extant traits, rather than their representational meaning derived from the use of language in the texts.

It has been suggested by some commentators that computer assisted content analysis is still in its infancy with prospects for a bright future (Neuendorf 2002; Riffe, Lacy, et al. 1998; Roberts 1997). Their prevalence also indicates their usefulness and relevance for content analysts. Yet these advantages are limited by their applicability in terms of the specific research and their ability to enhance primary concerns of
reliability and validity as well as other functional and operational issues. The use of computer software package is a matter of choice, irrespective of their appeal and image of cutting edge sophistication. It is not simply a matter of using them in a bid to merely demonstrate knowledge of the latest software or a sure means of covering for the reliability of the study. Nevertheless, it is necessary for researchers to be acquainted with these packages in order to make informed decision regarding their use or non-use in research.

7.10 Choosing and training human coders
Pilot coding or pre-testing as it is commonly referred to is highly recommended in the content analysis process (Babbie 1992; Neuendorf 2002; Riffe, Lacy, et al. 1998). For the pilot testing in this study two coders were requested to code a sample of articles that were not a part of the final data set (See Appendix for pre-test questionnaire). They were close acquaintances of the researcher who were not university students. However, due to time constraints these coders advised this researcher that they were unable to code the final draft of the coding form. The pilot coding form was not as extensive as the final draft and was conducted to guide the researcher on how to develop the coding form for the study. Two undergraduate students pursuing degrees in International Tourism Management were then asked to participate in the final draft of the coding form.

There are no specific guidelines in the literature on the choosing of human coders. According to Shapiro (1997:232), traditionally, the main qualification required of coders is that they should be competent in the natural language of the texts under examination. There are occasions when the issue of the nationality of coders may appear to be relevant, for example, in cross-cultural studies. In her study on advertising leisure themes across several countries, McCullough reported that cultural bias may have been introduced with the use of coders who were all from the US (McCullough 1993:384). The coders in this study are both Caribbean nationals who are second year undergraduate students. Although they are not British nationals and do not comprise the market of newspaper readers in the UK, their inclusion was not seen as posing a risk to the validity of the coding process.
Essentially, the training of coders according to the specifications of the code book rules is designed to reduce any form of bias in the coding process (Kassarjian 1977; Neuendorf 2002; Riffe, Lacy, et al. 1998). Furthermore, the approach taken in this study was to utilise blind coding, that is, the two coders did not know the research question or objectives of the study. Neuendorf (133) recommends this approach in order to reduce chances of bias or demand characteristic, that is, the tendency of study participants to attempt to give responses they feel the researcher may prefer.

Several training sessions, over a period of four weeks, were held using articles that were not part of the study sample. The coders in this study were trained to stick closely to the codebook to guide their coding decisions. Final, independent coding did not begin until there was a general feeling of competence on the part of the coders and the perception of this researcher. In keeping with Neuendorf's (2000:133) advice, training sessions were conducted to ‘standardise’ and ‘calibrate’ coders’ techniques.

Importantly, the coders were also trained not to engage in theoretical interpretations or suppositions or to approach the exercise with a concern of agreeing or disagreeing with the contents of the articles. The instructions were aimed at getting coders used to the fact that they were not being asked to code according to their own opinions or perceptions but on the basis of the specific guidelines given to them. The coders contributed to the design of the final draft of the coding form by the suggestions made during the training sessions. Franke (2000) quoted by Neuendorf (135), found that it is best to give coders hard copies so that they can ‘mark up’ the pages which helped them to work better. In this study coders were therefore given hard copies of articles to code as well as a coding forms and codebooks.

7.11 Challenges and limitations of using human coders
When using human coders in content analysis, the researcher has to trust them to carry out the prescribed coding procedures. The researcher therefore has to depend on the goodwill and compliance of the coders. During this research there was concern when contact could not be made with one of the coders. Both coders were asked to keep in contact with the researcher or to at least be available for the researcher to
contact them during the coding process to ensure that it ran smoothly. In this research, one coder left the UK and returned home to the Caribbean during the semester break taking the majority of articles to be coded home with her. In spite of assurances that she would keep in touch, there was no telephone or email communication over four weeks. Some 20 out of a total of 71 articles and coding sheets were returned to the researcher by this coder via post without a cover note or explanation if more coding sheets were to be expected. Overall, this researcher was not in contact with this coder for over eight weeks. As to be expected, this frustrating and agonising situation prompted this researcher to consider using computer software at this late stage rather than using human coders.

Further exploration of other software packages was then made to determine if they were able to accommodate the goals of this study. As already discussed before, the use of computer software was deemed not entirely suitable for this study and these limiting factors remained across the range of quantitative software programmes. The other option for this researcher was to replace this coder with another one and engage in another round of training sessions.

The risk involved in this approach is that as this new participant was not present in the first training session with the remaining coder, it would be difficult for her to be at the same level of coding competence. It was decided to attempt to make contact for the final time before starting training with another coder. Fortunately for this exercise, there was a response from the errant coder who gave assurances that she had completed the coding and would be taking them with her on her return to the UK for the start of the new semester.

It was impossible to foresee the problem that emerged with this coder, but the experience of this exercise is instructive for future research using human coders. It is apparent that the coding exercise was tedious for both coders and so they were not motivated to quickly finish the project. Perhaps, if this researcher had offered monetary payment so that the coders approached the exercise as a project for which they would be remunerated, they would have been more committed to the task, and with this incentive in mind, complete the exercise with alacrity.
Severe financial constraints did not allow this researcher to offer credible payment to the coders for their efforts, and so there was a reliance on their goodwill for this project. Their initial enthusiasm and diligence in the commencement of the coding process was deeply appreciated by this researcher, but apparently, the large number of articles to be coded some 158 articles overall was too demanding for the coders. During the first week of the exercise, both coders reported that they could only code for over an hour at a time. The problem of coder fatigue is extensively reported in the literature, but there is no clear advice as how to overcome it (Berelson 1952; Krippendorff 1980; Neuendorf 2002; Riffe, Lacy, et al. 1998).

There is also a possibility that the coding form was extensive and detailed in terms of the number of articles that that each coder was required to do. It may be that an extensive coding form is not conducive to human coding of large numbers of data. As there were time constraints, a better option perhaps would have been to use computer coding for as many categories as possible, and use human coders only for the latent categories which could not have been validly coded by computers. Maybe, if the coders were faced mostly with latent categories on the coding form, they would not have found the process so tedious and been able to complete it more speedily.

Protracted coding periods aroused the concern of this researcher who hoped the coders would have stuck closely to the exercise until completion to ensure their concentration and in turn high intercoder reliability. However this was not the case as coders reported that they suspended coding for as long as three weeks between articles. This suggests that the coding exercise was not done consistently over a time period, but was interrupted by delays throughout the coding process. The researcher did not have control of this process of coding and so such considerations were noted for their implications for reliability scoring among coders.
7.12 Interjudge/Intercoder Reliability
The key test of reliability in content analysis using human coders is the level of intercoder reliability. Kassarjian (1977:14) defines intercoder reliability as the ‘degree of consistency between coders applying the same set of categories to the same content’. When there is a high level of reliability agreement, the researcher is able to make assertions on the validity of the categories. Low intercoder reliability may be attributed to poorly defined categories or to extraneous factors such as deviant coding or a lack of commitment to the exercise by coders.

7.13 Data selection and sampling issues
The aim of this study is to determine the image of Caribbean destinations in the UK press. It was decided to focus on the Sunday newspapers as these editions mostly carried travel pages which it was expected would provide stories on selected Caribbean destinations. It was also expected that non-travel stories would also be featured in these editions as well, and so the Sunday editions were ideal in providing the coverage required for this study. The overall population of the study was defined as the total number of articles on the Caribbean that were found in all the Sunday editions of UK newspapers for the year 2000.

There are a total of nine national Sunday newspapers in the UK. There are other newspapers such as Scotland on Sunday that is available nationally but focuses primarily on coverage for that country. On this basis it was not included in the list of UK national newspapers. The original intention was to select a random sample from the nine newspapers for data collection for 2000. In keeping with traditional sampling procedures, the next step was to randomly sample for articles over the year. However in the course of data collection it was found that with this sampling, some countries were not captured as stories on them were less frequent than others. This raised the prospect that this sampling approach would result in some countries not being featured at all in the data set.
Although in the literature there are clear examples for the legitimacy of such sampling procedures, it was apparent that this approach is more feasible for theme or word searches, rather than a case when there is a need to gather information on a group of selected countries. In order to capture all the countries in the selected group, it was necessary to conduct a broad sweep of collecting relevant articles from all the Sunday editions for 2000. This effort yielded the desired result of capturing articles on all eighteen countries of the study area.

In the early stages of data gathering it was found that stories covering sporting events, in particularly cricket, were overwhelming and generally did not focus on the Caribbean destinations but on the sporting match or event. It was decided that these articles were not to be included in the data set since they inflated the size of the data while not providing pertinent information specific to the image of the destinations. Although articles that covered sporting events were eliminated, articles that featured sport celebrities and leisure sporting activities were included in the sample as they were considered relevant to the sporting image of the Caribbean. Generally, all types of articles on individual Caribbean countries were collected. These items ranged from hard news stories, features and travel stories that had a focus on one or several Caribbean countries. However, letters to the Editor and opinion pieces were not included in the data set.

As the focus of examination of this study is the stories and textual narratives written by journalists and travel writers, advertising and photo captions were excluded from the data set. Most consumers are aware that advertising messages are paid for by those with an interest in promoting these destinations and so they are viewed with less credibility (Gartner 1993). Critically, this study presents an in-depth investigation of the level of organic and covert image formation agents in newspapers rather than focussing on the more induced level of image formation represented in advertising. Photo captions were not included in this study in keeping with the emphasis on language and narrative representations of destination image.
7.14 Data sources

The rapid growth and prevalence of digital and electronic technology have opened up access to a reservoir of message archives and indexes. The days of labouriously pouring over newspapers and other texts for selection of data are a distant nightmare. There are numerous electronic archives and indexes that facilitate the speedy, exhaustive and systematic access to articles, and these continue to grow daily. The ability to download, save and print articles directly offers the advantage of the speedy availability of hard copies of articles or as electronic files. This is more convenient that using original newspaper editions and microfilm copies where searches have to be conducted manually and then photocopied before hard copies can be obtained.

This research utilised the PROQUEST search engine available via the Internet to subscribers such as academic institutions. It offers archives of most of the newspapers in the USA and UK. Systematic, page by page searches of every edition of archived newspapers is available using PROQUEST so that intensive searches can be made apart from the use of keyword searches. For this study the former method was predominantly used, however keyword searches were also conducted using destination names to cross check and to verify that there was an accurate tally with the original search. It was found that the page by page search of each Sunday edition was comprehensive. PROQUEST provides the headlines and opening sentences of each story on a page. Articles for the study were chosen by scanning these headlines and if mention was made of any destination countries or the region, the article was read completely and selected based on the research criteria.

Of the nine national Sunday newspapers, six were available on PROQUEST. These included the 'so-called' elite brands, The Sunday Times, The Sunday Telegraph, The Sunday Observer and the Independent on Sunday as well as the mid market Mail on Sunday. Electronic archived editions or CD Rom were not available for the remaining newspapers. In an attempt to gain access to their electronic archives, this researcher made telephone contact with the owners of the Sunday Mirror and the Sunday People, News of the World and the Express on Sunday. Only the Mirror Group favourably
responded by granting free access to their commercial website which contained the relevant archived material.

But in spite of extensive pleas, no such concession was made by News Corporation while the Express Group explained that they had to shut down this archived site in a cost cutting exercise. News International also referred this researcher to a news service, but the costs of getting the data was prohibitive and only available on hard copy and not as electronic files or on disk. The final recourse was to gather the information from the News of the World and the Sunday Express from microfiche at the Newspaper Library at Colindale in North London which was a very long and arduous process. As only photocopy copies were available for these articles, they also had to be typed into the NVivo software for qualitative analysis.

This experience of data collection highlights the need for university libraries to acquire archives of the tabloid press in addition to the prestige brands. Repeatedly, University Librarians informed this researcher that they did not and were unlikely to keep archives of the redtop tabloids. There may be some commercial consideration involved in the policy of access to archives. For example, News International seemed quite willing to allow their prestige brands to be archived online, but not their tabloid editions, The Sun and News of the World that could only be obtained by directly paying the company for this access. However, the tabloids are a part of the reality of the British media and newspaper landscape, and it is vital for the librarians of educational institutions to reconsider existing policies in the interest of academic research. According to the Audit Bureau of Circulation (ABC), tabloids not only dominate Sunday readership, but they also command the largest share of readers in comparison to the prestige brands (McNair 1999:12). This means that news representations presented by these editions reach a wider section of the population than the prestige brands. In spite of the notions of the low academic appropriation of 'red top' tabloid material, still it is in the interest of social record and research, there should be an appreciation of the importance of these publications as artefacts of British cultural and social life.
7.15 Generalisability

Content analysis follows the same rules of generalisation as any other quantitative method. This means that probability samples may generalise findings to the population that they are drawn from (Babbie 1992; Neuendorf 2002). In this study, the unit of analysis is every article featuring selected Caribbean destinations while the population comprises all 52 editions of Sunday newspapers for the year 2000. Since the aim of the study is to ascertain a contemporary picture or a ‘slice of life’ view of the image of the Caribbean in the press, it was decided to purposively choose the year 2000 for the population. The findings of this study are therefore generalisable for the year sampled. Sekaran (2000: 278) notes that there are instances when purposive sampling is preferable, particularly when the information required can be best obtained in that way and fits the criteria that the researcher needs. The year 2000 provided an up-to-date account of stories on the Caribbean and was deemed appropriate for this study. Although purposive sampling restricts the generalisability of the findings, in this study the findings are generalisable to the population of Sunday newspapers for the year 2000.

CONCLUSION

It is claimed that content analysis is perhaps the fastest growing technique in quantitative research and the field of mass communication (Neuendorf 2002; Riffe, Lacy, et al. 1998). With the increasing popularity of content analysis, there have been efforts to refine and expand the boundaries of the method to make it even more efficient in the analysis of both latent and manifest meanings of texts. Particularly in the area of media studies and mass communications, there is focal interest on the ways the analysis of message content can be used to make inferences concerning the characteristics of both senders and the receivers of communication. Although the extent to which inferences can be made from content analysis remains an area of debate, the discussion in this chapter has shown that the method provides a bridge to make linkages across message sources and receivers. This chapter also highlighted the advantages and limitations of computer assisted software packages and the continued value of human coders in content analysis. While reliability is high with computer packages, human coders may provide higher validity to the research. In
content analysis, the application of intercoder reliability ratings answers questions of reliability and also the validity of coding categories. It has been shown that for this study, human coders are more suitable for the coding of latent content over computer software. This chapter has also discussed the data selection and sampling procedures that have been undertaken for this study. The following chapter presents the results of the content analysis exercise and discusses the implications of the findings in terms of the study’s research goals.
CHAPTER 8

FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS – CONTENT ANALYSIS

INTRODUCTION

The findings and the analysis of the content analysis coding are presented in this chapter. The aim of the analysis is to describe and to determine the frequencies and the patterns of image constructs of Caribbean destinations portrayed in the newspaper articles selected for this study. The data have been analysed by measuring the relative frequencies of the variables that have been used to code newspaper articles. The analysis focussed primarily on frequency counts and cross tabulations of variable constructs. Where relevant, non-parametric chi square tests were conducted in order to determine the significance of association between variables. The approach taken was to discuss reliability sampling and intercoder results and then to analyse the basic identifier categories or form variables that describe the main features and characteristics of the newspaper articles. This was followed by the analysis of the content variables that identified destination image attributes, message features and textual style.

8.1 Discussion of population, sample size and intercoder reliability tests

The data population for this study was defined as the total number of articles of the selected Caribbean countries that were that were gleaned from all nine national Sunday newspapers for the year 2000. This yielded a total number of 158 articles that were comprised of both news items and travel stories. All the coded data that were coded were imputed in SPSS and analysed for the findings of this study.

However the test for intercoder reliability was conducted on a random sample which was calculated using the formula detailed below taken from Riffe, Lacy et al (1998):-
Sample size calculation

\[
    n = \frac{(N - 1)(SE)^2 + PQN}{(N - 1)(SE)^2 + PQ}
\]

\[
    n = \frac{(158 - 1)(0.03)^2 + 0.09(158)}{(158 - 1)(0.03)^2 + 0.09}
\]

\[
    n = \frac{157 	imes 0.0009 + 14.22}{157 	imes 0.0009 + 0.09}
\]

\[
    n = \frac{0.1413 + 14.22}{0.1413 + 0.09}
\]

\[
    n = \frac{14.3613}{0.2313}
\]

\[
    n = 62
\]

According to Riffe, Lacy, et al. (1998:125), researchers can use this formula to calculate the standard error to estimate a minimal standard size necessary to infer to the population at a given confidence level. Here, the standard error for this reliability sample was set at a 95% confidence level as advised by Riffe, Lacy, et al. (1998:126) as acceptable resulting in a sampling error (SE) of .03. This SE was used to determine the reliability sample of 62. It is therefore assumed that obtaining a 90% agreement on each variable of the 62 articles means that at least 85% or better agreement would exist if the entire population of 158 were coded by the two coders and reliably measured (Riffe, Lacy, et al. 1998:126).

As mentioned earlier, the reliability sample was randomly chosen and this was done using a printed table of random numbers. For reliability tests to be made, both coders were assigned the same 62 articles. However the coders were assigned the articles in the reliability sample as well as others that were not in it. This means that a total of 220 articles were read by the two coders. In this case, Coder 1 was assigned a total of 120 articles and Coder 2 was given 100. This accounted for the total of 158 articles in the population, inclusive of the same 62 items that were coded by each of the coders. As expected, there were differences in coding in the reliability sample. Lombard, Snyder-Duch, et al. (2002:601) advise that the appropriate procedure for incorporating the coding of the reliability sample is to use a ‘majority’ decision rule when there is
an odd number of coders or having the researcher or other expert serve as tie-breaker, or discussing and resolving the disagreements with the coders. In this study, there were only two coders, and since they were not available to resolve these disagreements, this researcher served as the tie-breaker. Such coding decisions were done after the articles were read by this researcher and then these were included in the final data set (Neuendorf 2002:146).

Content analysis projects must report intercoder reliability agreement and a suitable statistical index that accounts for agreement by chance or else risk being invalid or meaningless according to Lombard, Snyder-Duch, et al. (2002) and Neuendorf (2002). Riffe, Lacy, et al. (1998) also state that content analysis research must report simple percentage agreement scores as well as an statistical index that takes chance into consideration for every variable used in the study. The three formulas that are usually mentioned in the literature to control for chance agreements are Scott’s Pi, Cohen’s Kappa and Krippendorf’s Alpha. Scott’s Pi is one of the most popular tests that is considered appropriate for nominal level variables and when they are two coders according to Lombard, Snyder-Duch, et al.(2002:591). Based on these features, Scott’s Pi was deemed suitable for this study. The formula for Scott’s Pi is represented as

\[
\frac{%OA - %EA}{1 - %EA}
\]

OA = observed agreement  
EA = expected agreement

Scott’s Pi corrects for the probability of chance agreement based on the number of categories and how they are assigned. The statistic has a normal range from .00 which represents agreement at chance level, with 1.00 representing perfect agreement and less than .00 indicating less than a chance agreement (Neuendorf 2002:150). According to Neuendorf (2002:145) a ‘coefficient of .90 or greater would be acceptable to all, .80 or greater would by acceptable in most situations, and below that, there exists great disagreements’ on acceptable reliability scores.
Table 8.1 reports both simple percentage agreement results as well as Scott’s Pi scores for intercoder reliability for the variables used in the coding instrument.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Percentage Agreement</th>
<th>Scott’s Pi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Newspapers</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date of article</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Page number of article</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender of writer</td>
<td>91.9%</td>
<td>.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Destination mentioned in headline</td>
<td>96.8%</td>
<td>.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Destination focus</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of story</td>
<td>98.4%</td>
<td>.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of news story</td>
<td>91.9%</td>
<td>.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject of article</td>
<td>88.7%</td>
<td>.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People image</td>
<td>91.9%</td>
<td>.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holistic image</td>
<td>87.1%</td>
<td>.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coastal</td>
<td>93.5%</td>
<td>.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mountain</td>
<td>90.3%</td>
<td>.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>95.2%</td>
<td>.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban - cityscape</td>
<td>91.9%</td>
<td>.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flora &amp; fauna</td>
<td>96.8%</td>
<td>.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (landscape)</td>
<td>88.7%</td>
<td>.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unspoilt</td>
<td>91.9%</td>
<td>.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authentic</td>
<td>93.5%</td>
<td>.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adventurous</td>
<td>95.2%</td>
<td>.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beautiful</td>
<td>88.7%</td>
<td>.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overdeveloped</td>
<td>98.4%</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crowded</td>
<td>98.4%</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Threatened</td>
<td>98.4%</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unusual</td>
<td>98.4%</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychological neutral</td>
<td>79.0%</td>
<td>.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local people</td>
<td>91.9%</td>
<td>.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hospitable</td>
<td>95.2%</td>
<td>.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledgeable</td>
<td>91.9%</td>
<td>.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smiling</td>
<td>96.8%</td>
<td>.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friendly</td>
<td>95.2%</td>
<td>.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrious</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other positive</td>
<td>93.5%</td>
<td>.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hostile</td>
<td>96.8%</td>
<td>.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ignorant</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revolting</td>
<td>93.5%</td>
<td>.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laid back</td>
<td>96.8%</td>
<td>.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exploitative</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral negative</td>
<td>85.5%</td>
<td>.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water-sports</td>
<td>95.2%</td>
<td>.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land-based recreation</td>
<td>91.9%</td>
<td>.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sightseeing</td>
<td>96.8%</td>
<td>.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dining</td>
<td>96.5%</td>
<td>.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partying</td>
<td>95.2%</td>
<td>.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shopping</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relaxing</td>
<td>93.5%</td>
<td>.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other activities</td>
<td>83.9%</td>
<td>.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of holiday experience</td>
<td>74.2%</td>
<td>.63</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Most of the variables scored acceptable levels of intercoder reliability. However, the Scott’s Pi test for intercoder reliability show that the category ‘type of holiday experience’ was .63, far below the acceptable .80. This category measured the latent content of Cohen’s (1979) modes of tourist experience. As noted in the chapter on Content Analysis, it is difficult to achieve high reliability scores for the coding of latent content. Although the pre-test indicated low agreement, it was hoped that with extensive coder training that intercoder reliability would improve. However, this was not achieved in the final coding and so this category had to be eliminated from the analysis as instructed by Kassarjian (1977), Neuendorf (2002) and (Riffe, Lacy, et al. 1998).

This means that this study found that it was not possible to use content analysis to determine the types or levels of Cohen’s modes of tourist experience in the newspaper articles. The overall validity of the study was not compromised by this elimination as types of holiday experiences was one of several variables on message content that were being examined. It is apparent that it is difficult to achieve high reliability scores in coding for conceptual characteristics in texts. In a study to determine the presence of six latent leisure themes in 500 print advertisements, McCullough (1993:384) reported low intercoder reliability scores of between 57% to 65%. McCullough’s study supports the low intercoder reliability of this finding and suggests that content analysis may not be suitable to determine subjective, latent or conceptual features of texts.

The category ‘Reader Positioning’ scored .78 which is also below the recommended .80 level. However, Lombard, Snyder-Duch, et al. (2002:593) argue that a criterion of .70 is often used in exploratory research and that is possible to use more liberal criteria when applying more conservative indices such as Scott’s Pi or Cohen’s Kappa. This category was therefore included in the analysis.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Genre convention</th>
<th>93.5%</th>
<th>.90</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reader positioning</td>
<td>85.5%</td>
<td>.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benefits for reader</td>
<td>83.9%</td>
<td>.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sponsor id</td>
<td>87.1%</td>
<td>.81</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
8.2 Discussion of newspaper characteristics

The form variables in the coding form attempt to measure the type and level of stories in terms of their presentation in the newspapers. Features such as page numbers, headlines and type of article, whether travel feature or hard or news stories represent key manifest variables that may be used in assessing how stories on the Caribbean are represented and covered. More importantly, they also serve as the basis for determining differences in the nature of the coverage of Caribbean destinations across newspaper types and the implications of this for readership perceptions and the image they hold of these destinations. As Figure 8.1 indicates, the *Sunday Observer* provided the largest number of stories on the Caribbean at 19%, the *Sunday Times* next with 16% and mid-market *Sunday Express* with 11.4%, followed closely by the *Mail on Sunday* and the *Sunday Telegraph* each with 11% stories.

**Figure 8.1 - Level of coverage of Caribbean stories in Sunday newspapers**

![Bar chart showing level of coverage of Caribbean stories in different Sunday newspapers]

The tabloid *People* carried the least with 6%, while the *Independent on Sunday* carried 9% which was the least for the quality broadsheet papers. However, taking into consideration that the prestige papers tend to carry more pages than the other
newspapers, it can be concluded that there are no significant differences in the level of coverage in the number of stories between the quality papers, the mid-market and the tabloid press. This suggests that there is a similar level of coverage of Caribbean stories in the Sunday national newspapers.

There was a slight difference in the level of coverage across the newspapers in terms of travel and news stories and hard and soft news as shown in the tables below:

**Table 8.2 – Difference of coverage between news and travel story**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sunday Newspapers</th>
<th>Type of story</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>News Story</td>
<td>Travel Story</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>News of the World</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Mirror</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday People</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mail on Sunday</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Express</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Times</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Telegraph</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Observer</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent on Sunday</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>87</strong></td>
<td><strong>71</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There was minimal difference in the number of news and travel stories in the sample. Only three newspapers, the *Sunday Express*, *Sunday Times* and *Sunday Observer* had more travel stories. The tabloid press and the *Mail on Sunday* carried more news stories than travel stories while the *People* did not have a travel story. Overall, there were more news stories than travel stories.

Looking further at the breakdown of the type of news stories, there were no significant differences in the proportion of hard versus soft news stories between newspapers.
Table 8.3 – Difference in level of coverage of hard and soft news stories

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sunday Newspapers * Type of news story Crosstabulation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Count</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Type of news story</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Newspapers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>News of the World</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Mirror</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday People</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mail on Sunday</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Express</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Times</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Telegraph</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Observer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent on Sunday</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It may seem surprising that given their concentration of serious topics and presentation of hard news, that the quality broadsheets did not carry more hard news stories than the tabloids. This low representation in the hard news domain may suggest that the region is relatively insignificant in the hierarchy of news values and that this is consistent across the various national newspapers. These findings show that the Sunday newspapers do not portray significant differences in the level and type of coverage on the Caribbean. It also addresses one of the main research questions of this study as to whether there are differences in the level of representation across newspaper types.

It can be concluded that the lack of distinct differences implies that the quality newspapers may be informing their readers on the Caribbean no more than the tabloid press. Interestingly, findings on similar levels of stories in the quality and tabloid press was reported by an earlier content analytic research undertaken by Evans, Krippendorf, et al. (1990:105). In that study they found that science reporting in the national prestige and tabloid press in the United States featured ‘the same type of science news in roughly the same proportions’. It may be inferred that in spite of the their apparent differences in content and readership both quality and tabloid newspapers do not appear to vary in particular subject areas.
8.3 Further exploration of form variables

Newspapers tend to place stories on various pages depending on their conception of the importance of the item. Story placement on page one therefore gives an indication of its relative importance and reflects the overall news values of the newspaper. A cross tabulation of the various topics of stories with the page numbers they were placed showed that crime and politics stories were mostly featured on page one.

Table 8.4 Top page numbers of various subjects of stories in newspapers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page of articles</th>
<th>Event (s)</th>
<th>Crime</th>
<th>Economy</th>
<th>Political</th>
<th>Cultural</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Political stories received the most prominence with 8 stories in the top ten pages. There were five cultural pieces, with stories on crime and the economy next with four stories each. While political items may have negative or positive overtones, it could be argued that the overtly negative crime stories did not overwhelm the prominent pages of the newspapers, but was somewhat balanced by political stories. Those crime stories with implications of threats to personal safety may heighten the risk perception of tourists to the Caribbean and promote negative organic images of the region as a tourist destination. On the other hand, the comparatively high placement of cultural stories suggests that this feature of the region may be ranked highly in terms of the news values of the national newspapers. This is likely to work favourably for the region's organic image and may represent the dimension of the Caribbean's image best suited for the development and enhancement of a brand identity (Gartner 1993).
8.4 A word on gender

As indicated in the chapter discussing destination image constructs, there is no clear conclusion in the media research literature on the distinctions that can be made between stories written by men as opposed to women. However, Pritchard & Morgan (2000:124) contend that in tourism, the travel media have been dominated by ‘particular masculine scripts’ which has led to the predominance of images of gendered landscapes that offer ‘feminine seduction and masculine adventure’. They conclude that the effect of the dominance of masculine scripts has been to privilege the male gaze as the ‘master subject’. But Pritchard and Morgan did not provide clear constructs and variables in support of these arguments that could have been operationalised for content analysis coding so that their assumptions on gendered differences in tourism media images could have been tested.

This study was therefore limited to accounting for the relative frequencies of stories written by men and women. This category was deemed useful in determining whether stories are mostly written by men as suggested by Pritchard and Morgan (2000). As the findings below in Figure 8.2 indicate, men do make up the larger proportion of writers and hence gives some support for Pritchard and Morgan’s view of the dominance of masculine scripts in the travel media.

Figure 8.2 Gender of Writer of News and Travel Stories
This bar chart shows that there were male writers for 34% and 22.7% of news and travel stories respectively. Female writers accounted for 11.3% news stories and 17.3% travel articles. Overall, the gender of 14.7% of the articles was not identified. Eight articles were not coded in this category in the sample.

A chi-square test was conducted in order to establish if there was a statistically significant relationship between gender and the type of news story. The result is presented below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chi-Square Tests</th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Chi-Square</td>
<td>7.781a</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>.020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood Ratio</td>
<td>7.872</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>.020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear-by-Linear Association</td>
<td>.004</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.950</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N of Valid Cases</td>
<td>150</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As indicated in footnote a, the assumption of minimum expected cell frequency of 5 and greater than 5, was not violated. This means that the findings can be used to test for significance (Pallant 2001:259). The Asymp Sig. also needs to be .05 or smaller to be significant. In this case, the value of .020 is less than .05 and so it can be concluded that the result is significant. However, it may not be tenable to establish this relationship between gender and news stories due to the high proportion of articles where the gender of the writer was not identified.

From these findings it may be argued that the dominance of male writers present the likelihood of bias towards the male perspective. It can also be assumed that knowing the gender of the writer may be important in terms of the overall media representation and the images of the destination. Nonetheless, it must be maintained that assertions on gender distinctions require further research to establish the demarcations between
the male view and female perspectives in the representations and image constructs of tourism destinations.

8.5 Discussion of destination characteristics

The coding of destinations presented in the articles in the sample was undertaken to determine the level and type of coverage they were given in the national newspapers. These factors are implicated in the presentation of their image in the newspaper press. The data for this study was comprised of countries known as the Commonwealth Caribbean, that is, the 18 former colonies of the United Kingdom located in the Caribbean basin. This category also included stories focussing on the region that may not focus on any one country. This was useful in locating a regional or composite image as opposed to the image of individual countries. The table below shows that all the destinations in the population set was represented in the data. In other words, there was at least one article on all of the countries of the British Caribbean.

Table 8.5 Destination Focus of Articles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Destination</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Anguilla</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antigua &amp; Barbuda</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bahamas</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barbados</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belize</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bermuda</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>British Virgin Islands</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cayman Islands</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dominica</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grenada</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guyana</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jamaica</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montserrat</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Kitts &amp; Nevis</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Lucia</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St Vincent &amp; the Grenadines</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trinidad &amp; Tobago</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turks &amp; Caicos</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caribbean (no mention)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caribbean (more than one)</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>158</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

192
Here in Table 8.5 Jamaica takes the lead in the sample with 19% of articles with Barbados in second place at 8.2% which is less than half the total for Jamaica. St. Lucia and the Turks & Caicos Islands follow with 7.6% of articles. Anguilla, Cayman Islands, Montserrat and Trinidad and Tobago each have one article. However, another indication of the level of prominence of the destinations is demonstrated by their mention in the headlines. The occurrence of the destination name in the headline promotes a brand identity that may be enhanced or diminished depending on the nature of the story (Gartner 1993).

In Figure 8.3 Jamaica features prominently with the most number of headline mentions in nine articles, St Lucia is next with six and Turks and Caicos with five mentions. The Caribbean brand name also appears to have a comparatively high level of exposure with eight mentions in headlines.

**Figure 8.3 Level of destination mention in headlines**

But although Jamaica is the most prominent in the number of stories and in headline mention, this is predominantly for news stories rather than in travel stories.
It is clear from the line graph above, Figure 8.4, that Jamaica has almost three times the number news stories than travel stories at 22 and eight stories respectively in the articles. Other destinations such as Antigua and Barbuda, the Bahamas, Belize, Guyana and St Vincent and the Grenadines show a similar pattern as Jamaica with more hard news stories than travel stories. By contrast, Barbados has more travel stories at seven and news stories at six. St. Lucia also follows this pattern with eight travel stories and four news stories. This suggests that those destinations with a higher number of news stories than travel stories may have a more dominant organic image in the newspaper press than destinations with a higher level of travel stories. The implication of this for destinations is that those with a higher level of news stories may have to conduct specific and focussed campaigns to redress the organic images that are predominantly negative. However, if the organic image is deemed to be positive, this may present a distinct opportunity to build on and to establish a value added benefit or brand image for the destination.

Overall there was a slightly higher level of news stories on the Caribbean than travel stories at 87 and 71 respectively. Travel stories were just about 10% less than news stories. This may be an indication that there is no major imbalance in the types of
coverage of the region as both travel and generic news stories are at a similar level of representation. The two categories, destination in headline and type of news stories are indicative of the relative prominence of these destinations in the newspapers. But the results show that Jamaica in particular seems to have significant exposure compared other destinations in the region based on the island’s high ranking in both categories. This suggests that Jamaica has a strong organic image and that perhaps there is greater awareness as well as more clearly defined views and opinions held on the destination among readers.

8.6 Discussion of destination attribute constructs

Destination image assessment is primarily undertaken by the measurement of attributes of the destination (Echtner & Ritchie 1993; Gallarza, Saura, et al. 2002; Pike 2002). In a content analysis of destination brochures, Dilley (1986) measured the relative frequencies of various attributes of the destination in order to determine the pattern and level of image constructs portrayed in the brochures. This approach is also adopted in this study in order to locate the pattern and level of image constructs of the Caribbean in the newspaper articles.

Category 11 focuses on the main subject or topic of the articles. The subject themes were categorised in terms of travel focus, people focus and a generic focus. These variables assess the content of the articles in terms of thematic emphasis. The determination of thematic emphasis is important in order to evaluate news values and they also indicate the nature and pattern of the representations portrayed in the articles. In this category, travel news stories were coded to assess the most popular travel topics.

The pie chart below shows that the focus of stories was mainly on the destination at 63%. This was followed by stories on accommodation at around 15%, with holiday activities next at approximately 8%. Stories on family vacations and transportation were least represented in the sample. These findings indicate that the typical travel story focuses on the destination. The image of the destination is therefore central to the holiday experience. While accommodation facilities, attractions and holiday
activities are important features of travel, they are subordinate, although complementary, to the overall image of the destination.

**Figure 8.5  Level of representation of topics of articles**

![Figure 8.5](image)

But even though they may be complementary, these features have to be anchored in a strong destination image. The implications for destination marketing are that the overall image of the destination is paramount so that focusing on a particular niche or segment of the travel experience may not be sufficient to sustain a strong image of the destination.

The next two categories of People Focus and Generic Focus include news and travel stories. Here the People Focus category comprises locals of the destinations, celebrities and ex-patriots. It is important to point out this category measures the frequency of stories that focus on people as the main subject for the articles.

**Figure 8.6  People Images in articles**

![Figure 8.6](image)
As shown in Figure 8.6, stories on celebrities take the lead at 25%, followed by local people at 9% and ex-patriots at 3%. Local people had a lower level of representation than celebrities and this may imply that overall they are less significant in defining the image of the destination at the organic level. Although the content and nature of image constructs of local people are explored in more detail later in this analysis, nevertheless this category shows that it is more likely for a story on a Caribbean destination to feature a celebrity rather than a local of the destination. This exposes the priorities and the interests of the media in terms of coverage of people in relation to the Caribbean. In other words, it is likely for the Caribbean to get some mention in national newspapers based on the visit of a celebrity to the country rather than coverage of locals.

The high level of celebrity stories may be explained by the demand of readers for news on celebrities. The lifestyle choices of destinations for vacation getaways or hideaways of entertainment, sporting and political celebrities are duly recorded and photographed in the press. Readers' obsession with celebrities is such that their sightings at holiday locations ensure a place in print in both tabloid and quality newspapers. There were several stories in the sample that were not more than three sentences that simply reported that a particular celebrity was visiting or vacationing at a destination, and this was enough to be included in the choice for publication in the newspaper. The appetite for celebrity news indicates the influence of popular culture in travel and tourism.

Caribbean destinations and others gain publicity and mention in newspapers when they are chosen for holidays or visits by the rich and famous and this may have an halo effect for the destinations they visit. Or more appropriately, the choice of a vacation destination as part of the consumptive lifestyle of a celebrity tends to make the destination appear more trendy or special. However this image development also occurs at the organic level outside the direct control of destination managers.

But the fluidity, fickleness and dynamism of popular culture and celebrity stardom may undermine the ability of destination marketers to harness the benefits of exposure in a
sustained manner in favour of the destination. The reality is that today’s celebrities may be tomorrow’s pariahs. Destination image built around celebrity endorsement or tropes from popular culture may therefore be tenuous for the long-term image of the destination. Most destinations may be able to reap temporal benefits from their association with the rich and famous, for example, Mustique and Princess Margaret and Richard Branson and Necker Island. But is should be noted that the focus of press reports is usually on the celebrity, not the destination that is likely to be subsumed in these stories.

Ex-patriots living in the destination also represent another image source for the destination. According to Dann (1992:61), by their maintenance of the rituals of their home country, ex-patriots often exemplify and highlight the difference and strangerhood of the locals. For the Caribbean the most common problem was the tendency of ex-patriots to convey an image of some destinations in the region as colonial outposts or invoke nostalgia of a moribund imperial past. Stories on ex-patriots were only 3% suggesting that they may not be very significant in terms of their impact on the image of the region.

The generic subject category combines a wide range of topics. This category is useful in tracking news values as well as locating the topics that that are mostly associated with the Caribbean.

![Figure 8.7 Subjects covered in Sunday newspaper articles](image-url)
In this category, crime stories are the most frequent at 10%, closely followed by political stories at 9% and cultural stories at 8%. As noted earlier, the relative parity between crime and political stories may benefit the overall organic image of the Caribbean destinations in the press. However it is also necessary to determine the distribution of subject themes across the different destinations. For example, most of the crime stories were on Jamaica that accounted for almost half of the crime stories. On the other hand there were no crime stories on Barbados as the island was represented quite favourably with stories only on the country’s economy and culture. Within the region, Jamaica’s image as a holiday destination is being undermined by a predominance of crime stories, while Barbados seems to have an advantage in terms of a more positive image generated by mostly cultural and political stories.

The lack of news stories on Barbados supports the destination’s position as having the largest share of tourists to the region (Caribbean Statistical Report 2000). This works favourably in maintaining their dominance in the market but it also makes the destination vulnerable to negative news stories. On the other hand, destinations such as Jamaica and Antigua with longstanding media images of crime and corruption continue to have a high level of coverage of these issues reinforcing these images at the organic level. This shows how the media tend to perpetuate and promote particular ways of seeing these destination through stereotyping and by choosing to continue to report these negative features.

8.7 Description and analysis of image attributes
According to Echtner & Ritchie (1993) it is possible to differentiate image attributes in terms of a continuum of functional/psychological, common/unique and holistic/attribute constructs. These constructs cover both the physical landscape features and the more subjective and evaluative dimensions of the image constructs. However, the main consideration for identifying and composing an hierarchy of attributes rests on the argument that they are the basis for consumer images which determines travel motivation and behaviour.

In establishing the link between attributes and travel motivation, Crompton (1979:414) proposes that the attributes of the destination relate primarily to the pull
factor while the psychological features are linked to the push factor or motivational
needs of the consumer. Crompton (1979:416) states that people often do not go on
vacation if they ‘have not had the opportunity to recognise their tension states in
socio-psychological terms’. This implies that consumers are likely to be more
motivated to travel based on socio-psychological features rather than only the
physical features or the amenities of the destination. It was therefore useful to
identify the level of physical and psychological dimensions of the image attributes
and constructs as a basis of making inferences concerning implications for reader’s
travel motivation and behaviour.

8.8 Discussion of landscape image attributes
As expected for Caribbean destinations, there was a predominance of coastal
representations of the region. The region is known for the sun, sand and sea product
and this was duly reflected in the findings.

Figure 8.8 Physical landscape attributes

![Bar chart showing physical landscape attributes](image)

Figure 8.8 shows coastal attributes with a commanding prominence at 55%, rural
features are next at 13%, flora and fauna with 11%, mountain vistas at 8% and urban
scenes the least represented at 6%. The dominance of coastal representations suggests
that the Caribbean holiday experience is essentially defined in terms of its coastal
landscape. This may present challenges for the destinations to attempt to diversify or
expand the range of touristic experiences apart from the sun, sand and sea. While the Caribbean benefits from having a highly recognised and strong brand image for coastal holidays, the drawback is when this gives the impression that this is the extent of the holiday experiences that the region has to offer.

As competition between destinations intensify, both within and outside the region, the question of brand identity becomes more critical as consumers seek to locate that 'something extra' more than the mere coastal attributes when making their travel decisions (Leventhal 1996; Gnoth 1997; Taylor 2001). Destinations that are able to offer this bonus appeal whether through some physical or symbolic attribute maybe able to establish a distinctive and preferred image among consumers.

As noted earlier researchers have established distinctions between image constructs. For Echtner & Ritchie (1993), physical landscape constructs are functional attributes in contrast to the more subjective psychological attributes. These differences in attributes are differentiated in the language style with psychological attributes having to tendency to more evaluative than the descriptive mode of physical attributes. The use of psychological and holistic attributes demonstrates the writer making a value judgement regarding the landscape. These attributes resonate with the deeper psychological needs of the consumer and relate to their travel motivation. The measurement of the landscape psychological attributes gives a picture of the dominant appeals to the consumers’ travel motivations.

Figure 8.9 below shows that the most common descriptor for the regions’ landscape is 'beautiful'.
Beneficially for the region, the more dominant attributes are positive with beautiful emerging as the more popular at 33%, with unspoilt following next at 15%. This high level of representation of these attributes suggests the importance of aesthetic landscape values in the holiday experience of the region. This suggests that pristine and natural landscapes are dominant motifs for travel associated with the Caribbean and instances where these features or values are compromised may undermine the holiday experience. The natural landscape is definitely prioritised over the built environment, so that it appears that there may be limited scope for the region to introduce man-made attractions or experiences as alternatives to the traditional sun, sand and sea holiday. The travel motive of authenticity is supported in this finding with a representation of 6%, while the quest for unusual vistas also featuring at 5%. Overall, these findings support Crompton’s (1979:415) argument of an hierarchy of motives constructs in choosing a pleasure vacation.

More negative attributes however are ranked lower, with threatened at 2% and crowded and overdeveloped at 1% each. It is particularly significant that the neutral landscape attribute emerged at 46%. This means that almost half of all the stories on the Caribbean did not provide a subjective or psychological evaluation of the landscape. This non-representation of psychological landscape attributes suggests that there is a low level of persuasive appeals in this aspect of the region’s image. It
is not clear why travel writers are mostly descriptive rather than evaluative in their representation of the region, but it may be inferred that it is generally accepted that the physical and functional attributes sufficiently represents the vacation experience.

Crompton (1979:421) alluded to this when he pointed out that consumers have been conditioned into thinking primarily of the travel experience in terms of the destination and the functionality of the product offered. He argues the modus operandi of the travel industry has been based on this assumption. This may also account for the predominance of stereotypical landscape imagery in tourism and the prevalence of cliché in representing these attributes (Voase 2000). It may be further inferred that the presence of more evaluative and persuasive appeals in tourism messages and communications addresses and stimulates the more socio-psychological dimension of the consumer travel motivation, and engages them at a high involvement level in the buying decision process. But it is also important to point out that negative psychological attributes also have evaluative and persuasive appeals that may be more damaging in their overall impact on consumers if they violate the norms of consumer expectation of the destination.

8.9 Discussion of image constructs of local people

The aim of this category is to measure the frequency of the mention of local people in stories as opposed to a previous category that coded for the number of stories that had local people as the focus of the story. In their respective reviews of the TDI literature, Gallarza, Saura, et al. (2002) and Pike (2002) found that the image of local people was one of the most common and significant variables in the measurement of destination image. This finding prompted more detailed measurement of this construct in this study. As shown in Figure 8.10 this study corroborates the importance of the construct of the local people in the overall destination image.
There is mention of local people in just under half of all stories at 47%. But it is also important to identify the most common attributes associated with the representation of local people in the news stories. Local people attributes were measured in terms of positive and negative constructs as differentiated by Dann (1996a; 1996b). Dann (1996a:353) also argues that neutral images may be deemed negative if the local people are merely mentioned with no descriptive or evaluative component presented in the representation.

The frequencies of positive and negative attributes of local people are shown in Table 8.6 below.

Table 8.6-Level of representations of local people attributes in stories

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attributes</th>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hospitable</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledgeable</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>1.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smiling</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friendly</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>1.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrious</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hostile</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ignorant</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revolting</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laid back</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exploitative</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral Negative</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The attributes friendly and hospitable are the most frequent at 10% and 13% respectively. With the negative attributes, neutral is the most frequent at 18% followed by hostile at 8%. However the mean shows that there were relatively minimal differences between the comparative frequencies of positive and negative people attributes as demonstrated in Figure 8.11

Figure 8.11 Comparative frequencies of positive and negative people attributes

![Graph showing comparative frequencies of positive and negative people attributes.]

But as Table 8.7 below shows, most of the positive representation of local people is presented in travel stories while news stories have more negative people constructs.

Table 8.7-Representation of destination peoples in news and travel stories

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attributes</th>
<th>News Stories</th>
<th>Travel Stories</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hostile</td>
<td>85%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ignorant</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revolting</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laid back</td>
<td></td>
<td>100%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exploitative</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral Negative</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hospitable</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>73%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledgeable</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smiling</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friendly</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>83%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrious</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Positive</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Here again it can be concluded that the negative images of local people are conveyed primarily at the organic level while the positive ones are dominant at the induced level of destination image formation. The high level of neutral negative constructs in both news stories and travel stories at 43% and 57% respectively suggests that although they are likely to be mentioned, the local people of the destination are not often given significant prominence in either a positive or negative way. These findings indicate that it maybe beneficial for Caribbean destination marketers to bring destination people in the forefront of advertising initiatives in such a way that not only highlight their service qualities, but also gives them defined identities. It may be that concrete images of real people can give more definition and vividness to a destination.

8.10 Portrayal of leisure activities

The portrayal of leisure activities that are undertaken during a vacation operates as a pull factor that may stimulate the travel motivation and help the shape the image of the destination in the mind of the consumer. Consistent with the dominant coastal landscape constructs in the sample, the findings show that there was most mention of watersport activities in the stories. Apart from watersports there is a similar parity of representation for other leisure activities.

Watersports is represented two times more than any other leisure activity in the sample. Land-based activities and dining are also ranked highly at 16% each. Sightseeing and partying come next at 11%. It is interesting that relaxing ranks even higher at 13%, showing that while the Caribbean holiday experience is mostly defined in terms of specific leisure activities, this includes the notion of relaxing or simply doing nothing. The attribute relaxing can also be linked to the travel motivation of escape that is often associated with Caribbean destinations.
8.11 Discussion of reader response and style constructs

The measurement of the reader response and style constructs is aimed at determining how the genre and language style of texts may be related to reader response. It seeks to determine if specific textual forms of address and language forms are related to authorial intentions to persuade and to influence their readers. These constructs are related only to travel stories as the intent was to make inferences concerning the nature of persuasive appeals in these stories.

The passive voice is represented in travel stories at 22%. This is on par with the active voice ‘I/ you’ and ‘we’ which were 18% and 4% respectively. This shows that
half of the travel stories were written in the passive voice and the other in the active voice. But Bhattacharyya (1997) argues that even when the passive voice is used there is still the voice of the implicit narrator that is evident in the ratings and evaluations that are presented of the product and experiences of the destination. Yet this finding also indicates that travel writers in the press still tend to use the Imperial 'I' as proposed by Pratt (1992), to convey the authority and credibility of their accounts. However the relative parity of active and passive voices suggests that the travel writing genre is flexible in its use of both modes of address.

This flexibility in modes of address is reflected across newspaper types. The number of stories written in the passive mode was slightly above those written in the active voice as demonstrated in Table 8.8 below

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 8.8</th>
<th>Modes of address in Newspapers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Newspapers</td>
<td>Active Voice 'I' or Active Voice 'we'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>News of the World</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Mirror</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mail on Sunday</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Express</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Times</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Telegraph</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday Observer</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent on Sunday</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall, the active voice is more dominant in travel stories than the passive voice at 52% and 48% respectively. However, these findings showed no significant differences in modes of address across newspapers. This continues the pattern of earlier results that have shown no clear differences between the newspapers.
For reader positioning which focuses on the persuasive language used by travel writers to encourage consumers to purchase the experience described, the results show that most travel stories did not have a call to action at 18%. This is understandable as travel writers may feel constrained to overtly appear as de facto employees of the destination or the travel intermediary that may have sponsored the trip. However as seen in Figure 8.14 the direct call to action was represented at 10% and indirect call to action at 17%, together this is a total of 27%, which is above the 18% noted for no call action.

It is evident that most travel writers tend to employ more covert persuasive appeals to influence consumer choices rather than using a direct call to action. After all, the travel writer is supported by the industry. It is therefore likely that the travel pages of the newspapers supported by profitable and voluminous travel advertising, will be a medium for the encouragement and promotion of travel to their readers. The question of the news values of objectivity is not paramount in the travel pages under such terms and so exposes the travel writer in the press as complicit with commercial travel interests.

**Figure 8.14 Reader positioning in the travel press**

![Bar chart showing reader positioning in the travel press](image)

Further clarity on the persuasive content of travel stories is presented by measuring the extent to which benefits of the particular experience is represented as opposed to the negative outcomes. This result is shown in Figure 8.15 below
Benefits of the holiday experience are mostly presented in the travel stories at 27% while negative effects are at 18%. This corroborates the previous finding on reader positioning that point to the mostly persuasive content and appeals of travel stories. However, this finding also suggests travel writers do not always choose to ignore the negative experiences at the destination. Such stories may be damaging for the destination if the authorial intention is also to persuade readers on conveys this in the article.

The next category, sponsor/company identification in travel stories indicates the sponsors of the travel writer’s trip that is usually mentioned at the end of the article. This gives a picture of the extent to which there is a clear notice of the association of the travel writer with the industry. As Gartner (1993) points out, travel stories in the press are covert induced images as they are not clearly seen by consumers as direct communication from travel interests, as is the case with advertisements. It is apparent that common practice among travel writers and editors not to overtly identify sponsors since most travel trips are usually facilitated by travel interests (Seaton 1991).
The findings in Figure 8.16 show that travel intermediaries are the most mentioned sponsors at 13%, with airlines next at 3.2%. It was surprising that destinations received only 1.3% of mention in travel stories which was less than the 1.9% of hotel chains. It is necessary to make a point of clarification in order to explain this finding. Often in travel stories, two or three sponsors are identified at the conclusion of the article. Here, coders were instructed to code for the first sponsor mentioned in the article, and not the others that may have been identified. This means that destinations may have been mentioned more often than indicated in this finding, but after the travel companies that are often named first. It is therefore more appropriate to conclude that this finding shows that travel intermediaries were the most prominently identified sponsors of the trips of travel writers.

Travel companies are the most likely links with writers in the marketplace and it is in their interest to actively support the trips of travel writers to destinations on their portfolio. Equally important is the fact that the provision of the details of the sponsor best supports the call to action appeal of travel stories. The provision of contact numbers, email addresses and web pages of tour companies and other travel intermediaries provide the required information to readers and enables them to easily follow through on the experience presented in the story. This makes practical sense in terms of a call to action with the booking information at the end providing closure of the experience described. Readers are generally guided towards choosing the destination described and in responding to the information they are linked to a
particular travel wholesaler or packaged holiday that is seen to offer the same experience. Overall, the reader response constructs show that there was a high level of persuasive appeals in travel articles. However it is also clear that there is some flexibility in the development of the genre in terms of the use of the active and passive voice.

8.12 Limitations of the study
Content analysis was used in this study to provide a descriptive account of the image constructs of select Caribbean destinations. These constructs were operationalised using nominal variables for the coding form. This was deemed suitable to answer the research questions posed to determine the nature and type of image constructs across the various newspapers. Consequently, this study mainly involved the analysis of simple frequencies of occurrence and co-occurrences of variables.

Neuendorf (2002:168) advises that for studies based on research questions that seek to describe form and content characteristics of a message is ‘probably best addressed with simple frequencies of occurrence and no test of statistical significance’. Since no formal hypotheses on proposed relationships between variables were made in this study, tests to determine the statistical significance between variables in order to make inferences on co-occurrences and causal relationships were not required.

This study is therefore limited in making inferences on the nature of the relationship between the various variables that comprise destination image constructs. On the other hand, it has generated data on the frequencies and types of image constructs that can be used operationalise future enquiries into significant relationships between destination image constructs. It also gives a picture on the hierarchy of attributes in defining particular constructs. For example, the content analysis finding show that in landscape constructs, it was found that coastal attributes were the most frequent, followed by rural, mountain, flora & fauna with urban attributes the least in defining the Caribbean landscape.
CONCLUSION

This chapter primarily presented a descriptive account of the image of the Caribbean destinations in the UK press. It presented a picture of the frequency and type of image constructs across various newspaper types. The findings showed that there were no significant differences in the number and type of news and travel stories between the tabloid, mid-market and quality broadsheet newspapers. The results also indicated an hierarchy of thematic and attribute constructs. Stories focussed mainly on destinations and celebrities, while the major subject themes represented were crime and politics. For travel stories, functional attributes were predominant with less representation of psychological and holistic constructs on the destinations. It was concluded that the emphasis on the functional attributes of destinations demonstrated a traditional approach to focus more on the product of the destination to define the tourism experience. However, it was argued that psychological attributes may be more persuasive than functional attributes in that they may be more likely to act as stimuli for the travel motivation of consumers. The analysis of the rhetorical style of the travel articles showed their prevalent use of modes of address and persuasive appeals aimed at encouraging readers towards buying the travel experience described in the stories. While this chapter has analysed the frequencies and types of representation of Caribbean destinations in the press, the following chapter on Discourse Analysis extends the investigation to exploring how destination images have been constructed in the newspaper texts.
CHAPTER 9

METHODOLOGY - DISCOURSE ANALYSIS

In the beginning was the Word... (The Gospel According to St John 1:1a, KJV)

INTRODUCTION

One of the greatest challenges of conducting discourse analysis is that it encompasses a variety of theoretical orientations and methods. Researchers usually have the responsibility to locate the variety or type of discourse that is most relevant to their research needs. Therefore this chapter focuses on explaining the discourse theories and methods that have been utilised in this research. This chapter does not present an expansive critique of the diversity of discourse theories and methods, yet it focuses on uncovering the common principles and generic approaches that characterise the research field of discourse analysis. Towards this end, key issues such as the epistemological foundations of discourse analysis and the distinguishing features of the method in relation to other qualitative approaches are reviewed in this chapter. How to actually ‘do’ discourse analysis is often a vexing question with answers from the research literature for the most part being elusive. Nevertheless, this chapter seeks to explain the management and treatment of the data collected for this research including the purpose, benefits and limitations of using the Nudist NVivo software in achieving the overall goals of the research. Above all, there is the commitment in making transparent as possible, the strategic thinking, steps and methods that have been used in the application of discourse analysis in this research process.

9.1 Introducing discourse analysis

All discourse theories share the common epistemological position that language organised as discourse ‘has the power to influence the way people experience and behave in the world’ (Burman & Parker 1993:1). The task of discourse analysis therefore attempts to ascertain how people’s identities and attitudes are shaped and constructed to produce particular meaning and effects (Tonkiss 1998:247). On a basic level, everyday discourses, that is, talk and texts are defined as discourse. However,
defining discourse as simply talk and text does not explain how they work in producing meaning and action in society. This definition presented by Hajer (1995: 14) attempts to address this function of discourse.

*Discourse is (here) defined as a specific ensemble of ideas, concepts, and categorizations that are produced, reproduced, and transformed in a particular set of practices and through which meaning is given to physical and social realities.*

With this definition, discourse is presented as social practice that has the ability to shape and direct people’s relationship with the social world. Phillips & Hardy (2002:2) take an even stronger position on the power of discourse in society

*Our view of discourse can be summarised in a sentence: Without discourse, there is no social reality, and without understanding discourses, we cannot understand our reality, our experiences, ourselves.*

Discourse theory generally sees the role of discourse as influencing the cognitive scripts and categorisations that are antecedent to social action. As Torfing (1999:82) contends, ‘our cognitions and speech-acts only become meaningful within certain pre-established discourses’. In other words, discourse influences our perceptions and thoughts so that it guides and maps our understandings of reality.

In order to reveal how meaning is produced, the study of language goes beyond linguistic examination to a focus on how language impacts social practices. It was Michel Foucault who insisted that discourse is about the ‘production of knowledge through language’ (Hall, 1997). He maintained that discourse for the most part dictates and regulates the way topics and subjects are meaningfully expressed and discussed. By extension, discourse is also able to limit and constrain other ways of constructing knowledge about topics and practices. It is through discourse that we are able to distinguish distinct fields of knowledge that establish particular domains of expertise. This is clearly illustrated in disciplinary fields such as medicine and law. Accordingly, within discourse certain speakers and ways of knowing are authorised and legitimated and are able to ‘discount competing accounts’ that may not conform to the knowledge claims of that discourse (Tonkiss, 1998:248).

Inasmuch as these dominant modes of understanding exist, they influence representations of the world, so that reality is mediated by representations that are
based on some form of discourse (Shapiro, 2001:320). Often, the challenging question posed to this constructionist theory of meaning is whether anything exists outside of discourse. For Foucault, although he accepted that there was a real, material world, his main point was that ‘nothing had any meaning outside of discourse (Foucault, 1972) quoted in (Hall, 1997). As Hall restates it, ‘the concept of discourse is not about whether things exist, but about where meaning comes from’. Thus, meaning does not reside in ‘things-in-themselves’ but only within the discourse which forms and produces them.

9.2 Varieties of discourse and discourse analysis
Foucauldian discourse takes the ontological position that there is no real distinction between cultural practices that comprise activities such as discourse and communication, and material practices such as work that involves body and physical objects. However, critical discourse analysts such as van Dijk (1988) and Hodge & Kress (1988) do not share this view as they prefer to keep the distinction between the two practices (Wetherell, 2001). Fundamentally, critical discourse analysis (CDA) takes a realist position that maintains that engagement in political change can be influential in addressing the ‘underlying real causes and patterns of social relations’ (Wetherell, 2001:394). This commitment to social change by CDA is challenged by Hammersley (1997:245) who disputes the basis on which such analysis can ‘claim to offer an understanding of discursive processes,...also of society as a whole, of what is wrong with it, and how it can and should be changed’. In other words, CDA suggests that there is a reality outside of discourse that is assumed in the idea of changing society towards some ideal.

Contrariwise, discourse theorists like Laclau and Mouffe see no distinction between discursive and non-discursive practices ‘on the grounds that a practice is structured along the lines of discourse’ (Eagleton 1991:219). In taking this more relativist position, Laclau and Mouffe argue like Foucault, that material objects only become meaningful based on ‘their constitution as objects of discourse’. The significance of these different positions on discourse is that it relates to the overall practice of discourse analysis, and the approach taken by analysts who work within the various traditions. Generally, CDA tends to focus on the connections between language,
power and privilege, with the aim to expose injustices and oppressive practices in society. More Foucauldian type discourse analyses tend to take a more catholic approach to discourse analysis that embraces ‘human meaning-making processes in general’ (Wetherell, 2001:390). Such studies tend to examine how ‘mega’ discourses shape social reality and constrain actors (Phillips & Hardy, 2002:21).

The variety of discourse approaches reflects the range of disciplines within the social sciences that engage and utilise discourse analytic approaches (Hammersley 1997; Kogan 1998; Phillips & Hardy 2002; Wetherell 2001; Wood & Kroger 2000). Apart from the more traditional disciplines that have popularised discourse analysis such as sociology, psychology, linguistics, media and cultural studies, discourse analysis is increasingly being applied to areas such as economics, politics, international relations as well as organisational behaviour and management. Such diversity however, has spawned a vast array of approaches and concerns within the field of discourse analysis (Hammersley 1997:237). For example, there are different considerations regarding the importance of social context in conducting discourse analysis. Although the social setting of discourse under review is a necessary prerequisite of analysis, researchers who are interested in conversation and the nature of talk, tend to emphasise the proximate context, that is, the immediate features of the interaction (Wetherell 2001:387). These would include aspects for data inclusion such as the occasion and the nature of the conversation.

According to Wetherell (2001:387), studies that are interested in modes of representation, that is, why an event is described in a particular way, may find the distal context, that is, factors such as the social class and the cultural settings of the discourse more relevant. However, Phillips & Hardy (2002:20) suggest that the decision taken by the discourse analyst as to relevant context, rests the on practicality and the theoretical orientation of the particular study being undertaken.

Nevertheless, the distinctions between the various discourse approaches do not necessarily mean that that there are fixed boundaries between them. However, it is unlikely that those within the critical discourse analysis tradition would be amenable to a more radical relativist position in their approach. As the diagram below shows, there are clear demarcations yet, areas of convergence between the varieties of
discourse analytic approaches. Still, Phillips & Hardy (2002:21) are keen to point out that the various theoretical and methodological emphases of the approaches to discourse analysis, should be seen more as a continuum, and that there are studies that may not follow the strict distinctions that are suggested by the diagram.

Figure 9.1  Different Approaches to Discourse Analysis (Phillips & Hardy 2002:20)

9.3 Applying discourse analysis to communication and media research

Not only do theories of discourse share an emphasis on discourse as practice, they also have a concern for the social processes of representation and communication (Wood & Kroger, 2000:22). According to Kogan (1998:230), ‘discourse analysis covers a range of methods for studying human communication processes’. The nature of discourse enquiries probes how meanings are produced and transmitted in human communication. The underlying conviction of discourse analysis, is that meanings are shared through the medium of language. It is the social functions of language, rather than their linguistic features on their own, that hold the key to understanding how meanings are produced and reproduced in everyday life. Discourse analysis therefore seeks to make clear and explicit how language functions in producing meaning within human communications. Herein lies the major advantage of
employing discourse analysis, it reorients the search for meaning and social reality from the traditional research domain of the cognitive 'black box', to the sphere of human interaction and communication where 'the social and the cognitive are essentially intertwined (Hajer, 1995:60).

9.4 The linguistic turn and the quest for meaning

The philosopher Ludwig Wittgenstein has been credited with pioneering the daring challenge to traditional notions of language as referential and representative of the world (Potter 2001:41). He argued that language derived meaning based on its use, and as such, played a definitive role in constructing social meanings and practices. It is this fundamental reorientation of language from being representative of some external reality to the alternative position as being constitutive of social reality that defines the concept of the linguistic turn in social research. An outcome of the linguistic turn has been an emphasis on the analysis of talk and text and how they are constructed as sites of meaning. On a basic level these ‘actual practices of talking and writing’ are defined as discourses (Phillips & Hardy, 2002:3). Accordingly, language and how it is arranged discursively to produce meaning in text and talk encompasses the research enquiry in discourse analysis.

The centrality of language in locating meaning is hardly indisputable, however there are diverse conceptualisations of how language works in human communication. Graddol (1994) argues that there are three contrasting models of language that dictate how human communicative behaviour are described and analysed. In other words, each language model implies a particular perspective on how meaning is communicated. According to Graddol, the first model emanates from structuralism that views language as a conduit that transfers ‘ideas from the mind of the speaker to the mind of the listener’ (9). Structuralism assumes that meaning can be encoded in the message of texts that are then decoded by receivers. The metaphor of the electrical circuitry used in the traditional Shannon Weaver model of communication explains this approach to language. Also implied in this perspective is the role of language in producing certain desired and predictable effects on receivers who decode the messages sent to them.
While structuralism views language as an autonomous system of meaning, the second model of language description asserts that language must be examined within the social context of its production. The sociolinguistic school advocates that language is not only about 'information processing', but it derives meaning from its link to human activity, culture and practices. Arguments in favour of this view were supported by the Whorf-Sapir hypothesis which declared that 'language does not exist apart from culture' (Graddol, 1994:12). It also claims that 'language categories which vary from culture to culture (also) structure our understandings of the world' (Edwards, 1997:22). Among the research findings conducted by Whorf and Sapir, is the noted example of Eskimos having several words to describe snow in the Inuit language. They argued that the existence of several words for snow in Inuit was related to the Eskimos' unique natural environment and their interaction with it.

The implications of this perspective in explaining communications is to locate meaning as an outcome of 'the interaction of language and social context' (16). In this regard, linguistic structures by themselves, do not determine meaning, but rather, it is the social context of their use that determines the meaning that is produced. This view proposes meaning as relative and contextual, so that language as communicated in texts not only encodes ideas, but also inscribes social relations and conventions. By implication, grammar, rhetorical strategies and the genres employed in texts reflect the social context of their production, and in turn, communicate particular views and perspectives on reality to receivers. It is within this social configuration of reality that language and by extension texts, are able to convey meaning.

The third example of language description proposed by Graddol is the postmodern model. Although it may seem likely, the postmodern model of language does not reject the notion of the structure of language in entirety, but instead argues for the relativity and the complexity of these structures. Therefore it is impossible to pin down 'true' meanings from language, as multiple versions may be legitimately obtained from the readings of texts. Generally, postmodernist communication theories emphasise the active participation of receivers in the construction of meaning (Barrett, 1998:269).
A compelling exposition of this approach is Stuart Hall’s seminal paper ‘Encoding and Decoding in Television Discourse’ (Hall, 1994). Here, Hall argues that the communication process is characterised by an inextricable link between the moments of production and consumption. Hall suggests that in the communication process there is an ongoing circulation of meaning that is constructed in the production stage, decoded in the consumption stage, and then is linked through feedback and social practices into the production stage where the process continues. Hall explains that from the moment of production, meaning is encoded in terms of how it is framed and constructed as discourse. He explains further that

The institutional-societal relations of production must pass under the discursive rules of language for its product to be ‘realised’. This initiates a further differentiated moment, in which the formal rules of discourse and language are in dominance. Before this message can have an ‘effect’ (however defined), satisfy a ‘need’ or be put to ‘use’, it must first be appropriated as a meaningful discourse and be meaningfully decoded. It is this set of decoded meanings which ‘have an effect’, influence, entertain, instruct or persuade, with very complex perceptual, cognitive and emotional, ideological or behavioural consequences. In a ‘determinate moment the structure employs a code and yields a ‘message: at another ‘determinate moment the ‘message’, via its decodings, issues into the structure of social practices. (202)

This encoding/decoding model proposed by Hall suggests that meanings are social productions that are not fixed, but negotiated and have implications for power relations within society. The Gramcian notion of hegemonic power is invoked by Hall to account for how dominant or preferred meanings are institutionalised and embedded in the everyday patterns of social life’. This means that preferred meanings or readings of messages are inscribed by the ‘institutional/political and ideological order that ‘legitimates, limits and sanctions’ (ibid 207). It is not that individual cognition is discounted or denied, but rather this view sees meaning as socially and jointly constructed (Graddol, 1994:18).

Hall’s encoding/decoding model which has been adopted in the analytic approach of this study, has become more widely known as the cultural circuit model as it also clarifies how cultural meanings and practices are produced and negotiated (Barrett, 1998:268). It is these discursive formations as captured in texts and other social practices that account for cultural and communicative meanings, and so are important sites for analysis. However, postmodern theories extend the search for meaning beyond words in language to include ‘signs’ ranging from music, pictures, clothing, cuisine and consumer durables (ibid 17). These are described as part of a repertoire of
‘signifying practices’ in that they communicate and produce meaning in similar ways to language. So that ‘whatever signifies or has meaning can be considered part of discourse’ encompassing both verbal and non verbal constructions of meanings (Macdonell, 1986:3).

9.5 From language to ‘messy texts’

The rationale for textual analysis rests on a conviction that meaning is encoded and embodied in texts (Deacon, Pickering, et al. 1999:139). However, texts are not only the repositories of language as they are also seen as the ‘material manifestation of discourses’ (Phillips & Hardy, 2002:4). Apart from their physical materiality, on the semiotic level, the organisation and structure of texts resonate with meaning. The analysis of their production, structure, design and consumption is related to wider features of the world and social reality ‘beyond the text’ (Boyd-Barrett, 1994:23). Texts therefore reflect the processes involved in meaning making. Readings or interpretation of texts are valuable for enquiries on how meanings are produced, received and appropriated in society.

Texts have been generically defined as ‘communicative artefacts (Graddol 1994:41), while media texts have been specifically defined as ‘a point of connection between the encoder and the decoder (Deacon, Pickering, et al. 1999:141). But as Deacon et al point out, this connection does not necessarily mean that both encoders and decoders are brought ‘into a position of symmetry’ based on the text. If that were true, then there would be no risk of miscommunication or misunderstanding. This implies that although texts are central to the production of meaning, there is no way that their analysis can guarantee that particular readings or interpretations are absolutely definitive of either the intentions of the encoder, or of the overall effect on the decoder. There are distinct limitations in applying textual analysis unilaterally in making these specific inferences concerning the senders or receivers of communication.

Media texts are polysemous, or ‘messy’, woven from a vast array of different discourse and semiotic threads (Graddol, 1994:46). This means that several readings, apart from the dominant and preferred readings may be obtained. But it the process
of identifying how these dominant readings are constructed, inscribed and legitimised in texts that exposes the effects of these discursive formations in social phenomena. The focus of enquiry in discourse analysis is not so much a matter of making inferences on the effects of the text on the receiver, or the intentions of the sender, but moreso, to determine how the text is organised and constructed to produce particular world views and conceptions of reality. As Phillips & Hardy (2002: 4) conclude

*Discourse analysis is thus interested in ascertaining the constructive effects of discourse through the structured and systematic study of texts;*

Essentially, discourse analysis seeks to uncover how texts are discursively organised and constructed to legitimise particular orientations and ‘common-sense’ views of the world. Accordingly, the analysis of textual strategies, themes, codes and structures of media texts establishes the means to make inferences on the constructive effects of language in social reality.

### 9.6 The structure of media texts

In his book *News As Discourse*, Teun van Dijk (1988:30) argues that the analysis of the structure of media texts exposes how ‘discourse structures influence and are influenced by the social situation’. He posits that ideological positions may be hidden within the syntactical, semantic and lexical features of a text. For example, van Dijk (1988: 177) writes that

*The traditional example of using ‘terrorists’ instead of ‘guerrillas’, or ‘freedom fighters’ is only one example...A large part of the hidden point of view, tacit opinions, or the usually denied ideologies of the press may be inferred from these lexical descriptions and identifications of social groups and their members.*

For van Dijk, the microstructure of the media text, that is, its overall linguistic and rhetorical features and the macrostructures, such as the overall theme shown in the headlines and lead paragraphs work ideologically in the content of the text. Particularly for news stories, these operate as schemata that link to the cognitive processing of the information contained within the text. By making this leap from text to the individual ‘black box’, van Dijk goes one step further to ‘suggest a correspondence between text structures and cognitive structures’ (Boyd-Barrett, 1994:30). For example, he contends that macrostructures such as headlines and lead
paragraphs have the best recall and therefore show that the news values of journalists have some effect on their readership. Similarly, Edwards (1997:16) makes the claim for a relationship between discourse and cognition that is manifested in the overall structure of texts by arguing that

*The point is that all sets of event descriptions are rhetorically organised, construct the nature of events, assemble description and narrative, and make attributional inferences available.*

Yet, it is difficult to avoid the shadow of textual determination that is implicit in making the link between discourse and cognition. Even though such analyses may show patterns that link texts to wider social practices, yet they still cannot claim to account for the intentions of the producers of the text or the effect of the text on the receivers. Wood & Kroger (2000:10) caution against using discourse as a ‘route to the inner workings of the mind’ and argue that the extent of discourse analysis is to show ‘the systematic links between texts, discourse practices and socio-cultural practices’. To make inferences on communicative effects, Deacon, Pickering, et al. (1999:182) suggest that there should also be some empirical and objective basis as provided by content analysis to show how ‘a number of detected associations in the text clearly reflect a given intention or an inevitable shaping of the readers’ views’. Discourse analysis working in conjunction with content analysis offer a more sound approach for making inferences on the production messages and their reception in textual research. Still, both these methods have to guard against the extremes of textualism that makes definitive claims on inevitable responses of receivers based only on the texts being examined.

### 9.7 Genres and rhetorical strategies

One of the main characteristics of texts is that their form conveys meaning along with their actual content. However, when features of texts become stylised, conventional and fixed, so that particular meanings are assumed by their use, they are defined as genres. A genre can be described as a specific textual form that specifies the formal composition of the text, the appropriate subject matter, and the mode of address (Jensen & Jankowski 1991:37). The significance of genre in discourse analysis is that it exposes the storytelling techniques and strategies that have been utilised to construct a particular worldview and to elicit certain responses. Graddol (1994:46)
notes that 'a genre is taken to be socially constituted, representing particular institutional interests and ideological functions'. In terms of how they work in communication, Jensen & Jankowski (1991:37) state that genres, in particular their mode of address (to readers), 'motivate and structure the transfer, uses and impact of communication in contexts of social action'. A common approach within discourse analysis is to examine and interrogate the ideological assumptions and world-view implicit in the genre. There is also a concern for content and how certain themes are treated in the analysis of textual genres (Graddol, 1994:46).

Often, writers employ rhetorical strategies in the construction of their argument and in the telling of their stories. Rhetoric refers to those features of discourse that make 'communication more persuasive' (van Dijk, 1988:28). In discourse analysis, the identification of the rhetorical strategies employed in texts points to the way certain positions are constructed to 'counter or undermine actual or possible alternatives (Wood & Kroger 2000:199). These usually work by setting up contrasts and dichotomies in texts that often link to universal concepts, examples of which are good versus evil, public versus private, or right versus might. Therefore, rhetorical strategies are discursive resources, that when analysed, can reveal the ways in which readers may be encouraged and persuaded to adopt certain views or to follow certain actions.

According to Tonkiss (1998:250), discourses are able to 'modify, constrain and elicit outcomes' in their effect, and in this regard, their rhetorical organisation implies 'larger principles of social order and regulation'. Some discourse analysts instead of focusing on rhetorical strategies, pay special attention to interpretative repertoires, that is, the use of metaphors, grammatical constructions and figures of speech in the construction of social accounts of phenomena (Billig, 2001; Phillips & Hardy, 2002; Tonkiss, 1998, Wetherell, Taylor, et al., 2001). In this study there was an emphasis on the examination of the rhetorical strategies and genres in the discourse rather than on interpretative repertoires, although metaphors and figures of speech were also examined as part of the analysis of the rhetorical styles of texts.
9.8 How to ‘do’ discourse analysis?

After combing through the varied strands of discourse theories, the researcher is faced with the task of actually doing the analysis. This stage is no less daunting than identifying the particular theoretical orientation that best supports the research question. As discourse is both theory and method, there is always the need for the researcher to maintain the connection between the analysis of the data, and the epistemological framework of the methodology.

The research literature seems to concede that doing discourse analysis is a tenuous process. Gill (1996:143) candidly states that in explaining how discourse is done, there is a risk of completely mystifying the process. She admits that in providing a recipe for doing discourse analysis, the method always seems to slip away and appears to be ‘ever elusive’ as analytical and coding schemes never seem to quite capture the phenomenon under review. Tonkiss (1998:250) is equally forthright on the slippery contours of the method, when she writes that ‘discourse analysis is a messy method’. She suggests that the reason for this is because the method is largely ‘data-driven’, and so it is difficult to formalise a standard approach. Essentially, there are no strict rules of the method or prescribed stages and steps that are requirements, other than an allegiance to a ‘strong constructivist view of the social world (Phillips & Hardy, 2002:5). Perhaps the most enlightening advice on conducting discourse analysis comes from Potter (1996: 28) who states that

However,... learning to do analysis... is very much a craft skill like bike riding... There is no substitute for learning by doing... Such learning is time consuming, hard work and often frustrating. However, the goal is to develop an analytic mentality that is sensitive to the action orientation of talk and texts.

It is clear that the ‘how’ of discourse analysis unfolds with the process of actually ‘doing’ it. This point may be relevant for other methods as well, but for discourse analysis in particular, this researcher has found that learning comes with ‘doing’. Although this researcher benefited in gaining the requisite competencies from attending an intensive two-week methodology course on discourse analysis, at the University of Essex, it was in the process of actually doing the analysis for this research that understanding of, and practical proficiency in applying the methodology were deepened and broadened.
9.9 What makes discourse analysis different from other qualitative methods?

Since discourse analysis is a qualitative method, it is basically inductive; so that it 'involves moving from the concrete to the abstract, from the particular to the general' (Wood & Kroger, 2000:34). This similarity has often led to the blurring of boundaries between other qualitative methods and discourse analysis (Phillips & Hardy 2002:9). Discourse analysis borrows or utilises several interpretative techniques, linguistic and textual analytic approaches that may be applicable to the research. According to Gunter (2000:88), the procedure in most discourse analysis consists of a layered combination of several techniques. He notes that usually, the process combines specific linguistic analysis such as a search for word choice, textual patterns and rhetorical strategies that are followed by thematic analyses.

In answering the question of what makes discourse analysis different from other qualitative methods, Phillips & Hardy (2002:10) respond that

*What makes a research technique discursive is not the method itself but the use of that method to carry out an interpretive analysis of some form of text with a view of providing an understanding of discourse and its role in constituting reality. To the extent that they are used within a discourse analytic ontology and epistemology, many qualitative techniques can become discourse methods.*

It is therefore expected for discourse analysts to employ qualitative techniques such as interviewing, transcribing, coding and sorting in the process of analysis and as required by the nature of the research (Tonkiss 1998:254). The previous quote underscores the primacy of engaging the constructivist orientation in discourse analysis, but it is also a fact that there are also other methods such as symbolic interactionism that also share this common epistemological conviction. So what distinguishes discourse analysis from these approaches? According to Wood & Kroger (2000:28-30), one of the more salient differences between discourse analysis and other such qualitative methods, is in the formulation of categories in the process of analysis. While most qualitative methods focus on establishing a set of 'interrelated and hierarchical categories that reflect the content of the data', with discourse analysis, the focus is instead on accounting for how these categories are constructed within the discourse.
This difference in analytical strategy in categorisation rests on the grounds that
discourse analysis probes more deeply into the socially constituted nature of
categories that may be assumed and taken for granted in the discourse. Whereas other
qualitative methods approach discourse to see what they may reveal about people’s
cognition, scripts and social structures, discourse analysis takes another perspective
that examines how the discourse itself produces these categorisations. Wood &
Kroger (2000:29) explain that while ‘conventional qualitative analysis reduces data by
grouping them into categories’, discourse analysis takes another route by ‘expanding
the data by breaking it down and examining relationships among the components in
order to identify functions’. Significantly, unlike other qualitative approaches,
discourse analysis does not claim to present the only true interpretation of discourse,
but recognises that the analysis produced is also another version, another discourse.

9.10 Doing discourse analysis

It is clear that although discourse analysis shares similar techniques, procedures and
principles with other qualitative methods, its theoretical emphases and specific
analytical strategies make it a distinctive method for the examination of social
phenomena. Nonetheless, having identified the unique features of discourse analysis
as a qualitative method, there is still the task of delineating the parameters and scope
of a discourse analytic enquiry. Some discourse analysts set wide-ranging parameters
for their research. For example, Guy Cook (1992:1) in his book Discourse of
Advertising, notes that his approach to discourse analysis involves a broad approach
that looks at the ‘context of communication, who is communicating with whom and
why; in what kind of society and situation; through what medium and how different
types and acts of communication evolved, and their relationships to each other’. He
justifies this breadth of approach on the basis that the study of discourse must be
undertaken holistically, that means taking its context into account.

Such an approach is by no means prescriptive for all discourse studies. For the most
part, it is mostly suited for Cook’s research purposes and focus. In any event, such
wide parameters are not within the remit of this research that is engaged in
determining how images of the Caribbean holiday experience are constructed in the
British press. What is advocated in the literature is that the researcher has the choice
depending on the research imperatives, to set the scope of the enquiry in terms of the
extent of the context to be reviewed and the level of analysis required (Gill, 1996; Phillips & Hardy, 2002; Tonkiss, 1998; Wood & Kroger, 2000).

In conducting discourse analysis, Wood & Kroger (2000:25) invoke the image of the qualitative researcher as *bricoleur*, that is, someone who presents 'a pieced-together, close-knit set of practices that provide solutions to a problem in a concrete situation'. Consequently they recommend that discourse analysts employ a strategy in research that draws on resources, that is, ‘notions, techniques, devices and strategies from different perspectives that are appropriate for the specific project’. It is not just eclecticism for its own sake, but a combining of methods from various perspectives as a strategic approach to achieving the research goals. Bricolage in research thus becomes a means of refining and developing the field of discourse analysis. It is therefore inappropriate to expect a standardised set of techniques or methods that is distinctively dedicated to discourse analysis. It is also incorrect to expect different researchers to come up with the same version as implied in the positivist principle of reliability. Wood and Kroger (26) explain further that

*Within discourse analysis there are multiple possibilities with respect to data collection, and, especially, analytical resources and their use. And we stress that no analysis will use every possibility. Not all will be appropriate in each case. And there area always many different ways to look at a piece of text, at multiple versions of analysis.*

What is germane in the evaluation of the research process in discourse analysis, is the extent to which the techniques used, the strategies employed, and the outcomes presented, are justifiable and plausible.

Yet, even though there are no absolute guidelines or statement of procedures for conducting discourse analysis, Tonkiss (1998:250) notes that there are key themes and useful techniques that may be adapted throughout the various stages of the research process. She identifies the three stages of the research process as firstly, selecting and approaching data, then sorting, coding and analysing data; and finally presenting the analysis. These stages are common to most research enquiries but there are specific concerns, perspectives and strategies that are particularly relevant for discourse analysts. However, these stages outlined by Tonkiss are useful in making transparent the strategic thinking, methods and techniques that were applied in this research. The
themes and considerations of each stage recommended by Tonkiss are therefore discussed with reference to the specific steps that were taken in this research.

9.11 Selecting and collecting data

According to Tonkiss the main consideration in selecting and collecting data in discourse analysis is to identify material that provides insights into the issue under review. It is the richness of the data content in terms of providing fruitful themes for analysis that is paramount rather than the number of texts. Therefore it is important for the texts selected to be adequate in textual detail, as well as range, in terms of the topic being analysed. Tonkiss also advises that it is not necessary to be unduly preoccupied with selecting a sufficiently representative sample as this is not crucial to discourse analysis. This is because discourse analysis is not so much focused on the representativeness of the views or ideas expressed in data, but rather, on an emphasis in discovering how these views are 'shaped, reproduced and legitimated' in the discourse.

In this study, the data set that was selected is based on the requirements of the content analysis that is also being used in this research. For the most part, discourse analysis tends to deal with small data sets that are unlikely to be widely representative (Gill, 1996; Tonkiss, 1998:259). Admittedly, the sampling requirements required for the content analysis in the study is much larger than what is needed in discourse analysis. Purposive sampling has therefore been used to conduct the discourse analysis. The samples for discourse analysis have been selected to clearly demonstrate the how meaning has been constructed in the texts. It is generally recommended by qualitative researchers that instead of being concerned with sample size, there is only the need to 'apply theoretically informed, purposeful sampling strategies' that ensures that theoretically relevant cases may be empirically demonstrated' (Kelle 1995:27). This was the approach taken in this study where the articles were purposively sampled to include those texts that presented clear examples of the image constructs. However, in order to pick out relevant instances, there was still a need to review the entire data set.
9.12 Sorting, coding and analysing data

After collecting the data the real task of analysis begins with iterative readings of the texts in the data set. Tonkiss instructs that the process of analysis begins in an inclusive way by the selection of a number of themes and sections of data that relate to the research question. Coding and categorisation of data are to be guided by the theory relevant to the study. Usually theory is paramount in discourse analysis. This means that the methods chosen and their application throughout the research process should be compatible with a discourse analytic theoretical orientation. This is true as well for the management and analysis of the data. Jones & Viechnicki (1997:71) maintain that ‘data are never able to speak for themselves’ and so the theoretical assumptions of the research provide the definitive link to the phenomenon being examined.

While as Tonkiss (1998:250) asserts, the discourse analytic process is data driven so that it is ‘theory free’. Universally, theory is implicated in the various routine decisions and in the interactions in the data that may not be overt but underlie the overall course of the research. Perhaps, metaphorically, theory can be seen as the cement that links the method, data and text and context of the research in a unifying and logical framework. According to Tonkiss, in this stage the process is comparable to qualitative analysis with the researcher engaged in sifting, comparing and contrasting the different ways in which themes emerge in the data. The approach of discourse analysis is then to uncover how these themes are organised, what associations are being established, and the ways particular meanings are being mobilised by the organisation of the text (Tonkiss 1998:255).

The data in this study have been examined with the aim to determine how images of the Caribbean are constructed in the UK media. The data was interrogated in terms of representations/constructs of landscapes, people and holiday activities based on concepts emanating from the literature on destination image. These three categories or tourism destination image schema were also utilised in the content analysis with the aim of identifying the pattern of the image constructs presented in the data. The rationale of dovetailing the analytic categories of the two methods is for the purpose
of maintaining consistency of analysis between the two methods as well as to obtain deeper insights on these three types of image constructs.

In keeping with van Dijk’s (1988:30) arguments that ideological positions are embedded in media texts, there was an examination of the ways in which these constructions were organised around relevant themes and meta-narratives. Ideological issues such as postcolonialism, as well as the typologies of tourist experiences as presented by Erik Cohen (1979), provided the thematic context and theoretical framework for the examination of the data. However, the procedure was not to impose these categories on the data, but to identify how these constructs were organised in terms of these ideological positions. Differences, variations and contradictions within each text and across various texts were detailed. Hall’s (1997:258) notion of the rhetorical strategy of binary oppositions in discourse was also a technique that was utilised to code where these oppositions were appropriated in the texts. Points of emphases and silences were also coded in order look at how arguments were presented to privilege particular perspectives, or to denigrate others, and to place the discourses and constructs in a ‘wider interpretative context’.

9.13 Presenting the data

The linking of text, context and discourse are pivotal moments within discourse analysis that according to Phillips & Hardy (2002:10) ‘incorporates a highly subjective and reflexive use of research methods’. Despite this, there is also a concern that there is an empirical basis for the presentation of findings. According to Altheide (2000:290), interpretative research remains empirical, ‘meaning that instances of certain meanings and emphases can be identified and held up for demonstration’. He suggests that discourse may be tracked or followed over a period of time and across different issues and different news media. Although the entire process of ‘tracking discourse’ as presented by Altheide, was not relevant in this research, there were aspects of this method that were applicable for the management and analysis of the data. Specifically, the notion of tracking the shifts, evolution and movement of discourses over a time period was not relevant as this is not a longitudinal study. However, the notion of tracking discourse across the various newspapers was particularly relevant.
9.14 Validity and Reliability

Another advantage of tracking discourse is that it provides the means to relate the text closely to the interpretations of the analyst. In this regard, a case can be made for the internal validity of the research in that evidence is presented so that the arguments coherently support the data. Discourse analysis places an emphasis on the internal validity of the research ensuring that there is a plausible movement from the data to the analysis (Tonkiss, 1998:259). Nonetheless, there is a limit to which the conventional notions of validity can be applied to discourse analytic research. As already discussed in the previous chapter on Quantitative and Qualitative research, validity in terms of a perceived correspondence to reality as the main criterion in evaluating the soundness of research is not accepted by discourse analysis. This is because the epistemological claims of discourse analysis are that the social world does not exist independently of people's constructions of it (Wood & Kroger, 2000:167). For discourse analysts the concept of validity rests on criteria that are 'sound, well grounded on principles or evidence, that can be supported and which are acceptable and convincing' (ibid, 167). Discourse analysts, like some other qualitative researchers, usually refer to validity in terms of the criteria of trustworthiness, soundness, plausibility and coherence (Altheide & Johnson, 1998; Guba & Lincoln, 1998; Hammersley, 1996; Tonkiss, 1998). Warranting, that is, providing justification and grounds for claims in research, is focused in discourse analysis on making the research process transparent. Accordingly, more importance is placed on reader evaluation in comparison with other methods. Potter (1996) notes that this transparency encourages warranting of the research, as it rests on shared knowledge, so that readers have the opportunity to make judgements on the research for themselves.

Like validity, conventional notions of reliability are reoriented in discourse analysis. Reliability assumes that the stability of findings reflect some fixed state in the 'real' world and as such supports validity. However, reliability in the traditional sense of producing the same versions with repeated tests is not particularly applicable to discourse analysis where several versions are possible. Wood & Kroger (2000:165) provide a convincing explanation of the role reliability plays in discourse analysis in comparison with its traditional application in research.
...it is not that discourse analysis avoid repetition. On the contrary, discourse analysis involves repeated readings of the text, the redoing of analyses both in the analysis and write-up stages, repeated questioning of the analysts own stance, and so on. It just means that we do not make repetition a criterion of warrantability. Rather, repetition is part of the careful attention to detail and the concern for refinement that are major features of discourse-analytic work.

Along with scholarly judgement within the rules and conventions of the methodological tradition, there is also a need for openness in the evaluation of discursive research. Without some acceptance of the claims of the methodology then there will be deadlock, but rapprochement is possible if there is an academic engagement with the claims of discourse analysis.

In the development of this chapter, there has been an attempt to make transparent the strategic thinking and decisions that have been made for this research. By this, there is an effort to lay the foundation for the plausibility and the justification of the findings of the discourse analysis that are discussed in the subsequent chapter. In that discussion, the aim is to demonstrate through the use of excerpts and instances from the data, arguments supporting the interpretations and inferences made in the research.

9.15 Reflexivity

By its very nature in questioning the assumptions of accounts of the social world, discourse analysis requires reflexivity on the part of the researcher. The concept of researcher reflexivity is usually advocated in the literature on qualitative research, particularly for researchers conducting ethnographic studies who need to reckon how their presence in the field may have affected the research process (Guba & Lincoln, 1998; Hammersley, 1992; Patton, 1990; Silverman, 1993; Wood & Kroger, 2000). The argument is that in maintaining a reflexive awareness of the how the data was selected, there is an acknowledgement of how the theoretical framework and the entire research process may have influenced the outcomes and findings of the research. In essence, there is an appreciation that the act of research is also a construction. Moreover, there is also the recognition that the knowledge produced is consequent to the researcher's own activities.
The theoretical and ideological framework of this study is particularly relevant for reflexive contemplation by this researcher. As a Caribbean national, who had worked for several years with the marketing of a destination in the region, this researcher was keenly interested in examining issues relating to the nature of communicative collateral as tools of destination image formation. This interest was also occasioned by this researcher’s observations of, and also involvement in, numerous debates centring on the contesting views between local industry marketers and overseas marketing and advertising representatives, on how the image of the destination should be represented in the tourist generating markets.

Perhaps it is this effort to account for these contradictions on image that has contributed to the orientation of this study towards exploring the ideological discourses of postcolonial theory, subaltern studies and Orientalism, that all question how the third-world subjects (landscape) are represented within Western discourse (Nelson & Grossberg, 1988; Spivak, 2002). The approach to discourse analysis has therefore been to locate meaning based on a postcolonial critique of the image of Caribbean destinations conveyed in the press.

9.16 Benefits and limitations of using computer-aided qualitative software

The management of data in the process of analysis is one of the more challenging features of qualitative analysis. Discourse analysis in particular requires the analyst to get quite ‘intimate’ with the data. Gill (1996:144) describes this stage as ‘immersion’ that suggests iterative readings until there is a deep familiarity with the data that stays in the thoughts and mind of the researcher even when other activities are being done. When the data set is relatively small, immersion may be possible, but when the data numbers exceed one hundred as in the case of this study, submersion and inundation are more apt descriptions of this researcher’s attempts of detailed, close analysis of the data. Not only is the sheer volume of the data for analysis a daunting and frustrating task, but questions also arise as to the extent of the thoroughness of the review of large data sets that are conducted manually. Of course, the manual approach to data management is not redundant by any means, and researchers have always found ingenious ways to get the task done. Gill (145) cites her experience of coding in discourse analysis noting that the end of the process
means that I have come to the stage where my household is subjected to colonisation by a plethora of small piles of paper, each representing the data in one particular category of interest.

Computer-aided qualitative data analysis or CAQDAS programmes are essentially designed to reduce the tedium, not the mention the complexity of keeping track of the small piles of paper, files, colour highlights, cutting and pasting involved particularly in the manual coding of large data sets. Essentially, CAQDAS programmes use textual database management systems for the automatization of manual coding, indexing and sorting operations' in qualitative analysis (Kelle 1995:1). These software programmes therefore may be lifesavers for researchers who run the risk of being deluged by voluminous data, but more notably as Gibbs, Friese, et al. 2002 (para 24) point out, they also contribute positively in making the analysis more exhaustive. This is achieved inasmuch as they assist in facilitating the check for negative cases, and to a degree, ensure that the data has been coded in a consistent and systematic way. Consequently, apart from reducing tedium, it is the benefits of being systematic and exhaustive in the management of large data sets that make the use of CAQDAS a worthwhile and viable option in qualitative research. Kelle (1995:22) claims that the use of larger sample sizes by qualitative researchers may have even more strategic consequences.

Managing complex textual data with computers offers the potential for increasing sample sizes, an idea which sounds attractive to many researchers on both methodological and policy grounds. Increasing sample sizes may be seen not only as a means of countering colleagues' criticisms, but also of convincing policy-makers (who are frequently also the funders of research) that the findings produced validly represent the views of the population under study. From this perspective, the computer is sometimes seen as a tangible aid for the defence of research findings.

In spite of the general agreement in the research literature that there are some advantages for data management in the use of CAQDAS programmes, there is also some caution and reservation in their use and application in research. Among the most cited warning is that of 'Frankenstein's monster' fears of the coding process taking over the research to the extent that coding becomes the object of the exercise rather than the means to aid analysis (Fielding & Lee, 1991; Gibbs, 2002; Kelle, 1995). The preoccupation with coding may lead to alienation from the data so that there is a focus on identifying patterns and co-occurrences that emerge, so that results are merely 'pattern analysis based on some simple code and retrieve' activities' (Gibbs, Friese, et al. 2002, para 25).
But as Kelle (1995) and Fielding & Lee (1991) maintain, these demonstrate problems with the researchers' approach to coding rather than with the software themselves'. According to Kelle (1995:11), there are two main approaches that coders may take to coding, either to view codes as signposts to certain text passages, or to code passages as denoting facts. In other words, codes in qualitative research should represent the 'perspectives of the researcher rather than clear-cult empirical contentful categories as is the case in content analysis' (Kelle, 2002).

Kelle explains further that qualitative coding marks signposts at certain text passages that are stored to enable the researcher to locate all the passages in the text that are relevant to a specific topic. This provides the grist for the analysis and does not constitute the analysis in terms of a demonstration of related occurrences and patterns. It is always necessary for the researcher to understand this inductive approach to coding that is required for interpretative and hermeneutic analytic styles of textual analysis. It is the fact that coder preference mostly influences the nature of the coding outcomes that gives Kelle the basis to refute accusations that most CAQDAS programmes are inherently biased towards the deductive approach of Grounded Theory, rather than most qualitative methods. Furthermore, he maintains that the essential 'code and retrieve' facilities of software programmes represents an 'open technology' that is applicable in 'various theoretical and methodological contexts' (Kelle 2002).

The most salient and credible criticisms of CAQDAS use refer to claims of their ability to make research more transparent and rigorous. Often, in their marketing claims, software companies appear to exaggerate benefits of increased validity and rigour by the use of their programmes. However, there is considerable scepticism on the use of software for the more analytic stages of research beyond the efficient handling of large amounts of texts, codes, memos and notes.

Gibbs, Friese, et al. (2002, para 12) report that there is a distinction between the mechanical and more conceptual aspects of analysis. They explain that the mechanical aspects of analysis refer to activities such as coding selected texts, searching the texts for key terms and generating reports. On the other hand, the
conceptual aspects include 'the reading of text, interpreting it, creating coding schemes and identifying fruitful searches and reports (para 13). All these activities need to be done by humans and cannot be done by machines. However, there are software programmes often referred to as 'third generation' versions that appear to go beyond the mechanical aspect by providing facilities that help the analysts to build theories and test hypotheses. Detractors of these theory building capabilities such as Kelle (2002:6.3), discount these conceptual claims of theory building by arguing that such programmes merely offer new and expanded versions of simple code and retrieve programmes that do not provide a 'totally different logic of textual data management'.

Kelle ironically points out that the possibility of third generation software conducting theory building, is as likely as the chances of index cards doing the same (ibid, 6.3). More alarmingly, claims of conceptual, theory building functions for computer software present the danger of 'methodological confusion and distortion' based on an approach that involves 'hierarchical relationships' contrary to interpretative and hermeneutic enquiries (Kelle, 2002:1.5; Wood & Kroger, 2000:142). Particularly for discourse analysts, such theory building assumptions can lead the researcher astray from the central focus of examining the meanings constructed in the textual organisation of the data, to an obsession with coding patterns and links.

9.17 Using NVivo for Discourse Analysis
Wood & Kroger (2000:142) discourage the use of computer assisted software programmes in discourse analysis. Their main contention is that there is a deductive bias inherent in these programmes that are based on a 'digital and quantitative' view of the world. The main danger then is the inability of these programmes to 'deal adequately with context' (141). But as pointed out before by Kelle, code and retrieve programmes are open technology that allow for their creative use in various contexts of hermeneutic work. As long as the coder maintains an inclusive perspective in coding, and sees the process as 'signposting' as Kelle suggests, it remains useful for data management. Nonetheless, Wood & Kroger (2000:141) concede that these programmes may be used by discourse analysts in instances when 'the sheer
management and organisation of material that involves large and heterogeneous data sets'.

In their recent publication Phillips & Hardy (2002) record the successful use of computer assisted software in their research. Similarly, in a earlier review, Cohen, Manion, et al. (2000) note that computers may be used to assist data management in discourse analysis. Gibbs (2002) applies NVivo to narrative analysis which may be considered to be a 'sister' method to discourse analysis in that they share the epistemological position on the social construction of reality. Generally, there is support in the literature for the use of computer assisted software in discourse analysis for practical data management purposes.

As discussed earlier in this chapter, the large data set for this study led to the decision to use a CAQDAS programme. There are many programmes now available within this suite of software that could assist in this endeavour. In order to make an informed decision as to the best package, this researcher attended workshop training programmes for winMAX 99 and the Nvivo for qualitative software presented by the CAQDAS training project at the University of Surrey. These two programmes, as well as other such as ATLAS.ti, and the more popularly used NUD*IST programmes, represent open technology, that is, they have code and retrieve features that are suitable for the coding required for this study. Commonly used software such as Microsoft WORD also have basic sorting and retrieving facilities that could assist in the management of data and in the mechanical coding required. The decision to choose the NVivo software package was therefore primarily a matter of the personal choice of this researcher. During the training sessions, this researcher found the layout and the design appealing and so there was a natural preference for it. NVivo has many features for coding, such as nodes, memos and annotations. In the early stages of discourse analysis this researcher found that in reading the data there were many leads, permutations of meanings and insights that could be coded. NVivo provided the facilities to record these insights, to keep track of them, while still allowing for links back to the context of the codes. Other practical features of NVivo are the colour features to highlight specific texts as the user wishes. The coding points or 'signposts' can also be coded as excerpts in the body of the final study.
The approach to the coding of the texts taken by this researcher was to read the texts first before the setting up of any nodes. Nodes in the coding process represent categories and, unlike content analysis, where categories are established before the coding begins, in discourse analysis categories emerge from the analysis rather than being imposed on the data a priori. In coding, the aim was to look for ways the language and the rhetorical strategies have been marshalled in the discourse of the texts. These were the points that nodes were set up in the texts. This coding strategy is advised by Gibbs (2002:62) for discourse analysts in order to ensure that there is a focus on the phenomena that is under examination in the texts.

Another useful feature of NVivo is the search facility that allows the researcher to retrieve particular nodes together with a single command. With normal word processors, search functions are limited to making changes one at a time. However, NVivo’s powerful search engine brings up a list of alternatives and provides the flexibility for the analyst to thoroughly explore a range of related finds and to also code these as well if necessary.

Besides the practical benefits of the efficient management of the data, this researcher also considered that becoming acquainted with, and learning the application of new computer-assisted software was a useful, long-term skill. These skills were deemed to be valuable beyond this study for future research activities, and, as most of the software shares generic features to facilitate easy adaptation between various programmes. For some researchers however, the usefulness of computer assistance is the ‘gloss’ or prestige that the employment of such software may provide as some insurance of rigor and objectivity to convince funding boards on the validity of constructivist oriented research (Kelle, 2002; Gibbs, 2002). Although this is an ill-advised basis for the use of software, it does not constitute grounds to discount their overall value in research activities. Indeed, these computer-aided software do not provide more rigour, transparency or scholarship in research, and their application in research are primarily mechanical not conceptual.

Nevertheless, computer-aided software programmes are now part of the academic landscape, and it is unlikely that they are going away, and so, it is preferable to have an awareness of their capabilities, at least from an informed position as a user. There
is merit in knowing when to best apply them or not. Contributions to the debate on their usefulness and limitations are more valuable from insiders who are able to test and challenge the various claims. It is therefore judicious for academic institutions to maintain an engagement with the software, at least with modest investment of time and resources, as this field of new technology expands and develops at a frenetic pace. The cautionary note offered by Marshall McLuhan is worthwhile repeating in maintaining balance on this issue. He wrote that

*Every technology contrived and outered by man has the power to numb human awareness during the period of interiorization.* Marshall McLuhan

The bottom line is that the use of technology should not suspend human analytic capacity. The seductions of computer power, therefore, should not replace, but rather, empower the analyst in the research process.

### 9.18 Limitations of Discourse Analysis

All text-based methodologies are haunted by the spectre of textual determinism. In other words, there is the danger of over inferring the implications of the findings in terms of either source or receiver characteristics or as a means of predicting behaviour. Discourse analysis appears to be even less restricted than content analysis in making inferences on the processes of human communication. Content analysis employs a realist ontology that views categories in texts as representing some reality 'out there' and so inferences can be made in terms of empirical and theoretical corroboration. By contrast, the constructivist and relativist ontology of discourse analysis discounts texts as referring to some reality but rather, sees meaning as a social process whereby the reader produces meanings in the act of reading.

Texts lend themselves to dominant readings that, when examined, can shed light on how meanings are constituted, accounted for and also inferred in society. Consequently, discourse analysis can work in tandem with content analysis in making inferences to source or receiver. In that respect content analysis provides the objective

---

1 Taken from *The Gutenberg Galaxy* (1962:153) Great Britain: Routledge & Kegan Paul Ltd.
and empirical rigour, while discourse analysis gives the interpretative and meaning dimension of the communication.

Epistemologically, discourse analysis faces the usual criticisms levied at constructionist approaches. Questions of objectivity, systematicity and bias of the researcher remain issues for those who adhere to the orthodoxy of positivism. Apart from these limitations often stated by detractors, the wide variety of discourse approaches tend to complicate, and at times obfuscate issues creating an impression of instability in the field (Phillips & Hardy, 2002:11). While for some, this diversity is viewed as an indication of the richness of the methodology, on the other hand, this complexity and ambiguity may undermine clarity in the field.

Another epistemological issue is that the emphasis on the examination of language in the construction of social reality tends to shift attention from ‘what is being analysed towards the analysis itself, and as such, runs the risk of losing the independence of the phenomena’ (Cohen, Manion, et al. 2000:300). The concern of Parker & Burman (1993) is that ‘discourse analysis risks reifying discourse’. However, it may be argued as well, that inasmuch as positivist approaches run the risk of reifying the ‘real’, discourse analysis challenges the traditional notion of a ‘true and real’ representation of reality. Nevertheless, there is a slipperiness in the relativist stance of discourse analysis that seems to disregard the implicit realism in the analytic process of linking text, context and discourse.

Beyond the epistemological limitations that arise with discourse analysis, there are questions that come with the practice of the method. Parker & Burman (1993) outline the many occupational hazards of these method, that include among others, that it is time consuming, messy, elusive and complex. Furthermore, the ‘three-dimensionality’ of the method as described by Phillips & Hardy (2002) which requires the analyst to make links between text, discourse and context is not only challenging, but there is also high risk of missing these connections and ending up with two-dimensional analysis that only links ‘text and context’.

Apart from the epistemological limitations and the challenges of actually doing the method, there are also institutional limitations to discourse analysis. Authors such as
Parker & Burman, 1993; Phillips & Hardy 2002; Tonkiss, 1998; Wood & Kroger, 2000 all report that there are constraints to the wide acceptance of the method in academic circles. In 2002, the year of the publication of Phillips and Hardy's book on the discourse analysis, the method was still considered a 'new', even though it emerged as a distinct method around the early 1980s according to Wetherell (2001). The lack of familiarity with the method in academic circles means that difficulties may be encountered in reviews of the research for journals and promotion prospects (Phillips & Hardy, 2002:11).

Even more perilous are incorrect assumptions of the method. This researcher was confronted by a colleague who insisted that scholarly informants had advised him that discourse analysis is linguistics and so practitioners must be linguists. What perturbed this researcher was not so much the erroneous conception concerning the method, but more, the dogmatic position and unwillingness to explore the various terrain and variety of the field. Such attitudes portend the fallacious position of 'one best way' of thinking which is a distinct possibility for those who may be acquainted with one particular variant of discourse analysis, and may be tempted to use this as the benchmark for evaluating all other kinds of discourse analytic approaches.

van Dijk (1998) who is a linguist, makes the case for discourse analysis as interdisciplinary, drawing on many theories and research traditions, and his own journal Discourse & Society, reflects this wide remit of the field. Furthermore, Wetherell, Taylor, et al. (2001), as well as Phillips & Hardy (2002) argue that there is an increasing openness to discourse analysis as a viable, novel approach in the social sciences to examine issues of meaning and representation. However, in the face of institutional constraints, and demands for justification of findings, discourse analysts are often encouraged to present considerable empirical evidence from the data for reviewers to consult if required. This may account for the numerous excerpts of texts in the presentation of findings as well as copious examples in research reports and theses of discourse analytic studies.
CONCLUSION

This chapter has presented the case for the application of discourse analysis as a methodology suited for the examination of the construction of social meanings through discourse. It highlighted the role of language and texts in the constitution of social phenomena, and pointed to the specific concerns of discourse analysis in attempting to clarify how and why social meanings are constructed. It is this emphasis on identifying the production of meaning in media texts that has rendered discourse analysis a suitable methodology for the specific aims of this study, to examine the image constructs, and representations of the Caribbean in the UK press. However the limitations of the method in practice, namely, its elusiveness, and lack of standardised instructions on how to ‘do’ it were noted as primary challenges in conducting discourse analysis. Other constraints such as the wide range of discourse theories and practices, and the lack of familiarity and wide institutional acceptance of the method were shown as hindering the stability and development of the field. In this chapter, an extensive evaluation of the merits of computer-aided qualitative software, particularly the NVivo programme, revealed that they were mainly beneficial in providing support for the mechanical aspects data management rather than as a tool facilitating conceptual analysis and interpretation. As discourse analysis is still considered to be a ‘new’ method, it has been suggested that misconceptions and doctrinaire attitudes towards the method need to be addressed for the ongoing development of the field. Nonetheless, it was noted that increasingly the method is gaining popularity among researchers as a novel approach for the exploration of issues of representation, legitimisation and meaning in social life. This discussion has established the theoretical foundations of discourse analysis and serves to clarify the research process involved in generating the findings and outcomes of this study that are presented in the following chapter.
CHAPTER 10

FINDINGS & ANALYSIS – DISCOURSE ANALYSIS

‘Watch the landscape of this island’, he began with the self-assured conviction that my mother couldn’t stand in him. ‘And you know that they coulda never hold people here surrendered to unfreedom’. The sky, the sea, every green leaf and tangle of vines sing freedom. Birds frisk and flitter and whistle and sing. Just so a yard cock will draw up his chest and crow. Things here have their own mind. The rain decide when it going to fall. Sometimes in the middle of the day, the sky clear, you hear a rushing swooping sound and voops it fall down. Other times it set up whole day and then you sure that now, yes, it going to fall, it just clear away. It had no brooding inscrutable wilderness here. There was no wildand passionate uproar to make people feel they is beast, to stir this great evil wickedness in their blood to make them to go out and murder people. Maybe that madness seized Columbus and the first set of conquerors when they land here and wanted the Carib people to believe that they was gods; but, afterwards, after they settle in the island and decide that, yes, is here we going to live now, they began to discover how hard it was to be gods. The heat, the diseases, the weight of the armour they had to carry in the hot sun, the imperial poses they had to strike, the powdered wigs to wear, the churches to build, the heathen to baptise, the illiterates to educate, the animals to tame, the numerous species of plants to name, history to write, flags to plant, parades to make, the militia to assemble, letters to write home. And all around them, this rousing greenness bursting in the wet season and another quieter shade perspiring in the dry. On top of that they had to put up with the noise from Blackpeople. Whole night Blackpeople have their drums going as they dance in the bush. All those lascivious bodies leaping and bending down. They couldn’t see them in the dark among the shadows and the trees; but, they could hear. They had to listen to them dance the Bamboula Bamboula, the Quelbay, the Manding, the Juba, the Ibo, the Pique, the Halicord, the Coromanti, the Congo, the Chiffon, the Banda, the Pencow, the Cherrup, the Kalinda, the Bongo. It was hard for Whitepeople.

Taken from Salt by Earl Lovelace (1996:5)

INTRODUCTION

This chapter continues the analysis of destination image constructs of the Caribbean with an examination of how these images have been discursively organised and constructed in the newspaper texts. This analysis is presented on three levels. The first level examines the ideological structure of the image constructs mainly within the framework of postcolonial critiques of Western representations of the ‘Other’. Within this context, the primary components or schema of tourism destination image identified in this study, that is, landscape, local peoples and activities that are portrayed mainly in travel stories, are analysed to determine how their meanings work
in relation to their appeal to tourist motivation and attitudes. Therefore the texts are examined in terms of the how the writer's valorises the functional, holistic, affective or enactive images of the destination. On the second level, this analysis focuses on media language and the ways in which the reader is engaged by the textual strategies employed in the text. It seeks to identify how the differentiated image constructs are discursively organised with specific inferences made to consumer behaviour. Part 11 presents the second level of this analysis that addresses the organic or autonomous image of the destination presented by the news stories on the Caribbean, in order to explain how these images are shaped by the news culture of the UK press. This chapter concludes with a discussion in Part 111 that integrates the findings of the content analysis and discourse analysis in order to relate and reinforce the overall outcomes of these analyses to the study's research goals.

10.1 Colonial discourse and images of the Caribbean

Many of the contemporary travel articles of the region in the UK press typify images of the holiday experience of the Caribbean that are yet suffused with notions of the colonial past. The dominance of the colonial motif arguably may be justified in terms of the realities of a shared historical experience. However, in terms of a postcolonial critique of this discourse, the issue is not merely the invocation of this colonial past, but how this invocation works in terms of the representations of these destinations and their holiday experiences.

An analysis of the colonial motif as a discursive strategy of representing the holiday experience is conducted of this article below:-

Escape: Caribbean Special: Grenada: Spice and easy: Neasa MacErlean finds Guinness, cricket and sun on the fragrant island of Grenada
The Observer
London (UK)
Sep 17, 2000

Authors: Neasa MacErlean
Pagination: 10

Full Text:
Imagine a Britain with sunshine nearly every day - a Britain so warm that palm trees grow on the edge of all beaches.

Discounting the effects of global warming, the closest you can probably get to this Britannic idyll is by making the nine-hour air journey to Grenada in the Caribbean. In our English-speaking former colony, the red telephone boxes are exactly the same as the London ones. The Queen still reigns. The policemen have 'ER' badges on their caps, more than matching the British bobby for smartness, right down to the black, shiny boots.

Despite the old horrors of empire and sugar plantations, the 95,000 islanders have a great affinity with the Brits and the Irish. When I went there on a windsurfing holiday in a party of about 30, everyone was impressed with the place.

Grenada could be the world capital of beautiful, pale sandy beaches bordering on to gentle turquoise seas. Its tiny area - 20 miles long and 12 miles wide - is also home to small rainforests, Hollywood-style waterfalls and Mount Qua Qua, the volcanic crater-turned-lake.

If your tastes also run to Guinness and cricket, you will probably never want to leave the so-called 'Spice Island'. The location of a Guinness brewery just outside the capital, St George, is testament to the marvellous quality of the water. Grenadians, like their fellow West Indians, are cricket-obsessed. They have a new national ground which, in the year since opening, has already hosted international matches.

Tours of the interior will make clear how the country became known as Spice Island. Many of the inhabitants make their (small) living by cultivating nutmeg and cinnamon trees and selling their produce at the colourful and lively St George market. When the wind changes, you often find a different spicy fragrance in the air. Cloves and saffron are also produced in large quantities - and you will often find yourself walking on paths covered in nutmeg shells.

But the island is still poor. While no one appears to starve, very few people reach European standards of living. Most British holidaymakers could buy the entire stock of any of the St George market stalls without noticing the outlay. Some holidaymakers will rejoice in the fact that Grenada is 'unspoilt'; others will feel slightly uncomfortable that the locals benefit so little from tourism and trade. There are signs, however, that international investment will start to enrich the local economy and provide more restaurants and other facilities for affluent Western travellers.

Only a couple of restaurants stand out now. Nutmeg on the Carenage, St George, provides wonderful views of the harbour and a three-course meal for about pounds 20 a head. Aquarium is approached by a road that is little more than a dirt track behind the international airport but is probably one of the most beautiful restaurants in the world. For about pounds 20 a head, you eat in a setting that could be used for a James Bond film - set into the side of a cliff, looking like a giant tree house and overlooking its own quiet share of sandy beach and gentle sea.

Getting there

Neasa MacEarlean travelled on a learn-to-windsurf package with Neilson (01273 626284), which still allowed her time to explore the island. A week at the Riviera Beach Hotel on Grand Anse Beach costs from pounds 744 (pounds 920 for two weeks), including flights, transfers, B&B accommodation and
all activities. Grenada is one of the cheaper islands for eating out.

From the first sentence of the article in lines 1 and 2, the Caribbean is being idealised in terms of the Mother Country, Britain. The writer invites readers to ‘imagine’, that is, to impose a way of seeing the island destination of Grenada as an idealised Britain. In other words, the writer is suggesting that the Britannic idyll is characterised by the imperial signifiers of red telephone boxes, ‘bobbies’ and their comparable shiny boots that is complemented by the attributes of the warm weather and tropical landscapes afforded by the destination.

What is important in this representation is how value is ascribed. Indeed the writer distinguishes warm weather, beaches and palm trees as the value-added benefits of this island but these are valorised within the context of their colonial association. In line 6, the writer makes an assertion as fact that ‘the Queen still reigns’. The colonial motif therefore operates as mode of inscription consistent with the ways early colonisers saw the New World, as a place to inhabit and to stamp their civilisations on and to claim in the name of the ruling monarch. The Imperial ‘I’ or ‘eye’ of the visitor establishes the claim to legitimacy and authority in seeing the world. But in the context of travel this quest is oriented for a search for an idealised Britain. Although there is the notion of escape and fantasy, noted in the invocation of the imaginary, yet this is not an escape to an unknown world, or to the unfamiliar that has merit for and by itself. Instead the escape is to an extension of Britain endowed with the attributes of tropical weather and landscapes.

This discourse therefore indicates how the identification of imperial signifiers prescribes a way of seeing and experiencing the island. In this respect, the discourse constructs the notion of the holiday ideal as related to the transfers of British culture within the landscape of the tropical. The landscape of Grenada is devoid of cultural meanings, it is only an attribute to escape to, and to enjoy while the context of British culture and civilisation provides the real meaning for the experience. The outcome is that Grenada has no distinct brand identity apart from its colonial heritage. Stripped of these colonial vestiges, it becomes essentially a place endowed with good weather and pleasing landscapes.
Notice in lines 13 to 16, the writer attempts to explain the attributes of the destination. Here the focus is expectedly placed on the landscape that is described as beautiful. Another notable feature of landscape representation in this article, is the manner in which the stereotypic images do not explicate what is really beautiful about the destination. The lack of identification of distinct attributes makes the writer resort to the overstatement that ‘Grenada could be the world capital of beautiful’. There is also the strategy to focus on physical dimensions, as seen in lines 13 to 16, where the strategy is to miniaturise in order to create differentiation and distinctiveness. The juxtaposition of ‘small rainforests’ with ‘Hollywood-style waterfalls’ serves not only to identify these natural attractions but it also works to provide contrast, suggesting the notion of a small island that is yet endowed with the waterfalls matching the glamour and the fantastical consistent with Hollywood. Yet this description of beauty apart from the precise physical measurements of the island could have been applied to any other Caribbean destination. Essentially, this inability to discursively represent distinctiveness relates to the lack of an appreciation of the particularity or brand image of the destination.

It may be argued however, that the writer indeed referred to Grenada’s brand image in line 24 as the ‘Spice Island’.

Tours of the interior will make clear how the country became known as Spice Island. Many of the inhabitants make their (small) living by cultivating nutmeg and cinnamon trees and selling their produce at the colourful and lively St George market. When the wind changes, you often find a different spicy fragrance in the air. Cloves and saffron are also produced in large quantities - and you will often find yourself walking on paths covered in nutmeg shells.

Here the writer in lines 26 and 27 point to the cultivation of nutmeg and cinnamon trees in the interior of the island which emits a spicy fragrance in the air when the wind blows. But this image and distinctive attribute of Grenada is not contextualised in this extract in terms of the holiday experience or the meaning it has for the writer. It is described mainly in terms of functionality, as a feature of the landscape which essentially prosaic. In other words the ‘spice island’ brand image is not endued with symbolic association with holidaying in the destination. The extent of the writer’s linking of the holiday experience and this attribute is in terms of ‘walking on paths covered in nutmeg shells’. By way of contrast, this description does not resonate with
the kind of symbolic meaning, imagination and even passion exemplified in the earlier descriptions of colonial signifiers at the beginning of the text.

But it is also important to locate how the colonial discourse of this travel article addresses contemporary social concerns. In lines 9 to 12, while the writer acknowledges the horrors of slavery, she provides assurances that remnants of past social antagonisms have been wiped out since the islanders appeared to have an affinity with the 'Brits and the Irish'. Here the writer suggests that no ill-will from the past remains to despoil the holiday experience. Indeed, the travel writing genre is not usually a site to debate serious issues of colonialism and oppression of colonial peoples. However, the fact that this point was raised here exposes the writer's awareness of the precarious ramifications of her strong invocation of the colonial past in constructing the holiday experience in the former slave colony. As such she provides her own testimonial as well as that of the windsurfing holiday 'party of about 30' that these issues do not threaten the holiday experience, and so counteracts the dissonance that may be implicit in terms of invoking the colonial imaginary as a means of experiencing the destination.

However, what is not so easily resolved is the contradiction of the ideal Britain transported to this tropical idyll and overt evidence of poverty. In line 30 the use of the modifier 'still' works at this point in the text to suggest that some expectation was not realised. It proposes a query of the disturbance of an ideal, interrupted by a reality that is not entirely congruous and justifiable. While at the beginning of the article, there was the intent to identify the familiar, as well as the similarities between Britain and the island, now there is the contrast of living standards.

Interestingly, the poverty of the local people is not seen by this writer as a failure of the civilising mission of the imperial past, but rather it is presented as an endemic issue for which foreign assistance will provide the solution. Since the evidence of poverty is disturbing, the tendency of the discourse is to ease this dissonance in the minds of consumers by reducing it to the point that the holiday experience is enabled without much consideration of local poverty. This extract also exposes another discursive strategy that involves the promotion of tourism development as the logical solution to issues of underdevelopment and poverty. In lines 35 to 37, tourism is
situated here as an industry of exchange, where the provision of luxury facilities is linked directly to improvements in the local economy.

The representation of tourism in terms of its exchange value works to legitimate its operation in less developed countries and attempts to resolve the tensions that may arise between an industry that promotes affluence and wellbeing in settings that bear the scars of deprivation. Apostolopoulos, Leivadi, et al. (1996:283) have argued that the notion of tourism as social exchange does not take into account the inequalities of this relationship. For countries whose economies are heavily dependent on tourism earnings, there are apparent dangers of exploitation and an imbalance in the commitment of resources to develop and sustain tourism industries without commensurate indications of poverty reduction and alleviation in local communities.

It is not been suggested that the discussion presented here represents the only way of interpreting the above travel article. It is being proposed that this analysis exposes the ways in which colonial discourse was used to construct the holiday image of Grenada. It has identified how the British culture was fore-grounded and presented as the locus of symbolic value for seeing and experiencing the destination. On the other hand, Grenada has been mainly represented in terms of its landscape where the functionality of these attributes was used to define the holiday experience of the island. In this regard, the image of the destination was confined within the stereotypic frame of sun, sand and sea, and did not provide or offer an appreciation of Grenada’s symbolic brand image or identity.

10.2 Images of the ideal Caribbean holiday—deconstructing the stereotype

While the preceding analysis of the meanings of the destination images of the Caribbean experience focussed on the colonial motif, the analysis now progresses to examine other aspects of the meaning of image constructs of landscape, local people and holiday activities. It may be argued that an understanding of how the Caribbean holiday experience is constructed is afforded by an examination of what is presented in travel stories to be the best of what the region has to offer in terms of the holiday experience. Again, the focus of the analysis is on how these various attributes are
valorised. These may be determined with regard to whether they are constructed mainly in terms of their functionality or whether symbolic value is ascribed to these constructs. As maintained in the previous discussion, representations of symbolic value facilitate distinctiveness and brand image in contrast to functional image constructs that are associated with stereotypical images.

In the article below, the writer seeks to first discount myths and popular images of the Caribbean with the aim of updating and correcting wrongly held perceptions of the islands. In so doing, he implicitly establishes his position to write authoritatively on the Caribbean ideal based on his supposed expertise and knowledge. According to (Bhattacharyya 1997), travel writers often use this authorial voice to persuade readers as to the legitimacy of their statements, and use this a means of presenting their own opinions as facts. By demonstrating this expert knowledge they assume the right to ‘mediate’ the travel experience and are able to convince readers on the evaluations and the conclusions presented.

In lines 1-5 the writer employs the rhetorical strategy of discounting popular views by providing specific examples that support his point. This allows him to credibly make the case for the ideal Caribbean holiday experience. As the writer seeks to further make the case of Barbados as a premier destination in the Caribbean, he engages in a direct comparison of the islands. He uses the social environment of the various islands to establish the basis for differentiation. The islands of Haiti, Jamaica and the Dominica Republic are discounted because of the threats posed by menacing, hassling natives or dilapidated hotels. In line 23, the writer notes with dramatic interjection that in comparison to his frightful experiences on the other island mentioned, Barbados ‘thankfully- was different’.

**Barbados: I've swum, eaten, chilled out - what else is there to do?: Andrew Malone appreciated the lack of hassle in Barbados, even if lazing about can induce boredom. At least he didn't bump into Scary Spice**
The Observer
London (UK)
Sep 17, 2000

Authors: Andrew Malone

---

252
Myths surround the Caribbean. There are fables about black magic and strange Voodoo rituals in Haiti. But the most enduring popular image is of people lounging in hammocks, sipping rum and listening to reggae music as waves gently lap the shore and the sun slips below the horizon to signal the end of another day in paradise.

This had not, unfortunately, been my experience during three previous trips to the region. Stopping in Jamaica a few years ago after a trip to South America, paradise swiftly developed into an endurance test. Violent crime was rife. Stoned touts hassled aggressively, muttering dark threats when their demands were not met. Many tourists stayed behind high fences patrolled by guards.

One afternoon, I watched as a roller-blading holiday-maker careered along the main street in Montego Bay, pursued by a horde of touts, shouting: 'You want ganja? A taxi? How about some hair braiding?'

A trip to Haiti was similarly interesting. American warships landed troops in Port Au Prince, while an evening taxi trip ended with us being pursued by a pick-up full of grim-faced Tonton Macoutes, the sunglass wearing thugs employed by Papa Doc and his son Baby Doc during their murderous rule of Haiti.

The Dominican Republic was worse. There was a rebellion by other guests at our crumbling, all-inclusive hotel. Anyone who refused to join in was branded a 'scab' by the Liverpudlian ringleader. It was like Carry On Up The Caribbean.

Barbados - thankfully - was different. While my wife, Sue, slept off the rigours of a British Airways Club Class flight (grilled turbot followed by a cheese board of stilton, accompanied by a cheeky-nay, impertinent-little 1996 Claret), I went to test the water of our beach front hotel. The sea was perfect: enough waves to make it fun and warm enough to stay in all day.

Then, in what for me was the defining start to our two-week holiday, the first tout loomed into view as I lounged on a sunbed and watched the sun set. 'Any bad habits, man?' he asked.

I thought about telling him to pull up a chair and boring him with tales of orgies and drink and drug abuse, hoping he would think I was a nutter and put the word out to the other touts to give me a wide berth.

Instead, I smiled and said: 'Not at the moment.' He smiled back and said: 'No problem, man.' And then he sauntered off back down the beach. Barbados does not have the hassles of other Caribbean islands.

The 250,000 Bajans who populate the island, perched off Colombia near the bottom of a string of islands that curve up towards Puerto Rico, take pride in their country. There are few of the problems associated with other islands in the region. Literacy levels are high; crime is negligible.
The only violence I came close to was when the waiter brought the bill for our evening meal on our first night, and I almost hit him. Paradise comes at a price: Barbados is not a cheap destination. Dinner for two, with a bottle of house wine and no coffee or liqueurs, averaged around pounds 80. This would have been acceptable if the food had been fantastic. Some meals were good - fresh fish or shell fish - but most of them were unspectacular. Multiply that by 14 - your meal out is your main evening event - add breakfast or lunch, and you get the picture.

We stayed at the Bougainvillea Resort, a crescent-shaped collection of apartments with beautiful sea views, on the south coast. Many of the guests could be seen on their balconies, having dinner they had cooked themselves after a trip to Big B's, the local supermarket two miles up the coast.

The island has always been associated with celebrities - Scary Spice was holidaying on the luxurious west coast and Michael Winner is a regular visitor - and the locals have cashed in by charging prices that rich people would never lower themselves to question.

There has also been a recent rise in the number of cheap package deals, prompting a rise in the number of fast food outlets where groups of British and German holidaymakers chomp on pizzas every night.

It is worth hiring a car to tour the island. (It also makes the walk back from Big B's redundant). The west coast has superb beaches and snorkelling in calm, lagoon-like waters. The north of the island has big cliffs, which the sea crashes into, sending waves into the air. The east coast was our favourite. You drive through sugar plantations and mountains dotted with gaily coloured rum shops, and end up on a rugged coastline with brilliant waves. Bathsheba, a popular place for surfing, is a fantastic spot for lunch and then a swim.

On the way back to the south, one of the highlights, particularly at weekends, is the fish fry at Oistins. Local musicians set up speakers near the market in this little fishing village and blast out music, while dozens of Bajan women set up stalls and fry flying fish. It is served with the ubiquitous rice and peas, and makes a good night out especially with a glass or two of the local rum.

Barbados is, in the main, the place to go for a lazy beach holiday. Most activity centres on the sea. I rented a hobie cat - a small catamaran - and buzzed around our bay, watching flying fish as the sun beat down. I'd always thought they simply leapt out of the water and back in again, like dolphins. But they can fly for up to 20 metres at a time, their wings whirring like hummingbirds as they flit above the waves.

We had wanted a chilled out holiday, and we got it. But - and this sounds niggardly - there is only so much chilling anybody can take. By the time we had been round the island to different beaches, gone swimming and finished our books, it is difficult not to get itchy feet. Relaxing can give you too much energy. I even found myself asking some Germans for a game of beach volleyball. You could, of course, make the days drift by in a haze of marijuana sold by various hawkers, who, judging by their red eyes, did precisely that.

I would recommend Barbados as the perfect place for a week's break in the middle of winter, when things are really depressing here. The flight only takes eight hours and a week would give you plenty of time to see
everything and relax. But two weeks as a main summer holiday would probably be too much - in terms of things to do and the damage to your pocket.

Getting there

Andrew Malone travelled with Worldwide Journeys (020 7388 9292). Two weeks at the Bougainvillaea in a deluxe one-bedroom suite costs pounds 1,302 per person, including return flights with British Airways, all taxes and air transfers.

It is important to note how the writer constructs this perception of difference. In lines 29 to 37, he recounts his encounter with a tout on the beach in Barbados. The stereotypical picture perfect scene is presented with a beachfront hotel and ‘a beach with warm fun waves’. But this ideal was threatened when a tout emerged posing the possibility of disrupting the idyllic moment. However, the polite response of the tout to his rejections, leads the writer to declare that Barbados does not have the hassles of other Caribbean destinations.

This definitive statement underscores differentiation between the islands. It not necessarily the inferior landscapes or the presence of touts in the other islands, but the fact that Barbadians are likely to be more polite and sensitive to tourists that makes the destination a cut about its competitors in the region. The writer then draws on his knowledge of social indicators of Barbados’ literacy and crime levels to strengthen his case and to explicate why Barbados is less threatening. The overall effect is to create the impression of Barbados as not only a picture perfect destination in terms of physical attributes but also brings to fore holistic images of the island as safe and as a civilised community. By extending the representation beyond the sun, sand sea stereotype, the value added benefits of courteous, literate locals serve to enhance the distinctiveness of Barbados as a safe, stable holiday destination.

However, the writer’s unreserved endorsement of the holistic image of safety is sustained until he considers the high cost of the vacation. In lines 42-49 he shows his angst at the high costs of meals on the island that he does not consider value for money. Here the mediocre or ‘unspectacular’ quality of food in addition to a lack of exciting activities to engage in after a week on the island, adds up to an overly expensive holiday experience. He attributes the expensive costs of food to the island’s popularity with celebrities who can afford to pay, and that this does not reflect the true quality of the food or potential holiday experiences of the destination.
The conclusion of his evaluation expressed in lines 89 to 93 is that Barbados is therefore a destination that is perfect only for and within the limits of a week’s holiday from a depressing winter in the UK. In other words, for this travel writer, an extra week is not worth the expense in holidaying at the most ideal Caribbean destination, so that in spite of it being safe, yet the island is overrated in terms of prices and diversionary experiences on offer.

After noting that the presence of the rich and famous, may be the reason for the expensiveness of the island, in lines 59 to 61 the writer comments that the cheap packages to the island have led to the rise of fast food outlets catering to European holidaymakers. This information indicates that the island is not exclusive to rich celebrities and interposes the picture of the island as an emerging mass tourist destination. The image of groups of British and German holidaymakers who are the traditional stock of mass tourists who ‘chomp on pizzas every night’ introduces a note of disdain on these holiday activities. The juxtaposition of this observation with the point on celebrities who visit the island serves to undercut the notion of the destination as a premium holiday destination. The image of the mass tourist also suggests a contradiction of a supposedly premium destination that is hosting mass tourists.

The writer here exposes the extent of his valorisation of the Barbados holiday experience. The popular images of sun, sand, sea or these functional attributes, though picture perfect are not necessarily the locus of value. The writer seems to be indirectly making the point that Barbados is no longer an ideal since it does not offer quality food and sustaining, enlivened holiday experiences at value for money.

The deficiency of the destination in offering diversionary experience is seen in lines 75 to 76 where the writer notes that Barbados is ‘in the main’ ideal for lazy beach holiday as most of the activities centres on the sea’. The sea which was described as ‘perfect’, ‘fun and warm’ (lines 26-27), as ‘superb’ (line 63) and ‘fantastic’ (line 65) is now constrained and delimited as an ideal in terms of the holiday experience. The writer appears to be wanting more than activities centred in the sea, and he also wants to do more than ‘chilling out’, and so inadvertently undermines the ideal sun, sand and sea vacation that he states that Barbados has to offer. On the other hand, he notes
that those who do not choose to be ‘active’ may opt to ‘drift in a haze of marijuana’ (lines 86-87), suggesting the risk of decadence for travellers who do not engage in diversionary holiday activities. In this respect, varied holiday experiences and those with a range of activities are presented as comprising the ideal holiday experience.

Line 92 indicates the writer’s ultimate stance where he states that in Barbados ‘two weeks as a main holiday is too much’. The Barbadian holiday experience is therefore ascribed a specific temporal dimension beyond which it is no longer satisfying and pleasurable. This has significant implications for the destination if it is to sustain its traditional positioning in the British market as a long haul, long stay vacation destination. Here the writer is also prescribing a specific time frame that implies a shift in the way of experiencing the destination. It is arguable, that this temporal shift is occasioned by the needs of a ‘money rich time poor’ target market that are changing their values towards an appreciation of shorter, but more frequent vacation breaks.

What is critical is the implications of this shift in holiday length of stay. The benefit of time space compression of today’s world is evidenced in line 91 when the writer notes that the trip to island is ‘only eight hours’. This means that traditional long haul destinations are no longer being represented as being so far away to merit an extended stay at the destination. There is also the added perception of vacation time at the destination as comprising hours that have to be filled with activities that are varied, diversionary and thrilling. Consequently more demand is placed on the destination and the overall holiday experience to fill leisure hours and make them more meaningful. So lazing on a sunbed (line 30), driving through the mountains and sugar plantations (line 66) enjoying fish fry and beer with the locals (line 71-77), buzzing around the bay in a catamaran (76-77) were still not enough to ward off the writer’s ennui during two week vacation on the island.

The apparent weaknesses of these holistic images of the destination therefore serve to diminish it as a valued brand. Within the discourse of this article, safety is a premium feature when compared with other islands, but in terms of attributing value-added for the island’s holistic image quality holiday experiences, it is not enough to construct as an ideal destination. The fact that Barbados has high literacy and a people who take
pride in their country is not afforded consideration for a premium vacation. Furthermore, the conventional and popular tropical images of the destination while still important is not considered sufficient in valorising premium, ideal holiday experiences.

It is therefore apparent that the sun, sand and sea image, though picture perfect and ideal, is not used in this discourse to denote premium value, instead, it operates as functional imagery that is depicted in clichéd, flowery language but does not offer a clear evaluation of the holiday experience. However, as shown in this article, holistic attributes such as safety, courteous people and expensive were constructed using more elaboration and evaluation in order to make the case, and in so doing, clearly defined, more distinct brand images were constructed. The significance of these discursive strategies is that they may have various persuasive appeals to readers. It is therefore likely that functional image constructs that lack symbolic and emotive appeals may not be as persuasive in influencing destination image formation as more holistic and affective imagery. Brand image is therefore more than the listing of attributes, but it is how these are evaluated and endued with symbolic meanings and cultural resonance in their representations that enables the distinctiveness and brand appeal of the destination to emerge. This analysis has shown how the writer has been able to construct the holiday experiences of the destination by employing the rhetorical strategy of attribution of value. He does this by constraining certain aspects of the experience and enlarging others, so that he delineates a preferred way of seeing and appreciating the destination. He also endues certain experiences with value and reduces others as he constructs the holiday experience.

It is hardly contestable that the intent of the article is to persuade. Like most travel articles in the press, this one utilises the usual strategies of directly addressing the reader. The writer uses the personal ‘I’ that is the dominant mode of travel articles in the Sunday newspapers as reported in the findings on content analysis. The use of the personal ‘I’ presumes the value judgement of the writer, but as highlighted earlier this is presented in the mode of expert opinion. It is the views of someone who was in situ as an investigator, and as the arbiter of value, is in the position to make definitive statements on the destination, thereby mediating the holiday experience.
The writer’s role in mediating the holiday experience is also demonstrated in terms of his use of enactive imagery that details to readers how the particular experience may or should be appreciated. Lines 62 to 69 illustrate this enactive style and how it works. Here the writer describes his drive tour of the island and shows how to enjoy the east coat by going through the mountains and to view the ‘rum shops’, ‘rugged coastlines and brilliant waves’ as well as ‘Bathsheba as a place to surf, swim and have lunch’. The writer in essence re-enacts the experience in such a way that routinises and directs the reader to appreciate the activity as the preferred way of engaging with the destination. Although this is not a direct call to action in terms of a sales pitch for readers to visit the island, yet the reader is engaged in terms of the performance of the particular holiday experience.

Admittedly, as a genre, travel writing tends not to demonstrate overt calls to action for readers to book the holiday as is the hallmark of destination advertisements and promotions. However, in this article there is the indirect call to action when in line 94, in the subheading ‘Getting there’ seems to link the experience described above with the details of the travel writer’s booking arrangements. The content analysis findings in Chapter 8 revealed that newspaper travel articles were mainly sponsored by tour operators. Here, specific details of telephone numbers, the cost for a two-week holiday inclusive of flights, taxes and transfers of the holiday package offered by the tour company which sponsored the writer’s trip were noted at the end of the article. This provides closure for the holiday experience described and shows the affinity between travel writers and the travel trade, particularly in providing copy for the newspaper travel pages.

The implications of this arrangement between the travel press and tour operators indicate that the choice of representations of the destination is likely to support and affirm the types of holiday packages on offer by tour operators to consumers. Apart from their main role of creating and increasing awareness of destinations, there is also the main issue of the nature of the representations of the destination and how these image constructs are valorised. As illustrated from the analysis of the discourse of the travel articles, the interests of the purveyors of travel are likely to be the main consideration for travel writers in terms of their ascription of value and in the tenor of their representations of the holiday experience. The outcome of this practice is that
local stakeholder interests in the representation and image of the destination may be subsumed by the demands of the market. In other words, how the market constructs and represents the holiday experience is enshrined as the only legitimate, uncontested way of experiencing the destination.

Discursively in this article, the construction of destination images has been linked to market demand. Also in this extract on Barbados, the sun, sand, sea attributes were presented as ideal attributes. However in terms of his representation of the consummate experience of the destination, the writer suggested that there were deficiencies in terms of diversionary activities and delivering a premium product at a commensurate price. It could be maintained that stereotypical images of the Barbados as a destination as represented in this discourse was not associated with premium value. However, the island’s most distinct holistic image that emerged from the article was that of safety and the civility of the locals, and these was valorised only in terms of its choice above other Caribbean competitors. In this way this brand image was beneficial in highlighting the competitiveness and appeal of the destination. But on the other hand, it was not factored in as an attribution of value in terms of premium pricing.

10.3 Of smiling hosts and their guests

Images of local people form an important component of destination image according to Gallarza, Saura, et al. (2002). A major expectation and requirement of holiday experiences is that of welcoming, friendly hosts. Not only is this routine for the service culture of the hospitality industries, but it also important in setting the context of the holiday. The writer of this passage establishes the importance of the welcome of local hosts signified by their smiles. Here he describes the holiday experience as mainly satisfying based on this welcome.

1 Smiles. Smiles are the souvenirs I treasure most from my trip to the small West Indian island of St Lucia. Yes, there was sunshine, sea like blue Champagne and crustaceans in every liqueur known to man, but from the moment the BWIA plane touched down on the surf- fringed airstrip at Hewanorra there began an endless succession of 100-watt, happy smiles, almost all accompanied by a ‘Welcome to San Loosha’, straight from the heart, that I will never forget (The Observer- 25/06/00:6).
Here the writer makes the assertion that it is the welcome of the local people that characterised his most meaningful experience of St. Lucia. He makes an apparent declaration of the primacy of the warmth of local people for his holiday experience, illustrated in phrases such as ‘smiles are the souvenirs I treasure most from my trip’ and ‘happy smiles...I will never forget’. But in the next paragraph and ensuing ones after that, the writer makes no effort to explain how these smiles were acted out in terms of his encounter to with the locals during his holiday. (See Appendix for full text of article)

8 From Hewanorra a half-hour minibus ride wove giddily round the potholes in the roads to my destination: the luxurious Jalousie Hilton on the west coast of the island. Tucked away beneath the dense coconut palms in its own exclusive bay between the island's famous Pitons - two green peaks thrown up by volcanic activity 40,000 years ago - this was like no hotel I had ever seen before. It describes itself as a 'resort and spa', with guests housed in separate villas, and you really do need recourse to a map to find your way around the 300 acres of this former plantation. To aid you in your travels, a discreet fleet of minibuses cruise the lanes invisibly, materialising magically within 30 seconds of a guest's request.

18 This is a destination for the true tropical sybarite. There is so much to do - with four restaurants, three bars, tennis courts, swimming pool, beach, golf course and spa centre - that to reveal one's intention to explore the island beyond the gated perimeter is considered at the very least eccentric. What more could you want, the eyes of the puzzled staff seem to say. But it is essential to get out and about, if only to stop yourself from becoming irreversibly accustomed to private plunge-pools and saronged Bond-girl-alikes (usually honeymooning with some smouldering James) by the gallon.

It comes as a contradiction after the powerful declarations of the opening paragraph that the writer commits more copy space to describing and relating his experiences at his hotel and in touring the island, rather than recounting his experience with the locals. As seen in lines 18 to 23, the Jalousie Hilton all-inclusive hotel is the antithesis of a holiday that facilitates an appreciation of the genuine warmth and smiles of the locals. Even the spatial layout of the Jalousie described in lines 10 and 11 as 'tucked away beneath dense coconut palms in its own exclusive bay' emphasises alienation from the local people. The image of luxury and first class service efficiency and hedonism presented here eclipses the local smiles and personal touch and places the focus on the amenities and physical landscape attributes of the destination.
The landscape and the hotel attributes of the destination comprised the major focus of the writer and the extent of the contribution of the locals to the holiday experience although deemed crucial, was not explored in the article. This focus and prioritising of landscape attributes as paramount to the holiday experience in the Caribbean was highlighted in the findings of the content analysis where landscape constructs emerged most frequently in relation to the other image constructs.

Therefore, although the local St. Lucians are denoted as valuable by the writer, yet the connotation of the subtext, instead of conveying their appeal, ultimately works to objectify them. They are depicted here essentially as ‘smiles’, fixtures of a service attribute, undifferentiated and lacking in character and definition. The phrase ‘endless succession of 100-watt happy smiles’ portrays them as embodiments of a holiday attribute that were to be consumed along with the other luxuries of ‘blue Champagne and crustaceans’. It may be concluded that the statement of value of the locals was not borne out in the terms of the treatment of their representation in the text. The clash between the denotative and connotative readings of the text shows where the true valuations of the writer reside. This seems to be mainly in affirming the conventional stereotype of the holiday experience where landscape images define the holiday experience and the image of local peoples do not feature as premium dimensions of the holiday experience. This treatment of local peoples shows how travel writers may ascribe value in terms of denotative statements, but this may be undermined by the nature of their treatment of these image constructs, and how they construct and relate value and symbolic meanings of the holiday experience.

10.4 Differentiating Caribbean destinations

It may appear a daunting task to identify unique features to differentiate the many destinations within the Caribbean region. Differentiation is central to developing the brand identity of various destinations of the Caribbean. To date, their similarities as sun, sand and sea destinations have been the basis for their renown in the travel market. These images have been successfully exploited but in turn have also created the impression of the Caribbean as offering the same basic experience differentiated only by a change of location. Consequently representations across destinations have
been mostly flat and homogenous in their depiction of similar landscapes, types of people and activities.

The dilemma this poses for individual destinations is the task of creating a brand identity that shows the destination as offering something extra in comparison with competing destinations. Often competitive advantage is achieved in terms of which destinations have the most marketing budget to create high profile visibility and awareness of the country in the marketplace, rather than being able to benefit from a distinct, valued brand identity. This may mean that a high marketing spend has to be maintained in order to keep awareness of the particular destination at a high level.

10.4.1 Highlighting differentiation strategies in travel texts

Examples of differentiating destinations in the Caribbean are often presented in the context of the personal evaluative opinion of the travel writer rather than based on some objective measurement. In the following passage, a reviewer in the *Sunday Telegraph* assured readers that the writer of a recent travelogue on the Caribbean offered authoritative guidance on the choice of destinations since the book offered tourist statistics and

*Davies's personal opinions about, for example, the best beaches, and a guide to every island. Together they provide the essential information that will enable any traveller to decide which particular floating paradise to visit. Ratings range from one star ("interesting - but I don't plan to return" eg Trinidad) to three stars ("islands I can't wait to go back to" eg Nevis) (Sunday Telegraph-14/05/00:16)*

This subjective ranking of destinations does not overtly seem to be a mere opinion by the travel writer. Within this context it works as an informed commentary on the countries. Here the travel writer is presented as a discerning consumer with the know-how to evaluate and discriminate between various destinations. This approach may appeal to readers who prefer to be highly engaged in their purchase of the holiday experience particularly with stories that appear to be not just a descriptive account of a holiday, but as a judgement from an informed appraiser.

10.4.2 Marketing implications of destination image differentiation

Although there is a general blurring of differences between Caribbean destinations in travel stories, it is possible to pinpoint their relative brand identities, that is, the main
holiday experiences and image constructs that best defines them. It is true that whatever label may be claimed for one, can also be ascribed to another, but it may also be argued that each destination can be classified in terms of key attributes. Table 10.1 below presents a qualitative typology of the various destinations based on the sample of newspaper articles used in this study.

Four main image constructs or brand descriptors have been identified in the sample to distinguish destinations. These are Nature, Paradise/Recreational, Elite/Celebrity and Cultural destinations. However, it is important to remember that all 18 countries in the sample have been represented in terms of each of the identified image constructs.

**Table 10.1 Main image constructs of Caribbean destinations**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Image Constructs</th>
<th>Destinations</th>
<th>Key Characteristics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nature Destinations</td>
<td>Belize, Dominica, Guyana, Montserrat</td>
<td>Mainly represented as underdeveloped with attributes such as rainforests, sensitive biodiversity and generous endowments of flora and fauna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paradise Destinations</td>
<td>Antigua, Bahamas, BVI, Barbados, Grenada, St. Lucia, St. Kitts &amp; Nevis, Tobago</td>
<td>Offer the typical recreational sun, sand and sea holidays. Featuring deluxe hotels, modern facilities and many holiday activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elite/Celebrity Destinations</td>
<td>Bermuda, Mustique, St Vincent &amp; the Grenadines, Turks &amp; Caicos</td>
<td>Identified in terms of the celebrities who frequent there, too expensive for the mass tourist market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural Destinations</td>
<td>Jamaica, Trinidad &amp; Tobago</td>
<td>Renowned for music, culture, entertainment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The image constructs or attributes of the destinations itemised above indicate the areas of distinctive brand appeals that they have in the marketplace. However, the promotion of a destination brand image involves capturing the essence of the destination’s experience and its effects on the consumer. In finding the unique trait that is useful in building the brand image, the aim is offer to the consumer a bonus that is based on a ‘recognisable differentiated value’ (Leventhal 1996:19).

This may be particularly crucial for destinations in terms of a marketing position as they can maximise the perception that they have something more to offer their customers. Chen & Uysal (2002:987) maintain that competitive marketing positioning is vital for the long-term success of the destination and this is usually achieved by being able to successfully market a distinguishable physical or symbolic feature of the destination. This is particularly crucial for Caribbean destinations that have few clear
differences to distinguish them based on their physical and functional attributes. Nevertheless, it as being suggested throughout this discourse analysis that there are symbolic differentiated value between the various destinations that can be exploited for brand identity and market positioning.

10.5 Differentiating image constructs by textual characteristics

In keeping with discourse analysis, this textual examination has mainly explored the ideological underpinnings and power implications of the construction of destination images in terms of how they prescribe preferred ways of seeing and experiencing the destination. However, it has also highlighted the importance of the differentiation of the image constructs in terms of the creation of brand images of the destination. Nevertheless, it is important as well to theoretically clarify the basis of linking differentiated image constructs to brand identity and also to inferences to their possible relationship to readers. This is critical in establishing a nexus from the travel writing discourse to high or low-level involvement responses from readers to the holiday experience described by the writer. The main supposition of establishing how differentiated destination image constructs forms a link from text to mind is to explore the relationship between mediated texts and the consumer.

This discussion therefore clarifies the ways in which various image constructs have been discursively presented in the texts. The focus here is on identifying the rhetorical strategies that have been used in the creation of destination images in the media texts. It is being maintained in this discussion that these various constructs can be differentiated in terms of their varying association with particular consumer responses. For example, TDI studies have theorised differences in images based on the source of the communication and their expected effect on consumer responses in that organic images are deemed more credible than induced images (Gartner 1993). However, this study suggests that TDI constructs can also be differentiated textually.

Research conducted on the types of media language in the press has shown that different speech codes are oriented towards varying cognitive styles. As shown by Namenwirth & Bibbee (1975:51) highlighted earlier in this study, elaborated speech codes in the newspaper press are more theoretically oriented, displaying a critical
articulation and with appeals to reason. In contrast, restricted code styles are more
descriptive and involve limited cognitive processing on the part of the reader. This
distinction between the various levels of cognitive engagement in media language was
applied to the analysis of image constructs. Theories of TDI constructs proposed by
Echtner & Ritchie (1993) and Goossens (2000) were used to determine how these
differentiated constructs have been organised and conveyed in texts. These were then
examined in terms of their implications for reader responses based on the
characteristics of these communications.

10.6 Introducing the Tourism Destination Image Media Matrix

Four types of TDI constructs were identified in terms of their rhetorical organisation
and their proposed implications for reader or consumer responses. These constructs as
identified in the TDI literature are Functional, Enactive, Affective and Holistic image
constructs. It must be emphasised however, that inferences from texts to likely
reader and consumer responses are based on theoretical assumptions. Further
research must be conducted with consumers and then corroborated in order to
establish an empirical or predictive model. Essentially, this is a critical framework
combining strands of relevant theories as a basis to pursue investigations into these
relationships. It is applicable in terms of forging an understanding of how mediated
destination images may be related to consumer responses, in other words, it offers a
model of reader responses that establishes a bridge from text to mind in terms of
destination images (Scott 1994).

10.6.1 Functional Destination Imagery

Echtner & Ritchie (1993:3) describe functional imagery as the more tangible
components of the attributes of the destinations. This is the most typical message style
in travel articles and can be seen as the template for such stories. Essentially, it is a
message type that describes the tourism product in a manner that affirms the
recreational holiday experience. It this way it centres the holiday experience in terms
of the product attributes of the destination. The authorial intention of this style
appears to emphasise mainly the pull factors of the physical or tangible attributes of
the tourism product in creating the image of the destination (Crompton 1979).
This message style normally presents a generic rendition of these attributes that does not offer a distinct impression of the destination. The destination is not usually conveyed as more than the sum of its parts, rather images are stereotypical and the language clichéd. Functional images that focus mainly on attributes may be differentiated from the type of image that creates brand awareness according to Poiesz (1989:461). He explains that

> With regard to product and brand conceptualisations, there is a parallel shift in attention: away from physical aspects and functional benefits of products to their symbolic associations, expressiveness, psychosocial aspects intangible aspects and surplus product value or augmented products.

Although Poiesz was referring specifically to products in this quote, it is also applicable for destinations that have been marketed in terms of their physical attributes. It may be inferred that the functional message style does not readily engage the reader in terms of a high level of cognitive processing since the language is rarely evaluative and mostly descriptive. This may also suggest that this type of message stimuli may lead to a low elaboration or a low involvement response from the reader in terms of a distinct appreciation of the distinct image of the destination.

Leventhal (1996:22) argues that the level of consumers’ knowledge is related their involvement with the product. He contends that communication that encourages consumers to cognitively process information in terms of an understanding of the distinct benefits of the product are likely to gain an highly involved consumer. He explains further that the ‘candid marketer requires high involvement because consumers must understand the communication’ in order to create brand awareness and consumer loyalty. In other words, high involvement/elaboration is linked with brand awareness by reason of an awareness of the distinct benefits and value-added dimensions of the brand. In this regard the generic nature of functional message images do not facilitate high involvement or brand awareness.

### 10.6.2 Enactive Destination Imagery

Enactive images are described by Goossens (1994:313) as ‘a kind of role-play or imagined consumption in which individuals try out relevant consumption situations through do-it-yourself or experience-it thoughts’. This means that stronger emotional feelings are stimulated through enactive imagery based on the fact that the consumer is personally highly involved with touristic information. However, Goossens’ definition is modified in this model to refer only to messages that engage the reader to
role-play and to take part in a written script of the travel experience portrayed in the article. This type of message style in contradiction to Goossen's view is defined here as low involvement based on the assessment that such examples of role playing and scripting in the messages are mainly stereotypical in a similar manner as functional imagery.

Enactive imagery essentially differs from the functional imagery in terms of the presentation of the travel experience in terms of showing how the individual may relate to the attributes of the destination. It is however no more evaluative or specific about the brand image of the destination. Enactive imagery mostly utilises the pronoun ‘you’ indicating the authorial intent to prompt the reader to role-play and to see herself acting out the recreational experience. This message style therefore locates the holiday experience in terms of experiencing the product attributes of the destination. It is not evaluative and so does not facilitate a high elaboration/involvement engagement.

10.6.3 Holistic Destination Imagery

This type of message style is distinguished by the predominant use of evaluative, elaborated code styles. The cognitive processing of the message is facilitated by the authorial emphasis on presenting the value of the holiday experience in terms of overall differentiated benefits and advantages. This approach is likely to gain high involvement from consumers as adjectival descriptors emphasise intangible psychological attributes, uniqueness and comparative advantages. Holistic imagery therefore primarily relates to push factors, that is, those psychological factors that motivate consumers to travel. As noted in the Poiez quote noted, the emphasis of this kind of image or brand differentiation puts the attention on meaning and symbolic value in terms of the perception of the destination.

10.6.4 Affective Destination Imagery

Affective Destination imagery is typified in message styles that emphasise the emotive value of the destination holiday experience. Like holistic imagery, it is likely to engage high involvement consumer responses by invoking specified hedonic values of the product. This emotive appeal can ‘stimulate motivating forces that mediates hedonistic consumer behaviour’ (Goossens 2000:313). The writer in the passage below, focuses on the emotive aspects of the Barbadian holiday experience by highlighting her feelings and mood stimulated by the atmosphere of the setting.
On the last night I went out on my balcony to listen to the soft waves, the crickets and the singing frogs. The night sky became scattered with egrets, the blossom was enough to make one swoon and everything in my life seemed suddenly ‘Ea-sy’.

(Sunday Express-19/09/00:75)

Here the writer points out the landscape attributes, ‘the soft waves’, ‘the night skies’. However, she does more that present these images in a descriptive, functional manner as she also makes the association between the landscape and her feelings and even the quality of her life. So in effect the attributes of the ‘crickets and singing frogs, and the appearance of the blossom had the powerful emotive effect to ‘make one swoon’.

In this type of description, the emotive quality of the imagery is emphasised and the reader may be engaged in seeing the destination in terms of the emotive context of the experience.

However it is also important to point out that these types of message styles are not mutually exclusive. Several styles are at times featured in the same article as directed by authorial intentions. The matrix below shows the suggested relationship between different message styles and proposed message and receiver characteristics.

**Figure 10.1 TDI Media Matrix**

This matrix seeks to explain how the varying types of imagery and stimuli in messages may induce particular consumer responses and how authorial intention may...
be inferred from message type. The main limitation of this model is that the inferences on the levels of consumer responses are mainly theoretical and there is need for more consumer-based tests and research to provide corroboration of the inferences being made as to consumer response. Another limitation is that it does not take into account the individual personal characteristics or circumstances that may confound how these images may work.

It may also be argued that these distinctions may be deemed as textual artefacts and that in reality all these distinctions between image types are blurred in the mind of individuals and may complement or reinforce each other. Whether this is the case or not, does not invalidate the usefulness of this model in theorising how messages work in the mediation of tourism destination images. It is more accurate and preferable to view the TDI Media Matrix as a heuristic model that may be used to assist in the operationalisation of image research studies based on textual mediation, and as a means to clarify consumer responses to tourism media messages. The TDI media matrix can therefore be viewed as filling the gap in the literature in terms of the varying relationship between differentiated destination images with reader and consumer responses.

PART 11 'Worlds Apart': The Caribbean and British news culture

The preceding discussion focussed on travel stories with the examination of the ways in which the holiday experience in the Caribbean is constructed. Most of the research in the literature have focussed on travel stories resulting in a conspicuous gap in the research in terms of explaining how news stories relate to travel motivation or behaviour. Gunn (1972) theorised that consumers perceive organic images as more credible than induced ones. However, there is no clear understanding of how organic images relate to travel motivation. This area of destination image formation is still both under-theorised and lacking in empirical research.
Nevertheless, one of the questions of this study is to determine the news media images of Commonwealth Caribbean and to clarify how these representations of the region have been constructed in terms of prevailing news values in the UK newspaper press. It is being suggested that there are distinct portrayals and positioning of Caribbean regions within the existing news culture of the press. Examination of these news values is important in understanding media practices in the presentation of organic images of the destinations.

The nature of newspaper representations may account for and explain the stereotypes and shared images of the region. The findings of the content analysis show that despite their varied readership, newspapers presented similar levels and types of stories on the Caribbean. There were no clear differences in these image constructs across newspaper types. This suggests that there are shared news values in terms of the reportage on the region. This analysis of the discourse therefore seeks to uncover how these news values expose the power/knowledge structures that govern these representations across the socio-economic divide of news readerships. Furthermore, an understanding of the news culture can be useful to marketers in destination image management in clarifying and making sense of the disparate range of news stories that may be published on the destination.

10.7 Political representations of the Caribbean, the compliant position

Although the majority of the British West Indies or Commonwealth Caribbean countries gained independence from imperial rule since the early 60s, political and economic and social legacies of this past colonial relationship remain. Most of the countries of the British West Indies are part of the Commonwealth, and still have the Queen as the titular head represented by a locally appointed Governor General. This colonial relationship is often reaffirmed in both travel and news stories. The ‘Britishness’ of some of the countries has been represented as evidence of British control as well as political and cultural influence that indirectly affirms a sense of power and dominance internationally.

Among the manifestations of British status and world dominance is their control of overseas territories. These representations are particularly dominant in news stories
on British overseas territories. Therefore these stories have been purposively sampled on the basis that they typify and also accentuate these representations. Their analysis therefore serves to explicate how the position of dependency of the Caribbean countries, described as the complaint position in this study, underpins political representations of the Caribbean in the UK national press.

Here in the article below, as suggested by the headline, this story is presented as an item on EU policy to curtail rice imports to the EU. The reader is therefore directed towards the central concern of the story as the effect of EU action on the Caribbean island.

EU halts the rice mills on Turks and Caicos
The Sunday Telegraph
London (UK)
Oct 1, 2000

Authors: Christopher Booker
Pagination: 14
ISSN: 0307269X
Companies: Company Name: European Union
SIC: 926110

Full Text:

IN July I reported how Brussels had dealt a crippling blow to the Turks and Caicos Islands, a tiny British "overseas territory" (as we must now call colonies) near the Bahamas, by preventing them from shipping small quantities of top-grade rice into the EU. Columbus Foods invested pounds 4 million in a rice mill on Grand Turk, which became the island's largest employer, under an EU scheme to help overseas territories by allowing them a quota to export milled rice to Europe.

But then southern European rice-growing countries such as Italy objected, even though the Turks and Caicos long-grain rice does not compete with the short-grain rice grown in Europe. The islands' quota was cut to almost nothing, putting 60 people out of work. Columbus Foods then discovered that, under the rules, they had the right to a "derogation", allowing them to continue exporting to the EU so long as their exports were less than one per cent of the EU's own production.

The only trouble was that, to obtain this derogation, it had to be approved by a Brussels committee dominated by Italy and other EU rice growers. The Turks and Caicos have now heard that, even though their production should fall well within the rules, the derogation has been refused, with no reasons given. The Grand Turk rice mill must stay silent, its 60 workers out of a job. And there is nothing, it seems, the British Government can do to
Ostensibly in line 1, the writer positions the story in terms of focusing on the Turks and Caicos being dealt a crippling blow by an EU rice quota. By line 4, the picture emerges that the ruling jeopardises the UK company Columbus Foods’ investment of £4 million into rice production on the island. He also points out here as well that the employment of large numbers of locals is also being threatened by the new rule.

Interestingly, the writer does not challenge the original EU policy of the allocation of rice quotas neither does he question the legitimacy or fairness of this initial policy. As seen in lines 10 to 14, the writer’s main contention is with the subsequent decision by the EU to restrict this quota to one percent of their rice production. He centres the discussion on highlighting the inconsistencies of the ruling in terms of the preferential treatment of some EU countries over others. This leads to the observation that although the writer starts his story in terms of championing the cause of the Turks and Caicos Islands, he is more concerned in bemoaning the encroachment on British sovereignty and its apparent consequence of Britain losing out to competing European countries. The fact that southern rice growing countries such as Italy were able to politically out manoeuvre the British to get the quota cut in their favour was the real basis of the writer’s angst. However, he stages and attempts to legitimise his questioning of EU’s power in terms of its exploitation and of the interests of a tiny, Caribbean nation.

This is therefore a story about global power structures rather than the ‘crippling blow to the Turks and Caicos’ Island’ of an EU ruling. It may be concluded that the writer’s main theme and concern is his contention with the EU as weakening the UK’s sovereignty. But he constructs this argument within the context of the threat to the UK’s ability to protect their overseas territories, however his subtext focuses mainly on the rivalry of European states rather than pursuing the interests of the Turks and Caicos’ unemployed. He therefore fails to address germane issues of how global trading patterns and quota systems in a world where free trade doctrines are apotheosised, are often not honoured in trading arrangements.
It is therefore pertinent in light of the writer’s treatment to the subject, to ask the following questions of the writer. Would he have displayed similar angst if the Turks and Caicos were territories of Italy and this ruling worked against the favour of the UK? What are the principles on which he challenges the refusal of the derogation of the export of rice to the island? If as denoted in the text, his main agenda was to highlight and expose the practice of impartiality in trading practices, then he would have drawn on pertinent discourses of fair trade and equity that would have provided the ideological underpinnings to construct his argument. It is therefore apparent that the writer mainly draws on the discourse of country sovereignty based on his representation this issue of the rice quotas. His intent is therefore to expose the danger of the EU power superstructure and since his agenda is that of UK sovereignty, he stages this as also threatening by extension that of the country’s overseas territories such as the Turks and Caicos.

The marginality, even the impotence of the Caribbean in the wider economic and political arena is highlighted in this story. Within this discourse it may be argued that those islands that are overseas territories remain a concern in so much as it reinforces and works in the interest of the imperial power. In lines 20 to 21, the assumption is being made that the colonial power will always maintain a benevolent administration of their overseas territories. This highlights and reinforces not only the dependency of these countries, but their expected compliance to the global world order. Ironically, in championing the cause of this Caribbean territory, this story emphasises the political powerlessness and lack of voice of such territories in negotiating a place in the global economic and political arena. Here the Caribbean is positioned at the periphery of world politics and trade negotiations so that they are in need of patronage as they are incapable, or have no real legitimate claim to negotiate their own destinies1.

However, patronage also means that countries of the periphery fail to have their voice heard or legitimated in today’s global political power structure. In the article below on
the attempt to decriminalise homosexuality in the Caribbean, the intent of the writer appears to be mainly to inform readers of the situation. This is in contrast to the preceding article where the writer’s view is dominant and he presents his own value judgment on the issue. However, the article below features a hard news style format where the writer’s opinion is not voiced and he takes a neutral stance in reporting the issues. The hard news style relates to factual reporting that situates the writer as a dispassionate mediator of information who has no stake in representing or championing any particular cause. News styles values of impartiality and the rejection of value judgements are evidenced in this news story with the extensive use of the passive voice as well as the quoting of several sources on the issue.

Britain to legalise gay sex in colonies
[FINAL Edition]
The Independent on Sunday
London (UK)
Nov 12, 2000

Authors: JO DILLON POLITICAL CORRESPONDENT
Pagination: 10
ISSN: 09519467

Full Text:

1 BRITAIN IS set to enrage its Caribbean territories by forcing through legal changes decriminalising gay sex.

3 Following a year-long row with politicians and religious leaders in the Overseas Territories, hostile to legalising homosexuality, ministers have vowed to act.

6 An Order in Council is expected before Christmas that will push through measures to legalise private, consensual gay sex between adults in Anguilla, the British Virgin Islands, the Cayman Islands, Montserrat and the Turks and Caicos Islands.

10 Baroness Scotland, the Foreign Office minister responsible, said in a recent letter to an MP that she had tried to encourage each territory

---

1 Wallerstein posited the notion of the world as divided into core and periphery based on dependency theory. He argued that this described an economic relationship between strong, industrialised countries or regions as weaker, agriculturally based states often lacking in technological infrastructure. Peripherality is therefore not really a spatial description but refers to a lack of power and influence with social, political and economic implications (Wallerstein, E (1974) The Modern World System: Capitalist Agriculture and the Origins of the European World Economy in the 16th Century, Academic Press, New York.)
to pass the necessary legislation themselves, anxious that the British
government did not "impose" laws on the territories against the spirit
of partnership.

The minister held a series of discussions with politicians, church leaders,
the local press and many ordinary residents living in the Caribbean territories.
But when asked to enact the law, they refused.

Lady Scotland said in the letter: "We said that in the event of formal
notification that they were unwilling to pass the necessary measures, we
would have to consider making an Order in Council." She added: "I expect
to do this before Christmas."

Jenny Tonge, the Liberal Democrat MP who has been campaigning for a
change in the law, said last night: "The Government gave the Overseas Territories
the chance to change the law themselves but they have not. It is vital
we keep up pressure to ensure the government proceeds with the Order as
a matter of urgency."

The Government's decision to act was also welcomed by gay rights group
Stonewall. Executive director Angela Mason said yesterday: "This is a very
welcome initiative. Equality before the law is a basic human right wherever
you live. We are delighted the Government is taking these rights seriously."

But the Government must fight to defend equal rights for homosexuals
closer to home tomorrow.

Ministers face a challenge from members of the House of Lords over moves
to lower the age of consent.

Baroness Young, the Conservative peer who has led opposition to the
plan, has said she will now accept the principle of equality in age, but
will try to outlaw anal sex for boys and girls under 18.

Peers will be given a free vote on the issue.

Since Labour came to office, the Lords have thrown out the Sexual Offences
(Amendment) Bill, which would lower the age of consent for homosexuals
from 18 to 16, three times despite overwhelming support in the House of
Commons.

But the Leader of the House of Lords, Baroness Jay, has insisted the
measure will become law "one way or the other" by the end of this Parliamentary
session. The Government intends to use the Parliament Act to force through
the Bill, even if it is rejected again by peers.

However, the structure and the development of the storyline open up questions on the
balance and even treatment of the issues by this writer. It is the choice of spokes
persons in reporting this story that exposes the question of balance. Most of the
sources quoted in the text are British lawmakers. They also all share view that
homosexuality should be decriminalised. However, the spokespersons or local
sources were not directly quoted in the story. It was only stated in lines 1 to 5 that
Caribbean territories would be angry at the proposed legalisation and that this has
been a year-long row.
The writer here makes an informed assumption of an expected angry reaction of the local community, but fails to highlight the substance of their arguments in the text to contextualise the basis for their reaction. There was a need to make clear the essence of local ‘anger’. From the story, it is quoted that the islanders are hostile to the homosexual lifestyle. But it may be argued within the context of colonial relations, that local lawmakers on the island may also be angry at the imposition of a law that goes against the democratic wishes of the local community. But the main point is that the reader is not given the opportunity to determine how local people construct the decriminalisation of homosexuality.

Nevertheless, the main side of the story that is presented is that of the attempts of British lawmakers to encourage and conciliate through their efforts as quoted by Baroness Scotland to hold community meetings and conversations with local stakeholders. However, in spite of these efforts as noted in line 17, the islanders still refused to enact the law. Interestingly, the grounds of their refusal, or the bases for their unreasonableness, in spite of conciliatory attempts were not made clear by Baroness Scotland nor the writer. They were only reported being hostile by an opposing party to their views. In this regard the views of the locals were not legitimated, if only by their absence.

The news story values of balance required this exploration of the nature of the local objections or else there is the risk of representing them as intractable and bigoted in terms of how the story outlines and expresses opposing views. For example, the writer follows from Baroness Scotland’s quotes to present the support of the Liberal MP, Jenny Tonge who noted that the locals had a ‘chance to act’, that is to comply with the British ruling. This is immediately followed by a quote from a gay rights activist Angela Mason, who welcomes the imposition of the law on the basis that ‘equality before the law is a basic human right’ (lines 22-30).

These quotes condemn the stance of the locals and are therefore legitimated in their absence to voice their defence. The issues of engagement with locals, the opportunity given them to comply to that law and the essential ‘truth’ of the human rights position being advocated all construct and organise the voice of those promoting
decriminalisation. It may be concluded that the structure of the story in terms of the choice of spokespersons and the nature of their comments in criticising the response of the local islanders suggest a bias of representation. This may not be overtly intended, but it implicit by reason of the absence of the voices of the islanders in this argument. This story therefore ignores the issue of the clash of values or opposing opinions in reporting and constructing the story.

Notably, in line 31 towards the end of the story, the writer records the view of Baroness Young who expresses her opposition to the lowering of age of consent for homosexuals. Within the context of this analysis, this may be interpreted as the writer highlighting only elite spokespersons or those located in Britain who are enabled to voice their opposition. This begs the question as to why local opposition voices were not recognised or privileged in this report.

It may be questioned how this subject of the row between local islanders and the British lawmakers relate to the formation of destination images. Essentially, the impression is likely in light of the reasoned accounts of the chosen spokespersons to present the islands as backward or even human rights violators. Such violations of human rights have been used as platforms to blacklist countries that are alleged to commit such offences. These negative organic images can spill over into the travel market and influence consumers' perspectives of these destinations. But more importantly, this article underscores the representational and signifying practices of the news media of the Caribbean. The approach is to deny share of voice, to fail to recognise, legitimate or to even explore the point of view of local people. The tendency therefore is to privilege the voice of elite countries, where their views of events and occurrence are presented as definitive and total.

While the interpretation presented in this analysis is by no means the only approach to interpret or read these representations of Caribbean countries in the UK national press, it underscores how a postcolonial critique may expose the assumptions of political marginality and peripherality in the representation of these nations. These representations form the organic images of these countries and they highlight the relevance and importance of interrogating and challenging these normative practices.
of seeing and reporting the Caribbean and other developing countries in the British news media.

10.8 Crime Reporting – the conflict position

Like political stories on the Caribbean, stories on crime are usually featured on the prominent pages of all of the Sunday newspapers. These stories along with travel advisories usually create nightmares for public relations and destination marketing managers. However there were relatively few stories that featured stories on crime taking place in the Caribbean or those perpetrated against Caribbean nationals. These types of stories as well as those that present bare factual accounts of crime were rare in the sample. However these crime stories appeared less damaging in terms of the organic images of Caribbean destinations than those on crime against tourists or those that made wider associations of Caribbean criminal activity that pose a threat to the UK. In the article below, Jamaican Yardie gang activity in the UK is presented as a threat to UK security. This story is also a hard news story that is aimed at presenting factual information rather than persuading readers on a point of view.

POLICE TAKE YARDIE BATTLE TO JAMAICA
Published: 05/03/2000
Section: News of the World
Author: TIM LUCKETT, Crime Correspondent

1 BRITISH police are to station an officer in Jamaica in a bid to stem a string of Yardie-related murders in North London. Metropolitan detectives hope that by basing a man in the island’s capital Kingston, drug gang members will know they are being watched and think twice about flying over here. There were at least 24 Yardie-linked murders in London last year. A total of 26 people have been charged in connection with 17 of them. Part of the problem is Britain’s slack visa regulations which Yardies manipulate to bring their own brand of terror to our streets. Detective Chief Inspector Steve Kupis, who has just returned from a fact-finding mission to the Caribbean resort, said: "Much of the violence has its roots among violent criminals travelling from Jamaica."

2 The island has long been a clearing house for Colombian drug cartels moving cocaine. Mr Kupis said: "Relatively small amounts of cocaine from Jamaica get washed up into crack cocaine which leads to violence. Many shootings have occurred as a result of drug wars and you end up with fortified crack houses."

With their alleged arsenal of marijuana and cocaine, Yardie gangs are presented in this story as invasive, threatening and menacing, so that as the headline declares the fight has to be taken to enemy territory by placing Scotland Yard policemen in
Jamaica. This notion of a threat to national borders appears damaging as it invokes war imagery of a ‘battle’. This type of representation is inimical to the promotion of travel to the country and this is further reinforced when the writer highlights the holiday image of the destination by describing it in line 9 as the ‘Caribbean resort’. By making this association with violent Yardie gangs and ‘resort’, the holiday image of Jamaica is further undermined.

The positioning of the root cause of the violence being presented here as located outside of the North London community suggests that the resolution may be in imposing stricter immigration policing and the posting of Scotland Yard policemen in Jamaica. In essence, this positioning suggests that there are no antecedents in these communities that may have engendered this problem. This was even verified by the fact-finding mission to Jamaica that deduced that travel of violent criminals to the UK was predominantly the reason for the violence. The subtext is therefore that illegal immigration is a security risk that is such that it constitutes a war that must be waged overseas in enemy territory.

In line 11, the story line continues to build the case of Jamaica’s violent crime activity by making the point that the island has long been a transhipment point for Columbian drug cartels. This statement is not attributed to the police spokesperson, but is stated by the writer as a fact. The point to note is that the writer interjects this link himself in order to show how Yardie gangs are linked to cocaine trafficking and to emphasise how much the island needs policing and hence rationalises the deployment of British police to address the problem. The significance of this representation of crime is how it portrays the incapacity of the national government to police the country and deal with Yardie violence. More importantly, it is how the problem is portrayed as a crisis that can only be solved by exogenous means, that is, UK policing extended to the island.

As a hard news story, there is no evidence of an attempt to persuade on a particular point of view and so the story mainly comes across as a factual piece of reporting. However, by reducing the complexity of the network of international drug activity, the writer is able to present the solution to the problem as stricter border policing even if this has to be extended to Jamaica. More significantly this emphasises the conflict
position that is accentuated by the notion of the vulnerability of British borders and hence to need to engage in a battle to resolve this deadly conflict.

The tendency to use incidents of crime to introduce other agendas or to extend the implications in terms of wider social issues, represent the real damaging effects of crime stories. This occurs as the crime and its proposed effects are enlarged and then follow more complex narrative story-lines that intensifies the negative image of the destination. Therefore stories on crimes against tourists may be even more damaging for destinations as they not only put the local industry in the spotlight, but can also snowball into an opportunity to recount other incidents as well as social problems being experienced by the destination.

The extract below shows how the writer shifts the story on the murder of a British story to construct a more disturbing picture of a destination in a period of decline as a tourist paradise (See full text of this story in Appendix 11). The story leads with the Bahamian Prime Minister reassuring the world of the warmth and kindness of Bahamians in spite of the murder. The writer highlights the fact that the government’s attempt to restore confidence in the island ‘backfired’ when the Scotland Yard detective invited to the island to investigate the case was robbed at gunpoint in the island. This had the effect of contradicting the assertion of the Prime Minister on the warm hospitality of Bahamians.

Hubert Ingram, the prime minister, offered a pounds 120,000 reward for information leading to an arrest, saying: “This is a most difficult time for the Bahamas, a tourist destination, where we pride ourselves on extending warmth and kindness.” He also called in Scotland Yard to assist the local police and to help to restore confidence in Paradise Island and the 700 other islands of the Bahamian archipelago. That move backfired when the detective superintendent sent from London was robbed at gunpoint within hours of stepping off the aircraft, and he returned home without playing any part in the investigation. Paradise Island has been transformed from the tranquil isle where William Randolph Hearst, the American newspaper magnate, and the Shah of Iran once had palatial homes, and is now crammed with high-rise hotels and casinos (Sunday Telegraph – 23/01/00).

Here the writer undermines the authority and veracity of the most elite source of information on the island by highlighting contradictory evidence. It may be argued that this is consistent with acceptable news values to expose the inconsistencies in such statements made by officials. Indeed, this is part of the overall investigative nature of news reporting. But it is also apparent that the writer had another intent.
when he moves from the objective reporting mode to introduce his own opinion and point of view to enlarge his argument on the decline of the destination as a ‘Paradise Isle’. This is shown in his statement that Paradise Island has been changed from a ‘tranquil isle’ for the rich and famous to a resort ‘crammed with high-rise hotels and casinos’. This point of view has no direct bearing on the preceding discussion of the murder of the tourist or of the failure of the local authorities in dealing with the public relations fallout of the crime. The writer therefore extends beyond the facts of the story and makes a wider link to the rise of mass tourism on the island. He therefore creates the impression that the declension of the destination is linked to mass tourism which accounts for the rise of crime on the island.

The tendency to use incidents of crime to introduce other agendas or to extend the implications in terms of wider social issues, represent the real damaging effects of crime stories for tourist destinations. These types of representations are insidious as they introduce the point of view of the reporter in ostensibly hard news, objective stories. This has the outcome of infusing organic images with the opinions of the reporters whose readers may not readily identify the hidden persuasive strategies in the report.

10.9 Reggae rhythms – the celebratory position
The culture of the Caribbean is a distinct area where the region is affirmed and celebrated. As the content analysis finding show, the region’s culture was the most frequently mentioned topic in the news story category. Apart from sports, the indigenous musical forms of reggae and calypso are usually featured as unique and also as an area of international achievement and emulation. This is represented in the article below where the cultural contribution of reggae is highlighted (See Appendix 12 for full article).

Getting back to their roots
[7GV Edition]
Sunday Times
London (UK)
Aug 13, 2000
Culturally speaking, reggae and its accompanying musical baggage are Jamaica's great gift to the world. Among the island peoples of the West Indies, only the Cubans and the Trinidadians have come close to the export achievements notched up by the pop musicians and producers of post-independence Jamaica. Nobody outside America has done more to influence not just what we listen to, but the way we listen to it.

In Bob Marley the island spawned a performer every bit as charismatic as Bob Dylan or John Lennon and, next to Michael Jackson, the only truly identifiable but no less important are the many innovations in sound recording and reproduction first devised in makeshift studios or outdoor discos in Kingston, and since adopted all over the world. Few of the young clubbers who dance all night to extended remixes of current chart hits are aware that this practice originated with a Jamaican DJ, Ruddy Redwood aka Mr Midnight and his Treasure Isle sound system, in 1967. Even fewer will know that it came about by accident, after the enterprising Redwood was supplied with a record of On the Beach, a big local tune by the Paragons to which the disc cutter had forgotten to add the vocal. He played it anyway, the crowd went wild, a style - initially known as a "version" - was born.

This article is a review of the book Bass Culture which chronicles the historical evolution of reggae music. The writer readily expresses his own views on the music when he declared in lines 1 to 5, that reggae music is "a gift to the world". He sets out to build on this main premise by highlighting the contribution that the music has made to other musical forms as well as to popular culture. He extols the extent of the influence of this music form in terms of its impact on the musical appreciation of western culture. In this treatment, the region is accorded world status in being able to produce its own musical icon, Bob Marley, comparable in status with Western musical giants such as Bob Dylan, John Lennon and Michael Jackson.

The headline for the article ‘Getting back to the roots’ illustrates the writer’s appreciation of the origins of reggae music which are now so integrated in popular music forms that it is not often recognised. By highlighting the specific contribution and influence of reggae music the writer is making a specific case for its unique contribution and achievement coming from its humble beginnings in ‘makeshift
studios and outdoor discos'. From their obscurity and positioning on the margins of the mainstream, these reggae pioneers are lauded for their innovation that promulgated them to the centre-stage of world music.

Here the writer strikes a celebratory tone in his representation of the origins of reggae music. He attributes the music with powerful effects that triumphed over the insignificance of its roots, so that the music is portrayed not just as another musical form, but as a discourse of achievement and overcoming adversity. Based on this representation of reggae music as emerging from outside the mainstream, it is endowed with a subversive appeal that also accounts for its potency and attraction in western popular culture. However, this celebratory position also resonates with Bhabha's notion of hybridity that suggests that the subaltern may be undermining the polarities and differences between cultures. This influence is particularly demonstrated in the area of popular culture that affirms and encourages the adoption of modes of cultural resistance (Fiske 1997; Hollinshead 1998).

In lines 16 to 19, the accidental 'birth' of 'version' and the powerful responses it evoked attests to an indigenous art form that is undeniably authentic. This is an attribute of the music that is valorised and lauded by the writer. In this respect, the reggae music is presented as 'cultural capital ' adding value and enrichment to Western culture. This stands in stark contrast to colonial discourse discussed earlier in this study that attributes no essential value to the Caribbean. It is likely that the prestige accorded to cultural expressions in Western societies may also explain why there is openness and appreciation of varied cultural forms. This discourse of popular culture therefore prescribes merit to the artistic fringe and celebrates, accepts and also appropriates reggae music.

These positive attributions are rich in symbolic meanings that are beneficial for the destination. However, the benefits of these positive images may appear to be limited to those segments of the market that are interested in culture. However, even beyond its segmental appeal, the valorisation of the Caribbean's cultural indigenous expressions and exports works to build brand identity based on an attributed symbolic value of the Caribbean cultural experience. Symbolic or hedonistic value of the
region is achieved when the image of the destination is represented as more than a collection of tourist product attributes but is also culturally potent and pleasurable.

In this analysis, the news media image of the Caribbean has been classified in terms of discursive positions described as compliant, conflict and celebratory. These are not been proposed as definitive of all news media images of the region, but it is being suggested that they reflect a common news culture that is maintained across the various segments of national newspapers in the UK (Allan 1999). These mediated images operate at the organic level of image formation and have been reviewed in terms of their implications for the formation of organic images of Caribbean destinations in the UK press.

The compliant discourse position exposes the dominance of colonial tropes in a post-colonial world and reinforces the need for an ongoing agenda to interrogate and challenge established news values in terms of representations of the region. The conflict position also indicates the tendency of represent nations as threats to the security and the integrity of civil society in the West. The celebratory position relates to representations that are inflected with the perspectives of the subaltern and is shown to be increasingly valued and appreciated within Western popular culture.

10.10 Explaining the rhetorical structure of news stories in relation to organic images

The crux of the various discursive stances outlined above, that is the compliant, conflict and celebratory positions are that they reflect some level of ascription dictated by the news values of the writers and the overall news culture in which they operate. It is instructive that even the most factual of news stories not only describe events but are also likely to convey some evaluation or perspective that directs the understanding of the event. This can often be detected in the type of language used in reporting the event whether there is a mainly factual approach of if there is some evaluation that also occurs. The following article from the News of the World on June 14, 2000 shows the writer was not just reporting an incident of a marijuana find:

**DOPEY BUNCH**

*JAMAICAN drug smugglers slipped up when they stuffed*
£10,000 of cannabis in a banana crate—it was discovered by a delivery driver overpowered by the pong on his rounds in Bideford, Devon.

Here the writer mocks the drug smugglers in reporting the incident. The satirical edge is conveyed in the headline and in this one sentence story a powerful impression is conveyed of the silliness of these Jamaican drug smugglers.

In this next extract the writer goes for an emotive angle in reporting on drug smuggling activities in St. Kitts & Nevis

**THE owner of the tropical hideaway where Princess Diana escaped from her marriage break-up is selling up amid fears over drug cartels and a rise in violent crime. (Mail on Sunday, 27.02.00:17).**

The memory of Princess Diana is invoked to accentuate loss, not only of the princess as a popular celebrity icon, but to also reinforce the impression of Paradise lost and to establish a context of relevance and proximity in establishing the newsworthiness of the story. This tendency for snowballing as mentioned earlier or the need to make references to wider issues beyond the local event, especially by highlighting the destination’s touristic image is common discursive strategy that often exposes the persuasive agenda of the writer. Ehemann’s (1977) indicated that the ‘evaluation terminology’ of news stories are able to ‘sway the reader towards a particular sort of evaluation and conclusion’ about a destination.

This discussion on the use of evaluative language and on the extent to which the writer introduces a value judgement, shows how organic images may have persuasive effects on readers. Even though they may appear more credible to consumers and appear objective and balanced, they are also constructions based on codes of newsworthiness and significance and informed by dominant ideological discourses (Allan, 1999:63).

**PART III - A synthesis of the findings**

The preceding discussion of the findings of the content analysis and discourse analysis presented the outcomes of this study with regard to the overall research goals to conduct a quantitative and qualitative assessment of the image of the Caribbean in
the UK national press. It is necessary however, to bring together the various elements and levels of this investigation in order to clarify their saliency with respect to this study’s overall research goals and objectives. Essentially this study sought to identify and to analyse mediated images of the Caribbean in order to facilitate an understanding of how they relate to consumer responses. While the content analysis yielded information that presented an overall pattern of the image constructs, the discourse analysis explicated how these meanings were constructed in the texts.

**10.11 Key findings on the nature of destination image constructs**

The overall picture of image constructs that have emerged from the content analysis shows that there are constructs that are more dominant and typical in terms of defining the holiday experience. The findings of both the content and discourse analysis highlight the importance of landscape constructs in defining the Caribbean holiday experience. Coastal, scenic and colourful images of paradise in pristine, tropical landscapes were essentialised as the main domains of engaging, appreciating and experiencing these destinations. Physical, visual and tangible features of the destination were therefore constructed as the central components of the destination image formation process and the context for the holiday experience.

A key finding of the content analysis in terms of the attribute image constructs showed that psychological holistic images were less represented in the sample than functional holistic images. Discourse analysis also reinforced these findings by revealing that functional images were mostly denotative and lacking in symbolic meaning compared with holistic images.

Etchner and Richie basically established a distinction between functional and holistic psychological image constructs but they did not theorise on the implications of their relative significance in the image formation process and the subsequent impressions of the destination based on their differences. However, it is being argued that that the findings of this study suggest that the dominance or prevalence of functional attribute imagery works to reduce destination distinctiveness and appeal. The generic nature of such types of representations is likely to promote a desire to travel but they operate at the low involvement level and do not appear to be associated with symbolic or augmented value appeals as psychological or holistic image constructs.
It is worthwhile to again quote Poiesz (1989: 461) here to clarify this argument. He makes the case that marketing practice has now established that

...brand positioning cannot take place on the basis of intrinsic, functional product characteristics. Instead, brand positioning should be based (more) upon subjective, attributed characteristics, thus taking into account symbolic and intangible aspects.

It is not being suggested that functional destination attributes are not important in image formation, but the supposition presented here is that the pervasiveness of such mediated representations of destinations and the holiday experience tend to be limiting and constricting, thus reducing the possibilities for distinctiveness and competitiveness among destinations.

The almost universal invocation of colonial tropes in the ontology of both travel and news narratives indicate the one-dimensional route in mediated representations of the Caribbean. As the discourse analysis showed, colonial tropes and practices of ‘Othering’ and accentuating ‘difference’ remain fundamental to the meanings and rationale of seeing the Caribbean and the travel experience in the region. This study proposes that this epistemology of the Caribbean may be undermining competitiveness and reducing the chances of enlarging the scope and range of holiday experiences and destination appeal in the marketplace. Of course it suits prevailing travel interests to maintain this epistemology, as it provides stereotypical credence and continues to generate and stimulate a steady demand for travel characterised by low involvement behaviour in the marketplace. It is therefore difficult for destinations to challenge or contest the economic basis for representations that convincingly typify ‘what the consumer wants and needs’ (Ateljevic, Doorne 2002). This economic logic provides the basis to legitimise and naturalise the current epistemology that is dominantly purveyed in the media by way of news and popular culture as well as in promotional and marketing communication messages.

The question however arises of the type of images and how they are to be generated in terms of challenging existing representations and images. If the dominant paradigm of sun, sand, sea and sex images are limiting, what are the types of representations
that will liberate yet continue to sustain the tourism industry in the region? The findings of this study have indicated that the domain of culture and local folkways open up avenues for the revaluation and re-textualisation of Caribbean destinations and the holiday experience. These image constructs were shown to offer the means to build symbolic value and meaning based on its influence and effect in shaping public perception, lifestyle and tastes. It is within this sphere of influence of 'creolisation' and 'indigenisation' that alternative epistemologies of the region may be engendered and dispersed (Sheller 2003:190).

These seeds of subaltern resistance are likely to gain legitimacy within the locus of popular culture that is open to resistant forms of identities and expressions as suggested by Fiske who contends that popular culture is a site of 'resistance for subordinated and disempowered peoples who challenge and conflict with the 'dominant, hegemonic' discourses'. Neither is this subaltern resistance typified only by the stark counter travel writing genre demonstrated by Jamaica Kincaid's jeremiad in her novel A Small Place that chastises the legacy of oppression and mastery that is assumed in the tourist gaze. On the other hand is not an ahistorical stance that negates the colonial past of oppression, however, it a repositioning and revaluation of the what this past means for the present and future development of the region that presents a liberating alternative to discourses and representations of difference. In his postcolonial critique on the political and cultural identity of the Caribbean, Vinay Lal (2002) demonstrates this stance of subaltern resistance in his construction and reinvention of the region that incorporates the realities of colonial history but is not circumscribed and limited by these antecedents.

Thinking of the Caribbean as a civilisation offers a number of possibilities for an emancipatory politics that may otherwise be barred, and allows us to envision a unique space.., a Caribbean civilisation suggests a way of contending with a legacy of colonialism, suffering, and oppressive knowledge systems that leaves the victims of history not disempowered, as is presently the case with most formerly colonised peoples, but as possessed of the capacity to shape a future that is not simply a version of the contemporary West. The Caribbean then, is not a constellation of land masses surrounded.. by the sea, the not-empty space in the middle of the doughnut, but flowways within waterways, a sea within an ocean...In rupturing isolation and insulaion, in pointing at the commonality of processes, as well as the more profound linkages and possible constructions, a Caribbean civilisation furnishes a way of embracing pluralism, of recognising racial, ethnic, linguistic and class diversity without submitting to debilitating fragmentation.
In this rendition of the historical and cultural identity of the region, the normative codes of difference are transgressed. This imaginary offers the invitation to a rediscovery of the Caribbean that is both empowering to locals and offers numerous possibilities for fulfilling holiday experiences and encounters.

CONCLUSION
This discourse analysis was conducted within the critical framework of postcolonial studies that challenges and interrogates the norms and practices of Western representations of the ‘Other’. The outcomes of the analysis show how the Caribbean’s image was constructed both in terms of the holiday experiences offered and also as independent nations and overseas territories. In this chapter it was shown how newspaper media practices represent Caribbean destinations in terms of preferred holiday experiences. These representations were shown to engage dominant discourses that prescribe notions of the ideal holiday experience. The peripherality and marginality of Caribbean nations were the dominant discourses that defined their representations in wider social and political contexts in the news stories. However it was found that the culture of the region emerged as representing symbolic value in news narratives. Finally, the study proposed a critical model, the tourism destination image media matrix, that may be applied to clarify how various image types, that is functional, enactive, holistic and affective imagery may relate to consumer practices and behaviour. It points to how authorial intent to persuade may be inferred from these textual images, and how they may engage readers at high or low involvement levels based on how these images may be have been perceived by readers. Within this framework the model represents an attempt to establish a link from text to mind based on the rhetorical construction of tourism destination images.
CHAPTER 11

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

...an old map of the islands does not look like a cartography of imagined paradises, but like what they were in historical reality: a succession of crusted scabs with the curve of the archipelago a still-healing welt. No metaphor is too ugly for the hatred and cruelty the West Indies endured; yet their light is paradisal, their harbours and shielding hills, their flowering trees and windy savannas Edenic...No historical collection acknowledges the fact that the beauty of the Caribbean islands could have helped the slave survive, whenever these intervals, like the light through rain clouds over a sea of sugar cane, or shadows moving over the Jamaican mountains, fell, and in their serenity, exacted some strength, because what is surely another beauty is the strength, the endurance of the survivor.


INTRODUCTION

The various research strands of this study are brought together in this chapter in terms of the findings and the research goals of the enquiry. It reviews the outcomes of this examination on the image of the Caribbean in the UK press and shows the areas where this study has contributed to the body of knowledge on tourism destination image (TDI). It also reaffirms the basis for the proposed tourism destination image matrix on destination image that links various types of textual images with authorial intention and consumer responses. This discussion advocates the utility of textual analysis as a methodological approach in destination image studies and suggests how this may be extended in future research. The recommendations proposed in this chapter detail the specific research issues that have arisen from the processes and outcomes of this study, both in relation to methodological enquiry and the subject area of tourism destination image. Each of the proposed recommendation is critically discussed in terms of agency, priority and relevance for the development of tourism as a field of study as well as for marketing practice within the Caribbean tourism industry.
11.1 The research agenda

The purpose of the study was to also determine how TDI constructs were presented in the newspaper texts and to identify key features of these messages as a basis to infer likely source intentions and receiver responses. The review of the literature indicated that TDI constructs were usually assessed by measuring the attributes of the destinations based on consumer perceptions. However two main studies by Ehemann (1977) and Dilley (1986) have investigated TDI based on textual analysis of newspaper articles and tourism brochures. Following this tradition of textual analysis, this study focussed on examining the constructs of Caribbean destinations presented in newspaper articles in the UK press.

In this research, both news articles and travel stories were analysed, using content analysis to determine the level and pattern of image constructs. As proposed by Echtner & Ritchie (1993), these constructs were measured in terms of their functional/physical and holistic/psychological attributes. Other textual features such as the persuasive content features of the texts were also measured in order to establish a basis to infer reader response. Discourse analysis was the other textual method that was used in order to clarify the meanings of these images and how these representations were constructed in the newspaper stories. The discursive examination was conducted with the framework of postcolonial critiques of Western representations of the ‘Other’ that interrogates the power/knowledge foundations of the practice of representations. This enquiry essentially sought to determine how images of the Caribbean destinations were constructed in terms of the holiday experience. It also examined the rhetorical strategies that shaped the discourse towards the presentation of preferred holiday experiences.

11.2 A summary of the findings

One of the more significant findings of the content analysis was that there were no significant differences in the level and type of image constructs across newspapers. Given the polarised nature of the newspaper market with segmented readerships and differentiated news epistemologies, it was expected that these differences would be reflected in the articles. However, it was apparent that for both news and travel stories, there were similar levels and types of representation across mass tabloids,
midmarket and quality broadsheet newspapers. This means that newspapers are not
differentiated in terms of news and travel representations of the Caribbean and that
destination image constructs are not differentiated across newspaper brands.

For tourism destination image constructs, the findings show that landscape image
constructs were predominantly used to define the holiday experience in comparison
with hotels or attractions which were featured as complementary and not as the focus
of the experience. Landscape images were also more dominant than those of local
peoples and holiday activities. As expected, coastal attributes were most mentioned
in stories reinforcing the stereotypical nature of these representations.

Overall, the physical/functional image constructs of the destinations were more
predominant in relation to the holistic/psychological constructs. This suggests that
these holiday experiences may have more direct appeal in terms of motivational pull
factors rather than push factors. As suggested by Crompton (1979), motivational push
factors may be more effective in soliciting consumer travel responses in favour of a
particular country brand, than pull factors that simply arouse the desire for travel. It
also suggests that stereotypical brand appeals of paradise and escape have been
reduced of symbolic resonance and is located more within the domain of the
physical/functional continuum than in terms of psychological constructs.

There was a slightly higher level of news stories than travel stories in the sample with
political and crime stories mostly featured in the prominent first four pages of the
newspapers. There was also a high level of stories on the culture of the region that
were predominantly positive representations. This suggests that culture may be an
area on which to build brand distinctiveness for the various destinations of the region.
The findings on the message styles of the articles show that the modes of address used
were mainly flexible. The use of both passive and active voices was balanced across
the sample. Nevertheless, the articles were mainly persuasive in terms of an indirect
call to action to readers to pursue the holiday experience conveyed.

Differentiated rhetorical strategies were identified in the language style of travel
stories. This study proposes a TDI media matrix as a heuristic to clarify the
relationship between message type, authorial intention and image type. These were
noted as relating to various authorial intentions and consumer responses at the high and low involvement levels. The TDI matrix infers that functional and enactive image types that were mostly descriptive and prescriptive, would be likely to engage the consumer at the low involvement level, while holistic and affective imagery that utilised more evaluative language would solicit more high elaboration/involvement responses.

Moreover, it was shown that news stories mainly used evaluative language rather than mere factual and descriptive language in their reportage. It was maintained that news stories were constructed in terms of news values based on notions of 'newsworthiness' that involved ascription and evaluation. Therefore although consumers may perceive these stories as objective and neutral, they are also inflected by the prevailing news culture that influences how these representations are portrayed. It was concluded that the evaluative language of organic images in news stories is a powerful medium in shaping the images and perceptions that consumers have of destinations. This finding extends and deepens Ehemann's (1977) investigation of the evaluation terminology used in the news media. It is suggested that the high level of evaluative language and elaborative codes styles employed by news stories may be more influential in the formation of distinctive impressions of the destination – whether negative or positive - than travel stories.

11.3 Limitations of the study
This study provides an analysis of the image of the Caribbean in newspaper articles that is delimited within a one-year period. As such, it offers a relatively static picture of these images. A longitudinal study would take into account the fluidity and changes in the pattern of destination images that may occur over a period of time. By only examining articles in the year 2000, it was not possible to determine whether these image constructs were relatively stable or constantly in flux. However, this study adequately provides a contemporary and 'slice of life' picture of the current images of the Caribbean as well as the representational practices of newspapers in their coverage of these countries.
The focus of this study was limited to the English speaking Caribbean nations. However, the region also comprises French, Dutch and Spanish speaking countries that were not examined. Although the nomenclature ‘Caribbean’ was used rather widely in this study, it must be noted that the exclusion of these other countries means that it was not possible to produce a fulsome picture of the image of all the countries of the region. The conclusions are therefore constrained to refer to the English speaking Caribbean as defined in the sample.

The analysis of media texts was conducted only on news stories excluding photographs. This limited the scope of the study to the language meanings of the texts. Photographs also tell stories and convey meaning. These visual images may be even more powerful than words in evoking particular responses. Since the visual image was not included in this analysis, it is possible that there were layers of meaning that have not been investigated in this study.

This study has concluded a theoretically based link between the message characteristics of news stories, the type of destination image construct and likely consumer responses. In other words, it has proposed that inferences can be made from messages to receivers based on the characteristics of the images presented in the travel story. However, this study did not establish a similar link for news stories since there was a lack of theoretical and empirical research to support inferences from messages to readers. This means that this study has not proposed likely consumer responses to mediated image constructs for news stories. The TDI media matrix conceptualised in this study is singularly applicable to travel stories or travel messages.

The TDI matrix is limited in accounting for all types of messages on destinations. It makes the assumption that travel stories and industry related travel stories for the most part are generally positive and are geared to stimulate travel. Neither does the TDI matrix explain how consumers respond to various negative images of the destination that may emerge from hard news stories. Furthermore, it does not clarify how differentiated image constructs, whether functional, holistic, enactive or affective, depicted as negative representations, relate to consumer decision to visit the destination or not. This is very crucial to understanding how some consumers still
continue to go the destinations that have sustained protracted negative hard news reporting in the media.

11.4 Contributions of this study to tourism research

The main contribution of this study is the establishment and the testing of a framework for the examination of mediated tourism destination images. It has integrated theories from media studies, cultural geography, cultural studies and consumer behaviour within the field of tourism marketing. As such, it offers a unique combination of a critical cultural examination and consumer oriented research based on the examination of media texts. It also directly contributes to an understanding of the symbolic consumption of travel in relation to consumer behaviour. In this regard a research agenda has been charted not only specifically for tourism destination image studies, but also in clarifying wider issues of the relationship of tourism and the media.

This study has also highlighted how destination image studies may facilitate research into the field of destination brand image. In this study culture emerged as a positive construct for both news and travel stories. The evaluative language used in texts was shown to be associated with differentiated, distinct destination images as opposed to the stereotypical, clichéd language of messages that utilised mainly descriptive and prescriptive language.

Previous models of destination image formation are Sender based and demonstrate how the source of the message relates to consumer responses (Dann 1996). Sender based models theorise that the source of the message influences the response of consumers. As such, the more credible the sender of the message, the more likely the consumer will respond positively to the message. Existing TDI models on destination image formation, therefore suggest that organic images that come from apparent non-biased sources are therefore more powerful than induced images from tourism related sources.

However, this study has presented another frame of reference for understanding destination image by focussing on message characteristics. As indicated by the
proposed TDI media matrix, it has been proposed that destination images may also be
differentiated textually in terms of their rhetorical organisation and inferred reader
responses. This study has shown how message characteristics are also important in
defining and understanding how destination images may relate to particular responses.
The main contribution of this study is in clarifying a Message based model to explain
destination image formation. It has shown that destination image constructs may be
differentiated textually and that these constructs can be measured quantitatively and
analysed qualitatively for their discursive meanings. It has also demonstrated with the
TDI matrix how these differentiated constructs can be used to determine the level of
brand identity depicted of the destination, and how this relates to high or low
involvement responses from consumers.

Echtner & Ritchie’s (1993) work on TDI identified image constructs as differentiated,
varied in quality and characteristics. However, they did not clarify how these
differences related to likely consumer choices. They also did not account for how
differentiated images contribute to the brand identity of a destination. Beyond
locating this gap in the literature, this study also contributes to the understanding of
TDI constructs. This is achieved by proposing the nature of the representation or the
type of image constructs, may be related to consumer responses in producing a brand
identity and in invoking high or low involvement behaviour in the choice of a
vacation destination

This study makes a specific contribution to the understanding of the influence of
media messages in destination image formation. While extant research on TDI
usually include the media as a variable in the operationalisation of research on
destination image formation, still, there have been no clear theoretical positioning on
how these ‘media effects’ work in terms of held images and influence on buying
behaviour. However, it must be re-emphasised that in this study, the conclusions
made as to likely media influence is limited to the remit of textual media messages
and travel stories in particular. It does not extend these conclusions to other forms of
mediated messages in the media such as news stories or the ‘powerful’ visual media
such as photographs and television.
This study has established the grounds for the inclusion of mediated messages in the study of TDI. As argued in the review of the literature conducted earlier in this study, the direction of studies in this area has been predominantly engaged in determining the cognitive images of destinations held by consumers. These images are usually measured and analysed in order to establish correlation between destinations attributes and individual characteristics so as to determine target markets that would be likely to choose the destination or to establish those attributes that contribute most to positive images of the destination. However, such studies did not gauge or assess the influence of the media in terms of the powerful messages they convey of tourist destinations in their routine practices.

The complexity of the media is such that is difficult to point out the direct and singular effects of the media in terms of the cognitive processing of consumers. But by examining how these images are mediated and constructed textually, this study has clarified how media images relate to consumer responses. Consequently it is necessary for studies on TDI to include mediated messages more significantly in studies in this subject area. Consumer based studies in tracking and measuring the cognitive image constructs will always be required, but as shown in this study, invaluable insights may be also gained from the study of media messages in destination image formation.

**Part 11 - Recommendations for future research**

11.5 The case for academic research on media influence and tourism destination images

While this study has demonstrated the role of mediated messages in image formation, it has also pointed to the need to expand the conceptualisation of TDI beyond cognitive measurements of image attributes. It has been shown that the study of media representation of destinations is also important in understanding how destination images are formed and become incorporated into stereotypical images of holiday destinations and the experiences they offer. Therefore, the foremost research imperative that emerges from this study is:-
1. To widen the scope of TDI studies to incorporate studies of representational practices relating to tourism in order to contribute to an understanding of the role of the media and popular culture in shaping perception and knowledge of destinations

This recommendation therefore encourages more enquiries that focus on social artefacts such as media messages that contribute to the understanding or the creation of destination images. As noted earlier, the examination of how messages are constructed exposes how destination images are valorised. The ascription of value in terms of the destination attributes, the assumptions and normative practices that are used in their representations are important in understanding how knowledge and perceptions of destinations are created, produced and incorporated. Significantly, this kind of enquiry exposes the extent to which popular stereotypes of destinations contribute to their competitiveness or brand identity. Equally important is that this research may assist marketers in identifying strategies to challenge and contest stereotypes that may not be in the interest of their destination.

This study focussed on articles on the press, but that is just one aspect of the media landscape. However studies of the representation practices of other media such as television and radio programmes and the Internet which are also powerful and pervasive sources of consumer information is required. This is vital in understanding the relative effectiveness of various media with regard to the mediation of the holiday experience. Such information would be invaluable for destination marketers who have to negotiate the increasingly complex media landscape and use those media that maximise their budget spend.

However, there are other means of researching the representational practices in tourism by using other qualitative methods to clarify how destination images are produced. It is also possible to conduct phenomenological studies of the journals of various travel writers, detailing how they negotiate the same destination and how this relates to the outcome of the travel articles. Such an enquiry may record those elements of the experience that they include or exclude in the printed story, and so expose the common considerations that are used in construction of travel articles.
This study did not include the images of destinations presented by photographs. But they are a powerful means of media representations of destinations and the holiday experience and so it is important that they are studied. It is therefore a research imperative for TDI studies to address this area in the literature that is currently under theorised and lacking in empirical research. On another level, this study also highlighted the importance of colour imagery in the representation of landscapes. It was identified that there was a strong invocation of colour imagery in the travel articles on the Caribbean. The role of colour as image constructs and its importance in destination images and the holiday experience has not been addressed in the literature and is eminently in need of academic research in order to inform understanding of TDI.

Popular culture is also an important site for TDI studies apart from the mass media. Movie induced tourism and role of popular culture in creating distinct images of destinations are well documented in the tourism literature. This study found the representational practices of the culture of the Caribbean was prevalent, prominent and celebratory. This suggests that popular culture in an important variable in shaping images of destinations. This also implies that it has the power to influence how destinations are perceived and that may be why it is constantly appropriated to enhance the symbolic appeal of destinations by destination markets.

Popular culture also provides meaning for the symbolic consumption of travel for consumers who use it forge their own meanings of the destinations as well as holiday experiences. It is therefore important to continue to investigate how popular culture is incorporated into and feeds images of travel, destinations and holiday experiences. Countries are reshaped and moulded to conform to notions of preferred holiday experiences that are not static, but subjected to changes and shifts in cultural tastes and practice. Images are consequent to the evolution and ferment of the social and cultural discourses that shape lifestyle preferences and practices. It is therefore necessary to probe how images of destinations are reconfigured and constructed in terms of wider socio-cultural developments. This will inform studies into the symbolic consumption of travel in relation to consumer behaviour.
This study mainly focussed on organic images depicted in the mass media. However, an implied corollary of this study of organic media messages, is the examination of how induced images mediate the holiday experience. This may take the form of first identifying how these images are produced by focusing on the activities and the processes of public relations and advertising companies who are responsible for the management of the image of the destination. Advertising, public relations copy and promotional material on destinations also need to be subjected to systematic investigation to identify how message characteristics are constructed to produce desired effects. Consequent to this, the task would be to assess the message characteristics of these materials and then try to determine which type resulted in more defined brand identity and high or low involvement consumer responses.

11.5.1 Research imperative for TDI matrix
The central research aim of this study was to attempt to determine how mediated image constructs relate to consumer responses. In this respect, the TDI matrix was proposed as a theoretical model to clarify how varying image impacts may have various impacts on readers. Consumer based studies would be able to corroborate or refute these text based inferences. Empirical validation is critical in establishing the predictive value of the model. In order to verify the assumptions of the TDI matrix, the second recommendation of this study is:-

2. To test the theoretical assumptions of the TDI matrix of purported influences of mediated differentiated destination images on consumer responses.
An approach to testing the TDI matrix would be to run experimental tests. For example, experimental tests may be conducted with consumers desirous of a Caribbean vacation to determine whether texts featuring holistic and affective imagery encourage elaborative cognitive processing and a more clearly defined image of the destination in comparison with functional and enactive imagery that facilitate stereotypical images. This could be assessed in terms of whether consumers identify with, and show a preference for destinations that are represented in holistic and affective messages, than those that basically feature functional and enactive images. Repertory grid methods may also be applied using travel photographs to identify how differentiated images relate to distinct brand images and to determine if this heightens
their involvement in terms of the purchase of the holiday experience depicted the messages.

This study also recommends that more theoretical and empirical work be conducted to determine how news stories relate to organic images of destinations. This is important not only because they are perceived to be more credible by consumers but also because such an understanding is vital in exploring how mediated images are related to consumer perceptions. It is therefore important for the impact of news media images to be theorised in terms of their message characteristics and TDI.

This study identified that news stories tended to invoke the destination image of the Caribbean islands particularly in terms of how they were undermined by the events being related in the story. This implies that news stories that employ this discursive strategy may be more damaging in their effect than stories that do not make these kinds of associations. This finding already lays the foundation for theorising on the nature of mediated news images and how their discursive formations may relate to various inferences on reader perceptions of destinations. This has provided a basis for ongoing research on the influence of the media in destination image formation.

11.5.2 Interrogating existing epistemologies of Caribbean destinations

By examining the discursive formations of tourism destination images in the news media, this study has essentially embarked on the interrogation of representational and signifying practices related to tourism. This continues the tradition of critical cultural research within tourism that investigates how tourism shapes ways of seeing and experiencing tourism (Britton 1979; Crick 1996; Hollinshead 1999; Mellinger 1994; Morgan & Pritchard 1998).

This study has shown how conventional and stereotypical ways of representing and constructing Caribbean destinations may be undermining the competitiveness and the brand image of these destinations. By uncovering how stereotyping are produced and reproduced in texts, these assumptions of their legitimacy have been questioned. The study therefore recommends that there is a continuation of the a research agenda:-
3. To interrogate and challenge existing epistemologies of tourism in terms of their implications for enhancing the brand image and competitiveness of destinations in the region

Part of the process of interrogating epistemologies or paradigms that construct and represent the region, is the presentation of alternative ones. This study has begun this process by suggesting alternative paradigms and frameworks for representing the region by indicating that destination images should be evaluated in terms of their contribution to the creation of brand image. It has been suggested by this study that images should be examined in terms of how they differentiate and valorise Caribbean destinations and their holiday experience in terms of symbolic meaning. It is therefore necessary for ongoing research into how symbolic meanings may be ascribed and infused into existing images of destinations.

One of the key findings of this study is the predominance of landscape attributes in representing and defining the Caribbean holiday experience. Images of people and of activities were accorded a lower level of representation and significance in the articles. However, as suggested by the discourse analysis in this study, such representations may be traced to established ways of seeing and appreciating landscapes that hark back to imperial epistemologies of foreign lands. These assumptions and ontology of landscape representations must be contested in order to allow for the acceptance and appreciation of plural epistemologies in representations and experiences of holiday destinations. A continued programme of postcolonial critiques of tourism representations is therefore strongly advocated to facilitate this process of change and development for tourism in the Caribbean.

Research questions for future academic enquiries related to this strand of enquiry include

❖ How do existing images/epistemologies of destinations relate to their competitiveness?
❖ What are the alternative epistemologies that facilitate brand image formation?
❖ How do mass media images shape perceptions of destinations?
❖ How is popular culture appropriated and utilised in the formation of destinations images and holiday experiences
❖ Why is stereotyping typical in representing tourist destinations?
These research questions outline a programme for enquiries that interrogate existing epistemologies and signifying practices as well as presenting alternative ways of seeing and experiencing tourist destinations. These issues are important for regions such as the Caribbean that are highly reliant on tourism and hence to need to maintain competitive advantage in the global marketplace. But on a more general level, the question of alternative frameworks of experiencing destinations is critical to the sustaining the imaginary of travel and the creation of enlivened and dynamic representations of tourism destinations and the holiday experiences they offer.

11.6 Specific recommendations for tourism research on the Caribbean and for the marketing of these destinations

The preceding recommendations have mapped out a specific research agenda for expanding the study of TDI as well as the main strands of study on the influence of the media in tourism. Still, the findings of this study also have implications for ongoing academic research specifically related to the Caribbean arising from this study. However there are also practical recommendations that have been made to the Caribbean tourism industry for the novel marketing strategies that should be considered in order to enhance competitiveness.

This study focussed on the image of the Caribbean in the UK national press. But it is also useful for future research to examine the representations of non-Commonwealth countries in the UK press in order to deepen the analysis in this area. A similar analysis of the representational practices of the region in the press in the United States may provide interesting contrasts to this enquiry of the UK press. This would also be beneficial in providing further clarity on the similarities and differences in mediated images of the region in their major tourist generating markets. Furthermore, this would provide the information to clarify their relative competitiveness in the media. In order to achieve the following objectives, this study recommends immediate academic research:-

4. To compare and contrast signifying and representational practices of different Caribbean countries in their major markets of the UK and the US
The significance in conducting a comparative analysis of representation and images of the region in region’s major source markets, is to provide greater clarity for marketing strategies. By examining the signifying practices related to the representation of the Caribbean holiday experience, more sophisticated and strategic marketing campaigns can be devised that attempt to challenge, contest and reorient images that do not serve the long term interests of the destinations of the region.

One of the key findings of the content analysis of this study is that there were no major differences in the level and type of image constructs across newspapers. This finding came as surprise to this researcher given the distinct segmentation and readership divide of the UK press landscape. However, this finding has implications for the need for destination marketers to accentuate the differences in their advertising and promotional collateral for various market segments in the media. This may be beneficial in stimulating an awareness by the various newspaper brands on the need to recognise the importance of differentiating their travel media product in the similar manner in which they modify their news stories and other specialist product output according to their perceived needs of their target market. In light of this finding, this study recommends that destination marketers in the Caribbean refocus their marketing emphasis:

5. **To target various newspaper segments with differentiated brand images**

This recommendation does not mean that generic market images of destinations should become more complex or differentiated to account for various target groups. That is not what is being suggested here in this recommendation. Instead, this recommendation is specific to the medium of UK national newspapers where differentiated advertising and media messages from destinations may serve to promote brand identity and competitiveness.

Apart from the level of induced images in terms of above the line media collateral, it is also possible for destination marketers to influence the perspectives of travel writers in their representations of the destination experience. It is therefore important for destination marketers to take the lead in this regard by taking the initiative:-
6. To develop specific targeted pre-trip and on site information for travel writers to encourage more symbolic representations of the destination

The overall purpose of such targeted information specifically targeted for travel writers is to stimulate their reflection on their role in terms of their role in representing the destination. The aim of this information would be to reorient them to an understanding that how they construct the destination and the holiday experience is significant in shaping the nature of the demand for the destination. Travel writers tend to be aware of their readers' needs and of their own role in simulating the holiday experience in order to reduce the uncertainty of those who would travel to the destination (Seaton 1991).

It is therefore important for travel writers to be aware of their unique role as 'experts' in mediating the holiday experience. This means that they should have a keen awareness and understanding of how their ascription of value benefits and symbolic meaning of their stories may contribute the level of appreciation of readers for the destination and the holiday experiences on offer. Such awareness may lead to a reorientation of their seeing and experiencing foreign destinations so that stereotyping and cliché is not relied on as the accepted stock in trade of travel writing. Destination marketers could therefore facilitate dialogue with the production of these dedicated travel writers information and use them as a means of forging closer relations with the travel press.

Academic research should also be used to encourage reflexivity in the media on their news values and signifying practices in relation to developing countries. For example, the media should be made aware of how the lack of voice and space given to local spokespersons and how this relates to news values of balance and fairness and objectivity.

11.6.1 Specific recommendations for marketing and media relations practices in the Caribbean

It is important for destination marketers in the Caribbean to also take the lead in trying to influence their travel partners on the merits of promoting new epistemologies of the region. This case however must be made in terms of presenting the profitability and long-term benefits of these approaches. Those travel intermediaries, trans
national tour operators who have a major stake in the industry of Caribbean must be engaged in an ongoing dialogue on the value of updating and refreshing images of destinations other than relying on the stereotypical images in generating market flows. One of the arguments that may be useful in presenting this case to tour operators is the notion of dynamism of popular culture and how keeping apace with the changing trends reflected in this area may be beneficial to destinations. This study therefore recommends that it is important for Caribbean destination marketers to take the initiative:

7. **To explore the merits of advertising and promotional programme based on positive and relevant features of popular culture to create new epistemologies of Caribbean destinations**

The high cost of advertising spend and media penetration has been a major deterrent to most destinations in undertaking risky changes in advertising strategies in the media. The challenge of introducing innovation is that it may be difficult to assure stakeholders of going beyond the 'tried and true' in destination marketing. However, there is a priority for destination marketers to explore these areas, as marketing rivalries become more frenetic, and governments demand more of advertising spend in shining through the media clutter and achieving maximum effect in the market. There is no way to underplay the risk that is involved in moving away from established norms of representations. Therefore, while exploration and the engagement of stakeholders is a priority, implementation should be gradual and developed in such a way to solicit the support and consensus of the industry.

There is no question that the international media has a role in the fortunes of destinations. Caribbean destinations are particularly vulnerable since current news values in major markets do not afford them privileges of voice as the given to elite nations. Consequently, it is difficult for Caribbean destinations to introduce their perspective on events and incidents that relate to the region. Their marginality of position is emphasised and intensified in the media in terms of their representational practices. It has also been shown in this study that even hard news reporting on the region commonly refer to the TDI images of the Caribbean to accentuate the effect of their negative reports on the region. In acknowledgement of the key role of the media
and in order to redress issues of lack of voice, this study recommends that it is now critical for destination marketers:-

8. To develop and maintain strategic links with local and international news media in an attempt to redress lack of voice and the tendency of undermining TDI images in negative news stories

Caribbean destinations have to intensify and become even more proactive with their engagement with the media. Tourism destination markets cannot wait for a negative event to occur to keep the media updated on contact numbers and ways to access key informants from the destination. Press trips targeting editors of national newspapers have to be more than just familiarisation on destination products. These organised trips should also include opportunities for face-to-face meetings with top officials who will provide the crucial media ‘sound bite’ in the event of a crisis or even in routine reporting of negative stories. Such trips should also be an occasion to encourage travel writers to reflect on their current representational practices.

For the Caribbean, regional marketing tourism such as the Caribbean Tourism Organisation and the Caribbean Hotel Association may facilitate the hosting of dedicated media fora involving travel journalists, bureau chiefs and news reporters to explore these issues. These organisations should also commission studies such as undertaken in this thesis that utilise content analysis and discourse analysis to provide empirical evidence of these representational practices that could be used to encourage the reflection of the media on their own practices.

It would be naïve though, for destination marketers to ignore the reality that current media practices prioritise negative news, reinforce stereotypes and in the case of the Caribbean, are sensitive to the paradise image of these destinations as a discursive strategy to heighten the news values of the item. In the cut and thrust of news production it is unlikely that the cultivated collegiality between reporters and the destination officials will be sustained. Nevertheless, the destination can employ below the line media relations strategies that may counteract representational strategies such as snowballing, where the writer links past negative stories to contextualise a current negative stories. The main approach is to attempt to provide
resolution to events, by following up with press releases on events, even when their saliency may have passed in terms of coverage. These press releases should emphasise the work that has been done locally, show how the matter is being managed and controlled by local operatives in order to provide closure. In this regard, it may hinder any attempt to link disparate events to convey a picture of an ongoing problem or a cumulative record of incidents which show a destination in decline or losing control of their stability and image as a preferred tourist destination.

11.7 A Caribbean coda
At the end of the 19th century, the Colonial Secretary Joseph Chamberlain described the Caribbean as the ‘British empire’s darkest slum’1. There are few who would disagree that as tourism destinations, the Caribbean has long shaken off this ignominious past to become generally perceived as a region of fantasy, pleasure and satisfying holiday experiences. Tourism has earned international renown for the Caribbean as one of the world’s premier tourist destinations. The image of the countries of the region is therefore critical for the continued growth and prosperity of the tourist industry on which the economies of many of these countries depend.

This study maintains that in spite of the current successes of the Caribbean tourism industry, there is an urgent imperative for the Caribbean to once again re-imagine the region in order to enhance competitiveness. It has been shown that mediated images of the region in the UK national press reveal traditional, stereotypical images of the region that may be undermining premium brand distinctiveness of the regions in general, and of particular destinations.

11.8 Postscript
Destinations are the vanguard of the travel industry, they anchor the holiday experience, accommodating the in situ delivery of the vacation as well as providing functional, symbolic and hedonistic value for the consumer. In this respect, destination images are the mainstay, the vital force that energises and sustains the

---

1 Quoted in Richardson, Bonham C. (1992b) 'Depression Riots ad the Calling of the 1897 West Indian Commission' *New West India Guide* 66:3-4 pp 176.
tourism industry. This study has highlighted the importance and influence of TDI on consumer perceptions, attitudes and responses. More significantly it has shown that how these images are mediated are also crucial in perceptions, meanings and appreciation of the holiday experiences of destinations.

CONCLUSION

This study examined the dynamics and the meanings of these images of the Caribbean in the UK press and suggested that destination managers in the region need to build and reinforce the symbolic and brand value of these destinations in order to ensure their competitive advantage in the global marketplace. It was proposed that stereotypical sun, sand and sea representations of the region may be limiting the scope and range of holiday opportunities, and in this turn, may be contributing to an overall devaluation of the Caribbean holiday experience.

This study has shown that traditional epistemologies of Caribbean destinations appear to diminish the effectual symbolic resonance of destination images that enhance brand identity and competitiveness. It has been also suggested in this study that plural paradigms of representations that offer new ways of experiencing travel and holiday destinations are required to facilitate tourism growth consistent with the development goals of destinations such as the Caribbean that rely on tourism. This study therefore advocates ongoing consumer based research on image formation linked to critical investigations into the dynamics of popular cultural production and consumption. As a focal point of cultural production, circulation and dissemination, the media, particularly the messages and images that they convey of holiday destinations and experiences must be on the agenda of ongoing studies and research on destination marketing, management and development.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Ahuvia, A. (2001) ‘Traditional, Interpretative and Reception based content analysis: Improving the ability of content analysis to address issues of pragmatic and theoretical concern’. *Social Indicators Research* 52, (2) 139-172.


311


Gauntlett, David. (2002) 'Ten things wrong with the 'effects model'. [On-line article]. Available at http://www.theory.org.uk/effects.htm[Date of access:08/09/02].


Hollinshead, K. and Jamal, T.B. (2001) 'Delving into Discourse: Excavating the inbuilt power-logic(s) of Tourism'. *Tourism Analysis* 6, (1) 63-73.


337


Squire, S. (1994) 'Accounting for cultural meanings: the interface between geography and tourism studies re-examined'. *Progress in Human Geography* 18, (1) 1-16.


Waitt, G. (1999) 'Naturalizing the 'primitive': a critique of marketing Australia's indigenous peoples as 'hunter-gatherers''. *Tourism Geographies* 1, (2) 142-163.


Overview
This codebook gives specific instructions on coding newspapers articles. The articles are being coded to determine representations and images of the selected Caribbean destinations. It also provides definitions of all the categories and variables to be coded.

General Instructions
First read through each article before starting to code. Use pencils only when coding the articles. Ensure that you erase any changes so that your choices are clear. Always refer to this code book when coding each article. You are NOT to consult the other coder or any one else when coding, remember you are to code each article independently. If you have any questions please consult this researcher at the telephone numbers provided. Every category in the coding form relates to definitions prescribed for this study. The definition of each category is outlined below. It is necessary for you to only refer to these definitions when coding each article. Do NOT apply your own understanding of these definitions when coding, but instead use the definitions provided in this code book at all times.

If you are feeling tired while coding, take a break and return to coding when you are feeling more refreshed. Keep this code book handy when coding as you may have to refer to it from time to time in order to clarify coding procedures. Not all categories are applicable to all articles. There are specific categories that refer only to news stories and others that are applicable only to travel articles. Those categories are specifically indicated on the coding form. Pay special attention to those categories where only ONE variable is applicable, do not circle more than one. Where more than one variable is applicable, carefully consider the variables that are most suitable to code. Remember to circle ‘Other’, if none of the previous variables in a particular category are suitable.

Specific Coding Instructions and Variable Definitions

FORM VARIABLE CONSTRUCTS

Form variable constructs are categories that identify general features of the articles such as the name of the newspaper, date and page position.

Article Number: Note the number on the article and insert that number here

1. Coder Number: Refers to the Coder Number that has specifically been assigned to you by the researcher.

2. Sunday Newspaper: Look at the top of the article for the name of the newspaper and circle the matching number on the coding form. Note that there are nine in all. ONLY circle one.

3. Date of Article: Record the day first, then the month.

4. Page Number of Article: Put in the page number(s) of the article as indicated at the top of the hard copy.

5. Writer of Article: If the writer’s name is indicated, fill in the name below. The name is usually at the top of the page but in some instances it may be at the bottom. Leave space blank is the writer’s name is not given anywhere in the article.
6. **Gender of Writer**: If you can determine the gender of the writer by the name, circle the appropriate number on the coding form, but if you are not sure and cannot identify this, circle 3. Circle **ONLY** one number for this category.

7. **Destination Mentioned in Headline**: Circle the relevant number if the country is mentioned in the headline.

8. **Destination Story Focus**: In choosing from this list, ensure that you circle **ONLY** the destination that is the main focus of the story. Only **ONE VARIABLE** should be coded in this category. If the story focuses on more than one destination, then you should circle the variable for ‘Caribbean (more than one destination)’. In some stories, although other Caribbean destinations may be mentioned, they may not be central to the story. In that case only the country which is the focus of the story should be coded. For example, if the story focuses on Barbados, but there is an ongoing comparison throughout with Jamaica, then the variable for Barbados should be coded. If the article only mentions the region in a generic way, such as Caribbean **without** mentioning any one destination, circle the variable number for ‘Caribbean (no mention of any one destination)’.

9. **Type of Story/Article**: Only **ONE number** should be chosen in this category. A **News Story** is defined as new information about events, things or persons. It is an attempt to give an objective report that answers ‘who’, what, when, where’ with an emphasis on facts. Additionally, for the purposes of this coding, a news story basically refers to articles that are NOT travel features. The difference between a **News Story** and a **Travel Story** for coding here is primarily based on the **purpose** of the writer of the article. It is therefore possible for a **News Story** to focus on travel in some way. For example, to report on an incident relating to a tourist, a destination or airline etc. in an objective manner is a News Story, since the aim of the writer is not to describe a travel experience for the benefit of the reader, or to highlight or promote travel as an end in itself. Articles focusing on describing or giving facts for the purposes of information to make readers aware of travel and to promote travel is to be coded as a **Travel Story**.

10. **Type of news story**: This is applicable only to stories that have been circled as news stories in the above category. Circle **only ONE number**. The differences between ‘hard’ and ‘soft’ news are based both on the content and form. Hard news stories mostly take the structured form of who, what, when, where in a rigid format. Soft news have a less rigid format and are usually features, opinion pieces and commentaries. In terms of content, the values of hard news have a public emphasis, that is, addressing such issues of public affairs, crime, government etc. Soft news stories on the other hand focus on human interest topics and on private lives.

**CONTENT VARIABLE CONTRUCTS**

Content Variable Constructs are categories that identify the image attributes of the destinations as well as motivations associated with them.

11. **Subject of Article**: The subject of the article is the topic that the story centres on. If the topic is not listed, then the number for ‘Other’ should be circled. The subject should then be listed in the space provided. Only **ONE variable** must be chosen. These variables are applicable to all articles.

- **Destination** – focus on a country, resort area, region, location
- **Accommodation** - hotel chain, budget facilities etc. All types of accommodation facilities including cruises
- **Attractions** - these are both natural and man-made attractions – From waterfalls to theme parks
- **Weddings & Honeymoon** – the story should focus on weddings and honeymoons taking place at the destination
- **Holiday Activities** – focus of the story is on any holiday related activities or range of activities while on holiday at the destination
- **Family Holiday** – Centres on travel that caters to families with children. Includes articles that highlight facilities that are specifically designed for children.
- **Transportation** – Includes stories on airlines, ground transportation
Images of People

**Locals** - focus of the story is on locals, one individual or group in the country. Local people may be international celebrities such as Derek Walcott, St. Lucia’s Nobel Laureate. This category also includes nationals from the Caribbean who now live in the UK or other overseas countries. This category also include persons born in the country of ‘foreign’ parentage

**Ex-patriots** - non-locals, people from other countries who now live and work in the country on a relatively permanent basis

**Celebrity** - internationally known overseas, non-nationals of the countries in sample. Includes royalty, movie stars, financial magnates, rock stars, models and writers etc

**Event(s)** - Occasions that are staged in the destination/region to include both formal and informal events. Examples include carnival, sporting events, reggae show etc

**Crime** - a crime story may focus on an incident or report on a particular trend in crime. Includes stories on safety issues, travel advisories, money laundering, drugs, crimes among locals and against tourists

**Economy** - referring to any story that addresses the local economy of the destination- e.g. the impact of EU laws on bananas. Covers issues dealing with development, underdevelopment, infrastructure, taxation, free trade, offshore banking regulation etc

**Political** - Relating to stories on elections, party politics and sleaze locally in the destination and also in terms of relationship with politics and politicians in the UK. Includes story relating to UK colonial relationship with countries

**Disaster(s)** - natural and man-made disasters, road accidents, sporting accidents- volcano, hurricane, earthquake – these stories report on these occurrences, their impacts and how people are coping.

**Environment** - focusing on the natural flora and fauna – how they are preserved or endangered- stories on bio-diversity management

**Culture** - refers to stories on the art, poetry and music of a country

**Other** - any subject that has not been noted in any of the variables listed above in this category

12. **Physical Landscape Attributes**

More than one variable may be chosen in this category. The approach here is to pick out all the various landscape attributes that have been mentioned in the story. Some features may be more dominant than others, however it is important to identify all the relevant variables.

**Coastal** - identify if the story highlights the coastal attributes of the place described- that is the sun, sand sea features- descriptions of beaches, coastlines, underwater diving etc

**Mountain** - story highlights the mountain vistas

**Rural** - relates to the landscapes that are not urbanised but that remain rustic and not intensely developed

**Urban** - story highlights cityscapes, malls, buildings and highly developed areas in terms of infrastructure and civic amenities

**Flora & Fauna** - here plants, vegetation and the wildlife, animals are highlighted in the story- maybe they are mentioned in terms of their destruction and the need for preservation.

**Other** - code this variable if you have identified a landscape variable not identified above

13. **Landscape psychological**

In this category the aim is to identify the writer opinions or value judgements on the landscapes that is being described. These variables focus on determining the meaning that is ascribed to the landscape. All the relevant variable numbers must be circled.

**Unspoilt** - pristine- the landscape is described as being free from the ravages of development or pollution, garbage

**Authentic** - defined for coding purposes as original, not contrived or staged for tourists. Story suggests that the setting is a ‘back region’ – that is, not produced or manipulated for the gaze of tourists.

**Adventurous** - story suggests that the landscape offers adventure, a place for exploration and challenge
Beautiful – and other adjectives such as attractive, lovely, superb – and many more of that kind that expresses the beauty of the landscape
Overdeveloped – story points to the excesses of development which may be ribbon development of too many tourist facilities along the coastline, urban sprawl, crowded
Threatened – here it is mentioned that the landscape and the environment is at risk from many factors such as development, pollution, a political situation, natural phenomenon (disaster) etc
Unusual – the landscape is presented as being somewhat extraordinary, not as expected or not fitting in the stereotype. It is seen as unique in its characteristics and its effects on the observer.
Other – this is to be coded if another variable have been identified which is not in the above list

14. People - Locals
This category examines how the locals of the destinations have been presented in the story. These may be ordinary people, business people, public officials or politicians. The people here must be on location at the destination that is the focus of the story and not in another country.
Identified, mentioned in story – code this number if locals have been mentioned in any way, from immigration officers, as workers, as performers, as acquaintances etc.
Not mentioned / absent – code this number if locals are not referred to or mentioned at any time in the story. If this variable is coded, ignore categories 16 and 17 below.
Only ONE variable may be coded in this category

15. Positive (code all the variables that apply)
Hospitable – here locals are viewed as kind hosts, helpful, co-operative, facilitating, greeting and welcoming, courteous
Knowledgeable – locals are presented as having expertise, insight, skilled, competent. They have an in-depth knowledge of the area
Smiling - this should be coded when there is a direct reference to locals smiling with others.
Friendly - locals are viewed as being warm, sharing friendships and interests, easy to talk to communicative, open and indulgent. Here there is a deeper encounter with locals that goes beyond they being seen as just smiling and being hospitable.
Industrious - hardworking, responsive to queries, ambitious and on the move, energetic and productive
Other – other variable not mentioned in text

16. Negative (code all the variables that apply)
Hostile – host nationals are seen as aggressive, threatening, violent and inciting fear in others, involved in criminal activities against each other, against visitors, prejudiced against minority groups, uncooperative, unfriendly and not willing to engage with outsiders
Ignorant – not having the correct facts, simplistic, superstitious, inefficient and unskilled, lacking expertise, lacking creative, silly, uneducated, illiterate
Revolting – offensive behaviour and practices, inciting shock and disgust in others, arrogant, repulsive
Laid Back – lazy, not industrious or diligent, sluggish, unresponsive, unproductive and indifferent to the needs or concerns of others, particularly outsiders, lacking ambition
Exploitative - Corrupt and mercenary, deceitful and dishonest, harassing visitors, trying to con others to get money, venal
Other – other variables not mentioned in text

17. Activities – Leisure based
This category examines the kinds of leisure activities mentioned as taking place at the destinations in all the articles. Leisure is basically defined as non work activities. It is likely that this category will predominantly relate to travel feature stories. However, news stories may also mention the leisure activities of the people of their news stories. For example, if the leisure activities of Princess Margaret, Mick Jagger and Elton John in Mustique is mentioned in a news story, then these are to be coded. More than one variable may be coded in this category.
Water-sports activities - any water based activities (related to the sea) as well as beach activities such as beach volley ball, water polo. Sailing, yachting, diving, water-skiing, swimming all fall within this category
Land based activities - recreational activities such as walking, sports activities, going to the gym, spas are among the many activities in this category
Sightseeing, visiting attractions – all kinds of activities associated with sightseeing including visits to concerts, shows, museums, historic sites, observing whales, wildlife

Dining – featuring various ‘eating experiences at formal restaurants to roadside venues- drinking of wines and other spirits are also included

Partying, nightlife – highlighting both nightlife and clubbing activities

Shopping – purchasing of all kinds of consumer goods- souvenirs, tourist art as well as prestige brand goods

Rest and Relaxation – highlighting restful activities, even doing nothing such as sleeping – meditation and yoga related activities

Other – leisure activities not listed in variable above

18. Types of holiday experiences-Motivation and meaning – image attributes

This category examines the various meanings that can be attributed to or derived from the holiday experience. It is important to determine which of these modes best represents the type of holiday experiences being described by the writer. These definitions should be read repeatedly to ensure that the most suitable variables are chosen. Only travel feature stories are to be coded for this category. Code only ONE variable in this category.

Recreational Mode - The holiday is presented as fun and enjoyment only. The holiday is seen as an opportunity for people to play and enjoy themselves. The landscape, the environment, the activities and people of the destination are all seen in terms of how much fun they offer and so there is no deep connection with the destination or the place. The individual contact is superficial, reality is not important and oftentimes artificial, and inauthentic environments are preferred in the recreational mode.

Diversionary Mode - The holiday is presented as a break from everyday pressures and so the vacation is presented as getting away from reality, to a make-believe world that realises the individual’s deepest fantasy. The holiday experience is presented as an escape from the boredom and meaninglessness of routine, everyday existence. The emphasis is on the boredom and drag of everyday life, so the trip is an opportunity to ‘recharge the batteries’. Like the recreational mode, there is no deep connection with the place, but the holiday highlights the benefits offered for being different from the mundane and everyday.

Experiential Mode – The vacation experience is presented as a search for interesting sights, encounters and experiences. The holiday is not seen as just offering fun or an escape from the everyday, but there is more interest in the novel, in the strangeness of other cultures and people. Although there is still no real connection with the landscape or the people, yet there is interest and satisfaction gained from noting the novelty and ‘otherness’ of the holiday experience.

Experimental Mode – The holiday is presented an opportunity to try out and engage with the alternative lifestyle as seen in the destination. Here there is an attempt to connect with in a deeper way the landscape and the people of the place visited. There is an openness and appreciation for the unexpected and the non stereotypical. Individual expresses a new sense of identity and increased self awareness.

Existential Mode – Here the holiday experience is presented as the they way to live - so much that it replaces the everyday which is rejected for what is seen as the more authentic experience of the destination. The individual expresses a total commitment and devotion to ‘back-stage’ world of the destination which is now becomes the world of the individual who no longer sees it as ‘foreign’. 
READER RESPONSE CONTRACTS

These categories below relate to the strategies that a writer uses to present the story to readers. The structure and the style of the articles are examined in terms of how the arguments are presented to the reader.

19. Genre Convention – Narrative Voice – this category identifies the style of the writer in reporting the story. Only ONE variable must be coded.
   First Person ‘I’/‘you’ – uses the active voice to relate the story
   First Person ‘we’ – uses the plural version of the active voice to relate the story – indicating that this involves the involvement of another person as part of the story
   Passive voice – Personal pronouns are not used at all in the story

20. Reader Positioning
   Call to Action – choose only ONE variable
   Direct call to action – here the reader is directly addressed to participate in the experience by such imperatives such as ‘feel’, ‘hear’, ‘see’, ‘smell’ among others. The use of these verbs pull the reader to actively engage with experience.
   Indirect call to action – here the call to action is more of a suggestion and is usually modified with some sort of choice or options. So an indirect call to action will be more covert with ‘you may call, or feel or see’. There is no direct command for the reader to do anything, but it is implied.
   No call to action – the reader is not invited in anyway to react or respond

21. Benefits for Reader – there in an indication in the story that direct and indirect benefits may be achieved if certain prescriptions are followed. The writer may show in the story how this benefit was personally gained. The writer may be seen as advising the reader on how ways to gain this benefit. For example – the statements ‘if you go to St Kitts you will get the needed peace and quiet you deserve’ or the and ‘booking with Elegant Resorts gives sure value for money with no worry’ all offer benefits to the reader. However, the writer may also caution against certain experiences. For example, the statement, ‘Flying long haul to the Caribbean is a health risk’ suggests a negative effect for the reader. Only ONE variable is to be coded in this category.
   Benefits mentioned – the article mostly highlights the benefits of a particular experience or facility.
   Negative effects mentioned – story highlights that negative, harmful effects may result from particular experience.

22. Sponsor/company identification – At the end of the travel feature stories there are usually tag lines that indicate the companies that may have facilitated the trip of the travel writer. Or there may be a subheading which lists practical information for readers to follow up and to call 0800 numbers to make a booking or to get brochures. Circle all the variable that apply
   Destination – the name of an national tourism organisation for a destination is mentioned – their website or 0800 number etc
   Hotel Chain/Group – hotels or their marketing agencies mentioned
   Airline/Cruise – scheduled or charter airlines mentioned
   Tour Operator/Wholesaler/Retailer – various travel intermediaries mentioned
   None identified – no company or sponsor identified or mentioned
   Other – other variable not listed above
APPENDIX 3

Destination Image Coding Form
© 2002 Marcella Daye (PhD thesis)

FORM VARIABLES

ARTICLE NUMBER:

1. CODER NUMBER – (Put in the coder identification number that has been assigned to you)
   01  02

2. SUNDAY NEWSPAPERS (Circle ONLY ONE number)
   1 News of the World
   2 Sunday Mirror
   3 Sunday People
   4 Mail on Sunday
   5 Sunday Express
   6 Sunday Times
   7 Sunday Telegraph
   8 The Observer
   9 Independent on Sunday

3. DATE OF ARTICLE (Record the day first, then month and then year)
   / /00

4. PAGE NUMBER OF ARTICLE (Put in the page number of the article as indicated at top)

5. WRITER OF ARTICLE (if the writer’s name is indicated, fill in the name below. Leave space blank if there is no writer indicated at the top of the article)

6. GENDER OF WRITER (Circle ONLY ONE number)
   1 Male
   2 Female
   3 Cannot identify

7. DESTINATION(S) MENTIONED IN HEADLINE (list the countries, also Caribbean if mentioned)
   1 Mentioned
   2 Not mentioned
8. **LIST THE DESTINATION(S) THAT THE STORY FOCUSES ON** (Remember that although other Caribbean destinations and other countries may be mentioned in the story-they may not be central to the story. In choosing from this list ensure that that you circle only the destination(s) which is the main focus of the story. If you are not sure, please circle the number for that response.)

1. Anguilla  
2. Antigua and Barbuda  
3. Bahamas  
4. Barbados  
5. Belize  
6. Bermuda  
7. British Virgin Islands  
8. Cayman Islands  
9. Dominica  
10. Grenada  
11. Guyana  
12. Jamaica  
13. Montserrat  
14. St Kitts & Nevis  
15. St Lucia  
16. St Vincent & the Grenadines – Mustique  
17. Trinidad & Tobago  
18. Turks & Caicos  
19. Caribbean (no mention of any ONE destination- only reference to the region)  
20. Caribbean (mention of more than ONE destination)  
21. Not sure

9. **TYPE OF STORY/ARTICLE** (Circle only ONE number)

1. News Story  
2. Travel Story

10. **TYPE OF NEWS STORY** (This is applicable only for stories that have been circled as news stories in the above variable. Circle only ONE number)

1. Hard News Story – Public Emphasis (government, public affairs, crime)  
2. Soft News – Private Emphasis (features, commentary, anecdotal, human interest)
CONTENT VARIABLE CONSTRUCTS

11. SUBJECT OF ARTICLE (this is the generic topic which the story centres on- if the topic is not listed, then circle the number for other and list the subject on space provided) Circle ONLY ONE number.

1  Destination – country, location, region, resort area
2  Accommodation – hotel chain, budget – the full range of hotels
3  Attractions – natural and man made, Disney etc
4  Weddings & Honeymoon
5  Holiday Activities – diving, sports, meeting people, sleeping
6  Family Vacations – featuring children, travel with kids
7  Transportation – Airline, cruise, ground transportation etc
8  People – Locals/natives of the destination – an individual or several persons
9  Ex-patriots – people from other countries who have made the destination their home
10 Celebrity – international stars, royalty, distinguished scholars in whatever field
11 Event(s) – pre or post coverage of an event taking place at the destination – carnival, sports
12 Crime – reporting incidents, money laundering, safety issues, civil disturbance
13 Economy – focus on the economic performance of destination, development issues
14 Political – elections, party politics, sleaze, corruption as it relates to local and overseas
15 Disaster(s)- natural or man-made, road accidents, volcano, hurricane
16 Environmental – focus on natural flora and fauna in terms of preservation or bio-diversity
17 Other

12. IMAGE ATTRIBUTES

   Physical Landscape features (Circle all that apply)
1  Coastal (beach)
2  Mountain
3  Rural
4  Urban – cityscape
5  Flora & Fauna
6  Other

13. Landscape psychological (Circle all that apply)

1  Unspoilt-pristine
2  Authentic
3  Adventurous
4  Beautiful
5  Overdeveloped
6  Crowded
7  Threatened
8  Unusual
9  Neutral

14. People – Locals (Circle only ONE)

1  Identified or referred to in story
2  Not mentioned in any way, absent
(Circle all that apply)
1 Hospitable
2 Knowledgeable
3 Smiling
4 Friendly
5 Industrious
6 Other

1 Hostile
2 Ignorant
3 Revolting
4 Laid back
5 Exploitative, corrupt
6 Neutral

15. Activities- Leisure based (Circle all that apply)
1 Water-sports activities
2 Land based recreation, walking, hiking, sports
3 Sightseeing, visiting attractions, concerts, museums
4 Dining, drinking
5 Partying, nightlife
6 Shopping
7 Relaxing, sleeping, doing nothing
8 Other

16. Types of holiday experiences (Circle only ONE)
1 Recreational Mode
2 Diversionary Mode
3 Experiential Mode
4 Experimental Mode
5 Existential Mode

22. Genre Conventions – Narrative Voice (Circle only ONE number)
1 Active Voice I/you
2 Active Voice ‘we’
3 Passive Voice

23. Reader Positioning – Call to Action (Circle only ONE number)
1 Direct call to action (imperatives)
2 Indirect call to action
3 No call to action
24. **Benefits for Reader**  (Circle only ONE number for each category)

1  Benefits mentioned
2  Negative effects mentioned

25. **Sponsor/company identification**  (Circle all that apply)

1  Destination
2  Hotel Chain/Group
3  Airline
4  Travel Intermediary
5  None identified
6  Other
# APPENDIX 4

## Coding Analysis Coding Schedule

**PRESS REPRESENTATIONS OF CARIBBEAN HOLIDAY EXPERIENCE**

### NEWSPAPER

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Independent on Sunday</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Sunday Times</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### DATE-MONTH

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### HEADLINE

‘Jamaican cool’

### TYPE (MODE) OF TOURISM EXPERIENCE

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Recreational Mode/Amusement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Diversionary Mode/Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Experiential Mode/Interest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Experimental Mode/Rapture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Existential Mode/Dedication</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### NARRATIVE VOICE

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1st Person (Active)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>3rd Person (Passive)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### LANDSCAPE

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Coastal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Mountain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Rural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Urban</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Flora and Fauna</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### WRITER'S APPROACH

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Direct/Hard Sell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Indirect/Soft Sell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>No Sell</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### TONE OF STORY

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Positive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Negative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Most positive with negative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Most negative with positive</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 5

Escape: Caribbean Special: Grenada: Spice and easy: Neasa MacErlean finds Guinness, cricket and sun on the fragrant island of Grenada
The Observer
London (UK)
Sep 17, 2000

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Authors: Neasa MacEarlean
Pagination: 10
ISSN: 00297712
Companies:
Company Name: Guinness PLC
DUNS: 21-012-9250
SIC: 312120

Abstract:

Discounting the effects of global warming, the closest you can probably get to this Britannic idyll is by making the nine-hour air journey to Grenada in the Caribbean. In our English-speaking former colony, the red telephone boxes are exactly the same as the London ones. The Queen still reigns. The policemen have 'ER' badges on their caps, more than matching the British bobby for smartness, right down to the black, shiny boots.

Grenada could be the world capital of beautiful, pale sandy beaches bordering on to gentle turquoise seas. Its tiny area - 20 miles long and 12 miles wide - is also home to small rainforests, Hollywood-style waterfalls and Mount Qua Qua, the volcanic crater-turned-lake.

Neasa MacEarlean travelled on a learn-to-windsurf package with Neilson (01273 626284), which still allowed her time to explore the island. A week at the Riviera Beach Hotel on Grand Anse Beach costs from pounds 744 (pounds 920 for two weeks), including flights, transfers, B&B accommodation and all activities. Grenada is one of the cheaper islands for eating out.

Copyright Guardian Newspapers, Limited Sep 17, 2000

Full Text:

Imagine a Britain with sunshine nearly every day - a Britain so warm that palm trees grow on the edge of all beaches.

Discounting the effects of global warming, the closest you can probably get to this Britannic idyll is by making the nine-hour air journey to Grenada in the Caribbean. In our English-speaking former colony, the red telephone boxes are exactly the same as the London ones. The Queen still reigns. The policemen have 'ER' badges on their caps, more than matching the British bobby for smartness, right down to the black, shiny boots.

Despite the old horrors of empire and sugar plantations, the 95,000 islanders have a great affinity with the Brits and the Irish. When I went there on a windsurfing holiday in a party of about 30, everyone was impressed
Grenada could be the world capital of beautiful, pale sandy beaches bordering on to gentle turquoise seas. Its tiny area - 20 miles long and 12 miles wide - is also home to small rainforests, Hollywood-style waterfalls and Mount Qua Qua, the volcanic crater-turned-lake.

If your tastes also run to Guinness and cricket, you will probably never want to leave the so-called 'Spice Island'. The location of a Guinness brewery just outside the capital, St George, is testament to the marvellous quality of the water. Grenadians, like their fellow West Indians, are cricket-obsessed. They have a new national ground which, in the year since opening, has already hosted international matches.

Tours of the interior will make clear how the country became known as Spice Island. Many of the inhabitants make their (small) living by cultivating nutmeg and cinnamon trees and selling their produce at the colourful and lively St George market. When the wind changes, you often find a different spicy fragrance in the air. Cloves and saffron are also produced in large quantities - and you will often find yourself walking on paths covered in nutmeg shells.

But the island is still poor. While no one appears to starve, very few people reach European standards of living. Most British holidaymakers could buy the entire stock of any of the St George market stalls without noticing the outlay. Some holidaymakers will rejoice in the fact that Grenada is 'unspoilt'; others will feel slightly uncomfortable that the locals benefit so little from tourism and trade. There are signs, however, that international investment will start to enrich the local economy and provide more restaurants and other facilities for affluent Western travellers.

Only a couple of restaurants stand out now. Nutmeg on the Carenage, St George, provides wonderful views of the harbour and a three-course meal for about pounds 20 a head. Aquarium is approached by a road that is little more than a dirt track behind the international airport but is probably one of the most beautiful restaurants in the world. For about pounds 20 a head, you eat in a setting that could be used for a James Bond film - set into the side of a cliff, looking like a giant tree house and overlooking its own quiet share of sandy beach and gentle sea.

Getting there

Neasa MacEarlean travelled on a learn-to-windsurf package with Neilson (01273 626284), which still allowed her time to explore the island. A week at the Riviera Beach Hotel on Grand Anse Beach costs from pounds 744 (pounds 920 for two weeks), including flights, transfers, B&B accommodation and all activities. Grenada is one of the cheaper islands for eating out.

Caption: article-Grenada.1

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction or distribution is prohibited without permission.
MATERIAL REDACTED AT REQUEST OF UNIVERSITY