The Translation of Extralinguistic Cultural References in Animated Feature Films by Unofficial Subtitlers in Iran

by

Jaleh Delfani

Submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

University of Surrey

Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences

School of Literature and Languages

Supervisors:

Professor Sabine Braun
Dr Dimitris Asimakouelas

©Jaleh Delfani 2019
Declaration of originality

This thesis and the work to which it refers are the results of my own efforts. Any ideas, data, images or text resulting from the work of others (whether published or unpublished) are fully identified as such within the work and attributed to their originator in the text, bibliography or in footnotes. This thesis has not been submitted in whole or in part for any other academic degree or professional qualification. I agree that the University has the right to submit my work to the plagiarism detection service TurnitinUK for originality checks. Whether or not drafts have been so-assessed, the University reserves the right to require an electronic version of the final document (as submitted) for assessment as above.

Signature: Jaleh Delfani
Abstract

The preferred mode of audiovisual translation for foreign language programmes on state television and cinemas in Iran is dubbing. Dubbing is done by professionals who are supervised by the authorities, and a considerable part of foreign programmes is being censored. On the other hand, subtitling is not supervised by any formal institutions and is practiced by ‘unofficial’ subtitlers. Although their work does not necessarily follow subtitling norms, some of these subtitlers produce work of high-quality standards and their products are popular among the target audience. In order to shed light on the reason behind this popularity and address this under-researched phenomenon in the Iranian context, the current study focuses on the work of three informally recognised experienced subtitlers, whose works are popular among the audience, by taking animation as a case in point as a genre that has attracted dual audiences of (young) adults/children.

The thesis contains a comparative analysis of the subtitles produced by the abovementioned unofficial subtitlers for five popular animated feature films to gauge the most frequently applied strategies by these subtitlers. As cultural elements have widely been recognised by scholars as one of the most challenging aspects of translation, Pedersen’s (2011) taxonomy of transfer strategies for Extralinguistic Cultural References (ECRs) in subtitling has been employed as a tool for analysing the subtitles. Pedersen’s model was adapted through partial redefinitions and extension of the categories to suit the purpose of the present study. The comparison focused on commonalities and differences in the subtitlers’ translation choices regarding the identified ECR instances in the selected animated feature films. The study reveals that unofficial subtitlers have a strong tendency to opt for target-oriented strategies when dealing with the translation of ECRs. Paraphrase was found to be the most frequently used strategy, followed by using a superordinate term and cultural substitution.
Acknowledgments

This PhD has not only been an academic achievement but a ‘PhD of life’, with all the ebbs and flows it has to offer. I sincerely believe that it could not have been completed without the support and guidance of the following people who inspired my journey to success.

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to my amazing supervisors Professor Sabine Braun and Dr Dimitris Asimakoulas for their continuous support, insightful comments and encouragement throughout these years. I also owe an apology to Dr Dimitris Asimakoulas for taking up all his consultation hours towards the end of writing up this thesis and would like to thank him again for his generosity in sharing his immense knowledge, time, and smile. I have been blessed to have these two inspirational academics as my supervisors.

Very special and heartfelt gratitude goes out to my landlady, Daisy Tabtab, who I now consider a close friend and family. I cannot thank her enough for all the support she sincerely provided me with throughout this journey. She is truly an earth angel.

I am wholeheartedly grateful to my best friend Shima Balouchian who has always been there for me through all stages of my life including my PhD studies. Her endless moral and emotional support has always helped me through the most frustrating situations I had to cope with. I am so blessed and grateful to have her in my life.

I would also like to thank my PhD officemates and friends Dr Kim Starr, Dr Geraint Rees, Dr Katerina Perdikaki and the rest of the lovely people in our office. For their support and encouragement and their unselfish sharing of knowledge, I will always be grateful.

I am also grateful to the lovely staff in our department, especially Karen Short, for her unfailing administrative support and for always being kind to me.

Last but most certainly not least, I am eternally grateful to my life mentor, my mom, for her ceaseless moral support and for always guiding me through life and being my role model. Without her genuine inspiration I would not have been able to walk this path. I am also grateful to my dad, my sister and my brothers for supporting me throughout writing this thesis and my life in general.
Table of Contents

Abstract ..................................................................................................................................... 3
Acknowledgements .................................................................................................................. 4
List of Tables ............................................................................................................................ 7
List of Figures ........................................................................................................................ 10
List of Images ......................................................................................................................... 13
Chapter 1 Introduction .......................................................................................................... 14
Chapter 2 Literature Review ................................................................................................ 21
  2.1 Animation Genre ............................................................................................................. 21
    2.1.1 The Development of Animation ............................................................................. 23
    2.1.2 The Impact of Animation on Children ............................................................... 28
    2.1.3 Animation as a Field of Academic Studies ....................................................... 32
  2.2 Norms in Translation .................................................................................................... 38
    2.2.1 Definitions and Categories for Norms in Translation ......................................... 38
    2.2.2 Classifications and Taxonomies for the Translation of Cultural References ..... 43
    2.2.3 Pedersen’s Taxonomy of ECR Transfer Strategies ........................................... 47
  2.3 Audiovisual Translation: Principles and Practice ........................................................ 52
    2.3.1 Subtitling in Focus ............................................................................................... 54
    2.3.2 Non-professional Subtitling ................................................................................ 61
    2.3.3 Censorship in Iran ............................................................................................... 69
        2.3.3.1 Censorship in Literature ....................................................................... 71
        2.3.3.2 Censorship in Films and AV Products ................................................. 72
    2.3.4 Unofficial subtitling in Iran ................................................................................ 77
        2.3.4.1 Sociocultural Aspects........................................................................... 77
        2.3.4.2 Linguistic Aspects................................................................................ 91
Chapter 3 Methodology ......................................................................................................... 102
  3.1 Aim and Research Questions ......................................................................................... 102
  3.2 Ethics ............................................................................................................................... 105
  3.3 Research Material .......................................................................................................... 108
    3.3.1 Selection of the Subtitlers ................................................................................. 108
    3.3.2 Selection of the Films ....................................................................................... 110
  3.4 Analytical Framework .................................................................................................... 114
    3.4.1 Classification of the TTs Based on Pedersen’s Taxonomy ................................. 116
    3.4.2 The Adapted Model and its Pertaining Strategies ............................................ 128
Chapter 4 Data Analysis ........................................................................................................... 142

4.1 Analysis by Films .............................................................................................................. 142
  4.1.1 Analysis of the Animated Feature Film Frozen ...................................................... 142
  4.1.2 Analysis of the Animated Feature Film Despicable Me 2 ............................... 160
  4.1.3 Analysis of the Animated Feature Film Inside Out ........................................... 180
  4.1.4 Analysis of the Animated Feature Film Hotel Transylvania 2 ....................... 197
  4.1.5 Analysis of the Animated Feature Film Zootopia ............................................. 218
  4.1.6 Conclusion ............................................................................................................... 235

4.2 Analysis by Subtitlers ..................................................................................................... 240
  4.2.1 Analysing the subtitling behaviour of Subtitler A ............................................ 240
  4.2.2 Analysing the subtitling behaviour of Subtitler B ............................................ 243
  4.2.3 Analysing the subtitling behaviour of Subtitler C ............................................ 244
  4.2.4 Conclusion ............................................................................................................... 246

Chapter 5 Discussion ............................................................................................................. 254

5.1 Unofficial subtitling in Iran: Product and Process-oriented Perspectives ........... 255

5.2 The Way the Animated Films Are Presented in the TC by Unofficial Subtitlers .......................................................................................................................................................... 265

Chapter 6 Concluding Remarks .......................................................................................... 269

References ............................................................................................................................. 275

Filmography ............................................................................................................................ 288

Appendix A (Data Analysis Spreadsheets)
List of Tables

Table 3.1 The initial selection of films for the project .......................................................... 111
Table 3.2 Data analysis grid based on Pedersen’s (2011) taxonomy ........................................ 116
Table 3.3 Examples of Transliteration+ Addition/Completion ........................................... 133
Table 3.4 Existing subtitles for each film by subtitlers ....................................................... 138
Table 3.5 Data analysis grid based on an adaptation of Pedersen’s (2011) taxonomy .......... 139
Table 4.1 Example of Transliteration in Frozen ................................................................. 147
Table 4.2 Example of Calque in Frozen ........................................................... 149
Table 4.3 Example of Paraphrase in Frozen ...................................................................... 151
Table 4.4 Example of Transcultural ECR in Frozen .......................................................... 152
Table 4.5 Example of Meaning shift in Frozen ................................................................. 153
Table 4.6 Example of Superordinate term in Frozen ........................................................... 155
Table 4.7 Example of Official equivalent ECR in Frozen ..................................................... 156
Table 4.8 Distribution of source and target-oriented strategies by each individual subtitler and in total in the animated film Frozen .......................................................... 159
Table 4.9 Example of Transliteration in Despicable Me 2 .................................................. 163
Table 4.10 Example of Calque in Despicable Me 2 ............................................................ 165
Table 4.11 Examples of Creative rendition and Transliteration in Despicable Me 2 .... 166
Table 4.12 Examples of Calque and Transliteration+Specification in Despicable Me 2 ..... 167
Table 4.13 Example of Paraphrase in Despicable Me 2 ..................................................... 170
Table 4.14 Examples of Omission and Paraphrase in Despicable Me 2 ............................. 170
Table 4.15 Example of Situational substitution in Despicable Me 2 ................................. 171
Table 4.16 Example of TC ECR in Despicable Me 2 ............................................................ 172
Table 4.17 Examples of Omission, Transliteration, and Superordinate term in Despicable Me 2 .............................................................................................................. 173
Table 4.18 Example of Official equivalent in Despicable Me 2 ........................................ 175
Table 4.19 Distribution of source and target-oriented strategies by each individual subtitler and in total in the animated film Despicable Me 2 .......................................................... 179
Table 4.20 Example of Calque in Inside Out .......................................................................... 183
Table 4.21 Examples of Transliteration+Specification and Transliteration+Calque in Inside Out .................................................................................................................. 184
Table 4.22 Example of Calque and Transliteration in Inside Out ........................................ 185
Table 4.23 Examples of Paraphrase in *Inside Out* .......................................................... 187
Table 4.24 Example of TC ECR in *Inside Out* .............................................................. 188
Table 4.25 Example of Superordinate term in *Inside Out* ........................................... 189
Table 4.26 Examples of Transliteration+Calque and Omission in *Inside Out* ............... 190
Table 4.27 Example of Meaning shift in *Inside Out* .................................................... 191
Table 4.28 Examples of Official equivalent in *Inside Out* .......................................... 192
Table 4.29 Distribution of source and target-oriented strategies by each individual subtitler and in total in the animated film *Inside Out* .......................................................................................... 196
Table 4.30 Examples of Transliteration and other strategies by subtitlers in rendering the same ST ECRs observed in *Hotel Transylvania 2* ................................................................. 200
Table 4.31 Examples of Calque and Creative rendition in *Hotel Transylvania 2* ............ 203
Table 4.32 Examples of Transliteration+Specification and Omission in *Hotel Transylvania 2* .......................................................................................................................... 204
Table 4.33 Example of Paraphrase in *Hotel Transylvania 2* ........................................ 206
Table 4.34 Example of Superordinate term in *Hotel Transylvania 2* ............................ 208
Table 4.35 Example of Creative rendition in *Hotel Transylvania 2* .............................. 209
Table 4.36 Example of TC ECR in *Hotel Transylvania 2* ............................................ 210
Table 4.37 Examples of Situational substitution and Omission in *Hotel Transylvania 2* .... 211
Table 4.38 Examples of Transcultural ECR in *Hotel Transylvania 2* .......................... 212
Table 4.39 Example of Official Equivalent in *Hotel Transylvania 2* ............................ 214
Table 4.40 Distribution of source and target-oriented strategies by each individual subtitler and in total in the animated film *Hotel Transylvania 2* ......................................................... 217
Table 4.41 Examples of Paraphrase and Calque in *Zootopia* ......................................... 221
Table 4.42 Example of Transliteration+Specification in *Zootopia* ............................... 222
Table 4.43 Example of Transliteration+Calque in *Zootopia* ......................................... 223
Table 4.44 Example of Paraphrase in *Zootopia* ............................................................ 225
Table 4.45 Example of Calque and Transcultural substitution in *Zootopia* .................... 226
Table 4.46 Example of multiple ECRs occurring in one utterance observed in *Zootopia* ... 227
Table 4.47 Example of multiple ECRs occurring in one utterance observed in *Zootopia* ... 228
Table 4.48 Examples of Calque and Transcultural substitution in *Zootopia* .................... 230
Table 4.49 Examples of Omission and Official equivalent in *Zootopia* ......................... 232
Table 4.50 Distribution of source and target-oriented strategies by each individual subtitler and in total in the animated film *Zootopia* ............................................................................. 235
Table 4.51 Distribution of source and target-oriented strategies (as well as Official equivalents) in all 5 films (total n: 370) ................................................................................................................ 236
Table 4.52 Distribution of source-oriented strategies in all 5 films (total n: 129) ................. 237
Table 4.53 Distribution of target-oriented strategies in all 5 films (total n: 208).................... 238
Table 4.54 Categorisation of the strategies in terms of frequency of application by the subtitlers throughout the corpus............................................................................................................. 239
Table 4.55 Source and target-oriented strategies applied by subtitler A in each individual film and in total throughout the corpus ........................................................................................................ 240
Table 4.56 Source-oriented strategies applied by subtitler A in each individual film and in total throughout the corpus ............................................................................................................. 241
Table 4.57 Target-oriented strategies applied by subtitler A in each individual film and in total throughout the corpus ............................................................................................................. 242
Table 4.58 Source and target-oriented strategies applied by subtitler B in each individual film and in total throughout the corpus ........................................................................................................ 243
Table 4.59 Source-oriented strategies applied by subtitler B in each individual film and in total throughout the corpus ............................................................................................................. 243
Table 4.60 Target-oriented strategies applied by subtitler B in each individual film and in total throughout the corpus ............................................................................................................. 244
Table 4.61 Source and target-oriented strategies applied by subtitler C in each individual film and in total throughout the corpus ........................................................................................................ 244
Table 4.62 Source-oriented strategies applied by subtitler C in each individual film and in total throughout the corpus ............................................................................................................. 245
Table 4.63 Target-oriented strategies applied by subtitler C in each individual film and in total throughout the corpus ............................................................................................................. 245
Table 4.64 Distribution of total instances of source and target-oriented strategies used by subtitlers (A, B, C) ................................................................................................................ 247
Table 4.65 Distribution of total instances of source-oriented strategies used by subtitlers (A, B, C) ................................................................................................................ 247
Table 4.66 Distribution of total instances of target-oriented strategies by subtitlers (A, B, C) 248 .............................................................................................................................................
List of Figures

Figure 2.1 Pedersen’s (2011) Taxonomy of ECR Transfer Strategies .................................. 48
Figure 3.1 Adaptation of Pedersen’s (2011) taxonomy of ECR transfer strategies .................. 129
Figure 4.1 Total source and target-oriented strategies – absolute frequency – Frozen .......... 144
Figure 4.2 Total source and target-oriented strategies – relative frequency – Frozen .......... 144
Figure 4.3 Total source-oriented strategies – absolute frequency – Frozen ....................... 146
Figure 4.4 Total source-oriented strategies – relative frequency ........................................ 146
Figure 4.5 Total target-oriented strategies – absolute frequency – Frozen ....................... 150
Figure 4.6 Total target-oriented strategies – relative frequency – Frozen ......................... 150
Figure 4.7 Total source-oriented strategies used by subtitlers (A, B, C) in absolute frequencies – Frozen .......................................................... 156
Figure 4.8 Total source-oriented strategies used by subtitlers (A, B, C) in relative frequencies in Frozen ........................................................................................................ 157
Figure 4.9 Total target-oriented strategies used by subtitlers (A, B, C) in absolute frequencies in Frozen ........................................................................................................ 157
Figure 4.10 Total target-oriented strategies used by subtitlers (A, B, C) in relative frequencies in Frozen ........................................................................................................ 157
Figure 4.11 Total source and target-oriented strategies – absolute frequency – Despicable Me 2 ................................................................................................................ 161
Figure 4.12 Total source and target-oriented strategies – relative frequency – Despicable Me 2 ................................................................................................................ 161
Figure 4.13 Total source-oriented strategies – absolute frequency – Despicable Me 2 ........ 162
Figure 4.14 Total source-oriented strategies – relative frequency – Despicable Me 2 .......... 162
Figure 4.15 Total target-oriented strategies – absolute frequency – Despicable Me 2 ........ 169
Figure 4.16 Total target-oriented strategies – relative frequency – Despicable Me 2 .......... 169
Figure 4.17 Total source-oriented strategies by subtitlers (A & B) in absolute frequencies – Despicable Me 2 ........................................................................................................ 177
Figure 4.18 Total source-oriented strategies by subtitlers (A & B) in relative frequencies in Despicable Me 2 ........................................................................................................ 177
Figure 4.19 Total target-oriented strategies by subtitlers (A & B) in absolute frequencies – Despicable Me 2 ........................................................................................................ 177
Figure 4.20 Total target-oriented strategies by subtitlers (A & B) in relative frequencies in Despicable Me 2 ........................................................................................................ 178
Figure 4.45 Total target-oriented strategies – absolute frequency – *Zootopia* ...........224
Figure 4.46 Total target-oriented strategies – relative frequency – *Zootopia* ...........224
Figure 4.47 Total source-oriented strategies by subtitlers (A & C) in absolute frequencies – *Zootopia* ..................................................................................................................................................233
Figure 4.48 Total source-oriented strategies by subtitlers (A & C) in relative frequencies in *Zootopia* ..................................................................................................................................................233
Figure 4.49 Total target-oriented strategies by subtitlers (A & C) in absolute frequencies – *Zootopia* ..................................................................................................................................................234
Figure 4.50 Total target-oriented strategies by subtitlers (A & C) in relative frequencies in *Zootopia* ..................................................................................................................................................234
Figure 4.51 Total source and target-oriented strategies applied by subtitler A throughout the corpus ...............................................................................................................................................249
Figure 4.52 Total source and target-oriented strategies applied by subtitler B throughout the corpus ...............................................................................................................................................249
Figure 4.53 Total source and target-oriented strategies applied by subtitler C throughout the corpus ...............................................................................................................................................249
Figure 4.54 Total source-oriented strategies applied by subtitler A throughout the corpus ..250
Figure 4.55 Total source-oriented strategies applied by subtitler B throughout the corpus ..250
Figure 4.56 Total source-oriented strategies applied by subtitler C throughout the corpus ..251
Figure 4.57 Total target-oriented strategies applied by subtitler A throughout the corpus ...251
Figure 4.58 Total target-oriented strategies applied by subtitler B throughout the corpus ...252
Figure 4.59 Total source-oriented strategies applied by subtitler C throughout the corpus ..252
Figure 5.1 Taxonomy of ECR Transfer Strategies by Pedersen (2011:75) .......................257
Figure 5.2 Adaptation of Pedersen’s (2011) taxonomy of ECR transfer strategies ..........259
Figure 5.3 Pedersen’s simplified process-oriented taxonomy of ECR transfer strategies ....263
Figure 5.4 Simplified process-oriented version of the adapted model .........................265
List of Images

Image 2.1 *Scanner Darkly* (2006) ........................................................................................................26
Image 2.2 *The Lion King* live action (2019) ..................................................................................26
Image 2.3 The landing page for the censored websites in Iran...........................................................58
Image 2.4 Snapshot from the film *Searching* (2018) ......................................................................66
Image 2.5 Snapshot from the film *Searching* (2018) ......................................................................66
Image 2.6 An example of visual censorship on the Iranian state TV (IRIB) .................................75
Image 2.7 An example of visual censorship on the Iranian state TV (IRIB) .................................76
Image 2.8 A screenshot of the subtitles details page on *subscene.com* .........................................83
Image 2.9 A screenshot of the IDs the Iranian unofficial subtitlers use on *subscene.com* ............83
Image 2.10 The front side of the DVD covers as distributed in the Iranian black market .........88
Image 2.11 The rear side of the DVD covers as distributed in the Iranian black market .........88
Image 2.12 DVD cover including Persian paratexts (film) ..............................................................89
Image 2.13 DVD cover including Persian paratexts (animation) .................................................89
Image 3.1 An example screenshot of *subscene.com* website .........................................................110
Image 3.2 Snapshot of the quote “*forget it Jake. It’s Cloud Town!*” both in the original film *(Chinatown)* and in *Inside Out* animated film .................................................................118
Image 4.1 Snapshot from *Frozen* relating to the example in Table 4.1 ......................................149
Image 4.2 Reference to Marshmallow in *Frozen* ......................................................................153
Image 4.3 Marshmallow plant vs the confectionary .................................................................154
Image 4.4 Images of Gru, Bruce Willis, Humpty Dumpty and Gollum ...........................................164
Image 4.5 Transliteration+Specification strategy in *Despicable Me 2* ..................................168
Image 4.6 Snapshot of the scene relating to the example in Table 4.22 ......................................185
Image 4.7 /پشمک/ .........................................................................................................................194
Image 4.8 Snapshot of the scene relating to the rendition of the ECR ‘*piñata*’ by subtitler A as shown in Table 4.30 .........................................................................................................................202
Image 4.9 ‘Count Chocula’, the referent of the ECR ‘*chocolate cereal*’ as shown in Table 4.33 above ...............................................................................................................................207
Image 4.10 The ‘Bullpen’ at Zootopia Police Department ..............................................................222
Image 4.11 Snapshot of the scene relating to the ECR *(Jerry Vole)* observed in *Zootopia* . 231
Image 5.1 A snapshot from *Hotel Transylvania 2* (visualising the game ‘*Limbo*’) ..........264
Image 5.2 A snapshot from *Hotel Transylvania 2* (creative rendition by subtitler C) ........266
Chapter 1

Introduction

Audiovisual (AV) products have become an indispensable part of modern life. As an omnipresent medium, AV products serve different aspects of our lives; entertainment (films, animations, TV series, video games), education (from pre-school to university programmes), commerce (advertising and corporate videos showcasing the structure, activities and products of companies), artistic creation and reception (artists making installations which increasingly involve moving images, museums, exhibitions). These products have changed the way we read texts, read combinations of words and images, form assumptions based on our background, gender, social class, ethnicity and age. In essence, AV products have changed the way we communicate at all these levels. This necessitates providing translation for such products for cultural, ideological, economic and accessibility reasons.

The approach to translating and presenting audiovisual content across cultures and social groups can be affected by factors such as the sociocultural and political contexts. In some cases, authorities/patrons protect their own cultural, political and linguistic values through censorship or manipulation of the content. Over time, this complex phenomenon has been examined academically in the field of Translation Studies and accordingly in audiovisual translation (AVT), with the focus on issues of context, identity and manipulation.

Following this strand of investigation, it is worth examining as many contexts where patronage is at play as possible. There are several studies in European contexts, a few on South Africa (e.g. Kruger, 2012), but very few on the Middle East (e.g. Aksoy, 2001) and especially Iran (e.g. Novin and Salmani, 2017). In contexts like Iran, where the patrons are extremely ‘controlling’, counter-discourses (i.e. resistance to the main official narrative of what is good, proper and appropriate) emerge. The authorities want to control the prestige of AV products, the funds available in this market and the ideology that is brokered within the
AV market. To be more specific, in Iran, which is the focus of the present study, foreign programmes on state television and in cinemas are dubbed, which is done by professionals who are supervised by two formal institutions, i.e. The Ministry of Culture and Islamic Guidance (MICG)\(^1\) and The Islamic Republic of Iranian Broadcasting (IRIB). The former is responsible for restricting access to any media that violates Islamic ethics or promotes values alien to the Iranian Islamic Revolution and the latter is to monitor the audiovisual products (both domestic and foreign) prior to broadcasting on TV, to grant them screening authorisation. However, this official route for providing translations (i.e. dubbing) is expensive and relatively slow in terms of delivering AV products to consumers; more importantly, a considerable part of foreign programmes is being censored. The drawbacks of this official approach (i.e. temporal, economic and more importantly political and ideological constraints) resulted in the emergence of unofficial subtitling or ‘cybersubtitling’, a term used by Díaz Cintas (2018), as a popular translation practice in the country. Quickly produced subtitles for uncensored AV products are made available by ‘unofficial’ subtitlers and distributed illegally on the black market. Unofficial subtitlers, who have a non-commercial motivation, diversify the audiovisual landscape in the country by creating a specific means of accessing AV products, increasing consumers’ cultural/ideological awareness. In effect, unofficial subtitlers crave differentiated, i.e. de-centralised, patronage which is defined as “typical of (contemporary) democratic or liberal societies, where an array of different patrons are active at the same time and assume disparate ideological positions, and where, for instance, financial success does not necessarily confer status” (Asimakoulas, 2009:242). Nevertheless, this culturally impactful phenomenon is still under-researched in the Iranian context. This inspired the present project to investigate this phenomenon from two perspectives –sociocultural and linguistic– with the aim of addressing the following research

\(^1\) The institution was formed after the Revolution (1979) by merger of the Ministry of Culture and Art and the Ministry of Information and Tourism.
questions, which will be further elaborated upon in the chapter. The first research question comprises two sub-questions.

1. How can the practice of subtitling in Iran and the sociocultural conditions under which it takes place be characterised, i.e,
   a) What is ‘unofficial subtitling’?
   b) Who does it in the Iranian context?

2. What are the most frequently-applied translation strategies for Extralinguistic Cultural References (ECRs) in animated feature films subtitled from English into Persian by unofficial subtitlers?

3. What are the specific patterns of subtitling behaviour when dealing with ECRs that affect the way animated films are presented in the target culture (TC)?

The rationale for posing the above questions is as follows:

The focus of the empirical study is on linguistic manifestations of the subtitling strategies and behaviours in relation to the ECRs (RQ2 and 3). However, following the widely made argument that translation strategy choices are shaped by the sociocultural conditions under which they are made (e.g. Asimakoulas, 2009), insights into the sociocultural conditions of subtitling in Iran (RQ1) will guide the researcher in the interpretation of the findings from the linguistic analysis.

Unofficial subtitlers in Iran are not affiliated to or supervised by any formal institutions, nor are they trained as professional subtitlers, as there is no centralised training for subtitling in the country (although there might be some self-taught, diffused training). Nevertheless, some subtitlers have become recognised and popular among the audience for the high quality of their products.

Unofficial subtitlers in fact play a vital role in the accessibility of AV products in Iran and “have helped the progress of the practice so considerably” in the country (Mollanazar and
Nasrollahi, 2017:157). Nonetheless, this phenomenon has remained under-researched and the sociocultural aspect of this practice has not been addressed by Iranian scholars to date. Instead, a number of studies have been carried out by Iranian scholars with regard to the linguistic aspect of the practice in this context with a focus on interlingual translation strategies these subtitlers opt for mainly in subtitling American (Hollywood) films. Against this backdrop, the first research question of the present study focuses on the sociocultural aspect of the phenomenon to reveal the issues involved in the practice.

Most of the above-mentioned studies were carried out in the 2010s (Barzegar, 2010; Ghaemi and Benyamin, 2010; Jafari, 2013; Sadeghpour and Omar, 2015; Mollanazar and Nasrollahi, 2017 to name a few). Nevertheless, the genre of animation has remained under-researched in the field of subtitling in the Iranian context and to the best knowledge of the researcher only a very small number of studies investigated this genre (e.g. Amirian and Soleymani Dameneh, 2014; Sadeghpour, 2018). In addition to this, due to the specific characteristics the animation genre entails (e.g. creativity and humour), the findings of the studies carried out in film genre might differ from animation, which is the genre under investigation in the present study.

In order to have a more systematic understanding of the linguistic aspect of the practice, phenomena such as cultural references, humour and overall pragmatic effect need to be closely examined, to establish how unofficial subtitlers approach such phenomena in the process of subtitling. This may indirectly shed light on the reasons for the popularity of their products among target users. It may reveal to what extent Iranian unofficial subtitlers employ their personal ideology when dealing with pragmatic language phenomena such as cultural references. This could be interesting against the backdrop that they are not affiliated with any legal, official organisations, i.e. that no overt professional norms or ideology are imposed on their practice top-down.
Dealing with cultural references has always been challenging for translators due to the subjectivity, dynamic nature and relativity characterising their transfer. The comprehension and appreciation of cultural references may even cause problems for the source readership due to different educational and social backgrounds or generation gaps. The network of associations these elements create is specific to and based on the shared experiences of some of the members of the culture of origin (Ramière, 2007), which makes handling these elements in the process of translation worthy of investigation in the field of AVT. Some of these cultural references may offer a high degree of specificity. A case in point are Extralinguistic Cultural References (ECRs), proposed by Pedersen (2005), which according to him, refer to an entity whose referent is assumed to be identifiable by the source audience “as this referent is within the encyclopedic knowledge of this audience” (ibid.:2).

These highly challenging cultural elements have not been dealt with systematically in the Iranian AVT context to date. Thus, the second research question of the thesis focuses precisely on cultural references and aims to reveal the most frequently selected strategies by unofficial subtitlers in treating the ECRs in animated films. This research question will be addressed by means of a systematic theoretical and methodological framework which suits the purpose of the study to investigate the frequency and distribution of patterns in a corpus of the existing subtitles (product-oriented perspective). This will be then used for the purpose of qualitative analysis to explore the subtitlers’ decision-making processes (process-oriented perspective). The above-mentioned analyses will also shed light on the answer to the third research question, which seeks out any recurrent patterns of subtitling behaviour that might affect the way animated films are presented in the TC. To this end, the present study, by investigating the distribution of patterns in the corpus at hand and conducting a qualitative comparative analysis, examines the existing subtitled products of three popular unofficial subtitlers for five animated feature films. The focus is on strategies used for dealing with
ECRs based on a model adapted from Pedersen’s (2011) taxonomy of ECR transfer strategies for the purposes of the present study.

In order to elaborate on the points mentioned in this chapter and to shed more light on the phenomenon and the genre under investigation, Chapter 2 provides an overview of different areas relating to the animation genre. This is followed by a discussion of norms in translation and in subtitling, classifications and taxonomies for the translation of cultural references including ECRs, the modalities of AVT with a focus on subtitling, and the concept of non-professional subtitling. Finally, the chapter provides an overview of the research so far conducted on unofficial subtitling in the Iranian context, arriving at the research gap that this study aims to fill.

Chapter 3 outlines the analytical framework used for the project and the model which was devised accordingly for the purpose of answering the second and the third research questions of the project and of tackling the research gap identified in Chapter 2. This chapter also justifies the material used in this study, sets out the selection criteria and, finally, explains the data analysis procedure.

Chapter 4 provides the analysis of the most striking identified instances of ECRs in the corpus and the corresponding translation solutions adopted by the subtitlers, to see whether the selected unofficial subtitlers demonstrate specific patterns and tendencies in the subtitled products. The analysis is conducted by films and by subtitlers, providing an overview of the distribution of the patterns as well as a qualitative analysis, followed by some concluding remarks regarding the analysis.

Chapter 5 provides a discussion on the findings of the study by providing a systematic discussion on the salient findings previously presented in Chapter 4 to answer the second research question. In the last section, it aims at answering the third research question by elaborating on the findings pertaining to the subtitling behaviour of the subtitlers in the
translation of animated films and the possible impact they might have on the way these products are presented in the TC.

Chapter 6 offers a summary of the main findings of the thesis to examine whether the research questions posed in Chapter 3 have been adequately addressed. The chapter also outlines the contribution of the study, the limitations encountered and, finally, suggestions are made for further avenues to be explored in this area.
Chapter 2

Literature Review

As mentioned previously in Chapter 1, the genre under investigation in the present study is animation. Therefore, this chapter provides an overview of different areas relating to animation, starting with an introduction to animation and a review of the relevant literature on this genre (2.1). This is followed by an overview of the development of animation throughout the years (2.1.1). The next subsection (2.1.2) deals with the impacts of this genre on children, from different perspectives. This is followed by a discussion of animation as a field of academic study and accordingly as an area within the field of Translation Studies (2.1.3). The next section of the chapter begins with an introduction on norms in translation (2.2); the definitions and categories of norms proposed by different scholars are also discussed (2.2.1), followed by a review of the classifications and taxonomies for the translation of cultural references, including Pedersen’s model (2.2.2). The above-mentioned taxonomy by Pedersen is elaborated on in the subsection (2.2.3) that follows. The chapter then continues by reviewing the literature on audiovisual translation (AVT) (2.3) and discussing it as an academic discipline. Types and modalities of AVT are then set out, focusing on subtitling and also comparing it to dubbing (2.3.1). The concept of non-professional subtitling is discussed (2.3.2) and in the final subsection of the chapter (2.3.3), the phenomenon of unofficial subtitling in the Iranian context is extensively reviewed and the existing gap in the related literature is then revealed.

2.1 Animation Genre

Animation is a graphic representation of drawings in movement. Pioneers of animation include Georges Méliès (1902) and Émile Cohl (1907) in France, and Winsor McCay (1911) in the United States, who developed a technique using a series of drawings to obtain the impression of seamless movement between images (Laybourne, 1998). Animated film-
making techniques evolved rapidly in the following years, when Walt Disney took animation to a new level. He was the first animator to add sound to his movie cartoons, starting with the premiere of *Steamboat Willie* in 1928. In 1937, he produced the first full-length animated feature film, *Snow White and the Seven Dwarfs*. Several decades later, and with the introduction of computers, animation took on a whole new meaning and developed new techniques. *Toy Story*, produced by Walt Disney Productions and Pixar Animation Studios, became the first full-length feature film animated entirely on computers when it was released in 1995 (ibid.). In fact, the genre has developed impressively, as can be evidenced by its commercial success and popularity, as well as its complexity of form and oeuvre.

The same evolution has also been observed with regard to the theme and topics of animated films, as they evolved from being somewhat simplistic and relatively one-dimensional to covering a wealth of topics, with a balanced presentation of different ages, gender identities, and attitudes to life, which, in a way, has made this genre unique among other AV cultural products.

One prominent difference between animation and other forms of moving images is the scope of imagination it offers through the human’s mind. This has been supported by a number of scholars, including Thompson and Bordwell (2003) who claim that animation has absolute control over the *mise-en-scène*. It allows the film maker to draw literally anything either from the real world or his or her own imagination.

In other words, through animation, the ultimate level of the human’s imagination can be visualised, which makes it one of the most versatile and explicit means of communication.

In what follows, emphasis is placed on the development of this powerful mass communication technique, and the way it has evolved throughout the years. The section will discuss animation’s relation to culture and postmodernism and will then engage with the most recent and prominent method of animation production, i.e. computer-generated imagery.
(CGI). Further to this, the remarkable impact of CGI on the aesthetics of the genre, and also on the narrative and use of language in animation, which are likely to have a considerable impact on its translation, is discussed.

### 2.1.1 The Development of Animation

A film-making technique which began in the 1890s, animation has maintained its popularity over the decades and now plays a more significant role in the arts and entertainment industry than ever before (Lord and Sibley, 2004:17). According to Wells (1998:184):

> Animation, from its earliest developments, has prioritised the ‘temporal imagination’, predominantly in the comic mode, as a liberating form of expression in the face of the institutionalisation of mainstream live-action cinema. Its agenda from the outset has been to challenge the ideological certainties naturalised in photographic realism, and the emergence of classical Hollywood narrative. This was further enhanced by the use of different kinds of animation as an alternative and as more or less conscious resistance to the industrialisation of the form, and to the hyper-realistic consistency of the Disney Studio in the late 1930s and 1940s. Furthermore, animation did not merely contribute to defining, promoting and engaging with ‘popular culture’; it also undermined ‘high art’ in the course of developing many of its graphic and aesthetic qualities.

A piece of art is postmodern if it displays the traits and features that are generally associated with postmodernism. In his study on animation and post-modernity, Salmon (2007) suggested that the main characteristics of post-modernity can be applied to some recent animations. He further states that it is apparent that postmodern characteristics are being identified and applied to animation discourse when we consider the following statement by Lindvall and Melton (1994:71):

> Animated film serves as a site for exploring certain aspects of postmodernism, particularly the realms of double-coding, intertextuality, and carnival comedy. Its use of pastiche and parody, of extended quotation, and of multiple perspectives – of
heteroglossia within one small discourse – situate it as a prime property for postmodern analysis.

Additionally, Wells (2002) suggests that, based on the notion that postmodernism is the integration of high art and popular culture, animation has been viewed as a low art form of popular culture since it involves cartoons, comics and the mass marketing of trademarked characters and properties. However, he also adds that there has recently been an increased academic interest in the genre, as animation gains higher status as an art form. Precisely because of this distinctive feature, animated films lend themselves to a re-evaluation. Since the 1980s, cultural studies have indeed focused on the materiality of culture, and distinctions between high and low culture have been blurred. The same can be said about the general understanding of culture as making on the one hand, an elitist view of culture, and on the other hand, culture as being. The latter implies a more participatory and inclusive approach to culture in all its manifestations. As practices of cultural consumption and conceptions associated with cultural consumption (and production) shifted, so did the academic study of culture. Therefore, it could be argued that animated films, precisely because of their playful nature, have become a focus of academic and popular interest over time.

In this vein, Salmon (2007) has applied the characteristics of postmodernism to three animations: *Shrek*, *Fantasia 2000*, and *The Maxx*. His findings outline these characteristics in the chosen material; he relates the combination of Disney cartoons with classical music in *Fantasia 2000* to high and low art, as characteristics of postmodernism. The high level of parody, pastiche and appropriation that exist in *Shrek’s* irreverent treatment of the fairy tale genre, and the references to new technologies and mass media and avoidance of narrative closure in the animated adaptation of Sam Keith’s comic book *The Maxx*, also represent postmodernism characteristics. Based on the above observations, Salmon then establishes that animation is a medium that can be discussed within a postmodern context.
Among other aspects of this fast-evolving genre, aesthetics and commercial triumph is of high importance. Computer-generated imagery (CGI) has become the dominant method of producing animations and has had a remarkable impact on the aesthetics of the genre. A growing number of feature-length animations are being produced every year, and animation is becoming increasingly high-profile on the Internet and in the world of advertising. Right from its conception, an animated feature requires an enormous communication and marketing effort in many countries, and hence in many languages. Animated films are also enjoying increasing commercial success; of the 30 highest-grossing films worldwide in 2010, six were animated features (Toy Story 3 was the most commercially successful film of that year worldwide) (Schauffler, 2012). Furthermore, Frozen, Despicable Me 2, Monsters University, and The Croods were respectively the 3rd, 4th, 7th, and 14th highest-grossing films of 2013 worldwide. In 2014, How to Train Your Dragon 2, Rio 2, and The Lego Movie were the 11th, 13th, and 15th highest-grossing films (Schlossberg, 2014).

Animation development is taking a step forward by merging with other genres, namely live-action films. According to Wells and Hardstaff (2008:26), current critical discourse is signalling a possible convergence of animation and live-action. This refers to the frequent use of computer-generated special effects in live-action films, but also productions such as A Scanner Darkly (2006) directed by Richard Linklater (Image 2.1 below), where the two categories visibly merge to create a distinct hybrid look, as the film was shot digitally and then all live-action movement traced over by animators, a technique referred to as “rotoscoping” (Schauffler, 2012:67). The same applies to other productions such as the feature WALL-E (2008), which is largely computer-animated but also features segments that include live-action characters. Disney has turned a lot of its animated classics into live action, including Dumbo (1941) directed by Ben Sharpsteen, Aladdin (1992) directed by Ron
Clements and John Musker and *Mulan* (1998)\(^2\) directed by Tony Bancroft and Barry Cook. Director Jon Favreau proved with *The Jungle Book* (2016) that the technology developed to bring these animals to life through CGI did create an immersive new adventure that justified its existence. The forthcoming Disney live action film, *The Lion King* (Image 2.2 below), which will be released in July 2019, once more proves the remarkable improvement of technology in the field of animation. The first look at this live action film, from director Jon Favreau, was shown at D23 Expo 2017 California, receiving great attention and praise from the audience and reviewers (Foutch, 2017).

The fact that CGI is becoming ever cheaper and more mainstream arguably adds further to the influence and success of this rapidly expanding technology. Yet, even as these fundamentally different methods of film-making (i.e. CGI and live action) seem to be

\(^2\) Here the dates refer to the original productions of the said animations.
converging or increasingly co-operating, animation can nevertheless be considered a category of film that has its own defining characteristics. “Many animated films have in common a certain narrative mode which is based on a highly specific film-making process: a world is created from scratch without the application of any rules” (Schauffler, 2012:68). The distinctive language of animation, as described by Wells (1998), emphasises the methods and techniques used in animation making. These techniques include Metamorphosis, Condensation, Anthropomorphism, Fabrication, Penetration, and Symbolic association. The above-mentioned elements, which are typical of animation, influence the aesthetic structure of the animation, as well as the narrative and use of language, which are likely to have a considerable impact on its translation. By means of these film-making techniques, takes or scenes in animated features can be engineered to support one particular instance of verbal/form-based humour. Writers and animators are able to indulge in linguistic creativity, without having to fear a breach of realist conventions or credibility. They have a great wealth of stylistic means at their disposal and are able to use suggestion and symbolism to any degree that they choose. The creativity feature offered by the genre often results in great linguistic originality (Schauffler, 2012:69). One famous example is the hissing idiolect of Kaa the snake in Disney’s The Jungle Book (1967), which characterises her as a snake, but also as a less-than-trustworthy character (ibid.). This is also true in the case of made-up dialects; for example, The Smurfs use specific vocabulary that cannot be found anywhere else, sci-fi speak features in Final Fantasy and gothic/horror-speak appears in Tokyo Ghoul; and there may even be animated films with made-up languages. In comparison to live action, animation by its very nature requires more description to effectively communicate the visual. Therefore, the key difference between an animated and live-action script is that an animation script usually contains more detailed scene descriptions. In live action, the director interprets the written word, and thus expands on it. However, in animation, the writing is generally
more literally interpreted, and most storyboard artists often just translate the written word to visual images (Scott, 2011). The animation writer must describe the action as precisely as necessary to translate their creative vision or thoughts into sequences we can see on screen. This is essential when scripts are sent overseas to be animated, as a complex act of intersemiotic translation (Jakobson, 2000) may take place; in cases where the description is imprecise or not extensive enough, the translation to other languages and cultures leaves a lot of room for misinterpretation. It may seem like a burden to the animation writer to have more responsibility and to need to write more detailed descriptions, nevertheless, the merit is that the animation writer will learn to visualise, ‘humourise’ and ‘emotionalise’ a story (Scott, 2011). Obviously, the above-mentioned type of intersemiotic translation may also depend on the type of collaboration assumed to exist between the animation writer and their animators; as in any other type of translation job, the longer one collaborates, the more implicit the ‘translation brief’ becomes.

Having discussed the development of animation from the perspective of form, the next section will focus on consumers and the gate-keeping function that affects consumption among these consumers in terms of entertainment, education, and potential psychological effects (e.g. violence). In addition to this, the importance of taking these elements into account, both in the production of animations as well as during the process of translation, is dealt with in the same subsection.

2.1.2 The Impact of Animation on Children

It has been proven by numerous studies conducted by researchers and educational practitioners that animation facilitates learning (e.g. Morrison et al., 2002). Although the effect of animated graphics on learning is still controversial, one of the main reasons for the growing popularity of animation seems to be the belief that animation is more interesting, aesthetically appealing, and therefore more motivating than other film genres for children.
The worlds depicted in animations tend to be vibrant, spectacular and new, with endless possibilities.

Animations are believed to be a valuable source of so-called ‘edutainment’, a mixture of education and entertainment. This has led to a phenomenon that Wells and Hardstaff (2008:49) have referred to as the “persistent juvenilisation of animation to lend innocence and stealth to adult agendas”. This has occasionally led researchers to describe the use of animation as a powerful ‘Trojan horse’ useful for adults to ‘slip’ educational material into the ‘innocent’ entertainment of children (ibid.:49).

Researchers have delved into the impact of animation on children’s education. According to a report by Gill (1975), entitled “The Effects of Cartoon Characters as Motivators of Preschool Disadvantaged Children”, cartoon characters stimulate interpersonal behaviour, learning and social growth. If a cartoon character conveys an educational or moral lesson, then it can help speed up the learning process in children. In a study carried out in one of primary schools in North Cyprus by Burcu (2014), cartoon characters were used in mathematics education at primary level. The findings proved that cartoon characters were highly influential in the learning process and can be adapted to increase students’ achievement in mathematics lessons.

The possibility of using animations in promoting child literacy is currently being investigated around the world. Parry (2013:56) argues that:

> The relationship between film and children’s literacy is a rich and promising one. Children learn about how to read and enjoy films by watching and engaging with them. The complex and sophisticated meta-language of films is regularly made sense of and enjoyed by children, who develop implicit knowledge of the way films are constructed.

This also has implications for translation, as it emphasises the fact that taking into account the semiotics of the programme by subtitlers will contribute to the success of the translation as
the images are also a part of the message that need to be rendered. Different cultures and different generations within cultures, however, perceive the relation between image and language differently as images are “culture-bound references in themselves and always subject to ideological framing” (Díaz Cintas and Remael, 2007:46).

Animations may possibly serve as an alternative way to educate children because such type of drawings normally include some sense of humour, which is essential to a child’s learning and development. It has been determined that teaching students using an extremely serious attitude generally results in students that are tense and intimidated (Singer et al., 1999). The feature of humour in animations facilitates child literacy by attracting students to have confidence in tackling difficult subjects such as science and maths (Ulloth, 2002). Animation today is not just confined to movies and video games; the areas of its application are boundless. Some promotional videos or corporate videos of companies contain animations as they look accessible and creative, also promoting an image of the company as ‘friendly’.

One of the reasons animations are now found so widely is that many people believe that animations can help learners to understand complex ideas more easily. The process of teaching and learning gets a whole new experience when animations are used during the process.

It should be noted that, while having benefits for the viewers as mentioned above, animation, like other forms of entertainment (e.g. video games), might have negative impacts on the audience, specifically when it comes to young children. Violence, for instance, could be one of the undesirable impacts this genre might entail, which needs to be taken into account both in the production of animation (visual and verbal aspects) as well as in the translation of these products. To elaborate on this point, according to Bibi and Zehra (2012), children (of a certain age, especially young children) consider the things they watch in cartoons to be real, and they are unable to differentiate between fantasy and reality. They may believe that if a
character remains unharmed after an action scene, or if a character has supernatural powers, so can they. Therefore, it is important to discuss the potential impact of violence in animation on children’s life.

Many animations depict scenes of violence or danger, yet whitewash the effects of that violence. Without proper lessons to counterbalance those effects, children may grow up aggressive and eager to engage in violence, unaware that the real world contains far more consequences than what an animation depicts. Colman et al. (2014) studied the top 45 highest-grossing animated films of all time, from classics like *Snow White* (1937) to modern hits like *Frozen* (2013). They then tallied the death toll and compared it to the number of deaths in the top two highest-grossing films from each of the years the animated movies were released. They found the deaths of villains particularly problematic, because they may give children the wrong impression. They also claimed traumatic cartoon moments can have a lasting effect on younger children (ibid.). In the same vein, Sebastian (2010:11) states that “Violent animation programmes increase aggressiveness and desensitise a child to understand the feeling of others; they blur a child’s ability to distinguish real life from simulation”. Some studies seem to link violence in animation to a desensitisation when it comes to real-life violence. According to research carried out by the American Academy of Pediatrics (AAP) and the American Academy of Child and Adolescent Psychiatry (AACAP), “[c]hildren who view shows in which violence is very realistic, frequently repeated or unpunished, are more likely to imitate what they see” (Bibi and Zehra, 2012:online).

Because children identify readily with animation characters, such characters can be positive role models that encourage good moral behaviour. *Superman*, for example, is honest and brave, constantly standing up for the rights of others. The characters in the *Toy Story* movies do anything for their friends, while *Jimmy Neutron* demonstrates the value of studying and intelligence. Even *Popeye*, who lives in a world where violence solves problems, can
encourage children to eat their vegetables. Another example is *Monsters University*, which encourages young people to pursue their dreams, and to do so with humility, hard work, integrity, and an uncompromising commitment to honesty.

When an animated feature film is directed at a young audience, there are various considerations to be made in terms of the purpose of the production, be it education, entertainment or edutainment, but also in terms of its content and the potential impact this may have, particularly on very small children. These considerations are to be made at the stage of production of the source material, but they are just as important in translation, where strategies and decision-making come into the equation, especially because some aesthetic or functional aspects may need to be culturally filtered.

The translation of animated material falls within the area of audiovisual translation, of which it is a specific case. Before dealing with this area of translation, the animation genre needs to be looked into from a different perspective, to be systematically linked to the area of AVT. For this purpose, in what follows, detailed attention is given to this genre as an academic field of study.

### 2.1.3 Animation as a Field of Academic Studies

According to Wells (2002:6), the director of the Animation Academy in Loughborough University and Chair of the Association of British Animation Collections (ABAC), “animation is the most dynamic form of expression available to creative people. Animation is a cross-disciplinary and inter-disciplinary art and craft, science, social science and much more”. Preston Blair (cited in Wells, 2002:4), veteran animator at Disney, states that “animation is both art and craft; it is a process in which the cartoonist, illustrator, fine artist, screen writers, musicians, camera operator and motion picture director combine their skills to create a new breed of artist – the animator” (ibid.). Wells insist that animation is an art that remains consistently and insistently experimental, as it keeps growing in terms of mass
popularity and acceptance, and that it needs to be more widely acknowledged and recognised for its achievements, impact and continuing significance in the contemporary world. He further states that “animation is arguably the most important creative form of the twenty first century. [...] It is the omnipresent pictorial form of the modern era” (ibid.:1).

Despite the ubiquitous status of animation in everyday life, from TV commercials to feature length animations and other uses of animation on the web, this genre has long been neglected both critically and academically, frequently dismissed as an entertainment form merely aimed at children. However, the status of animation has gradually changed, and the profile and popularity of the genre have raised noticeably in recent years, with animation being granted its own Academy Award category and also the emergence of institutions and establishments dedicated to animation, such as The Society for Animation Studies (Davidson, 2003). In the same way, Wells (2002:1) states that the genre has undergone a remarkable development from being considered mainly as a genre of children’s entertainment or an American (cartoon) tradition to being recognised universally as an art form and a medium of expression. The establishment of the nomination for the best animated feature film in the Oscars, which was introduced later than other films, substantiates this argument.

The issue of complexity and double-layeredness has always been a focus in products intended for children, including children’s literature and adaptations of children’s literature for the big screen. This means that children are not the only audience that this genre addresses. The narrative and story plot of an animation in actual fact addresses two audiences: “children, who want to be entertained and possibly informed, and adults, who have quite different tastes and literary expectations” (O’Connell, 1999:209). The latter group is a conglomerate of editors, publishers, parents, educators, academics and critics (Puurtinen, 1995). Ultimately, it is adults who decide what is written, published, praised and purchased. According to Shavit (1986), some children’s stories like Alice in Wonderland are ambivalent texts as they can be
read by the first layer audience, i.e. children, on a conventional and literal level but interpreted by the second layer audience, i.e. adults, on a more sophisticated level. Puurtinen (1995:17) calls this genre unusual due to the following characteristics it holds:

The numerous functions it fulfils and the diverse cultural constraints under which it operates. Children’s literature belongs simultaneously to the literary system and the social-educational system, i.e. it is not only read for entertainment, recreation, and literary experience but also used as a tool for education and socialization. This dual character affects both the writing and the translation of children’s literature, whose relationships with literary, social and educational norms make it a fascinating and fruitful field of research.

The original texts of some children’s stories can be adapted to the culture and the social norms of the target community in order to make them more acceptable for the target reader/audience. As a case in point, Pinocchio has been translated and adapted into several languages and cultures. Deliberate changes in the story and its basic theme, ideological views hostile to children and the working class and ideas on how children’s personalities should develop have been introduced to these versions, making them very different from Collodi’s original (Wunderlich, 1992:198, as cited in O’Sullivan, 2005). The first American translation in 1904, for instance, is adapted to the social and political order, resulting from the industrialisation of the country towards the end of nineteenth century. In this cultural context, all scenes of violence, social criticism and ridiculing of grown-ups by children are systematically cut from the story (O’Sullivan, 2005:143). Further remarkable rewriting of the character occurred in Walt Disney’s Pinocchio (1939), where the protagonist was presented as polite, loving, and innocent incapable of any mischiefs (ibid.).

In 1977, the Japanese produced a fifty-two-part animated series of the story, going even further than Disney by simplifying and toning down the rebellious character of the original Pinocchio, making him instead a constantly entertaining character. This Pinocchio was a silhouette, which can be identified as a ‘child’ all over the world (O’Sullivan, 2005). The
Japanese series was shown on TV in 1980s in Iran (dubbed in Persian) and became one of the most popular cartoons during that period. The main message of this version was to be obedient and follow what your parents and grown-ups advise you to do, and to never listen to your peers or people who try to tempt you to do something that will defy your parents’ wishes or unsettle them in any way. Such changes over time indicate norms in production and reception. They are also a sign of the cultural impact that animated films have among viewers. The two adaptations mentioned above are probably some of the versions that millions of viewers, adults and children alike, may remember best and it is a version where Pinocchio’s image is idealised for the sake of addressing a wide audience. At the same time, they serve as effective vehicles of morals for children.

With the development of animation, the double-layeredness discussed above can be increasingly observed. As Ahluwalia, (2016:2) puts it, “animation is moving away from its traditional target audience, and is developing layers that both young adults and adults are able to relate to and appreciate. They appeal to and can be understood in different ways by people of all ages.” A very good example of this might be Pixar’s 2015 release, and 2016 Oscar Winner for animation, *Inside Out*. Although producers asserted that themes of emotional complexity and the difficulties of growing up could be understood by young audiences, many critics and adult viewers were not sure at whom the movie was really targeted. In other words, although the story was simple enough for children to follow, with artfully created animation, engaging characters, uncomplicated humour and a clear story, it was adults who were fascinated by its careful, insightful exploration of human emotions (ibid.). The popularity of animations like this, and the overall popularity of this genre nowadays throughout the world, means that there is a market for its translation and confirms that this medium deserves greater attention.
As mentioned above, animation has recently changed from being considered merely an art form and medium of entertainment for children, to being more complex and multifaceted, and a valid field of academic study. According to Ward (2003:135), “the fact that there is a Society for Animation Studies suggests that ‘Animation’ exists as an identifiable object of study, epistemologically separable from other forms of ‘artistic’ or ‘mass media’ endeavour”. Nevertheless, whether enough attention has been paid to this genre in academia remains questionable.

In this vein, Darley (2007:64) states that animation has not received as much scholarly attention and appreciation as other media, in particular, live-action film, and it has also been considered as trivial and rudimentary by cultural commentators. In fact, it has been overshadowed by live-action films mainly in the 20th century due to the considerations of moving image culture, which caused animation not to achieve the degree of academic disciplinary significance that has been given to live-action under the title of ‘Film Studies’. In this regard, Lamarre (2008) states that only recently has animation begun to get attention within academia. The 1990s was the period when animation gained enough significance, which resulted in animation being frequently presented as a field of analysis distinct from other disciplines, including Film Studies (Lamarre 2008). This could be due to the fact that there were fewer animated films in previous decades, therefore animation was not as visible and prevalent as it is today.

According to Ward (2006:229), animation “has its own logic and methods and it should be studied and dealt with as an autonomous discipline”. He further states, due to the fact that animation is a diverse medium and the notions of art and craft are attached to it as an activity, the relationship between practice and theory is of high significance in the field of Animation Studies. Admittedly, as a rich, multifaceted activity, animation exists in many different places at once, with an intuitive, magical nature that necessitates an in-depth theoretical
investigation to discover all the facts and complications involved with this challenging enterprise (ibid.).

As Darley (2007) puts it, there are different aspects of animation, including forms, styles and cultural diversity that have not yet received in-depth investigation. These aspects, specifically the technical characteristics related to the production process of animation, make it distinct from other forms of moving image. As a case in point, in terms of the differences between animation and live-action, the former transforms reality and presents metaphysical reality and what things mean, while the latter imitates real life and presents physical reality and how things look (ibid.:73).

Recent scholarship, however, has been trying to recover animation history and has delved into its multifaceted nature to recognise its cultural significance. Nonetheless, despite the emerging change in understanding and appreciating this genre, animation is still a rather under-studied subject field within the academy. Other aspects of animation still need to be researched and investigated, namely, its history, techniques, specific characteristics, production, dissemination, reception by the audience, and finally the cultural contexts (ibid.).

On the other hand, academic books, courses, conferences, seminars, and papers that focus on animation, plus the establishment of the Society for Animation Studies in 1987, are strong evidence that ‘Animation Studies’ exists, even if it is not as established and recognised as ‘Film Studies’.

Having discussed the academic aspects of animation, the concept of norms in translation needs to be explored, since reviewing the literature on norms and conventions in subtitling will enable the researcher to investigate the existing subtitles. Accordingly, the following section is dedicated to the discussion of norms of translation, and the influence these norms have on subtitling in general and on non-professional subtitling in particular.
2.2 Norms in Translation

The concept of ‘norm’ has been defined by translation scholars in different ways. According to Toury, norms are central to the act and the event of translating. He defines norms as “the translation of general values or ideas shared by a certain community – as to what is right and wrong, adequate and inadequate – into specific performance-instructions appropriate for and applicable to specific situations” (Toury, 1980:51), and characterises them as “a category for descriptive analysis of translation phenomena” (ibid.:57). The discovery and description of norms is fundamental to empirical work in Descriptive Translation Studies (DTS), as “in the descriptive paradigm norms provide the first level of abstraction and the first step towards explanation of the choices and decisions which translators make” (Hermans, 1999:79).

2.2.1 Definitions and Categories for Norms in Translation

Norms in translation have been defined and classified differently by scholars in the field. Toury (1980) describes three kinds of norms: preliminary norms, initial norms and operational norms. Preliminary norms guide the overall translation strategy and the choice of texts to be translated. Initial norms, govern the translator’s decision whether to stick to the source text or to the target culture. Operational norms, control the actual decisions made in the process of translation. If it is accepted that norms are central to translating, then their nature and their function need to be explained more systematically.

Bartsch (1987), by applying the norms concept to linguistics, differentiates between product norms and production norms. Product norms stipulate what a product must look like in order to be regarded as appropriate and correct. In other words, these norms relate to both the linguistic correctness as well as the correctness of their use and functionality. Production norms, on the other hand, relate to the methods and strategies by which a correct product can be achieved, which is similar to Toury’s ‘operational norms’.
Chesterman (1997) introduced two sets of norms, i.e. *expectancy norms* and *professional norms*. Expectancy norms, also referred to as ‘product norms’, relate to what the target language community expects a translation to look like ‘regarding grammaticality, acceptability, appropriateness, style, textuality, preferred conventions of form or discourse and the like’ (Chesterman, 1997:64). Expectancy norms “can be influenced by economic or ideological factors, power relations within and between cultures and the like” (ibid.). Professional norms, also referred to as ‘process norms’, govern the accepted methods and strategies of the translation process. They reflect or take into account the expectancy norms, since “any process norm is determined by the nature of the end-product which it is designed to lead to” (ibid.:67). Professional norms can be subdivided into three major types: *accountability norms*, *communication norms*, *relation norms* (Schäffner, 1999).

Accountability norms, which have an ethical dimension, deal with the question of whether translators are loyal to the original writer, to the commissioner of the translation job, or to their clients/prospective readers. Communication norms, which are related to the social aspect, stipulate that translators should act in such a way as to optimize communication (be truthful, be clear, be relevant) as required by the situation. Relation norms deal with the relation between the source and the target text. The translator must make a judgement considering the text type, the commissioner’s demand, the intention of the original writer, as well as the needs of prospective readers (ibid.).

Oser (1998:53) believes there are four kinds of norms that affect translation practice: linguistic norms of the SL; norms of the translation process (what some translators would call their translation philosophy), linguistic norms of the TL; norms governing the expectation of the TC (the TL receptor). Depending on how translators respond to the above, there might be periods or some individuals translating extremely literally, or, to look at the other extreme,
very freely (e.g. “English renderings of Omar Khayyam [Iranian astronomer and mathematician] by FitzGerald were exceptionally free”) (ibid.:55).

However, he also critically states that what we sometimes describe as a translation norm may be a manifestation of a broader social norm. Osers uses the example of censorship, e.g. Victorian era, tabooisation of many topics including sex, where authors would say ‘limb’ instead of ‘leg’ to refer to pieces of furniture and they would cover legs of tables with petticoats. These are social attitudes and they do not apply to translation exclusively, they also apply to original writing. However, individual translation philosophy as a norm may exist. Some translators simply prefer to produce receptor-oriented translations (domestication), others opt for ST-oriented ones and trends may cancel each other out even in the same society (therefore, no clear picture may emerge) (ibid.:56).

In a similar vein, Schäffner (1999) states, the selection, production and reception of translations all depend on the translation norms that prevail at a certain period and within a certain society: “Translational behaviour is contextualised as social behaviour, and translational norms are understood as internalised behavioural constraints which embody the values shared by a community. All decisions in the translation process are thus primarily governed by such norms, and not (dominantly or exclusively) by the two language systems involved” (ibid.:5). According to Hermans (1999), the norms and conventions of translation guide and facilitate decision-making. The basic premise is that translation, as a communicative act, constitutes a form of social behaviour. For communication to succeed, those engaged in the process need to coordinate their actions (ibid.:80).

As Pedersen (2011) puts it, the concept of ‘norm’ may on the face of it be seen as part of the prescriptive paradigm, as some sort of rigid decree. In other words, norms may appear as something that tells people what to do and what is ‘normal’. When the regularities of translation become prevalent and acknowledged by translators, they find an intersubjective
existence known as ‘descriptive norms’. By contrast, ‘prescriptive norms’ are imposed on us by an authority (ibid.:29). According to Hermans (2013), as the prescriptive force of norms increases from the permissive to the mandatory, they move away from conventions toward rules, which may be understood as institutionalised, usually explicit obligations and prohibitions issued by an identifiable authority with the power to impose specific sanctions for transgressions.

Chesterman (2006) believes that norms do not affect behaviour directly, because their influence must be filtered through the translator’s mind as decisions are made during the translation act. If translators are aware of norms, they adopt attitudes to them by choosing either to follow them or not. Pedersen (2011) believes norms indicate what translators do, and how they solve a certain problem; in this view, norms could be said to embody the collective experience of translators. According to Pedersen (2011:35):

> The advantage of Toury’s norm system is that it is holistic: it takes the whole process into consideration, not only translation itself. The drawback is that the terms are somewhat ambivalent. Furthermore, in Toury’s system, all norms seem equally pertinent, but in actual fact they have very unequal leverage. While all Toury’s norms should be taken into consideration when analysing translations, in actual practice the main focus will inevitably be the textual-linguistic norms, as some of the others could be easily investigated.

Chesterman’s norms, on the other hand, are based on the elements that create the norms rather than on the translation process. According to Pedersen (2011:36), one advantage of Chesterman’s norms is that the role of the reader is of prominent significance. In addition to this, making a distinction between product and process is another advantage of Chesterman’s norms. Such a distinction can also be seen in Toury’s norms, as his ‘acceptability norm’ deals with the relationship between the reader and the translated text. Nevertheless, in Chesterman’s norms this relationship has been prioritised over everything else. Pedersen (2011) explains that, since Chesterman’s model of norms emphasises the role of the audience,
it is preferred in the translation of audiovisual texts. Additionally, in making a clear
difference between the process and product of the translation activity, Chesterman’s model is
especially useful in subtitling (ibid.).

Having argued the distinction between product and process in norms of translation, another
set of norms that is considered to be beneficial in translation is that of Karamitroglou (1998),
who introduces a more practical understanding of the concept of norms in the context of
subtitling. In his study, Karamitroglou has examined the choice between subtitling and
dubbing for children’s programmes in Greece, which could be relevant to the present study,
in that Iran exhibits parallel AVT traditions, with a preference to dub programmes officially,
but to subtitle programmes unofficially. Karamitroglou’s work refers more to the
technicalities of subtitling, such as space, time, punctuation and editing. The norms proposed
by Karamitroglou (1998) for TV subtitles are briefly discussed below.

These norms are related to a number of parameters, namely: 1. Spatial parameter / layout, 2.
Temporal parameter / duration, 3. Punctuation and letter case, and 4. Target text editing. Each
of these categories outlines the norms and conventions in detail. For example, in the first
group, i.e. spatial parameters, he points to the position of the subtitle on the screen, the
number of lines presented at a time etc. When it comes to temporal parameters, he mentions
the maximum and minimum duration of a full two-line and also single-line subtitle, leading-
in time, lagging-out time, etc. When it comes to punctuation and letter case, he explains the
standards on the use of sequence dots, linking dots, dashes, question marks, etc. In target text
editing segmentations, omitting or retaining the linguistic items from the original are
discussed. With regard to culture specific linguistic elements, he believes that there are no
standard guidelines for the transfer of these elements. However, he suggests that there are
five possible alternatives for such a transfer: a) cultural transfer, b) transposition, c)
transposition with explanation, d) neutralisation (plain explanation), e) omission. He further
states that the choice of which option to apply depends on the culture specific linguistic element itself, as well as on the broader, contextual, linguistic or non-linguistic audio and visual situation by which it is surrounded. As outlined above, Karamitroglou’s (1998) classification of norms mainly focuses on the technicalities of subtitling rather than the linguistic aspect. In order to look into the linguistic aspect of subtitling, with the specific focus on cultural references, the next subsection outlines the classifications and taxonomies proposed by different scholars for identifying and treating these elements.

2.2.2 Classifications and Taxonomies for the Translation of Cultural References

Cultural references have always been considered one of the most problematic aspects of translation. From being accused of creating culture ‘bumps’ in translation (Leppihalme, 1997) to being considered as ‘translational hurdles’, specifically in the field of AVT, (Chiaro, 2009), they have widely been recognised by scholars as being one of the most challenging and problematic elements in translation studies. In experimental situations, cultural references, have been shown to slow down translators or at least to cause them to think of multiple alternatives whilst translating (Kruger, 2016). Apart from the fact that cultural references are challenging, they anchor a text to a cultural and narrative context, and can be humorous and convey information about the wit or personality of the characters (many of whom are a combination of caricature and of more person-like features). In other words, they are good indicators of how a translator may treat original material creatively and of how they apply a so-called cultural filter (House, 2015). Accordingly, these elements have been classified by several scholars, some of whom have also proposed strategies for treating them. A number of these strategies are outlined below.

One classification of cultural references is proposed by Newmark (1988), which is mainly based on different fields (such as ecology, artefacts, social culture, organisations, customs, activities, gestures and habits) relating to a culture specific lexicon. Mailhac (1996:133-
134), focuses on the nature of Culture Specific References (CSRs), and defines them as: “any reference to a cultural entity which, due to its distance from the target culture, is characterized by a sufficient degree of opacity for the target reader to constitute a problem”. His definition emphasizes the fact that the interpretation of these elements is characterized by varying degrees of subjectivity. Another important contribution to the classification of cultural references emerged in the context of AVT research. In his work on subtitling, Pedersen (2005:2) refers to these elements as Extralinguistic Cultural References (ECRs), defining an ECR as:

Reference that is attempted by means of any culture-bound linguistic expression, which refers to an extralinguistic entity or process, and which is assumed to have a discourse referent that is identifiable to relevant audience as this referent is within the encyclopedic knowledge of this audience.

Also in the context of audiovisual translation, Díaz Cintas and Remael (2007) distinguish between three main groups of cultural references: geographical (including physical geography and weather), ethnographic (including objects from everyday life, art, an individual’s cultural or social provenance), and socio-political (administration and institutions). Chiaro (2009) divides these elements into three macro categories of highly culture specific references, language specific features, and areas of overlap between language and culture.

Ranzato (2016), proposed a taxonomy to be used as a practical tool for analysis, which is mainly concerned with conceptual rather than lexical groupings of the CSRs. Her taxonomy has been predominantly proposed by taking the point of view of the target audience in its relationship with the source text. Her classification, in fact, focuses on the very nature of CSRs within the relationship between target text (TT) and source text (ST), from the exclusive point of view of the target culture (Ranzato, 2016:63). It also distinguishes
between real-world and intertextual references. The former are the references to non-fictional entities and events, while the latter are indirect or direct allusions to other texts, creating a relationship between the translated text and other texts (literary, audiovisual, and artistic). These allusions are not always verbal but also include non-verbal references such as images of red shoes and a rainbow to allude to *The Wizard of Oz* (ibid.), as well as acoustic references. According to Diaz Cintas and Remael (2007:46), “the most difficult situation arises when a linguistic sign, a phrase, refers metaphorically to an iconographic sign or image that the source and target culture do not share”.

In Ranzato’s (2016) taxonomy, cultural references are furthermore categorised as synchronous or asynchronous, which means that these references can also be time specific as well as culture specific. If the cultural references do not belong to the same time in which the audience live, they are ‘asynchronous references’ (ibid.:75). Being influenced by Pedersen’s (2005) transculturality parameter (as one of the parameters influencing the translator’s choices in treating cultural references), the taxonomy for the classification of CSRs proposed by Ranzato (2016) is illustrated in Table 2.1 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Real-world references</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Source culture references</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Intercultural references</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Third culture references</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Target culture references</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intertextual references</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5. Overt intertextual allusions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Covert intertextual allusions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Intertextual macroallusions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All of the above can be:

- Verbal or non-verbal cultural references
- Synchronous or asynchronous cultural references

Table 2.1 Ranzato’s Classification of CSRs (2016:64)

In the above category, intercultural reference is “a reference which has forged a dialogue between the SC and the TC”. They are “originally SC references which have been absorbed, in various degrees, by the TC, which has, to some extent, made them their own” (ibid.:66).
Third culture references refer to “elements which do not originally belong either to the SC or the TC but to a third culture[…] food and festivities, but also celebrities, often belong to this category” (ibid.:67). Having discussed the classifications of cultural references proposed by the scholars in the field, in what follows, the taxonomies of strategies for rendering these elements are addressed.

A number of different taxonomies has been proposed with regard to the strategies for the treatment of CSRs. In a widely-cited early study, Vinay and Darbelnet (1958) introduced a taxonomy which includes two macro strategies, i.e. Direct translation (including borrowing, calque, and literal translation) and Oblique translation (including transposition, modulation, equivalence, and adaptation). Ivir (1987) proposed seven strategies for translating CSRs, namely: borrowing, definition, literal translation, substitution, lexical creation, addition, and omission. Díaz Cintas and Remael (2007) proposed a detailed set of strategies for translating CSRs with the focus on subtitling: loan, calque, explicitation, substitution, transposition, lexical recreation, compensation, omission, and addition. Pedersen (2005), also with a focus on subtitling, proposed seven main strategies for the translation of what he calls ‘Extralinguistic Cultural References’ as: Official equivalent, retention, specification, direct translation, generalisation, substitution, and omission. Leppihalme (2011), proposed a taxonomy for ‘realia’ (a term referring to CSRs, proposed by Vlahov and Florin (1969)), with the main focus on translating proper names as follows: Direct transfer, Calque, cultural adaptation, superordinate term, explicitation, addition, and omission. Ranzato’s (2016) taxonomy of translation strategies for CSRs (with a focus on dubbing) comprises eleven strategies as follows: Loan, Official translation, Calque, Explicitation, Generalisation by hypernym, Concretisation by hyponym, Substitution, Lexical recreation, Compensation, Elimination and Creative addition. Pedersen (2005) further proposed his model in 2011 with some adjustments, as is discussed extensively in the next subsection. The rationale for
choosing his taxonomy as the theoretical framework for the present study is also explained in what follows.

2.2.3 Pedersen’s Taxonomy of ECRs Transfer Strategies

Pedersen (2011) has proposed his taxonomy, with the focus on professional subtitling, which is situated in the framework of Descriptive Translation Studies as developed and defined by Toury (1980, 1991, 1995). Pedersen’s work aims to discover and describe the norms that regulate the translation process and the creation of subtitles for television programmes. He focuses on identifying Extralinguistic Cultural References (ECRs), also known in Translation Studies as culture-bound words, since he believes cultural references constitute one of the most important translation problems that professional subtitlers deal with. Pedersen (2011) proposes a taxonomy of strategies to render ECRs and identifies the parameters that influence the choice of the translation strategies employed in the corpus of his study.

His taxonomy is presented from a product-oriented perspective with the view of analysing existing subtitles. It is also possible to view Pedersen’s taxonomy from a process-oriented perspective to look at the subtitling process from a subtitler’s view. In order to be able to find the reason for the strategies applied in translation of some culture specific or ECRs, the subtitling process needs to be considered as well as the product.

Pedersen’s taxonomy clearly distinguishes at a first level between source- and target-oriented translations. Within source-oriented translation, he points to ‘retention’, ‘specification’ and ‘direct translation’ as optional strategies. Among the target-oriented strategies, there are ‘generalisation’, ‘substitution’ and ‘omission’ as optional strategies. All these strategies are further divided into subcategories. There is also one strategy which does not belong to the source- and target-oriented groups, i.e. ‘Official equivalent’. An overview of Pedersen’s taxonomy is provided in Figure 2.1.
According to Pedersen (2011:76) ‘retention’ is the most source-oriented strategy, where the ST ECR is kept unchanged in the subtitle or slightly adapted to meet target language (TL) requirements. It can be complete, marked (e.g. by the use of italics) or unmarked. He gives the example of the car called *Cadillac Fleetwood*, whose name is retained in a subtitle as it is.

In ‘specification’ the subtitled ECR is more specific than the ST ECR, either with an addition of information not present in the source text or with completion, e.g. in the case of explicated acronyms.

In ‘direct translation’ the only change is represented by the language, without semantic alteration. The subcategories indicated in the scheme are calque or loan translation and shifted, which in Pedersen’s opinion is a more precise definition of literal translation. As an example of calque, Pedersen gives ‘Captain of police’, which in the Danish subtitle is rendered with ‘politi-kaptajn’ instead of the more localised term ‘kommissær’.

Under the category of target-oriented translation strategies, according to Pedersen, the strategy ‘generalisation’ makes the translation of the ECR in the subtitles less specific than
the one in the source text. This can happen via the use of a superordinate term or a paraphrase. The example given by Pedersen comes from the TV series *M*A*S*H* where the ECR ‘The Three Stooges’ has been replaced by a Swedish translation of the hypernym ‘entertainment’.

In ‘substitution’, subcategorised in cultural and situational substitution, an ECR is replaced in the subtitle with something else, either belonging to the same culture, or not. The example here is the substitution of the ECR NYU (New York University) with the term KUA (University of Copenhagen). Omission is the strategy chosen by translator when they decide not to translate the ECR present in the source text. To be able to translate an ECR with an ‘Official equivalent’, an official decision by some authority is needed. Conversion of measurements would fall into this category.

After identifying the translation strategies employed in the corpus, Pedersen also identifies the parameters that influence subtitlers’ choices. These parameters are: transculturality, extratextuality, centrality, polysemitics, media-specific constraints, and subtitling situation (2011:105).

According to Pedersen (2011:106-115) ‘transculturality’ is the level of accessibility of an ECR in a different culture, related to the concept of cultural distance (the closer the culture, the broader the knowledge of its ECRs in a target culture).

‘Extratextuality’ refers to the possibility that ECRs are fictional and created by a text. ‘Centrality’ refers to the importance of an ECR at the macro and micro-level. To put it another way, if an ECR is the subject matter or a very central theme of the film or TV programme at hand, it is central on the macro level. On the other hand, if the ECR is just mentioned in passing a few times in the film, then it would be central on the micro level (Pedersen, 2005, 2011). ‘Polysemitics’ is a parameter that subtitlers should consider because
they translate audiovisual material, polysemiotic by nature. Images also convey meanings that cannot be forgotten.

‘Media-specific’ constraints have to do with the switch from the spoken word of the dialogue to the written word of subtitles and to the condensation, omission and reformulation technically required in subtitles. The ‘subtitling situation’ is a broad parameter that includes consideration such as the skopos, the genre, the style of the source text and also sociological consideration about the target group of the text. With regard to the effect of genres on the process of subtitling, it can be argued that specific genres can impose a dilemma in framing the subtitled products. To exemplify the point of discussion, in a documentary genre using terminology, there is a constant dilemma of choosing between the term that is scientifically acceptable and the term that language users routinely employ, or a mixture of both depending on how the message is framed (Matamala, 2009). This dilemma can also be observed in the translation of culture specific references in animated films, in choosing between a rendition that is accessible to children or to the adult audience, or whether it should be accessible to both (considering the concept of double-layeredness of children’s texts discussed earlier). Another quandary would be whether the target audience need to learn the elements of source language (as in language learning) or its culture. In transferring the element of humour as one of the most significant characteristics of animation, translators might find it difficult to decide whether the target text should be more humorous than the source text or just as humorous as the source text, as long as the humour is transferred. This is one of the elements that needs to be taken into account in transferring the ECRs in the animation genre, of which humour is one of the main characteristics. Pedersen’s taxonomy can be a useful tool for analysis in the present study since, as noted earlier:
• It distinguishes clearly between source- and target-oriented strategies, which accordingly makes it easier to differentiate between the patterns and tendencies based on which the subtitlers of a given culture operate.

• It is presented from a product-oriented perspective with the view of analysing existing subtitles, therefore it can perfectly fit as an analytical framework to be used in corpus-based studies.

• It is also possible to use his taxonomy from a process-oriented perspective to look at the subtitling process from the subtitler’s view, which can be used to investigate the influence of cultural, ideological, religious, and political mindsets and the environment under which the subtitlers of a given culture operate, to eventually shed light on the reasons behind their final choices that appear on the screen.

Pedersen’s taxonomy can be successfully applied to professional subtitled products, as professional and trained subtitlers follow norms and strategies that mostly match the ones he introduces in his taxonomy. On the other hand, since the focus of the present study is to investigate the norms and strategies that unofficial (i.e. non-professional) subtitlers follow, some of the strategies do not fall into the categories presented by Pedersen. In other words, there are two features with regard to his taxonomy that need more discussion pertinent to the present study. Firstly, Pedersen’s taxonomy has been designed for the professional subtitling on TV programmes in the Scandinavian context, whereas the present study deals with non-professional/unofficial practices of subtitling in a very different cultural and ideological context, i.e. Iran. Nevertheless, he states that his taxonomy has been primarily constructed for the rendering of extralinguistic cultural references, but it could be modified to function as an analysing tool for other phenomena (Pedersen, 2011:74). Secondly, the concept of extralinguistic cultural references is rather controversial, in that it excludes the terms related to language by marking them as ‘Extra’ linguistic components and items. In fact, Pedersen
has classified culture-bound references into two categories: intralinguistic culture-bound references (including proverbs, idioms, slang and dialects) and extralinguistic culture-bound references (including expressions about cultural items which are not regarded as a part of language system). According to his definition, “ECRs are expressions that refer to entities outside language, such as names of people, places, institutions, food, customs, etc., which a person may not know, even if s/he knows the language in question” (Pedersen, 2007:30).

Both above-mentioned features in Pedersen’s taxonomy need to be tailored to suit the purpose of the present study. In other words, since the focus of the study is unofficial/non-professional subtitling, some categories need to be added to fit the strategies applied by unofficial subtitlers in the target context (which will be discussed in the Methodology and Discussion chapters). To this end, in what follows, the field of AVT, with the specific focus on subtitling as a mode of AVT, and accordingly non-professional subtitling as one of its subcategories, is discussed. The discussion is then followed by an extensive review of the literature on the concept of unofficial subtitling in Iran, which is the focus of the present study.

2.3 Audiovisual Translation: Principles and Practice

In view of the fact that today films and TV series are more popular than books or magazines, especially among younger individuals, AVT has become the most consumed type of translation. The internet and online distribution have had a substantial impact on the demand for AVT. The popularity of animated films is also a part of this AVT momentum, as can be seen in the literature as well as in real cultural practice and consumption. Viewers now have access, either legally or illegally, to their favourite audiovisual materials. According to Pérez-González (2014), during the last fifteen years AVT has been the fastest-growing strand of translation studies. A large quantity of translated material is transferred to other cultures: documentaries, interviews, films, news, discussion programmes, shows, series, cartoons, and
so on. This growth is particularly noticeable in those countries where English is not the official language (Díaz Cintas, 2003:192-193). In addition to the remarkable demand and popularity of AVT products as a means of entertainment, AVT has also gained significant academic attention in the field of translation studies.

Over the last fifteen years, the role of digital technologies as a catalyst for the emergence of innovative audiovisual textualities has attracted the attention of scholars focusing on the technological, industrial and pedagogical dimensions of AVT. It would be safe to argue that AVT has gained formal academic recognition with the inclusion of this field of professional practice and scholarly inquiry in translator training curricula in the mid-1990s. Through the institutionalisation of AVT, scholars in the field have been able to access vital resources, strengthen the field’s research base and secure academic recognition (Pérez-González, 2014:27).

The rapid growth of activities in the field of AVT at industrial level, including not only foreign-language subtitling, dubbing and voice-over, but also modalities such as intralingual subtitles for the Deaf and Hard-of-Hearing (SDH), audio description (AD) and audio subtitling, has had a positive knock-on effect in the university world, where AVT is now emerging as a thriving academic discipline for teaching and research (Díaz Cintas and Anderman, 2009:7). They further state that despite the importance of the role of AVT in our daily lives, on the whole universities were originally slow in curriculum design and the development of new courses. This situation has, however, changed over the past decade, and there are now many different specialist courses in AVT on offer at universities worldwide. In Iran, however, this trend is progressing slowly as there are not specialist courses as such in AVT studies and not all universities offer postgraduate courses in Translation Studies in general.
More recently, audiovisual translation has gained increasing attention within Translation Studies: “Although at present, audiovisual translation is experiencing an unprecedented boom of interest and activity at all levels, a number of problematic issues remain to be addressed. The changes taking place in the profession are fast, not always allowing sufficient time for full adjustment. Old methods tend to compete with new techniques, and consistency is not always maintained. Subtitle styles tend to vary from country to country, even from company to company” (Díaz Cintas and Anderman, 2009:8).

The focus of the following subsection is on subtitling as a mode of AVT, as well as a discussion on the reasons this mode is preferred to dubbing in some countries. This is then followed by viewing subtitling as an aid to the language acquisition process to see whether this mode can be considered beneficial in this respect.

2.3.1 Subtitling in Focus

The development of AVT has been different on different continents. Germany, Italy and France are examples of European countries with major film industries that preferred dubbing over subtitling. However, this mode of AVT was considered a costly method for countries with a smaller film infrastructures. For this reason, countries like the Netherlands, Belgium, Switzerland, Portugal and Greece, as well as Scandinavian countries, tended to favour subtitling. In Latin America, subtitling was practised initially in Spanish-speaking countries and later was replaced by dubbing as the preferred mode of AVT. However, subtitling was rapidly accepted in Portuguese-speaking Brazil (Freire, 2015, as cited in O’Sullivan and Cornu, 2019). Other factors such as levels of literacy and national bilingualism influenced the choice of dubbing. France, as a major film-producing county, despite favouring dubbing, has played a significant role in the development of technical and commercial aspects of subtitling from the transition-to-sound period until today (ibid.).
In the same vein, Szarkowska (2005) asserts that, considering the fact that the production of subtitles is a much cheaper and faster process than dubbing, subtitling is becoming a preferred mode of audiovisual translation in many European as well as non-European countries.

Subtitling has gained remarkable attention and recognition in comparison to other modalities of AVT. All subtitled programmes are made up of three main components: the spoken word, the image, and the subtitles. The interaction of these three components, along with the viewer’s ability to read both the images and the written text at a particular speed, and the actual size of the screen, determine the basic characteristics of the audiovisual medium. “Subtitles must appear in synchrony with the image and dialogue, provide a semantically adequate account of the source language dialogue, and remain displayed on screen long enough for the viewers to be able to read them” (Díaz Cintas and Remael, 2007:9).

As Dastjerdi (2011) states, translators involved in subtitling encounter some challenging problems other than those encountered in traditional text translation. AVT is something more than the mere linguistic translation of words. Since it involves a mixture of both visual and auditory means and a change from an oral medium to a written one, the translation task becomes more demanding. Gambier and Gottlieb (2001:xvii) note:

Among the features of an optimum quality in subtitling worth mentioning are spatiotemporal features (fonts, position and the length of the two lines of the screen) and textual features (division into semantic and syntactic coherent units; language register, etc.). Between these sets of features, subtitle punctuation establishes a certain rhythm in reading and makes immediate processing and comprehension of the subtitles easier. The viewer’s comfort is the result of the legibility and readability of the subtitles.

Choosing subtitling over dubbing depends on several factors. As Szarkowska (2005) claims, each country cultivates a different tradition of film translation, which is affected by a number of factors, such as historical circumstances, traditions, the technique with which the audience
is more familiar, the cost, and also the relationship between the target and the source cultures in an international context. In this regard, Szarkowska refers to the division of countries according to the type of screen translation they use. This category comprises four groups: first, source-language countries which refers to English-speaking countries (such as Britain and the United States) where there is not much demand for translation as the imported films are mostly in English. Second, dubbing countries: French-, Italian- German-, and Spanish-speaking countries (sometimes referred to as the FIGS group), where, since the 1930s, due to historical reasons, the preferred mode of film translation became dubbing. It can be argued that dubbing has in some cases been linked to state patronage. In this vein, Danan (1991), states that cultural and economic gatekeeping affected the way dubbing industries developed in several European countries. The third group is called subtitling countries, such as the Netherlands, Norway, Sweden, Denmark, Greece, Slovenia, Croatia, Portugal and some non-European countries where due to a high percentage of imported films there is a great and steady demand for translation. Considering both elements of time and cost, subtitling is normally preferred to dubbing in these countries. The last group in this category is called voice-over countries, mostly those that cannot afford dubbing, e.g. Russia and Poland. As mentioned earlier in the Introduction, the preferred mode of audiovisual translation in Iran is dubbing in cinemas and the national television, which, due to political, religious, and ideological restrictions imposed by the authorities, is subject to a high level of censorship. On the other hand, there is a high demand by the Iranian audience for recently-released foreign audiovisual products with no censorship involved. As a result, subtitled products have become prevalent and highly popular, but can only be found on the black market as they are not approved by the authorities in advance. Having this in mind, it could be argued that Iran falls under both the second and the third group in the above-mentioned category.
Szarkowska (2005) mentions the main reasons for the fact that subtitling is mostly preferred over dubbing, namely: the growth of technology, which results in a greater demand for subtitled AV products; the preservation of the original soundtrack in subtitled products as a way to avoid censorship; and finally, the pedagogical aspects of this mode. These elements are dealt with in detail below.

With regard to the first aspect, Szarkowska states that, with the improvement of technology, the demand for translation of audiovisual products has increased accordingly. Therefore, subtitling for films which are made to be distributed internationally is inevitable, since, compared to dubbing, it saves both time and money. In Iran, for the same reason, there is a high demand for subtitled products, specifically from younger audiences, as they wish to keep up with the rest of the world in terms of having access to recently released audiovisual products. In fact, the improvement of technology enables them to discover the most recently produced audiovisual materials even before they are imported, resulting in an increase in demand for the translation of such products. Due to several reasons, such as the lack of funding and the issue of censorship, there is a lack of provision of audiovisual products in Iran, so access to the majority of these products is not possible in the country. Popular media services like Amazon Prime, YouTube and Netflix are filtered or blocked by the authorities and not accessible to the users in the country. In relation to this, Azali (2016:online) states:

> Iran’s Government forbids the NSFW [i.e. Not Safe for Work] content, which ties the hand of YouTube, Netflix or any other video sharing or video-on-demand platform. NSFW is just the glimpse of these laws. You can’t have any kind of scene that contains nudity, kissing or showing too much skin, otherwise you would be censored instantly. These requirements for the distribution of the video contents are major obstacles in front of Netflix and YouTube. Netflix can’t just censor the contents for Iran’s markets.

Therefore, these platforms are filtered or blocked by the Iranian government and the users will face the blocked/filtered website sign as shown in Image 2.3 below (ibid.).
Consequently, as an alternative distribution route, the dissemination and circulation of subtitled products through underground channels and the DVD black market has flourished in the recent decades in the country. Therefore, it can be claimed that, in essence, in Iran there are two sets of AVT traditions for AV products; official programmes are dubbed, and unofficial products are subtitled.

Due to the reasons above, subtitling is preferred by a large number of Iranian viewers (specifically younger individuals). Those with a working knowledge of the source language (i.e. English) can also benefit from the intact soundtrack of the original in the subtitled versions. Another reason that subtitling is preferred by the audience is the fact that it promotes the learning of foreign languages, compared to dubbing, which is a strategy of domestication. However, if subtitles are rewritten extensively, the source culture becomes more opaque. Fawcett (2003) states that in subtitling, a number of restrictions (technical as well as ideological, social and moral, such as normalising, repressing, and censoring) frame the target text. In other words, it can be argued that the target text is manipulated by norms (consciously or subconsciously) rather than the constraints of subtitling. However, the general public (i.e. the real target of translation), who read the subtitles as fast as possible to maximise watching time, have no time to notice the manipulation of the source text (Fawcett,
In the same vein, in his study on the ‘defamiliarizing effect of subtitles’, Kapsaskis (2008) considers whether this effect gives rise to an awareness of foreignness and whether it improves the film-viewing experience. He further asserts that the extensive use of different translation strategies of text normalisation, together with subtitling conventions and rules, can restrict the defamiliarizing effect and consequently, the awareness of the foreignness in ‘dominant’ audiences.

The language learning aspect of subtitling, as mentioned above, has been of interest to several researchers; subtitled programmes are being investigated to assess their effectiveness in language learning and vocabulary acquisition. As a norm in language learning, some authorities and institutions promote subtitling and AV products as part of learning English. In Iran, for instance, subtitled films and animations are used in a number of language schools (for children as well as adults) as an aid to improve their English language proficiency. According to Díaz Cintas & Anderman (2009) AVT plays an important role in the classroom. Subtitling can be a powerful training and teaching tool in foreign language learning classes. Hearing the original language while reading the dialogue in context provides a stimulating environment for students to consolidate what they are learning and enrich their vocabulary, and at the same time they become familiar with and absorb the culture of a foreign language in an authentic setting. Subtitles are also a potent force in language acquisition outside the classroom. In a study carried out by (d'Ydewalle and Pavakanun, 1997:146), it was suggested that in some countries such as Belgium, Denmark and the Netherlands, where most popular programmes are provided with subtitles, the advantage of knowing several languages could be partially attributed to watching frequently subtitled television programs.

Koolstra and Beentjes (1999) state that incidental language learning through subtitling is one of the advantages of subtitling over dubbing. When subtitles are involved, viewers engage with the material on three levels: 1. spoken (original soundtrack of the audiovisual material),
2. written (mother tongue subtitles of the audiovisual material) and 3. visual (moving images in the audiovisual material).

Yuksel and Tanriverdi (2009) investigated the effect of audiovisual materials with and without subtitles in vocabulary acquisition. They found that the group who used subtitled films had a better progress than the group exposed film clip without subtitles, and that the difference between two groups in learning vocabulary was considerable.

In a study conducted by Rostam Shirazi, et al. (2015), the impact of Persian subtitled films on vocabulary acquisition of Iranian intermediate EFL learners was investigated. The participants were randomly divided into two homogeneous groups; controllable subtitle group (watching English dialogues with repeated Persian subtitles) and uncontrollable subtitle groups (watching English dialogues with unrepeated Persian subtitles). The results of the study indicated that the group using controllable Persian subtitles outperformed the other group.

Another study was conducted by Khosh Ayand and Shafiee (2016) on the effects of subtitles on oral fluency and accuracy of intermediate Iranian EFL learners. The results indicated the successful performance of the participants in the experimental groups to be attributable to using subtitles as a method for improving oral fluency and accuracy. In the same vein, the findings of a study carried out by Mardani and Najmabadi (2017) indicate that watching animated films with English audio and Persian subtitles was more effective in incidental English vocabulary learning of Iranian high school EFL learners in comparison to watching the same material with both audio and subtitles in English.

The above literature (specifically the studies conducted by Iranian researchers) indicates the significance of this specific type of subtitling, i.e. unofficial subtitling in the Iranian context, which has recently attracted considerable academic attention. Therefore, the next section examines the concept of non-professional subtitling in general, and in the Iranian context in
particular, to investigate whether non-professional subtitlers apply the same norms and strategies as professional subtitlers, and to consider how non-professional subtitling deconstructs and at the same time innovates these norms.

2.3.2 Non-professional Subtitling

The unprecedented rise in audiovisual products, along with a continued audience demand for recently released products, necessitates the presence of the subtitles, which is a much cheaper and faster process than dubbing. According to Orrego-Carmona, this change of events has had a major impact on the growth of non-professional subtitling and, at the same time, on users’ general view of subtitling (Orrego-Carmona, 2014:51). Non-professional subtitling is normally done by so-called ‘prosumers’ (consumers who have adopted some of the characteristics of the producer roles) who do not need to cross territorial boundaries, but rather connect through virtual channels, avoiding political and geographical borders and overcoming linguistic differences through translation (ibid.). Prosumers are present in most developed and developing countries, although the different regional contexts have resulted in varied scenarios in different nations. It could be argued that translation is not an activity that takes place between national spaces (at least not in all cases), but between cultural spaces. As a case in point, Catalonia is not a country, but there are prosumers there who may or may not interact with Castillian-speaking prosumers. What matters for prosumers is the expression of an individual sensibility or individual sense of culture and a feeling that brings unity to fragmented and confusing aspects of culture; in this sense a prosumer from Japan may have a lot in common with a prosumer from South Africa.

In Orrego-Carmona’s words, these users of volunteer-translated content are not always (and do not necessarily need to be) aware of the mechanisms put in place to provide them with subtitles, nor may they know about the impact their activity might have on general media flows. However, their actions indicate they are evidently willing to become beneficiaries of
the prosumers’ products. There are some idiosyncrasies or personal preferences in producing this type of subtitling by prosumers, who tend to create their own individual norms (Orrego-Carmona, 2014:51). Subtitles of this kind, in fact, do not follow certain norms and rules as set for professional subtitling, the only rules they follow will be the rules that have been defined individually (Mollanazar and Nasorllahi, 2017:157). On the other hand, in professional subtitling, the content of translation norms normally comes either from professionals of the practice, or from the consumers of such products i.e. the audience. In a social context such as Iran, the producer-consumer relationship has shaped a community. Consumers have a hunger for AV materials and subtitlers make sure their consumers access the latest AV products by offering them the values and the cultural accessibility they expect to receive. In fact, individual values are injected into mainstream products with a view to self-expression. This can be characterised as produsage (Burns, 2006) where, at its core, the shift in power from the media producer to the consumer-turned-producer takes place (Banks and Deuze, 2009:419). As Pérez-González (2014:245) puts it:

Ordinary people involved in self-mediation practices, including audiovisual translation, are motivated by monitorial or voluntarist agendas. Whether it is in an individual capacity, through stable citizen networks or as part of engaged adhocracies, amateur translators participate in public life through the appropriation, manipulation and distribution of audiovisual content, orienting to the demands and expectations of the audienceships that gravitate around these individual or collective prosumers.

This manipulation and dissemination of audiovisual products through underground channels in the Iranian context is very similar to the notion of ‘remediation’ as introduced by Deuze (2006). In the same vein, Pérez-González (2014:245) states that Deuze’s (2006:66) notion of remediation specifically describes the involvement of ordinary individuals in reshaping the media with the purpose of resisting the content of the media that is circulated in their current
environment. By means of remediation, prosumers act as translators with the power to manipulate the status quo and transfer the values and reality the audience expect to receive.

In Iran, which is the focus of this study, unofficial subtitlers play a significant role in the remediation of audiovisual products. The providers of such products, resisting the restrictions imposed by the authorities, create a medium through which they can satisfy like-minded consumers with a view to self-expression that goes beyond political, religious or ideological boundaries. Their activity is different from the concept of fansubbing, which is a rather westernised term for this practice and is one of the results of produsage culture as mentioned above. Fansubbing is more creative and idiosyncratic than traditional subtitling (Liu, 2014) and has been shown to differ quite substantially from its professional counterpart (Díaz Cintas & Muñoz Sánchez, 2006; Wilcock, 2013). The activity of fansubbing also acknowledges the active participation of the audience in the meaning making process and seeks to create subtitles that cater to the audience’s specific needs, by being more functional and more aesthetically pleasing than traditional subtitling (McClarty, 2012:136; Pérez-González, 2012:341). Although the term seems fairly straightforward, fansubbing is not a homogeneous activity and different authors place restrictions on what qualifies as ‘fansubbing’ and what falls outside the scope of this term. According to Orrego-Carmona (2014:78), there are two different types of fansubbing in terms of the format. The first type is pro-am (professional-amateur) subtitling, which can be considered an imitation of professional subtitling. The translation is produced to a certain standard but the version is usually individually distributed. The other type of fansubbing is called innovative/creative subtitling. The focus of this type of subtitling is on the exploration of new possibilities in subtitling, for example, using different colours or adding emoticons in the subtitle.

The activity of unofficial subtitling in Iran is, to a certain extent, similar to Orrego-Carmona’s pro-am subtitling, since it can be considered an imitation of professional subtitling. It could
also be argued that it differs from the concept of fansubbing in that it does not necessarily involve aesthetic aspects and creativity in the visual presentation of subtitles. Instead, the creativity in the translation of the source texts, specifically in the renditions relating to cultural references, may be considered as an appealing factor by the consumers. This is very similar to the notion of ‘creative subtitles’ as introduced by McClarty (2012). As McClarty puts it, creative subtitling, as a feature or sub-category of fansubbing, may be described as a subtitling practice that tailors subtitles in terms of their style, layout and choice of translation approach to the film and audience at hand (McClarty, 2012). In essence, this type of subtitling practice implies that each film and audience deserves a unique translation style and approach, instead of a one-size-fits-all solution. This is the reason why borderline legal or illegal subtitling activity exists; it is about a convergence of sensibilities, as envisaged by individuals who identify themselves (individually or professionally) as non-mainstream. If this type of approach is followed, the resulting subtitles will become an indispensable part of the film (McClarty, 2012:146). In order to make creative subtitling a feasible option, subtitlers would need to become an integral part of the film or series postproduction process, instead of being an afterthought that stands outside of the creative process (McClarty, 2012:149). However, this does not exclude the possibility that individual subtitlers might use unusual techniques that may fall under fansubbing, making these categories controversial.

Tonder (2014) states that it is important to note that McClarty’s (2012) ‘creative subtitles’ do not encapsulate all subtitles that deviate from the norm, but rather only those that attempt to bear in mind the aesthetic value of the source text and source culture as well as the aesthetic value of the target text and target culture. From this it becomes clear that not all fansubbing practices, such as glosses and linear notes for instance, can be classified as creative subtitling. According to Tonder (2014:5), the ways in which subtitling can be creatively applied to a film, or any other video material, is limited only by the scope of the imagination. ‘Once the
conventions for subtitling are disregarded, the subtitler is free to create a visual masterpiece on the audiovisual canvas”. Fansubbing techniques can be very varied. For instance, in creative subtitling, as a feature of fansubbing, there are different ways to highlight the relationships between the characters or to emphasise the emotions expressed by them. Colour and font are often used to highlight the relationships between people. Colour is often also influenced by “variables of field (what is being talked about), tenor (the relationship between the interactants) and mode (circumstances affecting the material delivery of speech) in any given scene” (Pérez-González, 2007:75). In other words, the use of different fonts and colours in subtitles are often associated with different characters, to help the viewer more easily identify who is speaking. Other techniques include the use of subtitles that are more than the standard two lines to allow for more detailed translations, subtitles that can appear anywhere on the screen to suit the current scene, the use of moving subtitles to create a particular effect, as well as the inclusion of ST words in the target text subtitles to underscore ‘untranslatable’ concepts (Díaz Cintas and Muñoz Sánchez; 2006; Schules, 2012).

Another example of using colours creatively could be the case where the colour red is used to emphasise a warning message as they appear on the screen (e.g. in the translation of the ‘hazard signs’ or the translation of ‘very hot’ on the bottle of a sauce). Punctuation is also sometimes used in the same way, to underscore what is being said and to express the underlying emotions. For instance, using all capital letters or excessive amounts of exclamation or question marks indicates anger or confusion. The activity of unofficial subtitling in Iran as noted above does not necessarily involve such aesthetic aspects and creativity in the visual presentation of subtitles. However, coloured fonts can be used in case of hardcoded subtitles where the subtitle is embedded on the screen and there is no option to remove it. In fact, a different colour is often used for the Persian subtitle to make it visible on the already embedded subtitle, which is normally in Korean (as subtitlers often access a film
via illegal methods before the official version is available). Images 2.4 and 2.5 below, the snapshots taken from the film *Searching* (2018, American thriller) illustrate the point under discussion. In the images below, as can be observed, in order to make the Persian subtitle visible, the purple Persian subtitle has been placed on the hardcoded Korean yellow subtitle. In the first image, the character is Skyping and in the second image the character is texting on their laptop.

Image 2.4 Snapshot from the film *Searching* (2018)

Image 2.5 Snapshot from the film *Searching* (2018)
Subtitles can also be tailored to suit the rhythm of the film by, for instance, slow shots may feature relaxed subtitles, while fast shots include unsteady subtitles (McClarty, 2012:146). The length of subtitles can also be tailored to suit a particular purpose. The position of characters can be used as a factor in deciding the placement of subtitles (McClarty, 2012:148). For instance, subtitles can be placed on the same side of the screen as the character who is speaking or they can be made to appear further away when the character is further away (McClarty, 2012:148).

By gaining popularity among audiences, fansubbing, in every sense of the word, seems to be a threat for professional subtitling, as this practice is more in line with the way audiences interact with media today. This implies that, ideally, professional subtitling choices should also be guided by the way the audiences prefer to interact with media. This is why fansubbers, according to Tonder (2014), are proud to acknowledge that their work is considered an intrusion in the area of professional subtitling and they describe it as a point of strength instead of a weakness, as they prefer to be innovative in this field instead of adhering to the conventional norms and rules set for professional subtitling (e.g. Karamitroglou’s (1998) and Pedersen’s (2011) subtitling norms, as discussed earlier in the chapter).

This view is supported by Tang (2014), who reminds us that subtitles are often distinguished into ‘good’ or ‘bad’, and very little attention is actually paid to the function that the subtitles serve as a whole (Tang, 2014:17). Chesterman believes that this stems, at least in part, from the pressure that researchers and translators often feel to adhere to the prescriptions and norms of the genre they work in and the resulting complacency this entails (Chesterman, 1997:68). However, judging fansubbing from this perspective is less intuitive, since these forms of subtitling choose to operate outside of the imposed constraints of the industry by creating their own guidelines of good usage (Tang, 2014:17, Bogucki, 2009:50, Pérez-González, 2012:8).
One of the motivations for fansubbing, for many, is the desire to access the authentic text (Caffrey, 2009). This does not necessarily stem from a debate about the loyalty of the TT to the ST, but rather from an awareness of the imposed constraints that are placed on subtitling, which often leads to the assimilation of the source text and source culture (Caffrey, 2009:219). Fansubbing prefers to follow a more ST-loyal approach that focuses on capturing as much of the source text information as possible. It seeks to provide the viewer with a final product with both linguistic and cultural depth, by attempting to capture not only the dialogue but also aspects of the setting and culture in which it is embedded, often because fansubbers are concerned with providing an enriching viewing experience to the audience (Condry, 2010:201).

One of the main tenets of fansubbing is that a viewer may be left in the dark when a specific aspect, often cultural or intertextual, is addressed via the visuals but left entirely unexplained by the subtitles, which are traditionally focused on the linguistic content of the text (Ortabasi, 2009:279-280). Schules believes that this basic tenet enables fansubbers to apply a creative solution to this type of problem by, for instance, using glosses or linear notes that become an integral and visible part of the film and facilitate understanding of the text on a deeper level (Schules, 2012:93, 122).

Having discussed all the above, fansubbing can be defined differently depending on the context in which it is being practised. As noted earlier, fansubbing in general is a rather westernised term for non-professional subtitling, since in a western society fans play a vital role in creating amateur subtitling for their favourite audiovisual products. However, the motivation for non-professional subtitling is quite different in the Iranian context.

To elaborate on the above concept, subtitling is mainly practised illegally and covertly by non-professional subtitlers in Iran, since almost all foreign language programmes on state
television and cinemas in Iran are dubbed and dubbing is done by professionals who are supervised by MICG and IRIB (see Introduction chapter).

As a result, not all recent Hollywood films and foreign programmes are selected to be shown on TV and in cinemas, as they might contain messages that clash with the political, ideological and religious beliefs of the regime. The limited number of AV products selected will undergo very strict supervision by the aforementioned institutions, therefore, involving a considerable level of censorship. Diaz Cintas (2012:282) has proven that political interests, rather than linguistic differences between languages, determine how cultural values are translated. With AVT connecting cultures across the globe, scholars are investigating, uncovering and analysing socio-political issues that may be hidden beneath the subtitles or dubbing of a programme (Flynn, 2016). Subtitling and dubbing offer a means by which national officials can protect their own cultural and linguistic values. In other words, “AVT is the means through which not only information but also the views, the assumptions and the values of a society are filtered” (De Marco, 2012:68).

According to Dwyer (2017), censoring translation can occur under either internally or externally imposed conditions, misrepresenting the source material intentionally, which can occur at three levels, namely words, images and other non-verbal communication. Dwyer’s (2017) statement applies to the concept of censorship in Iran, which occurs at all three levels suggested by her. To elaborate on the concept of censorship in Iran, the following subsection deals with the history of censorship in the country, followed by a discussion of its impact on cultural products and consequently on AV products.

2.3.3. Censorship in Iran

Censorship is defined as “a form of manipulative rewriting of discourses by one agent or structure over another agent or structure, aiming at filtering the stream of information from one source to another” (Billiani, 2007:3). It is an act that coercively and forcefully blocks,
controls, and manipulates the establishment of cross-cultural communication (ibid.). According to Asimakoulas (2005), censorship is not merely an issue of what is banned. It is also a matter of what is to be said and by whom, and whether/how it will be heard. He defines the term as “a barometer of the autonomy of the field of cultural production from the field of power (and economics)” (ibid.:96). The origins and sources of censorship vary according to each country. The fundamental origins of censorship are normally political, religious or economic. In Iran, for instance, censorship mainly stems from political and religious drives. According to Masroori (2001:1202):

The home of a rich and varied culture, Persia (called Iran since 1938) has been almost continuously subject to forms of censorship proceeding from autocratic governments and religious certainties.

In the same vein, Fotouhi (2016:99) states, “in a global context, during the recent centuries Iran has probably had more authoritative and censored control over the production of cultural material than other places”.

As mentioned above, the Iranian censorship has always been a mixture of political and religious suppressions. These suppressions have been most evident in the visual arts after the invasion of Persia by Muslim Arabs in the 7th century, bringing a religion that disapproved of the traditional arts of music and dancing, as well as the representations of the human form which also affected the literature and storytelling (Masroori, 2001). Since then, Islam “has affected Iranian life on different levels. Amongst its various influences, independent of an ongoing political engagement, has been its impact on Iranian social life, particularly on gender relation, and public and private boundaries” (Fotouhi, 2016:103).

Iran has been subject to two revolutions in the last century: the constitutional revolution of 1906 and the Islamic Revolution of 1979. Each of these revolutions brought about their own restrictions and censorship rules. Censorship undoubtedly and particularly affects cultural
products such as literature, press, films, art, etc. In a report published on CPJ (Committee to Protect Journalists) entitled *10 Most Censored Countries*, Iran ranked 7th. The report claims (CPJ, 2015:online):

The government uses mass and arbitrary detention as a means of silencing dissent and forcing journalists into exile […] Iranian authorities maintain one of the toughest Internet censorship regimes in the world, blocking millions of websites, including news and social networking sites […] Iranian authorities control coverage of certain topics by tightening the small circle of journalists and news outlets allowed to report on them.

Dealing with detailed political and social reasons for Iranian censorship is beyond the scope of this research. Nevertheless, in what follows, the impact of censorship on literature and audiovisual products, as examples of cultural products, is briefly discussed.

### 2.3.3.1 Censorship in Literature
An extensive censorship apparatus was created by the Pahlavi government, which, despite the overthrow of the Shah by the Islamic Revolution, still functions today (Mahloujian, 2002). The publication of all manuscripts is exhaustively controlled by the censorship authorities: “Even after publication, a book can be deemed immoral or hostile to the regime and be confiscated from bookshops” (ibid.:online). She further states, book censorship usually entails various steps, the first of which is a review of the manuscript by the authorities. Normally, a list of words, sentences and pages that must be deleted is then sent to the writer.

Before the Revolution, the authorities were strict about using some specific words such as “red” and “red rose” which symbolised bloodshed during the revolution, or “black night” and “high walls” which symbolised prison and repression. However, “since the Revolution, words with sexual connotations are of special concern to the censors” (ibid.). On a similar note, Callamard, et al., (2006) claim that literature and books in Iran (under the Islamic regime) are not exempt from censorship and must undergo a thorough examination by the MICG (The Ministry of Culture and Islamic Guidance), before permission for their publication is granted:
“The regulations governing book publication are both proscriptive and prescriptive in their nature, outlining both what writers should avoid as well as what they should endeavor to embrace” (ibid.:31). Some of the regulations are detailed below.

Content that is accepted and encouraged by MICG includes anything supporting the positive outcomes of the Islamic revolution, or promoting the Islamic Revolution through the publication of valuable scientific and cultural works. On the other hand, MICG prohibits material that allegedly profanes or denies the values of religion (i.e. Islam), spreads moral corruption, weakens national pride and patriotism, or creates a “loss of self-confidence before the culture, civilisation and imperialistic regimes of the West or East” (ibid.). Since the focus of the present study is on AV products, the following section sheds light on the regulations of censorship in films and AV products in Iran and the extent to which these products are affected by censorship in this context.

2.3.3.2 Censorship in Films and AV Products

The first Iranian film censorship occurred in 1929, only five years after the production of the first Iranian feature film (Shahabi, 2001). Indeed, Reza Shah Pahlavi set the first golden rule of film censorship in pre-revolutionary Iran: “namely that all kings, even foreign ones, had to be portrayed as decent and virtuous individuals, even if history was betrayed in the process” (ibid.:1208). However, censorship has taken on different dimensions since the Islamic revolution of 1979, due to: “the emergence of a new political system with its own cultural and ideological paradigms” (ibid.:1209). The film industry lay dormant for a number of years following the revolution, but resumed in 1983, giving the government an influential role in shaping the form and content of films. MICG and Farabi Cinema Foundation were given total power to control everything that was screened in cinemas and on TV (ibid.). In terms of domestic films, the rules of film censorship concerned issues such as portraying women and sexuality inappropriately (women had to wear the hijab (veil) in
all scenes of a film, even when they were at home with no strangers present), denying Islam’s pillars and principles, criticising or undermining Islamic values, insulting prophets and the leaders of the Islamic Revolution and other senior clerics, glorifying life in western world, harming the interests of the Islamic state, and finally, exaggerating the economic, social, and cultural problems of the country (ibid.).

Foreign films had to undergo exhaustive filters before their eventual release (ibid.:1210):

In the cutting rooms, scenes of nudity, song and dance, and physical contact between the opposite sexes, beyond a simple handshake or a friendly pat or nudge, are consigned to the waste bin. The vast dubbing apparatus within the Iranian film industry, meanwhile, functions far more ingeniously and sometimes alters half of the entire dialogue of a film or changes its storyline beyond recognition. The cutting room and the dubbing studio, working in tandem, are able to transform a boyfriend-girlfriend relationship in a film to one between a brother and sister, and no one – except those who have seen the original – will know any different.

In the same vein, journalist Reza Valizadeh, in his 2010 interview with Persian Letter (reposted by Radio Free Europe) explained:

Romantic dialogue is often changed, it isn’t proper for a woman to say to her partner, “I love you.” It isn’t considered decent. It’s clear how dialogue about sexual proposals is dealt with, they are changed to marriage proposals. Also we see that beer becomes lemonade on state television and whiskey becomes orange juice. Also dialogue about politics is often changed.

As mentioned earlier (in the introduction chapter), today, other than MICG, the screening authorisation for AV products in the country is granted by IRIB (The Islamic Republic of Iranian Broadcasting) which is mainly responsible for broadcasting on TV (and radio). To be more specific, there might be cases where AV products undergo even stricter filters by IRIB (compared to those of MICG) before they get authorisation for broadcast on national TV. In this vein, Kamyar (2011:10) states:
IRIB is one of the media that are called ‘culture-making medium’ and regarding its accessibility, it can influence the ways of living to a vast extent, so it is used to make culture relevant to Iranians under the name of an Islamic country in order to maintain Islamic-Iranian (traditional) values.

To support the above argument, Sadeghpour (2018:30) also states that the policies of IRIB, together with those of MICG (i.e. to “localise the cultural elements and censor the taboo words and images to preserve Islamic-Iranian culture and values”), lead to a mass censorship of audiovisual products that limits the number of AV texts to be dubbed. Therefore, “the selected products for dubbing are censored so much that in some cases their plots are affected or changed” (ibid.). A good example for this case is the Japanese TV series Oshin, which was aired in the 1980s in Iran and was one of the most popular TV series during that period. The leading character, Oshin, was presented as a cleaning lady, working in different houses, symbolising hard work and patience. The character had become the role model for many Iranian women at the time. However, in the original scenario, Oshin was in fact sold to a brothel and worked as a concubine. The change of the story’s main character from a concubine to a cleaning lady was so subtle that even today not all viewers are aware of the degree of manipulation and censorship involved in this TV series (Golshani, 2014).

In the same vein, Amirian and Shariati (2013), investigated the domestication strategy in the translation of an episode of an American TV series Due South into Persian, which was shown on IRIB (the Iranian national TV channel). The results of their study revealed a strategy of violating the main plot and changing the whole story, ignoring viewers’ expectations. They claimed that (2013:1):

Given priority to the target culture (that is Iranian culture), IRIB’s policy is to filter and transfer foreign assumptions and values; so, the main strategies in IRIB’s dubbing may match well with Schleiermacher’s (1998) concepts of “domestication” in order to create what Toury (1980) calls “acceptable translation” which is “oriented towards the norms of the target culture”.
According to Fotouhi (2016:105), while censorship has restricted certain kinds of ideological and artistic expression, it has been a reason for a kind of clever and creative response “where cultural producers reframe and present certain censored topics and ideas within new frameworks, accepted but unseen by censors”.

As discussed above, this form of censorship may affect language or other modes in an AV product. Further to this, there are striking cases of visual censorship in Iran whereby editing interventions or retouching of visuals takes place. This practice of intra-semiotic rewriting is not new; it has been routinely done in fascist regimes in Europe, (a good example on this topic is Danan 1991); what has changed is the technology used these days. See for example the following intervention made in terms of visual censorship on Iranian state TV. Gooya News, the Iranian news website, reposted some images of censorship on Iranian national TV (i.e. IRIB), from film fan site Cafecinema. They put together a series of side-by-side comparisons showing the before-and-after of this new censorship technique. Some of the efforts here are impressively subtle, as visualised in Images 2.6 and 2.7 below.

Image 2.6 An example of visual censorship on the Iranian state TV (IRIB)
As can be seen in the images above, regardless of the gender of the characters, they can be omitted or photoshopped to comply with the government’s ideological, political and religious beliefs.

Only recently, a small number of subtitled products have been shown in a limited number of cinemas in Tehran (e.g. *Three Billboards outside Ebbing, Missouri*, 2017). Nevertheless, as noted above, these products are affected by a high degree of censorship and are not appealing to individual consumers. Since AV products on TV, in cinemas, and in authorised video clubs are dubbed, this mode of AVT receives substantial funds and support from the government as opposed to subtitling, which is mainly produced illegally and covertly.

In essence, it is the lack of mainstream provision that has given rise to unofficial subtitling in the country. Non-professional or unofficial subtitling has therefore become very popular and prevalent in the Iranian context, and individuals who are interested in subtitling, language learning or watching movies in their original version (with subtitles as an aid for comprehension) are attracted by these products. In view of the fact that the practice of unofficial subtitling in Iran has recently gained a remarkable popularity, especially among
young audiences, addressing this under-researched phenomenon in the Iranian context will contribute significantly to the field of translation studies. The following subsection investigates this relatively new phenomenon in Iran from two perspectives: the sociocultural context surrounding this practice and the linguistic aspects of the process.

2.3.4 Unofficial subtitling in Iran

2.3.4.1 Sociocultural Aspects

The approach to translating and presenting audiovisual content is partly country-specific. In Iran, almost all foreign language programmes on state television and cinemas are currently dubbed and, as mentioned earlier, dubbing is supervised by two official bodies i.e. MICG and IRIB. This practice is highly professionalised, expensive and relatively slow in terms of delivering AV products to consumers. More importantly, a considerable part of foreign programmes, as discussed above, is routinely censored.

Due to the above-mentioned reasons, subtitling has emerged as a popular translation practice in the country and rapidly produced subtitles for uncensored programmes are made available illegally on the black market in the country. Subtitled products have become increasingly popular in the country over the past two decades. Fans of Hollywood films with a good knowledge of English became increasingly willing to share their favourite films with other film fans who are not proficient in English. Thus, they started producing subtitles using their PCs and distributing their subtitled products on the internet or through physical DVD stores on the black market. Gradually, these underground companies and amateur subtitlers became more and more active in the industry and, as a matter of fact, more linguistically and culturally aware of the source materials (i.e. American AV products). Arguably, this has resulted in a kind of cultural and linguistic competition, where anonymous yet overt distinction could, in theory, be achieved by producing gradually more (quantity-wise) and more sophisticated (quality-wise) subtitles for AV products. Improved quality, where it exists
and can be detected by audiences, is a sign of the evolution of the field. Thus, subtitlers can be credited with advancing the quality of the translation of these products or at least, on a most basic level, with the prevalence of the subtitled products in the country.

It should be pointed out that, at the early stage of this project, one of the objectives was to conduct interviews with the three selected unofficial subtitlers for the present study. The interviews would have given insights into the sociocultural aspect of the phenomenon as well as the process-oriented perspective of the investigation. Given the sociocultural environment in which these subtitlers operate, the interviews would have helped to reveal the reasons behind the subtitlers’ final choices that appear on the screen. Unfortunately, this plan never materialised for the ethical reasons that are explained in chapter 3 (section 3.2).

To mitigate this, I have relied on my personal and anecdotal experience, as someone born and raised in Iran, to shed light on the sociocultural aspect of the practice. In the process of compiling the relevant information, I was able to find other mediated evidence of subtitler behaviour, most notably, an interview conducted with a number of recognised and experienced unofficial subtitlers published on 30 December 2016, on a well-established Iranian news website (i.e. Mehr News). The interviews were mainly conducted in order to reveal the subtitlers’ motivation to remain in the practice, and to emphasise the significance of their role in the network of providing subtitled AV products. In addition to this, some sociocultural issues involved in the practice were discussed. The political and/or ideological aspects, however, were not dealt with. Other issues surrounding the practice such as the relationship between subtitlers and both consumers and other subtitlers (in terms of competing with one another) were also discussed. The following discussion will summarise the broader picture as it emerges from my own anecdotal experience and from data sources such as already published interviews.
The reasons for the emergence of the subtitling practice in the country (i.e. the limitations involved in the dubbed products on the national TV and cinemas) were discussed earlier (in section 2.3.3.2). In essence, consumers are culturally curious and have a hunger for foreign AV materials; accordingly, the unofficial subtitlers try to make sure their consumers are amused and entertained by making audiovisual products accessible to them both physically and linguistically/culturally. This creates a sense of community and service towards consumers and it can be argued that unofficial subtitling diversifies the audiovisual landscape in the country. These subtitlers seem to have accepted a cultural mission of ensuring that their consumers can access the latest AV products by offering them the values and the cultural accessibility they expect to receive. As mentioned before (section 2.3.2), the values they transfer through this community are in fact very similar to Deuze’s (2006:66) notion of ‘remediation’ in a sense that they manipulate the audiovisual status quo in the country by creating a specific means of accessing AV products that not only meet consumers’ needs and expectations, but can also increase their cultural awareness.

Compared to less than a decade ago, the quality of subtitles has improved significantly in Iran. Subtitlers’ awareness, both culturally and linguistically, has increased, and subtitles made by more recognised and more experienced subtitlers meet a certain standard that is broadly comparable with professional subtitling (an imitation of professional subtitling as suggested by Orrego-Carmona (2014)). This is, to some extent, similar to Massidda’s (2015) argument on the quality of fansubbing in Italy. She states that fansubbing/non-professional subtitling in Italy has become a practice with an important and positive impact on professional subtitling in the country. The findings of Massidda’s (2015) study, which was a qualitative analysis of subtitles proposed by two Italian fansubbing communities and professional subtitlers for a few episodes of two American TV shows, revealed that professional subtitlers seem to incorporate in their work some of the proposals made by
fansubbers; and subtitles by fansubbers are of superior quality compared to professionally produced ones. Massidda (2015:37) further states, “these unofficial producers have been reshaping the paradigms of the world media scenario”.

The findings of a study (in the Iranian context), carried out by Jafari (2013) supports the idea that unofficial subtitlers, facing no screening by the authorities, increase the fluency in the target text and make cultural references (in Jafari’s study, metaphors) more accessible to the target audiences compared to the renditions produced by the official subtitlers. The linguistic aspect of the practice will be broadly discussed in chapter 5.

As noted earlier, consumers’ needs and expectations are the most significant criteria for subtitlers to fulfil their sense of community and service. Various sources of information (e.g. online forums) suggest that there are a number of factors that consumers take into account when choosing their favourite subtitle(s); one of the most significant factors for the consumers is the quality and accuracy of the translation, i.e. the translations that read smoothly and enrich the film-viewing experience. Another criterion is the speed of production; the subtitlers who manage to scoop their rivals with subtitles for the latest films/series episodes are more appreciated and recognised by consumers (provided that the quality of the translation is not compromised). The next factor that is of high significance for the users is the right RIP (Routing Information Protocol; also known as Routing Protocol), which provides a means of communication between different routers so they can exchange information. To put it another way, the subtitle needs to be synchronised with the AV product available for download by the users. The more experienced and recognised subtitlers provide the link to the AV product (videos) to be downloaded in the SRT files they make available on the internet. In other words, the SRT files are synchronised with the AV product for which the link is provided in them. This feature can be considered as one of the reasons for the popularity of these subtitlers among the users (claimed by the users on the relating online
forums). Other subtitles i.e. the ones produced by less experienced/random subtitlers can also be synched with the AV products using specific software designed and available for this purpose. However, not all the users are able to use or aware of how to use this software. Videos are also available on some (unauthorised) websites available for the subtitled AV products. Another alternative to access the subtitled AV products is to (illegally) purchase them in DVD shops where the videos are available in physical DVD format and synched with the subtitles. The above-mentioned routes of accessing these products are discussed further in the chapter.

Being aware of the above-mentioned criteria, the subtitlers make an effort to work at the fastest pace possible and provide a high-quality Persian subtitle for the latest films, animations, and series. This production context combines the speed of sharing new releases with the high quality of a connoisseur mediator. Unofficial subtitlers produce subtitles that are high-quality (bearing in mind Massidda’s (2015) claim regarding the superiority of fan-produced subtitles), timely (on subscene.com, subtitles for new products can even be available the day after the original product premiered (e.g. The Equalizer 2, 2018)), and available for free or at a reasonable price. This goes completely against the typical project management principle of ‘two out of three’ (quality, speed, cost), as in normal circumstances a translation can be fast and good but not cheap, or cheap and fast but not good (Dunne and Dunne, 2011). The time for producing subtitles might range from a few hours (less than 24 hours and up to 72 hours after USA launch) for films and animations (depending on the popularity of a specific film or animation which is normally identified by the popular directors and the cast of these products), to only a couple of hours or so for an episode of a popular series. Nonetheless, according to one of the interviewees in the Mehr News interview, translating films that contain several instances of jargon or field-specific register, such as finance in The Big Short (2015), normally takes longer. In such cases, translators need to
research terminology and find the best and most accessible equivalent that is comprehensible for the audience regardless of their educational backgrounds.

Another aspect of the practice that is worth mentioning is that certain conventions and norms are set among subtitlers. To put it differently, experienced unofficial subtitling teams reach agreements with other teams, thereby establishing a form of unofficial guild, for example by agreeing to avoid ‘parallel operation’ or ‘parallel subtitling’. This means that, for instance, if a team has already started translating the first episode of a series, other teams should not translate the same series (according to one of the interviewees in Mehr News interview). However, there are exceptions to this norm; for instance, the selected films for the present study were available in multiple versions by different subtitlers or teams. This means that this norm or unspoken convention applies to some contexts where communication channels are established, but not others. As the practice is highly competitive in terms of popularity among the users, subtitlers compete with one another to be the first team to translate AV products as soon as they are available and accessible online by the production companies. In return, for most of them, the only reward is the number of user downloads and the appreciative and positive comments that users make on their work, which keeps them motivated in the practice (image 2.8 below). These unofficial subtitlers are normally anonymous and are known by their professional IDs/aliases (image 2.9 below).
Image 2.8 A screenshot of the subtitles details page on subscene.com

Image 2.9 A screenshot of the IDs the Iranian unofficial subtitlers use on subscene.com
One of the main motivations for unofficial subtitlers is the passion they have for films and translation, regardless of the monetary return, which is normally meagre or entirely absent. As mentioned in the Introduction chapter, the practice of unofficial subtitling in Iran goes against official patronage institutions. This point throws up interesting similarities with other contexts with competing AVT practices. For example, Massidda’s (2015:38) claim about Italian fansub communities, which according to her, “emerged in opposition to dubbing, as a form of resistance against its supposed authenticity and the unchallenged idea that dubbing might unequivocally represent the best of all possible worlds”. She further states that dubbing represents a domesticating process and affects the quality of dubbed products in terms of linguistic and cultural mediation (ibid.).

In Iran, ‘self-proclaimed’ institutions/groups of patronage in AVT (i.e. the unofficial subtitlers) focus more on the status component or the ideology component of patronage rather than on the economic component, as defined by Lefevere (1985). The patrons’ aim is to provide quality translation for popular films (mainly Hollywood films) for their audience. These unofficial subtitlers are mainly in their 20s or 30s, with different educational backgrounds ranging from social sciences (management, cinema, art) to engineering fields (according to Mehr News interview). The majority of them have a good knowledge of English and started translating while of high school stage to improve their language proficiency or as a hobby (normally with the purpose of translating their favourite films and sharing them with other film fans). Some subtitlers have stayed in the scene and joined translation teams at unofficial privately-owned subtitling companies, so are paid for their work. The translation work they provide can be paid per minute, per word, or per line (stated by one of the interviewees in the above-mentioned interview). Nevertheless, as mentioned earlier, the main motivation for the majority of unofficial subtitlers is non-commercial. They
normally upload the subtitles they provide for free, on the main source and largest database known to their users (i.e. subscene.com).

Users can rate and vote as ‘good’ their favourite subtitles. There is also a facility for users to upload their comments. The positive comments made by users, and the number of downloads that appears on the ‘subtitles details’ screen on the website, are in fact the main yardstick by which subtitlers are compared. This creates a competitive environment in which subtitlers make an effort to produce the first, and more importantly, the highest quality subtitles, to win over the most users. Once again, the status component of this idiosyncratic type of patronage seems to be of utmost importance.

The interviews reveal that, more recently, a shift of motivation in the practice is emerging. To be more specific, today, some unofficial privately-owned companies have set up websites with the purpose of providing AV products along with their Persian subtitles. A number of unofficial subtitlers join the translation teams in these companies and are paid for their work. These companies normally make a considerable amount of money by selling accounts to users, in order for them to be able to download the (subtitled) AV products. These platforms are also supported by advertising materials featured on them. Nevertheless, translators are not normally paid adequately considering the effort they make to produce high-quality subtitles within a short period of time (as is confirmed by one of the interviewees in the above-mentioned interview). Therefore, some of these subtitlers leave the scene after a while, finding it not financially viable.

In addition to the above-mentioned route for accessing the subtitled products, there are other websites that make these products available (based on my knowledge and desk research). These websites are normally the ones set up by subtitlers who are more experienced in the practice and therefore more recognised, as their aliases appears on most of the subtitled products. Their work is valued and is popular among the consumers due to the high standards
of translation and synchrony with the film. These subtitlers normally work in a team under the alias of which they make their subtitles available to the users. Users can subscribe to websites to access the products and, in some cases where the subscription is free, users/fans support their favourite translators through crowdfunding. This acts as a form of unspoken contract, describing the level of relationship between the subtitlers and their fans. Despite the fact that the motivation of some above-mentioned translators has become commercial, they normally do not compromise quality, therefore, they remain popular and their work is valued and appreciated by users. These subtitlers set up a website where the users can download Persian subtitles normally accompanied with the AV products. However, since the websites are not authorised, they get filtered frequently by the authorities, blocking users’ access to these websites. The website hosts will, however, find a way to circumvent the restrictions imposed by the authorities and make their subtitled products accessible to the users. Some of the solutions they have come up with so far can be listed below (based on my personal knowledge and anecdotal experience):

- Changing the IP address of their website (e.g. example.com to example.ir)
- Renaming the website (e.g. example.com to example.1.com)
- Defining an Internet command line for the website that will automatically link the users to the new URL
- Most recently, making an ID in the most popular social network in the country, i.e. Telegram, and providing a link to safari browser in their Telegram channel. By joining these channels, the users will get notifications regarding the latest (subtitled) products available on the relating website and will be able to access their favourite products through the relevant domain.

It is worth mentioning that Telegram, known as the “king of messaging app/social media” in Iran, has more than 40 million users in the country (Azali, 2017). This social media has
gained popularity among the Iranian users since mid-2014 (after Viber was banned by the authorities). As the largest hub to host Persian content, it has become one of the main business and social platforms in the country, through which individuals are able to post various materials and advertisements relating to their business and other social contents. For this reason, mainly during political or social chaotic periods, this social media gets filtered by the authorities in order to prevent the potential formation of social protest movements. However, by using VPN\(^3\) accounts, the users can remove the filters and access the content of the media.

Another means of access to the subtitled AV products for users, which is quite convenient and popular, is through physical DVD stores known to individual users or, in some cases, individual illegal distributors who do not have a premises but can provide customers with unauthorised AV products (with Persian subtitles) at their home or other private and safe places. In fact, DVD stores and other private illegal distributors play the role of distributors in this network. From personal experience, these physical DVD stores only display authorised AV products. At the same time, they provide their recognised, trusted customers with original (uncensored) films and series, with subtitles that are already synched with the product. This constitutes another main channel through which ‘unauthorised’ AV products are distributed. These DVD shops function as a mini-theatre scene with a façade where propriety is upheld, and a backstage setting where illegal activities take place. Interested customers may need to break the façade somehow by signalling to distributors what they need. At the same time distributors come to know and trust clients. Similarly, they know how to protect themselves and their business by filtering out potential outsiders or inquisitive authority representatives. The (trusted) consumers who are the big fans of American films and series and appreciate high-quality translation, would normally ask for their favourite translators/subtitlers when

\(^3\) Virtual Private Network secures the private network, using encryption and other security mechanisms to ensure that only authorised users can access the network and that the data cannot be intercepted.
purchasing these products. More experienced distributors, trying to make sure their customers are satisfied, download the highest quality subtitles (in terms of both translation and synchrony with the films) which are later sold in DVD format. These distributors also subscribe to websites that (illegally) provide images for either the original DVD cover (Images 2.10 the front side of the DVD covers and 2.11 the rear side) or photoshopped covers with Persian paratexts (Images 2.12 and 2.13 covers with Persian paratexts).

Image 2.10 The front side of the DVD covers as distributed on the Iranian black market

Image 2.11 The rear side of the DVD covers as distributed on the Iranian black market
Image 2.12 DVD cover including Persian paratexts (film)

Image 2.13 DVD cover including Persian paratexts (animation)
In essence, in transferring linguistic and cultural values through this medium, the technological aspect should not be disregarded. The use of DVD burners, paratexts, printing covers and so on, also serves the purpose of diversifying the audiovisual landscape in the country. Given the sociocultural environment in which they operate, (i.e. the network of providing unauthorised AV products), distributors run the highest risk due to their physical presence and visibility. There is always the risk of being caught by the authorities (i.e. agents of ‘Edare-ye Amaken’, or Bureau of Premises, which is responsible for the enforcement of accepted moral codes in places of work and other offices). If caught, they will face severe penalties ranging from getting their premises closed down, to considerable amount of financial penalties, and in some severe cases, depending on the level of perceived incongruity of the content of these products with the regime’s beliefs, the distributors might be sentenced to imprisonment. Referring to the above-mentioned discussion it can be argued that, despite all the restrictions imposed by the government, unofficial subtitlers (and other individuals involved in the network) play a vital role in increasing the prevalence of AV products and, accordingly, the level of cultural and ideological awareness of part of society, which makes the phenomenon socially and ideologically impactful.

Focusing on the social aspect, in his recent study, Díaz Cintas (2018) explored the social significance of some of the new forms of subtitling that have emerged in the age of digital media which he refers to as “cybersubtitling” i.e. subtitling on the web (ibid.:129). He introduces three main types of cybersubtitles: ‘fansubs,’ ‘guerrilla subtitles’ and ‘altruist subtitles.’ ‘Fansubs’ are more traditional and best known among the three. ‘Guerrilla subtitles’ was first introduced by Dwyer (2017:110) and referred to “both fan and non-fan modes of pirate translation,” understood as a “practice that rebels against or resists legal media and translation frameworks” (Dwyer 2017:123, as quoted by Díaz Cintas 2018:133-
In the classification proposed by Díaz Cintas, ‘guerrilla subtitles’ are the ones produced by individuals engaged in political matters whose aim is to combat censorship and conformity by “spreading certain narratives that counter-argue the truth reported by the powerful mass media” (ibid.:134). ‘Altruist subtitles’ are normally undertaken by individuals with a close affinity to the project on hand as in the case of Khan Academy as well as volunteer subtitling for TED Talks, with ethos of “You can learn anything. For free. For everyone. Forever” and “Ideas worth spreading” respectively (ibid.). It can be argued that the practice of unofficial subtitling in Iran has got the elements of the three main types of cybersubtitles proposed by Díaz Cintas (2018), in that it can produce “highly skilled, specialised results” (Dwyer, 2017:110) through following different conventions (as in fansubs), it circumvents censorship and the restrictions imposed by the Iranian authorities (as in guerrilla subtitles), and it is produced by volunteers for everyone although not always for free (as in altruist subtitles).

This section has set the scene and shed light on the sociocultural aspect of the unofficial subtitling phenomenon in Iran. Assuming that the sociocultural context in which the subtitlers operate can influence the strategies they opt for, an understanding of the sociocultural context of unofficial subtitling in Iran will help the researcher to interpret the linguistic analysis of the practice, which is dealt with in Chapters 4 and 5.

2.3.4.2. Linguistic Aspects

From an academic perspective, a number of Iranian scholars have recently looked into various aspects of the unofficial subtitling practice. Nevertheless, it remains an under-researched phenomenon and a new area for research in the Iranian context. Various scholars have referred to this phenomenon by different terms, among which are underground subtitling by Jafari (2013), non-professional subtitling by Ameri and Ghazizadeh (2015), fansubtitling by Khoshsaligheh and Fazeli (2016), non-official subtitling by Mollanazar and
Nasrollahi (2017), and fansubbing by Khoshsaligheh, et al. (2017) and by Mollanazar and Nasrollahi (2017). In the present study however, the practice is referred to as *unofficial subtitling* and to a certain extent differs from the above-mentioned terms for the reasons discussed below.

Fansubbing/fansubtitling is practiced all over the world and can be considered a subcategory of unofficial subtitling in the Iranian context, in that unofficial subtitling is practised in different genres (not limited to anime) and translations produced by unofficial subtitlers normally meets the high standards of translation. Using the term ‘non-professional subtitling’ to refer to these subtitlers can be highly controversial, as it is to some extent synonymous with ‘amateur’ subtitling, as both terms imply that these subtitles do not offer the standards that are required in professional subtitling and are therefore low quality. However, this does not precisely describe the current practice of subtitling in the country as these subtitles are not necessarily done by amateur subtitlers and the quality standards they observe in some cases are equal to (if not better than) professional subtitlers. As mentioned before, the only ‘professional’ translators in the country in the area of AVT are the ones who produce translation for the dubbed materials, therefore there are no ‘professional’ subtitlers (i.e. subtitlers trained for the practice) in this environment. Nevertheless, although subtitlers in Iran have not been professionally trained, it can be argued that in this sense, unofficial subtitling is a subcategory of non-professional subtitling. Arguably, the very use of the term non-professional is not as intuitive either, when there are no official subtitlers in the country, except the extremely small number of subtitlers working for the cinema (see comment on subtitled programme screenings above). Referring to this practice as ‘non-official’ subtitling does not accurately describe it either; the dyad official/non-official alludes to the bureaucratic labels of ‘official’ and ‘non-official’ that can be sanctioned by the government. Subtitling in Iran goes beyond such official sanctioning and works in
parallel with practices of approving material that has been subtitled or is in the process of being subtitled. Thus it may be better to use the term ‘unofficial subtitling’ because this description emphasises the fact that the majority of these subtitlers evade the restrictions and censorship involved in official subtitling and/or dubbing in a confined political and ideological environment of the country; as such, unofficial subtitling plays a significant role in enhancing the popularity of certain products and spreading the source language and culture.

As noted earlier, this area of audiovisual translation is still under-researched in the Iranian context. Nevertheless, in what follows, an extensive review of the related literature on the studies that have been carried out in this area is provided, and the research gap is accordingly revealed. The features that are addressed in the following studies include: the direction of the studies; (some focus on Persian to English direction, therefore, internationalised products), the genre; (which is mainly feature films), the translation problems; (e.g. metaphors, humour), comparative studies; (there are studies that compare official with non-official products in AVT).

In a study carried out by Marashi and Poursoltani (2009), the strategies applied by the Iranian subtitlers in subtitling Persian feature films into English were investigated to find out the most and least frequent strategies used by subtitlers. A comparative analysis was carried out on Persian-English parallel corpora. Gottlieb’s (1992) classification of interlingual subtitling strategies was used as the analytical framework in this study. The results indicated that all Gottlieb’s strategies were applicable to Persian into English subtitling of Iranian feature films, with transfer (translating the ST completely and accurately) being the most frequent, and deletion (the total elimination of parts of a text) being the least frequent strategy in English subtitles. They claimed that the low frequency of deletion does not indicate that the amount of reduction is also low; instead, it shows that
total elimination of some of the dialogue is the least frequent strategy and that quantitative reduction does not necessarily involve significant semantic reduction (Marashi and Poursoltani, 2009:15).

Barzegar (2010) investigated the translation of colloquial expressions in English into Persian subtitled films. The theoretical framework of the study was the combination of the taxonomies presented by McCrimmon (1963) and Holmes (1992). According to the findings of the study, transfer has been the most frequently applied strategy by Iranian subtitlers, followed by deletion, translation into expression with a higher degree of formality, paraphrase, semantic equivalent, condensation or under-translation, mistranslation, addition or over-translation, and translation into expressions with a lower degree of formality.

Ghaemi and Benyamin (2011) also looked into the interlingual strategies from English into Persian subtitles and their frequency. They conducted a corpus-based, comparative, descriptive analysis of an English-Persian parallel corpus, comprising English films in different genres with Persian subtitles, based on Gottlieb’s (1992) classification. The results indicated that all the strategies proposed by Gottlieb were applicable to the corpus, with some degree of variation in distribution among different film genres. The most frequently used strategy was transfer and the least frequently used strategies were transcription and decimation respectively (Ghaemi and Benyamin, 2011). The results also indicated that film genre played a crucial role in the variation of used strategies, which supports the point of discussion earlier in the chapter regarding the dilemma involved in translating specific linguistic elements in different genres and the influence of the genre on the decision-making process.

Jafari (2013) conducted a comparative study of two trends of subtitles in Iran, by looking into the strategies applied by what he called ‘governmental subtitlers’ and ‘underground
subtitlers’ in translating the metaphors found in American films. Newmark’s (1998) model for translating metaphors was used as the theoretical framework of the study, i.e. 1. Reproducing the same image in the TL, 2. Replacing the image in the SL with a standard TL image, 3. Translating metaphor by simile, 4. Translating metaphor by simile plus sense, 5. Converting metaphor to sense, 6. Deleting, 7. Combining the same metaphor with sense. The result indicates that the most frequent strategy applied by governmental subtitlers for translating metaphors has been the second procedure suggested by Newmark (1988), as they have been replaced by TL metaphors. The fourth and the seventh procedures have not been used by these subtitlers. With regard to the underground subtitlers, the most frequent procedure has been the fifth strategy as suggested in Newmark’s model, which means most metaphors have been converted to their intended senses. The result of the study could be indicative of underground subtitlers facing no restrictions from the authorities and, therefore transferring the metaphors to their intended sense, which increases the fluency of the text for the target viewer. On the other hand, governmental subtitlers replaced the source metaphors with TL metaphors that are more target-oriented, but that do not always comply with the spatial and temporal constraints of subtitling. Other Iranian scholars have also considered subtitling from the linguistic aspect of the practice, more specifically employing different theoretical frameworks to investigate the strategies these subtitlers apply in rendering specific linguistic elements, one of which is humour.

In a study carried out by Amirian and Soleymani Dameneh (2014), the strategies applied by subtitlers in translating American humour into Persian in the comic genre (the case study of The Simpsons Movie) was investigated, based on Ross’s (1998) classification of humour and Gottlieb’s (1997) microstrategies. According to the findings of their study, in translating humour the Persian subtitlers used transfer as the most frequently used strategy and the least frequently used strategies were observed to be decimation, deletion, imitation, resignation.
and substitution. They further stated that the findings of their study were in line with Gottlieb’s (1992) findings, indicating that by using strategies 1-5 (expansion, paraphrase, transfer, imitation and condensation), a more or less adequate rendering of the source text material into the target language is provided, whereas strategies 6-8 (decimation, deletion and resignation) involve some degree of semantic and stylistic loss (Amirian and Soleymani Dameneh, 2014:online).

Sadeghpour and Omar (2015) have also investigated the translation strategies employed in the subtitling of Persian comedy into English (a case study of the Iranian comedy *Lizard* (2004), a highly popular film and claimed to be the highest grossing in the country at the time of release). Humorous instances were detected and identified in the Persian version and were classified into three groups according to Raphaelson-West’s (1989) categorisation of humour. The eight strategies for translation of cultural jokes proposed by Tomaszkiewicz (1993, cited in Díaz Cintas, 2009) were adopted as the framework of the study. The results of the study revealed that due to the differences between languages and cultures, linguistic and cultural jokes resist in translation whereas universal humour can be transferred easily into other languages. Accordingly, literal translation was found to be the most frequently used strategy in subtitling from Persian into English. Furthermore, an equivalence strategy was also observed to be used frequently. Sadeghpour and Omar (2015:1995) believe that to transfer cultural humour and create the similar effect in the target language, subtitlers need to “create the humour in accordance to the visual context of the film and domesticate the translation to achieve the desired result”.

In a study conducted by Khoshsaligheh and Fazeli (2016), the process of producing ‘fansub’ for anime, the common challenges, and the technical aspect (the equipment and facilities involved in producing this kind of subtitle) have been investigated in Iran. The study in fact provides descriptive information regarding the technical dimension of the production process
including the timing, typesetting and encoding. A few individuals active in fansubbing were selected through snowball sampling and interviewed. The participants were from different age groups and different educational backgrounds, mainly irrelevant to translation. According to the findings of the study, the most active fansubbers normally work as a team in producing the subtitled products. The subtitling team comprises two groups, namely; the translation and editing group and the technical and software related group. The individuals involved in the translation and editing team are normally older than those in the technical team. The production process includes the following steps: original anime acquisition, translation, translation check, timing, typesetting and karaoke, final edit, encoding, quality control and the distribution of the final product. The interviewees’ main motivation was to provide high-quality subtitles for Persian speakers as soon as possible. Since they provide their material for free, the activity is not economically viable and they tend to leave the scene after a while (Khoshsaligheh and Fazeli, 2016:14). Nevertheless, the findings of the study cannot be generalised to the whole concept of unofficial subtitling practice in Iran, as it was limited to looking into the activity of ‘anime’ fansubbing and mainly investigated the technical aspects of the practice.

Mollanazar and Nasrollahi (2017), presented the subtitling practice in Iran as two trends of ‘official’ and ‘non-official’ or ‘underground’ subtitling. The former refers to the subtitles that are produced in official studios, which are in conformity with the rules and regulations set by the aforementioned formal institution. It should be pointed out that, based on the researcher’s anecdotal experience, official subtitles (the term mentioned by Molanazar and Nasrollahi), are distributed only through two main authorised providers i.e. Soroush and Resanehaye Tasviri in Iran. Nevertheless, for a number of reasons as listed below, the products they provide are not appealing to the majority of the audience. Firstly, the number of subtitled products they provide is very limited. Secondly, the subtitled products are quite old and new
AV products are not available. Thirdly and most importantly, as mentioned earlier, the products they provide involve a considerable degree of censorship.

Non-official subtitling on the other hand, as Mollanazar and Nasrollahi (2017) put it, refers to the freelance translators who are employed by an entity not affiliated to the government, producing subtitles using their PCs and distributing their subtitled products through underground channels or on the internet. “These underground companies and amateur subtitlers have helped the progress of the practice so considerably that nowadays a Persian subtitle, though non-official, can be found for almost all the imported American movies and TV-series” (Mollanazar and Nasrollahi 2017:157). It could be argued that, in essence, the difference between the unofficial practice of subtitling in the Iranian context and other, possibly Western and Eastern models of cultural production, is a pyramid where big studios and official organisations are at the top, and grassroots production or illegal activity at the bottom. In Iran, this pyramid is inverted, as most activity can be observed in those unofficial contexts/channels of cultural production; it is these individuals, groups or covert institutions that allow the great majority of cultural flows from abroad to happen by creating a specific route to access the AV products both physically and culturally/ideologically through self-expression and the awareness of the needs and expectations of their consumers. The whole phenomenon as discussed earlier, is a manifestation of the notion of ‘remediation’ in the society.

In their study, Mollanazar and Nasrollahi (2017), investigated the most frequently used subtitling strategies applied by the subtitlers by analysing the official and ‘non-official’ subtitled versions of a number of Hollywood films. Gottlieb’s (1992) subtitling strategies were used as the basis for the theoretical framework which, due to linguistic and cultural differences, were put under five main categories taken from ancient rhetoric as defined in Delabastita (1989:199) namely; Repetitio, Adiectio, Detractio, Transmutatio, and Substitutio.
Their study, unlike the study carried out by Khoshsaligheh and Fazeli (2016), dealt with the linguistic aspect of subtitling, which is mainly the task of the translator or translation team. The analyses were made irrespective of the censored parts in the official versions. The results of the study indicated that the two subtitling trends under investigation follow different paths of normative behaviour and apply different strategies in translating the same linguistic-audiovisual segment. Based on Delabastita’s (1989) model, the findings showed that repetito (literal translation, also referred to as transfer), was observed to be more common in the non-official subtitles in comparison to the official versions (i.e. non-official subtitlers showed more inclination towards literal translation). Detractio (omission) was seen to be more frequently used by the official subtitlers that might be indicative of the official subtitlers trying “to affiliate with the reduction requirement of the subtitles” i.e. the subtitlers’ awareness of spatial and temporal constraints as required in the operation of professional subtitling (Mollanazar and Nasrollahi, 2017:172). It could be argued that, further to the reason mentioned by Mollanazar and Nasrollahi, applying the strategy of omission frequently by official subtitlers might also be due to the political and ideological restrictions imposed by the formal institutions under whose supervision these subtitlers operate. The strategy of transmutatio, including dislocation, conversion, justification and deacronymisation, was the third most frequently used strategy by the subtitlers observed in this study, occurring more commonly in official versions. According to Mollanazar and Nasrollahi (2017:172), this could be a result of official subtitlers intending to increase the fluency in the subtitles as they are being broadcast to the layman. Nevertheless, not all instances have been necessarily more fluent in the target texts produced by this group (ibid.). The strategy of adiectio (addition) was the fourth most applied strategy by official subtitlers, whereas in non-official subtitles this category was the least frequent one: “This indicates that while official subtitles are more condensed, they are still more expanded in comparison to non-official versions” (ibid.:173).
Reflecting on this argument, it can be inferred that the author refers to the more condensed translations than the original dialogues in official subtitles, which are still more expanded in comparison to non-official versions. Regarding the strategy of paraphrase, both versions tended to render idiomatic expressions to non-idiomatic expressions while official subtitlers showed more cases of modifying moral issues in the renditions. Only a few number of modification of political, moral and religious issues were observed in non-official versions which, according to Mollanazar and Nasrollahi (2017:174), “might be considered as instances of self-censorship and how subtitlers may be slightly inclined towards compliance with dictated norms and regularities, regardless of lack of screening”. They further claim that, since official subtitlers are accredited to certain formal institutions, their subtitles might be more in line with the guidelines of professional subtitling and less literal, producing more dynamic equivalents, in contrast to the approach taken by non-official subtitlers, who showed less tendency to opt for creative solutions, instead settling for more literal renditions. In addition to this, the financial aspect of the practice can play a significant role in motivating official subtitlers to follow specific guidelines and quality standards, making them operate in accordance with a specific framework, whereas non-official subtitlers do not necessarily follow the subtitling norms and guidelines and, even if they do, they might be individually defined ones. Finally, Mollanazar and Nasrollahi believe that official subtitlers normally have the required educational or professional background to meet the specifications required for the job, whereas non-official subtitlers mostly do subtitling as a hobby or for personal and sometimes pedagogical purposes. All the above-mentioned factors can significantly affect the choices made by both groups of subtitlers, which are not necessarily an outcome of the political and ideological system (Mollanazar and Nasrollahi, 2017:176).

Sadeghpour (2018) examined the degree of the adequate transference of humorous (linguistic and extralinguistic) cultural expressions in the genre of comedy animations from
English into Persian, in both dubbed and subtitled versions. He classified the identified humorous expressions in the source texts into eight groups, based on the selected classification of humour by Nedergaard Larsen (1993). The translation strategies employed by the translators were analysed using selected translation procedures chosen for the study and Pedersen’s (2011) strategies for transferring ECRs in subtitling. In order to identify the most effective translation procedures (as one of the aims of his study), the translations were evaluated through the functional theory of Reiss and Vermeer (1984). The findings of his study revealed that substitution is a practical strategy in the transfer of humorous (linguistic and extralinguistic) cultural expressions in comedy animations from English into the Persian, in both dubbed and subtitled versions.

As can be observed, all but a couple of the studies mentioned above have investigated the same genre (i.e. film). Furthermore, these studies mainly investigated the subtitling strategies applied by Iranian subtitlers (in general), and only a few of the studies have specifically looked into linguistic elements such as metaphor, humour, and colloquial expressions in subtitles. This indicates that the genre of animation remains under-researched in the field of subtitling by Iranian ‘unofficial’ subtitlers. Therefore, due to the specific characteristics the animation genre entails, the findings of these studies might differ, compared to animation, as the genre under investigation in the present study. In addition, only one of the above studies (i.e. Sadeghpour 2018), has looked into the translation of ECRs, focusing on ‘humorous’ references only, whereas the present study investigates the translation of all types of ECRs in subtitling animations by (popular) Iranian unofficial subtitlers.
Chapter 3
Methodology

This chapter focuses on the methodological approach selected for the present study, which has been applied to answer the research questions of the project and to tackle the research gap identified in Chapter 2. Firstly, Section 3.1 elaborates the research questions and the research gap previously identified, and spells out the focus of the study. Section 3.2 describes the unsuccessful procedure undertaken for the ethical approval to conduct interviews initially planned as part of the project. The following section (3.3) explains the material used in this study and the selection criteria for including it. Section 3.4 outlines the analytical framework used for the project, which is divided into two subsections with the purpose of elaborating on the strategies in the taxonomy selected as the theoretical framework for the project (3.4.1), and the adapted model devised for the purpose of the present study in (3.4.2). Finally, the data analysis procedure is explained in section 3.5.

3.1 Aim and Research Questions

As discussed earlier in chapter 2, this study aims at addressing the phenomenon of ‘unofficial subtitling’ in the Iranian context, which is an under-researched area in the field of AVT. It needs to be mentioned that, despite the focus on the Iranian context, the phenomenon this project investigates has wider appeal beyond the Iranian framework.

The popularity of Hollywood productions around the globe has resulted in Iranian viewers’ increasing demand for more access to uncensored products. Therefore, the practice of ‘unofficial subtitling’, which involves no censorship, has had a remarkable effect on the popularity of subtitled products among Iranian audiences, in comparison to the dubbed products broadcast on TV, which involve a considerable level of censorship. This has resulted in the availability of Persian subtitled versions of almost all recently released American films and TV series in the Iranian market (Mollanazar and Nasrollahi, 2017). This sub-field of translation is not as chaotic as it may seem at face value, as there are patterns
shaped by supply and demand in the relevant context. Depending on their preference, users can choose the subtitled version of their favourite film or programme, which are available either on the black market, or can be purchased by subscribing to websites where subtitled products can be downloaded. However, since these websites are not authorised by a formal institution, they frequently get filtered by the authorities and are, as a result, not always the most convenient way of accessing these products for users. There are also a number of official websites available where subtitled products can be purchased. However, since their products need to comply with the ideological and political constraints set by the Islamic regime, a high level of censorship is imposed on the content of such products and they are, therefore, not appealing to the majority of the audience.

As mentioned earlier in Chapter 2, some of these unofficial subtitlers are more active and therefore more experienced in the field and, as a result, they are informally ‘recognised’ in the illegal subtitling scene and their products are the most popular among the target audience. Illegal subtitles in Iran seem to have an overarching motivation. However, there are two defining features of cultural production which emerge: first, the creation of subtitles driven by commercial interest; and second, the non-commercial approach (see Chapter 2 section 2.3.4.1). The focus of this study is the former since, in order for subtitlers to be able to compete in the market, their translation is produced to a certain standard, to meet the needs and expectations of the audience.

Unofficial/non-professional subtitlers are a heterogeneous group of people who do not necessarily hold a relevant education qualification. However, some of them have a very good knowledge of English with practical translation skills. As discussed in Chapter 2, not enough research has been done on unofficial subtitling in the Iranian context and, more importantly, on exploring the reasons of their popularity and success in the practice.
Therefore, the objective of this study is to investigate the trend of unofficial subtitling in the Iranian context, by looking into the translation strategies these subtitlers apply in translating Extralinguistic Cultural References (ECRs) in animated films. The reason for looking into the translation of ECRs is that cultural elements in general, and ECRs in particular, can be considered among the most challenging aspects of translation. In addition to this, animation, due to its unique characteristics (mainly creativity and humour), facilitates tackling such problematic aspects of translation. Accordingly, the research questions of the project are set out below:

**Research Questions**

The main research question is:

How is ‘unofficial subtitling’ of animated films done in the Iranian context?

This entails three specific research questions, the first of which comprises two sub-questions.

1. How can the practice of subtitling in Iran and the sociocultural conditions under which it takes place be characterised, i.e,
   a) What is ‘unofficial subtitling’?
   b) Who does it in the Iranian context?

2. What are the most frequently-applied translation strategies for Extralinguistic Cultural References (ECRs) in animated feature films subtitled from English into Persian by unofficial subtitlers?

3. What are the specific patterns of subtitling behaviour when dealing with ECRs that affect the way animated films are presented in the target culture (TC)?

The first research question has been mainly dealt with in Chapter 2 (Section 2.3.4.1) by defining the phenomenon of unofficial subtitling in the Iranian context, the popularity of the activity and the presence of some informally recognised unofficial subtitlers in the scene, which will also be discussed further in this chapter (Section 3.3.1).
In order to be able to answer the second research question, Pedersen’s (2011) taxonomy of transfer strategies for Extralinguistic Cultural References (ECRs) was adapted as the analytical framework for this project. A set of animated films with subtitles by different subtitlers was selected. The films were then examined to identify instances of ECRs and, further, in each TT version, the translation of each ECR was coded with the appropriate strategy label. The frequency of each strategy was calculated, and a quantitative and qualitative comparison was made among the works of selected subtitlers, which was subsequently used as a guideline to inspect the third research question. In other words, the ST-TT comparison of subtitles was made to see how each subtitler makes the film accessible for the target viewer and whether these films have been creatively rendered so that viewers come to appreciate them, and finally, how subtitlers affect characterisation or change the intention of the ST creators.

It should be pointed out that, in order to investigate the practice of unofficial subtitling in the Iranian context more precisely, by looking into this phenomenon from a sociocultural perspective, and also to be able to delve into this activity from a process-oriented point of view rather than only product-oriented, at the early stages of the project it was planned to conduct interviews with the subtitlers and possibly with a number of distributors and viewers in Iran. However, the required ethical approval was not granted for conducting the interviews and the study was carried out without this element. In what follows, the procedure for the ethical approval application and the relating implications involved are outlined in more details.

3.2 Ethics

The title of the present thesis was initially:

“Unofficial Subtitling in Iran; Process, Product, and the Sociocultural Context”
The reason for choosing the above title was to unveil the sociocultural aspect of unofficial subtitling in the Iranian context, for the first time, as well as observing this practice from an additional level of analysis, i.e. from a process-oriented perspective by looking at the subtitling process from a subtitler’s view alongside the product-oriented perspective. Therefore, the relating research questions were:

1. What is the sociocultural context surrounding unofficial subtitling in Iran?
2. What profiles of subtitlers can be identified in the Iranian context? (inter alia, such profiles may entail preferences in relation to, attitudes towards, and approaches to unofficial subtitling)
3. What are the most frequently applied translation strategies in unofficial subtitling in Iran?

In order to be able to answer the first two research questions above, it was planned to interview the subtitlers whose products have been analysed in this study. In other words, there would be three interviews with three of the most recognised unofficial subtitlers, to find out the reasons behind their choices of translation strategies in translating ECRs. It was also planned to conduct a complementary set of interviews with consumers, to delve into the sociocultural aspect of this phenomenon in Iran. Accordingly, the subtitlers would be interviewed with regard to the sociocultural aspect of their practice, namely the network they are dealing with and the problems they might face in this regard, and so on. The consumers, including the audiences and the distributors of these products, would also be interviewed. The audiences would be interviewed regarding their preferences in the style of subtitled products they tend to purchase (more authentic to the source culture or more adapted to the target culture), as well as the reasons of their preference to watch subtitled products and whether or not they prefer to purchase the products subtitled by specific subtitlers. The distributors also
would be asked questions about the problems they might encounter in distributing the illegal AV products and the penalties they have to pay and the relating consequences they should expect if caught by the authorities. Approximately 20 interviews were envisaged to be conducted in this group. The informants would consist of 15 audience members and 5 distributors. Having said all the above, the procedure to obtain the ethical approval for conducting the interviews was undertaken and the application was sent to the Ethics Committee of the University of Surrey.

It was clearly explained in the protocol of the project that, since subtitled films for adult audiences are illegally distributed, distributors run the risk of being caught by the authorities and can potentially face severe sanctions and penalties, and that this poses a distinct ethical risk for the proposed project. In order to effectively mitigate the above-mentioned risks and complications, animation has been chosen as the genre under investigation in this study. This genre is (normally) overlooked by the authorities, who seem to focus more on genres concerning political and religious views of adults, as portrayed in Western audiovisual products. The Ethics committee initially suggested that the interviews should be conducted remotely and not in person, to avoid the risk of travelling to Iran for the purpose of conducting interviews of this nature. The committee also required a more secure method of conducting remote interviews rather than via Skype. Accordingly, the ZOOM software was suggested to the committee, with all the relevant security details. Notwithstanding this suggestion, the project in the end was not granted the requested ethical approval.

Consequently, it was concluded that doing close reading/analysis of subtitles is low risk and the only line of investigation possible. Therefore, the title of the thesis and the research questions were adjusted accordingly, to suit the focus of the present study. It should be mentioned that the interviews were designed to complement the research by providing additional insights into the practice of subtitling in Iran and would have offered a great
opportunity for triangulation in this research, in terms of examining the process of subtitling and the reasons for choosing specific strategies in translating ECRs. However, as this was not the main focus of the project, forgoing the interview element did not affect the substance and originality of the present study, and the analysis of the existing subtitles still revealed insightful findings on the linguistic aspect of the practice. Nevertheless, the researcher had to exclusively rely on the subtitles and her personal interpretation of the texts, which requires acknowledging the limitations that the personal interpretations entail in any qualitative research. In what follows, the selection criteria for the subtitlers and for the material of the study is discussed.

3.3 Research Material

The genre under investigation in this study is animation, as a format that appeals to a dual audience of (young) adults and children, and that keeps growing in terms of mass popularity and acceptance, but that is also an under-researched genre in the Iranian context. In addition to this, the popularity of this genre in terms of language learning purposes in Iran is of high importance. Language schools use animated films as a complementary material for both children and young adults, and encourage parents to purchase subtitled versions of animations for their children in order to help them improve their English language skills at home. Moreover, some adult language learners try to improve their English language skills by watching subtitled animations, especially at the earlier stages of their language courses, since the language used in animations is simple and easier to comprehend, as the messages and narratives in which they are embedded are mainly targeted for children. The following section outlines the selection criteria for the subtitlers and films in this project.

3.3.1 Selection of the Subtitlers

As discussed earlier, some unofficial subtitlers are more informally recognised by audiences than others in the subtitling scene. Among these subtitlers, the subtitled products for animated
films of three individuals were chosen for detailed analysis. The criteria for choosing these subtitlers for the study are outlined below:

- The number of subtitled products they have produced to date
- The user rating out of 10 and proportion voted as ‘good’ by users
- Number of downloads of the subtitle produced for each film

The source to acquire the above information was subscene.com (image 3.1 below), where the downloadable SRT files for the subtitles are available. This website is run by a private company, supported by adverts, which provides access to non-professional subtitles from around the world and is amongst the most visited non-professional subtitles websites according to Alexa.com⁴. Amateur subtitlers from around the world can upload their subtitle files onto subscene.com and the users can find subtitle files for films by searching the name of the film through the website, which provides subtitles in more than 50 languages, mainly in English, Arabic, Brazilian, Portuguese, Farsi/Persian, Indonesian and Vietnamese.

⁴ An official website that provides commercial web traffic data and analytics.
Considering all the criteria above, three subtitlers have been identified as the most popular subtitlers. In order to maintain anonymity, the selected subtitlers in the project are referred to as subtitler A, subtitler B, and subtitler C.

3.3.2 Selection of the Films

The corpus of the study comprises five animation films and their Persian subtitles, produced by the same three selected subtitlers. The rationale behind the selection of the films is as follows:

- Date of release 2013 onwards: As the research project commenced in 2015, and the pilot study was carried out in 2016, the intention was to select the most popular
animated films among recent releases (2013-2016), to be able to analyse the latest works of the selected subtitlers, which could support the validity of the findings.

- A high popularity rating: (at least 4 out of 5 stars) by the audience according to IMDb. The selected films are among the highest-grossing animated films during the given period.
- The availability of Persian subtitle version for all five films. In other words, to ensure comparability, the choice fell on films for which subtitles by the same three subtitlers were available (see Table 3.3).

Taking into account the first criterion, among the most popular animated films released during 2013-2016 introduced by IMDb, the following 10 films were initially chosen and later narrowed down:


With regard to the third element of selection, i.e. the availability of subtitles produced by the selected subtitlers, the selected films were narrowed down to the following list:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title of the film</th>
<th>Year of release</th>
<th>Producing Company</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Frozen</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>Walt Disney Animation Studios</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Despicable Me 2</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>Illumination Entertainment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotel Transylvania 2</td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>Sony Pictures Animation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inside Out</td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>Pixar Animation Studios</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Croods</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>DreamWorks Animation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3.1 The initial selection of films for the project

A plot summary (from IMDb) for each film has been provided below.
**Frozen (2013)**

“In the Kingdom of Arendelle, Princess Elsa has the power to create and freeze ice and snow. She accidentally hits Anna her younger sister, on the head with her powers and almost kills her. Their parents take them to trolls that save Anna’s life and make her forget her sister’s ability. Elsa returns to the castle and stays reclusively in her room with fear of hurting Anna with her increasing power. Their parents die, and a few years later Elsa’s coronation forces her to open her castle gates to celebrate with the people. Anna meets Prince Hans at the party and immediately falls in love and decides to marry him. But Elsa doesn’t approve, loses control of her powers, and freezes Arendelle. Elsa flees to the mountain and Anna along with the peasant Kristoff, his reindeer Sven, and the snowman Olaf seek out Elsa.”

**Despicable Me 2 (2013)**

“The ex-villain Gru is raising his daughters Margo, Edith and Agnes and researching a legitimate jelly and jam business with Dr. Nefarion and the minions. Meanwhile, a laboratory in Arctic is stolen by a powerful aircraft using magnetism. The Anti-Villain league (AVL) agent Lucy Wilde recruits Gru to help her agency discover who has stolen the laboratory and its research. They know that the thief has a store in a mall, and Gru suspects that the owner of the Mexican restaurant Salsa & Salsa, Eduardo Perez, may be the villain El Macho that is presumed dead.”

**The Croods (2013)**

“The film is set in a fictional prehistoric Pliocene era known as “The Croodaceous” (a prehistoric period which contains fictional prehistoric creatures) when a caveman’s position as a “Leader of the Hunt” is threatened by the arrival of a prehistoric genius who comes up with revolutionary new inventions as they trek through a dangerous but exotic land in search of a new home.”
**Inside Out (2015)**

“When a young girl named Riley is uprooted from her Midwestern lifestyle and moves to the busy and chaotic San Francisco, her emotions; Anger, Sadness, Disgust, Fear, and (her most important emotion) Joy, start to disagree on how to deal with this dramatic change, which causes problems up in Headquarters, the central living and working place for the five emotions.”

**Hotel Transylvania 2 (2015)**

“Dracula’s rigid monster-only hotel policy finally opens up its doors to human guests. But Dracula is worried that his adorable half-human, half-vampire grandson, Dennis, isn’t showing signs of being a vampire. So while Mavis, Dracula’s daughter, is busy visiting her human in-laws, Dracula enlists his friends Frank, Murray, Wayne and Griffin to put Dennis through a “monster-in-training” boot camp. But little do they know that Dracula’s grumpy and very old, old school dad Vlad is about to pay a family visit to the hotel. And when Vlad finds out that his great-grandson is not a pure blood and humans are now welcome at Hotel Transylvania, unwanted complications arise.”

It needs to be pointed out that *The Croods* was replaced by the animated film *Zootopia (2016)* produced by Walt Disney Animation. The reason for this replacement was that, although *The Croods* fulfilled the selection criteria, it contained a lower degree of cultural embeddedness due to the primitive setting of the story and therefore it had to be discarded from the list of selected films. On the other hand, a high number of ECR instances was observed in *Zootopia*, the plot summary of which is provided below.

**Zootopia (2016)**

“In a world where animals have no intention of eating each other, a little bunny named Judy Hopps who grew up on a farm leaves her family to pursue her dreams of being the first bunny
cop in Zootopia. While there, she runs into a con artist fox named Nick Wilde, and they have
to work together after an incident threatens Zootopia.”

The following section describes the analytical framework used for the project followed by the
data analysis procedure.

3.4 Analytical Framework

As noted in Chapter 2, Pedersen’s (2011) taxonomy of ECR transfer strategies has been
chosen as the analytical framework for the present study. His taxonomy has been proposed
with a focus on the professional subtitling for Scandinavian TV programmes. However, the
focus of the present study is to investigate the strategies applied by unofficial subtitlers in the
Iranian context. This can be investigated from different perspectives, one of which is the way
that these unofficial translators deal with translating problematic items such as cultural
elements, which is the aspect in focus for the present study. As Franco Aixelá (1996) puts it,
language itself is a culture specific phenomenon. Therefore, everything is practically culture
specific in a language, something that makes it difficult to define a culture specific reference
(Franco Aixelá, 1996:56-57). Unofficial subtitlers do not necessarily follow the norms set by
the professional subtitling establishments or by the agents and institutions of professional
subtitling. Nevertheless, the translation of culture-bound elements is challenging regardless of
the background, profile, and training of a subtitler. Pedersen’s taxonomy, designed for
subtitling with a specific focus on the translation of cultural references or, according to him,
Extralinguistic Cultural References, is therefore a useful framework in the context of this
project as well.

Pedersen (2011:43) refers to an ECR as “a reference that is attempted by means of any
cultural linguistic expression which refers to an extralinguistic entity or process. The referent
of the said expression may prototypically be assumed to be identifiable to a relevant audience
as this referent is within the encyclopaedic knowledge of this audience”. Nonetheless, he
explains the choice of the term ‘Extralinguistic Cultural References’ by considering these cultural items as not being part of the language system. He excludes what he calls ‘intra-linguistic culture-bound references’ such as idioms, proverbs, instances of slangs and dialects. In the present study all levels of his taxonomy (see Figure 2.1) have been considered for the data analysis and a number of categories have been added to his model to suit the purpose of the study for the reasons that will be discussed further in the section.

In order to test the methodological validity of the analytical framework, during the early stages of the project, a pilot study was conducted. The animation film selected for the pilot study was *Monsters University* (released in 2013 by Walt Disney Pictures). In the pilot study, the analysis was made based on the first two levels of Pedersen’s taxonomy, namely source-oriented and target-oriented strategies and the first level of subcategories these two entail, i.e. Retention, Specification, Direct translation as the subcategories of source-oriented strategies, Generalisation, Substitution and Omission as subcategories of target-oriented strategies and also Official equivalent as a separate category. The decision to use the first two levels of this model was to make sure that the framework as a whole is suitable before going into more granular detail. Further levels were then considered in the analysis process for the main study. The subtitlers for the main study though were the same three subtitlers as selected for the pilot study.

A data analysis grid using Pedersen’s (2011) taxonomy for the pilot study is shown in Table 3.2 below.
Table 3.2 Data analysis grid based on Pedersen’s (2011) taxonomy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source text</th>
<th>Target text</th>
<th>Back-translation</th>
<th>Source-oriented</th>
<th>Target-oriented</th>
<th>Official equivalent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ST ECR</td>
<td>1 (subtitler A)</td>
<td>1 (subtitler A)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 (subtitler B)</td>
<td>2 (subtitler B)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 (subtitler C)</td>
<td>3 (subtitler C)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Since Pedersen’s taxonomy addresses professional norm-oriented subtitling by professional subtitlers, his model needed to be broadened to include some subtitling techniques that were observed in the analysis of the material in the pilot study, and that have not been identified in his taxonomy. In the main study, a category system as an adaptation of Pedersen’s taxonomy, including partial redefinition and extension of the categories, was presented to suit the purpose of the study. The present model used as an analytical framework for the study, was in fact gradually developed alongside the data analysis. The categories added to Pedersen’s model will be outlined further in this chapter. The following section delineates the categories in Pedersen’s taxonomy by providing examples pertaining to each strategy with the purpose of validating the logic based on which the classification of the TTs was carried out.

3.4.1 Classification of the TTs Based on Pedersen’s Taxonomy

As noted in Chapter 1, the present study employs both quantitative and qualitative methods for the data analysis. Descriptive statistics is used to gauge the frequency of the different strategies applied by the subtitlers, based on the analytical framework of the study, i.e. an adaptation of Pedersen’s taxonomy of ECR transfer strategies, for which a detailed discussion is provided in Chapter 4. The purpose is not an absolute quantification of the strategies but rather the identification of the tendencies and preferences in choosing the strategies by the
subtitlers in the present corpus. The frequency analyses are then used as a basis for a range of qualitative analysis of the data to answer the research questions.

In order to demonstrate the rationale and process on which the TTs (i.e. the renditions of ST ECRs) were classified throughout the corpus of the study, an example for each strategy as presented in Pedersen’s taxonomy is given below. The categories and relating subcategories of the source-oriented group are outlined first, followed by target-oriented strategies.

- **Retention**

Retention, according to Pedersen (2011:76), is the most source-oriented strategy, where the ST ECR is kept unchanged in the subtitle or slightly adapted to meet TL requirements. This strategy, however, was not applicable to the TTs of the present study and therefore was replaced by ‘Transliteration’ which is explained in detail in section 3.4.2 of the chapter.

- **Specification**

According to Pedersen (2011), Specification, as a source-oriented strategy occurs when the ECR is kept untranslated, but an explanation is provided for the term, making the TT ECR more specific than the ST ECR (Pedersen 2011: 79). This strategy entails two subcategories namely, Completion and Addition. Completion, in fact provides more information that is latent in the ST ECR to make it more accessible for the TC viewer (Pedersen, 2011). In fact, the ECR is not translated but the latent information is added to complete the sense in the target culture. This strategy is exemplified below:

Example (1) (*Inside Out*)

ST ECR: *Forget it Jake. It’s Cloud Town!*

TT: فراموشش کن جیک. اینجا محله ابرهاسی! (اشعاره به فیلم محله چینیها)

Back-translation: *Forget it /dʒeɪk/. It's /kləʊd təʊn/ (referring to the film Chinatown)
The above ECR was identified in the animation film *Inside Out*. In order for the ECR instances to be distinguishable, they are shown in bold and italics in ST, TT and BT throughout the chapter. The whole utterance has been treated as an ECR since the line has been derived from the popular 1974 American film *Chinatown*, starring Jack Nicholson. The sentence has been used frequently ever since as a well-known quote. It is actually used in the situations where people in power do injustice and get away with it because they are too powerful for others to win against them. In fact, the word ‘Chinatown’ represents any place that has corruption.

The TT viewer might not be familiar with the quote and its origin as much as the ST viewer might be. Therefore, the translator opted for a Completion strategy, i.e. providing more information in brackets to make the ST ECR more specific and accessible for the TC viewer. The name *Jake* referring to the main character in the film played by Jack Nicholson, which is also an ST ECR, has been transliterated in the TT as shown above. The snapshot of the original scene in the film *Chinatown* where the famous quote is uttered, alongside the duplicated scene in the animation *Inside Out*, are shown in Image 3.2 below.

![Image 3.2 Snapshot of the quote “Forget it Jake. It’s Cloud Town!” both in the original film (Chinatown) and in Inside Out animated film](image-url)
In what follows, the Addition strategy as a subcategory of Specification is exemplified.

- **Addition**

According to Pedersen (2011:80), the Addition strategy involves the linguistic process of one of the following: meronymy, polysemy, or hyponymy. In the Example (2) below, the ST ECR, *Cannoli* ⁵ has been treated as a hyponym of pastry. Therefore, by adding the word ‘pastry’, the translator has made it clear for the target audience what *Cannoli* is. Nonetheless, the strategy used here can also be classified as Completion, as the word ‘pastry’ spells out the latent meaning in the ST ECR.

Example (2) (*Zootopia*)

ST ECR: Grandmama made you *cannoli.*

TT: مامان بزرگ برات شیرینی "کانولی" درست کرد.

Back-translation: grandma made you “/kʌnoli/" pastry.

Instances such as the above example were observed rather frequently throughout the TTs in the corpus, making the classification process difficult and time-consuming. In addition to this, strategies of both Addition and Completion in all relating instances were observed to be accompanied by the strategy of Transliteration, resulting in forming the combined category of Transliteration+Specification, which will be outlined further in section 3.4.2. The major drawback of Completion and Addition, however, is that they are both space-consuming strategies and, therefore, not the most felicitous strategy to be used in the subtitling process. However, the fact that these strategies are used throughout the corpus suggests the operation of different sets of norms in unofficial subtitling.

- **Direct translation**

The strategy of Direct translation in Pedersen’s taxonomy is, according to him, rarely applied to most proper names, but is commonly used “for rendering the names that are constructed of

---

⁵ *Cannoli* are Italian pastries that originated on the island of Sicily and are today a staple of Sicilian cuisine as well as Italian-American cuisine (Gangi, 2006).
common nouns, and which thus have compositional sense which can be translated” (Pedersen, 2011:83). He further states (ibid.):

Vinay and Darbelnet (and Chesterman 1997:94) have two strategies called “calque” and “literal translation”. The term Direct Translation is used here to cover both their levels of literalness. Also, to some scholars (cf. Shuttleworth & Cowie 1997), the term “literal translation” is used in a much broader sense, as a synonym of word-for-word translation, and an antonym of “free translation”. Other scholars (e.g. Newmark 1988:75), use “literal translation” as a synonym of what I here call Direct Translation. Thus by, using Direct Translation instead of “literal translation” we can avoid the ambiguities associated with that term.

For the purposes of this study, the same distinctions concerning degrees of literalness will be adopted, as per Pedersen’s taxonomy. It can also be argued that literal translation is more apt when referring to larger units of translation (i.e. entire phrases and clauses, or at least units large enough to make judgements on both a lexical and a syntactic level), compared to ECRs as smaller units of translation.

Based on the outcome of the strategy, Direct translation is divided into two subcategories in Pedersen’s taxonomy: Calque and Shifted. Calque here is referred to the definition of the term by Shuttleworth and Cowie (1997:18) as “a term used to denote the process whereby the individual elements of an SL item (e.g. morphemes in the case of a single word) are translated literally to produce a TL equivalent” whereas the translation strategy is labelled as “Shifted Direct translation” only if each and every morpheme has been translated (within the confines of obligatory shifts), including cases which produce neologisms (Pedersen, 2011:83).

According to Vinay and Darbelnet (2000), in the process of calque, which is a special kind of borrowing, a language translates literally each of the elements of a borrowed expression from another language (ibid.). They state that the result of this process is either a ‘lexical calque’, “which respects the syntactic structure of the TL, whilst introducing a new mode of
expression” or a ‘structural calque’, “which introduces a new construction into the language” (ibid.:85). They provide below English-French examples for these two types of calque respectively (ibid.).

Compliments of the Season! Compliments de la saison!
Science-fiction Science-fiction

Further to this, calque is also defined as “a term used to denote the process whereby the individual elements of an SL item (e.g. morphemes in the case of a single word) are translated literally to produce a TL equivalent” (Shuttleworth and Cowie, 1997:18). Chesterman (1997:94) states that calque is a strategy that “covers both the borrowing of individual items and the borrowing the syntagma. He provides the following example for calque translation (ibid.):

English: The man in the street French: l’homme dans la rue

Newmark (1988:84) also asserts that calques are used frequently in the translation of the names of international organisations, for instance:

French: Communauté Économique Éuropéenne English: European Economic Community

Having mentioned the definitions and examples above, it can be argued that the strategy of ‘calque’ involves literal translation, as literal translation is “maximally close to the SL form, but nevertheless grammatical” (Chesterman, 1997:94). According to Pedersen (2011), in Direct translation, unlike the strategies of Specification and Generalisation, the subtitler does not make any effort to make the ST ECR more accessible for the TC viewer or to convey the connotations in any way (ibid.).

The following examples of Direct translation have been selected from the corpus of the present study to illustrate the above discussion.
Example (3) (*Inside Out*)

**ST ECR:** You know what? Save *Chopsticks*, and *Heart and Soul*, get rid of the rest.

**TT:** مينوني جيه جوه غذا وقلب وروح رو نگه دار، بقيه رو بده بره

**Back-translation:** You know what, keep the *food sticks* and *heart and soul*, get rid of the rest.

In the example above, which was identified in the film *Inside Out*, the purpose of the scene is actually to depict how long-term memory often works, as the long-term memory workers in Riley’s brain delete four years of piano lessons. One of the workers says: “Save ‘Chopsticks’ and ‘Heart and Soul’, and get rid of the rest”, and the other one vacuums away four years of work. In fact, “Chopsticks” and ‘Heart and Soul’ are piano lessons mostly known to individuals with a music background. Nevertheless, in the above example, the first ECR (i.e. Chopsticks) has been paraphrased to food sticks (i.e. sticks that are used for eating food), therefore a paraphrase with sense transfer, whereas the second ECR (i.e. Heart and Soul) has been literally translated into the TL, which also falls into the category of Direct translation as it involves only the language level and no effort has been made to transfer the connotation or to guide the TT audience in accessing the ECR, which might cause ambiguity in terms of connotations as the TT viewer will be grappling with the ECR. It can be argued that this kind of direct translation can be categorised as ‘lexical calque’ proposed by Vinay and Darbelnet (2000), as discussed above.

With regard to the Shifted Direct translation, according to Pedersen (2011:84), if a morpheme-for-morpheme translation would result in a different solution than the one chosen, then the example should be assigned to the Shifted subcategory. In this category, the subtitlers perform some optional shifts on the ST ECR to make it more unobtrusive (Pedersen, 2005:5). It should be pointed out that in the TT corpus of the present study, no
cases of Shifted Direct translation were observed as such. Nevertheless, obligatory shifts required by the differences between SL and TL as language systems (e.g. word order) have been made in the cases of Calque translations. In what follows, the target-oriented strategies in Pedersen’s taxonomy have been discussed and exemplified accordingly.

- **Generalisation**

Generalisation, as the first category of target-oriented strategies, occurs when a specific ECR is replaced by a more general term in TT. This can be done either by replacing the ST ECR by a superordinate term, or by paraphrasing, which is normally longer and less specific than the ST ECR, although the synonymy is preserved (Pedersen, 2011:85).

In the following example, identified in *Hotel Transylvania 2*, Dracula is trying to teach his grandson to turn into a bat as one of the vampire’s capabilities when Dennis, the grandson, starts trying to make some moves to turn into a bat but he seems to be disappointing his grandpa as Dracula utters the following:

**Example (4) (Hotel Transylvania 2)**

ST ECR: What's that? The *electric boogaloo*?  
TT: داری چیه؟ داری می‌پرچمش؟  
Back-translation: What's that? Are you *dancing*?

The subtitler opted for a Generalisation strategy here, replacing the ST ECR ‘electric boogaloo’ with the less specific term ‘dancing’.

Paraphrase on the other hand, occurs when expressing the meaning of the ECR entails rewording the term for the purpose of clarity for the TC audience. An instance of Paraphrase strategy is given below:

---

6 An American street dance as a funk style of hip hop dance.
Example (5) (Zootopia)

ST ECR: He was wearing a Paisley tie, sweet Windsor knot

TT: 

Back-translation: He was wearing a beautiful buta design tie with a big knot

In the above example identified in the film Zootopia, the bunny Officer Hopps is looking for a missing otter, Emmitt Otterton, and asks the yoga instructor who last saw him for a description of his appearance and clothing. As can be seen, the ECR ‘Windsor knot’ has been paraphrased to a ‘big knot’, making it more accessible for the TC viewer.

It needs to be noted that ‘Paisley’ is another ECR identified in the above utterance however the strategy applied in transferring it will be discussed in the relevant category.

- Substitution

This strategy is referred to as ‘replacing culture (with culture)’ (Pedersen, 2011:89), as it involves removing the ST ECR and replacing it with either an ECR which is known to both TC and SC, or an ECR which is only known to the TC. The former is labelled as Transcultural substitution and the latter is referred to as TC ECR substitution in the present model. There is another type of cultural substitution in Pedersen’s taxonomy which is called Situational substitution, where the ST ECR is replaced by something completely different that fits the situation (Pedersen, 2011:95.) In what follows, examples of all subcategories of Substitution strategy are provided.

The first example was identified in the film Frozen. A salesman is trying to sell some summer items at a sale price, as he utters:

---

7 A method of tying a necktie which produces a wide symmetrical triangular knot.
Example (6) (Frozen)

ST ECR: Half off swimming suits, clogs\(^8\), and a sun balm of my own invention.

TT: لباس شنا، سندل و کرم ضد آفتاب اختراع خودم همه نصف قیمت.

Back-translation: Swimwear, sandals\(^8\) and a sun block of my own invention all half prices.

In the Example (6) above, the ECR ‘clogs’ has been substituted with ‘sandals’ as ‘clogs’ is not known to the TC, but ‘sandals’ are known to both SC and TC, i.e. Transcultural ECR. Nevertheless, clogs are different from sandals in that they have closed toes, while sandals are summer footwear designed with open toes to let air circulate around the feet to keep them cool. However, the context of a summer sale justifies the reason for the selection of the word ‘sandals’ as a substitution in the above example.

In the example below, on the other hand, the TT ECR is a term known to the TC viewer only. In other words, the strategy applied here is TC ECR substitution. The example was identified in the film Hotel Transylvania 2, where Dracula is asking one of his employees, called ‘Porridge Head’, if he called a hearse for one of their clients. As can be seen, the word ‘Porridge’\(^9\), a meal known to the SC, has been substituted with ‘Fereni’\(^10\), a traditional Persian dessert, which is only known to the TC audience.

Example (7) (Hotel Transylvania 2)

ST ECR: Now, Porridge Head, did you call a hearse for the Gremlinbergs?

TT: خب، کله فرنتی، واسه خانواده گرمیمرگ، خست که خیر کرد؟

Back-translation: so, Fereni head, did you call a hearse for “Gremlinbergs” family?

The third subcategory of Cultural substitution i.e. Situational substitution is exemplified below.

---

\(^8\) Clogs are a type of footwear made in part or completely from wood with closed toes, and soles that are shaped to fit the feet.

\(^9\) A dish consisting of oatmeal or another meal or cereal boiled in water or milk.

\(^10\) A traditional Persian pudding dessert which is soft, creamy and sweet, made with rice flour, milk, sugar and rosewater.
Example (8) (*Frozen*)

ST ECR: Do you Anna, take Kristoff to be your *trollfully* wedded…?

TT: تَوْ "آنَا"، "كَرِيْسْتَف" رَا بِعْنِوَان هِمْسَر قَانُوُنِي خُوُدِ بِرِمْبِيْزِيْنِي ...؟

Back-translation: Do you “Anna” take “Kristoff” to be your *lawful* spouse…?

The adverb ‘trollfully’ has been coined in the film *Frozen*, as the fictional creatures trolls are a part of the story, and in this particular scene the troll priest is performing the wedding ceremony, uttering the above sentence to Anna and Kristoff. According to Pedersen, ECRs can refer to extralinguistic entities, including fictional ones (Pedersen, 2011:43). Therefore, the term ‘trollfully’ which is derived from the word ‘troll’ has been identified as an ECR in the example above. The term is also a paronym in that it is approximate to truthfully (with the substitution of two sounds in word-initial position). The subtitler has opted for a Situational substitution in this instance as the ST ECR has been substituted with ‘lawful’, a term that fits the situation in the given context, but does not operate as an ECR in the TT.

- Omission

The last category of the target-oriented strategies is Omission, which is also considered “the most target-oriented strategy available as it prevents a problematic ST item from entering the TT in any form at all” (Pedersen 2011:96). This strategy has been considered a valid solution (Toury, 1995:59) in cases where the translator has tried other solutions but in the end opted for omitting the ST term as the only possible option. According to Leppihalme (1994:121), the choice of Omission might be either out of translator’s futile effort in finding the right replacement for the ST term, or out of his/her irresponsibility, not making enough effort to find the right replacement.

An example of Omission strategy would be the translation solutions for the terms ‘Wallaby’ and ‘Didgeridoo’, which were identified as ECRs in the film *Despicable Me 2* when agent
Lucy Wilde is being transferred to Australia and Gru is asking her whether she has made up her mind to go to Australia. She replies:

Example (9) (Despicable Me 2)

ST ECR: Well, it’s not definite yet. I’m still figuring it out. I’ve already been working on my accent. Wallaby\textsuperscript{11}. Didgeridoo\textsuperscript{12}.

TT: نیست قطعی نیست هنوز دارم روش فکر میکنم از همین الان دارم روی لهجه گام کار میکنم.

Back-translation: Well, it’s not definite yet. I’m still thinking about it. I’ve already been working on my accent. Ø. Ø.

As can be seen above, the ECRs ‘Wallaby’ and ‘Didgeridoo’ have been omitted in the translation. According to Mollanazar and Nasrollahi (2017), the subtitler might omit a segment which carries the less important information (due to spatio-temporal constraints), for the sake of the segment which is of high verbal content. The two ST ECRs in this example, in fact, do not carry important information and are uttered by the character only as a practice for the Australian accent. On the other hand, the subtitler might have failed in finding an appropriate substitution for the ST ECR in the given example. Nevertheless, as mentioned earlier, Omission is accepted as a valid translation strategy in the process of subtitling.

- **Official equivalent**

The last strategy in the present model is Official equivalent, which, according to Pedersen (2011), is neither a source-oriented nor target-oriented strategy and only happens when some sort of official decision is made by the people in authority to replace the ST term with its Official equivalent. A good example to illustrate this strategy would be conversion of measurements, as exemplified below.

\textsuperscript{11} A type of pouched mammal found in Australia that belongs to the same taxonomic family as kangaroos.

\textsuperscript{12} The didgeridoo is a wind instrument made from hollow wood, developed by Indigenous Australians of northern Australia within the last 1,500 years and still in use today.
Example (10) (Zootopia)

ST ECR: Sir, you were going **115 miles** per hour, I hope you have a good explanation.

TT: جناب، شما سرعت داشتید امیدوارم توضیح مناسبی داشته باشید

Back-translation: Sir, you were going at **185 km**. I hope you have a good explanation.

In the above example, the ECR ‘115 miles’ has been converted to ‘185 km’ as the metric system is the official measurement system in the TC. It can be argued that Official equivalent, in essence, functions as a target-oriented strategy in that the ECRs are adapted to the target language and culture. “If a SC ECR is always rendered in a particular way in the TC, an official equivalent has been established through entrenchment” (Pedersen, 2007:36). Some of the TTs fall into a grey area between Cultural substitution and Official equivalent, since according to Pedersen, “a common source for an official equivalent is a cultural substitute from the TC” […], therefore, “there is a strong link between cultural substitution and the use of an official equivalent” (ibid.:37-38).

The examples above clearly clarify the decision-making process and the rationale behind the classification of the TTs in the present study based on Pedersen’s taxonomy. However, as mentioned before, Pedersen’s taxonomy did not cover all the strategies applied by the subtitlers in the given context. Therefore, some strategies have been added to his model, developing an adapted model which covered all the strategies observed in the TT corpus. The following section delineates the adapted model by providing examples for the (new) strategies that were not discussed in section 3.4.1.

### 3.4.2 The Adapted Model and its Pertaining Strategies

It was discussed earlier (section 2.2.3) that Pedersen’s taxonomy is designed to analyse the translations produced by Scandinavian professional subtitlers making subtitles for American TV programmes. However, the present study aims at analysing the subtitles produced by
Iranian unofficial subtitlers for American animation films distributed illegally. In addition to this, the present study is carried out in a different language pair, which may affect the behaviour of the subtitlers in question as they may behave less predictably, using language resources which do not necessarily bear similarities to formal or functional features of the English-Danish/Swedish language direction. Therefore, in the analysis process, several strategies were applied by the selected Iranian subtitlers that Pedersen’s taxonomy does not cover. As a result, a number of categories were added to his model in order to make a more systematic analysis and as a way to adapt Pedersen’s typology to the purpose of the present study. In effect, five strategies have been added to Pedersen’s model, namely: Transliteration, Transliteration+Specification, Transliteration+Calque, Creative rendition, and Meaning shift. The adapted model is illustrated in Figure 3.1 below.

Figure 3.1 Adapted model from Pedersen’s (2011) taxonomy of ECR transfer strategies

In what follows, the reason for including the aforementioned strategies is explained in detail.
• **Transliteration**

Including the strategy of Transliteration within the present model was based on the following grounds. According to Pedersen (2011), Retention, as the most source-oriented strategy, is when the translator retains the ST ECR unchanged in the subtitle or slightly adapted to meet TL requirements (Pedersen 2011:76). Examples of this case can be proper nouns such as place names, or the names of institutions, a brand, a person and so on. This strategy, however, cannot be applied when the language pair does not share the same alphabets. In other words, Retention, as presented in Pedersen’s taxonomy, can only be applied when the language pair is Latin-script-based as is the case with English and Danish, i.e. both languages use Latin alphabets and could be matched letter-for-letter and, therefore, readers expect to see foreign words and are able to comfortably read English at great speed as they stand. On the other hand, since Persian is not a Latin-script language, retaining the ECR unchanged when rendering from English into Persian is not possible. In cases where the ST ECR needs to be kept, subtitlers opted for the strategy of Transliteration, which, according to Catford (1965:66), is a process in which “SL graphological units are replaced by TL graphological units”. That is to say, transferring ST into TT using target language characters while keeping ST pronunciation as similar as possible (and if there is no equivalent sound, then the closest possible match is found).

As an example; keeping the word *Batmobile* (the fictional car driven by the superhero Batman) in the TT (Persian) as موبیل بت [moβi/ˈbætmobiːl/ with a very close pronunciation of the word in English.

Having in mind the above-mentioned point, no cases of Retention were observed throughout the analysis of the entire corpus. Instead, a high number of Transliteration cases were identified, an example of which is illustrated below:
Example (11) (*Despicable Me 2*)

ST ECR: I too have spent many nights trying to drown my sorrows in *guacamole*

TT: منم شب های زیادی رو سعی کردم که غم‌هایم توسط گو آکاموله غرق کنم

Back-translation: I too have spent many nights trying to drown my sorrows in */goakamole*/

The above ECR instance was identified in the film *Despicable Me 2*. In the example above, the character Gru is upset, dipping crackers in guacamole when his supposed friend, Eduardo Pérez, is asking him the reason of his grief. Gru, however, pretends to be fine and enjoying his guacamole when Eduardo utters: “I too have spent many nights trying to drown my sorrows in guacamole”.

As can be seen in the example, the ST ECR, guacamole, has been transliterated into the target language, keeping the pronunciation as close as possible to the ST. Therefore, the TC viewer reads the word very similarly to the way it is read in English. However, according to Catford (1965:67-68), the process of Transliteration can be complicated due to the presence of three theoretical problems. Firstly, there might be more than one phonological equivalent for an ST letter. Secondly, there is not in all cases a one-to-one equivalence between SL and TL phonological units. Thirdly, there are cases that arbitrary choices need to be made between more than one TL letter that can represent a TL phonological unit.

With regard to the first theoretical complication mentioned by Catford, an example in this language pair (English-Persian) would be the sound */θ/ that does not exist in Persian therefore, in transliteration from English into Persian, this sound is replaced by either */t/ (in cases that the word starts with */th/) or */s/ (in cases that the word ends with */th/). An example for the former would be the word *thyme* (the herb) transliterated as */tʌym/ and the word *Booth* as an example for the latter which will be transliterated as */bu:s/ into Persian.

---

13 A popular Mexican avocado-based dip.
Regarding the second theoretical complication mentioned above, i.e. when a one-to-one equivalence between SL and TL phonological units does not exist, the local adaptation of sound might result. In other words, if a given language does not have a particular sound, then the translators use the option that the speech community feels is the closest equivalent. As a case in point, Persian language does not have a /w/ sound as pronounced in /ˈwiːzəl/, therefore this sound is replaced by /v/ as the sound closest to /w/, so the word is pronounced as /ˈviːzəl/ in Persian.

It could in fact be argued that, although Transliteration is considered a source-oriented solution, it can be adjusted to suit the TT characteristics, therefore, to some degree it functions as a target-oriented transfer strategy. In what follows, the combined strategies emerging from Transliteration are outlined and discussed in detail.

- **Transliteration+Specification**

In the process of classification of the TTs, the Transliteration strategy was not always observed as a single, stand-alone category throughout the corpus, as there were cases where Transliteration was combined with other strategies in Pedersen’s taxonomy, such as Completion, Addition and Calque. However, as mentioned earlier, since there is a very fine line between the definitions of these strategies in Pedersen’s taxonomy, deciding into which categories the TTs fall has been rather complicated and time-consuming in many cases. For instance, some cases of TT tend to straddle the line between Completion and Addition, as they both add information to the ST ECR to make it more accessible for the TT audience. It could be argued that both categories (Transliteration+Completion/Addition) function as both source and target-oriented, in that they keep the ST in its untranslated form, i.e. Transliteration (source-oriented) yet providing more information to make it more accessible for the TT viewer (target-oriented). The final outcome, however, will not dramatically change
the way the subtitlers’ intervention is seen in such instances, on the basis of how they treat these items.

Some examples of these cases are given in Table 3.3 below to illustrate the above discussion:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST ECR</th>
<th>TT ECR</th>
<th>Back-translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Krumping</td>
<td>رقص كرامبينگ</td>
<td>/krampi:ng/dance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limbo</td>
<td>بازي ليمبو</td>
<td>/li:mbo/ game</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cannoli</td>
<td>شيريني كاتولي</td>
<td>/kanoli:/ pastry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kumbaya</td>
<td>كومبايا (اينگي در سال 1920)</td>
<td>/kumbəyə/ (a song in 1920)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cribbage</td>
<td>كريبج (یک نوع بازی با ورق)</td>
<td>/kribej/ (a type of card game)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3.3 Examples of Transliteration+ Addition/Completion

As can be seen in the examples above, the ST ECRs have been kept in their untranslated form, in fact transliterated, and some information is added to make the ECR accessible for the TT viewer. As Pedersen (2011:79-80) puts it, Addition is based either on meronymy, polysemy, or hyponymy, and Completion happens when some information is added to spell out the latent meaning in the ST ECR. In rendering some of the above ECRs, the linguistic process of hyponymy is involved, i.e. *Krumping* as a hyponym for dancing, *Limbo* as a hyponym for game, and *Cannoli* as a hyponym for pastry. Nevertheless, the added information (dance, game, and pastry) spells out the latent connotation of the ST ECR and, therefore, can also be categorised as Completion.

Correspondingly, in other cases the explanation for the ST ECR has been provided in TT (in brackets), while keeping the ECR in its untranslated form, making the ST ECR less specific and giving the TT viewer the full version of the term by spelling out the latent connotation in the ST ECR. Therefore, differentiating between the two categories (Completion/Addition) was not always an easy task as the categories would overlap. Consequently, the combined category of Transliteration+Specification, encompassing both Addition and Completion, has
been added to the present model, to resolve the ambiguity arisen from differentiating between the two subcategories of Specification.

- **Transliteration+Calque**

As mentioned above, another category that was observed while analysing the data, was that of Transliteration+Calque, where the ST ECR was transliterated and also a word-for-word translation of the ECR was provided in TT. The following example illustrates this category.

Example (12) (*Hotel Transylvania 2*)

ST ECR: Maybe you should just get *Bluetooth*

TT: شاید بهتر باشه با پلوتوس (دندون آبی) کار کنی

Back-translation: Maybe you’d better work with */bluːtuːs/ (dændon aibi:)

In the example above, identified in *Hotel Transylvania 2*, the character Johnny, Dracula’s son-in-law, is trying to teach him how to send a message using a mobile phone. At one point he gets frustrated teaching him and suggests it might be better if he gets Bluetooth on his phone. As can be seen above, the translator opted for Transliteration [بلوتوس] */bluːtuːs/; however, a word-for-word translation, i.e. (dændon = tooth aibi: = blue), is also provided in the brackets right after the Transliteration. It can also be observed that the sound /θ/ in */bluːtuːθ/ has been replaced by /s/ in transliterating into the TT for the reasons mentioned earlier. Two other strategies that were added to Pedersen’s model as mentioned above, i.e. Creative rendition and Meaning shift, are discussed in what follows.

- **Creative rendition**

Creativity, as one of the prominent features of the genre under investigation, was observed in a number of renditions throughout the corpus. In these cases, not only did the translator substitute the ST ECR with a term known to the TC viewer, but also tried to be as creative as possible in the process of rendition. In fact, as mentioned above, due to its general playfulness and humour (which are challenges to creatively tackle), animation leaves ample
room for observing creativity in the subtitling solutions. One of the instances where the element of creativity was observed is discussed in Example (13) below:

Example (13) (Hotel Transylvania 2)

ST ECR: You’d rather be listening to those putrid new songs? What happened to

Michael Row Your Corpse Ashore? Or Old McWerewolf Had an Axe?

TT: ترجيح ميدي به اون شعراي دريبت گوش كني؟ چه بلایي سر شعر "صد دانه جسد دسته به دسته" او؟ "اومد؟ یا" یه کنر دارم تيز تئيزه؟ 

Back-translation: Do you prefer listening to those rubbish poems? What happened to

“a hundred corpses in groups” or “I have an axe which is so sharp”? 

In the example above, the ST ECRs i.e. Michael Row Your Corpse Ashore and Old McWerewolf Had an Axe are both creative versions of the original songs Michael Row the Boat Ashore14 and Old MacDonald Had a Farm15 that have been altered to suit the vampire story plot.

At first glance, the translation of theses ECRs might be characterised as Cultural Substitution as both songs have been substituted with target culture children’s songs. Nevertheless, the translator opted for a creative rendition, changing the words of the original songs to contextualise the meaning and the rhyme with the vampire theme. In other words, the original songs for the renditions are respectively "A Hundred Rubies in Groups"16 and "I have a ball which is so round"17. Both songs have been altered in a very creative way which not only

---

14 "Michael Row the Boat Ashore" is an old American folk song that belongs to the slave era. It was sung through the years and, most notably, became a popular anthem during the civil rights movement (Epstein, 2003).

15 "Old MacDonald Had a Farm" is a classic nursery rhyme with deep roots in American history about a farmer named MacDonald and the various animals he keeps on his farm.

16 "A Hundred Rubies in Groups"[صد دانه پاقوت دسته به دسته] is a poem that children are taught in primary school. The poem describes the beauty and order in which the pomegranate seeds are set. It has been written by Mostafa Rahmandoost, a famous Persian children’s poet.

17 "I have a ball which is so round"[یه توب دارم تئيزه] is a nursery rhyme. A kid describing a ball that he received as a prize from his dad for doing well at school.
accommodates the vampire theme, but also is more accessible for the TC viewer as they can connect with the renditions in the first instance.

- **Meaning shift**

In the process of analysis, some translations were observed where the translator had changed the meaning of the ST ECR, as the TT did not convey/refer to the intended meaning of the ST. As mentioned earlier, it was initially planned to conduct interviews with the selected subtitlers in order to delve into the decision-making process of translation, which would have facilitated the identification of reasons for the subtitlers’ choices in some cases that were difficult to classify. Nevertheless, making a shift in the meaning of the ST can stem from several reasons, including the translator’s intention to increase the fluency in the TT by making the ST more accessible for the TT reader/viewer, the translator’s miscomprehension of the term due to not having adequate knowledge of the SC and so on. In the same vein, Katan (2004) states, the ST message can be distorted in a number of ways in communication. “First, languages differ in how their lexicogrammars show what is thematic, what is in focus and what is emphasized” (ibid.:188). He further states, distortion or shift can be used to intensify the contextual effects in the target culture. These out-of-awareness/conscious shifts need to be understood and used as a part of translation process whether ‘devious’ or not (Katan, 2004).

Nevertheless, regardless of the reason behind the ‘Meaning shift’ (whether intentional or unintentional), this category was added to the analytical taxonomy used in the study. In fact, the researcher tried to get into the mindset of the subtitler to see what shift or modification was involved in the translation process. Example (14) below, will shed light on the above discussion:
Example (14) (Frozen)

ST ECR: They don't call me the “Little Dipper” for nothing!

TT: الاكی به من دب اصغر نمیگن

Back-translation: They don't call me constellation for nothing

The above example was identified in Frozen. Little Dipper in fact is a North American term for a constellation in the Northern Sky which is also known as The Little Bear. However, in the context of this animation, it refers to the bird Dipper\(^\text{18}\), as the character the Duke of Weselton, in an agile and astute manner, utters the following sentence: “They don’t call me the Little Dipper for nothing! Like a chicken with the face of a monkey, I fly!”

He utters this as he is confidently dancing with Princess Anna, boasting about his dance moves. This suggests that the meaning of the ST ECR Little Dipper in this context is the nimble bird Dipper. Therefore, translating the term as “constellation” would be a shift in the meaning which does not convey the intended ST message. It should be noted that the translation of “constellation” as shown in the above example, i.e. [اصغر دب], is itself Arabic, which can be translated into Persian as “little bear”, though the Arabic translation for this term has been established and standardised in the target language therefore, the literal translation (little bear) would sound odd to the TC viewer.

More examples of the added categories, i.e. Transliteration, Transliteration+Specification, Transliteration+Calque, Creative rendition, and Meaning shift, will be given and discussed further in the Data Analysis Chapter. The following section describes the procedure followed in collecting, preparing and analysing the data in the present project.

3.5 Procedure for Data Collection and Analysis

As far as the data collection is concerned, the animation films were publicly available and the existing Persian subtitles produced by the three selected subtitlers were collected from the

\(18\) The Dipper is a short-tailed bird from the genus *Cinclus* in the bird family *Cinclidae*. It is remarkable for its ability to dive and swim underwater in search of food (Whistler, 2007).
website subscene.com, where subtitles are available in downloadable SRT format. It needs to be mentioned that the subtitles for all five selected films produced by subtitler A were available, as subtitler A has produced the highest number of subtitles among the three. Subtitlers B and C however, have produced subtitles for three of the five selected movies each. Table 3.4 below clearly illustrates the aforementioned point.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Film Title</th>
<th>Existing subtitles by each subtitler</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frozen</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Despicable Me 2</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotel Transylvania 2</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inside Out</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zootopia</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3.4 Existing subtitles for each film by subtitlers

As can be seen in Table 3.4, the only film for which all three subtitles were available was Frozen, which has gained remarkable popularity worldwide and is ranked among the highest-grossing 2013 films according to IMDb. In the same way, this animated film gained significant popularity among Iranian audiences. It might be for this reason that among all five selected films for this project, Frozen was the only animation for which three subtitled versions done by the selected subtitlers were available.

As for other subtitles available for the selected films, the existing subtitles by subtitler B were available for the films Despicable Me 2 and Inside Out and the subtitles by subtitler C were available for Hotel Transylvania 2 and Zootopia. That is to say, a total number of 11 existing sets of subtitles for the five selected films comprise the corpus for the present project.

As mentioned earlier, the subtitle for each film was downloaded in SRT format from subscene.com and then was dragged onto the film, which was then played by Media Player Classic Home Cinema (MPC-HC) software, to be closely analysed. This process was carried
out for each film, with their existing subtitles by each subtitler. The following data collection and analysis procedure was devised and applied to each film:

**Step 1:** The whole film was initially watched, in order for the researcher to familiarise herself with the story.

**Step 2:** The ECRs were then identified in the film during a second round of watching. Labelled as Source Text (ST), they were transferred to an Excel spreadsheet in the order they appeared in the film. The spreadsheet was later used to record the results of the analysis (Table 3.5 below).

| ST (Source Text) | TT (Target Text) | BT (Back-translation) | Source-oriented | Transliteration | Transliteration + Specification | Calque | Transliteration + Calque | Shifted | Target-oriented | Generalisation | Supercodinate term | Paraphrase | Substitution | Cultural | Transcultural ECR | TC ECR | Situational | Omission | Creative rendition | Meaning shift | Official equivalent |
|------------------|------------------|-----------------------|-----------------|-----------------|-------------------------------|-------|---------------------------|---------|-----------------|----------------|-------------------|------------|--------------|---------|-----------------|-------|-----------------|-----------|------------------|

Table 3.5 Data analysis grid based on an adaptation of Pedersen’s (2011) taxonomy

For contextualisation purposes, the identified ECRs were recorded together with the essential co-text surrounding them. Nevertheless, the unit of analysis in each case was in fact an ECR. The approach to selecting the length of the text around an ECR was to choose the whole utterance that contained the identified ECR. The utterances were normally a sentence/statement/comment or a very short dialogue. The same approach was applied to the corresponding TT, starting and ending at the same points as in the selected ST utterance.

It should be pointed out that there were cases where an utterance contained more than one ECR. Therefore, the same utterance was transferred to the analysis table according to the
number of ECRs in the utterance, each time marking one ECR to be analysed. An example of this case is shown below:

ST: He was wearing a green *cable knit sweater vest* and a new pair of *Corduroy slacks* and a *Paisley* tie, sweet *Windsor knot*.

(*Zootopia*)

The above example, taken from *Zootopia*, contains four ECRs (marked in bold and italics). Therefore, this utterance was transferred to the analysis table four times, each time marking only one ECR to be analysed.

**Step 3:** The translations of the ECRs were then identified in the subtitled versions (as explained above) and were transferred to the analysis table in the Target Text (TT) column. A back-translation (BT) was then provided for each TT. The complete data analysis tables (the Excel spreadsheets) are provided in Appendix A, which include all source-text ECR instances accompanied by the relating translations, and back-translations as well as translation categories chosen and marked for each ECR term. For the purpose of transparency, in the spreadsheets, each subtitler’s work has been shown in a specific colour (i.e. subtitler A: black, subtitler B: purple, subtitler C: brown).

**Step 4:** The subtitling solutions were then classified using a data analysis grid as illustrated in Table 3.5 above, which was in fact based on the adapted model (Figure 3.1) that was developed from Pedersen’s (2011) taxonomy to suit the purpose of the present study. All three levels of Pedersen’s taxonomy, as shown in Table 3.5 above, were taken into account, i.e. source-text oriented and target-text oriented strategies, with all relating categories and subcategories, and also Official equivalent at the end of the table standing on its own as this category belongs to neither source nor target-oriented strategies. For the purpose of clarity, the main groups (source and target-oriented) are marked in orange, the added categories are marked in purple, the main categories in green, and their relating subcategories in white. In
cases of cultural substitution (as a subcategory of Substitution), the subcategories it entails (i.e. Transcultural ECR, and TC ECR) are marked in grey.

The translation of each identified ECR was observed closely in order to decide which strategy was applied, according to the adapted model. In order to do so, the researcher first decided whether the rendition provided for each ECR was source-oriented or target-oriented, trying to be as consistent as possible in treating the identified ECRs in terms of source-oriented or target-oriented strategies and in choosing the relating subcategories each TT ECR fell under.

After categorising the translations of the identified ECRs for each film, the frequency of application for each strategy was then calculated and captured in Excel, in order to be used in the quantitative analyses. The quantitative analyses were conducted per film and per subtitler, and they were then aggregated accordingly, which will be discussed in detail in the next chapter.
Chapter 4

Data Analysis

This chapter corresponds to the data analysis of the present project, which was briefly outlined in the Methodology Chapter. The focus of the present chapter lies on the analysis description of the identified instances of ECRs in the corpus and the corresponding translation solutions adopted by the subtitlers. This procedure was carried out to observe whether there are certain patterns and tendencies demonstrated by the selected unofficial subtitlers in opting for translation solutions for the instances of ECRs identified in the selected animated feature films. The chapter is divided into two main sections, namely: Analysis by Film (Section 4.1) and Analysis by Subtitler (Section 4.2). Each section subsequently contains subcategories pertaining to each film and each subtitler. In other words, an overview of the qualitative and qualitative analysis of the data relating to each film is provided in Section 4.1, which ends with a conclusion of the film analysis. In Section 4.2, the same analysis associated with each subtitler’s work has been dealt with, followed by concluding remarks regarding the analysis.

4.1 Analysis by Film

4.1.1 Analysis of the Animated Feature Film Frozen

Frozen, directed by Jennifer Lee and Chris Buck, is a 2013 American 3D computer-animated musical fantasy film produced by Walt Disney Animation Studios and released by Walt Disney Pictures. According to the Internet Movie Database (IMDb), the story underwent changes over several years. The film was originally developed as an adaptation of the story “The Snow Queen” by Hans Christian Andersen. It was first written by Jennifer Lee in 2011 but, later on, it was modified in certain parts and additional stories were created by Chris Buck. Frozen has become more than a film, as it created a whole trademark and a company featuring costumes, games, accessories, decorative objects, etc. The film has gained
remarkable popularity worldwide and is ranked among the highest-grossing films of 2013, according to IMDb.

In order to identify the ECRs according to Pedersen’s (2007:30) definition of the term, i.e. “expressions that refer to entities outside language, such as names of people, places, institutions, food, customs etc., which a person may not know, even if s/he knows the language in question”, the instances were identified by closely watching the film several times.

Nevertheless, due to the lower level of specificity in the plot of this film, as a fairy tale, the number of ECRs identified throughout the film was the lowest (i.e. 16) of the five animations selected for the study. It should be pointed out that identifying the instances of ECRs and categorising the relevant TTs throughout the corpus of the present study relied heavily on the researcher’s interpretation of Pedersen’s (2007 and 2011) definition of the term, and the strategies in his proposed taxonomy of ECR transfer strategies. Therefore, the analysis of the data was a tentative attempt as there were some difficult demarcation issues regarding the classification of the TTs and many cases of ECR renderings end up in grey areas between two strategies. Nonetheless, the researcher tried to be as consistent as possible in treating the ECRs and the classification of the TTs accordingly.

After identifying the ECRs in the film and transferring them (along with the relevant co-texts) to the Excel sheet, as previously explained in Chapter 3.5, the relevant translations for the ECRs (by three subtitlers) were also transferred to the Excel sheet. A back translation was then provided for each TT accordingly. The translation solutions for the ECRs were identified in line with the analytical framework of the study, i.e. Pedersen’s taxonomy of ECR transfer strategies (see Table 3.5). To be more specific, the analysis was made based on an adapted model from Pedersen’s (2011) taxonomy of ECR transfer strategies discussed earlier in Chapter 3 (Figure 3.1). The three versions of subtitles were then compared. The comparison
was made with regard to commonalities and differences in terms of subtitlers’ translation choices in translating the same identified instances of ECRs. It should be pointed out that, since the number of instances was 16, there were 48 translations of the instances, produced by the three selected subtitlers, to be analysed \((16 \times 3 = 48)\). The analysis of the distribution and frequency of the strategies applied by the three subtitlers is outlined as follows.

Of the 48 translations of the identified ECRs, 14 were classified as source-oriented, 30 as target-oriented, and 4 Official equivalent cases were observed.

The absolute and relative frequency (absolute values and percentage) of the total source-oriented and target-oriented strategies applied by the three subtitlers in translating ECRs in the film *Frozen* is illustrated in Figures 4.1 and 4.2 below.

![Figure 4.1 Total source and target-oriented strategies – absolute frequency – Frozen (total n: 44)](image1.png)

![Figure 4.2 Total source and target-oriented strategies – relative frequency – Frozen](image2.png)
In order to look into each category closely, the main categories, i.e. source-oriented and
target-oriented, have been analysed in detail.

As explained above and in Chapter 3 (section 3.5), the taxonomy used in the present study has
been developed as an adapted model from Pedersen’s (2011) taxonomy of ECR transfer
strategies. In the present model (see Figure 3.1), the source-oriented strategies comprise the
subcategories of Transliteration, Transliteration+Specification, Calque, Transliteration+
Calque, and Shifted Direct translation.

The absolute and relative frequency of source-oriented strategies used by all three subtitlers
in the film *Frozen* has been shown in Figures 4.3 and 4.4 below. It needs to be mentioned
that the strategies selected for each translation (as shown in the bar charts below) are in fact
subcategories of the main categories. In other words, the main categories (i.e. Direct
translation, Generalisation, and Substitution) have been omitted in bar and pie charts, to avoid
ambiguity in the process of data analysis. The only main category that has been kept in the
charts is Omission, as it stands on its own in Pedersen’s taxonomy and entails no
subcategories (see Figure 2.1 Chapter 2). Other than the strategies in Pedersen’s taxonomy,
the five categories that have been added in the adapted model, i.e. Transliteration,
Transliteration+Specification, Transliteration+Calque, Creative rendition, and Meaning shift,
have also been kept as they are, since they are not divided into subcategories (see Figure 3.1
Chapter 3).

---

19 For the purpose of comparability and transparency, as the figures and relations differ in each film, relative
distribution and absolute frequency are illustrated in both visualisations, i.e. pie chart and bar chart.
As can be seen in the figures above, among the source-oriented strategies the most frequently used strategy was Transliteration, with 43% of occurrence, followed by Transliteration+Specification and Calque, occurring 29% and 21% respectively, and finally, Transliteration+Calque, as the least frequently used strategy, with 7% of occurrence in this group. No cases of Shifted direct translations were observed. It could be argued that, among source-oriented strategies, subtitlers have frequently opted for Transliteration in rendering ST ECRs which, as a replacement for Retention in the present model, can be considered the most source-oriented strategy, as it allows an element from the SC to enter the TC. Nevertheless, Transliteration involves the process of replacing the SL characters with the TL characters and producing the closest pronunciation to the ST, which might also entail some phonological
adjustments to the ST to be replaced with the closest equivalent sound in the target language. Therefore, while being considered as a source-oriented strategy, Transliteration, to some extent can operate as a less source-oriented strategy than the wholesale introduction of an item in English characters. This may be possible in other genres (e.g. science and documentaries) but in films, targeting a mixed audience, some adjustments are required to be made. An example of this strategy observed in the film Frozen is provided in Table 4.1 below. In order for the ECRs to be distinguishable from the rest of the utterance/co-text, they have been marked in italics in the tables throughout the chapter. The TTs (i.e. subtitles) are presented in the tables as they appear on the screen in the relating scenes/frames.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hang in there Joan</td>
<td>مایوس نشو، &quot;جوآن&quot;</td>
<td>don't lose your hope &quot;/dʒəʊən/&quot;</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Transliteration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&quot;زان&quot;، طاقت بیار (اشاره به نامListener داک و اینه اوزن شدست)</td>
<td>&quot;/dʒəʊən/&quot;stay tolerant (referring to /dʒəʊən dərk/ picture which is hung)</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Transliteration +Specification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>قوی باش، جان</td>
<td>be strong /dʒəʊ/</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Transliteration</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.1 Example of Transliteration strategy in Frozen

In the example above identified in Frozen, the character Anna, while singing points to the picture of Joan of Arc on the wall and utters hang in there Joan. The ECR Joan, has been transliterated by all three subtitlers as can be observed in Table 4.1 above. However, subtitler B has also provided an explanation for the ST ECR in brackets to make it more coherent for the TT viewer, hence falling under the combined category of Transliteration+Specification.

---

20 Joan of Arc is considered a heroine of France for her role during the Lancastrian phase of the Hundred Years’ War, and was canonised as a Roman Catholic saint.
This helps anchor the message of the visuals and offers semiotic cohesion, as language and image are fully aligned (Díaz Cintas and Remael, 2007:51). Arguably, this can also have a pedagogic/mnemonic function for the target viewer, provided that the exposure time on the screen is enough for an average viewer to read the explanation. According to Díaz Cintas and Remael (2007:97), “a one-liner of some 7 or 8 words should not stay on screen more than 3 seconds, and a two-liner containing between 14 and 16 words ought to remain on screen a maximum of 6 seconds”. There is an exception to this rule when it comes to the subtitling of songs, in which case, if the rhythm requires, the subtitle can stay on screen beyond the 6 seconds (ibid.). Therefore, if the two-liner subtitle stays on the screen long enough for the viewer to read, the combined strategy of Transliteration+Specification is an apt strategy. In the above example, however, the exposure time for the two-liner subtitle (65 characters) is less than 2 seconds (based on the time codes in the relevant SRT file), which is indeed very fast. Therefore, the subtitle does not stay long enough on the screen for the viewer to read and, as a result, is not a suitable strategy in this specific example.

Another point that can be noticed in the TTs above could be the different ways subtitlers have transliterated the ECR Joan, i.e. (/dʒʌn/, /ʒʌn/, and /ʤʌn/). The first Transliteration (/dʒʌn/) is the closest to the ST pronunciation, while the second (/ʒʌn/) is the closest to the French pronunciation of the ECR, and the last (/dʒʌn/), would be the right transliteration for John/Jon but not for Joan.
With regard to the strategy of Calque, as the third frequently used source-oriented strategy observed in TTs relating to *Frozen*, an example is provided in table 4.2 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Prince Hans of the <em>Southern Isles</em></td>
<td>شاهزاده &quot;هانس&quot; از جزایر جنوبی</td>
<td>Prince &quot;Hans&quot; of <em>southern isles</em></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Calque</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>شاهزاده &quot;هانس&quot; از جزایر جنوبی هستم</td>
<td>I'm Prince &quot;Hans&quot; of <em>southern isles</em></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Calque</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>شاهزاده هانس هستم از جزایر جنوبی</td>
<td>I'm Prince Hans of <em>southern isles</em></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Calque</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.2 Example of Calque in *Frozen*

The ST ECR in the above example, i.e. *Southern Isles*, is suggested to be located somewhere near or within the region of Denmark in the Scandinavian setting of *Frozen*. Although this ECR refers to the name of a place, all three subtitlers have opted for a word-for-word translation rather than Transliteration. It can be argued that, in this particular case, providing
a word-for-word translation (lexical calque as a form of direct translation as discussed in chapter 3, Example 3) for the ECR will make it more coherent and semantically transparent for the TT viewer, whereas transliterating the term would cause ambiguity for the TT viewers with no background knowledge in English.

In what follows, the absolute and relative frequency of total target-oriented strategies observed in *Frozen* is shown (Figures 4.5 and 4.6).

![Figure 4.5 Total target-oriented strategies – absolute frequency – Frozen (total n: 30)](image)

![Figure 4.6 Total target-oriented strategies – relative frequency – Frozen](image)

Among all target-oriented strategies, Paraphrase is the most frequently used strategy, occurring 50%, followed by Transcultural substitution (14%), Meaning shift and Situational substitution with the same occurrence (13%), and replacing an ECR with a Superordinate term...
term occurred at the frequency of (10%). No cases of TC ECR substitution, Omission, or Creative rendition were observed in this group (these categories therefore do not appear in the pie chart above).

Paraphrase, according to Pedersen (2011:85), happens “when the ST ECR is replaced by a phrase which is generally longer, but more or less synonymic, apart from being less specific”. This strategy could happen in two ways; the translator rephrases the cultural elements either by removing the ECR but keeping its sense (sense transfer) or by completely removing the ECR and its sense and replacing it with something that fits the given situation (situational paraphrase) (Pedersen, 2005:8-9). It should be pointed out that all the instances of paraphrase observed in translating the ECRs in this film fall under the first group, i.e. paraphrasing with sense transfer. This could suggest that the subtitlers have tried to convey the same connotation of ST ECR yet had no option but to rephrase it to make it more accessible for the TT viewer. The example below is a particular case in point.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I will add a quart of <em>lutefisk</em></td>
<td>میکنم اضافه خشک ھم ماهی،</td>
<td>I will also add a dish of <em>dried fish</em></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>میکنم سفید ھم ماهی خشک</td>
<td>I will give this bottle of <em>dried fish</em> for free</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>یه ظرف ماهی خشک کم کیلو روش</td>
<td>I will also add a quarter of kilo of <em>white fish</em></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.3 Example of Paraphrase in *Frozen*

---

21 *Lutefisk* is a traditional Norwegian dish. It has a gelatinous texture, and is made from aged stockfish (air-dried) or dried/salted whitefish and lye (flavorverse.com).
As can be seen, the ST ECR, *Lutefisk*, has been rephrased into dried or white fish, which is in fact what *Lutefisk* is made of, therefore removing the ST ECR but transferring its sense to the TT, making it more accessible for the TC viewer.

Transcultural ECR, as the second most frequently used strategy in target-oriented strategies observed in *Frozen*, is referred to as “an ECR which is not bound to the Source Culture, but which should be retrievable from common encyclopedic knowledge of the ST and the TT audiences, as it could be assumed to be known in both the SC and the TC” (Pedersen, 2005:10). An example of this strategy is given below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>we'll have soup, <em>roast</em> and ice cream</td>
<td>باشیم داشته، کباب و بستنی باشیم</td>
<td>we should have soup, <em>kebab</em>, and ice cream</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Transcultural ECR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>الیتیه که سوپ، کباب و بستنی سرو می‌کنیم</td>
<td>we will definitely serve soup, <em>kebab</em> and ice cream</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Transcultural ECR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>مطمئناً سوپ و گوشت کبابی بستنی هم سرو می‌کنیم</td>
<td>we will surely serve soup and <em>kebab</em> meat and ice cream</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Transcultural ECR</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.4 Example of Transcultural ECR in *Frozen*

In the above example, the ST ECR *roast* has been replaced with *kebab*, which is known to both SC and TC; in other words, *roast* might not be familiar to a high number of TC viewers, therefore replacing it with *kebab* will make the context more coherent to the TC audience.

Regarding Meaning shift strategy, which, as mentioned earlier, was added to Pedersen’s taxonomy in the present adapted model, there is a shift of connotation in the TT which might stem from various reasons such as: the translator’s lack of knowledge of the ST ECR or, as Katan (2004:188) puts it, a conscious shift. There were several cases where this strategy was
observed throughout the corpus analysis in the present study. An example observed in *Frozen* is provided below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>we totally lost marshmallow back there</td>
<td>گلی گل ختمی اون پشت از گلمون رفت</td>
<td>we lost a lot of /gol-e-khætmi:/ back there</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Meaning shift</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>گوله برفی رو اونجا گم کردم</td>
<td>we lost the <em>snow ball</em> there</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Situational substitution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>اون ذليلشده گلمون  کرد</td>
<td>that <em>abject</em> lost us</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Meaning shift</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.5 Example of Meaning shift in *Frozen*

In the above example, a snow monster (as shown in Image 4.2) is chasing Anna, Kristoff, and Olaf, the character of a funny snowman. At some point, Olaf thinks they have managed to get rid of the snow monster and utters: “we totally lost marshmallow back there”. By marshmallow he obviously refers to the snow monster, as it looks like marshmallow, the soft sweet made of sugar, water, and gelatine. However, the word marshmallow also refers to a
type of plant (scientific name: *Althaea officinalis*) which grows in marshes and other damp areas (Image 4.3 below). The plant is called /ختمی/ (/khætmi:/) in Persian. The first TT in the Table 4.5 above (/gol-e-khætmi:/) refers to the marshmallow plant (/gol/ = flower / khætmi:/ marshmallow). Therefore, the strategy used to render the ST ECR here falls under Meaning shift category, as it does not refer to the same ECR and the connotation is lost in the TT.

![Image 4.3 Marshmallow plant vs the confectionary](image)

The second TT, however, is a Situational substitution, in that marshmallow has been replaced by snow ball, in this specific situation. The third TT is another example of Meaning shift, where the meaning of the TT is completely different from the ST, i.e. translating ‘marshmallow’ into ‘abject’, which is a colloquial term meaning ‘inferior and lowly’ in the TT. In this sense, the last two solutions convey the intention of the ST effectively. The noun marshmallow serves as a nickname referring to the monster’s appearance and is incongruous with the image a monster conjures up for most people. All these intentions are lost in the first subtitler’s rendition where meaning shifts so radically. Another example of Situational substitution observed in *Frozen* was given in Chapter 3 (section 3.5, Example (8)).

With regard to the Superordinate term strategy, the following example can be discussed.

---

22 A perennial species indigenous to Europe, Western Asia, and North Africa, which is used as a medicinal plant and ornamental plant. A confection made from the root since ancient Egyptian time evolved into today’s marshmallow treat.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>there's soup and hot glogg in the great hall</td>
<td>اونجا سوپ و نوشیدنی داغ توی سرسراي بزرگ موجوده</td>
<td>there's soup and we have hot drink in the main hall</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Superordinate term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>soup and hot drink is provided in the great hall</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Superordinate term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>soup is ready, hot /glog/ wine is also served in the main hall</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Transliteration + Specification</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 4.6 Example of Superordinate term strategy in Frozen**

As can be seen, in transferring the ST ECR *glogg*, two subtitlers (B and C) have opted for using a superordinate term, i.e. ‘drink’, making the ST ECR less specific. Pedersen (2011:85) refers to superordinate term as “exploiting sense relations in the form of hyponymy or meronymy”. Therefore, both subtitlers have treated *glogg* as a hyponym for drink. In the first TT, on the other hand, the subtitler opted for a source-oriented strategy, i.e. Transliteration+Specification, in that the ST ECR has been kept untranslated yet transliterated, and the word ‘wine’ has been added to *glogg*, which in fact not only makes the ST more accessible for the TT viewer, but also can be considered educational as the TT viewer will learn a new term from the ST (*glogg*) and the fact that *glogg* is a type of wine.

As mentioned earlier, in the present taxonomy, Official equivalent belongs to neither source nor target-oriented group and is considered a single category in transferring ECRs, as it is “different in kind from the other strategies, in that the process is administrative rather than linguistic” (Pedersen, 2011:97). It is in fact a ready-made equivalent established by people in authority for a given ECR. Conversion of measurements falls under this category. The example below is a particular case in point.

---

23 A hot spiced wine and liquor punch served in Scandinavian countries as a Christmas drink (Merriam-Webster Dictionary)
It can be observed that in all three TTs, the ST ECR 100-foot has been converted to 30 meters, as the measuring system in the TC is metric.

In what follows, the distribution of source and target-oriented strategies by the subtitlers throughout the corpus of this film (Frozen) is shown and discussed accordingly. Figures 4.7 and 4.8 below illustrate the distribution of source-oriented strategies by subtitlers in both absolute frequency (4.7) and relative frequency (4.8).
In terms of source-oriented strategies, as can be observed in the figures above, subtitlers B and C show a very similar distribution, whereas subtitler A’s distribution of source-oriented strategies is slightly higher than the other two subtitlers. On the contrary, the distribution of target-oriented strategies by subtitler A (as can be seen in Figures 4.9 and 4.10 below), is the lowest among the three.
Nevertheless, the use of target-oriented strategies is fairly identical by the three subtitlers. The distribution of subcategories relating to the two main groups (source- and target-oriented) by the subtitlers will be discussed in detail in the section dedicated to the analysis by subtitler (section 4.2), further in this chapter.

Having discussed the above, it can be argued that, in transferring ECRs in the animated film *Frozen*, the subtitling behaviour observed in the TTs is more target-oriented (30 out of 48 TTs), with Paraphrase being the most frequently applied strategy by the three subtitlers. This suggests that, for a high number of identified ECR in this film, finding the right equivalent in the TL has not always been achievable and, therefore, the subtitlers have opted for rephrasing the ECRs to make them more coherent and accessible for the TC audience.

Among source-oriented strategies, on the other hand, Transliteration, and the combined strategy of Transliteration+Specification were respectively the most frequently applied strategies by the subtitlers, which indicates that the subtitlers, in these specific cases, preferred to keep the ECR as close as possible to the ST (Transliteration), in some cases providing an explanation for the ECR (in brackets) while keeping the ECR in its closest form (in terms of pronunciation) to the ST ECR (Transliteration+Specification).

The same procedure carried out for *Frozen* will be followed for the analysis of the other four selected animated films, and also detailed analysis will be made with regard to each individual subtitler (in the relevant section (4.2)), in order to be able to draw a conclusion from the results obtained, to see whether the subtitlers (separately and/or collectively) show a specific pattern in the process of translating ECRs in subtitling the animated films. Table 4.8 below illustrates the distribution of the strategies in both groups (source and target-oriented) by each individual subtitler, as well as in total in the animated film *Frozen*.
### Table 4.8 Distribution of source and target-oriented strategies by each individual subtitler and in total in the animated film *Frozen*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source-oriented Strategies</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>Total (in the given film)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transliteration</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transliteration+Specification</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calque</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transliteration+Calque</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shifted</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>6</strong></td>
<td><strong>4</strong></td>
<td><strong>4</strong></td>
<td><strong>14</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Target-oriented Strategies</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>Total (by Subtitler in the given film)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Superordinate Term</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transcultural ECR</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TC ECR</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Situational</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Omission</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative Rendition</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meaning Shift</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>9</strong></td>
<td><strong>10</strong></td>
<td><strong>11</strong></td>
<td><strong>30</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Official equivalent</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>Total (by Subtitler in the given film)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the next subsection, the animated film *Despicable Me 2* is analysed and the distribution of the categories is discussed, and examples of each individual category are provided for the purpose of elucidation.
4.1.2 Analysis of the Animated Feature Film *Despicable Me 2*

*Despicable Me 2*, directed by Pierre Coffin and Chris Renaud, is a 2013 American 3D computer-animated comedy film, and the sequel to the 2010 animated film *Despicable Me*. It was produced by Illumination Entertainment for Universal Pictures and animated by Illumination Mac Guff. The film was nominated for Academy Award for Best Animated Feature and for Academy Award for Best Original Song (“Happy”), losing both to Walt Disney Animation Studios’ *Frozen*. According to Box Office Mojo, *Despicable Me 2* became the second-highest-grossing animated film of 2013 and the third highest-grossing film of 2013. A plot summary of the film is provided in Chapter 3 (section 3.3.2). As mentioned earlier in the Methodology chapter, among all five selected animated films for the present study, *Frozen* was the only film for which all three subtitles (by the three selected subtitlers) were available; while two subtitles were available for each of the other four films. In other words, with regard to *Despicable Me 2*, the available subtitles were those of subtitler A and B. The number of ECRs identified in this film was quite high in comparison to that of *Frozen*. A number of 30 ECRs were identified in *Despicable Me 2*, therefore 60 TTs (by two subtitlers) were analysed, among which 33 were treated as source-oriented, 23 as target-oriented and 4 as Official equivalent cases. The absolute and relative frequency of the total source-oriented and target-oriented strategies applied by the two subtitlers in translating ECRs in this film is illustrated in Figures 4.11 and 4.12 below.

---

24 Box office Mojo was founded in 1999. It tracks box office revenue in a systematic, algorithmic way, and publishes the data on its website and is owned by IMDb. The website is widely used within the film industry as a source of data.
As can be seen in the figures above, in translating the instances of ECRs in this given film, the subtitlers have opted for source-oriented strategies more frequently than target-oriented strategies.

In order to look closely into the source-oriented and target-oriented strategies applied in translating the identified ECRs in this animated film, each individual strategy in these groups needs to be examined by analysing the relating TTs, and the distribution of each strategy needs to be discussed accordingly. To this end, Figures 4.13 and 4.14 below are provided to illustrate the absolute and relative frequency pertaining to each strategy in the source-oriented group, followed by an example of TT for each individual strategy to see what solution the two subtitlers opted for in rendering the same ST ECR.
It can be observed in the figures above that the most frequently applied strategy in this group is Transliteration, occurring 46% in relation to other strategies in this group, followed by Calque with 30% occurrence, while Transliteration+Calque and Transliteration+Specification occurred 15% and 9% respectively. The high frequency of Transliteration, along with the other two combined subcategories pertaining to it, may suggest that the subtitlers have tried to bring the TT reader closer to the SC as much as possible, by keeping the ECR in its closest form to the ST and/or keeping the ECR in the TT in its untranslated form, while providing an explanation or a word-for-word translation for it (or at least some part of it). It should be pointed out that the subtitlers’ decision-making processes cannot be examined closely unless using a systematic method of assessment such as think-aloud protocol. On the other hand,
where this method is not achievable and there is no access to the subtitlers/translator,
referring to the extra material available for each film (e.g. paratexts) might possibly help to
identify the effect of the animation layout and characters on framing the subtitled products, as
will be discussed further in the Discussion Chapter.

In what follows, some of the examples of identified ECRs in the film Despicable Me 2, along
with the relating TTs by the two subtitlers (A and B), are provided in order to examine
whether there are any similarities or differences in the translation solutions for which the two
subtitlers opted, in rendering the same ECRs. The examples of ECRs provided below in
Table 4.9, demonstrate the cases where the strategy of Transliteration has been used in
translating the same ECRs in the corpus of this film.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-What celebrity do you look like?</td>
<td>-به چه ادم مشهوری هستی؟</td>
<td>-which character do you like?</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Transliteration (x2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Uh, Bruce Willis.</td>
<td>-brus vi:li:s/</td>
<td>-/brus vi:li:s/</td>
<td></td>
<td>(Omission (x1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Mmm, no.</td>
<td>-no</td>
<td>-no</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Humpty Dumpty!</td>
<td>-/hʌmpti: dʌmpti:/</td>
<td>-/hʌmpti: dʌmpti:/</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Oh, Gollum!</td>
<td>-/gon/</td>
<td>-/gon/</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.9 Example of Transliteration strategy in Despicable Me 2

It should be mentioned that, in the example above, the five lines of subtitles appear separately
on the screen as shown in separate sections. Nevertheless, they have been put together in a
single table as a dialogue.
In the above example, Gru’s daughters are trying to sign him up for online dating. To do so, they need to upload a nice photo of him as well as some additional information such as what celebrity he looks like and so on. He thinks he looks like Bruce Willis (as they are both bald) but the girls disagree and suggest other well-known characters like Humpty Dumpty and Gollum who are also bald but with more resemblance to Gru. The humour here is cumulative, as the descriptions progressively become more grotesque or absurd, moving from an aging action-character actor, to a nursery rhyme persona, to a menacing fantasy character. The three characters in this utterance have been identified as ECRs, as they are all well-known characters, at least in Western and European countries. The relating images are provided below (Image 4.4) for the purpose of clarity.

Image 4.4: Top image: Gru
Bottom images from left to right: Bruce Willis, Humpty Dumpty, Gollum

Bruce Willis is a well-known Hollywood actor who is also known to the majority of TC viewers. Humpty Dumpty on the other hand, is a character in an English nursery rhyme, and
probably one of the best known in the English-speaking world but not in the TC viewers’ encyclopedic knowledge. The same goes for Gollum, a fictional character who was first introduced in the 1937 fantasy novel *The Hobbit* and became an important supporting character in its sequel *The Lord of the Rings*, and who is well-known to the SC but not to the majority of TC viewers. As can be seen in table 4.9 above, subtitler A transliterated *Bruce Willis* and *Humpty Dumpty* but omitted *Gollum*. Subtitler B on the other hand, transliterated all three ECRs, and has also used quotation marks to specify them as proper nouns. Nevertheless, no attempt has been made in any of the TTs to guide the TC viewer and the names risk being unknown to the majority of the audience.

The second frequently used strategy in this group in the given film is that of Calque, which is exemplified in Table 4.10 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>We are the <em>Anti-Villain League.</em></td>
<td>ما &quot;النجم ضد تهكاري&quot; هستم</td>
<td>we are &quot;anti villain league&quot;</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Calque</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ما اتحادية ضد شرارت هستم</td>
<td>we are anti mischief league</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Calque</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.10 Example of using Calque in *Despicable Me 2*

For the ECR *Anti-Villain League* (a fictitious name of a top-secret organisation dedicated to fighting super-villain activities in the film *Despicable Me 2*) both subtitlers have opted for direct translation using lexical calque, i.e. translating literally each of the elements of the ECR. In a different utterance where the same ECR (i.e. *Anti-Villain League*) has been
abbreviated to AVL by agent Lucy Wild when first introducing herself to Gru, the solution for rendering this ECR differs between the two subtitlers, as shown in Table 4.11 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&quot;I'm agent Lucy Wild of the AVL&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;I'm agent Lucy Wild of &quot;/e.ze.te/ &quot;</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Creative rendition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>من مامور لوسي وايلد هستم از &quot;اي وئي ال&quot;</td>
<td>I'm agent Lucy Wild of the &quot;/ey vi: el/&quot;</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Transliteration</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.11 Example of Creative rendition and Transliteration in Despicable Me 2

As discussed above, in Table 4.10, both subtitlers have provided a direct translation for the ECR Anti-Villain League. Subtitler A’s translation, i.e. anti villain council, reads as /andgœmæn-e zed-e tæbæhkəri:/, which can be abbreviated to AZT, pronounced /e.ze.te/ in the TL. Therefore, as can be seen in Table 4.11 above, where the abbreviated form of the ST ECR is uttered, subtitler A has creatively replaced it with the abbreviated form of the TT he already provided for the term, making it more coherent for the TC audience. Subtitler B, on the other hand, has used a Transliteration strategy, which might not transfer the same connotation, referring to his direct translation for the complete form of the ST ECR in the previous utterance.

As regards the combined strategy of Transliteration+Calque, as the third most frequently used strategy in this group, the following example is a good case in point.
In the example above, the character Eduardo Pérez is ordering cupcakes for a big party he is planning, when he utters: “I’m throwing a big Cinco de Mayo party”. The ECR Cinco de Mayo party has been translated word-for-word by subtitler A, and quotation marks have also been used to suggest that it refers to a special date or occasion, but no more attempt has been made to help the TC viewer to access the ST ECR. Subtitler B, on the other hand, has transliterated the ECR as well as providing an explanation of what the ECR refers to in brackets, therefore, using the combined strategy of Transliteration+Specification. Based on the time codes in the relating SRT file, the exposure time of the above two-liner subtitle (by subtitler B) on the screen is 3 seconds (for 105 characters, going against the norm of the number of spaces/characters allowed in a 2-liner subtitle), which is extremely fast (based on

---

25 Cinco de Mayo is an annual celebration held on May 5. The date is observed to commemorate the Mexican Army’s unlikely victory over the French Empire at the Battle of Puebla, on May 5, 1862, under the leadership of General Ignacio Zaragoza (Lovgren, 2006).
the exposure rule by Díaz Cintas and Remael (2007), as explained in relation to Example 4.1). Therefore, the subtitle’s exposure time in this example is short and, arguably, there is not enough time for the viewer to read the explanation provided in brackets, especially when it comes to young viewers, who normally have a slower pace of reading, or adults who are not accustomed to high reading speeds. This might not be the case with professional subtitling, where subtitlers are required to observe the norms of subtitling in the process of the practice. Image 4.5 below visualises the TT produced by subtitler B, using the combined strategy of Transliteration+Specification, as it appears on the screen when the above ECR is uttered in *Despicable Me 2*.

![Image 4.5 Transliteration+Specification strategy in Despicable Me 2](image)

With regard to the distribution of target-oriented strategies used in this animated film, Figures 4.15 and 4.16 are provided below.
As can be observed in the figures above, the most frequently used strategy in this group is that of Paraphrase (30%), followed by Omission and Situational substitution, occurring 26% and 22% respectively, whereas the strategies of Superordinate, Transcultural ECR substitution, and Creative rendition occurred at a low frequency in this group. No cases of TC ECR or Meaning shift were observed. In what follows, examples relating to the most frequently applied strategies in this group (in the film Despicable Me 2) are provided.
I would like to make some toast

I want to make a speech

I wanted to speak in bride and groom's honour

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I would like to make some toast</td>
<td>میخواهم بسخنرا بهم</td>
<td>I want to make a speech</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>میخواستم که به افتخار عروس داماد بدمک حرف بزنم</td>
<td>I wanted to speak in bride and groom's honour</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.13 Example of Paraphrase in Despicable Me 2

In the example above, the ECR toast has been paraphrased into making a speech by both subtitlers, making it less specific in the TC yet transferring the intended sense in the ST ECR. It should be pointed out that there were several cases throughout the corpus where, in transferring the same ST ECR, the subtitlers have opted for different strategies, as in the case with the examples in Table 4.11 and 4.12 above. The following example also is a case in point.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Didgeridoo</td>
<td>Ø</td>
<td>Ø</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Omission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>بوک استرالیایی Australian horn</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.14 Example of Omission and Paraphrase in Despicable Me 2

In the above example, the ECR Didgeridoo has been omitted in the TT by subtitler A, but paraphrased by subtitler B. As discussed earlier in Chapter 3 (section 3.5), in some circumstances Omission might be the only viable option, but it may also be opted for due to time pressure when subtitling a given film. It is considered as a valid solution by several scholars including Toury (1995) and Leppihalme (1994). The obvious drawback is that the
audience’s cultural knowledge is not expanded and, in some cases, the omission may create subsequent coherence problems. In the example above, however, this was not the case because the ECR did not carry significant information in the context.

The next most frequently applied strategy in this group was that of Situational substitution, where “every sense of the ST ECR is completely removed, and replaced by something that fits the situation” (Pedersen, 2005:9 and 2011:95). This strategy is exemplified below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>You are right, <em>cabeza de huevo</em></td>
<td>حق با تونه دوست خوب من</td>
<td>you are right <em>my good friend</em></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Situational substitution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>درست میگی ریس</td>
<td>you are right <em>boss</em></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Situational substitution</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.15 Example of Situational substitution in Despicable Me 2

In the example above, Eduardo addresses Gru as *cabeza de huevo*, meaning ‘egghead’ in Spanish, and also a reference to the radio programme *Manolo cabeza de huevo* and Gru’s resemblance to the character (both being bald). Both subtitlers opted for a Situational substitution by removing the ST ECR and replacing it with something that fits the situation, as Eduardo is agreeing with Gru on a subject and, therefore, it makes sense that he is addressing Gru as his friend or someone with whom he cannot disagree (i.e. his boss).

Another strategy that deserves to be discussed in this group is that of using a Transcultural ECR, which consists of using a better known (i.e. transcultural) ECR, either from the SC or from a third culture known in both the SC and TC. In other words, by using this strategy, the

---

26 A series of famous Spanish abusive prank calls made by the New York radio show *El Vacilón de la Mañana* (Spanish for *The Morning Party*).
subtitler removes the more exotic and peripheral ECRs and replaces them with ECRs that are more common and central (Pedersen, 2007:33). It could be argued, however, that the strategy creates an ethical gap, in that it involves a breach of reference: the ST ECR refers to one ECR; the TT ECR to another. Nevertheless, the subtitler simply helps the viewer to access the ST in an easy and comfortable way (Pedersen, 2007). The following example of using Transcultural ECR was observed in the given film.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>You did the Veterans Day Pageant and you haven’t been in combat</td>
<td>تو در مراسم روز والدین شرکت کردن و مشکلی هم نداشته</td>
<td>you attended the parents’ day ceremony and you didn't have any problem</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>TC ECR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>you attended the parents’ day ceremony and you didn't have any problem</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>TC ECR</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.16 Example of TC ECR Strategy in Despicable Me 2

In the example above, Gru is helping Agnes (his little daughter), practise her part for a Mother’s Day show. She sounds robotic when delivering her lines, saying that this is because she does not have a mom, but Gru points out that this should not affect her, saying: “You did the Veterans Day Pageant and you haven’t been in combat”.

The above ECR, i.e. Veterans Day Pageant/Parade, is widely known to the SC viewers but it is not in the encyclopedic knowledge of the TC viewer. Both subtitlers have opted for Transcultural ECR substitution by replacing it with an ECR that is known to both cultures,

---

27 An official United States public holiday, observed annually on November 11, that honours military veterans.
i.e. Parents’ Day28, to help the audience to access the ST ECR. In other words, both subtitlers have sought equivalence of effect, rather than equivalence of information, in transferring the above ECR.

The strategy of using a Superordinate term occurred only once in the corpus of this film as shown in Table 4.17 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Well, it's not definite yet. I'm still figuring it out. I've already been working on my accent. <strong>Wallaby.</strong></td>
<td>Well, it's not definite yet.</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>(Omission (x2 Transliteration (x1))</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Didgeridoo. <strong>Hugh Jackman</strong></td>
<td>I'm still thinking about it.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I've already been working on my accent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ø. Ø</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/hju: djækmæn/</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Well, it's not definite yet.</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Superordinate (term (x2 Omission (x1)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I'm still thinking about it.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I've already been working on my accent.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ø</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>/kæŋgоро/. Australian horn.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.17 Examples of Omission, Transliteration, and Superordinate term in Despicable Me 2

In the above utterance, three ECRs have been identified: **Wallaby, Didgeridoo, Hugh Jackman**. It needs to be mentioned that the same example was discussed earlier in Chapter 3 (section 3.5, Example 15) where the strategy of Omission was discussed. In Table 4.14

---

28 The Global Day of Parents is observed on the 1st of June every year. The Day was proclaimed by the UN General Assembly in 2012 and honours parents throughout the world (United Nations website).
above, one of the ECRs (Didgeridoo) identified in the above utterance was discussed regarding the strategy of Paraphrase. This time, however, the strategy of Generalisation by using a Superordinate term is the topic of discussion. In this scene, agent Lucy Wilde is being transferred to Australia, and Gru is asking if she has firmly made up her mind to go, when she utters the above ST. As can be seen, subtitler A has omitted the first two ECRs (i.e. Wallaby and Didgeridoo) but transliterated Hugh Jackman. The probable reasons for choosing an omission strategy in this case could be the spatio-temporal constrains involved in subtitling, or simply because Wallaby and Didgeridoo are not transferring any information here, and have been used by the character only to show she is practising Australian accent; therefore, the subtitler might deem it unnecessary to find an equivalent for these ECRs in the TT. On the other hand, Hugh Jackman, an Australian Hollywood actor who is quite well-known to the majority of TC viewers, has been transliterated, therefore, to some extent, this seems to be a well-motivated strategy in this case.

Interestingly enough, subtitler B has taken an opposite approach in transferring the same ECRs, in that the ECR Wallaby has been replaced by a Superordinate term, i.e. ‘kangaroo’, which is the same word in the TT with a slightly different pronunciation (i.e. /ˈkængoro/ instead of /kæŋəˈru:/). It can be argued that, in this specific case, the combined strategy of Transliteration+Generalisation has been used. The ECR Didgeridoo has been paraphrased to ‘Australian horn’; however, Hugh Jackman has been omitted in the TT produced by subtitler B. As discussed above, the reason for omitting the ST ECR could be space and time constraints or just to remove a foreign block in the TT, as it is not possible to paraphrase or to use a hyponym for people’s names.

29 A pouched Australian mammal which belongs to the same taxonomic family as kangaroos.
Regarding the strategy of Official equivalent, 4 cases have been observed in the corpus of this film, 2 of which, were conversion of measurement (feet to meters) which has been discussed earlier in Table 4.7 above. The other two are shown in Table 4.18 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Would you like some</td>
<td>Would you like some</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Official</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>peanuts or Pretzels?</td>
<td>peanuts or /ʧub fur/?</td>
<td>Equivalent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>يداموم زميني يا جوب شور ميل داريد؟</td>
<td>يداموم زميني يا جوب شور ميخواين؟</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Official</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do you want some peanuts or</td>
<td>/ʧub fur/?</td>
<td>Equivalent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.18 Example of Official equivalent in Despicable Me 2

In the above example, the identified ECR *Pretzels*, has been replaced by its Official equivalent in the TT i.e. /ʧub fur/. According to Pedersen (2007 and 2011), an Official equivalent can be created in two ways: a) through a decision made by the people in authority (such as conversion of measurements); or b) through entrenchment, which means if a SC ECR is always rendered in a particular way in the TC, an Official equivalent has been established. The TTs in the above example fall under the second category (Official equivalent by entrenchment) as *Pretzels* are known as (جوْب شور) /ʧub fur/ (ʧub= stick / fur= salty) in the TC (the word-for-word translation would be ‘salty sticks/crackers’).

As mentioned earlier (in chapter 3, section 3.4.1), Official equivalent is established as a fixed equivalent for specific STs, including ECRs. There are a number of food and beverage items that fall into this category, i.e. some official decisions are made for these items and they become standardised by professionals and institutions who use such items, and as a consequence they become entrenched in a given culture. The examples provided below support this argument.
**Jaffa cakes**

*Jaffa cakes* (biscuit-sized cakes) are a British product, the classification of which (as a cake or biscuit), was part of a VAT tribunal in 1991, with the court deciding that the *Jaffa cake* should be considered a cake for tax purposes. Therefore, this product has been standardised and entrenched as a type of cake in British culture.

**Cornish Pasty**

The *Cornish Pasty* Association, protecting the *Cornish Pasty*, has gained European protected (PGI) status in 2011 for this product, which means that only pasties made in Cornwall, to a traditional recipe and manner, can legally be called *Cornish pasties* (Johnson, 2011).

**Whisky vs Whiskey**

“*Whisky* derives from the Gaelic term *usquebaugh* which translates as ‘water of life’. In modern usage, *whisky* is from Scotland and *whiskey* is from Ireland. The difference comes from the translation of words from the Scottish and Irish Gaelic forms. In the late 1800s, Scottish whisky was also very poor quality therefore the Irish producers wanted to differentiate their product” (Dalloway, no date).

Pedersen’s (2011) taxonomy, like all taxonomies, is debatable and categories uses for analysis are not absolutely watertight. Therefore, it should be acknowledged that many cases of food and beverage ECR renderings end up in grey areas between Official equivalent and Cultural substitution. The above example (i.e. *Pretzel*), arguably straddles TC ECR and Official equivalent strategies. In either case, the decision on how to classify such cases will not affect the final findings of this study since both Cultural substitution and Official equivalent function towards the TC (although the latter is not directly considered as a target-oriented strategy by Pedersen).

---

30 GOV.UK, VAT Food. [https://www.gov.uk/hmrc-internal-manuals/vat-food/vfood6260](https://www.gov.uk/hmrc-internal-manuals/vat-food/vfood6260)
In what follows, the distribution of source and target-oriented strategies (both absolute frequency (values) and relative frequency (percentage)) by subtitlers A and B throughout the corpus of this film (*Despicable Me 2*) is shown and discussed accordingly (Figures 4.17-4.20).

![Figure 4.17 Total source-oriented strategies by subtitlers (A & B) in absolute frequencies – *Despicable Me 2* (total n: 34 out of 60)](image)

![Figure 4.18 Total source-oriented strategies by subtitlers (A & B) in relative frequencies in *Despicable Me 2*](image)

![Figure 4.19 Total target-oriented strategies by subtitlers (A & B) in absolute frequencies – *Despicable Me 2* (total n: 23 out of 60)](image)
As can be seen in the figures above, in transferring the ECRs identified in the animated film *Despicable Me 2*, the subtitling behaviour observed in the TTs is more source-oriented (34 out of 60 TTs), with Transliteration being the most frequently applied strategy in this group. This can imply the fact that the subtitlers, in these specific cases, preferred to keep the ECR as close as possible to the ST, specifically in terms of pronunciation, which, in a way, can educate the TT as they will get familiar with a ST ECR as it is. With regard to target-oriented strategies, Paraphrase was the most frequently used strategy in this group which can indicate that the subtitlers decided to help the TT viewer to access to the ST ECR by bringing the ST closer to the TT, through rephrasing the ST ECRs. An interesting point that has been observed in the analysis of these two films so far (i.e. *Frozen* and *Despicable Me 2*) is that Transliteration and Paraphrase have been the most frequently used strategies in the two main categories, i.e. source-oriented and target-oriented respectively. However, in *Frozen*, the strategies were more target-oriented, whereas in *Despicable Me 2* more source-oriented strategies were applied by the subtitlers.

In order to make a profound analysis in terms of the distribution of subcategories relating to the two main groups (source and target-oriented) by the subtitlers, each individual subtitler’s
TTs throughout the corpus will be analysed later in the chapter (section 4.2) which is dedicated to the Analysis by Subtitler. Table 4.19 below illustrates the distribution of the strategies in both groups (source and target-oriented) by each individual subtitler (A and B) as well as in total in the animated film Despicable Me 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Despicable Me 2</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>Total (in the given film)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Source-oriented Strategies</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transliteration</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transliteration+Specification</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calque</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transliteration+Calque</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shifted</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total (by Subtitler in the given film)</strong></td>
<td>18</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Target-oriented Strategies</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Superordinate Term</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transcultural ECR</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TC ECR</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Situational</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Omission</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative Rendition</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meaning Shift</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total (by Subtitler in the given film)</strong></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Official equivalent</strong></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.19 Distribution of source and target-oriented strategies by each individual subtitler and in total in the animated film Despicable Me 2

In the next subsection, the same procedure is carried out for the analysis of the animated film Inside Out. The distribution of the categories both in total and by each individual subtitler is demonstrated and discussed and examples of each individual category is provided accordingly, for the purpose of comparison and explication.
4.1.3 Analysis of the Animated Feature Film *Inside Out*

*Inside Out* is a 2015 American 3D computer-animated comedy-drama film produced by Pixar Animation Studios and released by Walt Disney Pictures. The film was directed by Pete Docter and co-directed by Ronnie del Carmen, with a screenplay written by Docter, Meg LeFauve and Josh Cooley, adapted from a story by Docter and del Carmen. The film has been praised by reviewers for its concept, screenplay, subject matter, and vocal performances (McCarthy, 2015). It grossed $90.4 million in its first weekend of release, making it the highest opening for an original title at the time and also accumulating over $857 million in worldwide box office revenue in 2015, making it the seventh highest-grossing film of 2015. The film received several awards, including a BAFTA Award, Golden Globe Award, Critics’ Choice Award, Annie Award, Satellite Award, and Academy Award for best Animated Feature. A plot summary of the film is provided in Chapter 3 (section 3.3.2).

Among the three selected subtitlers for the study, the available subtitles for this film were those of subtitler A and B. The number of ECRs identified in this film was higher than the first two films analysed so far (*Frozen* (16) and *Despicable Me 2* (30)). In fact, a total of 35 ECRs were identified in *Inside Out*, therefore, 70 TTs (by two subtitlers) were analysed, among which 30 were treated as source-oriented, 30 as target-oriented, and 10 Official equivalent cases were observed. The absolute and relative frequency (absolute values and percentage) of the total source-oriented and target-oriented strategies applied by the two subtitlers in translating ECRs in this film, is illustrated in Figures 4.21 and 4.22 below.
It can be observed that the subtitlers have treated the ECRs quite similarly, in that the distribution of the main two categories (i.e. source-oriented and target-oriented) is to a high degree analogous. In what follows, as the convention of the chapter, the distribution of the individual strategies pertaining to each group is illustrated, the relating TTs by the two subtitlers are analysed and compared in the tables provided for the instances that stand out more throughout the corpus of this given film. To this end, Figures 4.23 and 4.24 below demonstrate the absolute and relative frequency pertaining to each strategy in source-oriented group, followed by an example of TT for each individual strategy, to compare the solutions the subtitlers opted for in transferring the same ST ECR.
Unlike what was observed in the analysis of the other two animated films so far (i.e. *Frozen* and *Despicable Me 2*), where Transliteration was the most frequently applied strategy in the source-oriented group, in the film *Inside Out* the strategy of Calque, occurring in 43% of the TTs, is observed to be the most frequently used strategy in this group. This is followed by the combined strategy of Transliteration+Calque (23%), Transliteration+Specification and Transliteration with identical occurrence (17%). The example below illustrates the use of Calque and the combined strategy of Transliteration+Calque strategy by the subtitlers in transferring the same ECR.
In the example above, the ST ECR, i.e. *The Golden Gate Bridge*, (the famous bridge in San Francisco), has been translated word-for-word by the two subtitlers. Subtitler A, however, has transliterated the ECR as well as providing a Calque translation. The word-for-word translation for the ECR in TT is in fact /pol-/ærvæzæ tælæi:/ (/pol/=bridge, /-e/=determiner, /ærvæzæ=/gate, and /tælæi:/=golden). As can be observed, the Transliteration of the ECR in TT (/golden geɪt/) is very similar to the ST pronunciation. On the other hand, the differences between the language pair under investigation in the present study as language systems enforces obligatory shifts in direct translation which can be observed in all cases of Calque in the TTs of the given corpus.

With regard to the combined strategy of Transliteration+Specification, as one of the frequently applied strategies observed in this group, more information is added to the TT (or an explanation for the ECR is provided (mostly in brackets)), together with transliteration of the term. As discussed earlier (the discussion relating to the TT provided for the ECR ‘Cinco de Mayo’ in Table 4.12 above), it can be argued that there are both advantages and disadvantages involved when using the combined strategy of Transliteration+Specification. To put it another way, it could be advantageous due to the educational benefits it might offer to the TT viewers as they can get familiar with an element of SC, provided that, considering the constraints involved in subtitling, there is enough time for the viewer to read the
explanation. This element, i.e. the exposure time on the screen, is taken into account in professional subtitling, whereas in non-professional/unofficial subtitling this might not be a concern. In the example below, the two-liner subtitle (74 characters) by subtitler A stays on the screen for 5 seconds, which, based on the rule suggested by Díaz Cintas and Remael (2007:97) and mentioned in the discussion relating to the ECR Cinco de Mayo in Table 4.12, is an adequate exposure time on the screen and therefore an apt strategy for transferring the source ECR in this example. Having compared examples of long two-liner subtitles by subtitler A and subtitler B, it can be argued that the reading speed expected by subtitler A is slightly slower than that of subtitler B, therefore allowing more time to read the explanations provided in the brackets.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Forget it Jake. It's Cloud Town.</td>
<td>FRAMOOSH EKH, &quot;JIK, EINJAJA MELAMEHAE EBERHAEST&quot; (ESHAH E BEFILM &quot;MELAMEHAE EJINEH&quot;)</td>
<td>&quot;FOGET IT /Dzech/. IT'S CLOUD TOWN (REFERRING TO &quot;CHINA TOWN&quot; FILM)&quot;</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Transliteration + Specification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&quot;FRAMOOSH EKH &quot;JIK, EINJAJA SHEHR EBREH&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;FOGET IT /Dzech/. IT'S CLOUD TOWN&quot;</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Transliteration + Calque</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.21 Examples of Transliteration+Specification and Transliteration+Calque in *Inside Out*

A broad explanation for the example above has been given in Chapter 3 (section 3.4.1, Example 1). The strategy of Transliteration has been profoundly discussed throughout the chapter and also earlier in Chapter 3. Nevertheless, a relating example of TT where this strategy has been used in each given film will be provided for the purpose of analysis and comparison between the TTs. Example below is a case in point observed in *Inside Out*. 

184
In the above example, Joy, Sadness (the feelings inside Riley’s brain) and Bing Bong (Riley’s imaginary friend), are going over her memories by looking into her memory marbles, one of which is from when she was having a good time with her family and friends back in Minnesota after winning a hockey game in a place called *Twisty Tree*. In fact, the image of the tree is shown in the background in this scene (image 4.6 below), which may make the Calque translation a more apt strategy in this case, as it will make the ECR more coherent for the TT viewer. However, the strategy of Transliteration might cause ambiguity specifically for the TT audience with no background knowledge of the SL.

![Image 4.6 Snapshot of the scene relating to the example in Table 4.22](image_url)

Figures 4.25 and 4.26 below demonstrate the distribution of target-oriented strategies used in this animated film.
As can be observed in the figures above, the most frequently used strategy in this group is that of Paraphrase (63%), (as was the case with the other two films analysed so far, i.e. *Frozen* and *Despicable Me 2*), followed by TC ECR (13%), and an identical distribution of the other strategies, namely Superordinate term, Omission, and Meaning shift (7%), while the lowest frequency observed was that of the strategy of Transcultural ECR (3%). Opting for the strategy of Paraphrase might be due to the presence of psychological terms relating to memory and brain function and also technical terms relating to hockey, which were the main two themes in this film. In other words, in most cases the subtitlers decided to paraphrase
these ECRs to make them less complicated and more accessible for the TT audience. In what follows, the examples relating to the frequently applied strategies in this group are provided.

<p>| | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>ST</strong></td>
<td><strong>TT</strong></td>
<td><strong>Back translation</strong></td>
<td><strong>Subtitler Strategy</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>looks like we're going into REM&lt;sup&gt;31&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>انگار داریم وارد مرحله خواب فعل میشیم</td>
<td>looks like we are entering the active sleep stage</td>
<td>A Paraphrase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>انگار که داریم می‌میریم رو فاز خواب دینن</td>
<td>looks like we are going to the dreaming phase</td>
<td>B Paraphrase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>take it to DEFCON&lt;sup&gt;32&lt;/sup&gt; two</td>
<td>برو به درجه‌ی هشداری دو</td>
<td>go to the alert level two</td>
<td>A Paraphrase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>برو به امادگی مرحله دوم</td>
<td>go to the readiness level two</td>
<td>B Paraphrase</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.23 Examples of Paraphrase in Inside Out

In the examples above, both subtitlers have opted for Paraphrase to spell out the connotation which is latent in the acronyms (as defined in the relating footnotes). The first ECR, i.e. REM, is uttered by Joy, when Riley goes to sleep at night and Joy decides to call it a day, letting the emotions rest at the Headquarter in Riley’s brain. The second ECR, i.e. DEFCON, is uttered by the Anger in Riley’s dad’s head when he gets mad at Riley. In fact, Anger commands other emotions to get ready to fight when he utters: ‘take it to DEFCON two’, and

---

<sup>31</sup> Rapid Eye Movement (REM) is one of the five different stages the brain goes through during sleep in which the eyes move rapidly in various directions. Most dreams occur during REM sleep (Leonard, 2017).

<sup>32</sup> The Defense Readiness Condition (DEFCON) is an alert state used by the United States Armed Forces (Department of Defense Dictionary of Military and Associated Terms, 2001).
the sirens start to blare in Riley’s dad’s head. As can be observed, both TTs transfer the latent meaning in the acronym in a felicitous way.

With regard to the strategy of TC ECR, where a ST ECR is replaced by an ECR that is known and familiar to the TT audience, the following example is given.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>say cheese</td>
<td>بگین سیب</td>
<td>say /si:b/</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>TC ECR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>بگین سیب</td>
<td>say /si:b/</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>TC ECR</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.24 Example of TC ECR in *Inside Out*

In this scene, Riley and her mom are posing in front of a roadside cement dinosaur and her dad is taking a photograph and asking them to say ‘cheese’, which is common in English-speaking countries when taking a photograph. However, the equivalent word in the same context in the TT is /si:b/ meaning ‘apple’, a one-syllable word with a similar pronunciation to /ʧi:z/, which has a long /i:/ sound in the middle and therefore has the same effect of producing a smile on a face. That is to say, in the TT it is common to ask people to say /si:b/ when taking a photograph so direct translation would sound odd in this situation, as the equivalent for ‘cheese’ is /pæˈniːr/ in the TT. It should be mentioned that, in the given context, the strategy of Transliteration could also have been used, producing a similar effect in the TT, yet a source-oriented solution. Nevertheless, both subtitlers in this situation have opted for a felicitous strategy, i.e. substitution of the ST with a TC ECR, making it more coherent for the TC audience.

In what follows, the examples pertaining to other strategies observed in this group (Superordinate term, Omission, and Meaning shift) and also Official equivalent, as a stand-
alone strategy in the present taxonomy, are given and the coupled pairs are analysed and discussed accordingly.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>This way, just past Graham Cracker Castle</strong></td>
<td>از این طرف، درست بعد از قلعه بیسکوییتیه</td>
<td>This way, just past the /biskit/ castle</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Superordinate term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>از این طرف، درست بعد از قلعه بیسکوییتیها</td>
<td>This way, just past the big /biskits/ castle</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Superordinate term</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.25 Example of Superordinate term in Inside Out

In the above example, Joy and Sadness are asking Bing Bong to show them the way to the Train of Thought station, which will take them to Headquarters, when Bing Bong utters: “This way, just past Graham Cracker Castle”. All the objects and concepts that the emotions (and Bing Bong) refer to in the film are actually in Riley’s brain and memories, one of which is the Graham Cracker Castle, which is well-known to the ST viewer but not known or familiar to the TT audience. The solution that both subtitlers came up with in this case is that of Generalisation, by using a Superordinate term, i.e. using the word ‘biscuit’ as a hypernym for Graham Cracker, to make the ST ECR accessible for the TT viewer. It could be argued that, in transferring this ECR, the subtitlers have in fact used two solutions, in that the word ‘biscuit’ has been transliterated (as the word is the same in the TT /بیسکوییت/ /biskit/), as well as using it as a hypernym for the ECR Graham Cracker.

33 The Graham Cracker is a type of cracker confectionery that originated around the early 1880s, and is now a mass-produced product in the United States.
Nonetheless, replacing the ST ECR with a Superordinate term has not been always the easiest solution for the subtitlers in similar cases, as in the example below where subtitler B has omitted the ST ECR, while subtitler A has used the combined strategy of Transliteration+Calque to transfer the same ST ECR.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Tripledent gum</em> will make you smile!</td>
<td>/tripldent adams/ will make you smile</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Transliteration+Calque</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ø</td>
<td>Ø</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Omission</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.26 Examples of Transliteration+Calque and Omission in *Inside Out*

As can be seen in the above example, the ECR *Tripledent gum* (in a gum commercial in Riley’s memories) has been omitted by subtitler B, whereas subtitler A has transliterated the first part, i.e. /tripldent/, and has used a Calque translation for the word gum (/آدامس/ /ادامس/=chewing gum). As Pedersen (2005:7) puts it, some ECRs are lexicalised in the TT and can be found in bilingual dictionaries therefore, they could be considered Official equivalents. It can be argued that the Calque translation here (/آدامس/) can also be considered as an Official equivalent for chewing gum in the TT, which has been established by entrenchment. In fact, the word (/آدامس/) is itself an eponym (i.e. *Thomas Adams*, the creator of chewing gum) which has been integrated in the TT over years of usage.

In what follows, the strategy of Meaning shift observed in the corpus of this film is exemplified. In this scene, Sadness, Joy and Bing Bong are looking out the Train of Thought’s door and Bing Bong is trying to show them the different segments of the brain by pointing to each particular zone, such as inductive reasoning, language processing, critical thinking, and ‘Déjà vu’ (which repeatedly exists in between the zones). As can be seen in the
table below, subtitler A has paraphrased *Déjà vu* as ‘familiar imagination’, which is paraphrase with sense transfer (Pedersen, 2005), whereas subtitler B has rendered it into ‘that’s it again’ which shifts the ST connotation and is, therefore, ambiguous to the TT viewer.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>...There's <em>Déjà vu</em></td>
<td>اون آشناپنداری</td>
<td>That's the <em>familiar imagination</em></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>اونم دوباره خونده</td>
<td><em>That's it again</em></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Meaning shift</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.27 Example of Meaning shift in *Inside Out*

With regard to the strategy of Official equivalent which has been frequently applied by the subtitlers in the TTs observed in the corpus of this film, the following instances listed in Table 4.28 have been chosen for further discussion.
### Table 4.28 Examples of Official equivalent in *Inside Out*

An interesting point that has been observed regarding the application of Official equivalent strategy is that, in almost all cases (except for a couple of cases which will be discussed further in the relevant corpus), the subtitlers have chosen the same strategy in treating the given ECR. However, this has not always been the case with other strategies in that, as observed in several instances discussed above, the subtitlers have opted for different strategies in transferring the same ECRs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitle</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>on a scale of one to ten, I give this day an F.</td>
<td>متى بين 1 تا 10 نمره ... من به امروز صفر میمدد</td>
<td>between 1 to 10... I give today a zero</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Official equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>call security</td>
<td>هاتف رو خبر کنین!</td>
<td>Call /herastaw/</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Official equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>هاتف رو صدا کنید</td>
<td>Call /herastaw/</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Official equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I'm mostly cotton candy</td>
<td>من بیشتر پشمکی هستم</td>
<td>I'm mostly /paʃmæk/</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Official equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>من جنس اکثرا پشمکه</td>
<td>I'm mostly made of /paʃmæk/</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Official equivalent</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In Table 4.28 above, the first two instances of ECRs have been replaced by Official equivalents that have been set by people in authority. In other words, in the first example, the character Disgust is showing her disappointment with regard to Riley’s family moving to a new city (and a new house), when she utters: (“on a scale of one to ten, I give this day an F”), as F is considered the lowest mark in the ST educational system. However, the marking system in the TT is officially set on the scale of zero to 20 both at schools and universities. Therefore, as can be seen, both subtitlers have replaced F with zero which reflects the same degree of disappointment in the TT. In the second example, (i.e. call security), the ECR security, referring to the name of an official institution, has been replaced by its ready-made equivalent by the authorities in the TT as /حراست/ (herasæt/). The next instances, however, are food ECRs, which have been replaced by their Official equivalent established by entrenchment. In other words, ‘cotton candy’ is known as /پشمک/ (pæʃmæk/) in the TT. As discussed earlier in the chapter, many cases of ECR renderings end up in grey areas between two strategies, as in the case with Official equivalent and Cultural substitution. Nevertheless, Official equivalent is established as a fixed equivalent for specific STs, including ECRs. Some food and beverage items (as argued in the example relating to the ECR Pretzel), have been standardised by institutions and professionals in the TC, therefore, are known only by the specific terms created for them. (/pæʃmæk/)/پشمک/ is another instance in this context as it refers to the same product that is known as cotton candy in the SC (Image 4.7 below). Categorising items in relation to this technique, raises some questions, such as the need to distinguish between clear instances of official equivalents and cultural substitutions. For example, in contrast to (/pæʃmæk/), the decision to replace another food item, say Porridge, with the TC ECR Fereni (Example 7, discussed in chapter 3), constitutes a prototypical instance of substitution; the difference between the two techniques resides in the fact that substituted items are not exactly the same, even if they are very similar.
In what follows, the distribution of source and target-oriented strategies by subtitlers A and B throughout the corpus of this film (Inside Out) is shown and discussed (Figures 4.27-4.30).

Figure 4.27 Total source-oriented strategies by subtitlers (A & B) in absolute frequencies – Inside Out (total n: 30)

Figure 4.28 Total source-oriented strategies by subtitlers (A & B) in relative frequencies in Inside Out
It can be observed that, in the film *Inside Out*, the distribution of the strategies is similar in terms of source- and target-orientation. It should also be pointed out that both subtitlers have shown a similar pattern in treating the ECRs in the corpus of the three films analysed so far (i.e. *Frozen, Despicable Me 2, Inside Out*). In other words, subtitler A has shown a more source-oriented pattern in all three films and subtitler B, on the other hand, has shown more tendency to use target-oriented strategies in transferring ECRs in all three films. Referring to *Inside Out*, the most frequently applied strategy in the source-oriented group was observed to be that of Calque, unlike *Frozen* and *Despicable Me 2* where Transliteration was leading in this group. However, in terms of target-oriented strategies, the most frequently applied
strategy in all three films has been that of Paraphrase. As discussed earlier, the abundant presence of psychological terms in this film might be the reason for the subtitlers opting for the Calque translation and Paraphrase frequently in rendering the ECRs, rather than only transliterating the terms, which might result in incoherence and misunderstanding by the TT audience. A more in-depth analysis of all 5 films will be provided at the end of the film analysis section, to see whether more similarities and/or differences are demonstrated in the way ECRs have been transferred in the corpus of the study.

Table 4.29 below illustrates the distribution of the strategies in both groups (source- and target-oriented) by each individual subtitler (A and B) as well as in total in the animated film *Inside Out*.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>Total (in the given film)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Inside Out</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Source-oriented Strategies</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transliteration</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transliteration+Specification</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calque</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transliteration+Calque</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shifted</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total (by Subtitler in the given film)</strong></td>
<td><strong>16</strong></td>
<td><strong>14</strong></td>
<td><strong>30</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Target-oriented Strategies</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Superordinate Term</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transcultural ECR</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TC ECR</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Situational</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Omission</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative Rendition</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meaning Shift</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total (by Subtitler in the given film)</strong></td>
<td><strong>14</strong></td>
<td><strong>16</strong></td>
<td><strong>30</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Official equivalent</strong></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.29 Distribution of source and target-oriented strategies by each individual subtitler and in total in the animated film *Inside Out*
4.1.4 Analysis of the Animated Feature Film Hotel Transylvania 2

Hotel Transylvania 2 is a 2015 American 3D computer animated comedy film directed by Genndy Tartakovsky, produced by Sony Pictures Animation and animated by Sony Pictures Imageworks. It is the second sequel to the 2012 film Hotel Transylvania. The film was released by Columbia Pictures and was a box office success, grossing $473 million worldwide.34 A plot summary of the film is provided in Chapter 3 (section 3.3.2). Among the three selected subtitlers for the study, the available subtitles for this film were by subtitler A and subtitler C.

The number of ECRs identified in this film was considerably higher than that of the other three films analysed so far (i.e. Frozen (16), Despicable Me 2 (30), and Inside Out (35)). In fact, a number of 58 ECRs were identified in Hotel Transylvania 2, therefore 116 TTs (by two subtitlers) were analysed, among which 36 were treated as source-oriented, 74 as target-oriented, and 6 as Official equivalent cases. The absolute and relative frequency of the total source-oriented and target-oriented strategies applied by the two subtitlers in translating ECRs in this film is illustrated in Figures 4.31 and 4.32 below.

![Figure 4.31 Total source and target-oriented strategies – absolute frequency – Hotel Transylvania 2 (total n: 110)](image)

---

34 Box Office Mojo.
As can be seen in the above Figures, unlike *Despicable Me2* and *Inside Out* where the strategies were observed to be more source-oriented, in the film *Hotel Transylvania 2* the subtitlers have opted for more target-oriented strategies, which was also the case with *Frozen*. In fact, in this given film, the number of target-oriented strategies is more than twice the number of source-oriented strategies. In order to be able to discuss the probable reason(s) for the subtitlers’ tendency to treat the ECRs in a more target-oriented way, an in-depth analysis of the strategies pertaining to each category (i.e. source and target-oriented) needs to be made. To this end, in what follows, the distribution of the individual strategies in each group is demonstrated, and the relevant TTs by the two subtitlers are analysed and compared in the tables provided for a number of the instances observed throughout the corpus of this film. For this purpose, Figures 4.33 and 4.34 below demonstrate the absolute and relative frequency pertaining to each strategy in the source-oriented group, followed by an example of TT for each individual strategy to compare the solutions the subtitlers opted for in transferring the same ST ECRs.
Interestingly enough, it can be observed that the most frequently used strategy in the source-oriented group relating to the corpus of this film is also that of Transliteration. In other words, this pattern has been observed in the TTs relating to three films out of four that have been analysed so far, namely; *Frozen, Despicable Me 2* and *Hotel Transylvania 2*. The reason for opting for this strategy frequently has been discussed earlier both in this chapter and Chapter 3 (section 3.5) and will also be discussed further at the end of data analysis section.

The second most frequently used strategy in this group was observed to be Calque, followed by the combined strategies of Transliteration+Specification and Transliteration+Calque (28%, 17%, and 11% respectively). For the purpose of comparison and discussion, the TTs relating to each strategy in this group will be exemplified in the following Tables.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitle</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-You learned about everything growing up in <em>Santa Claus.</em></td>
<td>توانست &quot;سانتا کلاوس&quot; بزرگ شدی همه چی رو بیا و گرفتی. دستش &quot;سانتا کروز&quot; رو گرفتی.</td>
<td>you learned about everything growing up in '/santa klaʊz/'. The right word is '/santa kruːz/ '</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Transliteration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-It's Santa Cruz!</td>
<td>توی سانتا کلاوس بزرگ شدی و همه چی بلدی. سانتا کروز.</td>
<td>you grew up in '/santa klaʊs/ and know everything. /santa kruːz/</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Transliteration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I'm Batman! To the Batmobile!</td>
<td>من &quot;بیتمن&quot;. میرم به سمت &quot;بیتموبل&quot; (سالمین معروف بتمن)</td>
<td>I am '/bɛtmaːn/'. We are going towards '/bɛtmobiːl/'/'bɛtmaːn/’s famous car)</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>-Transliteration Specification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>به سمت بت موبیل!</td>
<td>I'm '/bɛtmaːn/! towards the /bɛtmobiːl/!</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Transliteration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No way! A piñata?</td>
<td>محله! به خر این باینی؟</td>
<td>no way! a candy donkey?</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>امکان نداره، به پینیتا</td>
<td>it's impossible, a /piːniːta/</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Transliteration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What's that? The electric boogaloo?</td>
<td>این چیه؟ داری میرقصی؟</td>
<td>What is this? Are you dancing?</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Superordinate term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>این چیه مثل؟ بوگالوی الکتریکی؟</td>
<td>What is this for example? /ɛlektɹiːk buːɡalou?</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Transliteration</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.30 Examples of different strategies in rendering the same ST ECRs in *Hotel Transylvania 2*
In the renditions of the ECRs provided in Table 4.30 above, it can be observed that, in some cases, both subtitlers transliterated the ST ECR, whereas, in a number of cases, the subtitlers’ approach in treating the same ECR differs. To put it another way, unlike subtitler C, that has opted for Transliteration in all 4 examples, subtitler A has shown a tendency to provide more information and explanation for the ECR or to rephrase it in a way that is more accessible to the TT viewer. Another point that can be observed here is that subtitler A, in the cases that opted for Transliteration, also used quotation marks to indicate that the ECR is referring to a proper noun which, to some degree, can help the TT viewer differentiate the ECR from the rest of utterance in a given context. In rendering the ECRs in the first utterance (i.e. Santa Claus and Santa Cruz) for instance, as can be seen above, both subtitlers have opted for Transliteration. This is a fitting strategy in this particular case for the reason discussed below.

In this scene Mavis, Dracula’s daughter, is talking to her ‘human’ husband, Johnny. She believes the reason that he knows everything and (unlike her), does not look different to others is that he was born and raised in ‘Santa Cruz’ (a city in California), which she mistakenly pronounces as ‘Santa Claus’, but is corrected by him accordingly in the following line of the utterance. The TT equivalent for Santa Claus is (بابا نوئل) /bʌbʌ noel/ which is in fact derived from the French word ‘Père Noël’ or ‘Papa Noël’. The reason that both subtitlers have not opted for the strategy of Transcultural ECR substitution (i.e. replacing Santa Clause by (بابا نوئل), known to a third culture), may be the presence of the ECR Santa Cruz in the following line of the utterance, which corrects the mispronunciation of ‘Santa Claus’. Therefore, it would be incoherent to the TT viewer if Santa Claus was replaced by its TT equivalent in this given situation.

With regard to other strategies used in rendering the ECRs in the Table above, it can be argued that using strategies of Paraphrase or Specification in transferring the ECRs in some specific cases might not be the best solution the subtitlers could have chosen. In other words,
in cases where the viewer can benefit from the non-verbal visual channel (i.e. the picture), as one of the four semiotic channels in polysemiotic texts (e.g. films or TV programmes) defined by Gottlieb (1997), providing extra information or paraphrasing the term will add to ‘intersemiotic redundancy’. Using the Paraphrase strategy in transferring the ECR *piñata*\(^{35}\) into ‘a candy donkey’ by subtitler A in Table 4.30 above is a particular case in point. Image 4.8 below is provided to exemplify this strengthened intersemiotic link created by the subtitler.

On the other hand, and going away from the comfort zone of viewers, Transliteration might be a more felicitous strategy in transferring the above ECR; this is because the TT viewer can benefit from the information that the non-verbal visual channel carries, together with the transliteration of the ECR, which can be educational in that the audience will learn what */piːniːˈata/* refers to in the ST. Nevertheless, choosing the most apt strategy in transferring the ECRs (specifically by non-professional subtitlers) can be more flexible, depending on the given context. To put it another way, in the example provided earlier in Table 4.22 relating to

---

Image 4.8 Snapshot of the scene relating to the rendition of the ECR ‘*piñata*’ by subtitler A as shown in Table 4.30

---

\(^{35}\) A decorated vessel (such as of papier-mâché) filled with candies, fruits, and gifts and hung up to be broken with sticks by blindfolded persons as part of especially Latin American festivities (as at Christmas or for a birthday party) Merriam-Webster Dictionary
In the above example, Johnny, Dracula’s son-in-law is being introduced for the first time to Dracula’s dad, Vlad, who is quite harsh and frightening to him. Johnny wants to impress him by pretending to be a vampire, wearing a vampire costume and teeth, but he is so scared to say the line he has rehearsed, and ends up instead murmuring “bla bla black sheep have you any wool?” (a famous English nursery rhyme). In the relating TTs, as can be seen in the Table 4.31 above, subtitler C has opted for a Calque translation, which can also be classified as Shifted direct translation in this particular case, where optional shift occurs by the subtitler to make the TT less foreign to the TT audience, compared to Calque translation, where the obligatory shifts are imposed by the difference between the languages (Pedersen, 2005:5). In
other words, the first part (the interjection *bla bla*) has been shifted to (*ver ver ver*) which has the same effect as ‘blah blah’ (silly or pretentious chatter or nonsense)\footnote{Merriam-Webster Dictionary.} in the TT.

Subtitler A on the other hand, has rendered the ST ECR in a creative way in that “bla bla” has been replaced by “beleh beleh”, to rhyme with the first syllable of the word ‘/belderʧi:n/’ /بلدرچین/meaning ‘quail’ in the TT, and since quail does not have wool, the rest of the utterance has also been altered (i.e. ‘*have you any wool*’ has been replaced by ‘*why aren’t you woolly*’). This rendition transfers both the intended effect and the humour in the given context.

In what follows, examples pertaining to the combined strategies of Transliteration+Specification and Transliteration+Calque are provided.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Holy rabies!</td>
<td>يا خدا! بازي ليموب؟ من فيلا عاشق اين بازي بودم!</td>
<td>oh God! <em>/liːmbo/ game</em>? I used to love this game</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>+Transliteration Specification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limbo\footnote{A dance or contest that involves bending over backwards and passing under a horizontal pole lowered slightly for each successive pass (Merriam-Webster Dictionary).}?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I used to love that game!</td>
<td>ووى خدا! من عاشق اين بازي بودم</td>
<td>oh God! <em>I loved this game</em></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Omission</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.32 Example of Transliteration+Specification and Omission in *Hotel Transylvania 2*

In rendering the ECR *Limbo* in the table above, as can be seen, subtitler A has transliterated the ECR, as well as providing additional information (adding the word ‘game’) in the TT, which in this case could be redundant as the second line of the utterance indicates that it is a type of game the character used to love. Subtitler C, on the other hand, omitted the ECR, which might be due to the reason discussed (the presence of the word ‘game’ in the line
followed therefore, coherent enough for the TT audience as well as the visual aid). As discussed earlier, opting for Omission could also be due to subtitler’s lack of knowledge or even laziness.

A good example of applying the combined strategy of Transliteration+Calque observed in the corpus of this film was given in Chapter 3 (section 3.4.2, Example 12), in which the TT pertaining to the ECR Bluetooth was discussed in detail.

In what follows, the distribution of target-oriented strategies (both total and individual strategies in this group) is delineated, the examples pertaining to each category is given, and the TTs by the two subtitlers are compared.

---

**Figure 4.35 Total target-oriented strategies – absolute frequency – *Hotel Transylvania 2* (total n=74)**

---

**Figure 4.36 Total target-oriented strategies – relative frequency – *Hotel Transylvania 2***
Similar to what has been observed in the analysis of other three films so far, among target-oriented strategies in the TT corpus of *Hotel Transylvania 2*, Paraphrase is the most frequently used strategy (28%), followed by Superordinate term and Creative rendition (with identical occurrence, i.e. 16%), TC ECR, and Omission occurring (12% and 10% respectively), Transcultural ECR, Meaning shift and Situational substitution, which have shown a relatively similar distribution. The number of Creative renditions in the TT corpus of this film, as can be observed, is more than that of the other three films analysed so far, which might be due to the predominant presence of the element of humour in the film and the implication of ECRs in a humour-saturated plot. In order to analyse and compare the TTs produced by the subtitlers in this group, a number of examples which stand out more in the corpus of this film are given below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Love your chocolate cereal</td>
<td>از صبحونه، هي شکلاتي كه عکست روشه، خيلي خوشم ميدا</td>
<td>I like <em>the</em> chocolate breakfasts with your picture on it</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>عاشق شکلات هاتون</td>
<td>I love your chocolates</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.33 Example of Paraphrase in *Hotel Transylvania 2*

In the above example, Dracula, ‘Drac’, and his entourage (the monsters and Dennis, his grandson) are wandering in a park. Drac is trying to make the monsters perform their exceptional abilities to inspire Dennis to find his inner monster. A passing car stops, and the driver asks Drac if he knows a nearby place to eat. The woman sitting next to the driver finds the situation embarrassing and so, to alleviate the embarrassment, the driver utters: “love
your chocolate cereal” and drives off. In the given context, ‘chocolate cereal’ is in fact a reference to a well-known chocolate cereal in the SC, i.e. *Count Chocula* (image 4.9 below), which, together with *Franken Berry*, were the first two cereals to be introduced as part of General Mills’ Monster Cereals in 1970s.

![Image 4.9 ‘Count Chocula’, the referent of the ECR chocolate cereal as shown in Table 4.33 above](image)

Since the ECR is not known to the TC, both subtitlers opted for Paraphrase strategy to make it accessible for the TT audience. It can be argued that subtitler A has produced a paraphrase with sense transfer (Pedersen, 2005:8), whereas the intended connotation is lost in the paraphrase by subtitler C.

In the following examples, the strategy of replacing an ECR with a Superordinate term in the corpus of this film is provided.
Can you get me some ice cream with anchovies?38

Can you bring me ice cream and fish?

Mishé brám béstí na márí biárí?

Méyonti wássínbéstí na márí bígyér?

A

Superordinate term

Can you get me ice cream and fish?

Méyonti wássínbéstí na márí bígyér?

C

Superordinate term

have you tried this Slurpee?

have you tried this drink?

Aín nöshidénti ro amatán kerdí?

A

Superordinate term

have you ever made its sound?

Carsásí rá ná hálá dáí aorí bódí?

C

Creative rendition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Can you get me some ice cream with anchovies?38?</td>
<td>ميشه يرام بستني يا ماهي بياري؟</td>
<td>can you bring me ice cream and fish?</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Superordinate term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>مييونتي واسم بستني يا ماهي بيغيري؟</td>
<td>can you get me ice cream and fish?</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Superordinate term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>have you tried this Slurpee?</td>
<td>اين نوشيدني رو امتحان كردي؟</td>
<td>have you tried this drink?</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Superordinate term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>صدشاس رو تا حالا در أورده بودي؟</td>
<td>have you ever made its sound?</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Creative rendition</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.34 Example of Superordinate term in Hotel Transylvania 2

In the first example above, the ECR anchovies has been generalised by both subtitlers as ‘fish’, which seems an apt rendition in this case. In other words, using Transliteration (/æŋʃəvɪs/) or the combined strategy of Transliteration+Specification (/æŋʃəvɪs/ fish) would not be the most felicitous solutions, as in the former the ECR would be inaccessible, and in the latter it would be space-consuming (even though not intrinsically negative). In the second example, on the other hand, the ECR Slurpee (a frozen carbonated beverage sold at 7-Eleven stores in the United States) has been replaced by a more generalised term ‘drink’ by subtitler A, whereas in the TT produced by subtitler C, a Creative rendition is observed, as, with the aid of audio channel, it transfers the specificity of the sound produced while drinking this beverage (this rendition will be discussed further in Chapter 5).

38 Anchovies are silver, slender salty little fish found mainly around the Black Sea and the Pacific and Atlantic, as well as the Mediterranean. They’re generally filleted, salt-cured and packed in oil or salt in tins or jars.
As mentioned earlier, the number of Creative renditions in the TTs pertaining to Hotel Transylvania 2 was higher than that of other films, due to the ‘humanised’ vampire theme which was the predominant concept of humour in the film. A couple of examples of Creative renditions observed in this film were discussed in Chapter 3 (section 3.4.2, Example 13). More examples are provided in the Table 4.35 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>all he needs is time with his Vampa</td>
<td>دنها جیزی که لازم داره اینه که با &quot;خون بابا&quot; وقت بگذرنfce</td>
<td>all he needs is to spend time with his &quot;/khu:n baba/&quot;</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Creative rendition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-it's the vampire summer camp.</td>
<td>اینجا اردوگاه تابستانی خون آشامهاست.</td>
<td>this is the vampires' summer camp. What is it? /ordu: khu:ni:?</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Creative rendition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-What's it? Camp Vamp?</td>
<td>اینجا اردوگاه تابستانی خون آشامهاست.</td>
<td>this is the vampires' summer camp. What is it? /ordu: fəm/</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Creative rendition</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.35 Example of Creative rendition in Hotel Transylvania 2

In the above examples, the fictitious ECRs Vampa (vampire grandpa) and Camp Vamp (vampire camp) have been rendered in a creative way by both subtitlers, in that subtitler A has rendered Vampa to (خون بابا) /khu:n baba/ which can be word-for-word translated as ‘bloodpa’ (/khu:n/=blood, /baba/=father/grandfather) and Camp Vamp has been rendered to ‘blood camp’ (اردوگاه خون آشام) /ordu: khu:ni:/ ( /ordu:/=camp / khu:ni:/= containing blood), both renditions transfer the connotation as well as intended humour. Subtitler C similarly has rendered both ECRs creatively; (i.e. Vampa to (بابا شام) /babaʃam/ as the word for vampire in TT is خون آشام /khu:nʃam/ (/khu:n/=blood /ʃam/=sucker) and /ordu: fəm/ for Camp Vamp
(ˈɔrdʒamp/ (meaning (blood)sucker here). In both renditions the elements of creativity and humour have been taken into account by the subtitler.

Another strategy that was used quite often in the corpus of this film was that of cultural substitution by TC ECR. The example below is a particular case in point.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-remember what we played when you were little?</td>
<td>/gayem bafak/ and looking for sharp objects</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hide and Go Seek Sharp Objects</td>
<td>/gayem bafak/ and looking for sharp objects</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.36 Example of TC ECR in *Hotel Transylvania 2*

In this example, Drac and his daughter Mavis have transformed into bats and are playing the games they used to play when Mavis was little, when Drac utters the above. The ECR *Hide and Go Seek* (popular children’s game) has been replaced by its TC equivalent /gayem bafak/ by both subtitlers as an accessible ECR for the TT audience.

The examples of other strategies in target-oriented group (i.e. Omission, Transcultural and Situational substitution) are provided below.
In this scene, Drac is asking the Monsterwolf Wayne to kill a deer to inspire to Dennis find his inner monster. As Wayne and other monsters are more modernised and less savage compared to previously, he is reluctant to obey Drac’s command and utters: “I haven't done this in years. We don't need to kill anymore, we have Pop-Tarts!”

The ECR Pop-Tart in the above example has been replaced by ‘frozen pizza’ by subtitler A, and paraphrased by subtitler C. Replacing Pop-Tarts with ‘frozen pizza’ might not be the best choice at the first glance, as the ECR has been removed and replaced by another ECR that does not refer to the same thing. However, the reason for this replacement might be the fact that Pop-Tarts and ‘frozen pizza’ have at least one thing in common; they are both junk food. Therefore, this might be an apt choice in this case, as the TT ECR to some degree transfers the intended connotation and, hence, fits the given situation.

It can be argued that some cases of ECR renderings end up in grey areas between Situational substitution and Transcultural substitution. In the above case, for instance, the ECR Pop-Tarts is absolutely unknown to the TC viewer (and there is no equivalent product for Pop-Tarts in the TC) however, it has been replaced by ‘frozen pizza’ which is a totally different

---

39 Pop-Tarts are rectangular shaped toaster pastries by Kellogg Company that are filled with different fillings and covered with sweet tasting frostings. They are traditionally served hot at breakfast time and are popular in the United States.
thing but known to both SC and TC that also fits the situation. On the other hand, there are cases where a relevant equivalent can be found in the TL for the ST ECR, which is in fact known to a third culture and does not necessarily belong to the TL. The examples below are particular cases in point.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitle</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>He climbs walls and wears a <em>cape</em></td>
<td>اون از دیوار بالا میره و شنل میپوشه</td>
<td>He climbs walls and wears a <em>cape</em></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Transcultural ECR</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitle</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>We’re gonna make the birthday a <em>masquerade</em> party.</td>
<td>میخواهیم یه جشن تولد بالماسکه هیولایی بگیریم</td>
<td>we are going to have a monster <em>masquerade</em> for birthday</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Transcultural ECR</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.38 Examples of Transcultural ECR in *Hotel Transylvania 2*

In the above examples both ECRs (i.e. *cape* and *masquerade*) have been replaced by their equivalent in the TT which are in fact known to a third culture, i.e. French. It should be pointed out that Persian has a lot of words of French origin, which have been standardised and are still used today. The gradual entry of a large number of loan words into Persian from French began in the 19th century and continued through the 20th century, as part of the process of modernisation of culture and society in Persia/Iran. Several political and educational factors played a significant part in the selection and derivation of these

---

40 *A sleeveless outer garment or part of a garment that fits closely at the neck and hangs loosely over the shoulders. Merriam-Webster Dictionary.*
borrowings (Deyhime, 2012). Before the fall of the Shah (the 1979 revolution), French was
the language of culture in Iran and was regarded as an indication of sophistication and
etiquette in those days. Most of these borrowed French words in Persian have a very similar
pronunciation to the original word in French (e.g. /televi:zi:on/ for ‘television’ or /ʌbuneman/
for ‘abonnement’ (subscription).
Since the source language in the present study is English (and not French), therefore, the loan
words from French language in the TT have not been categorised as Calque (loan
translation); instead, they have been classified as Transcultural substitution (known to a third
culture, i.e. French). Nevertheless, as mentioned earlier, the classifications made in the study
are tentative and largely depend on the researcher’s interpretation of the definitions and the
taxonomy of ECR transfer strategy by Pedersen (2011). This means that a form of language
that may bias categorisation in a certain way for European languages may need to be
rethought when used for other languages.
In the examples shown in Table 4.38 above, the first ECR (cape) has been replaced by (شنل)
/ʃenel/, derived from the French word ‘chenille’ referring to a type of thick fabric. In the TC,
this kind of fabric (in the past) was used to make a piece of garment very similar to a cloak
which was accordingly called /ʃenel/. Therefore, it cannot be considered as a Calque strategy
(loan translation), as the TT ECR (/ʃenel/) does not have its origins in the SL. This is also the
case with the second ECR (masquerade), which has been replaced by the loan word from
French (bal masqué) with a very similar pronunciation to the original word (/balmase/) in
TT.
The last strategy which does not belong to source nor to target-oriented group (Official
equivalent) is exemplified below.
In this scene, the monster magician, *Harry Three-Eye*, is doing a magic trick, guessing the cards the audience choose, which in this case is a *three of spades*. As can be seen in the Table above, both subtitlers have rendered *spades* to (پیک) /pi:k/ which can be classified as Official equivalent for the ST ECR. The associated numbers can be called just as the actual number (as in the TT relating to subtitler C, ‘three’) or the number can be accompanied by the suffix /lu:/ (as in the case with the first TT, ‘three=/se/+lu:/’(/selu:/)), which is in fact an old version of referring to the numbers in the card game in TL. It should be noted that playing card games in public has been banned in Iran since the Islamic Revolution in 1979. However, these equivalents were generated a long time ago and people still play card games in private and they are quite popular among both young and old individuals.

In what follows, the distribution of source and target-oriented strategies by subtitlers A and C throughout the corpus of *Hotel Transylvania 2* is shown and discussed accordingly (Figures 4.37-4.40).

---

The card game in general is called ‘Pasur’/pasuːr/ in Persian and the symbols are (/pi:k/=Spades, /khɑːʤ/ or /gɛfniːz/=Clubs, /kheʃt/=Diamonds, /del/=Hearts).
Figure 4.37 Total source-oriented strategies by subtitlers (A & C) in absolute frequencies – *Hotel Transylvania 2* (total n: 36)

![Bar chart showing absolute frequencies of source-oriented strategies by subtitlers A and C in *Hotel Transylvania 2*](chart1.png)

Figure 4.38 Total source-oriented strategies by subtitlers (A & C) in relative frequencies in *Hotel Transylvania 2*

![Pie chart showing relative frequencies of source-oriented strategies by subtitlers A and C in *Hotel Transylvania 2*](chart2.png)

Figure 4.39 Total target-oriented strategies by subtitlers (A & C) in absolute frequencies – *Hotel Transylvania 2* (total n: 74)

![Bar chart showing absolute frequencies of target-oriented strategies by subtitlers A and C in *Hotel Transylvania 2*](chart3.png)
The total distribution of target-oriented strategies, as can be seen, is somewhat higher (almost twofold), compared to source-oriented strategies (74 and 36 respectively), which may suggest that, in treating the ECRs in this film, subtitlers have tried to bring the SC closer to TC and make the ECRs more accessible for the TT audience; however, they thereby also take away the opportunity of learning new elements of the source culture. Another point that can be noticed in the Tables above is that subtitler A, unlike the pattern observed in the other three films analysed so far, has shown more tendency in opting for target-oriented strategies in *Hotel Transylvania 2*. This might be due to more Creative renditions and Generalisation strategies produced by this subtitler, as a result of the abundant presence of humour in the story plot and the mixed theme of vampire-human (vampire side leading to more creative renditions and the human side of the story entailing ECRs relating to modern lifestyle of the ST (the United States)), leading to generalisation, in order to make the ECRs more coherent and accessible for the TT audience. Subtitler C on the other hand, has shown a similar pattern as in *Frozen* (i.e. in both films, *Frozen* and *Hotel Transylvania 2*, subtitler C has shown more tendency in applying target-oriented strategies). However, in the corpus of this film, subtitler C has shown a slightly higher number of source-oriented strategies compared to subtitler A. Since the number of ECRs identified differs in each film, a more systematic result can be
obtained when the analysis of all films is made and the similarities and/or differences in treating the ECRs by the subtitlers in each film and accordingly the pattern each subtitlers individually presents can be observed.

Table 4.40 below illustrates the distribution of the strategies in both groups (source and target-oriented) by each individual subtitler (A and C) as well as in total in the animated film Hotel Transylvania 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>A</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>Total (in the given film)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hotel Transylvania 2</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Source-oriented Strategies</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transliteration</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transliteration+Specification</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calque</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transliteration+Calque</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shifted</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total (by Subtitler in the given film)</strong></td>
<td><strong>17</strong></td>
<td><strong>19</strong></td>
<td><strong>36</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Target-oriented Strategies</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Superordinate Term</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transcultural ECR</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TC ECR</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Situational</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Omission</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative Rendition</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meaning Shift</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total (by Subtitler in the given film)</strong></td>
<td><strong>38</strong></td>
<td><strong>36</strong></td>
<td><strong>74</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Official equivalent</strong></td>
<td><strong>3</strong></td>
<td><strong>3</strong></td>
<td><strong>6</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.40 Distribution of source and target-oriented strategies by each individual subtitler and in total in the animated film Hotel Transylvania 2
4.1.5 Analysis of the Animated Feature Film Zootopia

Zootopia, (also known as Zootropolis), directed by Byron Howard and Rich Moore, is a 2016 American 3D computer-animated comedy film produced by Walt Disney Animation Studios and released by Walt Disney Pictures. Zootopia is in fact the US title, which was changed to Zootropolis for the UK audiences. A number of factors were involved in changing the title in order to avoid any confusion for UK and some other European audiences. For example, “Zootopia” is the name of collection of children’s songs in the UK, as well as a well-known zoo in Denmark (Cunningham, 2016). This animated feature film received excellent reviews, with critics calling Zootopia “the whole package” and “one of the greatest Disney animated movies the company has ever produced” for taking on important social issues while mixing them with humorous pop culture references, making the film suitable for both children and adults (Cunningham and Verhoeven, 2016). It has earned a worldwide gross of over $1 billion42. A plot summary of the film is provided in Chapter 3 (section 3.3.2).

The available subtitles for Zootopia were those of subtitler A and C’. The number of ECRs identified in this film was quite high (i.e. 38), therefore 76 TTs (by two subtitlers) were analysed, among which 16 were treated as source-oriented, 51 as target-oriented, and 9 as Official equivalent cases. The absolute and relative frequency of total source-oriented and target-oriented strategies applied by the two subtitlers in translating ECRs in this film is illustrated in Figures 4.41 and 4.42 below.

---

42 Box Office Mojo.
In treating the ECRs in the corpus of the film *Zootopia*, the subtitling behaviour observed is similar to that of *Frozen* and *Hotel Transylvania 2* in that, in all three films, the subtitlers have shown an inclination to use target-oriented strategies. In *Zootopia*, the number of target-oriented strategies is over three times higher than the number of source-oriented. In order to look closely into each category in the main two groups (source- and target-oriented), the distribution of these strategies needs to be observed. To this end, in what follows, the sharing of each strategy in the source-oriented group is illustrated, a few pertinent examples are given, and the TTs (of subtitler A and subtitler C) are compared to see if any similarities and/or differences are observed. The same procedure will be carried out for target-oriented strategies accordingly.
The most frequently used strategy in this group, as can be seen, is that of Calque (47%), followed by the strategies of Transliteration and Transliteration+Specification (occurring 25% and 19% respectively), and finally Transliteration+Calque (12%). The pattern observed here is very similar to the distribution of source-oriented strategies observed in the analysis of the film *Inside Out* (see Figures 4.23 and 4.24). In both films, Calque has been used frequently, and other strategies in this group occurred at a lower level and fairly equally. However, in the other three films (*Frozen*, *Despicable Me 2*, and *Hotel Transylvania 2*), Transliteration was observed to be the foremost strategy in this group. An example of using Calque strategy in rendering the identified ECRs in *Zootopia* is given below and the TTs are compared accordingly.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Bullpen's</em> over there to the left.</td>
<td>أغلاز اونطرفه، دست چپ</td>
<td><em>bullpen is that way, to the left</em></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Calque</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>اتاقش اونجا سمت چپ</td>
<td><em>the room is there, to the left</em></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.41 Example of Calque and Paraphrase in *Zootopia*

In the example above, it is the rabbit Officer Hopps’s first day at work (at the Zootopia Police Department) and she is asking directions to the location where they do the roll call, when she is advised: “*Bullpen’s* over there to the left”. There are two connotations to ‘Bullpen’; the literal meaning refers to an enclosure for keeping bulls (or livestock, in general), and the slang meaning is used to describe an open work area not divided into offices 43 (i.e. a workplace filled with desks, rather than separating walls (see Image 4.10 below)). The first TT (subtitler A) is the literal translation of the term, which would sound odd if the context was not an ‘animal’ police department; however, in this particular case the literal meaning of the ECR fits the situation. Nevertheless, the intended meaning in this given context is the figurative meaning of ‘Bullpen’, capitalised in the original transcript. Subtitler C on the other hand, has generalised the term as ‘the room’ (i.e. the room where the roll call is carried out). Both renderings though are accessible to the TT viewer.

43 Merriam-Webster Dictionary.
Examples of Transliteration+Specification and Transliteration+Calque observed in the corpus of this film are provided in Tables 4.42 and 4.43 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>You played cribbage with a weasel once</td>
<td>تویه بارت با یه راسو ورق باری کردی</td>
<td>you once played cards with a weasel</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Superordinate term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>تویه بارت با یه راسو &quot;کربیج&quot; باری میکینی (یه نوع باری با ورق)</td>
<td>you play /kri:bedʒ/ with a weasel (a type of card game)</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Transliteration+ Specification</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.42 Example of Transliteration+Specification in Zootopia

In the above example, the ST ECR cribbage has been generalised by subtitler A as ‘cards’, a superordinate term (i.e. treating cribbage as a type of card game). Subtitler C, however, has transliterated the ECR as well as providing an explanation for the term in brackets (/kri:bedʒ/ (a type of card game)), the advantage and drawback of which was discussed earlier in the chapter. In the Table below, the strategy of Transliteration+Calque has been applied by both subtitlers in rendering the same ECR.
I'm going to be a police officer

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>من قراره یه افسر پلیس بشم</td>
<td>I'm going to be /æfsær-e-polisi:s/</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Transliteration+Calque</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>قراره که من یه مامور پلیس بشم</td>
<td>I'm going to be a /mæmu:r-e-polisi:s/</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Transliteration+Calque</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.43 Example of Transliteration+Calque in Zootopia

Pedersen (2007:37) considers American police titles as ST ECRs in the corpus of his study, to be mainly treated as Official equivalent; yet in some occasions where it appears that an Official equivalent has been used, it often turns out that a non-entrenched cultural substitute has been used instead. He offers the example of Captain (an American police title), which has been rendered to /kommissarie/ in the Swedish subtitle, and / kommissær/ in the Danish subtitle. In other words, kommissarie/kommissær seem to be the Scandinavian Official equivalents for Captain; however, throughout the corpus of his study, this ECR has also been rendered as /polischef/.

This is also the case with the renditions of police titles observed in the corpus of Zootopia. In the above example, in rendering the ECR Police Officer, it can be argued that both strategies of Official equivalent and Transliteration+Calque have been used. Police is in fact a loan word, which has been standardised in the TT (پلیس) (/poli:s/); however, Officer, has been rendered by subtitler A as (افسر) /æfsær/, meaning a high-ranked police and (مامور) /mæmu:r/ meaning ‘agent’ by subtitler C. The second rendition also can be referred to as a type of generalisation, in that /mæmu:r-e-polisi:s/ is a more general term that does not specify the rank, while /æfsær-e-polisi:s/ refers to a higher rank. Another rendition that has been observed for ‘Officer’ in the corpus of this film is (جناب سروان) /jenab særvan/, which is higher in rank.
compared to the two other renditions. Nevertheless, since the ST ‘Officer’ can refer to different titles in the TT, the renditions cannot be considered as specific Official equivalents.

With regard to the single strategy of Transliteration, only two cases were observed throughout the corpus of this film (both by subtitler C); the title of the film (زوتوپيا) /zu:topi:ʌ/ and the food ECR donut as (دونات) /donʌt/.

As discussed earlier, the number of target-oriented strategies in the corpus of Zootopia was observed to be much higher than the number of source-oriented strategies. The distribution of the strategies in this group are illustrated below (Figures 4.45 and 4.46), followed by the examples pertaining to each strategy and the TTs analysis accordingly.

![Figure 4.45 Total target-oriented strategies – absolute frequency – Zootopia (total n=51)](image1)

![Figure 4.46 Total target-oriented strategies – relative frequency – Zootopia](image2)
Among target-oriented strategies, Paraphrase (37%), Creative rendition (18%), TC ECR (17%) and Superordinate term (14%) have been used more frequently compared to other strategies in this group. Similar to other 4 films, Paraphrase is the most frequently used strategy in the target-oriented group. In addition to this, as in to Hotel Transylvania 2, a quite high number of Creative renditions has been observed in Zootopia. A few examples of the strategies the subtitlers opted for more frequently in the corpus of Zootopia are delineated below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>we're all good on bunny scout cookies</td>
<td>ارخگوش‌های پیشاهمگ شیرینی خریدیم</td>
<td>we have already bought enough sweets from scout rabbits</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>جون ما به اندازه کافی شیرینی خرگوشی داریم</td>
<td>because we have enough rabbit sweets</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.44 Example of Paraphrase in Zootopia

In the above example, the ST ECR bunny scout cookies is in fact an adaptation from (and a reference to) ‘Girl Scout Cookies’⁴⁴, a fundraising activity that has been ongoing in the SC since 1910s, and therefore known to the SC but not to the TC viewer. In the given scene, Officer Hopps is looking for a missing otter who was last seen in an establishment called ‘The Mystic Spring Oasis’. Officer Hopps approaches a meditating Hippie, Yax, to ask whether he has seen the missing otter, but before she even starts to talk, since Yax would never think a rabbit can be an Officer and assumes she is trying to sell cookies, utters: “you know, I’m gonna hit the pause button right there, cause we’re all good on Bunny Scout

⁴⁴ Girl Scout Cookies are cookies sold by Girl Scouts of the USA (GSUSA) as one of its major fundraisers for local Scout units. Members of the GSUSA have been selling cookies since 1917 to raise funds.
Cookies.” Both subtitlers have paraphrased the ST ECR. Subtitler A has rendered ‘scout’ as /pi:ʃʌhæŋ/, which can also be considered an Official equivalent, yet the whole ECR has been paraphrased to sweets from scout rabbits; furthermore, both subtitlers have also generalised ‘cookies’ to ‘sweets’. Subtitler C, however, has provided a paraphrase with sense reduction, as the word ‘scout’ has been omitted therefore, the specificity of the ST ECR is lost in the TT.

In another utterance, however, subtitler C has provided a rendition for ‘scout’ as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>ST</strong></th>
<th><strong>TT</strong></th>
<th><strong>Back translation</strong></th>
<th><strong>Subtitler</strong></th>
<th><strong>Strategy</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>all I wanted to do was join the Junior Ranger Scouts.</td>
<td>و تمام آزموم عضو شدن در گروه پیشانگان جوان بود</td>
<td>all my dream was to join young scout group</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Calque</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>the only thing I wanted to do was to join young commando forces</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Transcultural ECR</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.45 Example of Calque and Transcultural substitution in Zootopia

In rendering the ST ECR above, subtitler A has provided the same equivalent as in the previous example (Table 4.44 above), i.e. /pi:ʃʌhæŋ/+/ən/(plural suffix)=/pi:ʃʌhæŋən/(scouts), while subtitler C, however, has substituted the ST ECR with an ECR which is known to both cultures, i.e. ‘commando forces’.

As mentioned earlier in the Methodology Chapter (section 3.5), throughout the corpus there were cases where an utterance contained more than one ECR. In these cases, the same utterance was transferred to the analysis table according to the number of ECRs identified in the utterance, each time marking one ECR to be analysed. The table below illustrates the point of discussion.
Example of multiple ECRs occurring in one utterance observed in Zootopia

In this scene, Yax, is describing the missing otter as seen the last time at ‘The Mystic Spring Oasis’. As can be seen, a number of four ST ECRs have been identified in the utterance above (marked in italics). The relating TTs has been segmented into four different entries in the Table 4.47 below for the purpose of clarity in the analysis.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a green <em>cable knit sweater</em></td>
<td>جلیقه‌ی بافته‌ی سبز</td>
<td>a green knitted vest</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Superordinate term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>یه سوییشترت باقتفتی</td>
<td>a knitted /suːiːʃərt/</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Superordinate term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a new pair of <em>corduroy</em> slacks</td>
<td>با یه شلوار راحتی</td>
<td>comfy trousers</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>و یه شلوار مخمول نو</td>
<td>new velvet trousers</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a <em>paisley</em> tie</td>
<td>یه کراوات فشنگ با طرح بوته جقه</td>
<td>a beautiful tie with /boteh djegeh/ design</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>TC ECR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>یه کراوات نقش ترنج</td>
<td>a /torændʒ/ patterned tie</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>TC ECR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sweet <em>Windsor knot</em></td>
<td>با گره ی بزرگ</td>
<td>with a big knot</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>با &quot;/viːndsɔr/&quot; گره ویندسور</td>
<td>with a &quot;/viːndsɔr/&quot; knot</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Transliteration</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.47 Example of the presence of several ECRs identified in a single utterance in *Zootopia*

The first identified ECR (i.e. *cable knit sweater*, referring to a specific style of knitting), has been generalised using a superordinate term by both subtitlers ‘knitted vest’ and ‘knitted sweatshirt’ (which is pronounced as /suːiːʃərt/ in the TT and can also be considered as a loan

---

45 A durable usually cotton pile fabric with vertical ribs or wales – Merriam-Webster Dictionary.
46 Of Persian origin, paisley is an ornamental design on fabrics using the buta or boteh (بته shaped- a teardrop ) with a curved upper end, which has become popular in the West.
translation). The second ECR (i.e. corduroy slacks, referring to a specific type of trousers made with corduroy fabric) has been paraphrased as ‘comfy trousers’ by subtitler A (as corduroy trousers are normally loose fitting), while subtitler C has paraphrased the ECR as ‘velvet’ trousers, since corduroy is, in essence, a ridged form of velvet. Both renditions transfer the sense and are accessible for the TT viewer. For the third ECR (i.e. paisley tie), both subtitlers have replaced the SC ECR with the TC ECR, using two different TTs ((جقه) /boteh dżegheh/ and (تورنز) /torændʒ/), both referring to the ‘paisley’ pattern. The last ECR (i.e. Windsor knot, referring to a style of tying a necktie which produces a wide knot) has been paraphrased by subtitler A as ‘big knot’, making it accessible for the TT viewer, while subtitler C transliterated the ECR ((ويندسور) /vi:ndsor/” knot), keeping the element of source culture in the TT since from the co-text (paisley tie) it is obvious that the ECR (Windsor knot) refers to a type of knot used for ties, although, it is not clear which type of knot it refers to.

As mentioned earlier, similar to what was observed in Hotel Transylvania 2, the number of Creative renditions observed in the corpus of Zootopia was quite high compared to the other three films. A couple of examples of this strategy in the TTs of Zootopia are given in Table 4.48 below.
In the scene related to the first ST ECR (i.e. the reference to Jerry Vole), Officer Hopps and the fox Nick, her assistant, are searching inside a car, trying to find the missing otter, when Nick finds a CD (Image 4.11), the cover of which reads: “The Velvety Pipes of Jerry Vole” (the title of the CD is also uttered by Nick). The ECR Jerry Vole is in fact a reference to the well-known American singer and actor, Jerry Vale (1950s and 1960s), unknown to the TC audience (specifically the young audience). Subtitler A has produced a creative rendition, in that Jerry Vole has been replaced by ‘Jerry the ferret’, which is coherent to the image on the

47 “Kum ba yah” (“Come by Here”) is a spiritual song first recorded in the 1920s. It became a standard campfire song in scouting and summer camps and enjoyed broader popularity during the folk revival of the 1950s and 1960s.
CD cover, while at the same time, being humorous and ironic to the rendition of the name of the album (i.e. ‘Velvety Pipes’ has been rendered to (ألبوم پلنگستان /pælængestan albom/). The rendition /pælængestan/ is in fact /pælæng/+/estan/ (/pælæng/=leopard /and /estan/ a suffix (/istan or stan/) with ancient Persian roots, meaning ‘a land’ or ‘a place of’, as in Uzbekistan or Kyrgyzstan. Therefore, the rendition /pælængestan/ album by Jerry the ferret (a ferret singing for the land of leopards) sounds humorous and creative in the TT, despite the fact that the SC referent ‘i.e. Jerry Vole’ is lost in the TT. Subtitler C, on the other hand, has transliterated the ST ECR ”/ʤeri:vʌl/”, which does not transfer the intended humour nor the SC reference, and is, therefore, inaccessible for the TT viewer.

In the second example above, the ST ECR Kumbaya has been rendered creatively by subtitler A, in that the ECR is replaced by the name of a famous Persian pop song (همه جی آرومه /hæmefi: ærumeh/) meaning ‘everything is at peace and harmony’, which transfers the intended connotation of harmony and peace in the utterance, and is known as a popular song to the TT audience. It can be argued that subtitler A’s rendition can also be classified as TC.
ECR, as the ST ECR has been replaced by something that is merely known to the target culture. Nevertheless, considering the given genre, the element of creativity and the subtle element of humour integrated to the rendition is of more significance in classifying the TTs.

Subtitler C has transliterated the same ST ECR (i.e. *Kumbaya*), as well as providing a brief explanation in brackets for the ECR therefore, using the combined strategy of Transliteration+Specification.

In what follows, a couple of examples relating to the strategies of Omission and Official equivalent observed in the TT corpus of *Zootopia* are given.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
<th>Back translation</th>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TEN HUT!</td>
<td>Ø</td>
<td>Ø</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Omission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>خبردار! /kʰæbærðaɾ/!</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Official</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Hall is right up my tail to find them</td>
<td>شهرداری من رو مامور کرده که اونا رو پیدا کنم</td>
<td>the /fæhrdæri:/ has assigned me to find them</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Official</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>شهرداری ازم خواسته که پیدا نکنم</td>
<td>the /fæhrdæri:/ has asked me to find them</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Official</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.49 Example of Omission and Official equivalent in *Zootopia*

The first ECR in the Table above, *TEN HUT*, which is in fact an American military term meaning ‘Come to attention!’’, has been omitted by subtitler A, yet subtitler C has replaced the ECR by its Official equivalent in the TT (خبردار /kʰæbærðaɾ/), a military term used to draw the attention of the subordinates of the arrival/entrance of a high ranked Officer.
Both subtitlers have replaced the second ECR, *City Hall*, with its TT Official equivalent (شہرداری /خان).  
In what follows, the distribution of source and target-oriented strategies by subtitlers A and C throughout the corpus of *Zootopia* is illustrated and discussed accordingly (Figures 4.47-4.50).

![Figure 4.47 Total source-oriented strategies by subtitlers (A & C) in absolute frequencies – *Zootopia* (total n: 16)](image1)

![Figure 4.48 Total source-oriented strategies by subtitlers (A & C) in relative frequencies in *Zootopia*](image2)
It can be observed that both subtitlers have shown a very similar pattern of sharing, pertaining to the two main groups (source- and target-oriented) in *Hotel Transylvania 2* and *Zootopia*. In other words, the number of source-oriented strategies in both films is higher in the TTs by subtitler C, whereas subtitler A has shown a slightly higher number of target-oriented strategies in both films (*Hotel Transylvania 2* and *Zootopia*). Nevertheless, both subtitlers have opted for target-oriented strategies considerably more frequently than source-oriented strategies in rendering the ST ECRs in both films (*Hotel Transylvania 2* and *Zootopia*). Table 4.50 below illustrates the distribution of the strategies in both groups (source and target-oriented) by each individual subtitler (A and C) as well as in total in the animated film *Zootopia*.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>A</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>Total (in the given film)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Source-oriented Strategies</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transliteration</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transliteration+Specification</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calque</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transliteration+Calque</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shifted</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total (by Subtitler in the given film)</strong></td>
<td><strong>5</strong></td>
<td><strong>11</strong></td>
<td><strong>16</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Target-oriented Strategies</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Superordinate Term</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transcultural ECR</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TC ECR</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Situational</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Omission</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative Rendition</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meaning Shift</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total (by Subtitler in the given film)</strong></td>
<td><strong>28</strong></td>
<td><strong>23</strong></td>
<td><strong>51</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Official equivalent</strong></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.50 Distribution of source and target-oriented strategies by each individual subtitler and in total in the animated film *Zootopia*

### 4.1.6 Conclusion

Having analysed all five selected films, the distribution of the source and target-oriented strategies in all films, as well as each individual subcategory pertaining to each group, is shown in the Tables 4.51-4.53 below. It should be pointed out that, since the number of identified ECRs varies in each film, and also because the number of films analysed is different for each subtitler (i.e. subtitler A: 5 films, subtitlers B and C: 3 films each), therefore, in the tables provided below only absolute values are shown. However, the relative frequency of applying the strategies relating to each individual subtitler will be shown by percentage later, in section 4.2 of the chapter.
A total number of 370 renditions shaped the TT corpus of the study, the distribution of which can be seen in the above Table. It can be observed that, in 3 out of 5 films (i.e. Frozen, Hotel Transylvania 2, and Zootopia), subtitlers have opted for target-oriented strategies more frequently, whereas in the film Despicable Me 2 more source-oriented strategies have been used, and the distribution of source and target-oriented strategies in the film Inside Out is identical with the highest number of Official equivalents compared to other films. It can be argued that, unlike Despicable Me 2 and Inside Out, where the characters are real humans, Hotel Transylvania 2 and Zootopia have human-fictitious themes and characters (vampire and speaking animals respectively), which might have entailed opting for more target-oriented strategies, such as Paraphrase, Creative rendition, and cultural substitutions. Frozen, also with a fairy tale theme, has been treated in the same way. In order to look into the subcategories of source and target-oriented groups, the distribution of each individual subcategory in each film and in total (throughout the corpus) has been illustrated in the following Tables (4.52 and 4.53).
It can be observed that Transliteration and Calque are respectively the most frequently used strategies in this group followed by the combined strategies of Transliteration+Specification and Transliteration+Calque. No cases of Shifted Direct translation have been observed, where the subtitlers perform some optional shifts on the ST ECR to make it more unobtrusive (Pedersen, 2005:5). Nevertheless, as mentioned earlier, obligatory shifts required by the differences between SL and TL, as language systems, have been made in the cases of Calque translations.

The same analysis needs to be made with regard to the target-oriented strategies observed throughout the corpus. Table 4.53 below delineates the distribution of target-oriented strategies in all 5 films. As can be observed, the number of Paraphrase strategy is significantly higher than that of other strategies in this group. Paraphrase, among other strategies in target-oriented group, is normally more space-consuming; however, its length and complexity depends on the degree of familiarity of the TT audience with the ST ECR. In other words, there is an inverse relation between the two (Pedersen, 2005:8). Using a Superordinate term and substituting the SC ECR with a TC ECR and also Creative renditions are the next most frequently used strategies in this group. Omission, Situational and
Transcultural substitution and the meaning shift cases were among the least frequent strategies the subtitlers opted for in this group.

Table 4.53 Distribution of target-oriented strategies in all 5 films (total n: 208)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Film</th>
<th>Superordinate term</th>
<th>Paraphrase</th>
<th>Transcultural ECR</th>
<th>TC ECR</th>
<th>Situational</th>
<th>Omission</th>
<th>Creative rendition</th>
<th>Meaning shift</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Frozen</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Despicable Me 2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inside Out</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotel Transylvania 2</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zootopia</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>26</strong></td>
<td><strong>81</strong></td>
<td><strong>14</strong></td>
<td><strong>22</strong></td>
<td><strong>16</strong></td>
<td><strong>17</strong></td>
<td><strong>22</strong></td>
<td><strong>10</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.53 Distribution of target-oriented strategies in all 5 films (total n: 208)

Table 4.54 below illustrates the categorisation of the strategies in terms of frequency of application by the subtitlers throughout the corpus.
Having analysed all films, the remaining section of the chapter is dedicated to an analysis based on the TTs produced by each subtitler, by making a comparison of their works to see whether the subtitlers (individually and/or collectively) show any specific patterns in treating the ST ECRs. Therefore, the main focus of the following section is on highlighting some of the most striking commonalities as well as differences in their subtitling behaviour.
4.2 Analysis by Subtitler

4.2.1 Analysing the subtitling behaviour of Subtitler A

As mentioned earlier in the chapter, among the three subtitlers, subtitler A’s works were available for all 5 selected films as opposed to other two subtitlers, each with 3 subtitles available out of 5 films.

As can be seen in Table 4.55 below, subtitler A, in total, has shown more tendency to use target-oriented strategies when treating the ST ECRs. Nevertheless, in the renditions relating to the ECRs in Despicable Me 2 and Inside Out, a more source-oriented inclination can be observed. The discrepancy between source and target-oriented strategies applied by this subtitler is noticeable in the films Hotel Transylvania 2 and Zootopia.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Film</th>
<th>Source-oriented Strategies</th>
<th>Target-oriented Strategies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Frozen</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Despicable Me 2</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inside Out</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotel Transylvania 2</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zootopia</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>62</strong></td>
<td><strong>99</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.55 Source and target-oriented strategies applied by subtitler A in each individual film and in total throughout the corpus

In order to observe the frequency of each strategy in source and target-oriented groups applied by subtitler A, each category has been analysed closely in the Tables 4.56 and 4.57 below.
As can be seen, subtitler A has opted for Calque and Transliteration more frequently in the source-oriented group. The cases of Transliteration+Calque/Specification are lower, which may be due to the temporal and spatial considerations relating to subtitling taken into account by the subtitler. Transliteration and Calque translation, on the other hand, are space-saving strategies, while keeping the ECRs more source-oriented and bringing the TC viewer closer to the SC.

With regard to target-oriented strategies, as can be seen in the Table 4.57 below, subtitler A has opted for Paraphrase considerably more often than other strategies in this group. It is interesting to note that the number of Paraphrase strategies used by this subtitler is very similar in the films Inside Out, Hotel Transylvania 2, and Zootopia. This is the same case with the number of TC ECRs and Creative renditions in Hotel Transylvania 2 and Zootopia (occurring identically). Other strategies used frequently by subtitler A are those of using a Superordinate term and substituting the SC ECR with a TC ECR, as well as producing creative renditions for the ECRs. The number of Superordinate terms observed in Hotel Transylvania 2 is quite high compared to other films (i.e. 9 cases).
In order to be able to make a systematic and valid analytical comparison of the subtitlers’ works, in what follows the same analysis is made on the TTs by subtitlers B and C (individually). This, together with the analysis relating to subtitler A, will subsequently answer the second research question (i.e. What are the most frequently applied translation strategies for Extralinguistic Cultural References (ECRs) in animated feature films subtitled from English into Persian?). This is followed by the comparison of the subtitling behaviour of the three subtitlers (collectively), which will answer the third research question (i.e. Are there any specific patterns of subtitling behaviour when dealing with ECRs that affect the way animated films are presented in the TC?).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Film</th>
<th>Superordinate term</th>
<th>Paraphrase</th>
<th>Transcultural ECR</th>
<th>TC ECR</th>
<th>Situational</th>
<th>Omission</th>
<th>Creative rendition</th>
<th>Meaning shift</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Frozen</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Despicable Me 2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inside Out</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotel Transylvania 2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zootopia</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>14</strong></td>
<td><strong>39</strong></td>
<td><strong>5</strong></td>
<td><strong>12</strong></td>
<td><strong>8</strong></td>
<td><strong>6</strong></td>
<td><strong>11</strong></td>
<td><strong>4</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.57 Target-oriented strategies applied by subtitler A in each individual film and in total throughout the corpus
4.2.2 Analysing the subtitling behaviour of Subtitler B

The distribution of the source and target-oriented strategies by subtitler B is fairly equal, both in total and in each individual film, as can be observed in Table 4.58 below. Nevertheless, in the film *Frozen*, the target-oriented strategies are somewhat higher than the source-oriented strategies. Similar to subtitler A, the most frequently used strategies under the source-oriented group by subtitler B are those of Transliteration and Calque. The distribution of the combined strategies of Transliteration+Specification/Calque is identical to that of subtitler A (Table 4.59 below).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subtitler B</th>
<th>Film</th>
<th>Source-oriented Strategies</th>
<th>Target-oriented Strategies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Frozen</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Despicable Me 2</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Inside Out</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.58 Source and target-oriented strategies applied by subtitler B in each individual film and in total throughout the corpus

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(Subtitler B) Source-oriented Strategies</th>
<th>Transliteration</th>
<th>Transliteration+ Specification</th>
<th>Calque</th>
<th>Transliteration+ Calque</th>
<th>Shifted</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Frozen</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Despicable Me 2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inside Out</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.59 Source-oriented strategies applied by subtitler B in each individual film and in total throughout the corpus

With regard to target-oriented strategies (Table 4.60 below), subtitler B has opted for Paraphrase strategy considerably more frequently than other strategies in this group, which is a similar pattern shown by subtitler A above. Contrary to subtitler A, no cases of Creative renditions were observed in the TTs produced by subtitler B. Using cultural substitutions was observed to be the lowest applied strategy in this group by subtitler B. The number of Meaning shift is equal to that of subtitler A; however, it should be noted that the total number of TTs by the two subtitlers are not identical (as mentioned earlier), therefore, this can
suggest that the number of Meaning shifts by subtitler B could be relatively higher than that of subtitler A.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Film</th>
<th>Superordinate term</th>
<th>Paraphrase</th>
<th>Transcultural ECR</th>
<th>TC ECR</th>
<th>Situational</th>
<th>Omission</th>
<th>Creative rendition</th>
<th>Meaning shift</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Frozen</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Despicable Me 2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inside Out</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.60 Target-oriented strategies applied by subtitler A in each individual film and in total throughout the corpus

The same analysis is made with regard to the TTs produced by subtitler C in Tables 4.61-4.63 below, to observe the commonalities/differences in the three subtitlers’ works.

4.2.3 Analysing the subtitling behaviour of Subtitler C

Subtitler C, as can be seen in the Table 4.61 below, has shown a more target-oriented pattern in treating the ECRs throughout the corpus. This is similar to the pattern demonstrated by subtitler A in that, not only is a tendency towards target-oriented strategies observed, but also the difference between the distribution of these two groups is significant.
A similar pattern can be observed to that of subtitlers A and B in terms of distribution of source-oriented strategies in Table 4.62 below. To put it another way, subtitler C (like the other two subtitlers) has opted for Transliteration and Calque strategies more frequently, compared to other strategies that have been used infrequently in this group. In addition to this, the distribution of combined strategies of Transliteration+Specification/Calque is similar in the TTs produced by this subtitler, as in the case with the other two subtitlers.

Regarding the target-oriented strategies, similar to the other two subtitlers, subtitler C has opted for Paraphrase significantly more frequently than other strategies in this group. The number of Creative renditions by subtitler C is identical to that of subtitler A, despite the lower total number of TTs in the corpus produced by this subtitler. Cases of Omission observed in the TTs produced by this subtitler are slightly more frequent than subtitler A, specifically in rendering the ECRs pertaining to the film *Hotel Transylvania 2*, which might be due to the high number of identified ECRs compared to the two other films. The number of Meaning shift cases is similar to that of the other two subtitlers. Situational substitution has occurred equally (only once) in each film subtitled by subtitler C.
In the following section, the subtitling behaviour of all three subtitlers is compared and the results and patterns are discussed accordingly.

4.2.4 Conclusion

Throughout section 4.1, a number of examples pertaining to each subtitler’s TTs was given and the comparison was made in each case to see whether the subtitlers treated the ST ECRs the same way or whether they have opted for different solutions in rendering the same ECRs throughout the corpus. As mentioned earlier, a total number of 177 ST ECRs was identified in the corpus of 5 selected films for the study. A total of 370 TTs produced by the three selected subtitlers was analysed closely and the solutions chosen by the subtitlers were classified in each case, according to the model adapted from Pedersen’s (2011) taxonomy of ECR transfer strategies.

The results obtained from the analysis suggest that all three subtitlers had shown a similar pattern in treating the ST ECRs, in that a tendency to target-oriented strategies by the

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Film</th>
<th>Superordinate term</th>
<th>Paraphrase</th>
<th>Transcultural ECR</th>
<th>TC ECR</th>
<th>Situational</th>
<th>Omission</th>
<th>Creative rendition</th>
<th>Meaning shift</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Frozen</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotel Transylvania 2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zootopia</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.63 Target-oriented strategies applied by subtitler C in each individual film and in total throughout the corpus
When source-oriented strategies were applied, the subtitlers decided to keep the ECR as close as possible to the ST, either by Transliteration or providing a Calque translation for the given ECR. In cases of more complex ST ECRs, normally the Transliteration was accompanied by either Specification or Calque translation, to give guidance to the TT viewer and make the ECR more accessible for them (e.g. Cinco de Mayo party). These cases were, however, infrequent, compared to the single strategies of Transliteration and Calque in this group (Table 4.65 below). No cases of Shifted Direct translation have been observed, where the subtitlers perform some optional shifts on the ST ECR to make it more unobtrusive (Pedersen, 2005:5). Nevertheless, obligatory shifts required by the differences between SL and TL, as language systems (e.g. word order), have been made in the cases of Calque translations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Total instances of Source-oriented Strategies used</th>
<th>Total instances of Target-oriented Strategies used</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.64 Distribution of total instances of source and target-oriented strategies used by subtitlers (A, B, C)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Source-oriented Strategies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transliteration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.65 Distribution of total instances of source-oriented strategies used by subtitlers (A, B, C)

With regard to target-oriented strategies (Table 4.66 below), Paraphrase has been observed to be the most frequently used strategy by all three subtitlers in this group. Creative rendition has been observed in a number of cases in the TTs produced by subtitlers A and C; however, this strategy has not been used by subtitler B throughout the corpus. All subtitlers have opted for cultural substitutions (Transcultural ECR, TC ECR) and Situational substitution in a number of cases. Subtitler C has opted for Omission more frequently than the two other
subtitlers, the reason for which, considering the high number of target-oriented strategies by this subtitler, might be to increase the fluency of the TT by eliminating a foreign block. In terms of generalisation solutions, apart from the frequently used strategy of Paraphrase, a reasonably high frequency of replacing the ECR by a Superordinate term has been observed, specifically in the TTs relating to subtitlers A and C.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subtitler</th>
<th>Superordinate term</th>
<th>Paraphrase</th>
<th>Transcultural ECR</th>
<th>TC ECR</th>
<th>Situational</th>
<th>Omission</th>
<th>Creative rendition</th>
<th>Meaning shift</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.66 Distribution of total instances of target-oriented strategies by subtitlers (A, B, C)

As mentioned earlier, since the number of identified ECRs varies in each film, and also because the number of films analysed for each subtitler is different (i.e. subtitler A: 5 films, subtitlers B and C: 3 films each), in what follows, the relative frequency of applying the strategies relating to each individual subtitler is shown by percentage in Figures 4.51-4.59 below.
As discussed earlier (and also can be seen in the figures above), all three subtitlers have opted for target-oriented strategies more frequently than source-oriented strategies. Out of the three,
Subtitler C is observed to be the most target-oriented, as opposed to subtitler B showing the lowest percentage of target-oriented strategies. In fact, the distribution of source and target-oriented strategies by subtitler B is fairly similar (i.e. 46% and 54% respectively), compared to other two subtitlers, who show a significant difference in distribution between these two main categories.

The same figures showing the sharing of each strategy (as the subcategories of the main groups) adopted by each individual subtitler are displayed below.

![Subtitler A diagram](image)

Figure 4.54 Total source-oriented strategies applied by subtitler A throughout the corpus

![Subtitler B diagram](image)

Figure 4.55 Total source-oriented strategies applied by subtitler B throughout the corpus
As can be observed, among source-oriented strategies, subtitler C has used Transliteration more frequently than the other subtitlers. Subtitler B on the other hand, has opted for Calque translation in this group more frequently than the other two subtitlers. Subtitler A has used these two strategies fairly equally. The application of the combined strategies of Transliteration+Specification/Calque by subtitlers A and B is higher than that of subtitler C. With regard to target-oriented strategies, as can be observed in figures 4.57-4.59 below, the most frequently used strategy by the subtitlers in target-oriented group is that of Paraphrase.
Subtitler B has opted for this strategy more frequently than the other two subtitlers, whereas Creative rendition has been more frequently used by subtitler C, and no cases of this strategy have been observed in the TTs produced by subtitler B. In addition to this, subtitler B has shown the highest percentage of Meaning shift cases; however, subtitlers A and C have shown a broadly similar percentage of Meaning shifts, which is somewhat lower than that of subtitler B. This similarity is seen once more between subtitlers A and C in terms of using a Superordinate term and the strategy of TC ECR. To put it another way, more commonalities have been observed in the subtitling behaviour of these two subtitlers (A and C) compared to subtitler B. Overall, it can be stated that the main commonality among all three subtitlers is that they have all shown a more target-oriented pattern, with Paraphrase being the foremost.
strategy chosen. With regard to source-oriented strategies, Transliteration and Calque translation, in that order, have been the most frequently used strategies by the three subtitlers. The next chapter elaborates on the findings analysed in this chapter and examines to what extent the Research Questions of this study have been answered.
Chapter 5
Discussion

Following the detailed analysis of the corpus of five animated feature films, and having provided a qualitative analysis and quantitative distribution of patterns in the corpus at hand in Chapter 4, this chapter revisits the three Research Questions (RQs) posed in the methodology chapter, Chapter 3:

The first research question comprises two sub-questions.

1. How can the practice of subtitling in Iran and the sociocultural conditions under which it takes place be characterised, i.e,
   a) What is ‘unofficial subtitling’?
   b) Who does it in the Iranian context?

2. What are the most frequently-applied translation strategies for Extralinguistic Cultural References (ECRs) in animated feature films subtitled from English into Persian by unofficial subtitlers?

3. What are the specific patterns of subtitling behaviour when dealing with ECRs that affect the way animated films are presented in the target culture (TC)?

The main purpose of the present study, as stated in the RQs above, has been to investigate the phenomenon of unofficial subtitling in Iran from two perspectives; the sociocultural and the linguistic aspect. The sociocultural aspect i.e. RQ1, was dealt with extensively in Chapter 2, setting the unofficial subtitling ecosystem in Iran before proceeding to the linguistic analysis in Chapter 4. In view of the fact that the sociocultural context under which the subtitlers operate can influence the strategies they opt for, the sociocultural insight I gained through desk research informed the linguistic analysis of the study. The focus of this chapter is therefore on to what extent the RQs 2 and 3 have been answered in the context of this project.
To this end, this chapter is structured according to the findings pertaining to the linguistic aspect of the phenomenon of unofficial subtitling in Iran to shed more light on the answers to the second and the third RQs of the study. Accordingly, section (5.1) provides a discussion addressing RQ2, which delineates the salient findings previously presented in Chapter 4. Section (5.2) answers RQ3 by elaborating on the findings pertaining to the subtitling behaviour of the subtitlers in the translation of animated feature films while dealing with ECRs, and the way these products are presented in the TC.

5.1 Unofficial subtitling in Iran: Product and Process-oriented Perspectives

The present study set out to investigate the subtitling behaviour of three recognised unofficial subtitlers in the specific sociocultural context, by looking closely into their subtitled products for five animated feature films with the focus on the translation of ECRs in the corpus of the study. As mentioned in Chapter 2 (section 2.3.4.2), the studies that have been carried out to date in the area of unofficial subtitling in Iran, have mainly focused on the (Hollywood) film genre and have investigated the strategies applied by these subtitlers in general, i.e. the rendition of specific linguistic elements have rarely been looked into. The results of the studies mentioned mainly indicated literal translation (transfer) as the most frequently used strategy. The findings of the present study, however, have proved to differ from the above-mentioned studies, in that the renditions I have observed tend to be more target-oriented with paraphrase being the most frequently used strategy. The following points will elaborate on the above-mentioned argument:

- The genre under investigation in this study, i.e. animation, might have influenced the subtitlers’ choices, resulting in more accessible TTs for the younger audience.
- The unit of analysis in the study (i.e. ECRs) is very specific. The subtitlers might have opted for more target-oriented strategies to lower the degree of specificity of these elements for the target viewer.
The three subtitlers in the present study have been selected by focusing on the popularity criterion (as mentioned in the methodology chapter, section 3.3.1) as opposed to the above-mentioned studies that might have chosen the subtitled products randomly, disregarding the popularity factor. The subtitlers selected for this project are the most recognised and popular among other subtitlers, therefore, the patterns and tendencies they demonstrate can be indicative of the target audience taste and preference for subtitles.

According to a Persian film blogger, “when the name of the subtitler A (one of the selected subtitlers in the present study) appears on the screen at the beginning of the film, the highest quality translation and a unique film-viewing experience is guaranteed, this is more than just a name, it has become known as a brand and a credit among Persian subtitles”.

It was discussed in the Methodology chapter that the analytical framework for the present study was an adaptation of Pedersen’s (2011) taxonomy of ECR transfer strategies. After conducting the pilot study and proceeding with the analysis of the data, it was discovered that not all the categories in Pedersen’s taxonomy match the findings of the analysis in the present study. In other words, his taxonomy does not cover some of the strategies adopted by the Iranian unofficial subtitlers. This has led to the design of an adapted model of his taxonomy which suited the purpose of the present study, by some partial redefinition and extension of the strategies of Pedersen’s proposed model. Some features of Pedersen’s model (Figure 5.1), which were the cause to devise the adapted model for the present study, are listed below:

1. Pedersen’s model has been proposed with the focus on the professional subtitling for Scandinavian TV programmes, whereas the present study focuses on unofficial subtitling available on the black market in Iran.
2. The language pair in his model is English-Danish/Swedish which are Latin-script languages, whereas in the language pair of the present study (i.e. English-Persian), Persian is a Perso-Arabic/Arabic script language (Mirdehghan, 2010).

3. There are some difficult demarcation issues regarding the classification of the TTs and many cases of ECR renderings end up in grey areas between two strategies.

![Figure 5.1 Taxonomy of ECR Transfer Strategies by Pedersen (2011:75)](image)

With regard to the first point mentioned above, Pedersen investigated the products of professional subtitlers whereas unofficial subtitlers in Iran, as individuals not affiliated to or supervised by any formal institutions, might take a more flexible approach in the process of subtitling. However, both professional/official and unofficial subtitlers consciously or subconsciously follow a number of ideological and cultural factors in rendering source texts (Molanazar and Nasrollahi, 2017). In addition to this, it needs to be pointed out that the genre under investigation in this study (i.e. animation) demands even more flexibility in rendering
the ST, due to the presence of humour and the creativity element in the genre, which was the cause to add the strategy of ‘Creative rendition’ to the present model, since a number of renditions of this case were observed in the TT corpus.

Considering the second feature of Pedersen’s model, as mentioned above, the strategy of Retention (keeping ST elements in the TT (Pedersen, 2011:77)) was replaced by ‘Transliteration’ (replacing SL graphological units by TL graphological units (Catford, 1965:66)) as it is not possible to keep the English elements in Persian (a non-Latin-script language). This strategy was applied as a single strategy as well as in combination with other strategies leading to create the combined categories of ‘Transliteration+Specification’ and ‘Transliteration+Calque’ in the present model. Regarding the strategy of ‘Transliteration+Specification’ it should be pointed out that ‘Specification’, in Pedersen’s model, entails two subcategories of ‘Addition’ and ‘Completion’, which are, to a great extent, similar strategies, both adding to/completing the ST in the TT.

Regarding the third feature of Pedersen’s model, as mentioned above, there were many cases of TTs that straddled two strategies, making the demarcation very difficult and time-consuming. As a result, it the adapted model, ‘Addition’ and ‘Completion’ have been merged to their main category of ‘Specification’, which was observed in combination with ‘Transliteration’ throughout the corpus. In some cases, however, this strategy was observed together with the strategy of ‘Calque’, where the translators provided the literal meaning of the ECR as well as transliteration, forming the combined category of ‘Transliteration+Calque’. Another strategy that was added to Pedersen’s model was ‘Meaning shift’ which was observed several times throughout the TT corpus. Altering the meaning of the ST by the subtitler, as mentioned earlier in Chapter 3 and Chapter 4, might originate from various reasons including the subtitler’s lack of knowledge, miscomprehension of the ST, or even deliberate alterations that will be discussed further in
the chapter. Consequently, for the reasons outlined above, Pedersen’s taxonomy was partially re-designed to be used as the analytical tool for the present study, as illustrated in Figure 5.2 below.

![Figure 5.2](image)

Figure 5.2 Adapted model from Pedersen’s (2011) taxonomy of ECR transfer strategies

In Chapter 4 of the thesis, the data has been meticulously analysed and the findings were presented. In the remaining part of this chapter, the indications of the findings and certain patterns shown by the subtitlers will be discussed.

The sociocultural context in which the translators operate is central in understanding the behaviour of the translators and their choices. Therefore, the interpretations of the findings are based on the information provided in chapter 2 (section 2.3.4.1), as well as the researcher’s linguistic and cultural knowledge of the country under investigation. The
implications of the findings, however, are much wider and can be transferred to other contexts with a similar situation.

According to the findings of the data analysis, the renditions of the ECRs were mainly target-oriented by the three subtitlers, with Paraphrase being the most frequently used strategy, followed by using a superordinate term and substituting the SC ECR with a TC ECR, and Creative renditions which occurred equally throughout the corpus. There are several factors that might have influenced subtitlers in opting for target-oriented strategies. The three subtitlers selected for the study were the most recognised and the most popular. This can indicate that Iranian audiences prefer the translations that are more target-oriented and closer to their culture. This type of translation is informally known as ‘Iranised’ translation (in Persian /iːræniːzə/). Based on my own personal experience, the target audience believe they can connect with the plot and the characters better when the translation is closer to their culture and therefore more accessible to them. A smaller section of the audience might prefer subtitles that are closer to the source language/culture. This group considers the result of the Iranised translation an anomaly, which creates what is called a ‘credibility gap’ by Pedersen (2005 and 2007), ‘credibility problems’ by Nedergaard-Larsen (1993), and ‘authenticity problems’ by Gottlieb (1994). According to Pedersen (2007:33), “a credibility gap may appear when subtitled SC characters are seen to use TC ECRs”. Credibility gaps are said to be of different magnitudes, and the acceptability of this kind of cultural interchangeability varies between countries (Pedersen, 2007). According to the results of Pedersen’s (2005) study (analysing the Danish and Swedish subtitles of English TV programmes), cultural interchangeability is accepted by Danes but not by Swedes. Leppihalme (1996:214) points out the anomalies some sort of cultural interchangeability may cause in translation in general in Finland. However, she has also claimed that “target cultural replacements may be more often acceptable in film and television than in print” (Leppihalme, 1994:158 as quoted by
Pedersen, 2007:44). It can be argued that the same applies to Iran where the target cultural replacements (Iranised translations) are mainly accepted in AV products rather than in print (which is not the focus of this study).

With regard to the unit of analysis in the present study, it should be noted that, as a type of culture specific references, ECRs are known to be among the most challenging elements of translation. The degree of the specificity of these elements depends on the relationship between source and target culture (Ranzato, 2016) which in this case (Western and Middle Eastern) are dissimilar to a great extent. In rendering these elements, based on an in-depth analysis of the data, subtitlers opted for Paraphrase significantly more often than other strategies in the target-oriented group. This could be indicative of the subtitlers’ effort in making these elements accessible for target viewers, by alleviating the degree of their specificity. The drawback of this strategy, compared to other strategies in this group, is that it is normally more space-consuming, although its length and complexity depends on the degree of familiarity of the TT audience with the ST ECR. In other words, there is an inverse relation between the two (Pedersen, 2005:8). As a result, in several cases, the paraphrased ECRs were longer than the relating ST ECRs throughout the corpus. As a case in point, rendering ‘love your chocolate cereal’ to ‘like the chocolate breakfasts with your picture on it’ (as explained in Chapter 4, Table 4.33).

Using a superordinate term by the subtitlers can have a similar implication, as both Paraphrase and Superordinate term are subcategories of the Generalisation strategy. Opting for the strategy of TC ECR also underscores their inclination to produce a target-oriented product that is more accessible and more appreciated by the audience.

Another point of discussion based on the findings presented in data analysis chapter is the creativity of unofficial subtitlers in rendering the ECRs in this specific genre. It could be argued that a relatively high number of Creative renditions (as one of the categories added to
Pedersen’s taxonomy) can be indicative of the fact that unofficial subtitlers, not being screened by the authorities, have more freedom in the choices they make. However, the changes they make to the ST are not merely the result of or related to the censorship, as they are not normative. In other words, these subtitlers do not set out to break norms, as opposed to abusive subtitling, where the subtitler breaks the subtitling norms in an attempt to increase the translator’s visibility (Nornes, 1999). The changes made by unofficial subtitlers are rather related to the creativity aspect of subtitling animation and the enjoyable experience they intend to create for the audience.

Two other target-oriented strategies that were used quite often by the subtitlers were Omission and Meaning shift. There are several possible reasons for subtitlers choosing these two strategies; for instance, they can be used with the aim of increasing fluency in the TT. To be more specific, the subtitler might choose to omit a troublesome ECR, to remove a foreign block, thus helping the viewer access the utterance more comfortably. It should be acknowledged that this is not always the case, as omitting an ECR might in some cases create a block in the flow of the TT. The obvious fact is that Omission never results in an ECR nor does it add any material to the TT rendering of the ST ECR. For this reason, in Pedersen’s (2011) simplified process-oriented taxonomy of ECR transfer strategies (Figure 5.3 below), Omission has been placed somewhere in between the ‘minimal change’ strategies (more often imply that SC ECRs are retained in the TT) and ‘interventional’ strategies (the subtitler intervenes to help the TT audience access the ST ECR therefore, in most cases lead to target-orientation) (Pedersen, 2011:101).
According to Mollanazar and Nasrollahi (2017), the subtitler might omit a segment that carries less important information (due to spatial and temporal constraints), to accommodate segments of higher significance. Omission might also happen due to the fact that the viewer is receiving the information through audio and visual channels, and thus making it unnecessary or redundant to translate every segment of the ST (Mollanazar and Nasrollahi, 2017:165). A high number of the instances of Omission observed throughout the corpus in the present study support the above-mentioned statement as the omitted ECRs were mainly either the ones that did not carry a high verbal content (e.g. omitting *Wallaby, Didgeridoo*, as explained in Chapter 4, Table 4.17) or in cases where the audio and visual channel were helping the viewer to receive the message (e.g. omitting the ECR *Limbo* in the utterance: “Holy rabies! *Limbo*? I used to love that game!” back-translation: “Oh God! I loved this game”, Chapter 4, Table 4.32) where the presence of the word ‘game’ together with the visuals (Image 5.1 below) help the TT viewer to grasp the intended reference as well as the possible positive connotations of a leisure activity.
The Meaning shift strategy, similar to Omission as noted above, might either remove a foreign block or add it in the TT. As Katan (2004:188) puts it, shifts can occur for several reasons, among which one can refer to the differences between languages, as well as deliberate changes by the translator with the aim of intensifying the contextual effects in the target culture. As a case in point, rendering *Marshmallow* to ‘abject’ (Chapter 4, Table 4.5) has in fact increased the fluency of the TT by intensifying the belittling nickname *Marshmallow* to refer to the monster’s appearance.

With regard to the source-oriented strategies, Transliteration and Calque are the most frequently used strategies. Calque was mainly used in cases where the visuals could aid the TT viewer to access the ST and the literal translation did not sound odd to the viewer. Transliteration was mainly used for proper nouns as a single category; however, in cases where this strategy did not guide the viewer, the subtitler has intervened and used this strategy together with either Specification or Calque to make the ST ECR accessible for the TC audience, which, in a way, as discussed in Chapter 4, could also offer pedagogical advantages to the target viewer.

Considering the discussion above, the simplified process-oriented adapted model is shown in Figure 5.4 below.
The quality of translation in the unofficial subtitled products is not measured with the same yardstick used for official and professional subtitling. Nevertheless, the adapted models used in the study proved to be applicable in classifying the strategies used for rendering the identified ECRs in the corpus, as well as looking into the process-perspective of the practice.

Having discussed the main patterns the unofficial subtitlers have shown in treating the ECRs (i.e. target-oriented), and the corresponding frequently used strategies, the second RQ of the research has been addressed. The following discussion is provided with a focus on identifying any recurrent patterns of subtitling behaviour that might have affected the way animated films are presented in the TC. This will serve to answer the third RQ.

5.2 The Way the Animated Films Are Presented in the TC by Unofficial Subtitlers

The three selected subtitlers, as mentioned earlier, are among the most popular subtitlers, whose work is greatly appreciated and valued by the audience. Therefore, finding out whether each of these subtitlers follows a certain pattern in their subtitling behaviour, which might affect the way the animated films are presented in the TC in a given sociocultural
context, is of high importance. Based on the detailed analysis of the corpus, and according to the findings relating to the subtitled products of each subtitler, the following areas will be considered as the indices of certain patterns the subtitlers might have shown: being creative in rendering the ECRs, taking into account the visuals, observing spatio-temporal constraints, transferring the intended connotations and humour, creating new words (neologism).

The creativity element in the renditions of the ECRs has been observed in the products of subtitlers A and C, with C showing a higher proportion of creative renditions in relation to the number of TTs. One of the instances of Creative rendition that stood out was the rendition by subtitler C in the corpus of the animated film *Hotel Transylvania 2* (also mentioned in Chapter 4, Table 4.34). Here the ST “have you tried this Slurpee?” was rendered as “have you ever made its sound?” (Image 5.2 below).

Before elaborating on the implications of this rendition, it has to be noted that, in order to have a better understanding of the way the animated films are presented in the TC by the subtitlers, the researcher watched the directors’ commentaries relating to the five selected animated films to see if the director’s intended connotations, humour, etc. have been transferred to the subtitled versions of the film. In other words, to see whether the subtitlers
have been loyal towards the original version or towards the target culture viewer or whether they bridged between the two. The above-mentioned instance, taken at face value, was classified as Meaning shift strategy; however, in the commentary, the director revealed that the specific sound of slurping while drinking Slurpee was intended in this scene/utterance. Thus, the subtitler has precisely conveyed the director’s intended meaning in the given context. This example can indicate the subtitler’s level of awareness of the SC. In fact, there are two likely implications with regard to the above-mentioned rendition. The subtitler must have watched the director’s commentary, or s/he must have lived in the United States where this beverage is sold at 7-Eleven stores; therefore, s/he may have tried Slurpee and is familiar with the specificity of the associated slurping sound.

In this example, the subtitler has been loyal to the source culture. The audio channel (the specific sound Mavis makes while trying the beverage) will aid the target viewer to grasp the intended connotation of the TT. Other cases of Creative renditions by subtitler C and subtitler A were observed to be mainly biased towards the target culture, where the subtitlers have creatively reconstructed the intended humour in the TT. Among the three subtitlers, no cases of Creative renditions were observed in the TTs produced by subtitler B. However, this subtitler produced the highest number of Paraphrase and combined strategies of Transliteration+Specification/Calque, which can be indicative of target-orientation by making the ST ECRs less specific in the TT.

With regard to creating new TT ECRs, a few cases of neologism were observed throughout the corpus, mainly in the Creative renditions by subtitler A (e.g. A.Z.T for A.V.L, Fereni Head for Porridge Head, Bloodpa for Vampa, as discussed in Chapter 4), which, although unfaithful to the ST ECR, these instances transfer the humour and the intended connotation. The visual aspect has been observed in some cases where the visual aids the TT (e.g. rendering piñata to ‘candy donkey’ backed up by the visual channel (Chapter 4, Image 4.8).
As far as the spatio-temporal constraints is concerned, the frequent occurrence of Paraphrase (in the target-oriented group) and the combined strategies of Transliteration+Specification/Calque (in the source-oriented group) can be indicative of not taking into account the spatio-temporal constraints as entailed in professional subtitling, even with the intention of making the ST ECRs more accessible for the target audience. Overall, observing the features discussed above by these subtitlers has resulted in creating an enjoyable experience (similar to the original version of the animation) for the target viewer in a ‘semi’-professional subtitled product.

It could be argued that making the ST ECRs less specific in the TC, while managing to preserve the specific features of the genre, transpires as the uniform trend in the findings. According to Genndy Tartakovsky, the director of Hotel Transylvania 2, “storytelling in animation is actually what is authentic, funny, and meaningful in the characters”. Based on the findings of the study and the discussion in this chapter, it could be argued that the above-mentioned features (the authenticity, humour, and meaningfulness), which shape the way the animations are presented in the TC, have, to a great extent, been dealt with in the Persian subtitled versions of the five selected animations. Nevertheless, there are still many avenues to explore in this area. This will be addressed in terms of direction for further research in the next Chapter.
Chapter 6

Concluding Remarks

The present study set out to investigate the under-researched phenomenon of ‘unofficial subtitling’ in the Iranian context from two perspectives, i.e. sociocultural as well as linguistic aspects of the practice. The sociocultural aspect, which was the first Research Question of the project, was addressed in Chapter 2 of the thesis by shedding light on the phenomenon. This was done through mapping out the sociocultural environment of subtitlers; this environment is characterised by several challenges and unyielding restrictions imposed by the government; these are constraints that subtitlers have to tackle in the entire network of providing the subtitled AV products. As mentioned before (in Chapters 1 and 2), unofficial subtitlers, by producing subtitles for uncensored AV products and making them available to the target audience, diversify the audiovisual landscape in the country. Target users recognise some of these subtitlers and appreciate their high-quality products. Thus, identifying the strategies these subtitlers frequently choose, specifically when dealing with cultural references, which are known to be one of the most challenging elements in translation, has shed light on the possible answers to the second Research Question.

According to Baker (2009), the best method for studying regularities or habitual patterns of translation behaviours is to research a corpus of authentic translations. In this vein, the thesis contained a comparative analysis of existing subtitles produced by three recognised unofficial subtitlers for five popular animations to gauge the most frequently applied strategies by these subtitlers. To this end, Pedersen’s (2011) taxonomy of Extralinguistic Cultural References (ECRs) transfer strategies was employed as the basis of the analytical framework for the study. An adapted model was further developed with some partial redefinitions and extension of the categories (adding the strategies of Transliteration, Transliteration+Specification, Transliteration+Calque in the source-oriented group and
Creative rendition and Meaning shift in the target-oriented group) to suit the purpose of the study. The data was accordingly analysed in detail, to answer the second Research Question of the project as summarised below.

The most noteworthy trend that emerged from the findings is that the renditions of the ECRs were observed to be more target-oriented, with Paraphrase being the most frequently opted for strategy, followed by using a Superordinate term and substituting the ST ECR with a TC ECR, and Creative renditions (the last two occurring identically). Considering the fact that the three subtitlers selected for the study were among the most popular unofficial subtitlers (based on the selection criteria mentioned in Chapter 3), the trend observed suggests that the Iranian audience prefer AV products with target-orientation. Other strategies in this group (i.e. Situational and Transcultural substitution, Omission and Meaning shift) were used infrequently by these subtitlers. In the source-oriented group, Transliteration was observed to be the most frequent strategy, followed by Calque. This was followed by the combined strategies of Transliteration+Specification/Calque which occurred fairly equally. Shifted Direct translation (as optional shifts perform by the subtitlers) was not observed throughout the TTs. Nevertheless, obligatory shifts required by the differences between SL and TL as language systems (e.g. word order) have been made in the cases of Calque/Direct translations.

In order to answer the third Research Question of the study, specific attention was paid to the following areas to see whether the subtitlers have shown certain patterns or tendencies that might have affected the way the animated films are presented in the TC. These areas comprised the aid of visuals in the TTs, observing spatio-temporal constraints, creatively transferring (reconstructing) humour based on the theme of the animated films, and creating new words in the TT. Based on the discussion provided in Chapter 5, the frequent occurrence of Paraphrase and the combined strategies of Transliteration+Specification/Calque (all space-
consuming strategies) by these subtitlers can be indicative of not taking into account the spatio-temporal constraints as entailed in professional subtitling; yet the intention here is to make the ST ECRs more accessible for the target audience. This can be due to the fact that unofficial subtitlers have not been trained and are not expected to follow certain norms of subtitling as set in professional circles. Nonetheless, other areas mentioned above (i.e. the aid of visuals in the TTs, creatively reconstructing humour, and creating new words in the TT) were, to a great extent, observed by these subtitlers. It could be argued that the popular Iranian unofficial subtitlers are in fact semi-professional practitioners who manage to create an enjoyable experience for their audience which is similar to that of SC viewers. As can be concluded, the project answered the Research Questions and fulfilled the research aim set out in Chapter 3. In what follows, the contribution of the present study is outlined.

The study for the first time unveiled the sociocultural aspect of ‘unofficial subtitling’ in detail in the Iranian context, which, despite emerging as a popular means of access to the latest uncensored AV products, has been overlooked by Iranian scholars to date.

The adapted model used in the study proved to be applicable in systematically classifying the strategies used for rendering the identified ECRs in the corpus. It was also helpful in terms of looking into the process-oriented perspective of the practice as discussed in Chapter 5. Therefore, the model has potential to be used in other interlingual comparative studies for non-Latin-based script languages (i.e. other than Persian).

Another point that should be mentioned is that the analysis of the corpus of TTs (produced by the most popular unofficial subtitlers in the given context), highlights a target audience preference for the orientation of the subtitled products. There is a clear preference for target-orientation, which can influence the (non)professional practice of other AV translators. The implications of the findings, however, are much wider and can be transferred to other contexts with similar situations. Having answered the Research Questions of the study and
delineating its contribution, certain limitations also need to be acknowledged, which is discussed in what follows.

This project was of a small scale, focusing on five films of a specific genre. However, given the time, scope and resources/nature of this study, it was a suitable sample for qualitative analysis and also large enough to be used for investigating the distribution of patterns in the corpus, based on the adapted model of Pedersen’s (2011) taxonomy of ECR transfer strategies. There are two possible ways of extending the remit of this study. First, adopting a larger corpus, second, looking into different genres. A larger corpus may corroborate findings or provide an even more nuanced picture of the trends involved. Investigating other genres (e.g. film, sitcom) may reveal further insights into the decision-making process involved, taking into account the similarities or implications for related phenomena (e.g. the element of humour).

The researcher’s subjective engagement with the material and her familiarity with the topics portrayed in the films in the practices of unofficial subtitling was another limitation of the study. The observer’s own view is difficult to eliminate from this project. This may have framed the interpretation of findings to a certain extent. On the other hand, having full access to the target culture may be an advantage and the issue of subjectivity cannot be eliminated fully from studies of this nature (e.g. Desilla’s 2012 case-study on the implicatures in film).

The focus in the study mainly lay on ECRs, which, due to the definition of the term, excludes other cultural references such as idioms, proverbs, slang expressions, etc. A wider range of culture specific elements can be taken into account in conducting similar comparative studies. On the other hand, successfully dealing with these highly specific and challenging cultural elements (i.e. ECRs), can be considered as hallmarks of excellent linguistic competence of the subtitlers.
The lack of interview materials as a factor that lay beyond the researcher’s control should also be acknowledged as a limitation of the study. Asking questions about a product to understand the process is a standard technique used in process-oriented analysis in Translation Studies (e.g. Göpferich and Jääskeläinen, 2009; Hansen, 2003). Watching the subtitled products with the subtitlers and asking the reasons for their choices of translation strategies would have given more insights on the process. However, as Pedersen (2011) puts it, subtitlers might not be consciously aware of the choices they make and part of the process might be internalised and subconscious: “This is particularly true in the cases where the strategies combine; the subtitlers may not be aware that they have used more than one strategy” (Pedersen, 2011:103). Carrying out a similar study including the element of interviews is one of the areas for further research as outlined below.

One of the avenues that can be explored in this area is to replicate the ECR approach with a larger sample in the same genre (or other genres), as well as conducting interviews with the subtitlers to get more insight on the reasons for their final choices that appear on the screen. Staying within the same genre, a further, interrelated avenue would involve the observation of translation processes; for example, eye-tracking or video-recording to see how subtitlers tackle ECRs in animated programmes, how much time they take, or how they reflect on them (e.g. Kemppanen, Jänis, and Belikova, 2012; Kruger, 2016).

Further to this, the focus can be shifted to looking into other linguistic/pragmatics-related phenomena, such as humour and implicatures, which are of high significance in defining the level of audience enjoyment of AV products. As Desilla (2019) puts it, “mishandling pragmatic meaning across cultures may affect character perception, plot development and/or viewer enjoyment” (Desilla, 2019:255).
The emphasis can also be shifted to characters and narrative aspects in film, which can be explored through linguistic features such as the above (e.g. in animation, humour and ECRs may be a stylistic feature that specifically contribute to the enjoyment of viewers).

An interesting field of further research would be to carry out reception studies, as a follow-up to compare what the analysing expert sees and what audiences might see. Put differently, taking into account linguistic phenomena like pragmatics, as mentioned above, while conducting a reception study, will shed light on the way AVT products are received in the target culture. According to Desilla (2019), AVT gives the translator the opportunity to interfere with the implicatures intended by the filmmaker, which in fact highlights the significance of investigating the pragmatic phenomena in multimodal contexts (Desilla, 2019:255).

Another suggestion for further research in this area is to conduct ethnographic studies as a follow-up, linking this AV text analysis with modes of production/key players’ activities and institutions (and other methods, such as interviews and questionnaires).

In addition to the aforementioned areas, the implications of the study can be used for AVT educators/academics (e.g. breaking down ECR analysis into components), by teaching the specifics of each aspect in individual classes in an AVT module; the same can be said about non-Latin-based script languages (other than Persian). The implications can also be used for practitioners with the purpose of raising awareness as they make translation choices subconsciously (e.g. a workshop involving academics and subtitlers, where they discuss best practice and raise awareness on cultural specificity and the enjoyment this may entail for audiences).

Overall, given how young the field is, there are still numerous avenues to be explored in this area.
References


CPJ (Committee to Protect Journalists) (2015) 10 Most Censored Countries: The 2015 list of 10 Most Censored Countries is part of CPJ's annual publication. Available at: https://cpj.org/2015/04/10-most-censored-countries.php (Accessed 14 March 2019).


Davidson, E. (2003) ‘Animation: Genre and Authorship’, A review by Esme Davidson, Nottingham Trent University, UK. Available at:


281


285


Filmography


